

2. Navarro V. *Medicine under Capitalism*. Croom Helm, London, 1977.
3. Strong P. *op. cit.*; Strong P. *The Ceremonial Order of the Clinic*. Routledge & Kegan Paul, London, 1979.
4. That this is necessarily good is simply assumed by Marx. For a more recent and more sceptical view see the short story by Lem S. The twenty-first voyage, in his *The Star Diaries*, p. 166. Futura, London, 1978.
5. Waitzkin, p. 1.
6. The best critique that I know of this standard sociological mistake is Bittner's critique of Weber's definition of bureaucracy—Bittner E. The Concept of Organisation. *Soc. Res.* 32, 239–255, 1965.
7. See Kumar K. *Prophecy and Progress*. Penguin, 1978.
8. For a world-system analysis and a comment on the neglect of this level within modern sociology, see Wallerstein I. A world system perspective on the social sciences. *Br. J. Sociol.* 27, 3, 343, 1976.
9. Following Bauman, I take Socialism to be the counter-culture of Capitalism and an integral part of its internal critique. Any state which proclaims itself socialist reifies the critique of a particular moment and acts as a barrier to further reform. See *Socialism: The Active Utopia*. Allen & Unwin, London, 1976.
10. See, for example, Fabrega H. Jr. and Silver D. *Illness and Shamanistic Curing in Zinacantan: An Ethnomedical Analysis*. Stanford Univ. Press, California, 1973.
11. Strong P. M. *The Ceremonial Order of the Clinic*, *op. cit.*
12. E.g. Totman R. *Social Causes of Illness*. Souvenir Press, London, 1979.
13. Strong P. M. Sociological Imperialism and the Profession of Medicine. *op. cit.*
14. Marx clearly had the country gentleman in mind when he drew up this list of daily activities in the communist utopia.
15. Strong P. Medical errands. In *Medical Encounters*. (Edited by Davis A. and Horobin G.). Croom Helm, London, 1977.
16. To say this is not to reify science, far from it. For my own point of view, I follow Mead who sees science as merely problem-solving activity and thus something which every human does, indeed every animal.
17. Strong P. *The Ceremonial Order of the Clinic*, *op. cit.*, contains some detailed analyses of medical paternalism and the justifications which may be made for this.
18. Goffman E. *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*. Penguin, Harmondsworth, 1971.
19. See Horobin G. Professional Mystery: The Maintenance of Charisma in General Practice. Mimeo, Aberdeen, 1979 and Totman, *op. cit.*
20. Abercrombie N. and Turner B. The dominant ideology thesis. *Br. J. Sociol.* 29, 2, 149, 1978.
21. Harré R. *Theories and Things*. Sheed & Ward, London, 1961.

## AUTHOR'S REJOINDER

I thank Geoff Rayner, Gerry Stimson and P. M. Strong for their generally helpful comments and for the obvious effort they have devoted to criticizing my work.

Partly because of the editor's time and space restrictions, and partly because of the complexities of the commentators' remarks, I will not try to respond in any detail now. I do want to emphasize that the present paper gave an overview of a larger project. I hope to offer a fuller account in due course. In this task, critical appraisal and new extensions of these perspectives are most welcome.

HOWARD WAITZKIN