

## BOOK REVIEWS

## Single Reviews

## Creating a Nation with Cloth: Women, Wealth, and Tradition in the Tongan Diaspora by Ping-Ann Addo

New York: Berghahn, 2013. 252 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12380

**Susanne Kuehling**  
University of Regina

This book connects discourses on value, gender, and textile wealth and demonstrates how they relate to notions of nationhood and home. There are now at least as many Tongans in the diaspora as there are in Tonga itself, and family ties form an ethnoscape marked by “Tongan” practices of gift giving. Ping-Ann Addo’s multisited research in Tonga and with Tongan families in New Zealand and the United States discusses the ways in which Tongan commoner women, especially second-generation migrants, lead Tonga’s modernity as a multiterritorial nation, creating and exchanging gifts and investing in the “creative possibilities in this tension between movement and dwelling” (p. 30).

This approach opens a microscopic perspective on the options and strategies of Tongan women and textile wealth, called *koloa*. A table (pp. 34–35) is useful for keeping track of the different types of *koloa* (bark cloth, plaited, old, shiny, large, sewn, embroidered, crocheted, decorated, repaired, etc). In brief, the love and care, the work and sacrifice, of a woman coalesces in the textile when it is created, infused with her thoughts and emotions, her *mana* (spiritual efficacy or potency) and skills, showing what it means to be a good, loving Tongan mother. By making and exchanging *koloa*, Addo convincingly argues that Tongan women “keep people, place, and values connected through time and over space—in a continually renewed sense of being at home” (p. 198). This is how Tongan women create a multiterritorial social universe, “simultaneously characterized by movement and dwelling—rootedness and rootedness, in the words of James Clifford (1997)” (p. 18).

In chapter 1, Addo discusses the textile genre of *koloa*, focusing on the accepted variations, innovations, stylistic continuity, and creativity of, and within, the various categories. Chapter 2 describes the creative group work involved in making bark cloth sheets (*ngatu*) from various materials, including synthetic fiber. While commoner women “are marginalized within the twin patriarchies of

Tongan culture and New Zealand political economy” (p. 72) and struggle with poor job opportunities, they nevertheless “occupy a critical position in the facilitation of global flows and guarantee the everyday and ceremonial sustenance of their families.”

Chapter 3 presents three case studies that take a close look at the real-life pressures and strategies, the emotions and considerations, and the skills and shortcomings of today’s handling of *koloa* in multiterritorial Tonga. Family events, although burdensome, provide a stage for “fluidity” (Teaiwa 2005), “creating contexts for solidarity that also incorporate fluidity between multiple social roles and social situations” (p. 115).

In chapter 4, the notion of love (*ʻōfa*) is foregrounded as a motherly, womanly virtue that morphs into the textile, increasing its value together with the life events that mark the exchange of these textiles. The role of the church as recipient of gifts “beyond reason” represents a particular challenge to low-income Tongans in the diaspora who cannot afford to compete appropriately and who may change churches to avoid the shame (*mā*) of underperformance (p. 136). The case studies all illustrate the need to include the reality of a modern global economy into gift-exchange considerations. Cash is now an important element of gifting practices. Chapter 5 highlights the various ways in which Tongans in the diaspora are challenged by tensions, contradictions, and pressures resulting from overlapping exchange spheres and requests for remittances. Addo presents examples of innovative strategies for handling wealth in settings like a New Zealand funeral or the performance of allegiance to church and homeland in fundraising events outside of Tonga. *Koloa* can be pawned and sold and are often sent as gifts from Tonga to supportive relatives in the diaspora. As chapter 6 argues, cash can enter the gift category and gain what Annette Weiner called “symbolic density,” especially when donated at a church event (p. 174). Generous cash donations are valued evidence that diasporic Tongans are “generous, interested, and invested on numerous levels in *langa fonua*, or nation building” (p. 186).

In conclusion, the book provides a convincing case for the “fluidity” embodied in female wealth as well as how

koloa valuables “keep people, place, and values connected through time and over space—in a continually renewed sense of being at home” (p. 196). Addo makes clear that “at all levels, women are crucial to Tongan people’s realization of their highest cultural ideals because women produce the most important objects that people exchange and thereby reinforce social values through ritual exchange” (p. 191). This book is an important addition to the literature on Pacific diaspora and textile wealth. Addo could have added more to the growing literature on empathy and emotion by unpacking the notion of ‘ofa and its ambiguities, like the idea of suffering, shame, and face (*mata*). She lucidly demonstrates

how gift exchange maintains the ethos of generosity in spite of an overwhelming global pressure to accumulate and keep gifting to a minimum. New generations of diasporic Tongan women should be studied as well to follow up on this fascinating process.

#### REFERENCE CITED

Teaiwa, Teresia

2005 Solidarity and Fluidarity: Feminism as Product and Productive Force for Regionalism in the Pacific. Paper presented at “Gender, Globalization, and Militarism” conference, University of Hawai‘i at Manoa, Honolulu, February 4.

## Violence and Warfare among Hunter-Gatherers by Mark W. Allen and Terry L. Jones, eds.

Walnut Creek: Left Coast, 2014. 391 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12381

Douglas P. Fry

University of Alabama at Birmingham

This edited volume is certainly a “must-read” for anyone interested in the anthropology of violence or the origins of war. Attempting to cover all 19 chapters in a short review would be a recipe for superficiality, so instead I will focus on broader issues. The vast majority of the chapters are data based and constitute the strongest aspect of this book. They examine cases from various continents, sometimes employ innovative methods (e.g., stable isotopes to assess in-group or out-group membership and the analysis of contingency tables by using simulations), mostly consider cases from prehistory, and are interesting reading.

The weakest sections of the book come at the beginning and the end. The theoretical grounding is shallow and sometimes polemic. Because the editors are convinced that war goes way back, they do not fully examine how the topical chapters help to elucidate the patterns of violence and warfare vis-à-vis population growth, sedentism, and social complexity within the last 10,000 years. By contrast, a topical chapter by John Darwent and Christyann Darwent provides a lucid diachronic analysis that contrasts patterns of war and violence in northwestern Alaska and the eastern Arctic. The Darwents tie warfare and its absence to ecology and social organization.

The editors assert that nearly all of the case studies “support a long chronology for war and violence” (p. 354)—meaning millions of years. However, the chapters consider the European Paleolithic–Mesolithic transition; as far back as 9,000 BP; 4,000 to 400 BP; 1,000 BP; 2,000 BP; 6,500 to 3,000 BP; back to 5,000 BP; 3,000 BP; 1,180 BP; 900 BP;

6,000 BP; and, finally, a single chapter (by James Chatters) older than 9,000 BP. Because nearly all chapters deal only with the Holocene, the editors’ claims of a long chronology are not based on relevant archaeological data. For Paleoamerican remains dated before 9,000 BP, Chatters reports no violence indicative of warfare and instead concludes that violence was mostly nonlethal, “between members of the same social group,” and that “it would appear that the intent of the conflict was rarely, if ever, to kill the victim” (pp. 81–82). In short, there is absolutely no archaeological data presented in this volume that support a long chronology of warfare, contrary to the conclusions stated by the editors.

The editors contend that some chapters in the mobile forager part of their book show warfare. One problem here is a misplacement of chapters into the nomadic forager section on peoples that were not nomadic but lived in villages and showed signs of social complexity. One such misplaced chapter is by Kenneth Reid on the interior Northwest of North America, which explores “plateau pacifism,” as proposed decades ago by Verne Ray. Of significance, this study shows evidence of “emergent social complexity” (p. 177), with villages, cemeteries, and other features that are atypical of mobile foragers. Reid discusses fortifications, lack of sacked villages, and low level of skeletal trauma, and he concludes that, at 2,000 BP, “the scarcity of such evidence [of group violence], certainly by comparison with neighboring areas, underscores the regional lacunae of organizational features of warfare” (p. 170). Another fascinating chapter by Matthew Des Lauriers focuses on the ethnohistorical and archaeological evidence for warfare on a small island off Baja California. This study cannot be taken as evidence for warfare in mobile foragers either. It has been misclassified because the islanders lived in permanent villages of up to

481 residences. Des Lauriers draws parallels to the complex foragers of the Northwest Coast.

I find it surprising that Lewis Binford's (2001) magnum opus is not cited. Using a large sample of foragers, Binford (2001: ch. 12) provides an important context for interpreting the studies in this book. Binford demonstrates that, across habitats, low-density foragers use mobility as an adjustment to food acquisition regardless of habitat richness. This finding speaks directly to Paul Roscoe's chapter on high-density sedentary or semisedentary New Guinea foragers. Binford found that at population densities of about nine persons per 100 square kilometers, a threshold is reached and the population in relation to resources becomes "packed," which results in shifts toward sedentism and social complexity. New Guinea foragers are "packed" and have no place to move. Generally, concentrated marine or riverine resources

vis-à-vis population density leads to more specialized food acquisition strategies, settling down, and ultimately intergroup conflict and probably warfare. It is interesting to consider Binford's findings in relation to chapters on the resource-rich Murray River of Australia, the Baja Island, the Channel Islands Chumash, coastal New Guinea, Prince Rupert Harbour, and northwestern Alaska. Reliance on science can move us forward in understanding war and peace whereas "hawk-dove" polemics certainly will not.

#### REFERENCE CITED

Binford, Lewis

2001 *Constructing Frames of Reference: An Analytical Method for Archaeological Theory Building Using Ethnographic and Environmental Data Set*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

## The Ecology of the Barí: Rainforest Horticulturalists of South America by Stephen Beckerman and Roberto Lizarralde

Austin: University of Texas Press, 2013. 291 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12382

William Balée

*Tulane University*

This book springs from more than 100 field trips by two ethnographers to a little-known indigenous society of the Caribbean rim from the 1960s to the 1980s. It also covers their work in archives and libraries in reconstructing the more distant past of that society. The authors, Stephen Beckerman and the late Roberto Lizarralde, render to us the first treatise in English on the Barí of the Maracaibo Basin in Venezuela, drawing on the long-term collaboration of both. The work treats a singularly interesting group that simultaneously speaks to their past, present, and, I believe, potential future. The authors cover important issues in the ecological anthropology of lowland South America in additional ways.

The book oscillates between indigenous life histories and documentation of the etic sort—aerial photography from the past; archival and newspaper documentation from the past; measurements of house sizes, field sizes, catchment zone sizes, and so forth; returns on fishing and hunting per person per hour—both of past and present. In addition, it includes censuses and birth and death records over about a 50-year period. The broad methodology involves participant-observation and collection of quantifiable data. These data feature number of live births per woman past childbearing age interviewed and the number of children who survived infancy if they had a secondary father (i.e., a lover of their mother apart from her husband, who is

recognized as such before their birthdate, either at conception or during gestation of their mother). The methodology also encompasses the historical record, reconstructed from interviews, documents, and firsthand observation dating from 1961 when Robert Lizarralde first visited a newly contacted group of Bari. All this yields, in the aggregate, significant insights that the authors divide into three principal chapters (specifically, chs. 4, 5, and 6 of a seven-chapter book), called, sequentially, "production," "protection," and "reproduction."

The authors seek to answer big questions, some applicable to all societies, others more limited to lowland South America, and still some only focused on the one human group at the center of the ethnography. They are careful about how they pose these questions and admirably willing to admit when they are wrong, as regarding previously reported details of Bari society and culture. The authors focus on issues deriving from evolutionary ecology and reproductive biology, yet they are sensitive to both quantitative and qualitative limits on the reliability of data taken from a single society over a relatively short (for human reproductive purposes) time frame. Life histories and the personal observations of Bari individuals enrich whatever gaps might lie in the middle of the grander project of coming to grips with ecology—or, more to the point, with human adaptation of the Bari in tropical moist forest. In the end, these findings will stand the test of time for a number of reasons, the most important of which is the way the data were collected and reported: namely, with care. Ethnography goes on, while paradigms, however dogged, typically fall eventually

on the battlefield of ideas; this is no more transparent than in the world of Amazonianist ethnology.

The book contains a solid overview of the geography, landforms, and wildlife pertinent to the Bari. Of note is the discussion of big longhouses and the elliptical fields that tend to surround them. I demur here on this: "The natural environment of the central Bari homeland was for the most part unchanged by human presence . . . To survive and reproduce, the Bari needed to adapt to the plants and animals that made up the rain forest" (p. 3). I don't see that proposition proven herein, and I think the book would not have suffered any of its precision were those two sentences to have been omitted. The Bari are horticulturalists, and even if not possessing a large inventory of domesticates nor exceptionally large clearings for their crops (p. 216), the effects of agriculture over the long term sometimes change forest composition. The issue is not significant in the context of the authors' focus, which mostly regards how the Bari have survived the societal impacts of contact with differ-

ent groups through time, including Spanish conquistadores and slave raiders, Capuchin missionaries, oil companies, and homesteaders, some of whom sought to remove them from their lands by any means possible (including murder and mayhem, epidemics, and depopulation). Indeed, they are survivors of a lengthy and intense, if intermittent, contact situation. The volume nevertheless substantiates their retention of traditional lowland South American traits, including marriage patterns (as in the avunculate, sororal polygyny, and the original concept—proffered herein—of partible paternity); an interesting clearcut division of society (from any one person's perspective) into consanguines and affines; the language (of the Chibchan family); the agricultural system, even if some crops have been lost; the technology and knowledge associated with hunting and fishing; their continuance in upriver localities far from foci of permanent contact. In conclusion, the book is a solid and well-written contribution most appropriate for assignment to courses in ecological anthropology and South American ethnology.

## Religious Bodies Politic: Rituals of Sovereignty in Buryat Buddhism by Anya Bernstein

Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013. 280 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12383

**Mitashree Srivastava**

*University of Delhi*

In a transnational world where boundaries are becoming blurred and variations are getting entangled, social institutions are losing their resilience and are being transformed. Religion is one such social institution. Anthropological studies of religion are quite interesting as they have the potential of unraveling those facets of humanity that play a latent role in restructuring the human society in tumultuous times. *Religious Bodies Politic: Rituals of Sovereignty in Buryat Buddhism* is one such anthropological study. It examines the role of Buddhism in restructuring Buryat social worlds in the wake of collapse of state socialism and rise of global market capitalism.

*Religious Bodies Politic* is an ethnographic anthropological account that traverses various temporal and spiritual realms, cuts across both time and space, and chooses specific cultural historical contexts while illustrating the factors and challenges of the marginality of Buryat Buddhists (a cosmopolitan Siberian Buddhist community) in both the Russian Federation and the larger transnational world of Buddhism. The book explores rituals of sovereignty that help Buryat Buddhism to consolidate its power within the Russian State and build networks with a larger Buddhist world.

The book discusses the sharp contrast between the emerging notions of "Buryat Buddhism" at the Russian Republic of Buryatia (which is autocephalous and loyal to the Russian Federation) and that of a wing of Buddhism at Buryatia that traces its historical "roots" to Mongolia, Tibet, and India while striving to gain a cultural recognition in transnational Buddhist world within Asian Eurasian intellectual paradigms.

The book exhibits vigorous archival research on evolutionary history of Buddhism in Buryatia in Russia with special reference to its historical links to the South Asian Buddhist world. The book begins with a very elaborate introduction that can best be understood only after going through the six chapters of the book in detail—else the reader might find the brilliantly written introduction as a mundane combination of Russian history and Buddhist philosophy.

The titles of the chapters serve as frameworks within the boundaries of which the author perhaps desires her work to be interpreted by any reader this book might reach by purpose (as in Buddhism, there are no coincidences), but this leaves the reader with no option of interpreting the book beyond the obvious.

The narratives in the book hinge on understandings of several Buddhist precepts such as those of life and death; self or ego; doctrine of "upaya" or skillful means; reincarnation (bodies in flux); discipleship (lineages in motion); nirvana or Buddhahood; karmic creditors; and sacred rituals (such

as *chod* and *oboo* rituals diamond sutra, money and wealth, and so forth), all of which are crucial to understanding assertions of sovereignty via sovereign bodies (which include live bodies, dead bodies, famous bodies, reincarnated bodies, celibate and monastic bodies, and virtually dismembered bodies). Focus is laid on materiality of bodies that serve as quintessential technologies to reveal the past, shape the present, and refashion the future of Buryat Buddhism. The research is backed by theoretical underpinnings of biopolitics, body politics, and necropolitics, which emphasize the mobility of bodies across space, time, and life and death. Anthropological notions of body and embodiment, ritual economy, gender, money and morality, gift and “free gift,” market and exchange, and business and social responsibility also broaden the scope of the understanding of refashioning of Buryat Buddhism in a rapidly changing new social and economic order.

The book no doubt has some bold and sophisticated twists that general readers might find difficult to comprehend. Academicians and researchers working in anthropological domains will definitely find the book conceptually rich and theoretically strong. If only the author could have extended the universe of her anthropological study to include in its premise the Buddhist world at Bodh Gaya—the land of Buddha’s enlightenment—additional information on Buryat Buddhists’ links to India could have been explored (the above suggestion is made keeping in mind arrival of Buryat Pilgrims at Bodh Gaya, India, and the

extreme significance of Bodh Gaya in promoting transnational Buddhism).

*Religious Bodies Politic* advances the study of anthropology of religion in contemporary world. With religion having no universal definition and identities varying across demography ethnicity, gender, generations, and time epochs, the question of authentic identities or authentic models in religion become important and debatable for academic purpose. The utility of such debates might help in broadening the practical applicability of anthropology as a discipline. *Religious Bodies Politic* carries such debates one step further and explores the channels of reentering of world Buddhism toward the north in times of religio-political exigency.

To conclude, author Anya Bernstein seems to have well survived what she mentions as “torment of secrecy” and also accumulated much “symbolic capital” while researching in India. I am also looking forward to watching her documentaries, *Join Me in Shambhala* (2002) and *In Pursuit of a Siberian Shaman* (2006).

#### REFERENCES CITED

Bernstein Anya

2002 *Join Me in Shambhala*. 30 min. Color. Tibetan and Buryat with English subtitles. Documentary Educational Resources. Watertown.

2006 *In Pursuit of a Siberian Shaman*. 72 min. Color. Russian and Buryat with English subtitles. Documentary Educational Resources. Watertown.

## Back Stories: U.S. News Production and Palestinian Politics by Amahl A. Bishara

Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2013. 344 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12384

Steven Rousso-Schindler

California State University, Long Beach

How often do people read newspaper articles or watch a television news report and consider all the different people that contribute to the production of those news stories? Further, how often do journalists go far enough in depth in their stories to sufficiently explain the complex sociopolitical dynamics that help shape a news event? Amahl Bishara’s illuminating ethnography *Back Stories: U.S. News Production and Palestinian Politics* shows how few of the “back stories” audiences get when they consume news—and she reveals the stakes for missing this critical background information. The main purpose of the ethnography, then, is to unpack the complex process of how news in the occupied

Palestinian territories is generated for audiences in the United States.

To help tease out her main thesis, Bishara shows how different Palestinians involved in journalism—including translators, reporters, fixers, guides, drivers, and photojournalists—contribute to the production of news stories in the West Bank. Analyzing the labor practices of these often-unrecognized or underrecognized contributors show that news stories can only be constructed through a process of “accumulated authorship.” Without their local expertise, it would be extremely difficult for foreign journalists to generate news stories with the participation of local Palestinians. Revealing in detail the contributions of Palestinian journalists to news stories is also a way of talking back to orientalist claims that Palestinians are nonobjective epistemic others, incapable of contributing to the production of knowledge in general and trustworthy news stories more specifically.



The ethnography also investigates the unique conditions in the West Bank that restrict how news gets produced. This includes detailed discussions about how press freedoms are curtailed by a wide range of Israeli state and military practices that restrict journalists' access to news events. A sophisticated argument is constructed here about how Israeli-state officials justify these practices by branding Palestinian journalists as threats to Israeli national security. Later in the book, there is a discussion about how the embodied experiences of journalists affect the work of news-gathering. Avoiding Israeli gunfire and tear gas at protests or crossing through a dizzying array of Israeli checkpoints puts the lives of Palestinian journalists in danger yet also gives them the required proximity to news events that is necessary to help get a news story.

The book also analyzes how the creation of news stories for U.S. audiences in the West Bank creates a "feedback loop" that rebounds to influence Palestinian politics and society, which in turn influences what gets reported in the media. For example, Palestinian protests against repressive Israeli policies throughout the West Bank are popular sites for international reporting. Often, the resulting news reports tell the story about the often-violent Israeli military confrontations with Palestinian protestors. Being acutely aware of their representational struggle in the international media, sometimes Palestinians will organize a protest comprised primarily of children or religious leaders—sending a clear message of resistance through nonviolence—to shape how audiences outside the region view the Palestinian struggle for their rights. This is a strategy employed to claim agency in the narrating process of news stories over which Palestinians often have little control.

Perhaps the most important conceptual contribution of this book is the notion of "balanced objectivity." Anyone

engaged in understanding Palestine and Israel is extremely familiar with the phrase "fair and balanced." This often-repeated phrase refers to a quixotic imperative of presenting both the "Israeli" and "Palestinian" side of a story in one work. In principle, this is supposed to guarantee that audiences receive an equal, two-sided representation of any given issue. Bishara calls this specific orientation toward story construction in the news media "balanced objectivity"—objectivity being the "epistemic virtue" journalism imported from science that is achieved in journalism by providing balanced (and "disinterested") stories. In her deconstruction of this idea, Bishara shows how balance as a guiding principle for narrating news stories "flattens" the range of opinions Palestinians and Israelis have about any given issue. More problematically, she shows how this practice of balancing serves to conceal power asymmetries between Palestinians and Israelis during their interactions.

