**Adams, Vincanne. 2013. *Markets of sorrow, labors of faith. New Orleans in the wake of Katrina*. Durham, NC and London: Duke University Press. 228 pp. Pb.: €16.60. ISBN: 978-0-8223-5449-9.**

Most of us still remember the news coverage about Hurricane Katrina that devastated New Orleans in late August 2005. More than the destruction wrought by the hurricane itself, what perhaps astonished media audiences around the world (including the USA) most was what happened subsequently: how spectacularly the world's richest and most powerful nation failed, at virtually every level, to help one of its major cities to recover from the disaster. Much has been said and written about this failure, which was commonly ascribed to the Bush administration in particular and to government inefficiency more generally. Yet such critiques – though justified in many ways – overlook (or even reinforce) the larger and far more disturbing dynamics that made Katrina into the catastrophe that it was. Vincanne Adams' outstanding book fills this gap with her trenchant analysis not only of what *went* wrong in New Orleans, but also of what *is* wrong with neoliberal governance and 'market fundamentalism' more generally. In this sense, as she notes, 'this book is not about Hurricane Katrina' (p. 1), but rather is a brilliant ethnographic case study illustrating 'the inefficiencies of profit' that potentially affect us all in an increasingly neoliberal capitalist world.

Based on research carried out by Adams and her team between 2007 and 2011 in New Orleans, *Markets of sorrow* traces the trail of destruction left not by the hurricane itself (which only caused minor water damage in the city), but by a pattern where the federal government outsourced its responsibilities, such as maintaining levees or providing disaster relief, to private contractors. Both aspects of the catastrophe – the floods and the failed recovery – were thus entirely man-made (chapter 2). Recounting how especially the latter aspect impacted the lives of Katrina's victims, the ethnographic narrative of the subsequent chapters follows a well-designed arc, advancing the tragedy from sad to outrageous to hopeless, before providing ambiguous relief by focusing on the relative success of faith-based recovery programmes (chapters 6 and 7). Adams describes how the middle class was impoverished and the wealth of the rich erased (chapter 3) through the orchestrated failure of federally funded, but privately contracted, recovery projects like 'The Road Home Program' (chapter 4). Yet it was the poorest, weakest sections of society that were hit hardest by the 'regimes of dispossession' inherent in market-oriented relief work, pushing many into hopeless situations from which they could and would not recover (chapter 5), even when faith-based organisations finally did provide some effective help (chapter 6).

The strength of this book lies in the way Adams effortlessly manages to connect the tragic stories of individuals with a larger analysis of what she calls 'disaster capitalism' and an 'economy of affect'. Thus, disaster capitalism describes the process whereby private companies insert themselves as intermediaries between the government (which provides the funds) and its disaster-affected citizens, promising better and more efficient services than the governmental apparatus. However, their efficiency and accountability is limited to making profits, which requires them to be as inefficient intermediaries as possible – hence the 'inefficiency of profit'. This involves not only diverting (taxpayers') money meant for the needy, but also exploiting the free labour offered by volunteers. Both the suffering of victims and the compassion of volunteers become profitable economic resources for unscrupulous contractors like Halliburton, Blackwater or the Shaw Group. Far from being the win-win scenario portrayed by advocates of outsourcing government responsibilities to the private sector, such disaster capitalism ends up funnelling money intended for the poor upwards into a few rich, corporate hands, while instituting bureaucratic failure as a business model (p. 173). Since these arrangements are not widely known, the public interprets this failure as proof of government inefficiency, thus further legitimising the involvement of private firms.

It is difficult to imagine a more cynical arrangement than this. One hopes that Katrina is a particularly extreme case – an ideal type of disaster capitalism if you will – that does not necessarily reflect on humanitarian aid elsewhere. Still, Adams provides critical insights into the capitalist dimensions of 'humanitarian reason', which Didier Fassin's (2012) book so strangely ignored, and exposes some persistent myths of neoliberalism (most of all about the 'efficiency of the market') and the dire consequences of market-oriented governance. At the same time, *Markets of sorrow* is a respectful homage to both the victims and the volunteers affected by 'Katrina', who deserve their stories – and, more importantly, the truth about what happened – to be heard. This is public anthropology at its best, not only addressing core topics of our discipline but also illuminating social, economic and political issues that concern us all.

## Reference

Fassin, D. 2012. *Humanitarian reason. A moral history of the present*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

STEPHAN KLOOS
*Institute for Social Anthropology, Austrian Academy of Sciences (Austria)*

**Anghel, Remus Gabriel. 2013. *Romanians in Western Europe. Migration, status dilemmas and transnational connections*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books. 207 pp. Hb.: US$65. ISBN: 978-0-7391-7888.**

Through the lens of two case studies, this book analyses migration from Romania to Western Europe in recent decades, from incipient forms in the 1990s to becoming one of the largest migration waves within Europe. By comparing two different migration processes from origin to destination, incorporation and transnationalism, Anghel seeks to determine why migrants with better socioeconomic status perceived they had suffered a loss in the course of migration, whereas those with lower status perceived they had gained. The introduction offers a very good overview of the literature on Romanian migration, also browsing literature on other European circumstances. The author then presents his two case studies: German ethnics from Timişoara and their migration to Germany, and Romanian ethnics from Borşa and their irregular migration to Italy. In doing so he uses the extended case-study method, focusing intensively on a number of individual cases. Thus, the ethnography is sometimes shallow.

Given the title *Romanians in Western Europe*, I was initially sceptical and puzzled by the choice of starting with a case study based on a 'niche' category of migrants such as the German ethnics. One might also question the choice of bringing together these two case studies in the same analysis, as the first involves ethnic/political migration and the second economic migration. However, the validity of this choice becomes more apparent as the book progresses. First, Germany was the initial destination of Romanian migrants after 1989. A wealth of literature has shown that migration to Germany, of both German and other ethnics from Romania, was the catalyst for wider Romanian migration to Western Europe. Second, the author intends to break the image of Romanian migration restricted to Romanian (or Roma for that matter) ethnics, as if other ethnicities did not exist in the country.

The case studies highlight exquisitely how ethnicity is not a fixed category; once in Germany, many of the ethnic German migrants mentally remained very anchored in Romania. They regularly visited their former land; many of them married Romanian girls and brought them to their new home, thus ending up speaking more Romanian than when they were living there. The author shows how ethnic German migration diverges in several ways from the general assumption of transnational social fields/spaces. Another cliché of transnational migration that Anghel deconstructs is that of networks being ethnic. Once in Germany the migrants' networks mingle, as Romanians, Hungarians and Turks live closely together.

What is interesting in the second case study, more recognisable to the general audience as

Romanian migration to the West, is that the structural outcome of Italian laissez-faire led to much more closed networks, not only ethnic but even regional – see the author's very good example of the 'Zama Camp'. In most of the Italian cases there is a constantly evoked return to Romania, which remains only imagined or temporary. The absence of a facilitating investment context at home left the migrants with the almost exclusive possibility of investing in real estate. Anghel tries to explain the complicated rationale of the house boom due to migration and its link to local prestige. However, the author fails to demonstrate how policies of the receiving state impact on migrants' perception of status in Italy, only addressing them in his conclusions.

The initial question regarding the correlation between migrants' rights and their prestige finds its answer throughout the book and is well synthesised in the conclusion. Whereas the traits of the German minority migration were based on respectability abroad – as equals to Germans – the Romanians in Italy based their success on their reputation back home. The relatively better social capital that the German ethnics had did not help them attain better statuses; even though successful on the labour market, they suffered a loss of prestige. Romanian migrants to Italy juggled several jobs and built most things themselves, via networks. This reveals the ways migrants can construct their (own) social statuses. In many ways the book is a beautiful lesson in expectations: the story of German ethnics is largely one of high hopes brought down to earth, while the Romanians started from very little to achieve more.

RALUCA NAGY
*Leeds Metropolitan University (UK)*

**Bellwood, Peter. 2013. *First migrants. Ancient migration in global perspective*. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell. 326 pp. Pp.: €23.50. ISBN: 978-1-4051-8908-8.**

We have always been on the move, even before we were human beings. This is exactly what Peter Bellwood shows us in the 300 pages of his book. Throughout the ten chapters the author takes us along our archaic and sapiens ancestors in their movements over the entire globe. His main hypothesis is that migration played a central role in human evolution and that humanity has been shaped to a very large extent by mobility. The author looks at changes in language, material culture and biology, searching for supporting evidence of human mobilities. In doing so, he applies an interdisciplinary approach that combines insights from several disciplines (mainly Archaeology, Comparative Linguistic, Genetics and Anthropology), while arguing continuously against strong anti-migrationist views of human prehistory.

First migrations of the genus *Homo* (including ourselves) during the Palaeolithic are covered in chapters 3 to 5. Theories about the geographical origin of our ancestors and ourselves – modern *Homo sapiens* – as well as first expansions both within and beyond Africa are laid out in chapter 3. Once all connected mainland was inhabited, Homos' epic story continued beyond the sea into the Pacific and America (chapter 4). Ancestral modern humans performed impressive migrations, reaching and settling on all continents except for Antarctica. Migrations by Palaeolithic hunter-gatherers have been in geographical extent the greatest in prehistoric times and strongly influenced by climatic conditions as the postglacial period shows (chapter 5).

Bellwood gives great importance to the impact food production rather than just foraging had on ancient migration, and he structures the whole book accordingly. He labels the context-specific features of the ability to produce food 'food production complex', particularly regarding associated crops and domesticated animals. Since Neolithic times, when food production complexes first appeared, movement of populations often coincided with demographic increases resulting from the development of food production complexes.

Chapters 6 to 9 focus on the Neolithic period and the different food production complexes on Earth. The first and most important one, the Fertile Crescent Food production complex originated in the Levant and Anatolia, where crops

and animals were first domesticated. As the author states, 'population spreads [associated with the Fertile Crescent Food production complex] that occurred between 6500 and 2000 BC led to distributions of languages, genes, and economic lifestyles from Gibraltar to Bangladesh, and North Africa to Scandinavia, that still underpin the Western World as we know it today' (p. 173).

Equally important, the East Asian and Western Oceania food production complex (7000 to 4500 BC), based on rice, millet and pigs, can be traced back to the Yellow and Yangzi basins in what is now central China (chapter 8). Its associated Neolithic populations spread in a three-way expansion throughout Southern China and mainland Southeast Asia reaching India; into the Pacific through Island Southeast Asia; and northwards to Korea and Northeast Asia. This means that today almost half of the world's population owes a good part of its origin to the expansion of this food production complex.

Africa and America developed intensive food production systems only several millennia later than parallel developments in the Fertile Crescent and East Asia (chapter 9). Africa's first firmly attested food production was introduced from the Levant around 6000 BC. Similar to Africa, the American food production complex lacked domesticated indigenous animals. Mesoamerica and the Andes were the two main foci of early domestication in the continent and the spread of maize farming the most remarkable feature of this complex.

This book results from Bellwood's remarkable effort to compile references, studies, evidence and data from archaeological sites, while analysing all that material with migration in mind. This way he can assess the great importance of migration in human history and in creating human patterns of diversity. His multidisciplinary approach is probably the book's main strength. Although this makes for an engaging book, it is not an easy read – which is not surprising given the time frame and geographical span the author covers. First chapters are particularly harder to approach due to the myriad hypotheses presented. As the time span shortens, more solid evidence becomes available and the argument flows more smoothly. The reader is in the end rewarded with a novel, refreshing perspective on human mobility in prehistoric times.

DIANA MATA-CODESAL
*University of Deusto (Spain)*

**Bernal, Victoria and Inderpal Grewal (eds.) 2014. *Theorizing NGOs: states, feminisms, and neoliberalism* (Next Wave: New Directions in Women's Studies). Durham, NC and London: Duke University Press. 392 pp. Pb.: US$22.46. ISBN: 978-0822355656.**

At a time when non-governmental organisations (NGOs) have taken over much of the public discourse across the world on women's welfare, *Theorizing NGOs* offers timely and insightful perspectives on the intersection between NGOs, women's experiences of NGOs and feminism across the world. Bringing together scholarly writings on women's experiences with NGOs from different parts of the globe is definitely one of the highlights of the volume. In the well-crafted introduction, Inderpal Grewal and Victoria Bernal argue that the practical workings of NGOs are closely related to the logics of states. They rightly suggest that NGOs should be studied as entrenched within 'developmental regimes and programs of social welfare' as well as 'neoliberal articulations of productivity, entrepreneurship and empowerment' (p. 10). In these changing interactions between NGOs and states, new kinds of female and feminist subjectivities emerge. Therein lies the focus of this volume.

The 11 chapters are divided across three themes. The first part, 'NGOs beyond Success or Failure', brings out the complex dynamics of the relationship between NGOs, development discourses, statemaking processes and notions of women's empowerment. The chapters in this section, by Elissa Helms, Lauren Leve and Aradhana Sharma, show how these relationships produce unintended consequences for women's activism. Leve, for instance shows that NGO work in

women's education in rural Nepal led to those women taking up Maoism rather than becoming neoliberal subjects. Sharma, through her research of Mahila Samakhya, a state–NGO partnership in rural India, argues that even though the aim was to empower women in a neoliberal sense, Mahila Samakhya ended up reproducing existing social hierarchies. At the same time, it also gave rise to certain kinds of rights-based politics.

The four contributions that make the second section on 'Postcolonial Neoliberalisms and the NGO Form' show how NGOs, despite aiming at social change, exacerbate existing divides (North–South, rural–urban, elite–subaltern) and reinforce hierarchies of gender and class. Lamia Karim, for example, shows how microcredit in Bangladesh, touted as the panacea to poverty, ends up further strengthening unequal gender relations. Far from making them neoliberal entrepreneurs, microcredit pulls poor women into a rural moral economy where failure to repay the debt results in humiliation and loss of assets. In her chapter LeeRay M. Costa shows how women's NGOs in Thailand function as elite spaces to which rural and subaltern women have little access. And Kathleen O'Reilly's text about the NGO boom in northern India and women's participation argues that despite their limitations, development policies such as participation open up spaces for women's agency.

