



# Choosing a Fixed Cardinality Set

Jimmy Lee & Peter Stuckey



## SetSelect Question Revised (baguaCard-10-8.dzn)

- ⌘ Given a subset of numbers  $1..nSpots$  for each symbol in SYMB, choose a subset of  $1..nSpots$  of size `size` which includes at most one from each subset and maximize the damage points of the chosen set

```
nSpots = 10;  
damage = [10, 8, 4, 2, 6, 9, 5, 3, 8, 10];  
size = 3;  
SYMB = {'天', '澤', '火', '雷', '風', '水', '山', '地'};  
group = [{1,4,6}, {1,2,6,7}, {1,3,6,8}, {1,2,3},  
         {2,9,10}, {5,6,8,10}, {7,8,10}, {1,3,5}];
```



## SetSelect Revised Addition (baguaCardSet.mzn)

### ⌘ Additional constraint

```
card(attacks) = size;
```

### ⌘ Executing the model

```
attacks: {5,7,9} & damage: 19;
```

### ⌘ But we can model a set with **known** cardinality differently!

3

## Deciding a Fixed Cardinality Set

### ⌘ Instead of a set variable

```
var set of SPOT: attacks;  
with cardinality constraint  
card(attacks) = size;
```

### ⌘ An array of `size` elements

```
array[1..size] of var SPOT: attacks;  
• and some other constraints ...
```

### ⌘ **Why**: suppose `nSpots = 1000`, `size = 4`

### ⌘ First representation: **1000 Boolean variables**

### ⌘ Second representation: **4 integer variables**

4



## Deciding a Fixed Cardinality Set

- ⌘ Consider  
`array[1..3] of var 1..10: x;`
- ⌘ How many possible values? **1000**
- ⌘ And `var set of 1..10: x;` with  
`card(x) = 3;`
  - $10 * 9 * 8 / 3 * 2 * 1 = 120$
- ⌘ **First issue:** some array solutions are **not** sets of cardinality 3
  - e.g.  $[1,1,1] = \{1\}$ ,  $[1,2,1] = \{1,2\}$
- ⌘ **Solution:** ensure all different  
`forall(i,j in 1..u where i < j)`  
`(x[i] != x[j]);`

5

## Deciding a Fixed Cardinality Set

- ⌘ Consider  
`array[1..3] of var 1..10: x;`  
`forall(i,j in 1..u where i < j)`  
`(x[i] != x[j]);`
- ⌘ How many possible values?
  - $10 * 9 * 8 = 720$
- ⌘ **Second issue:** multiple representations of the same set
  - e.g.  $\{1,6,10\} = [1,6,10], [10,1,6], [10,6,1], [1,10,6], [6,10,1], [6,1,10]$
- ⌘ **Solution:** ensure ordered  
`forall(i in 1..u-1) (x[i] < x[i+1]);`

6



## Deciding a Fixed Cardinality Set

### ⌘ Consider

```
array[1..3] of var 1..10: x;  
forall(i,j in 1..u where i < j  
    (x[i] != x[j]));
```

### ⌘ How many possible values?

- $10 * 9 * 8 = 720$

### ⌘ **Second issue:** multiple representations of the same set

- e.g.  $\{1,6,10\} = [1,6,10], [10,1,6], [10,6,1], [1,10,6], [6,10,1], [6,1,10]$

### ⌘ **Solution:** ensure ordered

```
forall(i in 1..u-1) (x[i] < x[i+1]);
```

7

## Critical Issues in Modeling Decisions

### ⌘ Decisions in the problem

- are not necessarily the decisions in the model

### ⌘ If possible make them identical but

- what if you are deciding
  - a path in a graph,
  - a tree structure

### ⌘ **Critical modeling issue (1)**

- decisions in the model (satisfying constraints)
- are **valid decisions** in the problem

### ⌘ Add constraints to make this so

- e.g. add constraints forcing array elements  $\neq$

8



## Critical Issues in Modeling Decisions

- ⌘ Multiple decisions in the model
  - reflect the same decision in the problem
  - e.g.  $x = [1, 2, 7]$ ,  $x = [7, 2, 1]$  for  $x = \{1, 2, 7\}$
- ⌘ Critical modeling issue (2)
  - try to have only **one** set of decisions in the model corresponding to each solution
  - reflect **valid decisions** in the problem
- ⌘ Add constraints to remove all but one set
  - e.g. add constraints forcing array elements  $<$

