

PROPHET MOTIVE: DEGUCHI ONISABURŌ, OOMOTO, AND THE RISE OF NEW RELIGIONS IN IMPERIAL JAPAN. By Nancy K. Stalker. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008. Pp. ix + 265. Paper, \$30.00

During the course of Japan's rapid modernization in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the new religion Oomoto, led by the larger-than-life Renaissance man Deguchi Onisaburō (1871-1948), emerged as an influential force not only in religious life but in politics, the arts, media, business, and other fields. The group attracted over 1 million followers and persevered in the face of suppression until it was finally destroyed by the Japanese state in 1935 for having encroached upon hegemonic government control. Literally hundreds of religious groups in Japan today trace their origins to Oomoto, and countless Japanese religious figures have relied on the model of leadership created by Onisaburō, who enthusiastically made use of art and media as he tirelessly promoted himself and his organization. In her excellent first book, Stalker contributes welcome theoretical discussions to work on Japanese "new religions" by outlining what she calls Onisaburō's "charismatic entrepreneurship." Her introduction, which adds considerations of media and marketing to explanations of the rise of new religions, would serve undergraduates as a useful follow-up to the first chapter of Helen Hardacre's *Kurozumikyō and the New Religions of Japan*, now a standard text in courses on Japanese religion. The six chapters that follow deal with a wide array of topics, including Oomoto's conflation of Shintō and *kokugaku* (Nativism) with a global culture of spiritism and the occult, Onisaburō's complex ethos of Japanese essentialism and peaceful international engagement, and the group's ultimately disastrous embrace of Japanese nationalism in the 1930s. Readers looking for a straightforward chronicle of Oomoto's history or the life of Onisaburō may be frustrated by Stalker's complex explorations of thematic elements, and at times she appears to have sacrificed attention to detail in favor of pursuing broader ideas. But the deftly titled *Prophet Motive* breathes new life into the study of modern Japanese religion, and, as the fact that it has already been published in Japanese demonstrates, Stalker's book promises to be a key text in our field.

Levi McLaughlin
Wofford College

Buddhism

THE INCEPTION OF YOGĀCĀRA-VIJÑĀNAVĀDA. By Hartmut Buescher. Beiträge zur Kultur- und Geistesgeschichte Asiens, Vol. 62. Vienna, Austria: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2008. Pp. xxx + 230. €49.00.

This book is a welcome contribution to the ongoing project of constructing the historical and textual development of the Yogācāra school of Indian Buddhism during the second to fourth centuries CE, and is primarily addressed to Yogācāra specialists engaged in such "historico-philological"

analyses of religious traditions. It thus extends, and explicitly presupposes knowledge of, Schmithausen's methodologically similar search for the textual origins of the concept of *ālayavijñāna* (*Ālayavijñāna*, Tokyo: International Institute for Buddhist Studies, 1987). Buescher, though, is searching for the origin of not just one Yogācāra concept, but "of a specifically defined Yogācāra-Vijñānavāda stage of philosophical reflection," defined in terms of three "constellated" concepts—*ālayavijñāna*, *svabhāvatraya*, and *vijñaptimātra(tā)*. The Yogācāra-Vijñānavāda school is thus defined doxographically, albeit with philologically reconstructed genealogies replacing traditional ones. Though they are ultimately looking for different things in the same materials, the book is devoted to demonstrating that *ālayavijñāna* first occurs not (as Schmithausen argues) isolated in the voluminous *Yogācārabhūmi*, but rather *systematically* related to the other two essential Yogācāra-Vijñānavāda concepts in the authoritative *Samdhinirmocana-sūtra*. The work thus faces the challenges endemic to the historical reconstruction of ancient Indian textual traditions in general: It requires compiling countless bits of discrete information and marshaling them into "probable" scenarios (expressed in such qualifications as "suggests," "we may assume," etc.). Buescher's dense, detailed, and complex argumentation along these lines is, unfortunately, often obscured by convoluted syntax and sprawling sentences. This reservation aside, the work seriously challenges Schmithausen's hypothesis, is rich and rigorous throughout, and will certainly stimulate further work on the historical development of the Yogācāra school.

William S. Waldron
Middlebury College

DICTIONARY AND THESAURUS OF TOCHARIAN A, VOLUME 1: A–J. Compiled by Gerd Carling in collaboration with Georges-Jean Pinault and Werner Winter. Wiesbaden, Germany: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2009. Pp. xxxix + 204. €54.00.