Part three 'Feminist Social Movements and NGOs' brings forth debates on the relationship between feminisms and NGOs. What comes across from the four contributions is that transnational NGOs have taken a crucial role in feminist politics, creating both opportunities as well as constraints for feminists. In her chapter Sabine Lang argues that the co-option of feminist politics by the European Union represents a loss of feminism's radical edge. Saida Hodžić however sees the rise of NGOs as having offered different productive possibilities for feminist politics. Likewise, Sonia Alvarez shows that the feminist work pursued through NGOs in Latin America has opened up new avenues of agency and activism. So, on the one hand, NGOs' reliance on states and donors and their institutionalisation of feminism creates problems for women's movements, while on the other hand NGOs might still create spaces for feminist activism. As such, NGOs become important sites of struggle for feminists. The editors suggest in the conclusion that feminists have an ongoing stake in strategically engaging with NGOs and at the same time continuing to critique them.

Grewal and Bernal's achievement is to demonstrate, both in the introduction and in the selection of essays, how gender comes to acquire centrality in the process of NGOisation. They point out that the NGOs themselves become part of the processes that produce women as diverse gendered subjects, and feminists too are produced by these very processes. Further, their argument about the gendered processes of NGOisation being closely linked to the state and mimicking its bureaucratic rationalities has crucial implications not just for feminist scholarship and politics, but for those studying the changing nature of states under neoliberalism and globalisation. This volume is a must read for anyone interested in gender and development, and in the anthropology of the state.

LIPIKA KAMRA
*University of Oxford (UK)*

**Bolten, Catherine. 2012. *I did it to save my life. Love and survival in Sierra Leone*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press. 296 pp. Pb.: US$29.95. ISBN: 978-0520273795.**

*I did it to save my life* sheds light on the meaning of personal ties in the everyday struggle for survival of people whose lifeworlds are marked by chronic crisis and violence. From the perspective of one specific place that played a crucial role during the decade of civil war in Sierra Leone and the survival stories of seven individuals, Bolten creates an intimate portrait of the strategies people deploy to encounter the damaging forces that are at play in war and to protect their social worlds from collapsing. The seven people whose stories form the heart of the book come from various backgrounds: a soldier, a former RUF rebel, a

student, a trader, an evangelist, a father and a politician, each with very different accounts of how they experienced the war and its aftermath. While they all represent very different struggles, ideals and worldviews, they are connected through their love for the city of Makeni, a place that was of strategic importance and therefore suffered abuse from the different factions involved in the conflict. Their stories are also connected by the centrality of social relationships and emotional ties in surviving the war.

The main aim of the book is to rethink common conceptualisations of conflict that see war and emotionality as separate phenomena. Bolten stresses the importance of understanding the role of emotions in everyday experiences of conflict. In the context of Makeni and the seven stories she focuses on, the concept of love proves to play an essential role. Rather than stylising love as a romantic sentiment, she emphasises the importance of understanding love as a cultural practice, as an intersubjective web of relationships that constantly spins its threads towards a balance of reciprocity. In Sierra Leone, Bolt holds, people *do* rather than *feel* love. It is the work people put into nurturing each other and into keeping each other alive. As the stories surrounding Makeni show, love shouldn't be romanticised. To enable survival during times of crisis and chronic uncertainty, people are forced to constantly manipulate their relationships to achieve the best possible outcomes for themselves and their close ones, creating an atmosphere of suspicion and a constant fear of betrayal. What is more, because emotional ties play such a crucial role in Sierra Leone, they are also open to political abuse. Bolten shows how the very roots of the conflict can be traced back to the cultural practice of love. She argues that the RUF gained momentum among inhabitants of Makeni by playing into these narratives, using love as a recruitment strategy. This only worked, however, because people felt that the state had stopped looking after them. This comes to the fore in the story of Kadiatu, a trader, who turned towards the RUF because she felt that the government had stopped loving the people of Makeni. She interprets the government's fatal attacks on the city during the end of the occupation and its refusal to invest in infrastructure and trading as a refusal by the state to live up to its responsibility to love and nurture its citizens in equal terms. In Kadiatu's reading of the conflict, the government didn't leave her with any other choice but to cut losses with her loyalty to the nation and look for better relationships that allowed her and her children to survive.

Whether in politics or people's everyday lives, love appears throughout the book as a complex web of relationships, a continuous balancing act between the will to utilise emotional ties in order to survive and the danger of pushing it too far and thereby losing one's standing in the world. By creating a tapestry of experiences, voices and perspectives, Bolten provides a nuanced image of the seemingly banal steps people take in times of hardship, which allow them to maintain or recreate their social worlds. The seven individual stories of survival are the book's strongest asset. While some stories, particularly the story of the evangelist, the student and the trader, are successful in conveying the depth of experiences of love and survival in Makeni, others remain somewhat opaque and hidden under Bolten's own readings of their accounts. As a result, the concept of love is often spoken about by the author rather than the narrators themselves. However such a balance between words and lives is hard to achieve and it has haunted many ethnographies based on life stories. In the end this does not take away from the richness of Bolten's ethnography and the book's accomplishment in highlighting the importance of emotional ties in times of conflict.

ANNIKA LEMS
*Swinburne Institute for Social Research, Swinburne University, Melbourne (Australia)*

**Coe, Cati. 2013. *The scattered family: parenting, African migrants, and global inequality*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press. 256 pp. Pb.: US$21.91. ISBN: 978-0-226-07238-8.**

In her ethnography Cati Coe explores how Ghanaian transmigrants living in the USA or United Kingdom and their children fostered by relatives in Ghana adapt to being 'scattered'

transnational families, that is, families dispersed between multiple nations. Based on interviews with parents abroad and children in Ghana, Coe's main intervention is complicating the transnational literature that finds that lack of parent–child co-presence disrupts expectations of family life, breeding conflict and tensions that negatively impact transmigrants' children.

While acknowledging that some children find separation from parent(s) as disruptive, Coe's work goes further to demonstrate how for many children, parents' provisions of remittances and gifts – made possible through migration – are expressions of affection and parental obligation, emotional depth and closeness. Rather than an imperfect replacement for familial co-presence, many of these children understand transmigration as allowing their parents to be 'good' parents. Indeed, Coe writes, 'to the extent that a parent's migration leads to better support for a child, a migrant parent can be a better parent than one who lives in Ghana' (p. 181). In this, Coe's work adds empirical evidence to theorisations on the materiality of care and provider love.

This less disruptive reception to parents' migration is the result of what Coe terms a Ghanaian repertoire, or rather, cultural resources and frameworks through which Ghanaians adapt to – in this case – parent–child separation. Repertoire is much like habitus, a set of perceptions, dispositions and actions that predispose a person to act in particular ways, but adaptive to unprecedented situations. Unlike habitus, however, Coe's use of repertoire signals a multiplicity of knowledge, practices and beliefs; repertoires tend to be more easily visible and, therefore, discussed among its practitioners. These factors render repertoires open to historical analysis and explorations of changes over time (pp. 14–29).

Coe traces how a Ghanaian repertoire of contemporary transnational parenting has been produced and negotiated historically in the context of previous economic instability in Ghana and subsequent internal or international economic migration, as well as kinship practices of fostering the children of migratory parents. This opens up culturally appropriate possibilities on which parents can draw when they migrate. This repertoire has changed, however, producing tensions and conflicts for transmigrants and their children in Ghana. As international migrants, transmigrants are socially positioned such that, traditionally, they would raise their children and foster-*in* the children of others. Within the context of strict immigration laws, poor working wages abroad and concerns for children's development outside of Ghana, transmigrants find themselves fostering-*out* their children to relatives in Ghana. This happens at a time when novel middle-class ideals of nuclear families increasingly influence Ghanaian expectations of kinship practices, critiquing fosterage as second-best or a safety net for families in crisis. Tensions subsequently arise as parents attempt to foster-out their children into other middle-class, urban families or seek out other novel care practices (e.g. commercial arrangements) that disrupt familial reciprocity and wealth flows.

Analysing the ways in which Ghanaians interact with those they meet abroad and how those who remain in Ghana speak of transmigrants, Coe illustrates how this repertoire of migration and kinship is a cultural pattern to which transmigrants *can* turn when confronted with barriers to raising one's children. It is not, however, the preferred option. Moreover, while most children find separation from parents to be beneficial, many also do not find it ideal. Indeed, Coe's strongest analyses are those of children's interviews in which she traces the finely nuanced and complicated tensions in children's narratives.

The theoretical arguments of Coe's work are weighted in her introduction and conclusion, with the middle chapters fleshing out the details of a contemporary Ghanaian repertoire for transmigrant parenting. Her work also adds to the literatures on migratory motivations beyond economics (e.g. Ghanaian-American children migrating to Ghana for education), and the transnational lives of whole families, not just transmigrants. My two critiques are slight. The first Coe recognises: this work relies heavily on interviews with little participant-observation to enrich analyses. While discourse is habitual and conventional, revealing what people think is appropriate to reveal to themselves and others (p. 35), oftentimes actions belie discourse. Finally,

while ethnographically rich and well situated within the literature, this work offers an interesting and important case study rather than a novel anthropological approach to analysing transnational parenting. These minor critiques aside, Cati Coe's *The scattered family* is a meticulously researched and analysed ethnography detailing the many ways Ghanaian families adapt historical kinship practices to approach contemporary transnational parenting.

CHELSEA CORMIER McSWIGGIN
*Brown University (USA)*

**Copans, Jean. 2014. *Georges Balandier. Un anthropologue en première ligne*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France. 313 pp. Pb.: €29. ISBN: 978-2130607670.**

Originally Jean Copans (born 1942) had wanted to write a rather different book about his former teacher Georges Balandier (born 1920), who is introduced as 'an anthropologist in the front line' in its title. He had envisaged devoting two thirds to an analysis and evaluation of his writings and one third to a sociologically informed account of the wider context and impact of Balandier's work. It is not clear why Copans more or less gave up the second aim of his project. It is also noteworthy that although he informs us that at times he was very close to Balandier when writing this book, he does not indicate how this affected his work.

However, in the course of writing Copans still had to refer to some of the conditions that influenced Balandier's publications and their reception. Depending on the knowledge that readers already possess, his fragmentary and too often rather allusive treatment of this context may require some effort to understand correctly. Unfortunately in his footnotes Copans is more inclined to indulge in personal reminiscences than to provide helpful additional information. He seems to presuppose a reader who not only knows much about the recent history of France and its (former) colonies, but also about (French) academic developments during his lifetime, although at times he appears to realise that some explicit comments are necessary, at least for another generation. A serious drawback is the absence of any index. A list of abbreviations and their meaning would also have been desirable in view of the many institutional acronyms.

Balandier's work can be divided according to three stages in his career, but retrospective publications and revisions of and additions to new editions complicate such an analysis considerably. Although Copans claims to have been reading Balandier's publications assiduously ever since 1963, for the preparation of the present book he felt compelled to read much of his work again, but admits that he was still left with much uncertainty with regard to the finer details of his current interpretation. There is no comprehensive bibliography of Balandier's approximately 400 separate publications. The 100 titles that Copans eventually consulted are listed thematically at the end of the book, 40 of which are referred to regularly in the main text.

Between 1946 and 1955 Balandier conducted research in French colonies in West and Central Africa, much of which found its way to his well-known and often-translated *Sociologie actuelle de l'Afrique noire.* (The English translation of its title *The Sociology of Black Africa* lacks the stress on Balandier's innovative approach to modern conditions.) This book recognised African prophetic movements as an autonomous indigenous response to colonial subjugation, topics that had been neglected by French ethnologists until then. From 1955 until his retirement in 1985, Balandier occupied various important positions in institutions for advanced higher education and for academic and applied social research in tropical Africa. In 1962 he was also appointed to a chair of sociology at the Sorbonne university. His kind of anthropology was very different from the then prevalent structuralism, but he also kept his distance from neo-Marxist approaches that several of his former students (Augé, Meillassoux, Terray) adhered to. Turning away from a preoccupation with Third World problems, Balandier came to emphasise the importance of political anthropology as fundamental to any social analysis. Politics is for him the 'order of orders'. After 1985, Balandier became

interested in new (or newly named) phenomena in an increasingly globalised world, such as digitalised forms of communication, on which he wrote in a non-academic way.

Copans is by no means uncritical in his evaluation of Balandier's importance. He deplores that Balandier never applied his political anthropology to the new post-colonial African states. He also notes a lack of interest in an explicit methodology for the determination of what one is exactly going to investigate and how one can best represent one's empirical research data, problems that characterise much of contemporary (French) social science practice. Such criticism is kept in balance in Copans's summing up assessments of his work that culminate in his statement that the work of Balandier can help us achieve intellectual freedom as his thought lacks any trace of dogmatism (p. 13). However this may be, this reviewer also found in Copans's book many other good reasons for having a closer look at different aspects of Balandier's work than those with which he was already familiar.

JAN DE WOLF
*Utrecht University (The Netherlands)*

**de Munck, Victor and Ljupcho Risteski. 2013. *Macedonia: the political, social, economic and cultural foundations of a Balkan state*. London: I. B. Tauris. 256 pp. Hb.: US$67.55. ISBN: 978-1848859364.**

This volume, which represents the most recent contribution to the underdeveloped field of Macedonian anthropology, achieves a lot in spite of failing to live up to its overambitious title. Even its 12 chapters spread over 300 pages cannot cover every aspect promised in the title. What is missing in particular is the economic analysis, since there is no single chapter that could classify as a work of economic anthropology besides some background information provided by contributors on the general economic setting. Nevertheless, this collection of essays contributes in significant ways towards enriching the scarce English language literature on Macedonia. Particularly welcomed is the inclusion of essays that deal with Turks and Roma of Macedonia, which often tend to fall outside researchers' attention usually dominated by the highly politicised inter-ethnic relations of the two largest ethnic groups in the country, Albanians and Macedonians.

The overall excellence of individual chapters is dented by the two contributions of one of the editors Victor C. de Munck, who participates in two different chapters as co-author. One finds it difficult to accept the generalisations, even stereotyping, used in these contributions that rush through broad topics such as gender and inter-ethnic relations. However, these chapters are balanced by excellent contributions coming from Victor Friedman, Galina Oustinova-Stjepanović, Rozita Dimova, Ilka Thiesen, Burcu Akan Elis and Anastasia Karakasidou, which make the volume more than a valuable resource for anthropological scholarship.