An important emphasis of this book is on explaining Palestinian culture and Palestinian–Israeli dynamics from a perspective that is often inaccessible to audiences outside the region. This happens throughout the book when Bishara gives voice to ordinary Palestinians who often go unheard. It most explicitly occurs in the "interludes" between each chapter where Palestinians, in their own words, interpret the meaning of newspaper articles created for U.S. audiences.

*Back Stories* is an important resource for scholars in anthropology, Middle East studies, and media studies. Its unique methodological approach and innovative analysis make it a work well worth reading. For teaching, this book is probably best suited for graduate or advanced undergraduate students because it assumes readers have a significant background in the relationship between Israel and Palestine.

## Jewish Families by Jonathan Boyarin. Vol. 4

New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2013. 206 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12385

**Leonard Mars**  
Swansea University

Jonathan Boyarin, an anthropologist and lawyer, demonstrates his erudition in this ambitious book that examines studies of Jewish families in a meager 162 pages (excluding bibliography, footnotes, and index). His research ranges over millennia and geographical expanses. At the outset he informs us, "this is a fast ride through space, language, bodies, and time" (p. xv). Employing a variety of sources, he discusses ancient texts, films, ethnographic records, his personal experiences, and his own family relationships.

However, his prime attention is on ethnographic studies of "the past few decades" (p. 19).

Boyarin explores the development of the Jewish family with its continuities and discontinuities. Although his focus is on the Jewish family, he stresses more than once "that Jewish families are like and different from their non-Jewish neighbours" (p. 19). Thus, he affirms J. L. Talmon's argument in his book *The Unique and the Universal* (1965) about Jews.

A major theme of Boyarin's account is the impact of social change over many centuries on the Jewish family. Moreover, that change is not unidirectional, exemplified by an Algerian Jewish family in the early 20th century that moved from being modern, French-speaking, and nuclear to becoming an extended family imbued with Arab culture

(p. 36ff). This case demonstrates the flexibility and fluidity of the Jewish family. Indeed, the ideas of tradition and modernity themselves are brought into question.

As an anthropologist, Boyarin revives concepts such as kinship and descent, which have fallen into desuetude over recent decades. He also warns us not to equate normative statements of behavior with actual practice, especially when he considers Mark Zborowski and Elizabeth Herzog's classic study (1952) of the *shtetl* (small-town Jewish community), *Life Is with People* (which informed the musical *Fiddler on the Roof* and has colored popular views of family life among Eastern European Jewry, from which most U.S. Jews are descended).

Although Boyarin does not refer specifically to quasi-kin among Jews, he documents fictive kinship in three situations: first, among immigrants to the United States who formed "family clubs," similar to other immigrant groups, that supplied mutual aid to those who came from the "Old Country" (86 ff); second, when survivors of the *shoah*, otherwise known as the Holocaust, fashioned ties of kinship so as to reconstitute shattered family bonds (128ff); and third, to describe the role of Lubavitch, Chassidic, missionary couples who operate on university campuses and in remote parts of the world where few Jews reside. They provide quasi-familial support with their Friday night meals in addition to religious services and advice (p. 114).

Qua lawyer, he examines cases that appear before the Jewish religious court, the *beth din*, and the secular courts of the United States and the United Kingdom. His concern with the state courts demonstrates that Jews do not constitute insulated communities, and their family relationships are subject to the laws of the lands in which they live. In this respect, Boyarin briefly refers to the effects of Roman law on Jewish communities in the Middle Ages (p. 48). Indeed, he argues that the impact of the societies in which Jews live as minorities has influenced their family relationships. Moreover, it is not just a one-way transmission because he cites Jewish influences on the host society. He reveals his mastery of biblical and Talmudic

texts on issues of circumcision (pp. 139–143), education, marriage, inheritance, succession, and Jewish identity.

North American and European Jewish communal leaders frequently warn of the demise of the Jewish family as a result of assimilation, especially intermarriage. Boyarin is not so pessimistic. He contends that "new and viable forms of Jewish family are being invented and implemented now and will continue to be for the foreseeable future" (p. 156).

He detects three new forms in the transformation of the Jewish family. The first is "the re-invention of traditionalism" with its stress on endogamy, isolation from the non-Jewish world, and strict gender divisions in the nonegalitarian family. The second is a more open family form in which heterosexual, endogamous marriage is preferred but not enforced and in which the family is integrated into the modern, wider society. Third is the emergence of a Jewish family that would embrace "intermarriage, single parentage, same-sex marriage, and the inclusion of Jews and non-Jews, in the same family" (p. 161).

Boyarin's analysis combines both a formal, academic style and a chatty, informal manner expressed in his conclusion, "I wonder what you have made of this book" (p. 161). Well, this reviewer considers it a stimulating, informative, and provocative read that manages to cover so much in so few pages. It is relevant not just for students of Jewish Studies but also for anthropologists, historians, lawyers, geneticists, and theologians. As the author states and has successfully demonstrated, "This book is certainly not only for Jews, and it is for Jews who don't identify with rabbinic tradition as well as for those who do" (p. 19).

## REFERENCES CITED

- Talmon, J. L.  
1965 *The Unique and the Universal*. London: Secker and Warburg.  
Zborowski, Mark, and Elizabeth Herzog  
1952 *Life Is with People: The Culture of the Shtetl*. New York: Schocken.

# The Life Informatic: Newsmaking in the Digital Era by Dominic Boyer

Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2013. 240 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12386

**Elisabetta Costa**  
University College London

In *The Life Informatic: Newsmaking in the Digital Era*, Dominic Boyer offers a brilliant investigation into the transformations

of news journalism today. Until now, no book has attempted to integrate detailed ethnographic accounts of journalistic practices and understandings, with more extensive generalizations about the state of news journalism in the digital era. The book also intelligently traces the parallel between news journalism and anthropology in the era of digital communication: the prologue and conclusion examine the

“unconscious” dimensions of digital reason that have shaped the work of anthropologists by informing their theoretical paradigms, analytical styles, and academic productions.

*The Life Informatic* builds on Berry Williams’s approach, which is based on the historical examination of the forces involved in the institutionalization of electronic mediation. The book, indeed, interprets the transformations of the world of journalism as the result of the institutionalization of digital technologies and the impact of neoliberal politics, and it describes how digital communications and neoliberalism reinforce and naturalize each other. The main argument of the book is that journalistic practices have become office-based screen works where journalists recraft information already in circulation more than writing new news. This transformation has come along with a new equilibrium between radial (one to many) and lateral (from point to point) messaging that has affected production of news, their circulation, and reception. This rebalancing has redefined journalistic authority and shaped journalists’ sense of their work.

In addition to the fascinating and brave theoretical attempt, the book’s strength is its rich and deep ethnographic description. The research is informed by the extensive examination of news journalism conducted by the author in Germany over the course of 15 years as well as the three ethnographic cases presented in the book. Each of the first three chapters includes a presentation of a distinct ethnography carried out in an important node of the journalistic ecology: an international news agency, an online news portal, and a 24/7 news radio. Chapter 1 describes the work inside the Associated Press office in Frankfurt. It focuses on the work of the slotters that decide on a fast-time basis which stories the news agencies will send out. News agencies have become a more important node in the news-making process because they deliver most of the news that is used

by newspapers and newsrooms, which now rely less on the work of their own correspondents in the face of a general lack of economic availability. Chapter 2 analyzes news making in the online portal T-Online and focuses mainly on how analytics feedback has transformed traditional relations between journalists and their readers, challenging journalists’ expertise and authority. The chapter also examines the tension between automation and agency and how journalists experience it. Chapter 3 explores how MDR INFO, a 24/7 traditional radio public broadcasting organization, resists and is affected by digital transformation while trying to adapt to the abundance of fast-time information. Chapter 4 presents the theoretical reflections on the state of news journalism in the era of digital liberalism. Boyer’s work fully succeeds in relating the technological and organizational transformations with the experience of the professionals who live it. It takes into account how journalists make sense of and interpret the ongoing changes: their thoughts and feelings are divided between a perceived threat of digitalization and increased automation and their perceptions of themselves as active agents who use their competences and professionalism to make news—what Boyer calls “mediological” and “praxiological” awareness.

*The Life Informatic* is one of those rare scholarly works that stands to make a significant contribution to the understanding of journalism today. Although it doesn’t have the pretention to comprehensively cover all the nodes of journalism, it could have been worth including an analysis of the ways that social media have been shaping the circulation, reception, and framing of news today, given the pivotal importance they have in the way people choose and read news. However, it is an exceptional book that will be destined to have a significant impact within anthropology and sociology as well as journalism and media studies.

## Pueblo Indians and Spanish Colonial Authority in Eighteenth-Century New Mexico by Tracy L. Brown

Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2013. 248 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12387

**Mark T. Lycett**

*University of Chicago*

What are the limits and forms of Pueblo ethnohistory or of historical anthropologies of colonial situations more broadly? In this volume, Tracy Brown seeks to both challenge intellectual boundaries and received narratives and to establish a methodological window into Pueblo social life during the first two centuries of Spanish colonial incorporation of New Mexico. Drawing on a variety of

documentary evidence as mediated by both archaeological and ethnographic research, Brown is able to focus on a series of cases, situations, and incidents that establish or highlight status, gender, and standpoint as key terms in the negotiation of colonial imperatives. Again and again, the Pueblo Indians appear as diverse agents differentiated by context and circumstance, drawing on a range of prior cultural practices, beliefs, and structures and practicing a multiplicity of strategies to accommodate, resist, and manipulate the forms of daily life under Spanish hegemony. The result of these “snapshots,” in Brown’s terms, is social history as a dynamic, contingent, and creative process of situated articulations



between colonizer and colonized rather than an opposition between two distinct and incommensurate cultural or social formations.

Brown traces this complex social process through four arenas: politics, economy, pathways to social power, and cohabitation and marriage. In each of these topical foci, she is able to highlight the role of gender and commoner–elite differentiation in shaping strategy, opportunity, and outcome. These nuanced analyses of position and context are very much the strength of this work and the centerpiece of Brown’s historiography. In the course of these analyses, the author develops a number of provocative ideas that will surely inspire new research and debate. These include the propositions that traditional practices and beliefs formed the basis of elite male strategies; that colonial authority reinforced existing gender and status distinctions within Pueblo society; and that Pueblo women found new paths to prestige and power outside traditional political, ritual, and community structures.

This book, however, sets out to make a larger point about the production of anthropological histories and master narratives. Brown points out that such structures are often exclusionary and often insufficient on empirical as well as methodological grounds. She focuses on the critique of three well-developed tropes in Pueblo historiography: compartmentalization, borderlands or frontiers, and teleologies of colonial authority. In the first instance, she takes on Edward Spicer’s definition of cultural compartmentalization among the Eastern Pueblo as an isolation of core cultural beliefs unaffected by colonial incorporation. Rooted as it was in the framework of acculturation, compartmentalization allowed variation in colonial encounters to be accounted for in terms of autonomous, bounded, and prior cultural configurations rather than in terms of strategic negotiation and socially differentiated agency within a complex and evolving cultural milieu. Brown is particularly interested in the way that compartmentalization in tandem with “upstreaming” or the

direct historical approach works to limit the methodological vistas of Pueblo ethnohistory. The critique of Frederick Jackson Turner’s frontier hypothesis and its Boltonian variants is well established, and this work adds to it by documenting the variety and complexity of indigenous agency in producing the borderlands as a social space. Perhaps more provocative is Brown’s critique of John Kessel’s characterization of colonial authority as a shift from crusading intolerance to pragmatic accommodation. Once again the variability and complexity of the social histories documented in this work resist a simple narrative. While there are clearly radical differences in the pre- and post-Revolt colonies, Brown’s work suggests that they cannot be reduced to a single, linear narrative.

Many readers will find Brown’s “kaleidoscopic understanding” of social history to be frustrating. This book is not a narrative history in any sense nor is it a comprehensive approach to 18th-century Spanish–Pueblo relationships. Brown moves from case to case and from time to time with a fluidity that often seems to flatten time, reducing the colonial, and sometimes precolonial, into a single frame. While the overwhelming focus is on 18th-century documents, it is 17th-century documents, archaeological material, and even ethnographic observations that are used to build highly contextual arguments specific to time and situation. This temporal compression depends to a certain extent on the entanglement of each database, as Southwestern historians, archaeologists, and ethnographers have always relied on each other’s data to make sense of their own.

Nevertheless, Brown is quite clear about her methods, the logic of her arguments, and the basis of her conclusions. In opening the relatively neglected 18th century to provocative new questions and innovative approaches, this volume looks beyond simple narratives to a more nuanced and more problematized historical anthropology of the colonial borderlands.

## The Specter of “the People”: Urban Poverty in Northeast China by Mun Young Cho

Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2013. 232 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12388

**Rahul Oka**

*University of Notre Dame*

Many recent ethnographic studies on poverty and development have focused on unpacking stakeholder agendas, interactions, and their outcomes, particularly underscoring potential problems and unintended consequences of

intervention. *The Specter of “the People”* fits perfectly within this genre of highly detailed and nuanced analyses of urban poverty. The book contextualizes rich ethnographic data within larger political-economic transitions in China over the past fifty-odd years. The ethnographic site is Hadong, a small residential area of Harbin, the “cosmopolitan” port in the early 1900s, a premier industrial hub in Maoist China, and presently part of the Rust Belt in northeastern China, in decline since the market reforms of the 1980s. Mun Young

Cho addresses the plight of the resident urban workers and recent rural migrants in Hadong through the concept of *renmin* or “the people.”

The trope of “the People” is a popular essentializing device in politics. However, as Cho points out, the Maoist idea of *renmin* is not an essentialist category. An old Taoist parable (reframed by Mao) that can explain “the People” spoke of an old man who was tired of two big mountains blocking his path and resolved to level them bucket-by-bucket. When questioned about the feasibility of the scheme, the old man said, “I will do this, and after I die, my sons, their sons, and so on. One day, we will remove the mountain.” After seeing his perseverance, the gods removed the mountains. In his 1945 speech at Yan’an, Mao stated “Our God is none other than the masses of the Chinese people. If they stand up and dig together with us, why can’t these two mountains [of imperialism and feudalism] be cleared away?” (Mao 1967:272).

The old man represents “the People,” the backbone of the Revolution, the millions of unnamed urban workers, who would one day reap the benefits of their labor as the heroes of the state. “The People” of Harbin were the *dongbei ren* (the people of Northeast), the vanguard of the socialist, urban, industrial China of Mao.

Cho outlines how the term *dongbei ren* has since become a pejorative to indicate an embarrassing anachronistic population that still holds onto the memories of a China that no longer exists. After the market-oriented reforms initiated by Deng Xiaopeng in the late 1970s and 1980s, “the People” have become “the Population,” and the urban workers of the Rust Belt of Harbin are seen as the problem. However, the urban workers hold on to their idea of “the People,” valorized under Mao. Their anger and frustration at their present marginalization and the power of corruption in their daily lives stem from the marginalization of “the People” who built China and their feelings of entitlement for recognition (at best) or at least not being marginalized and ignored in the new China.

Cho undertakes a masterful analysis of the tensions that emerge when the workers invoke their claim to being “the People”: when the policymakers differentiate between “the People” as a nationalist trope and “the People” as a bureaucratic category wherein certain conditions have to be met to qualify for membership; when the global narrative of educa-

tion and professional work posits a new official definition of “the People” as those in line with global middle-class moralities and excludes those who cannot and will not fit these new categories; when the frustration of being left behind is not internalized but is countered by the aspirations of wealth, status, and home ownership, driven by the perceived success of friends and neighbors; when class hierarchies between intellectuals and professionals and factory workers are not acknowledged, even though these have been reinforced in new China; and when the urban workers discriminate against the rural migrants as backward, even as they themselves are mistreated in the new China and even though the rural migrants contribute to the economy as paying tenants of the urban workers.

However, Cho’s analysis unpacks the anger felt by those who regard themselves as “the People” and problematizes the contradictions between the workers’ frustrations at the new China, of which they are not part, and their pride about Chinese achievements, of which they are part. In their eyes, the Foolish Old Man succeeded, and China is not the “Sick Man of Asia.” But that old man who moved the mountains is no longer a hero of the state but, rather, a tired vestige only remembered and glorified in official discourse while denigrated in market-oriented practice.

I would highly recommend this book for both undergraduate and graduate students, not only for courses in anthropology but also in poverty and development studies. My only quibble with the book is that it did not engage a general literature on poverty and the state that has emerged within other social sciences and humanities. But for scholars of development and poverty, the most important contribution is the combination of archival data, nuanced ethnographic narratives, and linguistic phrases to generate a powerful and theoretical analysis backed by empirical data that speaks of the urban workers of Hadong as well as to the complexity of being poor and neglected while remaining and maintaining critical agency, as limited as it might be.

## REFERENCE CITED

- Mao, Z.  
1967 Selected Readings from the Works of Mao Tse-Tung.  
Beijing: Foreign Languages Press.

# Hacker, Hoaxer, Whistleblower, Spy: The Many Faces of Anonymous by Gabriella Coleman.

Brooklyn: Verso, 2014. 464 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12389

John Postill  
RMIT University

The past five years have seen a global flourishing of political initiatives in which tech-minded actors of different kinds (geeks, hackers, bloggers, online journalists, citizen politicians, etc.) have played prominent roles. From whistleblowing to online protests, from occupied squares to antiestablishment parties, these “freedom technologists” can no longer be dismissed, particularly after Edward Snowden’s revelations about the surveillance abuses of the United States’ NSA and allied agencies. Based on long-term anthropological fieldwork, Gabriella Coleman’s *Hacker, Hoaxer, Whistleblower, Spy* is a riveting account of one these new collective actors: Anonymous.

Written for a general readership, in the conclusion Coleman reveals that the book has two “clashing objectives.” “First and foremost,” it has the “Apollonian,” “empirical” aim of setting the record straight about Anonymous. Contrary to its popular image as a group of reckless hooligans, Anonymous has now “matured into a serious political movement” (p. 392). The book also has an ancillary, “Dionysian” aim: to “enhance enchantment” by learning from Anonymous’s exploits in its own terms, not through academic jargon, so as to “nudge forward [the ongoing] process of historical and political myth-making” (p. 394).

To elaborate on this idea, I wish to suggest that Coleman has actually written two (thoroughly entangled) books within the covers of one. Book 1 could be titled *Coming of Age on the Internet: How Anonymous Matured into a Serious Political Movement*. This is a book retracing the group’s exhilarating journey “from motherfuckery to activism” (p. 396). Coleman finds reasons for hope, because if “one of the seediest places on the Internet” (p. 51)—the uncensored website 4chan—could spawn such a formidable force for change, we may still have a chance to reverse the total surveillance course taken by the U.S. government and its allies after 9/11.

The story begins in 2008 (ch. 1) when Anonymous, until then a brand used primarily for trolling, “unexpectedly sprouted an activist sensibility” (p. 19). This sensibility soon blossomed when some Anons took on their “evil doppelganger,” the Church of Scientology. Although a successful operation, their use of strictly legal tactics earned them the accusation of “moralfaggotry” from hardcore participants (ch. 2). Other political milestones would follow, including their defense of WikiLeaks in the late 2010 “Cablegate” affair (ch. 4), the campaign against

Tunisia’s authoritarian regime whose downfall ushered in the Arab Spring (ch. 5), various operations launched against the security industry (chs. 7–9) and in support of Occupy (ch. 10), ending with the outing as an FBI informer of an influential Anon named Sabu (chs. 10–11).

If this first book tells a compelling story of transformation, then Book 2, the eponymous *Hacker, Hoaxer, Whistleblower, Spy: The Many Faces of Anonymous*, is an account of the continuity in diversity that makes Anonymous what it is. Taking our guidance from its title, we can divide Book 2 into four main parts, each emphasizing one of the “many faces” of Anonymous. Part 1 (chs. 1–3) could be aptly named “Hoaxer,” because it is here that we learn about the more “lulzy” exploits of the collective—that is, about its penchant for online trickery and mischief. Part 2 (chs. 4–5), where WikiLeaks looms large, could be named “Whistleblower,” followed by Part 3 (chs. 7–9), “Hacker,” devoted to a range of “security ops,” and ending with Part 4 (chs. 10–11), “Spy,” wherein Sabu’s betrayal is dramatically confirmed.

Beneath this broad typology lies a wealth of ethnographic detail. We follow the trajectories of a range of research participants, both online and offline, as they traverse a labyrinthine social world in constant flux. Some are skilled hackers, others merely geeks, still others have a way with the media or simply don the Guy Fawkes mask during street protests. Yet amid all this diversity, there is also unity, as Coleman explains in the introduction. For all their differences, most regular Anons enjoy gathering around IRC channels, share a predilection for “deviant humor,” despise the cult of celebrity, and are always keen to tinker with digital tools (or “weapons of the geek,” ch. 3). Although it may look chaotic to the untrained eye, Anonymous is held together by its “relationships, structures, and moral positions” (p. 114).