The Tocharian dialects A and B were the vehicle of a flourishing Buddhist literature (translations from Indian sources and original compositions) along the Northern Silk Road from the sixth to the eighth century CE. Carling's book is the first installment (covering one-third of the alphabet) of a dictionary of the Eastern dialect A, updating Poucha's etymological dictionary (1955) and the glossary of Thomas and Krause's primer (1964) in the light of newly available manuscripts (the Yanqi *Maitreyasamitiṇātaka* and c. 630 fragments in Berlin and Paris). The author demonstrated her expertise in a 2000 monograph on the Tocharian case system and a series of articles on Tocharian language and literature, and her dictionary is of a very high quality. It covers the material exhaustively and with attention to philological detail. Each entry provides a translation, a list of forms, complete citation of sources (hence *Thesaurus*), bibliographical references, and notes on derivation. The dictionary does not discuss Proto-Indo-European connections. It

distinguishes Middle Indo-Aryan and Sanskrit as donor languages and recognizes the importance of Gāndhārī; this could be systematized as a three-way distinction between general Indo-Aryan, dialect color, and signs of Sanskritization. Space could be saved by eliminating repeated translations in the parts of entries. The dictionary is an indispensable new tool for linguists and philologists, and one looks forward to further volumes and a single-volume edition.

Stefan Baums
Bukkyo University

DIVINE CONTINGENCY: THEOLOGIES OF DIVINE EMBODIMENT IN MAXIMOS THE CONFESSOR AND TSONG KHA PA. By Thomas Cattoi. Gorgias Easter Christian Studies, 7. Piscataway, NJ: Gorgias Press, 2008. Pp. xiii + 307. Cloth, \$105.00.

This volume is more an extended study of Maximos the Confessor than a work of comparative theology, but its substantial chapters on Tibetan Buddhism are a welcome novelty. It is rare to see a book range so freely over thinkers as diverse as Evagrius, Jikme Lingpa, and Judith Butler. The result is a bit of a mash-up, in which various Tibetan writers are marshaled to prosecute charges in a postmodern staging of the Origenist Controversy, and the reader's appreciation for *Divine Contingency* will be directly proportionate to her patience for speculative fancy. Cattoi is best when he does not stray far from his theme: His criticism of John Keenan's "Mahayana Christology" should be required reading for anyone interested in Buddhist-Christian dialogue. Still, Cattoi's enthusiasm occasionally outstrips his expertise, as when he challenges S. Karmay's understanding of the history of the Great Perfection. Cattoi's understanding of the history of Roman Catholic theology is also shaky, and he depends almost exclusively on unreliable secondary sources. Few specialists, for example, would turn to J. Milbank and C. Pickstock for an understanding of the Franciscan theologian Duns Scotus. These concerns notwithstanding, *Divine Contingency* is a unique example of Buddhist-Christian dialogue, and the speculatively inclined will benefit from perusing it.

Trent Pomplun
Loyola University Maryland

THE INNER SCIENCE OF BUDDHIST PRACTICE: VASUBANDHU'S SUMMARY OF THE FIVE HEAPS WITH COMMENTARY BY STHIRAMATI. By Artemus B. Engle. Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion Publications, 2009. Pp. xiii + 557. \$34.95.

Engle's book presents a detailed examination of traditional fifth-century CE Indian Buddhist Abhidharma classifications and categories of the five aggregates (*skandhas*) through the interpretative lens of Tibetan Gelukpa "stages of the path" (*lam rim*) commentarial exegesis. The study accomplishes this based on a trans-

lation and analysis of Vasubandhu's *Summary of the Five Heaps* (*Pañcaskandhaprakaraṇa*) and Sthiramati's *Detailed Commentary on the Summary of the Five Heaps* (*Pañcaskandhaprakaraṇavibhāṣyam*) in two parts. Part One consists of a Prologue and four sections that explain and elucidate the manner in which Engle relates practices on the "Stages of the Path" to Vasubandhu's *Summary*. This includes such topics as the suffering of lower realms of rebirth, taking refuge in the Three Jewels, and the doctrines of rebirth and karma. Part Two provides Engle's translations of Vasubandhu's *Summary* along with Sthiramati's *Detailed Commentary* followed by two appendices; Appendix 1 consists of the Tibetan translation of Vasubandhu's *Summary* (*phung po lnga'i rab tu byed pa*) and Appendix 2 contains a Sanskrit reconstruction of Vasubandhu's text. The Sanskrit reconstruction is superfluous, as the author himself acknowledges that a Sanskrit manuscript of Vasubandhu's *Summary* has been recovered from Lhasa, Tibet, and recently edited by scholars from Beijing and Vienna. While this study may not be as philologically precise and historically analytic as some scholars may expect, Engle's book is successful in carrying out its purported aim as a synchronic presentation of the soteriological understanding of Abhidharma for contemporary Euro-North American Buddhist practitioners drawn to modern Tibetan Buddhist traditions.