Using himself and the events that unwrapped around him recently and throughout his long academic career, Friedman manages to unpack several complex aspects of the politicised Macedonian identity and involvement of academics in these power struggles that are supposedly outside the academic realm. Friedman uses the concept of 'erasure' to seize the Bulgarian and in particular Greek policy aimed against the existence of multilinguism, multiculturalism and specifically against Macedonian identity both internally and internationally. In her contribution, Karakasidou offers an account of environmental depletion as an overarching problem, proving that nationalism should not be the sole concern for anthropologists and the people they study. Thiessen focuses on the role of symbolic borders central for the identity formation of Macedonians in times of great uncertainty. Her account, rich in ethnographic detail, allows us to see these processes from the everyday perspective, thus enriching the analysis of otherwise distant and cursory view that social scientists usually produce for international and EU policymakers. Even if one book chapter cannot overcome the huge gap in the literature, Ellis' bold attempt to offer a comprehensive picture of the situation in which the Turkish minority finds itself in present-day Macedonia commands respect. The author discusses

the shift of fortunes of the Turkish minority providing the historical context, discussing recent political entanglements of Macedonian ethnopolitics and the creation and maintenance of transnational links. Another little gem in this volume is Oustinova-Stjepanovic's chapter on Roma quest for 'true' spirituality. Elegantly interweaving elements of theory, historical accounts and ethnography, this rich and highly informative contribution expands the narrow regional or national focus towards the field of post-colonial studies and wider comparative frameworks. In her contribution, Dimova traces the social, political and demographic changes in Kumanovo through an analysis of urban spatiality, distribution, movement and the transformation of residential areas and public space in this little town. This analysis, supported by archival and historical data and conflicting memories of Kumanovo residents, allows Dimova to cut through the complexity of radical social, political and economic changes, or ruptures as she describes them.

Further contributions to the volume authored by Trpeski on the development of the grotesque Macedonian nationalism, Schubert on the clash of patriarchal values and modernity, Plaut on the manipulation of the plight of Roma by NGOs and politicians alike, and Schwartz on the impact of NGOs for raising environmental concerns in the border area with mixed population, offer additional valuable material for students of Macedonia and those interested in this turbulent region more broadly. Overall, the volume is a welcome contribution to the rather neglected field of Macedonian studies, and its combination of veterans and younger anthropologists yielded remarkable results.

GORAN IANEV
*'Sts Cyril and Methodius' University, Skopje (Macedonia)*

**Fedele, Anna. 2013. *Looking for Mary Magdalene: alternative pilgrimage and ritual creativity at Catholic shrines in France*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. xii + 320 pp. Pb.: US$36.95. ISBN: 978-0-19-9898420-8.**

Anna Fedele's text, *Looking for Mary Magdalene*, invites the reader on a pilgrimage of pilgrimages. Each chapter of the book, winner of an American Academy of Religion Award for Excellence, delightfully leads the reader through the south of France as neo-pagan pilgrims move between shrines linked to Mary Magdalene's life. As Fedele traces the experiences of the sojourners, she constructs a compelling case that creativity is a core component of ritual.

Fedele's data are drawn from more than three years of fieldwork accompanying three unique, unconnected, alternative pilgrimages through the shrines of Mary Magdalene. The groups vary in leadership, class, composition, origin and theology. Most importantly the groups vary in their adherence to rituals. One all-female group has structured rituals around femininity, menstruation and the earth. Another group, led by a neo-shaman, relies on energy harnessing techniques. The final group, headed by a Jungian psychotherapist, has no explicit rituals. Yet, they are all rich examples of the constant ritual negotiation that occurs in contemporary spirituality.

Without diminishing their diversity, Fedele successfully identifies a few central similarities among the groups. They are all attracted to Mary Magdalene as a feminine force, a healer and a guide. Magdalene is used to challenge patriarchal religion and celebrate the sacredness of sexuality and femininity. Also, energy is the guiding principle and arbiter of the pilgrims' experiences. Fedele shows how unique rituals are invented around these ideas and how these rituals create meaning for the pilgrims.

Fedele's work of expertly excavating pilgrims' ritual creativity challenges anthropologists and religious studies scholars to consider ritual as something in process, negotiated and always changing. Rituals must be studied not merely as repetitive acts, but with a hermeneutic that privileges life narratives. After one particular ritual, the pilgrims' descriptions were seemingly incongruent with one another, as if they had all performed different rituals. In effect, they had. Ritual is not only the gestures and acts performed, but more importantly it is the significance of these acts in conjunction with life narratives. Part of ritual creativity is the syncretism of combining or subverting elements from

multiple traditions (Catholicism, Protestantism, Indigenous and Feminist traditions). But even the borrowing of other traditions is usually part of a larger life narrative, for example, one's discontent with the Catholic Church. Ritual creativity is a process of reflexivity that adapts acts, gestures and objects to make sense of, transform and challenge past, present and future life experiences. This discussion could have been enriched with broader consideration of whether or not the claims about ritual creativity could be extended to all new and/or traditional religious movements. Fedele faintly acknowledges the possibility that all ritual is creatively negotiated, but she does not step away from her specific pilgrims for very long.

Fedele's analytical acuity is most evident in her parsing of rituals of menstruation. Two of the groups link Mary Magdalene closely to menstrual blood. By creating rituals around menstrual blood the pilgrims modify the meaning of menstruation. Such rituals are an opportunity for healing, empowerment and a privileging of the body. Whatever the original intent of the ritual, it was transformed by each pilgrim in light of their life narrative. Very often it was used to heal wounds related to sexuality, sexual relationships, reproduction or religion. Fedele's own experiences, a sort of sensuous scholarship, could have bolstered this account. She accompanied these pilgrims, took part in their rituals, and partook of menstrual blood. She writes a few brief notes of her discomfort during the blood rituals but nothing more. In a text filled with rich and sympathetic characters, the brevity and limited engagement of her own experience is detached and incohesive.

Fedele's chapter on energy may be the most important contribution of this book. The pilgrims understand the world as constituted by energy. Energy is the arbiter and goal of every ritual. Energy techniques are invoked to increase positive energy or disencumber those laden with heavy energy. Her idea of 'energy grammar', although the phrase only shows up once, is helpful and should endure as an analytical frame (p. 272). Energy is increasingly the discourse of religious experience and Fedele is correct to illuminate this from the pilgrims' narratives.

It is Fedele's deft handling of her subjects that sets this book apart. The text refreshingly avoids inundating the data with excessive theory. Mostly, Fedele relies on themes that emerge through her expert curating of the materials. Her descriptive abilities enliven the subjects and allow the subjects' voices to be clearly heard. This text is a comprehensive example of remarkable and revealing ethnography. Fedele is extraordinarily careful and sensitive in her claims and never overextends her findings. The claims are never pushed much beyond what they mean for these particular pilgrims. But perhaps they should be extended. The work here outpaces many works in religious studies and provides important, concrete evidence that more work must be done exploring ritual creativity and energy.

NATHANAEL J. HOMEWOOD
*Rice University (USA)*

**Fedele, Anna and Kim Knibbe. 2013. *Gender and power in contemporary spirituality. Ethnographic approaches*. Routledge Studies in Religion. London: Routledge. 238 pp. Hb.: US$125.00. ISBN: 978-0-415-65947-5.**

What do people mean when they call themselves spiritual? In analytical terms, is 'spirituality' indeed something that can be distinguished from 'religion'? Are the practices developed by contemporary spirituality as empowering as its advocates claim? What roles do gender and power have in contemporary spiritual groups? These are some of the questions that Fedele and Knibbe address in the introduction to this edited volume that appeared in the Routledge Studies in Religion series.

This book marks a turning point in research on gender, power and spirituality, and should be required reading for anyone interested in the changing terrain of contemporary religiosity. It comprises 11 case studies besides the introduction, with ethnographic research from a wide variety of places such as Germany, Mexico, France, The Netherlands and Portugal. Against the common

reading of spirituality as a substantially different phenomenon than religion, and going beyond the dualistic thinking that has informed much previous research in the field, Fedele and Knibbe prove the relevance of thinking in terms of continuities. Referring to Talal Asad's work on the understanding of the secular, the editors point out that while 'Asad has argued that the secular can be thought of only in reference to religion; similarly, "spirituality" seems to be inextricably linked to "religion"' (p. 4). They stress the analytical need to transcend the dichotomic view of religion/spirituality by paying more attention to the complex interplay between the two. Several chapters follow up in this vein, exploring their relationship in concrete contexts: Eugenia Roussou's contribution on Greece reminds us that religion and spirituality are not always separate endeavours from the participants' point of view; Anna Fedele's chapter on Mary Magdalene pilgrimages in the south of France shows that there is 'not only rupture but also a striking continuity between these pilgrims' spirituality and vernacular devotion to the Virgin Mary, past and present' (p. 97). Asa Trulsson's chapter on goddess-oriented groups follows in the same vein, emphasising the similarity between spirituality and lived religion.

Fedele and Knibbe's work also challenges mainstream discourses on spirituality (emic and academic as well) that characterise the 'spiritual revolution' as an egalitarian, non-authoritative and empowering movement that offers its followers the ability to resist and counteract the *devils* of a patriarchal and neoliberal society. According to such discourses, this new spirituality is characterised by the freedom of spiritual practitioners, who theoretically do not rely on external sources of power (as traditional religious followers are caricatured as doing) but on their 'inner' self, which is perceived as a 'free-floating' entity able to make *free* choices. However, as the excellent chapter by Hegner on urban witchcraft in Berlin shows, 'this approach often ignores the fact that the self, and thus the internal authority, is in and of itself a product of social configurations and thus the interplay of different external authorities' (p. 143). Knibbe's chapter on the spiritual milieu in The Netherlands develops a profound critique of those approaches that are blind to power issues; drawing on Bourdieu and Foucault, Knibbe argues that power works 'through the exercise of all kinds of subtle cultural scripts that are ultimately embodied in such a way that they structure the apprehension of the world, diffusing power' (p. 191). Further contributions by Viola Teisenhoffer on Umbanda practitioners in Paris, Monica Cornejo on Soka Gakkai Buddhists in Spain and Rachel Werczberger on a Jewish spiritual renewal community in Israel offer convincing illustrations of the subtle negotiations and creative tensions between authority and submission in these settings.

The book also contests those approaches that conceive of spiritual practitioners as 'passive victims of the neoliberal society' (p. 19) or of spirituality as 'a technique of pastoral power in the Foucauldian sense' (p. 14). Spiritual practices *per se* are neither empowering nor disempowering, as this depends on what people do with these spiritual practices in their specific situations. Likewise, if it is true that in terms of gender there is not a single 'empowering recipe' and that 'a discourse of empowerment for some women means the disempowerment of another group of women' (p. 189), it is also apparent that contemporary spirituality offers a creative source from and through which new models of femininity and masculinity emerge, as the chapters by Ethan P. Sharp, Inês Lourenço or Ehler Voss show.

In conclusion, this book expands existing research in the field of contemporary spirituality in new and exciting directions. The combination of rich ethnography and a theory-informed perspective that critically engages with the literature in the field makes for a lucid and insightful volume.

MAR GRIERA
*Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona (Spain)*

**Geismar, Haidy. 2013. *Treasured possessions. Indigenous interventions into cultural and intellectual property.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press. 328 pp. Pb.: US$20.64. ISBN: 978-0-8223-5427-7.**

The Pacific is known for its legacy of interconnection. In her impressively detailed book, Geismar

foregrounds a different form of connection. Throughout the region, people 'explore the possibility of genuine alternatives to the global policies and concepts that circumscribe their lives' (p. ix). They integrate cultural and intellectual property (IP) into the construction of identities and sovereignties and do so because 'they wisely perceive that recognition of their identity is mapped onto their power to mobilize and control resources' (p. 19). However, they sometimes fail to acknowledge that they have many things to teach each other. Geismar encourages us – Pacific islanders in particular – to learn from the 'divergent ways' in which people throughout the whole region 'work to similar ends' (p. x).

The book draws its substance from a comparison of the ways in which global and indigenous discourses about cultural and intellectual property are articulated in two Pacific nations, both central within the Pacific, but marginal worldwide. These are Vanuatu, which became an independent state in 1980 and where more than 95% of the population is indigenous, and New Zealand, a 'bicultural' settler state where the indigenous population is around 15%. They were selected not only because of their different histories, but also because they are both unique in the way they place indigenous people and discourses of indigeneity at the centre of projects and debates about national development. From this vantage point and through this method, the book ambitiously weaves Pacific ethnography, legal anthropology, material culture studies, museum studies and literature on indigenous rights, and it creatively rethinks indigeneity, property, sovereignty and the entitlements of culture.

Each chapter focuses on one aspect of this process of indigenisation. Chapter two prepares the ground for this comparison through a presentation of local histories. Chapter three sketches the structure of the comparison through an exploration of the construction of indigenous identity and law in each location. Geismar argues that these are co-produced – with sui generis laws being a case in point – and that they represent complementary frameworks for such provincialising projects. Chapter four discusses the development of copyright legislation in Vanuatu, noting the multiple understandings of law and the well-articulated and efficacious analogy between copyright and ceremonially sanctioned entitlements in the graded societies of North Central Vanuatu. Islanders, she points out, cleverly manoeuvre between different legal systems in order to consolidate their own political and economic interests. Chapter five centres on the emergence of the trademark law and Māori trademarks in New Zealand. Although indigenous value and colonial law also frame this development, as it happens in Vanuatu, the outcomes are different: failures of the state's implementation of this legal category have led to disappointment and, consequently, uncertainty about the power of indigenous IP to become a viable economic template for the indigenous population. From chapter six onwards, the focus is on cultural property, indigenous models of property (*kastom* and *taonga*) and the indigenisation of the market and the national economy. Chapter six highlights the significant role indigenous museums play in the conceptualisation of culture as property. The next two chapters focus on indigenous interventions into the commodification of culture and on the promotion of alternative grounds for commodity exchange. Chapter seven presents Māori activism in the auction marketplace and considers complexities in the production of value of treasured possessions. Chapter eight examines the revitalisation of traditional economy in Vanuatu through the Pig Bank Project and demonstrates how indigenous values can be efficaciously incorporated into all exchanges.