Who in academia would benefit from reading this work of popular scholarship? While the volume as a whole deserves to be widely read, the helix I am calling Book 1 will be of particular interest to scholars and students of politics, political anthropology, and social movements and activism. For its part, Book 2 is essential reading for those with an interest in media, communication, and digital culture. As Douglas Rushkoff puts it on the book’s sleeve, it is “a perfect initiation for all those n00bs out there still wondering what a ‘n00b’ is.” Moreover, this double-helix volume will make a very strong addition to courses on research methods, ethnographic writing, and public anthropology. Indeed, by pursuing her two “clashing objectives” simultaneously, Coleman sets a worthy example for students and scholars wishing to experiment with new ways of writing (digital) culture—and reaching diverse audiences while they are at it.

# Ecotourism and Cultural Production: An Anthropology of Indigenous Spaces in Ecuador by Veronica Davidov.

New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013. 288 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12390

Phyllis Passariello  
Centre College

Ecotourism is only the umbrella subject of Veronica Davidov's compact, data- and theory-rich book, *Ecotourism and Cultural Production: An Anthropology of Indigenous Spaces in Ecuador*. Her self-selected challenge was to document the complex multivalenced and multivoiced performances of "ecoturismo" surrounding the Kichwa in Ecuador's jungle lowlands, the "indigenous spaces" of her title. Using the Spanish term *ecoturismo*, she signifies precisely the entire cross-cultural development and production of the various "green" (or not) tourisms in process during the last two decades. Her refined definition of *ecoturismo* "fuses 'nature' tourism and ethnographic tourism in an interactive 'spectacle,' [which features] equal parts of toucan-watching and partaking in shamanic healing rituals, jungle tours and a crash course in indigenous histories with the oil companies." *Ecoturismo* represents multiple agents' agendas: Western tourist fantasies of the rainforest, the national government's development expectations, indigenous social movements, plentiful and diverse entrepreneurs and culture brokers, and, of course, the local people. The subjects of Davidov's spaces are Kichwa (Quechua, Runa), the largest group of indigenous people in Ecuador, primarily located in the jungle and its nearby gateway cities, who self-identify as indigenous people from an intact and vital culture, readily reshaping their perspectives and their behaviors with the times.

The global quest for oil, with petrocolonialism beginning in Ecuador in 1921, is still ongoing today, waxing and waning but always an important part of Ecuador's GNP. For years, international oil companies have clear cut and pushed roads through the thick jungle, rudely alerting the natives of the threats to their fragile environment and way of life. Ironically, the very roads that scar the jungle also facilitate the development of ecotourism and foster the rise of local and national pan-indigenous social movements. The movements demonstrate how the participating indigenous people are mindful both of their exploitation and of their traditional conservation ideals.

Frequently, Davidov references "neoliberal" development schemes in Ecuador usually entangled in international globalization scenarios. Ecoturismo presents a "unique

facet of globalization," with the potential for reconciliation between the competing agents of neoliberal development, ecological conservation, and cultural survival. Davidov summarizes her book as "an ethnography of a transnational network linking Western tourists, indigenous villages, extraction industries, and institutions of conservation as agents of development." Relationships between agents are shaped "by profit margins and historical fantasies, political agendas, and notions of self and 'other.'" Making sense of the multiple factions and contexts, the author skillfully paints a vivid and revealing picture of the "nuances" of the ecotourism phenomenon.

Davidov situates her ideas within several theoretical frameworks, citing freely, often in detail, an impressive variety of scholars. Curiously, however, she glosses over most of the groundbreaking work of Dean MacCannell, the iconic founding father of tourism studies, who pioneered conceptual building blocks that still endure. There is one brief mention of his early work, his discussion of the concept of authenticity, which is now so deeply embedded in the field (1973a, 1973b, 1976). MacCannell's later work presages and parallels some of Davidov's recent observations. For example, she frequently voices her convictions about the existence and importance of the "interactive playing field," an evolving place where tourists, brokers, and locals meet and co-construct together the jungle experiences. These convictions are instantly reminiscent of MacCannell's book, *Empty Meeting Grounds: The Tourist Papers* (1992), in which he suggests the co-constructive nature of the tourist-native encounter, the "meeting grounds" of his title. His latest book, *The Ethics of Sightseeing* (2011), questions the ethics of the co-constructed tourist sites and their communities, which is no doubt also relevant to Davidov's work.

In the course of her fieldwork, primarily conducted in 2004 and 2005, Davidov actively pursued a multivocal perspective, observing multiple interactive encounters between Western tourists, culture brokers, and indigenous locals as they co-constructed both the attraction and the experiencing of it. She sees ecotourism as a dynamic and ongoing event, "a space where meanings are negotiated" between "the fantasies and assumptions" of all involved and their resultant behaviors.

Davidov's believable portrayals of a modest but varied sample of people from all phases of the ecoturismo enterprise are animated by her outstanding ethnography, often thick and intimate. Western tourists emerge as complicit

with the natives in the construction of the “authenticities” required by the ecotourism complex. Davidov implies a hint of understandable disdain for the lumpen Western tourists, but the variety, depth, and sheer quantity of her data more than clarify any superficial biases. Some of her best ethnography appears in the rich life histories of key informants, including tourists.

Ambitiously, Davidov, the anthropologist as nomad, devised and carried out a peripatetic field plan, collecting extensive multivocal, multisited data. Ultimately she constructs a convincing synthesis that not only presents a clear and dynamic picture of ecotourism in her indigenous spaces but also generalizes a model with far-reaching implications and applications. This book is a superb example of the promising possibilities of contemporary ethnography.

## REFERENCES CITED

MacCannell, Dean

1973a Staged Authenticity: On Arrangements of Social Space in Tourist Settings. *American Journal of Sociology*, 79(3), 589–603.

MacCannell, Dean

1973b *American Journal of Sociology* 79(3):589–603.

MacCannell, Dean

1976 *The Tourist: A New Theory of the Leisure Class*. New York: Schocken.

MacCannell, Dean

1992 *Empty Meeting Grounds: The Tourist Papers*. London: Routledge.

MacCannell, Dean

2011 *The Ethics of Sightseeing*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

# Leisurely Islam: Negotiating Geography and Morality in Shi'ite South Beirut by Lara Deeb and Mona Harb

Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013. 304 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12392

Kristin V. Monroe

University of Kentucky

Can leisure be a catalyst for social change? This book explores this question through an ethnographic study of the meanings and practices of consuming leisure in relationship with morality, politics, geography, class, and sectarian identity among youths aged 18 to 29 in the Shi'i Muslim-majority suburbs of south Beirut, Lebanon. What makes leisure in Dahiya, as the area is known, such a compelling site of inquiry is that it is a very recent phenomenon, one configured by several social, political, and economic processes including the surge in investment and construction following the withdrawal of the Israeli army from south Lebanon in 2000 after almost two decades of occupation that began during Lebanon's civil and regional war (1975–1990), the growth and increasing visibility of Lebanon's Shi'i middle class, and the normalization of public piety in the neighborhoods of south Beirut. This is a part of the city wherein the religious-political party Hizbullah not only maintains governance and is the key promoter of economic development and social welfare projects but also exerts considerable influence over matters of morality and public practice by, for example, sending party members to café establishments in the area to ensure that they do not serve alcohol (p. 75). It is in this urban context, set amid the landscape of Lebanon's contentious sectarian politics, that authors Lara Deeb and Mona Harb argue that south Beirut's cafes are “providing

new spaces for leisure that are promoting flexibility in moral norms by highlighting tensions between religious and social notions about what is moral” (p. 10).

Drawing on their combined more than two decades of research in Dahiya, Deeb, a cultural anthropologist and author of *An Enchanted Modern: Gender and Public Piety in Shi'i Lebanon* (2006), and Harb, an urban studies scholar who has written extensively on this area of the city, focus their conceptual attention on how this moral flexibility is demonstrated through young people's decisions and understandings about how and where to have fun. In working out what they feel is a morally appropriate and socially comfortable leisure environment, the more and less pious young people whose words and practices are at the center of this book describe how they are guided by what the authors refer to as “multiple moral rubrics” (p. 18) shaped by religion as well as by ideals and values that are a part of the broader Lebanese social and political-sectarian sphere. This means, for example, that for many of Deeb and Harb's interlocutors deciding where to go out for a good time entails assessments about whether or not a venue serves alcohol, the kind of music it plays, and the conduct, clothing, and type of mixed-gender interaction of its customers. But in the fraught political context of Beirut, where the divides among different political-sectarian groups have become further entrenched in the last decade (see ch. 1), these assessments also have to do with seeking out territories of the city that Shi'i youths feel are their own, because they offer not just a sense of familiarity and shared identity but also physical safety.



While the book demonstrates the authors' navigation across a range of methodologies, from an extensive survey of the offerings of Dahiya's cafes and a thick description of their aesthetic styles (ch. 3) to material from interviews with leading Shi'i Islamic jurists about their views of the moral appropriateness of various forms of leisure (ch. 4), it is their work with focus groups that perhaps best illustrates their theoretical concern with a moral flexibility that is constituted through both a sense of individual responsibility and the notion of piety as a process. In the excerpts from transcripts of conversations among young people, readers can track the tensions surrounding the acceptability of such everyday public leisure practices as courtship behavior, the smoking of argileh (water tobacco pipes) by women, and mixed-gender dancing at weddings. It is through debate and discussion about what, for religiously committed and morally concerned youths, are definitively hot-button issues that the diversity of opinions and interpretations held by these young Muslims emerges. At the same time, however, the anthropology of morality that Deeb and Harb undertake

here provides a picture of how these young people's social and spatial practices are shaped not just by religion but also by class sensibilities and political-sectarian identity.

Readers with some background in the study of Lebanon, the Middle East, and Islam will undoubtedly be attracted to this book and perhaps find it easier work to follow the ins and outs of the Lebanese political scene, some of the tenets of Shi'i Islam, and Hizbullah's Islamist politics that frame the ethnographic material. In its innovative approach to understanding young people's morality through leisure practices and geographies, this meticulously well-researched and clearly written book should interest a much broader audience of scholars and students, however, in the anthropology of religion, youth, and cities.

#### REFERENCE CITED

Deeb, Lara

2006 *An Enchanted Modern: Gender and Public Piety in Shi'i Lebanon*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

## God's Agents: Biblical Publicity in Contemporary England by Matthew Engelke

Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013. 320 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12393

**Marcy Brink-Danan**

*The Hebrew University of Jerusalem*

This ethnography of the British and Foreign Bible Society heralds an important intellectual sea change; rather than approaching public religion as a philosophical puzzle—a well-worn exercise—author Matthew Engelke considers the lived experience of people whose goal is “publicizing” religion. Staff and supporters of the Bible Society, founded in 1804 by British evangelists, seek answers in practice to questions often restricted to political philosophy: What role can scripture play in public life? What role can politics, culture, science, and media play in promoting the Kingdom of God? Testing religion and secularity's porous membrane, the Society's Advocacy Team brings Bible groups to coffee shops, creates advertisements (think Bible quotes on beer mats and buses), takes up residence in parliament, and founds a public religion think tank called “Theos.” Between 2006 and 2009, Engelke documented the team's activities and visions, including innumerable meetings with politicians and reporters, conference organizing, writing of op-eds and research reports, and bottomless coffee drinking to discuss the merits of public religion. The British and Foreign Bible Society offers an ideal site to consider central issues in the anthropology of religion and

secularism: publicity, eschatology, and competing claims to reason.

The book elaborates a provocative theory of “ambient faith,” attending closely to the sensorium to highlight how different actors constantly reframe the private–public divide. This works delightfully for an analysis of (largely) Protestant agents who publicize something (here, faith) that is sometimes privatized, as when the team displays ambiguous, kite-like angels in a mall over Christmas. However, as the author and others ask, how far can a theory that takes up “faith” (as separate from praxis) travel beyond Protestant shores? Over Passover vacation in Israel, for example, commercial advertisers piped holiday music into public bathrooms across the country. While the danger of “misreading” ambient signals defines semiosis, I wondered to whom that bathroom sensory experience indexed “faith” rather than peoplehood, nationalism, consumerism, and so on.

With few exceptions, the Bible Society's Christianity tacks evenly between this life and the next. Engelke's subjects embrace the present, even as they recognize inherent flaws in human constructs. They understand politics, art, and coffee talk as integral parts of God's plan, criticizing other Christians for bypassing the present in their fast lane to the Kingdom. This example of the now–future nexus illuminates the stakes these subjects have in publicity, especially. Attention to eschatology here is, well, timely;

British Humanists, secularists, and new atheists increasingly publicize the unreasonableness of belief in an afterlife, in mottos such as “There is probably no God. Now stop worrying and enjoy your life” and “Humanism: For the one life we have.” That these parallel (and intertextual) messages compete for billboard space, media airtime, and on the floors of parliament in today’s British public sphere makes this nuanced approach particularly appealing.

The book rigorously analyzes internal staff discussions about the semiotics of reasonable religion; like all ad men, they are worried about how different audiences see their products (in this case, the Bible and its authorship). Their focus on messaging, undertaken in attempts to reclaim Charles Darwin or to debate Richard Dawkins, grows from an ongoing struggle to figure out what kind of religion is “culture facing”—religion that can be successful in engaging secular “cultural drivers” such as the arts, education, media, and politics—and when it begins to sound a bit, in their words, “nutty.” In this sense, the book is an exquisite example of “studying across”; Engelke and his subjects engage Rawlsian political theory in a mutually engaged concern for reasonable religion and its place in deliberative democratic practices.

The relative absence of veils, turbans, and yarmulkes in a book about public religion will surprise anyone who has spent time in Britain lately. At some point, members of the Advocacy Team realize that their somewhat myopic vision of British society excludes other faiths, but the book largely describes a Britain of Christians, lapsed Christians, and new atheists. The book’s merits could be amplified if the Advocacy Team’s work was considered in light of the widespread

British discourse of “failed” multiculturalism and, recently, multifaithism (Modood et al. 2010). The book missed a chance to explain why the Bible Society remains, with few exceptions, a white man’s club; when discussing opposition to the role of bishops in the House of Lords as a question of public religion, the analysis overlooks the obvious point that, at the time of writing (and until 2015), there were no female bishops in the United Kingdom.

While Engelke describes the book as a product of “hanging out,” this methodological modesty belies the systematic, ongoing, and attentive research that allowed him to write so intimately. In one such scene, the author interprets a Bible Society member’s tousled hair as if it were a barometer measuring a storm, noting how his subject’s hair appears increasingly mussed as he contemplates, with frustration, the wide publicity given to an “unreasonably” vociferous anti-blasphemy campaign. In these ethnographic moments, Engelke invites us into the ways in which religion, secularism, and Britishness are negotiated, reworked, and, finally, made available to and for the wider public. In this sense, the author’s methods give us overdue access to the backstage rehearsal, and final performance, of a thing as fraught and tentative as “public religion.”

#### REFERENCE CITED

- Modood, Tariq, Pragna Patel, Julia Bard, Tope Omoniyi, Joshua A. Fishman, and Stacey Gutkowski  
2010 From Multiculturalism to Multifaithism? *Studies in Ethnicity and Nationalism* 10(2):307–309.

## The Noodle Narratives: The Global Rise of an Industrial Food into the Twenty-First Century by Frederick Errington, Tatsuro Fujikura, and Deborah Gewertz

Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013. 216 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12394

Kathryn Franklin

University of Chicago

Academic conversations ranging over the last several decades have constituted “industrial food” as a complex intersection of technological interventions, historical discourses, and power relations (e.g., Goody 1982; Mintz 1985). Frederick Errington, Tatsuro Fujikura, and Deborah Gewertz’s interrogation of industrially produced instant ramen noodles participates in that ongoing tradition, and in particular within the trend of commodity-chain studies that parse capitalist production by following flow from producer

to consumer. *The Noodle Narratives* identifies the very quotidian ubiquity of instant ramen noodles (invented in Japan in 1958 and now produced and sold worldwide) as a premise for analysis and for the use of instant ramen as a point of entry into explorations of the mechanics of globalization. A core argument driving the book is that commodities such as palm oil–fried, MSG-infused instant ramen “grease the skids of capitalism” (p. 8), working against the frictions of local meanings and evaluative mismatch along global edges. As such a commodity, instant ramen is forwarded as an example—or even as the preeminent version—of capitalist provision: a food commodity that sustains the structures and relations of capital by sustaining (and producing) the bodies and subjects upon whom capital depends. Ultimately,

Errington, Fujikura, and Gewertz attempt to reconcile the role of the ubiquitous, satiety-inducing commodity instant ramen in initiating and perpetuating numerous forms of inequality within the system we might clunkily denominate “global capitalist modernity,” with the ongoing centrality of industrial foods in the provisioning of the world’s population.

In the first chapter, the authors reconstruct instant ramen as a complex hieroglyphic in the tradition of Sidney Mintz’s *Sweetness and Power* (1985)—although one might point out that whereas sugar was refined to sustain a capital labor force, instant ramen was engineered. The anatomy of instant ramen negotiates a tension between quotidian ubiquity (instant ramen’s ability to resist signification) and characteristics highly particular to ramen as a comestible as well as a commodity (the *umami* of MSG, cheapness, shelf life, mouth feel, satiety). The following chapters explore the ways in which instant ramen mediates various forms of relations and articulations at the local level as well as enabling certain forms of globality or globalization. Looking at the cases of postwar Japan, the contemporary United States, and the developing Pacific Islands, a focus on instant ramen gravitates toward hairline fractures: in class, social identity, and subject positions in consumption chains.

What emerges (often inexplicitly) from ethnographic case studies including a Japanese noodle museum, U.S. college students, U.S. prisoners, low-income Hispanic Americans in California, and marginal consumers in Papua New Guinea is that instant ramen analytically reveals anxieties about participation and belonging by sticking at the seams between freedom and constraint. In global centers, instant ramen indexes marginality and insignificance, evoking precarious and irresponsible student life, late nights, moments of dislocation—moments that, as the authors point out, are critically limited to “student days” or otherwise situated in the past for middle-class subjects. At the U.S. low-income margins, instant ramen is revealed as a “snack that sustains,” a commodity that through capitalist magic both serves as a full meal and is not quite food.

The case studies demonstrate how instant ramen as an engineered food likewise engineers its consumers in various ways—an argument that is further extended to the global margins and to the futurity of instant ramen’s capacity to mediate “the creation of the habitus of consumption itself” (p. 83). The authors are concerned with the role of instant ramen as a designated Poverty Provisioning Product, a commodity that represents a leading edge of capitalist advancement, transforming nonconsumers (read: nonmoderns) into the “bottom of the pyramid” of global consumer order. The discussion in these sections raises the question of the capacity of ramen to, therefore, in a sense “produce poverty” in those margins wherein the aesthetics of luxury and speed are deployed to invent a taste for modernity where it had previously been “lacking.” This image of instant ramen’s future is ultimately complicated by the authors’ philosophical consideration of the role to be played by industrial foods in a human future understood as structured by industrial capitalism and global in scale.

*The Noodle Narratives* is a useful contribution to ongoing attempts to find the seams in globalization (cf. Tsing 2012) by examining the messy interconnections between taste, power, labor, sustenance, and hunger at intimate, as well as global, scales. The examination of instant ramen effectively demonstrates the imbrication of an industrial food within networks and regimes extending far beyond the bounds of this single volume.

## REFERENCES CITED

- Goody, Jack  
1982 *Cooking, Cuisine and Class: A Study in Comparative Sociology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Mintz, Sidney W.  
1985 *Sweetness and Power: The Place of Sugar in Modern History*. New York: Viking Penguin.
- Tsing, Anna  
2012 *Unruly Edges: Mushrooms as Companion Species*. *Environmental Humanities* 1 (November):141–154.

# Politics in Color and Concrete: Socialist Materialities and the Middle Class in Hungary by Krisztina Fehérváry

Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2013. 312 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12395

Alexandra Szőke  
Swansea University

*Politics in Color and Concrete* is an eloquent analysis of the material transformations of domestic space during the four

decades of socialism and the following political-economic transformation in Hungary. Exploring the relations between politics and materialities, the book carefully examines the ways that changes in the built environment are deeply interwoven with the production of consumer subjectivities. The book draws on both several years of fieldwork in the former socialist model city of Dunaújváros (formerly Sztálinváros)

and a large variety of archival materials including home decoration magazines, films, and horoscopes. Author Krisztina Fehérváry cleverly shows the often-unremarked-upon continuities between postsocialist middle-class consumption and the socialist state's attempts to create demanding (*igényes*) citizens. This consumption-centered project came to haunt the socialist state, however, because the goods that were produced were seen as low quality and were denounced by the aspiring middle classes. In Fehérváry's interpretation, the shabbiness of these goods suggested to socialist citizens that the state did not consider them worthy of better quality products (esp. when viewed in an implicit comparison with the goods of Western democracies).

In such context, the designs, materials, and quality of goods that were considered "Western"—ranging from "American" open-plan kitchens to luxurious tiled bathrooms—were particularly desired by the newly arising middle classes of the 1990s and became significant markers of status and self-realization. These were considered part of a "normal" lifestyle that should be shared across a "global middle class," to which now they believed they belonged. However, this was not so easily achievable in the transforming Hungary, where things were continuously considered to be "not normal" through such implicit comparison to an idealized West. Thus, "the perception in the 1990s of a continued abnormalcy in service, bureaucratic and social spheres reinforced among citizens the desires to focus time and energy on creating spheres of normalcy in spaces within their control" (p. 234). This pushed people to invest financially and emotionally more and more in their private sphere, turning domestic places into "heterotopic" spaces in which an idealized "normal" life could be achieved.