James B. Apple
University of Calgary

THE TIBETANS. By Matthew T. Kapstein. The Peoples of Asia. Oxford: Blackwell, 2006. Pp. xviii + 360. \$33.95.

That a major scholar has put together a textbook on the history and culture of Tibet will come as a relief to all with serious interest in the subject, given how much myth and speculation has been written on this topic. Kapstein's work provides a highly accessible and comprehensive account of scholarship on the subject, ensuring that his book will feature prominently on reading lists for students at all levels, especially undergraduates. He provides detailed descriptions of the geography, archeology, prehistory, culture, religion, society, and arts of Tibet, grouped around a detailed narrative account of Tibetan history from before the imperial period (seventh to ninth centuries) to the present day, including much material that will be new to almost all readers as well as copious translations from Tibetan writings. Kapstein emphasizes the diversity within Tibetan areas, practices, histories, and beliefs; and he roots his discussions in a broad notion of economic pragmatism, showing how the competition for regime survival and dominance can explain tensions in religion as well as politics. The book includes lucid explanations of contemporary controversies among specialists, such as the debate over which king first introduced Buddhism to Tibet, the use of religion as an "ideological mask" to justify sectarian massacres throughout the Buddhist period, the disastrous dependence of Tibetan factions on foreign armies since the seventeenth century, and

the current emergence of Chinese as the language of choice for many young Tibetans.

Robert Barnett
Columbia University

BUDDHISM AND SCIENCE. By Donald S. Lopez, Jr. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2008. Pp. xiii + 264.

In tracing the development of the discourse on Buddhism and Science over the last 150 years, this informative book documents the different ways in which the teachings of the former and the findings of the latter have been represented as compatible over time. Lopez's intent in presenting this detailed historical analysis is to understand the persistence of this claim of compatibility in the face of ever-changing historical (and cultural) contexts that employ the shifting referents "Buddhism" and "Science." As the meaning of these two terms changes over time, the affinity between "Buddhism and Science" comes to refer to the affinity between the doctrine of karma and the universal laws governing a mechanistic universe; to Buddha's purported understanding of the theory of relativity; or, more recently, to neurological research on the effects on the brain of "Buddhist" meditation. By approaching the material as a historian of Buddhist thought and practice, Lopez asks thought-provoking questions, such as: What is gained (and lost) by Buddhism in its conjunction with science? What is the particular trait in this tradition that has sustained this conjunction for over a century and a half? He argues that this construction of Buddhism as a "rational" religion, the most compatible with science and hence best suited to modernity, comes at the price of discounting some of its fundamental, though "exotic" and pre-modern, elements: its deities, visualizations of the fantastic, invocation, etc. Lopez's study makes an original contribution to the field of science and religion and is suitable to undergraduate and graduate

seminars as well as the general reader interested in the Buddhism-and-science discourse.

Alberta Ferrario
University of Pennsylvania

CONVERGING WAYS? CONVERSION AND BELONGING IN BUDDHISM AND CHRISTIANITY. Edited by John D'Arcy May. Sankt Ottilien, Germany: EOS Klosterverlag Sankt Ottilien, 2007. Pp. 206. Paper, €15.80.

This collection of essays from the Sixth Conference of the European Network of Buddhist-Christian Studies contains autobiographical accounts, historical research, and empirical data on the problem of "multiple religious belonging" in Buddhism and Christianity. Its centerpiece is an exchange between P. Williams, Professor of Indian and Buddhist Philosophy at the University of Bristol, and J. Cabezón, the XIV Dalai Lama Chair in Tibetan Buddhism at the University of California, Santa Barbara. Cabezón, a Roman Catholic convert to Tibetan Buddhism, offers a perceptive criticism of Williams's account of his conversion from Tibetan Buddhism to Roman Catholicism. Not to be outdone, Williams is happy to provide an "only partially repentant" rejoinder to Cabezón's criticism. Their exchange, which very well might be unique in the history of Buddhist-Christian dialogue, shows the great importance that both Tibetan Buddhism and Roman Catholicism give to epistemology and metaphysics in establishing their respective claims. These two essays make quite a contrast to the "being Buddhist, being Christian, being both, being neither" approach so often taken in such discussions. (See, for example, R. Habito's article in this collection.) It is refreshing that both Williams and Cabezón, like Tsongkhapa himself, recognize that the tetralemma requires additional modal operators, and especially so when one's religious identity is at stake.

Trent Pomplun
Loyola University Maryland