This book argues that this form of indigenisation is a kind of provincialisation rather than a dramatic attempt to replace one system with another, radically different system. The province occupies a paradoxical position: it emulates the centre and, concurrently, cultivates its independence from the centre; it does not opt for rupture, but incessantly re-centres the relation between the global and the local. The result is 'much more radical', for 'the conduit of authority, the rationale of sovereignty, and the obligations of the market are channelled in different directions, according to different values, benefitting different people' (p. 211). By demonstrating that in Vanuatu and New Zealand '(indigenous) culture is not the

alternative to the market, but increasingly a condition for its existence' (p. 213), Geismar successfully provincialises the anthropology of property. However, the last lines – where she pessimistically reflects on the state's willingness to recognise indigenous people's ability and right to place key resources in a framework of their own making – cast a shadow on the enthusiasm the book draws on and, simultaneously, generates.

MAGDALENA CRĂCIUN
*University College London (UK)*

**Gellner, David N. 2013. *Borderland lives in northern South Asia*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press. 320 pp. Pb.: US$20.50. ISBN: 978-0822355564.**

This collection of articles by mostly young scholars engaged in exploring a region that the editor claims can be given a new label, 'Northern South Asia', aims to stimulate theoretical discussions on 'borders' as a conceptual and heuristic tool of analysis. It also aims to provide empirical data on a region where this concept has not been dealt with as copiously as in Europe and the USA. The most interesting aspect of the volume lies in the variety and novelty of border situations yielded by this region and its diversity in terms of the nature of borders: pre-modern, modern, soft, hard, thinly or thickly populated and also geological, like mountainous or watery, plain or rugged etc. The dominance of India as a major geopolitical factor in the lives of the smaller states – Bhutan, Nepal and Bangladesh – the chequered history of changing political fortunes as well as the historical shifting and redrawing of borders run through all the contributions to this volume. Three major political lines were drawn here: the MacMohan line (on the North-East), the Radcliffe line (dividing India and Pakistan) and the perpetually contested Kashmir line.

The ways in which the 'border' has been interpreted and analysed in terms of the technologies of its comprehension and existence (military powers, physical boundaries, mental and cognitive perceptions, maps and censuses, concessions and coercion) bring out the diffuseness and improbability of converting an abstract entity into a comprehensible and 'effective' reality. They also make apparent the incongruous relationship between the state (in itself a shadowy construct) and the people it aspires to call its own. The overall theoretical emphasis is thus on a historical and processual approach, sceptical about taking the relationship between people, places and cultures as timeless and essentialist, or in other words an intellectual opposition to 'sedentarist metaphysics' (p. 14).

As aptly discussed in these chapters, not all borders are geopolitical; religion and culture play equally important roles in dividing and uniting people. The people of Kargil, for example (Gupta), give more allegiance to their Indian identity than their religious (Shia) identity, unlike neighbouring Kashmir valley where religion comes up as primary. The people of Bangladesh again are vacillating between religion and language in different phases of the drawing and re-drawing of their borders.

Several contributions (Hausner and Sharma, Evans, Cons, Jalais) focus on the everyday suffering of people caught in the arbitrariness of borders that impose artificial boundaries on historical continuities; the 'enclaves' of Bangladesh, the linguistic/cultural identity of India–Nepal and India–Bangladesh and the sudden illegalities of centuries-old trade or kinship relations. They also describe the strategies and tactics of protest and the uneasy acceptance of those caught in situations of state-induced but also informal forms of violence by non-legitimate sources of aggression (Hausner and Sharma). Some scholars have preferred to put an emphasis on people's own narratives of their conditions and lives (Cons), thus criticising the more formal approaches.

Most works on the marginal positioning of borders have been cast in a highland–lowland paradigm or based on the physical distance between mainland and marginal communities, but works such as those of Jalais and Piliavsky add a new dimension to marginalisation, as is the case of the Sundarbans (deltaic Bengal) and the interior desert regions of Rajasthan. In both examples people concerned are marginalised more in terms of their identity (Bangladesh refugees in one case and stigmatised ex-criminals in the other)

rather than physical location; they are sought to be located as far away from civilisation as possible *because of* their stigmatised identity. Thus marginalised location is more about the metaphoric borders of being acceptable or non-acceptable rather than geopolitical frontiers. A major twist to the debate about borders is added by Piliavsky's study of the Kanjars that redefines borders as lines meant to 'enclose and divide' (p. 27). Piliavsky describes the strategic drawing of self-designed boundaries by the Kanjars as they forge survival strategies with the state (the persecutor) and police (representative of the state); while the former fades away into abstraction, the latter are recast as allies. Since the state actualises itself through its borders, the fuzziness of borders and the difficulty of defining them raise important questions on the reality of the state itself, a theme that opens this volume and is pursued throughout.

SUBHADRA MITRA CHANNA
*Delhi University (India)*

**Ghassem-Fachandi, Parvis. 2012. *Pogrom in Gujarat. Hindu nationalism and anti-Muslim violence in India*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. 352 pp. Pb.: £19.95. ISBN: 978-0691151779.**

Ethnic violence in India has been an important field of social scientific analysis, which provided a variety of explanations for its causes and effects. The book under review offers a completely different perspective on the subject, moving beyond the explanations proposed so far that tended to emphasise the political gains perpetrators expected to achieve. The very acts of violence and their multifarious expressions and structures remained unexplored in the literature, often being treated as self-explanatory. In his book Ghassem-Fachandi discusses how violence is conceptualised as cleansing pollution, purifying spaces, desecrating bodies and profaning objects as the events of the Gujarat pogrom unfolded (p. 26). He opens his gripping tale of the pogrom through the analysis of the events of 2002 mass killing of Muslims in Gujarat following the burning of the Sabarmati Express at the Godhra train station on 27 February 2002. This triggered the Godhra riots, the harbinger of the Gujarat pogrom that witnessed mindless killing of Muslims for three days, or approximately 72 hours.

Divided into eight chapters plus an Introduction and Postscript, the book offers a tour de force on the events. The title of first chapter, 'Why do you leave? Fight for us!' is an adaptation of the statement of a Muslim woman towards the author who wanted to take cover in their locality in the actual context of unfolding violence. This chapter provides a first-hand account of violence as it unfolded. It explores the 'fearsome' image of the Muslim as constructed by the Gujarati Hindus, now accepted and shared across the caste divide, in spite of the heterogeneity of the former. This initial analysis clears the ground for further exploration into the nature of violence as it unfolded on the streets of Gujarat. The author refers to the elements of violence that had acquired a permissive and carnivalesque spirit expressing a purported sense of anger. The other dimensions of violence included the peculiar reaction of the middle class, which expressed 'cultivated and aloof distancing' from the unfolding events, abdication of the civic order and the passivity of the state police, invocation of sacrifice as the idiom for killing, the discernment of an uncanny presence in sensitive city space and imaginative material that mainly concerned sexual fantasies about women. The second chapter, 'Word and image', analyses the specific manner in which the violent incidents are reported in the local media, including the electronic media and the tropes that have been used to cover the events. The author argues that the 'depth of the story is constructed not through certainty of fact or evidence but through allusion and accumulated suggestions' (p. 90) in which the diabolic stereotypes play a crucial role. What comes out clearly in this analysis is the sacrificial logic of the events. The third chapter provides readers with the shocking tales of the dance of death; the killing, burning, mutilation and terrible acts of violating dead bodies of women that chills the spine of any human being. The infamous killings of Muslims in residential areas of Ahmedabad such as Gulbarg Society and Naroda Patya on 28 February 2002

are analysed in a very detailed manner. The author shows that these incidents of violence, central to the Gujarat pogrom, went beyond the usual 'riots' as the situation became 'a festival of sorts by one community in the absence of the other' (p. 93). The analysis of these events from multiple perspectives is provided in chapter four, 'The lack of Muslim vulnerability', which opens with the fundamental question of how a familiar neighbour with whom one interacts and even shares laughs, arouses extreme forms of disgust, fear or anger? Further the author asks how, in the context of pogrom in Gujarat, the neighbour with whom one frequently interacts was turned into a stereotype. Through the analysis of three individual narratives told by people who are not votaries of Hindutva ideology and belong to three different communities – the Jain, Rajput and Dalit – Ghassem-Fachandi shows how these individuals identified something excessive in Muslims that could serve to legitimate the infliction of violence upon them. This refers to the beef-and meat-eating practice along with butchering that continuously recur in the Gujarati discourse about Muslims. In order to buttress his argument, the author draws from a book by an anonymous author titled 'Autobiography of a Goat' that eventually ended up in a (Muslim) butcher's shop (pp. 144–7).

The cultural dimensions of violence and its legitimacy are analysed in the following four chapters. The fifth chapter 'Vibrant vegetarian Gujarat', begins with a reference to a speech by Narendra Modi the then chief minister of Gujarat who was complacent in the Gujarat pogrom. Given on the occasion of the 135th birth anniversary of Mahatma Gandhi, Modi's speech referred to Hindu vegetarianism and attitudes towards animals as the 'hidden strengths' of Gujarat. Such recalling of dietary practices in the Gujarati context is inextricably linked to communalism; Ghassem-Fachandi argues that the triad 'diet, sacrifice and death' were articulated in diverse forms ad infinitum during the pogrom. The sixth chapter, 'Ahimsa, Gandhi and the angry Hindu', is a treatise on the issue of non-violence. It opens with a newspaper advertisement of the Modi government in Gujarat that carried an aphorism by Gandhi in which the prefix 'non' in the word non-violence was removed, maybe by error. However, Ghassem-Fachandi problematises this omission as 'a printed Freudian slip' (p. 186) that reveals how the Hindu right in India is cultivating the notion that only those who are powerful enough to practice violence could in fact argue for non-violence. This omission, which stands for 'a sudden eruption of truth, a public secret in a text authored by the Gujarat government' (p. 212) becomes an open statement of what violence meant in the Gujarat society which had created its own internal other as a sacrificial object. The seventh chapter titled 'Split city body' explores the internal boundaries of the city and their workings, exposing a particular perception of the intimate as separate. This opens a window into communal relations where externality is produced by constantly creating boundaries within the cityscape. 'Heterogeneity and the nation', the eighth chapter raises fundamental issues related to the Indian nation. It is high time those in India understood the fact that it is cultural heterogeneity that gave credibility to the idea of 'India' and not the monolithic notion that the RSS and the Hindutva forces uphold. The author argues that the Gujarati Muslims who are not 'pure' Gujaratis should subvert the claims of their detractors by 'appropriating the unbound elements of nationalism without renouncing their various religious and social identities by finding a way to affirm radical internal heterogeneity' (p. 272). In other words he argues that Muslims could claim the 'Indian miracle of multiple origins' even if their middle-class (Hindu) neighbours are averse to it.

The final section, 'Postscript', provides a critical assessment of the events leading to the pogrom and the culpability of former Gujarat chief minister Narendra Modi, who seems to have escaped the law on highly questionable technical grounds. Ghassem-Fachandi boldly chooses the term 'pogrom' to describe the events because it exposes the depth of the malaise of extermination of specific social groups in which large segments of the society become complacent and take part willingly without any expression of remorse. He further argues that although this event has several things in common with any

form of collective violence, there are specific cultural and psychological processes of individual and collective identification that were unique to the Central Gujarat region where the pogrom took place. Hindu nationalism in Gujarat worked through quite unexpected terrains, integrating the ideology of ahimsa (non-violence) to develop a politics of violence and ethnic cleansing by deploying the notion of communal sacrifice, a cleansing device to make a portion of one's own society into sacrificial victim (p. 9). Non-violence provided thus the necessary legitimacy for the violence of sacrificial cleansing of the abjected other of the Hindu nation, namely the Muslim.

The uniqueness of the book lies in the author's intimate experience of ethnic violence, which is quite exceptional for academic research on ethnic violence in India. Often written in the first person, the ethnographic narrative is powerful and extends beyond this experience into an in-depth analysis of the larger cultural context of violence in Gujarat. This book will remain a classic analysis of the politics of the Hindu right in India that draws its sustenance from the blood of the innocent. The Hindu right is nowadays reaping the dividends of the Gujarat pogrom and its aftermath through a curious mix of media hype and televised images that catapulted Modi, the former Gujarat Chief Minister, to his new role as India's Prime Minister.

SANAL MOHAN
*Mahatma Gandhi University (India)*

**Grassiani, Erella. 2013. *Soldiering under occupation. Processes of numbing among Israeli soldiers in the Al-Aqsa Intifada*. Oxford and New York: Berghahn Books. 168 pp. Hb.: US$90.00. ISBN: 978-085745-956-5.**

An emerging literature in the anthropology of morality is now exploring the ways dispositional, situational and institutional factors impinge on moral decision-making. This book strikes at the core of these concerns, assessing the extent of soldiers' agency in prolonged and uncertain conflict situations, and questioning the degree to which moral decision-making is displaced up the chain of command in military institutions. The author thus proposes that anthropologists of morality take a 'step back' and look more at the forces and structures that enframe the 'atrocity producing situations' that soldiers can find themselves in.

In a systematic study of the Israel Defence Force, the author marshals a wealth of soldiers' testimonies to build a penetrating analysis of the origins of military violence. The book deals with the on-the-ground quotidian experiences of soldiers serving in the occupied Palestinian territories (OPT), showing how soldiers give meaning to their experiences and how they attempt to make moral sense of the activities they perform. For example, an Israeli soldier reflects on his service in the OPT, saying: 'There's a very clear and powerful connection between how much time you serve in the Territories and how fucked in the head you get…' (p. 73), capturing the thrust of the book in a few words.

The book is based on interviews, testimonies and over a hundred descriptions of incidents, citing much documentation from 'Breaking the Silence', an organisation of Israeli ex-combatants that collects testimonies following soldiers' service in the OPT. The key argument is that the spatial surroundings of the territories powerfully influence soldiers' behaviour, ultimately leading to 'moral numbing'. This numbing process entails verbal strategies of legitimation and denial of actions, which help soldiers cope with their experiences and actions, thereby allowing the conflict situation, and concomitant atrocities and indignities, to persist.