Fehérváry's approach not only brings a fresh look at the period through its focus on everyday materialities but also offers a welcome correction to the often-simplified understandings of abrupt socialist–capitalist change. She describes a more gradual transformation by delineating five aesthetic regimes. While the Socialist Realism of the 1950s evidenced a promotion of former bourgeois values, the Socialist Modern of the Kádár era instigated the rise of modern consumer citizens, largely housed in newly built "panel blocks" (high rises). With time, however, this turned into Socialist Generic, as people increasingly became disappointed with goods produced by the state, especially as Western products became increasingly available. This

then led to a counter aesthetic of Organicist Modern that promoted natural colors and materials, along with folk artifacts. This trend eventually turned into a Super-Natural Organicism, as the aspiring middle classes started to strive for materials of natural origin that were enhanced with new technologies into high-quality products.

Fehérváry's choice of a small-scale industrial town in which to study these material transformations brings a significant contribution to recent attempts to grasp this historical period. However, it often leads the author to ungrounded generalizations. For example, the stress on panel blocks and the family house as its counterpart presents a simplistic picture of the complex array of housing that was appropriated by the middle segments in many other cities. The book could have profited from offering some details about how the experience of middle classes in Dunaújváros compared to those in more historic towns (e.g., Eger or Debrecen). In addition, whereas the author explains extensively the role of an idealized West in the consumption and self-positioning of Dunaújváros's aspiring middle classes, similar allusions to the role of Budapest and rural towns in the country are entirely missing. In this regard, it would have further strengthened the analysis if the author made more explicit use of the uniqueness of this newly constructed planned town and its specific position within the national sociopolitical structures. Such additions could have also furthered a more nuanced understanding of the concept of citizenship, which remains rather vague and undefined in the book while nonetheless hinting at important contributions to our understanding of consumption-based citizenship.

*Politics in Color and Concrete* weaves a diverse number of sources into an eloquent piece of historical urban anthropology. However, in parts the visual and written sources are used rather uncritically, presenting the opinion and styles promoted in magazines or socialist party publications as representative of the general practice of the entire population. Even though such discourses could be very pervasive, especially in an authoritarian regime, they are hardly ever implemented into everyday practice without any contestation. The second part of the book, which draws more extensively on ethnographic material, appears stronger in this respect, bringing significant insights into major discussions about the socialist "abundance economy" and the moral and highly gendered aspects of middle-class consumption of the 1990s.

# The Colours of the Empire: Racialized Representations during Portuguese Colonialism by Patrícia Ferraz de Matos.

New York: Berghahn, 2013. 308 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12391

Frederico Delgado Rosa

CRIA-FCSH/NOVA University of Lisbon

"I really think I prefer the Blacks of Harlem." This is a line from the 1940 Portuguese movie *Feitiço do Império* (The Spell of the Empire) depicting a travel to Angola by a rich Philadelphia heiress and her fiancé, a Portuguese immigrant in the United States. Her comment is sparked by the "still-savage" condition of the Natives under Portuguese rule, but the colonial administrator intervenes and explains to her the need of respecting the "usages and customs" of the Africans. The film is from a period in Portuguese history when censorship prohibited references to racial segregation or to human rights struggles of blacks in the United States. This is but one among many other sources analyzed in this book, which makes a contribution to the growing weight and relevance of the Portuguese archive to colonial and imperial studies. It covers particularly the 1930s and 1940s as apogee decades of dictator António de Oliveira Salazar's fascist-type regime, the longest of its kind in Europe (1926–1974).

Author Patrícia Ferraz de Matos intends to question the common-sense cliché that the Portuguese, contrarily to other colonizers, were not racist in their relationship with the colonized peoples and that they favored biological and social miscegenation, whether in Asia or in Africa. At the same time, she admits that such a benevolent stereotype makes the problem of racial representations possibly more complex. The book itself never reaches the point of clear-cut systematization, let alone definite oppositions, and that is perhaps its major strength. In the conclusion, Ferraz de Matos uses the word *impasse* to express what seems to be, in her view, the unsolved dilemma of Portuguese contradictory, even schizoid, racial representations.

By creating a distinction between *indígena* (indigenous) and *assimilado* (assimilated), the Colonial Act of 1930 set the scene of a specific ambivalence between "proclaimed equality and manifest inequality" (p. 238). If the *assimilado* attested the alleged results of the civilizing project, it was the *indígena* who best represented, culturally and in the very definition of such discriminatory legal status, the individuals of black race or descendants thereof. The exotic differences of the colonized were therefore omnipresent in image and discourse, to the detriment of the (residual) cases of "successful" assimilation. While fostering the idea of a

universal Portuguese identity within a multiracial empire and across both statuses, the regime did not promote "civilization" in practice. The *assimilado* was meant to prove an absence of racism, and somehow it did in the strictest sense; however, that does not exclude the racist tone underlying practically all Portuguese representations of the colonized peoples and individuals. The book includes interviews with former colonial officers, and one of them admits having erroneously taken the (Catholic) King of Kongo for an *indígena*.

This labyrinth is rendered all the more enticing by the fact that the Portuguese colonial archive is explored in several dimensions, from legislation to advertising, from primary school readers to anthropological papers, from cinema to exhibitions. What did an *Ovomaltine* advertisement and a paper by a leading anthropologist have in common? Questions such as these are raised, not always by explicit comparison but in any case by challenging juxtaposition, both of image (with selected reproductions) and discourse. The scientific anachronism of Portuguese anthropology up to the 1950s, with its obsessive emphasis on somatic measurement and classification, is a powerful ingredient of the monograph, not because it was blatantly racist but precisely because it denied being racist. English-speaking readers are given access to a veritable mine of unexpected, paradigmatic quotations, like this one: "Racism is worth of combat, but raciology is something else." The author of this sentence, anthropologist Mendes Correia (1919), was "well acquainted with the claims of Franz Boas" but refused to explain everything by "external conditions" (p. 130).

Among other connections between science (Ferraz de Matos often uses the word *pseudo-science*) and propaganda, the book deepens the analysis of the colonial exhibitions organized by the regime of Estado Novo in which it participated abroad. The legendary Exhibition of the Portuguese World, of 1940, is but one of several case studies. While most of Europe was devastated by war, the regime staged a monumental celebration of the 800-year anniversary of Portugal's foundation. The colonial section, meant to offer the visitors the chance to discover the exoticism of the Portuguese tropics, is analyzed in detail. One of the book's highlights is the moment when the author reveals, through her research at the Overseas Historical Archive (Lisbon), how the process of selecting the natives that were to represent the colonies in the Exhibition took place. Among other surprises, she demonstrates that some of them (e.g., Indian snake-charmers) did not come from Portuguese



colonies at all. In any case, they were confined to the venue. “Only the King of Kongo and his retinue were authorized to leave the exhibition whenever they wished” (p. 209).

Finally, this English translation of the Portuguese edition would be stronger if the opening chapter, instead of uselessly outlining the European ideas of race since the 16th century, gave a better historical contextualization of Portuguese colonialism.

## REFERENCES CITED

Correia, António Mendes

1919 As condições físicas na formação das raças [Physical conditions in the development of races]. Anais da Academia Politécnica do Porto. Coimbra: Imprensa da Universidade.

Ribeiro, António Lopes, dir.

1940 Feitiço do império [The spell of the empire]. 150 min. Tobis Portuguesa Studios. Lisbon.

# The Archaeology of Smoking and Tobacco by Georgia L. Fox

Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2015. 192 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12396

Shannon Tushingham

Washington State University

In *The Archaeology of Smoking and Tobacco*, Georgia Fox explores the “discovery” of tobacco by European explorers in the late 1400s, its development into a commercial commodity, and its subsequent rapid global spread, transformation, and “reintroduction” to the Americas as a trade commodity. The book focuses on historical (postcontact) use of tobacco over the course of about 300 years. This slim volume is the latest in a series of books on the “American experience” from an archaeological perspective published by the University Press of Florida and edited by Michael S. Nassaney.

The first chapter lays the groundwork for the book in a concise introduction in which author Georgia Fox explains its main theme: “to demonstrate how well positioned historical archaeology is to explore the role that tobacco and smoking played in the formation of American identities and cultural practices over a span of more than three hundred years” (p. 1). As she goes on to explain, tobacco—“that loathsome weed”—became a mass consumable that, along with other stimulants (e.g., sugar), “revolutionized the world and changed the course of history” (p. 1). This is a bold statement, but it is one that is well-supported in the pages that follow.

In chapter 2, Fox describes her theoretical approach, the foundation of which is macroscale World Systems theory, sometimes referred to as “dependency theory,” which provides a framework for understanding core–periphery relationships. For tobacco, the key core–periphery relationship was between the British centers of power at London and Bristol (the core) and the Caribbean and Chesapeake colonies that supplied them with unprocessed tobacco leaves (the periphery). I found it fascinating to learn how these relationships functioned and how the British maintained hegemony and the roots of a global market: for example, for many years, tobacco was grown in the colonies, sent to England for processing into smokeable form, and then sent back to the Americas (along with pipes manufactured in England) to be

sold to eager consumers: a process that seems staggeringly inefficient but enlightens one’s understanding of the roots of this global market. Where World Systems falls short, Fox employs consumer theory, which accounts for human desire of nonessential commodities such as tobacco, sugar, coffee, spices, and the like. Specifically, consumer theory can involve personal choice and individual agency, elements that help to account for tobacco’s long-standing mass appeal.

In the third chapter, Fox adroitly traces the history of tobacco from its use by native peoples in the Americas, its “discovery” by European explorers, its rapid spread and commercialization by British and North American colonists, and the role of slavery in these developments. Chapter 4 addresses the practice and material culture of tobacco smoking—the “nitty gritty” of archaeology—which for historical archaeologists includes the study of white clay pipes, ubiquitous items in historical (post-Columbian) dating sites that provide a reliable relative dating tool. As Fox explains, they are also “one of the first truly disposable commodities in the early modern world” (p. 121).

Chapter 5 documents an array of fascinating archaeological studies exploring tobacco’s role in the United States and the Caribbean, particularly those that focus on the identity and meaning of pipes and tobacco ritual, from its use in early encounters between Native Americans and European explorers; and by slaves, working-class mill workers in Massachusetts, Irish Americans in New York and New Jersey, and Victorian-era women; to its use in Colonial Jamestown and on the U.S. frontier—from boomtown saloons to brothels. Chapter 6 focuses on early tobacco use in British Colonial America at the Caribbean town of Port Royal, Jamaica, which Fox rightly labels “a pipe-lover’s dream.” In the early 1600s, Port Royal was a major hub in the tobacco trade until it was destroyed in an earthquake in 1692. It is also the location of major archaeological studies and where Fox did her research in the 1980s on 21,575 tobacco pipes. The final chapter of the book provides a short summary of the book and weaves together its major themes.

In sum, *The Archaeology of Smoking and Tobacco* is a well-written and accessible summary of 300 years of tobacco smoking in the Americas from an archaeological

perspective. It is filled with numerous interesting examples and is peppered with just enough archaeological theory and method to satisfy academic readers while keeping the interest of a larger general audience. It would be a great supplementary text for a class on historical archaeology or

material culture, although its list price may dissuade some. This would be a shame as Fox has written an engaging and lucid book that will be of interest to a broad readership who will be no doubt fascinated by the amazing history of tobacco as well as by how historical archaeologists interpret the past.

## Young Men, Time, and Boredom in the Republic of Georgia by Martin Demant Frederiksen

Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2013. 214 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12397

**Artūras Tereškinas**

*Vytautas Magnus University*

Analyzing marginalized young men in Batumi, Georgia, in his moving book, *Young Men, Time, and Boredom in the Republic of Georgia*, Martin Demant Frederiksen accounts for multiple temporalities, or “the role of past, present, and future both as they are experienced by young people themselves and as they are envisioned by society” (p. 179). The author asks how these temporalities play in the unfolding of these young men’s lives. His main argument is based on the assumption that his informants’ experiences of time that contradict the established political visions of the future make them marginal and socially excluded. These are young men who, in the anthropologist’s words, “lack access to the future” (p. 11). As a detailed ethnographic description of young men in Batumi amid social and material ruins in 2008–2010, the book documents their feelings of an impasse and standstill in their lives and their inability to deal with social changes.

The book is divided into four sections, each of which has an introduction, one or two chapters, and a conclusion. In the prologue, the author sets the tone of the book by briefly outlining the Georgian context and Batumi that he calls a “two-faced city.” He also presents methodology, research ethics, and theoretical vantage points that focus on the processes of material and social ruination and the relationship between the experience of time and marginality.

In the first section, the author extensively describes the history of Batumi and the ambience of a ruined city that also reflects shadows of the future that seem far removed from his informants’ lives. We also see the city through the eyes of his informant, Emil, who uncovers its darker side. In the last chapter of this section, the formation and articulation of brother-men relations regarded as an “outdated” mode of sociality is examined. However, brotherhood or brother-man ethos related to criminal subcultures, a redundant but nonetheless present mode of sociality, helps the young men cement friendships, maintain social ties, and develop coping strategies in regard to their daunting everyday lives.

Focusing on the young men’s hopes and dreams for the future, in section 2, the author conceptualizes dreaming as a

way of resisting depression and sorrow brought by the informants’ living at social margins. This section most explicitly demonstrates that the described men exhibit protest masculinity oriented toward a search for immediate pleasure, drug and alcohol use, and criminal activity.

In the third section, the author analyzes how the future acts toward men and makes them marginal. Frederiksen argues that different futures “shape and haunt the present” (p. 125), yet his informants either do not want to be part of these futures or feel that they do not belong to them. Conveying the pervasive emotions of disappointment and despair in the young men’s lives, the section also shows that the Georgian government and President Mikheil Saakashvili failed both to stimulate the social change and to create hope in Georgia. The fourth section summarizes the book.

Chronicling men’s victimization by the haunting past and nonexistent future, Frederiksen provides an abundance of evidence about their feelings of both emasculation and despair due to their inability to participate in the new state-defined discourses of the future. However, not only inconsistent national narratives of moving forward but also his informants’ experience of economic insecurity and blocked employment opportunities render them incapable of imagining the optimistic future. Oppressive gender codes based on men’s breadwinner obligations, both in ideology and practice, also add up to their disadvantage and distress.

Although the book is very sensitive to ethnographic details, some shortcomings should also be noted. The author often refers to “officially constructed ideas of the future” that lack, in the study, a more comprehensive definition. What we can grasp, by reading the book, is largely young men’s individual experiences that counteract the “optimistic” future projects of the Georgian government best captured in the author’s description of new architectural designs in Batumi. Yet even these designs do not warrant such phrases as “new state-prompted grand narratives of the future” (p. 174) that make the informants feel like social outsiders. Similarly, the author contradicts himself by writing, on the one hand, about his informants’ “loss of a future in the midst of societal optimism” (p. 10) and by claiming, on the other hand, that the Georgian government failed to free the country from criminal influences of the past and to create hope for a large portion of population. The social environment

in Batumi, as it emerges in the book, looks anything but optimistic.

Among studies on gender and social exclusion in postsocialist regions that focus largely on women,

Frederiksen's book is an important contribution to the history of dispossessed young men and protest masculinity. It is also a welcome addition to anthropological discussions of marginality and its temporal dimensions.

## Being Māori in the City: Indigenous Everyday Life in Auckland by Natacha Gagné

Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2013. 368 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12398

Lyn Carter

University of Otago, New Zealand

The challenges of maintaining identity and a sense of place become even more so when indigenous peoples leave their traditional homelands and migrate to urban environments. Natacha Gagné has carried out extensive fieldwork among the lives of one such group: the New Zealand Māori. Her excellent research skills and extensive fieldwork are evident throughout this pivotal piece that examines cross-generational lifeways and challenges for Māori people living in New Zealand's largest city, Auckland.

In an excellent summary of the background to Māori urbanization (ch. 1), Gagné outlines the history and challenges to contemporary Māori identity and the social change within New Zealand that led to the complexities that surround identifying as Māori in the city. The apparently simple characterization of urban Māori versus rural Māori is picked apart as Gagné delves into the complexities that such labeling fails to provide. The key arguments in the book merge the politics of differentiation with diaspora tendencies common to tribal peoples who have relocated outside of the comfort and familiarity of home (lands).

In chapter 2, the dichotomy of urban versus rural Māori identities is examined using a dreamtime narrative approach. This focuses on a utopian re-membling of a past and rural existence that has two main consequences. First, and on the negative side, the utopian past is used as a retreat when things in the city don't work out. Urban Māori then move to a more comfortable place "where they can escape their responsibilities in and for today's living conditions" (p. 65). These occur through the stories and memories—often from older generations—of an authentic existence available only in the home territories (p. 65). The rural-based Māori in turn idealize the life of their urban-based cousins. At the crux of this argument is the notion of authenticity and false Māori identities—authentic Māori versus plastic Māori (p. 75). On the positive side, dreamtime narratives encourage urban Māori to aspire to learning the language, *tikanga* (practices), and culture that abound within the rural strongholds. In reality, both urban and rural Māori idealize each other's existence and lifestyles in such a manner

that "hints at a lack of communication between the two milieus . . . and a shared solitude that is not expressed to each other despite ongoing connections" (p. 66). Despite the insistence that *whakapapa* (relationships and connections) remain strong, the two groups do not acknowledge the strengths of each other's existence but, rather, dwell on differences that create jealousies and misunderstandings. One of the participants states that although she is "staunch when it comes to my taha Māori (Māori side)" (p. 67), her real Māori identity comes from her friends and Māori activities at the University. She questions her own authenticity because she was not raised among Māori peers, and this adds to her sense of solitude living in the city. There is, however, a certain coexistence and interdependence between Māori regardless of location that becomes evident further on in the book. Gagné's fieldwork demonstrates the social changes discussed in chapter 1 have had the same impact on identity and cultural sustainability regardless of location.

In the search for defining identity in an urban context, there is another layer appearing in the urban versus rural dichotomy: that of urban-based Māori versus urban Māori. The former are the ones who continue to associate physically and spiritually with their home places and people; the latter are those who are disenfranchised from their rural counterparts and often do not know to which tribal grouping they belong. The layers of an urban identity and challenges to establishing authenticity are an important theme that runs through the book. The self-labeling to describe exactly "how Māori" urban-based families are is also at the heart of Gagné's case studies, conducted when she lived among urban-based Māori families (*whanau*) during a number of extensive field research periods (2001–02; 2005; 2011). In chapters 3 through 5, the quality of the research becomes apparent as Gagné leads the reader through the lives, dreams, and aspirations of two extended family groups. Through her fieldwork, she explores the prescribed characterizations of what makes Māori people "Māori," and she is able to show that these have been selectively utilized to suit conditions in a city context. A prime example is the discussion around the family house and surrounding neighborhood becoming like a *marae* (cultural space; chs. 2 and 4). It is to be expected that some social patterns will change as new circumstances present themselves, and Gagné ably demonstrates how these changes reinterpret tradition.

My one complaint with the book is that traditional anthropological research methods do not allow the participants' voices to be loud and clear. The voices are there—in quotes from the author's field notes—but they are interpreted to provide support to a predetermined research hypothesis. That matter aside, however, Gagné has provided a well-researched and comprehensive study of Māori identity when locations (physical and cultural) change. Nothing like this has been seen since Joan Metge's studies of Māori urban migration (1964)

and of modern *whanau* (families) in 1995. Gagné is to be commended for adding to this significant research field.

## REFERENCES CITED

Metge, Joan

1964 *A New Maori Migration: Rural and Urban Relations in New Zealand*. London: Athlone.

1995 *New Growth from Old: The Whanau in the Modern World*. Wellington: Victoria University Press.

# Migrants in Translation: Caring and the Logics of Difference in Contemporary Italy by Cristiana Giordano

Berkeley: University of California Press, 2014. 304 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12399

Ralph Grillo

University of Sussex

A few years ago, a young woman ("L"), originally from Zimbabwe, came before a British provincial court charged with attempted murder. Briefly, one night her mother woke to find her daughter standing over her with a knife. When the police were called, L was found to be in a trance-like state but subsequently claimed that her dead grandmother had come to her and told her to attack her mother, whom the grandmother had held responsible for L's father's earlier death in Zimbabwe. The court was offered three explanations by expert witnesses: an anthropologist described the cultural background of African beliefs in the supernatural; a psychiatrist suggested L suffered from a "psychological disorder of consciousness"; and another psychiatrist concluded that L had concocted the story, and that was the prosecution's case.

I was reminded of this episode, and many others like it in courts in Britain and North America, when reading Cristiana Giordano's excellent ethnography, *Migrants in Translation*, set in Turin, Italy, in the early to mid-2000s. The book is based on long-term participant-observation in various institutions concerned with the mental health of (women) migrants to Italy, mainly from Nigeria, Albania, and Romania, who have mostly been working as prostitutes (the author rejects the term *sex workers*). Their cultural difference (their "otherness") and the dilemmas of "translation" (in the broadest sense) between the different cultural mindsets that their difference poses are at the heart of the encounters that Giordano explores.

This theme is developed through detailed case studies located in various institutional settings. One of these, which figures prominently in the book, is the Centro Fanon (the choice of name is significant), a clinic whose practitioners

follow an ethnopsychiatric approach. This approach engages fundamentally with the social, political, and economic context of individuals' experiences and rejects mainstream biomedical models that would refer simplistically to "mental" illnesses such as depression. It has its origins in theories developed in the 1960s, in Italy and elsewhere, and was originally used with Italian patients. In the 2000s, however, it was increasingly applied to women of migrant background, arriving in Italy in growing numbers in search of work (often sex work) or asylum, from different socio-historical contexts with different cultural experiences. The approach frequently put the practitioners at the center at odds with other organizations engaged with migrant women, and indeed in the end their contribution was marginalized.