9

## SetSelect Question Revised (baguaCard-10-8.dzn)

- ⌘ Given a subset of numbers  $1..nSpots$  for each symbol in SYMB, choose a subset of  $1..nSpots$  of **size** size which includes at most one from each subset and maximize the damage points of the chosen set

```
nSpots = 10;  
damage = [10, 8, 4, 2, 6, 9, 5, 3, 8, 10];  
size = 3;  
SYMB = {'天', '澤', '火', '雷', '風', '水', '山', '地'};  
group = [{1,4,6}, {1,2,6,7}, {1,3,6,8}, {1,2,3},  
          {2,9,10}, {5,6,8,10}, {7,8,10}, {1,3,5}];
```

10



## Bagua Fixed Cardinality Model (baguaCardInt.mzn)

```
int: nSpots;
set of int: SPOT = 1..nSpots;
array[SPOT] of int: damage;
enum SYMB;
array[SYMB] of set of SPOT: group;
int: size;

array[1..size] of var SPOT: attacks;

constraint forall(i in 1..size-1)
    (attacks[i] < attacks[i+1]);
constraint forall(s in SYMB) (sum(i in 1..size)
    (attacks[i] in group[s]) <= 1);

var int: totalDamages =
    sum(i in 1..size) (damage[attacks[i]]);
solve maximize (totalDamages);
```

11

## Bagua Fixed Cardinality Model (baguaCardInt.mzn)

```
int: nSpots;
set of int: SPOT = 1..nSpots;
array[SPOT] of int: damage;
enum SYMB;
array[SYMB] of set of SPOT: group;
int: size;

array[1..size] of var SPOT: attacks;

constraint forall(i in 1..size-1)
    (attacks[i] < attacks[i+1]);
constraint forall(s in SYMB) (sum(i in 1..size)
    (attacks[i] in group[s]) <= 1);

var int: totalDamages =
    sum(i in 1..size) (damage[attacks[i]]);
solve maximize (totalDamages);
```

Decisions

12



## Bagua Fixed Cardinality Model (baguaCardInt.mzn)

```
int: nSpots;  
set of int: SPOT = 1..nSpots;  
array[SPOT] of int: damage;  
enum SYMB;  
array[SYMB] of set of SPOT: group;  
int: size;  
  
array[1..size] of var SPOT: attacks;  
  
constraint forall(i in 1..size-1)  
  (attacks[i] < attacks[i+1]);  
constraint forall(s in SYMB) (sum(i in 1..size)  
  (attacks[i] in group[s]) <= 1);  
  
var int: totalDamages =  
  sum(i in 1..size) (damage[attacks[i]]);  
solve maximize (totalDamages);
```

Valid  
representations

13

## Bagua Fixed Cardinality Model (baguaCardInt.mzn)

```
int: nSpots;  
set of int: SPOT = 1..nSpots;  
array[SPOT] of int: damage;  
enum SYMB;  
array[SYMB] of set of SPOT: group;  
int: size;  
  
array[1..size] of var SPOT: attacks;  
  
constraint forall(i in 1..size-1)  
  (attacks[i] < attacks[i+1]);  
constraint forall(s in SYMB) (sum(i in 1..size)  
  (attacks[i] in group[s]) <= 1);  
  
var int: totalDamages =  
  sum(i in 1..size) (damage[attacks[i]]);  
solve maximize (totalDamages);
```

At most one  
intersection

14



## Bagua Fixed Cardinality Model (baguaCardInt.mzn)

```
int: nSpots;  
set of int: SPOT = 1..nSpots;  
array[SPOT] of int: damage;  
enum SYMB;  
array[SYMB] of set of SPOT: group;  
int: size;  
  
array[1..size] of var SPOT: attacks;  
  
constraint forall(i in 1..size-1)  
  (attacks[i] < attacks[i+1]);  
constraint forall(s in SYMB) (sum(i in 1..size)  
  (attacks[i] in group[s]) <= 1);  
  
var int: totalDamages =  
  sum(i in 1..size) (damage[attacks[i]]);  
solve maximize (totalDamages);
```

Objective

15

## Solving the Model

### ⌘ Executing the model

```
attacks: [5,7,9] & damage: 19;
```

16





## Summary

- ⌘ There are multiple ways to represent fixed cardinality sets
  - var set of OBJ + cardinality constraint
    - good if the solver natively supports sets
    - good when OBJ is not too big
  - array[1..u] of var OBJ
    - good when u is small
- ⌘ Two critical issues in modelling decisions
  - ensure each solution to the model is a solution of the problem
  - try to ensure each solution of the problem only has one solution in the model (symmetry)

17

## Image Credits

All graphics by Marti Wong, ©The Chinese University of Hong Kong and the University of Melbourne 2016

18