The historical period of the study is 2000–2005, during the so-called 'Second Intifada' (or *Al-Aqsa Intifada*) – the uprising that demonstrated the anger, frustration and disillusionment of the Palestinians with their experience living under occupation. The overall context of the *Intifada*, however, is more deeply one of disaffection and disillusionment with the 1993 Oslo Accords, a process that failed to take the steps towards a long-term peace solution. The *Intifada* properly ignited in September 2000 after a provocative visit by Ariel Sharon – the then opposition leader of the Likud party – to the Temple Mount in Jerusalem. The violence

and sporadic attacks of the uprising included suicide bombings on both military and civilian targets, inside Israel as well as in the territories. The attacks elicited a heavy Israeli retaliation. More than a million bullets were fired by Israeli troops within the first three months alone. Israel consequently made a change in its mode of engagement with the Palestinians, moving away from controlling Palestinian lives from a distance, previously achieved through methods of disciplinary 'biopower', towards tighter control of Palestinian space, with more checkpoints and patrol roads, and stricter regulations on human movement between villages and across internal borders. The overall effects of this move towards 'sovereign power' included an increase in invasive practices, such as house and body searches, the closure of villages, curfews and inflexible border closures. These policies created great friction between the Palestinians and Israeli soldiers, particularly at checkpoints in the West Bank, where daily life was interrupted, with individuals frequently subjected to body searches and prolonged delays, oftentimes without any justification or explanation.

For the young soldiers on duty in the territories conducting such searches, the environment was reportedly draining. Fears of attacks, harsh weather conditions, uncomfortable work spaces, lack of sleep and the simple monotony of guard duty, all contributed to boredom and irritation, causing a dwindling of alertness, gradual moral decline and a general sense of disengagement and removal from the immediate situation. This sensation of disconnection made soldiers find it easier to be harsh or humiliating towards the Palestinians they stopped at checkpoints. This goes for soldiers on patrol, as well as those conducting planned house raids.

The author draws on theories of space to interrogate the nature of the militarised environment that the soldiers inhabit and dominate while in the territories, borrowing her theoretical frame from French philosopher Henri Lefebvre. A relational theory of space ties the particularity of a hostile environment to the social activity that it coordinates, entailing a notion of 'spatial practice' that sees spaces to be products of local culture as well as longer histories, trajectories and political imaginaries. Taking the physical surroundings of the territories into account heavily, the author shows how the long-term impact of time served in the territories produces a 'numbing effect' in soldiers. This numbing is manifest at three levels: emotional, physical and cognitive, culminating in 'moral numbing', yielding indifference to the harassment, inconvenience and insults caused. This approach to the study of military spaces emphasises the conditioning of soldiers' practices by the concrete environment itself. This makes for an astute critique, but at times verges on an apologetics for the morally indefensible acts of violence and invasion, where the ultimate causes of violence dissolve into the diffuse affective landscape.

The purpose and strength of this mode of attention, however, are to identify the situational factors and dynamics that create the conditions of soldiers' violent behaviour. Born out of the author's discontent with the official Israeli discourse and media portrayal of suspects of the disturbing atrocities that are relayed from the territories as one-off 'rotten apples', the study instead takes a more inclusive 'structural perspective' to yield a more complete picture of Israeli soldiers as an occupying force in the space of the OPT. The key questions that drive the study are thus: What happens when soldiers serve as occupiers? What changes do they experience in their moral commitments? What factors influence their behaviour? And what is the impact on moral decision-making?

Unsurprisingly, the end result of long hours of border duty, coupled with a diminished sensitivity to the experience of Palestinians, leads to what soldiers themselves term moral 'attrition' (*shkhika*). On the other hand, soldiers may also experience surprising sensations of power and pleasure from their duties. The book reports soldiers enjoying – even getting 'addicted' to – the feelings of strength at being able to make people do whatever they want. By virtue of carrying a weapon, soldiers find they can get Palestinians to stop and go at the simple wave of a finger. But these feelings of pleasure with their enhanced power also lead to anger and violent outbursts when that power is questioned, so that soldiers'

enjoyment of authority and the proclivity to commit violent acts appear tied. The author argues that soldiers 'addicted' to such a sense of power and almightiness easily lose the ability to make morally just decisions.

Conversely, the nature of soldiers' proximity to the Palestinians is difficult for some soldiers to cope with. Controlling Palestinians up close leads to issues of discomfort with intimacy, making it difficult to treat individuals as unique persons deserving respect, increasing the tendency to treat them mechanically and unsympathetically. This accords with prior work that describes the treatment of Palestinians under the broad 'othering' categories of 'Arab', 'Palestinian' or depersonalised terms like 'pregnant woman', 'old man' etc. (Ben-Ari *et al.* 2004). But soldiers also report internal conflict with their own feelings of insecurity. Stuck in an unpleasant, frightening and threatening environment, the soldiers often just want to get through their shift and not think too much about the work they perform. Their common use of the expression 'small head' (*rosh katan*) (p. 97) points to the kind of soldierly disposition that does not ask too much about what one is doing but just doing what one is told. While the author acknowledges that some soldiers do think about the nature of the occupation and recognise that there should be more reflection on the impact of their work, it is clear that to get through the difficult and emotionally taxing experience of service in the OPT, many soldiers disengage from reflective thought altogether.

Frankfurt school thinkers Max Horkheimer and Theodor Adorno, and philosopher Hannah Arendt, argued trenchantly that the singular problematic of modernity is the withering of critical thought in the midst of an ethically unmoored and expanding instrumental bureaucracy. In her report on the Eichmann trial in Jerusalem, for example, Arendt (1963) famously located the roots of the evil that enabled the Nazi Holocaust in the banal relinquishment of the capacity to think critically. Disturbingly, analogous conditions are described in the context of Israeli military activities in the OPT, with soldiers gradually losing the ability to engage the big picture and make morally just decisions. Indeed, soldiers succumbing to moral numbing use many discursive strategies to voice their sense of powerlessness, frequently saying 'What can you do?' (*ma la'asot?*) or 'There is nothing you can do' (*ein ma la'asot*) (p. 105). The overall effect of such verbal strategies of disavowal is to diminish individual moral responsibility, even in cases where soldiers recognise that the situation they are involved in is unpleasant and morally dubious. Consequently, soldiers refer to serving in the territories as doing 'dirty work' (*avoda shehkora*) (p. 108). Soldiers need to normalise such 'dirty work' by explicit reference to their role in protecting their fellow soldiers or other Israeli citizens. Professionalism, moreover, is alluded to as the soldierly virtue of carrying out orders without questioning. One soldier confesses 'it's much easier being a machine than a human being in situations like that' (p. 120). In this regard the explicit virtue of rigid obedience facilitates the emotional attrition that allows for moral numbing to take hold.

In her final analysis of 'moral numbing', the author mostly focuses on the multifarious relations that constitute the uncertain workspace of the OPT. In her reading, the space itself creates the sense of insecurity and danger that soldiers experience. An analysis that identifies the broader space and landscape over the responsible actors themselves, however, breaks with Lefebvre's dialectical theory of spatial practice, which regards human practices and physical spaces as ontologically entangled: A space such as a military checkpoint overdetermines soldiers' practices while the soldiers' practices stabilise and sustain the power relations at stake. By dwelling almost entirely on the ways in which spaces condition soldiers' moral behaviour, there is a tendency to brush over the ways soldiers voluntarily reproduce morally numbing spaces and their regimes of violence. Essential to the development of 'numbing' would be the military's disciplinary technologies that anaesthetise soldiers to the onset of moral decline. The military's modes of subjectivation and institutionalisation that render soldiers paralysed in the grip of an 'apparatus', however, are absent in the author's analysis. The less well-articulated lesson of the book is that soldiers must recognise responsibility for their actions, and crucially, retain the ability to think and analyse the spaces they find themselves in. Indeed, the

book makes it clear that precluding the corrosive rationality of military bureaucracy demands embracing the ability to think and continually engaging in moral reasoning. The book makes this argument well, and is an important contribution for scholars interested in spatial theory as it pertains to military morality.

Some straightforward and unequivocal policy lessons also emerge from the book. For example, it is clear that the 'eight hours on/eight hours off' regime for checkpoint duty is exhausting and counterproductive, causing moral 'attrition', the first step of the process that leads to 'moral numbing'. Implicit, also, is a call for more scholarship on violence and moral decay in institutions that operate in harsh and uncertain conditions. In this regard, the study is exemplary, and its contribution should be well received.

In conclusion, the book is a valuable addition to the anthropology of the military as it intersects with the anthropology of morality, as well as to Israel- and Middle Eastern studies. The text is well written and gives a clear, balanced and sympathetic picture of the conditions Israeli soldiers endured in the *Al-Aqsa Intifada*. Senior military leaders really should read this book, as should professionals and volunteers working in conflict situations, as all might benefit from a nuanced understanding of how moral numbing overcomes soldiers, an eventuality that can lead to pernicious and tragic outcomes. Otherwise, this book should be found on the shelves of scholars interested in the dubious morality of institutions, or indeed of curious readers interested in the institutional embeddedness of the intractable Israel–Palestine conflict.

## References

Arendt, H. 1963. *Eichmann in Jerusalem*. New York: Penguin Books.

Ben-Ari, E., M. Maymon, N. Gazit and R. Shatzberg. 2004. *From checkpoints to flow-points: sites of friction between the Israel defence forces and Palestinians*. Jerusalem: Harry S. Truman Institute for the Advancement of Peace, the Hebrew University.

IAN VINCENT MCGONIGLE
*Harvard University (USA)*

**Grønseth, Anne Sigfrid. 2013. *Being human, being migrant: senses of self and well-being*. New York and Oxford: Berghahn Books. 184 pp. Hb.: £53. ISBN: 978-1782380450.**

This edited collection, focused on migrants from different backgrounds and various locations in Europe, makes for an engaging read with well-argued essays. Conceptualising migrants as people living in-between, researchers analyse different experiences related to migrants' movements across space. The contributors have chosen a phenomenological approach in their ethnographies, attempting to capture the everyday lives of migrants. Their adaptive strategies are not seen in a negative sense, but rather as occasions to create agency through the creative use of available resources. These essays capture how senses of self are recreated and how they allow people to experience well-being even in a migrant condition, drawing a link between the status of a migrant and the general human condition.

The first chapter is focused on asylum seekers in Italy and the various interactions with the host society that shape their new lives. Barbara Pinelli presents a case study that highlights the manner in which refugees manage to transgress the difficulties caused by a faulty welfare system. Trapped in the liminality of waiting for help from authorities, women like Iolanda, the refugee presented in the chapter, find their agency fuelled by fantasies of a better future. Anne Sigfrid Grønseth, the editor of this collection, focuses in her chapter on the identity and wellbeing of Tamil refugees in Norway. She shows how social ties and migrants' connections with the homeland become important factors for a refugee's sense of self and group identity. Sometimes, the distress caused by such shifts transgresses from emotional states to bodily reactions such as undiagnosed pains and aches. Attuned to Pinelli's case study, the continuum from past to future is marked by a liminality zone that brings about both its ambiguity and opportunities for re-creating a good life in the future.

Maruška Svašek's chapter moves the reader's attention further along the imaginary map of migrations, looking at Dutch migrants in Northern Ireland. This case study is different from the

others, presenting the experiences of people who have migrated by choice. Resettlement, although in different circumstances in these cases, also has a significant effect on human well-being. The woman presented here is caught in a circular movement, of moving back to her native Netherlands from Northern Ireland. Svašek analyses how the past is presented and re-contextualised at different moments in time, reflecting the migrant's personal transformation. Northern Ireland is also the setting for Naoko Maehara's case study of Japanese migrants. To analyse psychological processes related to memories and their respective effects at an emotional level, Maehara chose to develop a photo-diary project. Diary notes charted the adjustment process of a recent migrant, when unfamiliar places generated a sense of loss and uncertainty that impacted on her well-being. It also charted, however, further along, how negative experiences are replaced with recent positive memories as the body adjusts to the environment, a new gained sense of place prompting well-being.

Christina Georgiadou's contribution focuses on Afghan refugees in Greece. The problems refugees encounter here are akin to those captured in other contributions, although Georgiadou's chapter presents a notable air of optimism. The two Afghan men included in this case study, while leading lives fraught with constraints of all sorts due to their refugee status, have managed to turn coercion into creative energies that have changed their lives significantly, allowing them to experience well-being in a hostile environment.

Maša Mikola's last chapter, centred on asylum seekers in Ljubljana, is the least positive in the collection. Mikola investigates extreme cases when refugees, usually conceptualised as powerless individuals, gain a voice through acts of self-harm. Faced with a restrictive, Kafkaesque regime, where silence brings about fears of all sorts, such resistance acts disrupt the power relations and bring refugees some long-sought sense of agency.

This collection ends with an epilogue written by Nigel Rapport. Rapport ponders on the title of the book, offering some interpretations of the various links that can be drawn between a general talk about humans and migrants. He goes on to analyse the particular case migrants represent, that of living between two worlds. In such movements, he sees an opportunity for an increased awareness that could draw the migrant further away from 'isms' (i.e. nationalism) and closer to the experience of human diversity.

The theoretical approach and diversity of cases offered by this volume recommend it for a broader readership beyond migration studies.

CRISTINA CLOPOT
*Heriot Watt University, Edinburgh (UK)*

**Hafez, Sherine and Susan Slyomovics (eds.) 2013. *Anthropology of the Middle East and North Africa: into the new millennium*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press. 414 pp. Pb.: US $26.52. ISBN: 978-0-253-00753-7.**

Based on a 2010 conference in the Center for Near Eastern Studies in UCLA, this volume will invariably disappoint anyone who, perhaps misled by its title, seeks an exhaustive overview of the field of Middle Eastern and North African (MENA) anthropology. However, to the extent that it offers 'selected anthropological studies of the MENA that represent a trend in opposition to the historical pattern of Orientalizing peoples of the region' (p. xiv), especially through 'the potential of ethnographic methodologies to serve as a catalyst for theoretical debate' (p. xv), this volume is a good addition to the anthropological body of work on the region.

The book is divided in four sections. The first section examines the historical and institutional constitution of MENA anthropology. Slyomovics starts by critically assessing major works in the field's history, starting from Carleton Coon's *Caravan* to Said's *Orientalism*. With a similar approach, Shami and Naguib outline, in broad strokes, the changing conceptions of identity and difference in MENA anthropology. Contrasting with these textual overviews, Anderson highlights the role of archaeological institutions in encouraging early MENA anthropologists to embark on ethnographic fieldwork, while Silverstein examines anthropology's influence on identity-making in the Maghreb since colonial times. Finally, in a

very interesting survey of current MENA anthropologists in the USA, Deeb and Winegar bring to light the political pressures placed by American academic institutions on the study of the region, including surreptitious censorship on any engagement with the Palestinian question.