One of those other organizations is the Catholic Church, and the book has a long chapter describing a shelter for former prostitutes and drug users run by nuns where Giordano worked as a volunteer. She contrasts the women's experience of the shelter's regime as rule governed, restrictive, and oppressive, as something to be endured to obtain the reward of a residence permit, with the nun's perspective, which sees it as a place where the migrant women can redeem ("remodel," "reset," "re-motivate") themselves in ways that accord with Catholic ideas about confession and salvation.

Another setting is the police station where migrant women who have been involved in sex work are persuaded to denounce their pimps and madams in a formal statement. Here an important role is played by what are called "cultural mediators," a peculiarly, if not exclusively, Italian phenomenon. Originally an ad hoc arrangement involving individual migrants assisting social workers and the like with people of the mediator's own cultural and linguistic background, it is now a full-blown professional occupation with its own training programs. In the cases followed by Giordano, mediators assisted migrants in making a "denunciation," as it is called, by translating their



often-halting and inconsistent stories and organizing them into an account that was “digestible,” as Giordano puts it, by the official bureaucracy—for example, emphasizing the claimant’s status as a “victim” of traffickers, thereby giving them a better chance of obtaining what they really want, a residence permit.

Giordano raises many questions of concern to anthropologists wrestling with the problem of how “culture” and cultural difference are employed, evaluated, and dealt with in institutional settings (medicine, the law) in Western societies, and one wishes that she had gone further to spell out the implications for multiculturalism, certainly

multiculturalism Italian style, perhaps via an extended account of cultural mediators. She might also have said more about her understanding of *incommensurability*—a term often bandied about imprecisely, sometimes with the implication that “never the twain shall meet,” a dangerous view that locks people into impermeable ethnolinguistic blocs. She avoids this, but her extended reflections on the issue would have been valuable. Nonetheless, this is a complex, rewarding, and thought-provoking book, and a short review cannot do it justice. It is highly recommended.

(And L? Guilty but discharged into the care of her mother.)

## Making Faces: Self and Image Creation in a Himalayan Valley by Alka Hingorani

Honolulu: University of Hawai‘i Press, 2013. 160 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12400

**Kim Gutschow**

*Williams College and Goettingen University*

Alka Hingorani’s book takes the reader on a fascinating journey into the Kullu Valley of the Indian Himalaya, one of the oldest towns in what used to be known as the Punjab Hill States, which now lies in modern Himachal Pradesh. The central strength of Hingorani’s book is its detailed description of actors and audience interacting to produce the embossed *mohras* (embossed metal images of deities) and *chhatris* (parasols) and other metal that adorn the chariots and present the local deities of villages and town within the Kullu valley. After a short introduction into the history of Hindu kingship in the region, Hingorani describes the annual arrival, during the Dashera festival, of the book’s central characters, namely the *palkhi* or *ratha*—chariots of the gods—housing elaborately carved images of local deities assembled at temple dedicated to Raghunathji, who is the tutelary deity of the Kullu *rajas* (historic kings).

Chapter 2 addresses the multiple *mohras*, or embossed metal images of the deities (or deity), that adorn a single chariot before launching into a discussion of their periodic dissolution and re-creation through artisans who work for patrons in the community. Because *mohras* are melted down, it is hard to have a genealogy of a single artist’s or even communities community’s work, but Hingorani does an excellent job describing the typologies, styles, iconography, iconology, and provenance of a variety of *mohras* including ones in museum collections as well as those still in use on chariots in the region today. Chapter 3 offers a detailed account of the step-by-step rituals and construction process for a single parasol commissioned by a local village as well as an embossed *mohra* that Hingorani herself commissioned.

This is the most empirical and lively chapter of the book, as the reader is introduced to the day-to-day events of a month-long creation of the parasol fleshed out in its social and ritual complexity.

Chapter 4 begins with a brief mention of Hindu theories of aesthetics and emotions that could have benefitted from a more elaborate discussion of the Hindu soteriology that describes and links emotions to aesthetics and life goals. Hingorani asks how an aesthetic sensibility is created and shared among the residents of the Kullu Valley, arguing that experience and response are inflected by shifting cultural expectations and continuity or tradition. We learn that artists, patrons, and audience collectively participate in the iterative process of reception and response, each side shaping and creating a subjective experience of aesthetics. The text describes a dramatic narrative between artist and patrons during each day of work that creates and reifies a shared aesthetic and appreciation. Hingorani unpacks the building blocks of aesthetic response, including historical and social context as well as individual subjectivity but does not delve into any of these fascinating topics in sufficient detail. For example, she mentions Pierre Bourdieu’s insight that aesthetics furthers particular social and economic interests without fully exploring how this thesis pertains to the sociological reality she describes. Chapter 5 focuses on the hereditary, male artisans who interact with patrons who outrank them in wealth and caste. We see how the artisanal process places the artisan and patron in liminal roles as the artisan appears to outrank patron during the process of creating art. The artisan is both insider, who becomes intimately familiar with the deity and village patrons during the construction process, and outsider, whose itinerant travels take him far beyond the parochial horizons and petty structures of his more deeply rooted clients. While Victor Turner’s notion of liminality is invoked, it is not fully explicated.



The last two chapters begin to theorize the ways that the relationships between artisan, patron, and art object distill elements of caste and culture in the Kullu Valley. Drawing on Claude Lévi-Strauss's structuralist view of myth, Hingorani unpacks the artisan Taberam's retelling of a classic Hindu myth as a means of synthesizing oppositions around caste. Hingorani argues that caste is a fluid, cultural category of exchange and customs that can both "permit and preclude, applaud and revile, include and elide modes of behavior and conduct" (p. 97). This insightful analysis of the role of caste and artisan, unfortunately, comes a bit late in the analysis and could have been presented earlier in the chapter as a framing device. While Hingorani notes

that caste is hardly the only referent of identity in Kullu culture, she suggests that artisans engage in the retelling of myths to enable moments of temporary transcendence and/or subversion of the hierarchy of caste within which they are embedded. Yet it remains unclear how subversive the retelling actually is given that she convincingly shows how bodies, including that of the artisan, learn to keep their place within the structure of society. Overall, the text closes with some interesting observations on caste, culture, and myth that could have been developed much earlier and more deeply throughout the book. Yet the reader is left wanting to know more about this fascinating part of the Indian Himalaya.

## Ireland in the Virginian Sea: Colonialism in the British Atlantic by Audrey Horning.

Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2013. 408 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12401

**Barbara J. Heath**

*University of Tennessee, Knoxville*

The last decade has seen an explosion of scholarship relating to the early modern Atlantic World as historians, historical anthropologists, historical archaeologists, and other scholars of the recent past explore the transformative and entangled processes of colonialism and empire. The success of such transnational, transoceanic approaches rests on the ability to compare and synthesize, while at the same time illuminating specific times and places that are crucial for understanding variation. In *Ireland in the Virginia Sea*, Audrey Horning strikes that balance admirably. Drawing on decades of research, she provides a carefully crafted and richly nuanced study of Ireland and the Chesapeake–Albemarle Sound region of eastern North America in the turbulent period of 1550 to 1650.

Horning's introduction outlines the major questions that structure the book and provides useful definitions of key terms. She rejects assumptions that Ireland and Virginia experienced similar colonial processes and that the former served as a model for the colonization of the latter. To counter these claims, she explores the history and culture of both places immediately prior to English settlement, outlines the political and economic context of English ambitions, and interrogates the nature of the colonial enterprise over time and within specific settlements. Chapter 1 focuses on the evidence of late medieval and 16th-century Ireland, a land populated by Gaelic lords and the Norman-descended Old English. From the 1550s to 1580s, English leaders operating within shared structural systems took part in the establishment of Irish plantations and the failed

1580s Roanoke colony in the New World. Despite these commonalities, Horning argues that different historical processes, geographies, and cultural practices distinguished the two enterprises. The plantation of Ireland, while often chaotic and violent, was imposed on people who shared a long political, social, and intellectual history of engagement with the planters and possessed recognized legal rights. In contrast, chapter 2 explores the Algonquian polities of the Albemarle Sound and the Powhatan paramount chiefdom of tidewater Virginia; their interactions with Spanish explorers and missionaries; and the relationships that developed between them and English colonists beginning in the 1580s. Horning argues that historical, cultural, and linguistic differences led the English, and later the British, to adopt a fundamentally different approach to colonization there. Chapter 3 returns to Ireland and the establishment of the Ulster Plantation, its relationship to the Virginia colony, and its role in promoting industry and urbanization. In chapter 4, Horning traces the factors behind the complex trajectory of coexistence, violence, and political subjugation that characterized Algonquian–British relations in the Virginia Tidewater from 1607 to the 1670s, and she considers why urbanization and industrialization failed to take hold. Chapter 5 summarizes her argument that Atlantic expansion took varied forms, shaped by the unique historical and cultural contexts of the people that the British sought to dominate. She concludes that outcomes were unpredictable and continue to resonate today and offers suggestions for future research that will further complicate and enrich our understanding of colonialism in the early modern period.

Horning's contextual approach allows her to trace a series of rich, complex, and interwoven stories. The appearance of men like Ralph Lane, who led the Roanoke colony

and later served in Ulster, or the Munster entrepreneur Daniel Gookin, who settled in Newport News near the lands of fellow Munster planters William and Thomas Newce (p. 314), illustrates the willingness of ambitious Englishmen to trade the difficulties of one colonial experience for the uncertainties and potential rewards of another.

Horning's work poses broader questions that reach beyond the Irish and Virginia experiences. How did materiality shape past interactions, and how do material survivals contribute to our understanding of colonialism and empire building today? How can scholars successfully interweave disparate sources? In Horning's study, the nature of the available evidence varies between Ireland and the New World, with the Irish experience more accessible through the documentary, literary, and cartographic records and the Virginia experience more reliant on a close reading of material remains. This problem of sources results in a somewhat un-

even narrative, with a densely descriptive history of Ireland focusing on the actions of a few key players as opposed to a richer but less personal portrayal of daily life and the shifting relationships between Algonquian Indians and the British. Despite these limitations, Horning achieves her comparative goals while demonstrating that the material world is crucial to our understanding of agency within the colonial world.

In *Ireland in the Virginia Sea*, Audrey Horning has made an important contribution to the scholarship of the early modern Atlantic for both the rich content she conveys and the theoretical and methodological framework within which she builds her argument. Her voice is clear and lively, and the text is well illustrated. This book should appear on graduate curricula focusing on comparative colonialism, historical archeology, and materiality, and it will appeal to serious readers of colonial history.

## A Monastery in Time: The Making of Mongolian Buddhism by Caroline Humphrey and Hülrelbaatar Ujeed.

Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013. 440 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12402

**Saskia Abrahms-Kavunen**

*Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology*

*A Monastery in Time* is the first ethnography to describe an Inner Mongolian Buddhist monastery. With so few anthropological works detailing Buddhism in the Mongolian cultural region, the book is a welcome addition. Authors Caroline Humphrey and Hülrelbaatar Ujeed set out to uncover contemporary formulations of the "Mergen tradition": a unique lineage of Inner Mongolian Buddhism translated into the Mongolian language and embedded in the Mongolian landscape. The book explores how a contemporary monastery negotiates its history, the changing expectations of the local laity, individual personalities, and external pressures.

Each chapter anchors itself in the ethnographic present (itself spanning over an impressive 15 years of research) detailing the histories of the monastery, the surrounding areas, and their influence on the present day. The scholarship is dense and occasionally dizzying, as readers are introduced to vast amounts of anthropological, historical, and philosophical material. The authors negotiate this extensive material by sliding between historical reflections and contemporary events, taking the reader backward and forward through time. In doing so, the authors are able to illustrate how the region's complex histories breathe life into and weigh upon the present.

The book begins by describing a moment in the monastery, an instance effervescing with enthusiasm

about the building of a Maitreya (Mong. Maidar) statue. As the ethnography progresses, it becomes clear that this effervescence was indeed a momentary fervor and that in spite of the hard work of the people involved, historically influenced divisions splinter and diffuse the initial enthusiasm that the authors encountered. By the end of the book, we leave the monastery in the process of what the authors call "archivisation": a deliberate recasting in terms intelligible to outsiders, both through its inclusion in the surrounding municipality and as a "cultural relic."

Followed closely throughout the many years during which the authors conducted fieldwork, the schism dividing the monastery's community is personified by the clash between two of their key interlocutors, Sengge Lama and Chorji Lama. For both of these men, the trauma of history weighs heavily on their contemporary differences. Their arguments are set among, and contribute to, the fragmenting community that Humphrey and Ujeed first encountered within the temple walls. For the authors, the older Sengge Lama instantiates learnedness, monastic discipline, and a working-class past. The Chorji Lama, a recognized reincarnation, represents the heritage of position. In Sengge Lama, we find the desire to impart his knowledge coupled with frustration at the difficulties of transmitting it. In Chorji Lama, we find a man struggling with his title and the interruption of his education during the Cultural Revolution, someone reluctant and unable to fulfill his expected role as a high lama, who is drawn to administrative rather than religious roles. Through the stories of these men and their other interlocutors, we discover how and why the monastery

struggles to maintain coherence. In learning about their lives (and that of the eighth Mergen Gegen), the authors mobilize firsthand accounts of the havoc wrought by the Cultural Revolution. In documenting this period, the book contains stirring accounts of violence both from the attacked and the attackers, giving shape to the recent history of the monastery and the region and the suffering endured therein.

*A Monastery in Time* is the result of years of thorough research undertaken by Humphrey and Ujeed. The book is a powerful ethnographic testimony to the contemporary and historical situation of a monastery in Inner Mongolia. As we encounter the histories of the region and those within it, we learn how these histories continue to shape and influence

actors in the present. Through their stories, we come to know the monastery, its monks and lay followers, and the unique form of Mongolian Buddhism that it represents. The monastery once housed the renaissance ambitions of the Mergen Gegen for a truly Mongolian Buddhism. By bringing life to the tumultuous histories of a single monastery, Humphrey and Ujeed indicate that a truly Mongolian Buddhism can be discovered, whole and divided both, amid the tangles of events and intentions that constitute its essential form. This dense and rich ethnography suggests ways in which historical and anthropological methods can be employed in highlighting the influence of time, change, and uncertainty on cultures and livelihoods in turbulent times.

## From Princess to Chief: Life with the Waccamaw Siouan Indians of North Carolina by Priscilla Freeman Jacobs and Patricia Barker Lerch.

Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2013. 128 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12403

Laura F. Klein

Pacific Lutheran University

The life history has been part of anthropology for almost a century. Paul Radin's *Crashing Thunder* (1926) and Nancy O. Lurie's *Mountain Wolf Woman* (1961) stand out as classics. The genre faded in popularity at midcentury but later came back into favor with increased interest in feminist and humanistic anthropologies. The focus on individuals allowed a more personal understanding of what culture meant for the people who identify with it. What does it mean to be Waccamaw? In the new form, the voice of the person who lived that life becomes primary. Biography moves closer to autobiography, and individuals, once known as informants, move to acknowledged coauthorship. *From Princess to Chief* is a modern life history. The authors are Priscilla Freeman Jacobs, a Waccamaw woman who has been both the titled princess (National Indian Day) and chief (Waccamaw Tribe), and Patricia Barker Lerch, an anthropologist who has studied the Waccamaw since 1981. Most of the text is Jacobs's first-person narrative of her life from birth to the present. Lerch's voice, written in the third person, fills in the background details for the readers.

This short book is divided into five primary chapters: "Early Memories," "Eyewitness to History," "Marriage and Family," "Indian Activism: From Princess to Chief," and "Spiritual Life." Chapter 1 traces Jacobs's life from birth through young adulthood. She emphasizes the importance of extended family as the main support structure in Waccamaw life. Chapter 2 begins in 1950 when a Waccamaw del-

egation, including Jacobs, went to Washington, DC, to promote a bill for federal recognition. The bill failed, but the importance of better schooling, protection of traditions, and ownership of land stayed with her. She returned home to devote herself to learning and teaching traditional skills. Chapter 3 returns to a focus on family. Jacobs completed secretarial school, lived away, married, and gave birth to two children. Chapter 4 begins after her father's death in 1985 when she became chief, an office she left in early 2005. She was one of the earliest contemporary women chiefs, and her term occurred during an era of Native activism. Issues of land, schools, and maintenance of traditional values consumed much of her tenure. Anxiety over the possible loss of Waccamaw traditions is exemplified in her concern about traditional powwows being threatened by young people's interest in Pan-Indian style powwows with fancy dances and monetary awards. Chapter 5 describes her final transformation. Always a religious Christian woman, she increasingly devoted her time to spreading her faith as a travelling evangelist. She soon heard a calling to be a pastor of one church. Although this was generally not a woman's role, she came to believe that Biblical teachings supported her plans. She and her husband built an independent Christian church where she has been dedicated to the same lifelong goals.

The primary purpose of this book is clearly stated at both the introduction (p. ix) and epilogue (p. 80). Jacobs is interested in teaching the next generation about the "real" traditions of the Waccamaw. In her words, "I began this project hoping that the record of my memories of the history of our Waccamaw Siouan Indian tribe would be passed on to the younger generation because I felt that many of them probably knew very little of these things" (p. 80). She is concerned that young people are adopting their impressions

of real Indians from distant tribes. She warns, “We need to be careful about borrowing traditions from the Navajo Indians or other tribes because it will weaken our own” (p. 81). This book should be invaluable in meeting these goals. It is written in a clear voice that has the authenticity of a wise and respected elder who has devoted her life to her people. If the job of the narrator is to create a unique voice and tell a story that reflects the goals and interests of her life, Jacobs, with the aid of Lerch, does an excellent job.

For anthropologists interested in Native southeastern cultures, this book offers an intimate peek into the modern Waccamaw world. They are a small, state-recognized tribe with no reservation but a 25-acre community-owned area. However, a part of the appeal of this book to this audience is the fact that southeastern tribes are not well known out of the area. The problems of recognition and revitalization of traditions differ from those of larger, better known groups. Likewise, the issues of race and gender in the segregated

south differed from other areas. While the primary audience can be expected to know much of this, this secondary audience may need a more extensive description of the history and context of Waccamaw life than is offered here. As such, this might be best read as a companion to Lerch’s ethnographic work *Waccamaw Legacy* (2004).

## REFERENCES CITED

Lerch, Patricia Barker

2004 *Waccamaw Legacy: Contemporary Indians Fight for Survival*. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press.

Lurie, Nancy Oestreich, ed.

1961 *Mountain Wolf Woman, Sister of Crashing Thunder: The Autobiography of a Winnebago Indian*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Radin, Paul

1926 *Crashing Thunder: The Autobiography of an American Indian*. New York: D. Appleton.

# Malignant: How Cancer Becomes Us by S. Lochlann Jain

Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013. 304 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12404

Nancy J. Burke

University of California, San Francisco

A few years ago, I was taken aback when I heard the following emitting from my kitchen radio: “We’re preparing people for understanding cancer as the next stage of life.” These words, uttered by a local oncologist, summarized the normalizing ethos of cancer that has increased exponentially in the United States since President Nixon’s declaration of a war on cancer in 1971. Kristin Bell (2014) recently documented the defining role breast cancer has played in this process, and others, including Barron Lerner (2003), Robert Aronowitz (2007), and Maren Klawiter (2008) have traced the historical and political roots of breast cancer advocacy organizations and their social impacts. A welcome critical addition is S. Lochlann Jain’s *Malignant*, a powerful cultural analysis and personal memoir of cancer as a thing, a process, an experience, and a product.

Unlike recently lauded contributions that further the trope of normalcy and inevitability by anthropomorphizing cancer and conscribing its “biography” to a history of oncology as developed and practiced in the global north (Mukherjee 2011), Jain forces us, through playful and painful use of her own biography, to expand this history beyond accepted and reproduced biomedical explanations that limit cancer’s causes and prevention to individual “lifestyle.” Rejecting this accepted rhetoric, Jain forefronts uncertainty, questions what constitutes evidence (and for whom), and reinserts the embodied experience of cancer and its

treatment at the heart of any discussion of the production of evidence. In doing so, she maintains a tension between embodiment and research, from the introductory discussion of Rose Kushner’s seminal article and Lerner’s interpretation of it (p. 16) to her own experience with egg donation, to the discussion of logics that underlie cancer clinical trials.

The book flows from diagnosis, through treatment, to “survivorship.” Chapters take on questions of what it means to “live in prognosis”; to deal with the financial burdens of cancer treatment and unknown life expectancy; to ponder causes inadequately addressed in the mounds of National Cancer Institute research; to question reigning approaches to cancer screening; to confront cancer’s effects on personal and professional identities; and to physically maneuver through reconstruction, prostheses, and carcinogenic makeup. While a longer review would allow discussion of the many nuanced contributions of this text, here I briefly highlight the ways Jain’s integration of the personal with cultural critique work to blur certainties surrounding cancer research and to turn the spotlight on the understudied area of cancer in young women, particularly those who have participated in IVF egg donation.

