Experiment Details

I've run run_search.py Python script, the result is recorded as below.

• Problem1

| Category | Number of actions in the domain | Number of new node expansions | Time to complete the plan search | Plan length |
|--|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------|
| 1. breadth_first_search | 20 | 43 | 0.00756960001308471 | 6 |
| depth_first_graph_search | 20 | 21 | 0.0035024620010517538 | 20 |
| 3. uniform_cost_search | 20 | 60 | 0.009290272952057421 | 6 |
| 4.greedy_best_first_graph_searchh_unmet_goals5. | 120 | 7 | 0.0016047820099629462 | 6 |
| greedy_best_first_graph_search h_pg_levelsum | 120 | 6 | 0.36281756800599396 | 6 |
| 6.greedy_best_first_graph_searchh_pg_maxlevel7 | 120 | 6 | 0.28398865001508966 | 6 |
| greedy_best_first_graph_search h_pg_setlevel | 120 | 6 | 0.4174564839922823 | 6 |
| 8. astar_search h_unmet_goals | 20 | 50 | 0.008155328046996146 | 6 |
| 9. astar_search h_pg_levelsum | 20 | 28 | 0.9013208069954999 | 6 |
| 10. astar_search h_pg_maxlevel | 20 | 43 | 0.9440778809948824 | 6 |
| 11. astar_search h_pg_setlevel | 20 | 33 | 0.9781918580411002 | 6 |

• Problem2

| Category | Number of actions in the domain | Number of new node expansions | Time to complete the plan search | Plan length |
|--|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------|
| 1. breadth_first_search | 72 | 3343 | 1.8369988469639793 | 9 |
| 2. depth_first_graph_search | 72 | 624 | 2.4815439780359156 | 619 |
| 3. uniform_cost_search | 72 | 5154 | 2.986213866970502 | 9 |
| 4.greedy_best_first_graph_searchh_unmet_goals5. | 172 | 17 | 0.017138831957709044 | 9 |
| greedy_best_first_graph_search h_pg_levelsum 6. | 172 | 9 | 8.893125845992472 | 9 |
| greedy_best_first_graph_searchh_pg_maxlevel7. | 172 | 27 | 18.81525965797482 | 9 |
| greedy_best_first_graph_search | 172 | 9 | 11.101002601033542 | 9 |

| h_pg_setlevel | | | | |
|-----------------------------------|----|------|--------------------|---|
| 8. astar_search h_unmet_goals | 72 | 2467 | 2.1007573819952086 | 9 |
| 9. astar_search h_pg_levelsum | 72 | 357 | 229.283577263006 | 9 |
| 10. astar_search h_pg_maxlevel | 72 | 2887 | 1311.5637586569646 | 9 |
| 11. astar_search h_pg_setlevel | 72 | 1037 | 986.0691579009872 | 9 |

As we see the result of Problem1 and Problem2, uninformed search algorithms should be fine with a reasonable large problem set.

• Problem3

| Category | Number of actions in the domain | Number of new node expansions | Time to complete the plan search | Plan length |
|--|---------------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------|
| 1. breadth_first_search | 88 | 14663 | 10.49843726301333 | 12 |
| depth_first_graph_search | 88 | 408 | 1.0789199330029078 | 392 |
| uniform_cost_search | 88 | 25 | 0.03610766201745719 | 15 |
| 4. greedy_best_first_graph_search h_unmet_goals 5. | 88 | 14 | 20.0398263669922 | 14 |
| greedy_best_first_graph_search h_pg_levelsum | 72 | 9 | 8.893125845992472 | 9 |
| 8. astar_search h_unmet_goals | 88 | 7388 | 8.214598022052087 | 12 |
| 9. astar_search h_pg_levelsum | 88 | 369 | 358.1219947949867 | 14 |

• Problem4

| Category | Number of actions in the domain | Number of new node expansions | Time to complete the plan search | Plan length |
|--|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------|
| 1. breadth_first_search | 104 | 99736 | 103.18970193102723 | 14 |
| 2. depth_first_graph_search | 104 | 25174 | 3286.7369884649524 | 24132 |
| 3. uniform_cost_search | 104 | 113339 | 102.79693892097566 | 14 |
| 4. greedy_best_first_graph_search h_unmet_goals 5. | 104 | 29 | 0.057383099978324026 | 18 |
| greedy_best_first_graph_search h_pg_levelsum | 104 | 17 | 38.346990627003834 | 17 |
| 8. astar_search h_unmet_goals | 104 | 34330 | 53.57759687898215 | 14 |
| 9. astar_search h_pg_levelsum | 104 | 1208 | 2013.923558992974 | 15 |

Questions and Answers

• Analysis of the number of nodes expanded against number of actions in the domain.

As the problem size increases, the number of actions in the domain also increases. For the uninformed

search, the nodes expansion will explode very fast.

• Analysis of the search time against the number of actions in the domain.

As the number of actions increasing, the runtime increase rapidly. For some search algorithms, the

increase speed is far more than the exponential due to the increase of the search space.

• Which algorithm or algorithms would be most appropriate for planning in a very restricted domain (i.e., one that has only a few actions) and needs to operate in real time?

breadth_first_search may gives the best real-time performance, but I think the three uninformed search all should be fine. This is because in a very restricted domain problem, we don't need to explore too many space, that makes the information less important compared to the

larger problem space.

• Which algorithm or algorithms would be most appropriate for planning in very large domains (e.g., planning delivery routes for all UPS drivers in the U.S. on a given day)

greedy_best_first_graph_search. Even if the solution may not be the optimal, but greedy_best_first_graph_search

can at least give a reasonable solution in a reasonable time.

• Which algorithm or algorithms would be most appropriate for planning problems where it is important to find only optimal plans?

breadth_first_search.