Following the first section, the book suffers from a clear lack of cohesiveness. The second section, by far the least cohesive, comprises a frugal chapter on youth in the Middle East (Joseph); some reflections on memories of violence among Sudanese and Eritrean refugees (Hale); an ethnohistory of negotiations between the Harasii tribe and the Omani State (Chatty); and an analysis of trust receipts in neoliberal Port Said, Egypt (Hegel-Cantarella). The third section, coalescing around a more defined theme (religion/secularism), begins with a strong Asadian essay on the false opposition between Islam and rationality (Hafez), followed by essays on the history of secularism in Turkey (Shively); on historical encounters between Shari'a and Western legal systems (Dahlgren); and, less on topic, on female experiences of contraception in Morocco (Hughes). The final section, focusing on media, includes three case studies on the role of national television in the 1975 Green March in Morocco (Spadola); the online redefinition of tribal identity in Saudi Arabia (Maisel); and the role of the Arab and Iranian blogospheres in MENA politics (Karagueuzian and Chrabieh Badine).

The central arguments in each chapter are too often overshadowed by political overgeneralisations. For instance, when Shami and Naguib write that 'new forms of knowledge about identity and difference in this region are central to the new social imaginaries that are emerging and being contested in city squares and streets every day' (p. 24), the statement's political optimism is not only too vague to constitute serious political analysis, but it obscures the significance and the specific definition of the 'new forms of knowledge' presented by MENA anthropology. Beyond overgeneralisation – a minor issue overall – there is an evident gap between the first section, which very aptly covers the academic legacy of MENA anthropology, and the remaining sections, which inadequately cover their allotted themes (respectively, subjectivity, religion and media). Even when we consider each chapter individually, the balance between theory and ethnography is often lacking, either by the depth of description (Joseph; Maisel) or, in cases where the description is strong enough, by theoretical ingenuity (Shively; Karagueuzian and Chrabieh Badine). Among more balanced chapters, one should cite Chatty's analysis, which ties the history of relations between the Harasiis and the Omani State to issues of identity-making among nomadic tribes in modern nation-states, as well as Hegel-Cantarella's analysis, which ties the economy of trust receipts in Port Said to more general issues concerning the trustworthiness of economic exchanges in legal regimes, which are materially supported by documents. Also worthy of mention is Hafez's chapter, a well-written genealogy of the notion of 'rationality' in European and Islamic intellectual history.

All in all, this book will interest the non-specialist seeking introductory case studies in MENA anthropology, but it may fall short for the specialist, who will find few chapters combining ethnographic substance with theoretical finesse. The first section should provide some solace, however, since it presents interesting insights into the intellectual and institutional history of MENA anthropology in the USA, the implicit academic locus of the volume.

CHIHAB EL KHACHAB
*Wolfson College, University of Oxford (UK)*

**Hindman, Heather. 2013. *Mediating the global. Expatria's forms and consequences in Kathmandu*. Stanford, CA: California University Press. 288 pp. Hb.: US$36.00. ISBN: 978-0804786515.**

*Mediating the global* is an engaging monograph portraying expatriates as globalisation's middlemen. The book explores historically the expatriate scene in Kathmandu over a period of six years (1994 to 2000), pointing out changes in overseas work relationships, shifts in the local situation in Nepal and in expatriate sending countries along with wider global changes in work, employment and gender.

Building on the work of Malkki and Appadurai, the author coins the concept of *Expatria*, which she sees as 'a network of association of elite overseas work' (p. 11) created between career diplomats, professional aid workers, business people, professionals mostly working as volunteers and consultants living abroad. Although global in expanse, *Expatria* has the characteristics of a small town, while expatriates live provincial lives, the author insists. Expatriates experience continuous geographical displacement surmounted by social coherence, dependence on (similar) institutional and bureaucratic frameworks and a life centred continuously around labour, wherever they are on the globe.

The first part of the book presents 'package expatriates' in their 'typical form' (p. 11) as a story of rules and institutions governing expatriate employment. Global, transcultural and above-all local models of labour fail due to specific and unaccounted for circumstances; while general measures remain in contrast with everyday realities of living in Kathmandu, Hindman argues. These measures are furthermore colonial in nature: expatriate practices in Nepal can be tracked back to colonial times, British governance in India having also made use of family units with gendered division of space and employment of locals in the household as a tool of governance. The second part of the book focuses on changes such as global shifts in the attitude towards work and gender. Looking at employer tests of cultural competency, the author pinpoints how in the global game of distribution some differences matter more than others: for example, race is considered of utmost importance while discussions of culture often exclude power, history and belief. Besides, as employers and institutions start preferring the single white-male-international citizen model of employment, expatriates with families fall in disgrace. This model of employment reshapes institutions dealing with expats and inspires a decline in both women in positions of power and the number of non-white expatriates.

Throughout the book the author points out the less rosy side of being part of *Expatria*. The unending packing and moving reconfigures significant relations, drawing spouses and children into the sphere of the employer while a system of compensation is designed to make the worker truly feel at home. Although these forms of intervention are meant to reduce stress, they in fact create new concerns and new problems through 'the displacement of links of caring' (p. 67): a double shift of labour for women who try to both ameliorate the difficulties of living abroad and to address the difficulties of living under a 'regime of accountability'. Besides, the inclusion of the family into the work sphere as the employer takes over responsibilities such as housing and schooling creates surveillance and regulation of behaviour along the construction of (new) norms about what constitutes a proper family.

Besides the problematic relationship between expats and their employer, global changes in employment patterns have created even more challenges. A preference for subcontracting enhances distance between the 'problems' and the people who address them. The lack of contact between the field and managers ensures squandering knowledge and resources, while short-term projects make the local population wonder 'what are the crazy foreigners going to come up with next' (p. 6). People hired to do a job have shorter contracts and are seldom interested in the context of the country they are delegated to. Also, changes in the language and terminology of aid programmes due to fast turnout in governmental and NGO proposals and 'bids' from subcontractors ensure a superficial proliferation of buzzwords that have little to do with actual local circumstances.

Hindman not only places expatriate life in perspective but also considers the actual impact of the development work and expatriate life as lacking efficiency. Her critique reaches also the hierarchy of nations and cultures implied in the expatriate model. These critical positions make the book an engaging read. However, due to the lack of thorough comparison, the book remains a mere sketch of changes in expatriate life in Kathmandu between 1994 and 2000. Published 13 years

after the last date of fieldwork the book remains mainly an instrument for historical comparison.

CAROLINA IVANESCU
*Erasmus University Rotterdam (The Netherlands)*

**Kwon, Soo Ah. 2013. *Uncivil youth: race, activism, and affirmative governmentality.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press. 184 pp. Pb.: US$19.86. ISBN: 978-0822354239.**

*Uncivil youth* examines the activist work of a youth collective, Asian/Pacific Islander Youth Promoting Advocacy and Leadership (AYPAL), constituted by participants from six different Asian ethnic organisations in Oakland, California. As a volunteer staff member and ethnographer, Kwon sought to understand how AYPAL operated as a site of youth development and activism in a neoliberal state. Through ethnographic descriptions of two campaigns undertaken by AYPAL combined with historical and theoretical analyses, Kwon argues that we need to have more nuanced understandings of youth activism in the neoliberal era, rather than uncritically celebrating youth's role in creating a more socially just society. The book's focus on Asian American and Pacific Islander (API) youth counters effectively images of API youth and adults as 'model minorities'.

In the introduction, Kwon makes several important claims about youth activism, the neoliberal state and the growing role of non-profits in providing youth services. She argues that both youth empowerment and youth criminalisation are intimately connected as twin state strategies to manage youth, particularly youth of colour. Drawing on Foucauldian notions of the production of disciplined subjects, Kwon argues that the neoliberal logic of the moment compels young people, especially poor young people and young people of colour, to 'self-govern' and to become responsible 'for acting on their behalf, but not necessarily to oppose the relations of power' that rendered them powerless in the first place (p. 11). She argues persuasively that moving activism and social movements under the purview of non-profits, whose finances and functions are government-regulated, shifts the emphasis from organising collectively for large social change to becoming 'good' individual citizens who vote, sign petitions and volunteer. Kwon's account of AYPAL's activism seeks to understand how the youth both challenge and are bound by the constraints of working within the framework of a neoliberal logic of self-regulation. To do so, Kwon relies not only on her fieldwork as a volunteer and ethnographer with AYPAL over the course of three and a half years, but also on close readings of reports by and websites of youth organisations as well as myriad historical sources.

In the first chapter, Kwon provides a historical and theoretical overview of when and how the category of youth and adolescence was produced in the USA and the subsequent government regulation of that category. She argues cogently that the production of this category was necessary for the regulating practices and policies that followed. Kwon notes that the raced, classed and gendered assumptions and concerns that undergirded the youth programmes of the Progressive era are still evident in current youth interventions. In chapter 2, she describes how the proliferation of non-profit organisations (12,500 in 1940 to over 2 million currently) has shaped the nature and scope of youth (and other) activist work. Because youth organising groups have to rely on foundation grants to fund their work, Kwon writes, 'their vision of social change and activism can be dampened by the mundane tasks of reading through calls for proposals and balancing budgets' (p. 65).

In the next two chapters, Kwon draws on her ethnographic work to describe two AYPAL campaigns. Chapter 3 describes the successful mobilisation of AYPAL youth, along with their African American and Latino/a peers, to halt the expansion of a juvenile hall. Chapter 4 describes AYPAL's less successful campaign to convince their congressional representative to sponsor a bill to halt the deportation of young Cambodian refugees. While the youth's efforts

and dedication described in these chapters are inspiring, more in-depth information about the particular youth involved and their reasons and motivations for leading the campaigns would have been useful. Kwon hints at, but does not elaborate, on racial, class and gender differences among the AYPAL youth in their understanding of and enthusiasm for the campaigns. It would have been helpful to hear more from the youth themselves, especially about how campaigns were chosen.

While Kwon's caution against uncritically championing youth activism as the sure-fire way to creative progressive social change is an important one, the force of her argument comes mostly from her theoretical and historical analyses rather than her ethnographic material. One particular strength of her work is that it focuses on youth activists who come from a diverse range of Asian ethnic groups; however, Kwon's account does not provide the readers with an in-depth understanding of the possibilities and challenges of how these youth worked within and across these ethnic and other differences.

ANITA CHIKKATUR
*Carleton College (USA)*

**Long, Nicholas J. and Henrietta L. Moore (eds.) 2013. *Sociality: new directions*. Oxford and New York: Berghahn Books. 244 pp. Hb.: US$80.00. ISBN: 978-0-85745-789-9.**

As a theoretical and analytic term, sociality is currently being used in diverse disciplines, with different aims. The editors of the volume, Nicholas Long and Henrietta Moore, want to offer a novel and more refined vision that socio-cultural anthropology has much to gain from. They provide a very broad definition of sociality (which has its roots in the 1989 Manchester Debate in Anthropology, cf. Ingold 1996: 50–80) as 'a dynamic and interactive relational matrix through which human beings come to know the world they live in and to find their purpose and meaning within it' (p. 2). With this broad definition at hand, they advocate for a processual theory of sociality that can do justice to its diverse manifestations, its plasticity and resilience.

The book consists of an introduction by the editors and ten chapters by individual scholars. Three of the chapters engage with the topic more theoretically, while the other seven approach it ethnographically. In their respective chapters, Henrietta Moore and Christina Toren address the benefits and shortcomings of sociality as a research domain in anthropology. Their views converge in envisioning human life as being at once a social, biological and historical process, and stressing the developmental plasticity of the body and the brain, and the importance of intersubjectivity and the imagination. They diverge, however, on the conclusions they draw from this. In Toren's view, sociality is analytically ineffective. Moore, on the other hand, considers it analytically interesting by emphasising the human ability to imagine, anticipate and assign meaning to emotions, values, objects or actions as distinctly human. In her view, relational or affect theories, in contrast to anthropology, do not take this aspect into account and therefore fall short of grasping the distinct quality of human sociality. The third theoretical contribution by Susanne Küchler reminds us that reflections on human sociality must consider such things as telecommunications devices and smart textiles, as these extend and distribute cognition in yet unknown forms.

The following chapters provide ethnographic case studies discussing how people in diverse contexts relate to each other, to other animals or to objects, and how this influences the way they see the world and create meaning in it. In his contribution Peter Geschiere draws on his work in Cameroun, where he has been studying the Maka people since the 1970s. He traces the way in which witchcraft, intimacy and trust have been implicated in each other and have remained frightfully resilient features of sociality in family networks, even while overcoming great distances. Nicholas J. Long takes us along to the virtual world of *Britannia*, where in the game *Ultima Online* long-term 'inhabitants' participate in a form of sociality that is partly self-created, as they represent personas that interact with others. Long

found that many 'inhabitants' enjoyed getting praise for their performance in self-taught virtual skills, which was perceived as refreshingly different from the sociality they experienced outside the game. In her chapter, Anne Allison problematises Japanese 'my-homeism' (*mai homu shūgi*) as a template for ideal sociality in post-war Japan. 'My-homeism' captures strong feelings of belonging, nuclear family making and prosperity thanks to corporate capitalism. With increasing economic precarity and disorientation, 'my-homeism' is now gradually replaced by other forms of belonging. Olga Solomon describes the interaction between children with a form of autism spectrum disorder and dogs. These children, who would otherwise have trouble playing with other children and developing a sense of 'we', manage to establish a form of sociality in this situation. Drawing on her study, Solomon warns of a conceptualisation of sociality too much focused on language use and complex social cognitive processes, which misses out cases such as these. The last three chapters focus on the coming together of large numbers of people. In her chapter, Sian Lazar concentrates on ideologies of collectivity, comparing two sets of union leaders in different contexts in Bolivia and Argentina. Adam Yuet Chau is critical of the usefulness of the term sociality, speaking instead of 'actants amassing' (p. 133 ff.) in an attempt to capture the coming together of large numbers of people, animals, food and other objects in an annual ritual in Taiwan. And last, Jo Vergunst and Anna Vermehren reflect in their contribution on an art project that centres on slow motion by bicycle, which they see as an instance of slow-motion sociality.