The multiple uses of statistics and their meanings tie together many of the arguments presented in *Malignant*. Jain describes the painful evocation of statistical data in her description of her own prognosis discussion. While her oncologist sucked on three successive Hershey’s Kisses, she asked him what her pathology report and the prognostic charts she compared it to meant. “Exactly what it says,” he replied (p. 27), concretizing the impenetrability of

these numbers for individuals seeking understanding and the taken-for-granted meaning these numbers hold for the oncologists treating them. Statistics such as these are at the heart of understanding and claiming efficacy in cancer research via the randomized controlled trial (RCT)—and, Jain argues, the depersonalization of research participation. She laments the reduction of living individuals to numerical data and the reliance of the RCT on proportional mortality to show effect. As she states, there is “a sterility of personhood that comes up over and over again in the way statistics are rerun and debated and in how the results are used for protocol, redone, or ignored” (p. 119).

Importantly, *Malignant* brings to the fore the understudied and largely unrepresented predicament of young women with cancer. The accounts of misdiagnosis, physician paternalism, and dismissive refusal to conduct adequate diagnostic tests (e.g., Dr. Nordic and the FNA instead of core biopsy, p. 92) are chilling and reveal an aspect of cancer culture little discussed outside of the blogosphere. Jain’s expertise in injury law places these accounts within the frame of physician versus legal interpretations of prognostic data and in the wider context of medical errors in the U.S. healthcare system. The discussion of the unknown relationship between the hormones used in IVF and cancer incidence in young egg “donors” is particularly salient and, once again, raises the specter of what becomes worthy of study, how evidence is generated, and what remains understudied.

The American Cancer Society estimates that 40,290 women will die from breast cancer in 2015. *Malignant* forces us to acknowledge the burden of suffering this number represents. An “elegiac politics,” Jain suggests, “a stance that

admits to the inevitability of these deaths given the environmental and economic landscape” (p. 223), helps us decipher the inherent contradiction of cancer by demanding recognition of economic profits as well as cultural and personal losses. Jain accomplishes this through tracing cancer “as a process and a social field” without losing sight of “its brutal effects at the level of individual experience” (p. 4). *Malignant* is a significant addition to medical anthropology and to the anthropology of cancer. The book will be of value to undergraduate and graduate students of anthropology, global and public health, women’s studies, and cultural studies.

## REFERENCES CITED

- Aronowitz, Robert A.  
2007 *Unnatural History: Breast Cancer and American Society*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bell, Kristen  
2014 The Breast-Cancer-ization of Cancer Survivorship: Implications for Experiences of the Disease. *Social Science and Medicine* 110:56–63.
- Klawiter, Maren  
2008 *The Biopolitics of Breast Cancer: Changing Cultures of Disease and Activism*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Lerner, Barron H.  
2003 *The Breast Cancer Wars: Hope, Fear, and the Pursuit of a Cure in Twentieth-Century America*. First edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Mukherjee, Siddhartha  
2011 *The Emperor of All Maladies: A Biography of Cancer*. Reprint edition. New York: Scribner.

## Islam, Youth, and Modernity in the Gambia: The Tablighi Jama’at by Marloes Janson

New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014. 320 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12405

Aomar Boum

University of California, Los Angeles

This ethnographic work represents a significant addition to the growing anthropologies of Islamic practices in Africa. Grounded in fieldwork, it provides a rich analytical description of how Gambian youth appropriate the discourse of the Tablighi Jama’at. As a transnational missionary movement, the Tablighi Jama’at is based on reformist Islamic ideologies. The uniqueness of this work emerges from its geographical focus on Gambia as an ethnographic site. Author Marloes Janson breaks away from the traditional intellectual assumptions that tend to see African Islam as separate from Middle Eastern or Asian Islam.

In contrast with the situation in South Asia, the Tablighi Jama’at is new in many African countries. In the Gambia, the movement has successfully attracted mostly young lower middle-class youth at a time when the state and educational institutions have failed to provide economic, social, and political alternatives to a growing population of disenfranchised youth. Janson traces the life stories and biographies of five Gambian youth as members of the Tablighi Jama’at. Their stories are not only about how a growing number of Gambians live Islam in a context of neoliberal economies that continue to marginalize the poor and push them outside mainstream society but also how they experience the teaching of the Tablighi movement in their local contexts and through their personal terms.

In her analysis of these youth narratives, Janson engages many anthropological works of Islam. Unlike many works



that focused on questions of Muslim piety and individuals' attempts to live a religious life, Janson's ethnographic work highlights religious challenges of Gambian youth as they "move in and out" of the Jama'at for different reasons. In her ethnographic record of the biographical stories of three men and two women, Janson is largely interested in how these African converts to a particular movement within Islam negotiate their identity as Gambian Tablighi members. Janson begins the book by providing a historical, political, and economic description of the general Gambian context in which the life narratives of these young male and female Gambians were shaped. She reserves a chapter for each biographical narrative depicting the transformation of these young Gambians as Tablighi members.

One of the key features of Janson's ethnographic method and approach is how it allows the reader to see individual religious experiences as ambivalent trajectories full of contradictions. The possibility to see these Gambian youth biographical narratives over a relatively long period demonstrates how the youth manage not only conversion to the teachings of the movement but also how they deal with its challenges. Even though Janson builds on other ethnographies of Islam, she tries to complicate the anthropological question of piety by underlining the possibilities of moral failure and pious imperfection in the spiritual journey of these Gambian youth. Janson's ethnographic project seems to stress the point that Gambian Tablighi youth approach religion as a mechanism of negotiating shifting relations with the world around them.

In addition to the ethnographic richness of the book, Janson situates Gambian Tablighi missionaries in historical context going back to the early 1990s. Chapter 3 provides a good discussion of how Gambian Tablighis have interacted with South Asian Tablighis over the years by appropriating a

set of religious tropes and expressions of what Islam means to them. In addition, Janson highlights the material forms of expression of Islamic practice through clothing, food, and language. Unlike the general literature on Islam, which tends to associate Islamic forms of expression with Saudi Arabia and other parts of the Middle East, Janson provides detailed ethnographic passages on how Gambian Tablighis adopt lifestyles of Indian and Pakistani Muslims and ascribe to South Asian religious centers a mythical status.

The adoption of the lifestyle and religious forms of expression of the Tablighi Jama'at is a form of breaking away with the Gambian Islamic past and its ancestral traditions. Advocacy of the Tablighi movement is a way to promote a new Islamic religiosity, which separates the youth from what they consider backward traditionalism of the elders. In Gambia, Janson contends, youth are seen as central to this success of separation from the older generation's system of belief. Janson argues that youth's appropriation and performance of Tablighi religious lifestyle is a way to "reclaim their youthfulness" from a gerontocratic system in which youth subordination is imperative.

Janson tried and succeeded in weaving a story of the Tablighi Jama'at in Gambia through the eyes of young converts. This ethnographic work resonates with many anthropological studies on religion and conversion as well as regarding the place of youth in ideologies of morality and religious renewal. Janson highlights how people cross religious boundaries and negotiate their movement in and out of belief systems and moral traditions. This work is a welcome contribution to the study of religion, conversion, and youth. It will be of interest to scholars in anthropology, Islam, religion, and youth. Its style also makes it accessible to a broader audience interested in religious movements.

## Speaking Pittsburghese: The Story of a Dialect by Barbara Johnstone

Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013. 288 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12442

**Marianna Di Paolo**  
University of Utah

In this book, Barbara Johnstone analyzes a complex set of linguistic and ethnographic data gathered over a 15-year period, showing in detail how the speech of Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, has come to both reflect and constitute its vernacular culture as it transformed from a Scotch-Irish western enclave to an early-20th-century immigrant steel town, then to a rust-belt city, and now to a 21st-century city known for its educational and healthcare institutions along with its

Steelers (American football) cult. The book is an engaging social history of Pittsburgh speech. Johnstone's clear style makes the book accessible to educated readers of all backgrounds by providing definitions of linguistic terms and copious language examples throughout.

Johnstone usefully distinguishes between Pittsburghese (the local stereotype of what distinguishes Pittsburgh speech from other English varieties) and Pittsburgh speech (what can be objectively observed about the English of the city). The appealing title, *Speaking Pittsburghese: The Story of a Dialect*, is interestingly incongruent with the distinction. Experimental data shows that while Pittsburghese is highly salient, Pittsburghers themselves do not (at least consciously) notice their

actual local dialect (although some level of notice at some stage is necessary for the speech features to be acquired).

First introduced in the substantive Preface, one of Johnstone's compelling findings is that, contrary to the theory that language variation is the result of speakers using language to project their identities, people who attribute social meaning to a linguistic feature (i.e., a variant of a variable) are not the same people who use the stereotyped feature. This mismatch between who uses a linguistic feature, who assigns it social meaning, and how and why that happens is at the heart of the book. The evidence for this argument comes from a detailed analysis showing the enregisterment of Pittsburghese as a dynamic process (i.e., how the features of Pittsburghese have come to be assigned different social meanings over time).

The second chapter focuses on the history and enregisterment of *yinz* (aka, *you'uns*), one of the most salient features of Pittsburghese, now a commodified brand for all things Pittsburgh (also ch. 7) and so appropriately scribbled on the front cover of the book. *Yinz*, now a regional variant of plural *you*, has Scotch-Irish origins, as do most features of Pittsburghese. Earlier, *you'uns* occurred throughout the U.S. Midland dialect region, to my knowledge, as far west as the Hill Country of Texas.

While the book is meant for a wide audience, the theoretical constructs and analysis of the data are firmly grounded in variationist sociolinguistics and linguistic anthropology. The author succeeds in this balancing act by skillfully explaining what sociolinguists and linguistic anthropologists do to study language as she presents her analysis of the data sets. Johnstone's explanations and examples of the analytical tools of enregisterment, metapragmatics, indexicality, and reflexivity are some of the clearest of which I am aware. In this regard, the book may also serve as an engaging textbook, and I recommend it for graduate students as well as for anyone interested in understanding current thinking in the study of language variation.

A stated goal of the book is to say "something new about the meaning of place in human lives" (p. 242) in that place is embodied in language and language helps to create a sense of place. In meeting this goal, Johnstone also responds, perhaps unintentionally, to an important question that has driven variationist sociolinguistics for five decades: Why do regional dialects persist? Johnstone shows us how the answer to this question must be tied to how and why linguistic forms are linked to social meaning—that is, how they are enregistered.

As excellent a book as it is, it has a few minor problems that caused me some confusion. While the word *standardized* is generally used in sociolinguistics to refer to the process of a dialect becoming the Standard dialect, here it is used to mean what is commonly referred to either as *focused* (in studies of language contact) or *narrowed* (in historical linguistics referring to semantic change). Second, the only citation provided for the matched guise experimental paradigm (p. 90) is Giles and Ryan 1982, but the paradigm was pioneered by Lambert et al. 1960. There are a number of typos, two of which require clarification: on page 49 in the definition of *iconic* the instruction to the printer to insert a picture of a pencil was not replaced by the actual picture, and on page 228 April 17 rather than March 17 is given as an indirect reference to St. Patrick's Day.

In summary, Johnstone's book is a well-argued, evidence-based study of a regional urban variety of English, bringing together the best of many fields of inquiry including variationist sociolinguistics and linguistic anthropology.

## REFERENCES CITED

- Giles, Howard, and Ellen B. Ryan, eds.  
1982 Attitudes toward Language Variation: Social and Applied Contexts. London: Edward Arnold.  
Lambert, W. E., R. C. Hodgson, R. C. Gardner, and S. Fillenbaum  
1960 Evaluational Reactions to Spoken Languages. *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology* 60(1):44–51.

# Accidental Immigrants and the Search for Home: Women, Cultural Identity, and Community by Carol E. Kelley

Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2013. 190 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12406

Jacqueline Knörr

Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology

Carol E. Kelley's book explores the immigrant experience by giving a voice to four middle-aged immigrant women whose lives she explores from childhood through adulthood. Kelley deals with the immigration histories of Anna, Barrett, Lisa, and Shirine, who originate from New Zealand, the

United States, Canada, and Iran and settle in Norway, Venezuela, Florida, and France, respectively. She classifies their immigrations as "accidental" because, in contrast to the majority of immigrants portrayed in the media and much of social science research, these women moved to new countries for reasons of marriage, education, or career and not out of economic or political needs. I do not find this classification—and, therefore, the title of the book—convincing. That more freedom of decision and self-determination were involved in these women's immigration

histories than in many other cases does not make their immigrations seem more but, rather, less “accidental” to me.

Kelley explores how these four women navigate between societal and family demands and their own need to take root in a new personal, social, and cultural environment. While Kelley intentionally focuses on the narrative accounts, she also engages with anthropological and psychological concepts in her analysis of the emotional conditions caused by the experience of immigration.

By employing personal narratives, Kelley achieves an intimate understanding of how the individual circumstances leading to migration have shaped these women’s sense of belonging and of how specific situations have affected their identities and attachments to former and new homes. Such accounts of personal experiences are not meant to generate universal statements about migration but, rather, in-depth knowledge concerning the insider’s perspective on the experience of migration, thereby also adding ethnographic “flesh” to more theoretical debates related to issues of migration, belonging, and identity formation. Focusing closely on the immigrant experience also reveals how the respective host society’s potential and willingness to welcome and include or to reject and exclude immigrants affects the latter’s perception of self and other in an immigrant situation and thereby also the chances to forge new ties and feelings of belonging. Looking back at many years of living in a foreign country from the perspective of immigrants reveals how meanings of home and belonging may change over time and in relation to personal developments, specific life events, and societal changes. This enables the reader to retrace how attachment to a new home is established and how connections and relationships to a former home are maintained and transformed. I agree with Kelley that “life histories are particularly effective in the study of immigration, as they provide a retrospective, humanized view of the slow process of adjustment to life in a new place” (p. 5). By means of biographic research, Kelley has succeeded at what she set out to do—namely, to “gain insight

into the interrelationship between immigration and individual perceptions of home” (p. 5) while permitting readers to compare and contrast the women’s (hi)stories themselves.

Kelley differentiates between four major phases of the women’s immigrant lives and deals with them in four chapters. The first chapter—“Accidental Immigrants”—is about the women’s lives until their arrival at what are to become their new homes. It deals with the reasons for and circumstances of their leaving their place of origin. The second chapter—“Transitions”—concerns the first months and years after the women’s arrival in their host countries and the adjustments and adaptations they must make to their new social and cultural environments. “Turning Points”—the third chapter—focuses on the life events that have most directly caused the women to determine where they belong and to commit themselves to a life that takes this sense of belonging into consideration. The final and fourth chapter—“Lejanía cercana”—deals with the women’s making sense of life lived in in-between places and their navigation and self-positioning between categories of belonging as a permanent condition of immigrant life.

I find the structuring of the book convincing as it allows for the contextualization of the women’s life courses in a comparative perspective and reveals that immigration is not a temporary process but continuously affects an immigrant’s identity and sense of belonging—albeit in different ways and to varying degrees of acuteness depending on a person’s phase of life and in relation to situation and circumstances. Despite this rationally persuasive argument, I found myself not following the author’s structure when reading the book. Rather, I wanted to know “what happened next” after having become captivated by Anna’s life history before her departure to Norway and by Kelley’s analysis thereof. Hence, I followed Anna through the different chapters of the book . . . and then Shirine, Lisa, and Barrett—not, however, without having read the short introductions to the different chapters first. There are different rewarding ways of reading this book.

## How Forests Think: Toward an Anthropology beyond the Human by Eduardo Kohn

Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013. 288 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12407

**T. M. Luhrmann**  
Stanford University

*How Forests Think* is a remarkable book. Eduardo Kohn uses language that captures your attention and makes you want to say “no” until, sometimes reluctantly, you will see what

he wants you to see. Do forests think? No, of course not. And yet, in the way that this ethnography unpacks what that question means, the reader comes to understand that they do.

The best way to understand what the book accomplishes is to begin with the observation that in the Amazon life is precarious and survival depends upon an intimate understanding of the natural world. There has been a lot of discussion among anthropologists about “perspectivism”

and “the ontological turn.” The achievement of the book is to provide the ethnographic context in which these debates make sense.

That context is that life in this setting is terrifying. It is not only terrifying, of course: social life is rich and full of kindness. The book has a wonderful description of the experience of sleep: “Sleeping in Avila is not the consolidated, solitary, sensorially deprived endeavor it is for us. . . . [it is] continually interspersed with wakefulness . . . thanks to these continuous disruptions, dreams spill into wakefulness and wakefulness into dreams in a way that entangles them both” (p. 13). But it is a world in which people often die in the dense jungle. Their feet slip, they fall into a stream, and their bodies are only discovered weeks later. Dogs die because they encounter a jaguar that mauls them. Jaguars maul humans, too. More than most ethnographies of the Amazon, this one gives a sense of the fragility of human life under the canopy. Kohn describes his own panic attack when en route to his village. A landslide halted his bus, and another blocked the return route. As he sat there among the chattering and, to his mind, clueless tourists, he realized that landslides could crush the bus entirely and bury them all, and he was paralyzed. “This is steep, unstable and dangerous terrain. The landslides reawakened in me a jumble of disturbing images from a decade of traveling this road: a snake frantically tracing figure eights in an immense mudflow that had washed over the road minutes before we had gotten there; a steel bridge buckled in half like a crushed soda can by a slurry of rocks let loose as the mountain above it came down; a cliff splattered with yellow paint, the only sign left of the delivery truck that had careened into the ravine the night before” (p. 46).

In this world, food is hunted, grown, and gathered, not purchased. Survival depends on reading the weather and on knowing which animals have passed by recently and what their movements might mean. As a result, it really matters that humans know the forest well. “This intimacy in large part involves eating and also the real risk of being eaten” (p. 3).

So humans become intensely interested in understanding how predators think. That is why people develop such elaborate ideas about predators and other animals and think of them as being like themselves, only seeing the world from a different perspective. “When the food was brought out the man saw piles of freshly cooked, steaming-hot armadillo meat. [The Lord of the Armadillos] saw this same food as cooked squash” (p. 121). Being predator or prey is a relative position; one can shift. Being human or jaguar is also an unstable position. But when the human imagines the jaguar’s experience, the human imagines that the jaguar has the equivalent of beer and other human food.

Kohn is not trying to argue that that all settings in which people are vulnerable to natural danger will develop perspectivism. He just shows that this complicated switching of perspectives as humans imagine the lives of predators is the way in which Amazonians have come to make sense of their world.

Kohn also does not push the strong version of the ontological argument: that different people live in worlds constituted of ontologically different stuff. Instead, he emphasizes the intense interdependency of all life. In the way that he formulates it, this interdependency is both true of all living ecosystems and particularly true among the Runa, who have elaborated ideas about persons being made through interaction. The theoretical apparatus Kohn uses to build this argument about an interdependency that unfolds over time is sufficiently open (a critic might say, vague) to leave a range of interpretive possibilities available to the reader. To this reader, Kohn seemed to be inviting his readers to understand coevolution from the inside. That is, he presents an account of the ways that animals and plants have evolved together and in response to each other as if he is describing the subjective experience of that process, drawing on the work of C. S. Pierce and Terrence Deacon. It is an account of how to think about thinking, as well as about the ways that different models of thinking about thinking emerge out of the intense and precarious interdependency of the forest world and become culture.

## UNESCO, Cultural Heritage, and Outstanding Universal Value: Value-Based Analyses of the World Heritage and Intangible Cultural Heritage Conventions by Sophia Labadi

Lanham: AltaMira, 2013. 204 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12408

Máiréad Nic Craith  
Heriot-Watt University

This book—which is a revision of a PhD thesis conducted at University College London—is a fascinating and insightful

read. Three major questions are addressed throughout: (1) How have official understandings of Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) emerged? (2) How have state parties interpreted the concept in nomination dossiers for inclusion on the World Heritage List? (3) How have postcolonial parties addressed that which is arguably a Eurocentric concept?

Methodologically, the author uses two primary sampling strategies. In a highly complementary fashion, she balances the use of typical case sampling, on the one hand, along with extreme case sampling, on the other hand. Religious heritage was selected as the typical case study, whereas industrial heritage was chosen as the extreme case study (the latter is generally underrepresented on the World Heritage List). All in all, Sophia Labadi analyzed 114 nomination dossiers, which were classified into three groups. The first focused on European religious sites and consisted of 46 dossiers in 12 countries. In the second group (non-European religious sites) were 30 dossiers from five countries. The underrepresented industrial heritage formed the final group and was made up of 38 dossiers in 19 countries.

Structurally, the book is well organized. Beginning with a theoretical framework, the first chapter explores the concept of OUV with particular reference to the notion of “reiterative universalism,” which allows for flexibility in the interpretation and translation of OUV in different concepts and settings. Chapter 2 considers the historical evolution of OUV from the perspective of international institutions such as UNESCO and the World Heritage Committee. National rather than international heritage features in the next chapter, which deals with the political dimension of heritage at the level of nation-state. Chapter 4 explores how cultural diversity has been evidenced in different state dossiers and how different cultural groups have been represented in relation to OUV. The following chapter deals with economic issues and the impact of tourism and sustainability on World Heritage sites. As authenticity is a key element in the assessment of World Heritage status, this issue is addressed in chapter 6. Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) features in chapter 7, while the concluding chapter reviews 40 years of the World Heritage Convention and offers recommendations for future directions.

Some particular interesting ideas emerge in this book, and the issue of the European dimension of heritage is well explored. As Labadi points out, the association of art, heritage, and intrinsic values is rooted in European philosophical texts. She revisits Immanuel Kant’s argument (1952) that individual aesthetic judgments are disinterested. People enjoy that which they consider beautiful, and such objective judgments are universal. More recently, other European philosophers such as Pierre Bourdieu (1984) have argued that aesthetic judgments are acquired and vary from one culture to another. The significance of this debate lies in the notion of intrinsic value, which is often “objectively” assigned by “experts” in the field who find OUV in particular World Heritage sites.

Labadi concludes that OUV has primarily been defined from a Eurocentric perspective in its first 30 years. This helps explain the overrepresentation of European heritage sites on World Heritage lists in the early decades. However, drawing on the concept of reiterative universalism, which was

originally developed by Michael Walzer (1989) and adapted from Seyla Benhabib’s (2002) “democratic iteration,” Labadi argues that human beings are perfectly capable of using common principles in implementing frameworks that have originated from outside their own culture. Moreover, any concept needs to be reinterpreted locally before it has significance. While the World Heritage Convention is not a neo-Orientalist or neocolonialist system, Labadi argues that nomination dossiers are “contact zones” where European ideas in relation to World Heritage values are reinterpreted and re-formed. Her suggestion is that non-European parties can overturn dominant discourses and give the subaltern permission to speak. While such dossiers are written with reference to a universalist framework, which is rooted in European philosophy, non-European state parties can either reproduce or transcend the dominant discourse.

I find this a fascinating argument, although it is not one with which I entirely agree. The current expectation that non-European state parties would be obliged to engage primarily with what is largely a European discourse is still a form of postcolonialism—a type that features in Franz Fanon’s (1967) *Black Skins, White Masks*. In that volume, Fanon outlines the postcolonial cultural legacy of a Mother Country to her former imperial subjects. Using psychoanalysis to explain his position, he argues black people in a white world suffer from feelings of inadequacy and inferiority. Uprooted from their cultural origins, they embrace the norms of the “Mother Country” and imitate the culture of the colonizer. Although mastering the language of the colonizer (i.e., “white masks”), they never achieve equality.

In this instance, Labadi is arguing that non-European state parties are making the best of the situation in which they find themselves—and so, perhaps, this book is also a call to all of us who are passionate about heritage to reconsider the criteria for World Heritage status and to review the Eurocentric nature of the “international” definition of *heritage* to achieve a more global consensus. This is definitely a book worth reading.

## REFERENCES CITED

- Benhabib, Seyla  
2002 *The Claims of Culture: Equality and Diversity in the Global Era*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Bourdieu, Pierre  
1984[1979] *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Fanon, Frantz  
1967[1952] *Black Skin, White Masks*. London: Pluto.
- Kant, Immanuel  
1952[1790] *The Critique of Judgement*. Oxford: Clarendon.
- Walzer, Michael  
1989 *Nation and Universe: The Tanner Lectures on Human Values*. [http://tannerlectures.utah.edu/\\_documents/a-to-z/w/walzer90.pdf](http://tannerlectures.utah.edu/_documents/a-to-z/w/walzer90.pdf), accessed June 4, 2015.



# Land, Mobility, and Belonging in West Africa

## by Carola Lentz

Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2013. 348 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12409

**Bill Derman**

*Norwegian University of Life Sciences*

This ethnography provides an important historical account of two West African peoples—the Sisala and the Dagara, with an emphasis upon the latter. Their homeland is an area of the West African savannah, in the borderlands of northwestern Ghana and southern Burkina Faso. The book is organized partly chronologically and partly thematically. The Dagara possess a highly mobile set of patrilineages and clans whose movements led them to settle on Sisala lands. What partly makes author Carola Lentz's research even more interesting is that the Sisala and Dagara had two different colonial powers. In addition, the independent nations of Burkina Faso and Ghana followed different policies. From an anthropological perspective, they have been theoretically important in the study of stateless societies (Middleton and Tait 1958) and hypotheses surrounding the nature of segmentary societies (Sahlins 1961) and the need to control people not land (Goody 1971), which Lentz disputes. More recently, debates have focused on their land tenure systems; the role, place, and power of earth priests; and ethnicity, power, and property (Lund 2008; Toulmin et al. 2002). She also includes a moral economy dimension: she records the Sisala as claiming that they cannot deny the Dagara land for subsistence purposes. The origins and the historical continuity of this norm are never entirely clear.

To these issues, Lentz has added rich descriptions and analyses of two ethnic groups that mobilized differently to acquire land, to move, and to remain settled. The Dagara emphasize autonomy—their young men seek new land and to become founders of a new village. In their spread, they weave networks that keep up social relations including the home village. The Sisala, however, emphasize stability and perhaps forced movement in the past. They do not keep relations with their original homes. There is a significant ideological difference among the two peoples sustained over time. But both agree that “first-comer narratives” are accepted while the earth shrine represents “some sort of pact with the earth god and the spirits of the land” (p. 18). The first-comer status permits them to acquire full property rights to the land. The book details how these property rights are contested over time between and among groups. Lentz notes the contradiction between recognizing mobility

and coming first to a place while the land doesn't move. As population has increased and land has become scarcer, first-comer claims remain the basis for land ownership even though national land policies have changed.

In discussing methodology, Lentz notes that people in general are reluctant to talk about history—and women are especially so. She notes that enterprising women could play an important part in establishing new villages, but this idea is not elaborated on further. She relies on the accounts of male lineage elders, and it has taken years of research to provide coherent and comprehensive accounts. Lentz contends that legal pluralism existed within and between the Sisala and Dagara. In general, two principles were at work in claims for land. “The land belongs to the tiller” or to those who were the founders of the earth shrine. The founders could claim certain boundaries as first comers, but those boundaries could be contested. Legal pluralism doesn't cease. The French and the British both imposed chiefs and paramount chiefs where there had been none. She views the earth priests as very limited in their powers. The colonial powers also redrew boundaries and did not, in the main, respect the indigenous boundaries set by earth priests and earth shrines. Colonial boundaries were less flexible than earlier ones, especially given the moral economy that permitted migrants to do subsistence farming on unused land if they acknowledged the earth shrine. Gifts were to be given to earth priests for this privilege. How and if these gifts have been changed over time is not fully discussed. Lentz makes the important point that earth priests just don't allocate land and the right to farm but also assign rights to harvest fruit, build houses, and bury the dead. Earth priests in turn may claim rights that may be contested by other earth priests. Boundary making can be fraught with tension and potential violence.

A short review cannot do justice to a magisterial historical and contemporary (through 2001) account of processes of change and continuity. Rich in narratives, readers will be grateful for the attention to comparison, nuance, and detail. These narratives are lifted to discuss issues of power, process, the nature of property, legal pluralism, ideas of autochthony, and contemporary land conflicts. The notes are rich with sources and references to other research. My complaint is the absence of women and gender as important concerns. Lentz makes reference, for example, to interethnic marriage but provides no discussion of the importance of women in marriage: Are there significant differences in the position of women among the Dagara and Sisala? Nor is there

a sense of how women coped and worked while men opened up new hunting areas, new farm plots, and new fishing grounds or, more recently, while the men participated in labor migration. Finally, there is no analysis of women in ritual arenas or enough analysis of them as actors in their own right.

## REFERENCES CITED

Goody, Jack

1971 *Technology, Tradition and the State in Africa*. London: Oxford University Press.

Lund, Christian

2008 *Local Politics and the Dynamics of Property in Africa*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Middleton, John, and David Tait, eds.

1958 *Tribes without Rulers*. London: Routledge Kegan Paul.

Sahlins, Marshall D.

1961 The Segmentary Lineage: An Organization of Predatory. *American Anthropologist* 63(2):322–345.

Toulmin, Camilla, Phillippe Delville, and Samba Traore, eds.

2002 *The Dynamics of Resource Tenure in West Africa*. Oxford: James Currey.

# Obsidian Reflections: Symbolic Dimensions of Obsidian in Mesoamerica by Marc N. Levine and David M. Carballo, eds.

Boulder: University Press of Colorado, 2014. 304 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12410

Marina Sprovieri

*Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas–Universidad Nacional de La Plata*

Obsidian is one of the few materials that has allowed—albeit its limited geographical availability—itsself to be formatized to fit so many different tasks, to be handled by so various social actors, and to take clear part of such diverse spheres in social life simultaneously. In this many-sided quality lies part of the interest that has moved its study forward in the most varied regions of the globe. *Obsidian Reflections* is an outcome of that interest and a concrete contribution gathering a number of study cases focused on obsidian in Mesoamerica, in which we find varied and complementary approaches to one of its less explored sides: the symbolic.

How past societies have organized and made use of the materials surrounding them has depended on a wide network of practices and associations that have given each element its own position and social value. The search for some thread of insight on this complex social weave moves us to explore various analytical paths and to deal with classification schemes that differ from the ones in the modern Western world.

This book is devoted to such a task, trying and combining multiple paths of analysis, all of which are potentially fruitful, to examine the role of obsidian in the Mesoamerican view of the world. On the one hand, there is thorough use of the richness and diversity of the Mesoamerican record, whether its archaeological, ethnohistorical, or ethnographic aspects, and even some of these aspects combined. In the same way, various study regions are considered, including

Central and West Mexico, the Oaxaca highlands, and even Honduras, Guatemala, and Belize, without losing sight of the larger region and the processes developed within it, providing a solid basis for analysis. The chapters in the book cover the ancient past through recent and current times, allowing us the possibility of making some links between ways of understandings and using obsidian along this wide time span.

Finally, the approach to the different cases is carried out from thorough contextual analyses, which consider obsidian in its relation to other types of materials and in varied social spaces such as ceremonial centers, households, mines, caves, and funerary contexts, therefore providing potential access to the signification of obsidian in social life.

In particular, the introductory chapter shows a detailed review carried out by Marc Levine of the theoretical perspectives in the study of obsidian in Mesoamerica, which examines both the traditional approaches (normative, functional, political economy) and the more modern perspectives (which focus on concepts such as life history, being in the world, object agency, and value, among others).

The following three chapters—by Véronique Darras, by Alejandro Pastrana and Ivonne Athie, and by John Monaghan—represent the ethnohistorical and ethnographic approaches to the subject. What is highlighted is the native understandings of the place of obsidian in the world, working toward chains of associations of different terms and concepts that shed light on the significance of obsidian in specific historical contexts.

The archaeological approaches, developed in the chapters by Kazuo Aoyama, by Marc Levine, by David Carballo, by W. James Stemp and Jaime Awe, and by Serra Puche and colleagues, take into account different material records, tackled via techno typological, microwear, spatial, provenance, and contextual analyses. There is a tendency to consider that the role of obsidian in ritual contexts is

primarily related to legitimization practices of a group within society (elites, dynasties, rising chiefs, etc.). However, in other cases, it is proposed that processes such as the conformation of social identities can influence the patterns of use of obsidian in the past.

Finally, William Parry carries out in his closing chapter a clear integration and examination of what is known about the ancient meanings of obsidian according to different fields of analysis: ethnographic and ethnohistorical sources, uses, and contexts of deposition. As he moves forward, the author goes back and discusses what he finds relevant in each chapter, adding his own research to ongoing debates on the participation of obsidian artifacts in funerary rituals in Teotihuacan.

*Obsidian Reflections* can be seen as an outstanding drive toward knowledge of symbolism and ancient ideologies related to obsidian in Mesoamerica, with approaches relevant beyond this region. What partially underlies the entire work is an approach to materiality inclined toward segmenting objects according to their performance in different domains of social action (domestic—ritual, symbolic—decorative—functional, and so forth), which can hinder the understanding of the object as a unit. Going back to the initial weave metaphor, the unit is made up at the knots, which are points of a network in which multiple layers of meaning converge and thicken. The challenge of trying ways to overcome segmentation in search of the whole must always continue.

## Land's End: Capitalist Relations on an Indigenous Frontier by Tania Murray Li.

Durham: Duke University Press, 2014. 240 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12411

Shane Greene

Indiana University, Bloomington

Tania Murray Li's recent book, *Land's End: Capitalist Relations on an Indigenous Frontier*, represents a mature intervention into the fate of rural Indonesians in the wake of twenty-some years of relentless global integration. I have no specific axe to grind with the ontologists that have come to dominate discussions of indigenous difference in recent anthropology—other than voicing that I don't share their enthusiasm or like the philosophical impoverishment it usually implies. Li's book is refreshingly not part of the trend. In fact, it is proof of what deep ethnography has always offered the anthropological enterprise and evidence of how fundamental political economy is to understanding the predicament in which Sulawesi highlanders now find themselves. After decades of engagement with the state, agribusiness developers, and coastal merchants—in their own active pursuit of a forever-receding horizon of “modernity”—most of their lives are simply far worse than they used to be.

As Li states in the Introduction,

The surprising finding of this book is that indigenous highlanders, people who are imagined by activists of the global indigenous and peasant movements to be securely attached to their land and communities, joined the ranks of people unable to sustain themselves . . . More surprisingly still, the process that dislodged them from their land wasn't initiated by land-grabbing corporations or state agencies. There was no “primitive accumulation” of the kind Marx described . . . The process through which they lost control over their collectively owned land was far less dramatic, even mundane. [p. 3]

The book goes on to tell a literal and figurative tale of land loss over the last couple of decades—a slow but sure process of dispossession and the steady redefinition of these highlanders' lives in terms of private property, profit, and new paradigms of material inequality.

The fact that this was as much or more the product of the highlanders' own pursuits of the false promises of modernity as it was any explicit bullying by more powerful outside development actors, and that a few decades later they ended up lumped together with the rest of the world's landless and poor, isn't necessarily that surprising. I also think Li simplifies a bit by deciding to articulate the argument as contrary to the idealized imaginations of rural social movements and indigenous activists. Such actors do of course trade in strategic essentialisms and romantic resistance stories, all while the populations for which they speak get absorbed by global capital. However, judging from personal experience and from many scholarly treatments with a more nuanced view of social movements, many are also well versed in logics of self-criticism, critical reflection, and even outright cynicism at times. I'm not sure it really works to lump all activists together in the way that the book does at times. Contemporary activists can also represent interlocutors equally self-conscious about how they too are wrapped up in the problem, even willing to concede they are part of it, rather than the only ones fighting for a “real” solution.

Despite this one disagreement, I find Li's book a fascinating account and necessary analytical take on two major counts. The first is methodological. *Land's End* is a wonderful lesson in the benefits of long-term engagement in a particular locale with the same collaborators; it could and should be read as a significant ethnographic statement in that

respect. Her work with Sulawesi highlanders over a 20-year span creates the necessary space for serious reflection on long-term dynamics. The critique of ethnography as too place based (hence, the frequent compulsion among current graduate students in anthropology to claim everything they do is “multisited ethnography”) and anthropology as too human centered (hence, the drive toward Latourian frameworks and posthumanist meanderings) are both beginning to reveal their limitations and revel in certain analytical clichés. Li’s book reminds us that ethnography of the particularly committed sort is not so much “tradition” as it is necessary, particularly if one considers how little other disciplines (much less lawmakers or business executives) actually care about direct engagement with radically impoverished people or the marginal spaces they inhabit.

Finally, *Land’s End* operates at a compelling theoretical interspace very much needed in contemporary accounts of globalization. As interpretive ethnography, she looks for a master metaphor—“my study concerns land’s end as a dead end,” Li (p. 180) says in the conclusion—in order to express something about how the highlanders’ comprehend their contemporary reality. As analyst of a brutal material outcome, one still historically emergent but showing no signs of relief, she pieces together a nuanced political-economic argument. It refuses to champion the hopeful or utopian when there are simply no real signs for such. It also moves past Polanyi-inspired expectations that rural peoples’ institutions might somehow sustain themselves in the face of capital’s expansion while simultaneously questioning traditional Marxist presumptions about the directionality and drivers of uneven development. In short, it’s really good anthropology.

## Muslim Societies in Africa: A Historical Anthropology by Roman Loimeier.

Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2013. 376 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12412

José van Santen  
Leiden University

By writing this book, Roman Loimeier undertook a courageous task that does not have any precedent. Loimeier resents all the major geographical areas within an African historical context and from a “southern perspective”—though because based on secondary sources, this seems somewhat contradictory. While reading how Islam became the common denominator for many Africans, it again comes to the fore that their society’s history has at times been as prosperous, but additionally as turbulent and violent, as the history in other parts of the world. Also, all along the centuries, the various regions of the continent have been part of a global(izing) world mainly through trade and efforts to control trade routes. According to the author, it is mainly by these routes that Islam as a religion gained confidence and rooted in many societies.

At a dazzling speed, we pass by empires, kingdoms, and wars and holy wars (*jihads*), the latter of which often led to general processes of Islamization for many groups within the continent. We learn about rebellions using the Islamic religion to give voice to their discontent and to counterforce existing political systems (but also systems of slavery) while realizing that various present-day Islamic–Islamists movements are a continuum just taking place in our contemporaneous political context.

Starting with the question of whether there is an “African Islam,” Loimeier engages in a long-lasting debate and again shows that Islam in the Middle East has been influenced by African scholars as much as vice versa. In the Middle Ages, Timbuktu was an acknowledged center of Islamic learning. African Muslim societies, often considered as marginally Islamic, have been core areas of the Islamic world all through history.

Loimeier thereafter describes various regions, starting with the Maghreb, labeling the Sahel as a connective space due to its trade routes, and continuing on with West Africa, Egyptian colonization, and the influence of the Ottoman Empires and East Africa (Nubia and Funj). The latter contains a very interesting chapter on the interaction of Muslims and Christians in Ethiopian societies, whereby, in some instances, the inhabitants of Christian empires forced Muslims to convert to Christianity or have their heads chopped off. The author finally passes by the East African coast further south to Muslims on the Cape, the region where they never became a political force. The last chapter deals with Muslims under colonial rule.

Despite this astonishing enterprise, some critical remarks can be made. At first, while covering various regions, I felt a desperate need to consult some maps. Far too few have been included. Secondly, the reader can find some moments of rest in the boxes throughout the chapters (though not in a balanced way) that deal with specific topics. As the author claims to write a historical anthropology, it would have been nice to find out more about how individuals decided to come to terms with daily life and the requirements of Islam.

Many scholars—including myself—have dealt with this issue. Regarding people (as human beings are quite absent in the book), what exactly, for example, should we envisage when author speaks about a “devastating human catastrophe” (p. 154)?

Third, a most precious item of trade—through which, as we have learned, Islam spread—was humans. Nevertheless, slavery had many different forms. I myself have written about the enslavement of an old woman (at the time that I often visited her) and her and her family’s conversion to Islam. Had such stories been included, they would have shed light on the phenomenon of slavery in a Muslim society, given that the concept is still used in an uncritical way. In Fulfulde, people employ many words for *slave* that are related to different sorts of slaves and the often politically important position that slaves acquire or their position as landowners.

My most severe criticism concerns the author’s absence of an awareness that processes of Islamization are gendered. Human beings in general are reduced to soldiers, scholars, tradesmen, kings, and emperors—all male, I assume—and in the rare cases in which women are mentioned, their roles

are downplayed and “subjected.” To give an example, we learn about Islamic scholars who started to write in their own (Fulfulde) language to popularize programs of reform to advance women’s education (p. 127). What should we deduce from this? While revealing the loss of Nubian matrilineal succession, we can only guess how women dealt with this loss (p. 139, 149). Other examples concerning gender involve a Jewish queen (p. 174); the circumcision of girls in Ethiopian orthodox Jewish and Christian societies (p. 177); and the emancipation (meaning what?) of Muslim women in Tanzania (p. 269) and white south-African women in marginal positions who married Muslims to escape an unfavorable social position (p. 252). In all these instances, no additional information concerning these women’s positions is given. It made me miss a bibliography. I understand the author’s way of quoting, but I often felt the need to know where his descriptions came from or to know more about issues that the author could not fully elaborate on in this compactly written book.

To conclude, I pose one final question: Is religion really only spread by trade, or is that a European (capitalist, Weberian) prejudice?

## Pregnant on Arrival: Making the Illegal Immigrant by Eithne Luibhéid

Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2013. 304 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12413

**Dianna Shandy**  
Macalester College

*Pregnant on Arrival* revolves around the multiple and contingent ways that migration, reproduction, sexualities, and the state intersect in Ireland. The book indicates that it “focuses on the Irish government’s and public’s responses to pregnant asylum seekers who acquired legal residency by giving birth to children rather than by state verification of their claims of fearing persecution” (p. 1). It goes on to note that it centers “on the period between 1997 and 2004, when the controversies over pregnant migrants were at their peak” (p. 2). These dates are meaningful because they bracket a surge in migration to Ireland during the economic uptick, known as the Celtic Tiger period, and the national referendum, which put an end to automatic birthright citizenship. While this indeed describes what is covered in the book, neither these statements of focus nor the book’s title, *Pregnant on Arrival: Making the Illegal Immigrant*, fully capture the scope of the book or what I view as its most intriguing contribution. While this temporally specific case study on migration to Ireland is noteworthy, it is the ways in which the author uses what she calls “queer migration theory” to relate this

case to seemingly remote phenomena that make this such a fascinating book. For example, putting the asylum seekers’ experiences in conversation with gay and lesbian emigration in the 1990s “since homosexuality was deemed incompatible with Irishness” (p. 37) is an illustrative example of how the lens author Eithne Luibhéid creates space for fresh insights.

Accordingly, the material covered in the eight chapters of this book spill over the narrow confines of its stated focus. The introduction lays out the author’s case for building a critical dialogue between queer theory and migration scholarship—a queer migration theory that emphasizes how a queer framework grounded in a critical analysis of heteronormativity can provide a useful lens for understanding the struggles of the migrants she describes. She also brings the concept of sexualities to the fore, with all of its rich and, as yet within the broader realm of anthropology, underexplored heuristic potential.