This book reclaims sociality as a research domain for socio-cultural anthropology, as it clearly emphasises the processual and biosocial character of sociality instead of looking at it as a product of social relations or as a biological capacity. The ethnographic case studies provide fine examples of the ever-changing forms in which humans relate to each other, to animals and to the environment, and of how they infuse objects and actions with meaning, as well as anticipate the future and imagine possible worlds.

## Reference

Ingold, T. (ed.) 1996. *Key debates in anthropology*. London: Routledge.

BARBARA GÖTSCH
*Institute for Social Anthropology, Austrian Academy of Sciences (Austria)*

**Macdonald, Sharon. 2013. *Memorylands: heritage and identity in Europe today*. London and New York: Routledge. xiv +293 pp. Pb.: £24.99. ISBN: 9-780415-453349.**

This volume discusses what the author calls the 'past presencing' and 'memory complex' in contemporary Europe. As she writes, 'the term memory complex should be seen as shorthand for something like "the memory-heritage-identity complex" for these are all tightly interwoven' (p. 5). Past presencing can also be conceptualised as a general preoccupation with and modality of incorporation of memory, heritage and identity – or the culturally specific forms they have assumed in Europe in the last few decades. In short, through the notions of 'past presencing' and 'memory complex', the author points out many modalities of imagining, experiencing and living the past.

The book comprises nine chapters covering various themes such as traditions, telling, feeling and selling the past, musealisation, cultural and transcultural heritage, and cosmopolitan memory. Furthermore these chapters offer representative case studies, an annotated review of the pertinent literature and a critical discussion on theories and methods. The way ethnographic examples relate to each other and become integrated into broader theoretical frameworks is remarkable, and gives the treatise a stimulating holistic flavour.

The evident priority given to theorisation is tempered by a similar concern regarding the risk of methodological 'presentism': being aware of the recent turns in the discipline, Macdonald fruitfully engages with their conceptual tools (incorporation, affectivity, phenomenology, materiality, etc.). That said, she also points out that none of these methodological turns is conclusive or

preeminent and that one has to calibrate one's analytic priorities and procedures according to the specificities of the research contexts.

Europe as a field of study is not uncritically postulated in Macdonald's work. Her perspective is in fact aimed at understanding how identities in Europe and European identities are constructed through the social mechanisms triggered by the memory complex. How, in other words, discourses and regimes of time, past and historicity relate to notions and practices of tradition, memory, history and heritage, and how these are manipulated, experienced and used by communities, institutions and nations. The book convincingly highlights analogies as well as differences in the ways European communities or institutions incorporate, materialise and sometimes commodify the past. It also demonstrates the pan-European dimension of the memory–heritage–identity complex, which is unevenly but widely spread – even if with a few relevant exceptions, like that of the Roma of Central Europe. According to Macdonald, Roma are in fact characterised by a very different regime of temporality, a different use of memory, and therefore an alternative way to 'conceptualize the relationship between past, present, and identity' (p. 67).

Assessing differences in constructing and representing 'Europeanness' also leads her to examine how Europe and Islam, Islamic veil and gender issues in Europe relate to questions of memory, tradition, heritage and national policy. These issues are treated with sensitivity and intelligence, though never losing critical acumen. Further insights are presented on the memory and heritage practices of ethnic, national or religious groups that are not geopolitically localised in any European nation-state (Roma, Jews, Muslims, Africans and other incoming migrants). In this case, Macdonald emphasises how actual social practices may diverge from public rhetoric in the cultural negotiation with more or less homogeneous groups considered as non-Europeans or 'others'.

Some aspects of this work can also be subject to criticism. For instance, although the book covers enormous ground and shows deep knowledge of the pertinent literature, it mentions no publications in Romanic languages, despite the vast production of studies about heritage and memory in French and Italian. Post-socialist Europe would have probably deserved more space. The subject of socialist nostalgia is well presented and thoroughly explored, but a longer discussion about the forms that processes such as musealisation, the reconfiguration of folk traditions and cultural heritages took immediately after the 1989 changes and later would have been pertinent given the overall topic.

As for the epistemological and methodological orientations of the book, two disciplines, namely cultural history and folklore, are underrepresented. The former is not completely absent, but it is referred to more as a producer of representations and regimes of temporality than as a discipline contributing to a better understanding, on a diachronic level at least, of the memory-heritage-identity phenomenon. Also folklore as a discipline is virtually absent from the treatise. The book would surely have benefitted from a brief discussion of the relations and interconnections between folklore, European ethnology and anthropology of Europe. These critiques, however, do not diminish the remarkable achievements of the book. *Memorylands* is strongly recommended reading for scholars interested in European studies and a must-read for anthropologists. It is an excellent, extensive analysis of memory, heritage and identity in contemporary Europe that will surely remain for a long time the reference point on these topics.

ALESSANDRO TESTA
*University of Pardubice (Czech Republic)*

**McCollugh, B. Megan and Hardin A. Jessica (eds.) 2013. *Reconstructing obesity: the meaning and measures and the measure of meanings*. New York and Oxford: Berghahn Books. 256 pp. Hb.: US$85.50. ISBN: 978-1782381419.**

This volume tackles the interrelated developments of the medicalisation of obesity and the propagation of ideas about the moral status of fatness around today's world. Including an array

of cases – from such countries as the USA, Australia, Samoa, Cuba and the United Arab Emirates – it provides a rich, empirically based set of analyses of the social categorisations and medical classifications that are used not only to describe and analyse states of large human bodies, but employed to offer value judgements and prescriptions for action. As the contributors to the volume explain, interventions related to fatness are found in a plethora of areas, including the medical and educational sphere, commercial and business enterprises and the health and cosmetics industries. Given the increasing medicalisation of contemporary societies, they accompany individuals throughout their lifetimes and in a variety of activities. Moreover, and these are probably the most important points for readers of this journal, the contributors convincingly argue that an understanding of obesity and of large bodies must take into account local contexts and cultural constructions in order to fully appreciate the diversity of experiences involved in such bodies. They also explain the need to take into account the lived experience of people in terms of how and why they choose what to eat, assess risks and health, and grapple with often diverging ideologies of consumption and restraint. It is these lived experiences that can provide insights for behavioural medicine.

The volume is framed by an excellent Introduction by medical anthropologists McCullough (Department of Veterans Affairs in New York) and Hardin (Brandeis University) and a rather bland epilogue by McGarvey (Brown University). The main part of the book is divided into four broad sections, comprising fascinating expositions of the quantification and universalising social appraisal of obesity; ethnographic depictions of fatness in Cuba and Samoa; investigations into the practices of weight management by individuals and by way of policy; and a systematic explanation of how the current biomedical model is inadequate in addressing the social causes of fatness, stigma and backlash in the form of eating disorders.

The introduction sets out the parameters of the volume by defining obesity as a medical classification and fatness as a political labelling of the body with multiple meanings. It then carefully charts out the aims of the edited collection in unpacking the equivalence between obesity and sickness and in examining how this equivalence is internalised by individuals. In order to achieve these aims, the editors explain, the contributions to the volume suggest moving away from seeing (along the lines of medical science) the individual as the basic unit, to seeing individuals as culturally located and understood in context. Thus many contributions examine bodies, food histories and epidemiological change, to show how large bodies are conceived as normal, sick or something more ambiguous. Looked at this way, the various chapters underscore how much obesity research is too Euro-centric and instrumental in its orientation and as a consequence misses the multiple meanings of being fat.

Two examples of outstanding contributions may provide readers with the flavour of the analyses. Rosen's chapter on adapting diabetes interventions in Samoa shows that the common global terms of behavioural medicine like the dichotomy 'collectivist-individualist' to characterise societies or the role of 'community' in governing eating and health practices are alien to anthropologists. They are alien since by reducing cultural and social complexity to a very small set of measurable categories, they tend to efface the differences of local contexts and understandings. The chapter by McCullough is probably the volume's strongest for the way it interweaves personal experience (without devolving into navel gazing), critical examinations of institutional and popular assumptions, and drawing wider lessons about the cultural and political implications of medical technologies centred on obesity. She uses her own pregnancy and the various reactions to it by medical personnel and her large body to show the blurred lines between obesity research and popular representations of obesity.

In all, the various contributions and the volume as a whole successfully de-naturalise and de-universalise obesity so that it is no longer a singular category and the various taken-for-granted assumptions about the stigmas attached to it are reconceived.

EYAL BEN-ARI
*Kinneret College on the Sea of Galilee (Israel)*

**Raikhel, Eugene and William Garriott (eds.) 2013. *Addiction trajectories*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press. 360 pp. Pb.: US$19.04. ISBN: 978-0822353645.**

Unlike previous researchers of addiction, the contributors to this volume 'move away from employing substance categories (alcohol, illicit drugs, pharmaceuticals) as the organizing rubric for research' (p. 6). The focus of their attention is *addiction* and all the different meanings with which scientists and lay people flesh out this notion in various cultural and historical contexts since late 19th century. The overarching idea of the volume is that of directed movement, *trajectory.* Addiction, as well as the individual experiences, relations, knowledges and technologies it produces, are analysed through the prism of three types of trajectories along which addiction moves through time and space: epistemic, therapeutic and experiential.

The individual contributions bring into light different epistemic framings of addiction. One frame, addressed by Summerson Carr, Angela Garcia, Nancy D. Campbell, Jamie Saris and Helena Hansen, links addiction to the problem of personal choice or will, a cultural understanding of addiction that stems from the prevailing American Twelve Step model of recovery, as well as punitive approach to addiction (pp. 44–5). This view draws a sharp line between people who 'can't stop', 'broken' addicts, and those who are able to exercise self-control, commit an intentional, voluntary act (a vivid illustration of this view is presented in Campbell's analysis of an episode from *The Oprah Winfrey Show*, p. 247).

Another epistemic model puts addiction in the realm of chronic diseases (Garcia). This socio-cultural idea initially emerged in response to the high incidence of repeated relapse seen among addicts in the US publicly funded treatment programmes, which conflicts with the moral, will-based interpretation of addiction. On the one hand, this model relieves addicts of the moral responsibility for their returning to drug use. On the other hand, as Garcia shows, by giving the feeling of an everlasting affection, chronicity may provoke 'a deep sense of hopelessness' (p. 56) in addicted people, who have to live with this interiorised cultural idea.

Tightly related to the chronicity model is the modern biomedical understanding of addiction (Campbell, Garriott, Hansen), which is based on the latest neurobiological research and development of neuroimaging technologies in the USA and Europe. This model defines addiction as 'a dysfunction of normal brain systems involved in reward, motivation, learning and choice' (p. 6). This approach makes room for treating addiction exclusively with pharmaceutical means, and for challenging 'stigmatizing and moralizing interpretations of addiction' (p. 16) by revealing the uncontrolled, 'subcortical' part of relapse mechanisms.

The second type of trajectories explored in this volume is 'therapeutic trajectories', which different anti-addiction regimens as well as addicted individuals take within the respective chapters. Thanks to the critical eye of researchers, we witness how the lines between licit and illicit drugs, and drugs and treatment regimens based on pharmaceuticals (like methadone and buprenorphine – see Lovell and Meyers' contributions) and psychotherapy (Shüll, Raikhel) become very thin and in some cases completely disappear. The geographical breadth of individual trajectories collected by editors is impressive: from narcology clinics in Saint Petersburg through suburbs of Marseille, down to the poor neighbourhoods of New Mexico, and up to the drug rehabilitation centres in Baltimore and mid-western USA. As one of the contributors states, these milieux contribute to the 'materialization' of 'experiential trajectories' and allow us to connect them to different national regimens of drug management (p. 129). In this way, for example, we can follow Pavel's trajectory, a Ukrainian 'toxicomane' who travelled to Marseille and used free French NGOs' methadone programmes to gain access to local healthcare services. Having been exposed

to both Ukrainian and French treatment modalities, Pavel's toxicomania shows how different social bodies, institutions and nations relate to addiction: in Ukraine he was considered 'a criminal' doomed for prison, while in France he became part of the French 'Republican model of solidarity' and enjoyed the generous aid of NGOs trying to entitle drug addicts to the same rights and services as ordinary citizens (Lovell).

Revealing the intricate details of addicts' worldviews and life trajectories, the authors bring these people closer to the reader and shed new light on the complexity of addiction as epistemic, therapeutic and subjective experience.

ALEXANDRA SERGEEVNA KURLENKOVA
*N.N. Miklukho-Maklai Institute of Ethnology and Anthropology, Moscow (Russia)*

**Rice, Tom. 2013. *Hearing and the hospital: sound, listening, knowledge and experience*. Wantage (UK): Sean Kingston Publishing. 214 pp. Hb.: US$95.48. ISBN: 978-1907774249.**

*Hearing and the hospital* brings to bear the significance, complexity and intrigue of the ethnographer's ear. Using wards in two UK hospitals as field sites, Tom Rice's ethnography of sound in hospital environments focuses on the real-time practice of listening. Through eight robust chapters, Rice shows the acoustic-social space of these wards and the people who inhabit them. The study is couched firmly at the crossroads of sensory anthropology and medical anthropology, intersecting with sound studies and science and technology studies, thereby giving ethnographic context to auditory knowledge. Rice's direction carries momentum from those anthropologists who have studied sound in non-Western contexts (e.g. Feld, Gell and Weiner) and bridges this path to an 'urban, Western, institutional setting' (p. 11). In this sense *Hearing and the hospital* expands the remit of the ethnographic method and writing for an 'anthropology "in" sound' (p. 173).

Rice introduces us to two forms of professional, clinical listening: monitory and diagnostic. The latter addresses *if* there is a problem, the former addresses *what* is the problem. Within a hospital environment, these modes of listening correspond to professional hierarchies, knowledge and experience, from nurse to student to doctor. At the same time, Rice also analyses patients' 'lay-listening' within hospital wards and how this affects the experience of hospitalisation and adoption of 'ill' identities. Chapters 1 and 2 reveal the hospital ward as a 'communal diagnostic and discursive space' (p. 52) by examining nurses' monitory listening and patients' listening and sound production in the ward soundscape. The acoustic distribution of sonic information, such as amplified diagnostic monitoring of body processes, challenges how we understand our bodies to occupy space and the borders of privacy.

Such an 'ears on' approach (p. 17) serves as an entrance point for another portion of Rice's fieldwork: learning diagnostic listening practices of cardiac auscultation with senior doctor-teachers. Auscultation and the stethoscope are thus primary tools Rice uses to draw together learning, sound and clinical knowledge. Learning diagnostic listening is distinctly informed through a 'community of practice' approach while renovating the concept with a sensory-based, situated, emplaced learning perspective. Rice shows the transmission of auditory knowledge from doctor to student and the effects of learning auscultation for performing 'doctorly' dispositions. Chapter 4 addresses both how the stethoscope affords a medical habitus (allowing the medical student to perform gestures, dispositions and knowledge) and how the stethoscope is deployed conspicuously by senior doctors to articulate their diagnostic authority. Rice traces this knowledge production in medical history by addressing the transformation of the body as listenable object within modern medicine in chapter 3. In particular, the stethoscope became key to unlocking the inner space of body sounds. Stethoscopic listening practices are shown in chapter 5's focus on the heart's 'lub-dub' rhythm and the situated learning process of identifying different murmurs and sounds. Chapter 6 concerns how this objectification of sound shapes interpersonal relationships on the ward floor.

Chapter 7 introduces auto-auscultation as patients listen to themselves and explores the effect of this kind of listening on the experience of illness.

Namely, how hearing one's body can often be an unknown, disturbing, anxiety-filled process that induces an unwell experience. Such an experience intersects with multiple sonic-clinical readings of the body, its objectification, its amplification and presence in space, and a patient's understanding of those sounds. Thus in Rice's terms, disease is both 'sounded and enacted' (p. 52).

While auscultation and the stethoscope are clearly shown as powerful tools that mediate relationships, being used to display and learn knowledge within the ward, chapter 8 brings forth questions of the death of the stethoscope. This is a potentially undermining notion, as it reveals how technology, users and practices function within an institution and the different claims to power that they afford. For example, ultrasound imaging technology, such as echocardiography, may render the stethoscope obsolete, thus setting the stage for a 'sensory politics' (pp. 153–4) of visual diagnosis versus listening diagnosis, and bringing about a repositioning of the value of expertise in each of these techniques.

*Hearing and the hospital* presents a diverse series of interrogations of auditory culture and listening attention that has emerged from rigorous ethnographic fieldwork. Rice accomplishes this task by shedding light on the fascinating complexity of sound in social life through numerous dimensions of sound, experience and knowledge in hospital environments. The research lays a cornerstone in providing a model for a grounded ethnographic practice of listening.

TREVER HAGEN
*University of Exeter (UK)*

**Underberg, Natalie M. and Elayne Zorn. 2013. *Digital ethnography: anthropology, narrative, and new media*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press. x + 117 pp. Hb.:€33.50. ISBN:978-0-292-74433-2.**

In light of the current proliferation of anthropological literature on ethnographic practice in virtual environments, Underberg and Zorn explore 'digital ethnography' in ways that attend to specific aspects of how anthropologists can make use of digital tools. In their book, which is dedicated to the memory of Elayne Zorn, who passed away before the volume went into print, they define digital ethnography as 'a method for representing real-life cultures through combining the characteristic features of digital media with the elements of story' (p. 10). This definition reflects their particular concern with ethnographic storytelling and with the ways new media can transform this technique of representation by following the principles of a 'multisensory multimedia ethnography' such as immersion, interaction and virtual embodiment that enable non-linear presentation and the involvement of multiple voices. In line with their emphasis on hypertextuality, the book itself extends into the virtual realm by frequently referring to web-based material, the links to which are listed as an appendix together with a useful glossary introducing the vocabulary of digital environments. When following these links into virtual realms the reader will realise that the volume offers much more than one can find in its actual 117 printed pages.

In the first chapter, the authors give an introduction to digital ethnographic storytelling and collaborative new media design illustrated by intriguing examples of oral history projects and cultural representations of indigenous communities in which activist anthropologists can be involved. The short discussion of these examples prepares the reader well for the second chapter, in which the authors analyse in detail two projects that enabled them to experiment with ethnographic representation. The first one is a website dedicated to Andean cultural expressions that introduces the user not only to particular artefacts or practices but also to Andean cosmology at large. The second one, a joint effort of the Pontifical Catholic University of Peru-Lima and the Digital Ethnography Lab of the University of Central Florida, is the PeruDigital project concerned with Peruvian festivals and folklore. The website was developed through 'participatory design' involving multidisciplinary scholars, students and community members. It offers different views on Peruvian festivals, as users can adopt the role of an ethnographer, sponsor or performer. In the virtual ethnographer's office users can, for example, read field notes on particular cultural performances.

In chapter 3 the authors further examine the potential of digital tools. They are concerned with ways to document, organise and examine data, and consider social networking software as a way to construct participatory environments, especially in regard to cultural heritage projects, advocating 'multivocality in decentering the knowledge and authority of the scholar' (p. 45). The subsequent chapter, which is written by Underberg and computer scientist Rudy McDaniel, presents insights into the use of extensible mark-up language (XML) as a tool to follow multiple paths through documents or narratives. They do so by referring to three rather diverse examples: the coding of vocation stories Underberg collected among Benedictine sisters in Peru, the creation of computer games for cultural heritage educational purposes and the employment of XML in a website concerned with the Puerto Rican diaspora in Central Florida.

In the last two chapters the authors focus on what they call 'cultural learning', i.e. on the design of digital environments for educational purposes such as video games where users learn by moving through virtual space. For this they present in detail a computer game that is based on a Spanish folktale recorded in the 1930s in Ybor City, Florida, a town once known for its cigar production by Cuban immigrants. Based on a research project by Underberg, the game is designed for middle and high school students and structured in five lessons teaching the students about social, cultural and economic aspects of Ybor City's history.

One could debate the extent to which the notion of digital ethnography is appropriate for cultural representations in computer games, despite the fact that these games are at least partly based on ethnographic knowledge. Moreover, one could also question the authors' definition of the concept *per se*, as too narrowly focused on representation and narration, i.e. on the products of ethnographic research rather than on the process of conducting it. Thus, readers who associate 'digital ethnography' with conducting online fieldwork in social media and virtual worlds will miss this aspect in the volume. However, those who seek a detailed account of the employment of digital tools for organising data, developing websites and computer games will find the book a useful and inspiring contribution to the emerging sub-field of digital anthropology.

MARTIN SLAMA
*Institute for Social Anthropology, Austrian Academy of Sciences (Austria)*

**Weiss, Erica. 2014. *Conscientious objectors in Israel: citizenship, sacrifice, trials of fealty.* Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press. 216 pp. Hb.: US$49.95. ISBN: 978-0812245929.**

Israel is a highly militarised society. At the heart of Israel's armed forces lies the system of conscription: men are typically drafted for three years of service, women for two years. As this powerful ethnography reveals, refusing to join the ranks of the military often results in severe social sanctions. 'What I am really afraid of afterwards is the career', says a young Israeli contemplating conscientious objection. 'If am asked at job interviews what I did in the army, what will I say?' (p. 99). Conscientious objection, he believes, will destroy the prospect of a career in politics. Another young man wants to train as a musician, but he has heard that musicians who refuse military service are systematically boycotted. A young woman worries about a proposed law to deny driver's licences to people suspected of shirking their military duties. Yet another believes it is impossible to become a medical doctor or psychologist without enlistment.

The conscientious objectors resist the hegemony of hawks in Israeli society. Though they may be marginal and maligned in public discourse, they are troubled by decades of occupation. They seem to realise that all revolutions begin with revulsion, and that precisely because 'the state needs bodies that can absorb bullets, kill, and die a principled death' (p. 95), state authority is fragile and contestable. Over the course of three years, Weiss competently tracks and traces the trajectories of two activist groups: Combatants for Peace, consisting largely of older, war-weary Israeli and Palestinian ex-combatants, and New Profile, a youthful feminist organisation made up mainly of pacifists and women. While the Combatants

for Peace are able to reach a mainstream audience in stylised public 'confessions' because they are endowed with prestige and symbolic authority derived from the state, the New Profile objectors are consigned to an underground existence, attracting leftist, anti-establishment youths with intellectual proclivities, enamoured by veganism and rebellious rock music – and therefore derided by conventional society.

Both groups share a rejection of the *sacrificial economy*, the central analytic construct in Weiss' work, capturing the 'ways that sacrifice can be exchanged for honor and authority in society' (p. 20). Israel's sacrificial economy generates a series of dualising distinctions, placing Jews over Arabs, (European) Ashkenazi Jews over (Middle Eastern) Mizrahi Jews, men over women, the strong over the weak, the wealthy over the poor (p. 166). The military at once absorbs and reinforces hierarchies: Arabs are not required to serve in the military, thereby strengthening the ethnonational bifurcation of Israeli society. Women serve a lesser amount of time, and when they refuse they are less likely to be jailed than men. Orthodox Jews often do not serve at all, on grounds of religious exemption. Middle-class citizens are better equipped to negotiate the bureaucracy of pacifism in the Orwellian-sounding Conscience Committee, which grants exemptions largely to those who are able to frame their objection in terms of a pathological, visceral aversion to violence rather than a systemic repudiation of state authority.

For their refusal to serve, Israeli conscientious objectors often end up paying a high price and they are faced with an array of punitive sanctions: jail sentences, dismissal from the military and a renunciation of the symbolic profits available to those that serve. They face ostracism by the community, 'rejections by loved ones and strangers alike who could not accept what they had done' (p. 30). Since the armed forces are a hallowed institution, steeped in grandiose national myths about the 'need for an aggressive posture of self-defense' (p. 41), refusal entails sacrificing the profits of sacrifice. Israeli conscription is too closely entwined in the Biblical tale of Abraham's offering of Isaac to God, or the story of Jewish mass suicide in the face of a Roman attack during the Siege of Masada, or the fear of encirclement in an assumedly hostile region – in short, too tied up in national ideals of sacrifice and strength – to be rejected without repercussion.

The book is at its strongest when Weiss offers an almost journalistic rendering of scenes and situations. The work could have been edited more closely. Theoretical disquisitions could have been cut in places to make room for more descriptive detail. Still, Weiss has written an evocative, incisive and brave ethnography that brings home the trials and tribulations of resisting the state. One can only hope that Weiss will continue to provide readers with outstanding scholarship on those sparse voices that may yet carry the best chance of yielding a lasting peace.

VICTOR LUND SHAMMAS
*University of Oslo (Norway)*

**Winter, Trish and Simon Keegan-Phipps. 2013. *Performing Englishness: identity and politics in a contemporary folk resurgence* (New Ethnographies). Manchester: Manchester University Press. 224 pp. Hb.: US$81.37/£60. ISBN: 978-0719085390.**

I was a morris-dancing anthropologist. And so it was with a pang for my own English fieldwork that I saw the cover of Trish Winter and Simon Keegan-Phipps' contribution to Manchester University Press' burgeoning series of new British ethnographies. The cover shows a white-shirted dancer, complete with crossed baldrics and jolly floral crown. It's a familiar image: in town square and comedy sketch, the garden variety morris dancer is easy to spot in the English wild.

From morris to melody, English folk music and dance is observably amidst a contemporary *resurgence* (a word that Winter and Keegan-Phipps choose carefully). This clearly written and neatly organised book delves into the increasingly lively folk scene. Over the past decade folk has gained popularity and prominence, and the book's first, most substantive part charts this progression. Two chapters then illumine professional(-ising) performance, and explore folk's growing, hybrid

connection with both the musical mainstream and aesthetic culture.

The matter of what makes folk *folk* is fraught and fascinating – and amply debated elsewhere. The animating question here is instead: what makes English folk *English*? The close analysis of an English folk tune's musical characteristics in chapter 3 leads into the book's second part, where the thornier matter of English identity is directly explored.

Englishness is a very 'now' topic, particularly as Scotland ponders independence. If the English have tended to think of themselves firstly or interchangeably as British, how does the ebb-tide of the union's northerly space rework that identity? Identity issues shadow Westminster's legislative halls and slither, too, through the far-right politics of the English Defence League. By working through these issues chapter provides a concise introduction to the contemporary landscape of Englishness.

The English landscape itself appears in chapter 6. Folk has often skipped hand-in-hand with idyllic imaginings of 'traditional,' typically rural, England. Nostalgia for place and past stitches still within what Winter and Keegan-Phipps identify as a national 'patchwork' of rural localism, urban change and cosmopolitan mingling. Chapter 7, simply titled 'Englishness', picks up the tangling theme and is a highlight of the book. In bringing together the folkiness of folk with the Englishness of England, this chapter offers a fascinating glimpse at the dance of construction and contestation. The chapter presents a diverse cast: the British National Party's pro-folk proclamations meet Folk Against Fascism's campaigning backlash meet The Imagined Village's performative amalgam of fiddle, folktune, sitar and social commentary. Readers and authors surely share the question: *whose* Englishness is it anyway?

The complexities of Englishness that are chapter 7's strength are equally the book's weakness. It is a difficult task to inspect identity tangles without becoming knotted up, too. The tricky twining of Englishness and Britishness compounds the difficulty, pushing the authors to limn Englishness; however, the authors' justification for something being an English expression is awkwardly often only their say-so. Sometimes the analysis of Englishness grows tangentially specialised: I felt frustratingly waylaid by descriptions of the arrangement of buttons on a melodeon and discussions of diatonicism versus pentatonicism. This may fascinate the musicologically literate, but is likely to douse the book's appeal to undergraduates without such knowledge. Meanwhile, the notable English North–South divide is largely left aside (and strangely so, given its loud, long national significance).

I began this review by situating myself as a morris-dancing anthropologist because this perspective flavoured my perception of the book. If I had hoped to revisit my dancing days in thick description, I was disappointed. Despite the series title, this is not what I – stickler anthropologist – would call ethnography. From film studies and ethnomusicology respectively, Winter and Keegan-Phipps have worked diligently to analyse music and interview performers. Yet their data, though textured, says little of the people who dance, sing and listen to folk. Voices in the book belong to pivotal performers – but how is the garden-variety morris dancer engaging with Englishness?

There are few ready answers here – but perhaps knotty identity questions are ultimately unanswerable. And, as Englishness attracts more scholarly attention, it is the sketchy preliminaries and intriguing, unexpected suggestions that will prove most engaging. Anthropologists might particularly respond to the conceptual experiment with indigeneity that drives Winter and Keegan-Phipps' conclusion, a fittingly provocative end.

BRYONNY GOODWIN-HAWKINS
*School of Social and Political Sciences, The University of Melbourne (Australia)*