Chapter 1 engages discourses of childbearing, with particular emphasis on how Irish women’s reproduction related to notions of economy (in the wake of the famine and later in the Celtic Tiger era), poverty and emigration, colonialism and postcolonialism, Catholicism and sexuality, race and nation, belonging and the EU, and, atop all of this, the arrival of migrant women whose children were eligible for birthright citizenship (before 2005). Chapter 2 draws on some



empirical interview-based data with members of the Irish public and a small sample of asylum seekers as well as participant-observation to provide texture and to complicate the official and media-based asylum narrative. Chapter 3 discusses the direct provision (asylum seekers were provided with room and board and a meager stipend, usually in an institutional setting) and dispersal (geographically placed throughout Ireland) system in place for managing (controlling) asylum seekers. She analyzes these settings and the legal-institutional structures that govern them for the inherent power dynamics—and the limits of that power—contained within. Chapter 4 delves into some fascinating and Irish-specific dimensions of migration by focusing on the “unborn.” The unborn are implicated in Catholic Ireland in numerous ways—from Irish restrictions over time on international migration for abortions to the rights of the unborn in pending deportation cases to the right of the state to inquire into a woman’s reproductive status and adjudicate their migration accordingly. Chapter 5 describes and analyzes the national referendum of 2004 in which automatic birthright citizenship to non-Irish parents was rescinded. Chapter 6 more explicitly broadens out the scope of this book by noting that the “panics” over “illegal migration” were, indeed, a manifestation of national

anxieties over other sets of issues, although this latter point is not fully unpacked. In this chapter, the author gives brief attention, as well, to heterosexual marriage migration, same-sex couples’ migration, sex work, and domestic workers. The conclusion does a nice job of pulling these many strands together and devotes attention to areas for future research.

The strength of this book lies in its innovative theoretical framing and the weaving together of seemingly disparate phenomena over time and space. The stated focus on a specific temporal-spatial moment seems confining, given the ambitions of this book. For those familiar with the case of the 2004 referendum, while clearly and accurately presented, there is little new empirical data here. That said, given the dominance of media, NGO, and government narratives on this chapter in the unfolding history of Ireland, however, “every little helps.”

I had the curious experience of reading this book while the Irish were casting their votes in a national referendum that resulted in the legalization of same-sex marriage by popular vote. It’s unclear what, if any, impact these two national referenda, nearly a decade apart, had on one another, but Luibhéid has put the relationship between Ireland, sexualities, and the state squarely in our crosshairs.

## The Government of Mistrust: Illegibility and Bureaucratic Power in Socialist Vietnam by Ken MacLean

Madison: The University of Wisconsin Press, 2013. 300 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12414

**Christopher Goscha**

*Université du Québec à Montréal*

Much has been written about communist Vietnam, and the war in particular, but surprisingly little has been written about the making of the socialist state and how power percolates through it to this day. In *The Government of Mistrust*, Ken MacLean makes a highly original contribution to the study of the Vietnamese state by taking us on a fascinating journey into the competition between the party leadership and its high-level bureaucrats determined to build a centralized communist state, on the one hand, and local officials and farmers equally intent on blunting that very effort to defend their own interests and ensure their well-being, on the other hand. By closely examining this interplay between bureaucratic efforts to guide major socioeconomic change and local efforts to survive it, MacLean shows that the post-colonial socialist state was much less successful in building a top-down, centralized state than we have been led to believe. Mistrust, in fact, is one of the most important and surprising products of this bureaucratic struggle to change

Vietnamese society. Mistrust between local and central authorities, between state and society, and among the lower ranks is an essential part of understanding the making of “socialist Vietnam.”

At the heart of MacLean’s argument is a sustained analysis of how, despite central efforts to impose rational control over rural Vietnam through better “documentation” and knowledge-producing “devices,” the leadership actually ended up increasingly in the dark about what was going on in the countryside. The “legible” became “illegible” is how MacLean puts it. To make his point, the author focuses on a number of “devices” designed to provide better documentation of and control over Vietnamese society. These included the following: statistics, audits, conventions, contracts, administrative templates, and so forth. Relying on an impressive array of archival and secondary sources in Vietnamese as well as extensive fieldwork and interviews, the author explores the conceptualization of these devices on high, examines their bureaucratic introduction, and then follows their evolution over time and space as the government’s officials sought to “guide” major socioeconomic projects in the countryside such as collectivization. The author demonstrates convincingly how lower-level officials,

often working closely with local village representatives, devised counter strategies and tactics to protect them, their needs, and interests. This set in motion a spiral of actions and reactions, leading to ever more paperwork and devices, much of it badly divorced from any sort of objective reality. In the end, central attempts to impose modern legibility ended up rendering things very “illegible.” This paradox is at the core of this book, and this illegibility demonstrates that the articulation of bureaucratic power was hardly centralized under a powerful party-state. MacLean shows that these devices, in the end, created a great deal of mistrust as all sides tried to guess and second guess what the others were going to do.

MacLean divides his book into three periods to show how this “government of mistrust” evolved over time: (1) “The Pre-centralization of Documentation: Revolutionary Mobilization before Collectivization,” moving rapidly from the 1920s to the 1950s; (2) “The Centralization of Documentation: Bureaucratic Professionalism following Collectivization,” spanning the period from the early 1960s to the mid-1980s; and (3) “The Para-Centralization of Documentation: Socialist Marketization after De-Collectivization,” covering the late 1980s to the present. Communist efforts to transform rural Vietnam via collectivization and decollectivization serve as the author’s two main case studies for fleshing out this interplay between the party-state based in Hanoi and local officials and farmers in the countryside. For each of the chapters figuring in these three periods, MacLean zooms in on a “device”—emulation campaigns, administrative templates, labor contracts, village conventions, and so on—to tease out how central efforts to render legible the exercise of power through collectivization and decollectivization often ended up making it illegible. I particularly enjoyed his discussion of “sneaky contracts” (ch. 4)—the efforts made by local officials and their peasant

constituencies to organize “unauthorized contracting experiments” of a market-driven kind in the 1960s and later to improve their well-being in the face of collectivization. Sometimes these local initiatives won the support of the central authorities; sometimes they did not. But MacLean clearly shows through this case study and others that power did not flow along one simple path toward the bottom nor was it a relationship built on trust. Indeed, these devices and the mistrust—and, indeed, falsifications—they created are excellent areas for understanding just how complex socialist Vietnam is. While MacLean does not engage directly with other scholarship on similar questions—consider, for example, Benedict Kerkvliet’s *The Power of Everyday Politics: How Vietnamese Peasants Transformed National Policy* (2005) or James Scott’s *Moral Economy of the Peasant: Rebellion and Subsistence in Southeast Asia* (1977)—he convincingly shows, to play off the title of another Scott publication (1999), the state did not always “see” that well because, as this book shows nicely, the implementation of the very transformative policies it advocated ended up blinding it to the dangerous impact of those policies on the very people it sought to help. The result has been the creation of a “government of mistrust” in Vietnam.

## REFERENCES CITED

- Kerkvliet, Benedict J.  
2005 *The Power of Everyday Politics: How Vietnamese Peasants Transformed National Policy*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Scott, James C.  
1977 *The Moral Economy of the Peasant: Rebellion and Subsistence in Southeast Asia*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- 1999 *Seeing Like a State: How Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

# The Survival of People and Languages: Schooners, Goats and Cassava in St. Barthélemy, French West Indies by Julianne Maher

Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill, 2013. 240 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12415

Gladys Saunders  
University of Virginia

This book tells a captivating story, a human story of people and languages and their unlikely survival. It is a story of amazing courage and resilience, of adversity and hardship. More precisely, it is the story of a small, relatively isolated com-

munity, descendants of the founding population of French settlers living on the tiny island of St. Barthélemy (now St. Barth), who came to speak four separate languages and the quest to understand why the survivors maintained their linguistic boundaries for 250 years. The raconteur of this astonishing account is linguist Julianne Maher, expertly equipped for the ambitious sociolinguistics project she has taken on.

While the majority of other sociolinguistic or linguistic studies dealing with the Caribbean focus their accounts on

slavery and the interaction of African and European populations in the plantation environment, this study, in contrast, focuses specifically on the European settlement. The real protagonists of Maher's book are the poor whites—the *engagés* (indentured servants) and their survivors. However, it is not the author's intent to minimize in any way those other accounts; rather, she has chosen to tell a different story of equal hardship. A study of this destitute population, she maintains, enhances our understanding of the social history of the colonization of the "New World."

In her exploration of St. Barth's unusual linguistic situation—why are there so many languages on such a small island—Maher realizes that an understanding of the island's history and its geography are crucial to explaining the island's linguistic diversity. Accordingly, her volume offers a myriad of historical and geographical information, beginning with the very first chapter, "Origins."

It should not be surprising, given its title, that most of the book is written with the general reader in mind and requires no specialized knowledge. The one notable exception is chapter 4, which presents a close examination and linguistic analysis of the languages of St. Barth. Another strong point of the book is its interdisciplinary quality: scholars working in a wide variety of fields, including history, anthropology, ecology, sociology, Caribbean studies, feminist studies, as well as linguistics and French studies, to name a few, will recognize implications of this work for their fields.

Today, St. Barth is recognized as a celebrity sanctuary—the most glamorous and luxurious vacation spot in the Caribbean, attests the author—but this was not the case up until the late 20th century. The conflicted history and complicated linguistic environment (chapter 2: "History's 'Shuttlecock'") written about in this book are not likely to be known to the wealthy tourists who flock to the island today.

As there were no records authenticating the persistence of distinct language varieties over centuries in St. Barth and no collective memory to explain them, Maher had to reconstruct the social ecology that produced them (ch. 3). The array of resources used to arrive at her explanation include

descriptions of the early French colonies, Swedish narratives, current evidence of settlement patterns, narratives of women's lives, the history of education, property ownership, emigration patterns, martial records, anthropological data, and many other factors.

The four separate languages spoken on the island—namely, English of Gustavia (center-west), the French Patois of Sous le Vent (western part of the island), the French Creole of Au Vent (in the east), and the French variety of Saline French (center-east)—are examined and analyzed in detail in chapter 4. For this part of her study, Maher relies on a corpus of native speaker interviews (more than 70 were conducted by the author). Samples from the recorded interviews are given in Appendix 2. In the same chapter, she also looks at other nonstandard French varieties with comparable linguistic histories, such as *le jèrriais* in the Channel Islands and Louisiana Cajun French, to contextualize the patterns of St. Barth patois and help determine whether the four St. Barth varieties are actually distinct from each other. Her analyses of the linguistic data are superb, and I find her comparative work compelling. In the end, she is able to ascertain that the four language varieties are quite distinct from each other and do not function as a continuum.

Maher concludes her captivating story, after a final chapter on language maintenance and language loss, by affirming that linguistic barriers were maintained on St. Barth for well over 200 years because of social factors such as poverty, economics, geography, and small population size. There were few unifying forces (such as education) on the island until late into the 20th century. It is surprising that language contact played such a minimal role in this story. St. Barth's linguistic complexity, suggests Maher (following the thinking of Edward Sapir), provides evidence that language preserves social history long after that history has been lost in the memory of its speakers. It is the persistence of the separate languages that captures the underlying social history of the island.

*The Survival of People and Languages* is an excellent model of rigorous sociolinguistic analysis and serves as living proof that sociolinguistic studies require extensive and detailed examination of the societies in question.

# O Mar É Que Manda: Comunidade e Percepção do Ambiente No Litoral Alentejano [The Sea Commands: Community and Environmental Perception on the Alentejano Coast] by Paulo Mendes

Lisbon: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, 2013. 251 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12416

L. Jen Shaffer

*University of Maryland, College Park*

Are social and cultural phenomena actually natural movements that are culturally perceived? What is the nature of the dialectical relationship between environment and identity, knowledge, and skills? How do we define community? The complicated processes and relationships captured by these questions have challenged ecological and environmental anthropologists in recent decades. Author Paulo Mendes's retrospective ethnography of an artisanal fishing community in southern Portugal explores these questions further, revealing in the process that some of the answers are as complex and deep as the sea itself.

To begin, Mendes introduces readers to Azenha do Mar, where he has conducted extensive fieldwork since the early 1990s, by recounting a night fishing trip he took with two local fishermen. During this expedition, the men used their local environmental knowledge to triangulate their position and locate a good catch in the dark of the night. Telling this story at the outset of the work hooks the reader while highlighting the relationships between fishermen, fishing, and the sea that Mendes intends to discuss. To tell the larger story, Mendes grounds his ethnographic analysis in Tim Ingold's (2000) dwelling perspective, which allows him to look back at his multiple field experiences in Azenha and reconsider observations, conversations, and events in a more holistic framework.

The book's six chapters chart a course to understand how the dialectical relationship between the sea and the fishermen structures social groupings within Azenha, community values and perceptions, and individual knowledge and skills. Chapter 1 introduces readers to Azenha do Mar and the in-migration of its population in the 1960s and 1970s. This investigation of historic forces, including social, political, and economic factors, that pushed people to settle and fish in this tiny coastal village provides context for a later comparison of local and tourist identities. Mendes returns to the literature in chapter 2 to position his ethnographic research at the intersection of maritime studies, identity and intentionality, and ecological anthropology. The next chapter returns to daily life in Azenha while assessing the relationship between fishing work, village life, and the sea. Chapter 4 takes an interesting

turn with a reflexive examination of the anthropologist's positionality, the process of participant-observation, and what can be learned from living within a study community. This description of methodology, the author posits, is relatively rare in Portuguese research—hence its inclusion. Interwoven with experiences of anthropology's wise elders, this discussion underscores the idea that participant-observation is a process, not a method, and echoes the concept of a dwelling perspective. The final chapters address identity, community, and knowledge more directly. The presence of long-term visitors and tourists since the 1980s has shaped local values regarding fishing work and land and sea patrimony. Mendes uses these interactions between locals and tourists as a point of departure to launch his final discussion in chapter 6 regarding the interactions between fishermen and between fishermen and the sea that link Azenha's social and natural worlds.

Scattered references to gendered activities throughout the text tease the reader and hint at possible influences and interactions affecting community that are never fully explored. Certainly Mendes makes the focus on Azenha's fishermen (*nota bene*: not fisherwomen) and how their knowledge and interaction with the sea help to structure community clear in initial chapters. He also recounts the difficulties of a male researcher asking women about their activities and knowledge and the paucity of women actually participating in fishing activities at sea. As a result, the thin discussion of women's participation in the fishery, their knowledge of the sea, and thus role in community structuring is not unexpected; however, it does remain unsatisfactory—especially given the dwelling perspective that Mendes uses to frame his analysis. Many interested readers may also be disappointed to discover that, at present, the book is only available in Portuguese.

The fishermen of Azenha do Mar sum up their relationship with the sea and their certainty of its impermanence with an expression that roughly translates as "the Sea is in charge/the Sea commands." They recognize the sea's dominant role in regulating and enabling their livelihood practice, as well as the knowledge and competency they develop on the job to respond to constantly changing conditions. This ethnographic retrospective of Azenha's fishing community unpacks the expression further to expose deeper meanings of identity that tie the social and natural together and that acknowledge the multitude of connections existing between fishermen, their daily work, and the sea. In arguing for an expanded notion of community, we see how the

seasonal rhythms engaging Azenha's fishermen with the sea give meaning and value to the human community, as well as the sea itself, in a process that negates the natural-cultural dichotomy.

## REFERENCE CITED

Ingold, Tim

2000 *The Perception of the Environment: Essays in Livelihood, Dwelling, and Skill*. London: Routledge.

# The Spectacle of the Late Maya Court: Reflections on the Murals of Bonampak by Mary Miller and Claudia Brittenham, eds.

Austin: University of Texas Press, 2013. 288 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12417

**Dorie Reents-Budet**

*Museum of Fine Arts Boston*

*The Spectacle of the Late Maya Court: Reflections on the Murals of Bonampak*, edited by principle authors Mary Miller and Claudia Brittenham, stands out for its exhaustive documentation and analysis of the famous Structure 1 murals at Bonampak, Mexico. The book is an excellent case study for anthropologists, archaeologists, and historians from the viewpoint of art history. It presents the full range of reconstruction paintings by Heather Hurst and Leonard Ashby and the diverse photographic endeavors during the 70 years since discovery, especially by the Bonampak Documentation Project. The photographic and graphic illustrations, presented in high-quality printing, alone make this an invaluable resource, while the five chapters confirm the value of art historical methods to the study of Maya material culture, history, and social process.

The Preface and chapter 1 summarize the murals' history of discovery and investigation. Chapter 2 describes the artistic processes of composition and execution, including painting-on-stucco techniques, preparations of the stucco surface, and paint composition and manners of application to achieve myriad colors and effects. The authors discuss the primacy of the painted line, the grid basis of Maya pictorial composition, the conventions of implying three dimensions on two-dimensional surfaces, portrayals of the fourth dimension (time), and conventions of human figural representations. Comparisons with other media, including stone monuments, bark paper books, and textiles, place the murals in a larger tradition while highlighting their innovations. Miller and Brittenham propose an overarching format based on the assemblage of compositional units in groups of three, exploring the artists' skillful adaptation of such pictorial conventions to the narrative complexities of a multifaceted visual format.

The second half of the chapter describes how the murals physically relate to Structure 1 and each room's interior space and assesses the nature of human interaction with the rooms and their respective murals. Here the artists fully displayed their mastery of Classic period pictorial conventions and architectural narrative as an encapsulation of the universe and the place of the Bonampak royal court therein.

Chapter 3 explores how text and image work together and independently as a tableau of separate vignettes. The chapter posits that the murals were not intended to be read as linear text but, instead, to be experienced in the three-dimensional space of human action. It is the viewer, sitting in the room and enveloped by the paintings, who gives substance and meaning to the portrayed individuals and events. The hieroglyphic texts, containing mostly titles and personal names rather than commentaries on the rendered activities, are discussed for a hieroglyphically literate audience. The data proffer a bountiful record of the innumerable actors in the royal court, and the authors take a fresh look at the personal identities and historicity of the murals. Miller and Brittenham now interpret the murals as evidence of power struggles after the death of Yajaw Chan Muwaan and the next king's accession under the auspices of Yaxchilán's ruler Shield Jaguar IV.

Chapter 4 undertakes a detailed analysis of the narratives embedded in text and image. The authors underscore their conclusion that the murals do not comprise personal biography, as do most royal Maya portrayals, but instead encompass a series of accounts with puzzling reading orders that encourage alternative readings. The authors highlight the scant correspondences between text and image as a device supporting the narrative's polyvalence. The scrutiny of each room's murals, employing analytical methods of art history, epigraphy, history, and semiotics, yields new insights into the meanings of these paintings.

The last chapter situates the murals in the broader Late Classic sociopolitical and economic landscape



before the collapse of Petén Maya civilization. The chapter compares the murals' pictorial program to other populated images on stone monuments and painted pottery, revealing the rich and varied approaches to complex narrative and the subliminal meanings encoded in Classic Maya art. The chapter ends with a new synopsis of Bonampak's political history and the place of the murals therein.

The book concludes with a catalog of photographic images that comprises a highly valuable resource. Color and infrared images are presented side by side—pictorial images

first, followed by a separate section for the captions. The reproduction quality is sufficient to permit magnification without compromising too much detail.

The bibliography is one of the most comprehensive listings for publications on Bonampak with a focus on the murals and the artistry of Maya material culture. It includes references to the archaeology of the Lacanjá area and the broader Classic Maya region. A few incorrect page references were noted, but this is a miniscule flaw in an otherwise outstanding study.

## Remembering Nayeche and the Gray Bull Engiro: African Storytellers of the Karamoja Plateau and the Plains of Turkana by Mustafa Kemal Mirzeler

Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2014. 392 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12418

Jan Jansen

*Universiteit Leiden*

Any scholar publishing in the field of oral tradition will tend to emphasize particular disciplinary perspectives. In his thorough study of Jie and Turkana oral traditions, Mustafa Mirzeler presents himself as an anthropologist, as researchers of oral tradition often do. Using classical methodological approaches such as participant-observation and apprenticeship, Mirzeler established close contacts with numerous storytellers and describes performances and stories with great eloquence and a keen eye for detail. Unfortunately, and probably because he was overwhelmed by the riches of what he heard, Mirzeler fails to consider the effect of his own position and its impact on the collected data.

Mirzeler discusses a wide range of story types, from foundation myths to tales about tricksters, but most prominent are those about a journey through the landscape of a woman called Nayeche and the Grey Bull. The two figures represent Jie agropastoralists (who cultivate sorghum) and Turkana pastoralists. The journey of Nayeche and the Grey Bull describes how different people can live together on land with scarce resources, and by following the storytellers, Mirzeler convincingly demonstrates that the landscape can be a "place of memory [that] shapes and informs a wide range of social experiences laden with meanings" (p. 243). Mirzeler's description of the landscape (and the accompanying pictures) reminded me of the film *The Tree of Iron* (O'Neill and Muhly 1988), with Haya blacksmiths imagining the land as a fertile female body.

Though an impressive study of the technique and creativity of individual storytellers, I found that the stories themselves were insufficiently analyzed. Mirzeler's prede-

cessor in the 1950s, the anthropologist P.H. Gulliver, saw the Nayeche stories as supporting both segmentation and alliance (p. 7), and John Lamphear, a historian working in the 1970s, saw them as dealing with fragmentation. But for Mirzeler, they "provide moral discourses that encourage communities to see their vulnerable lives in a perceptively different light" (p. 243). Mirzeler's focus on the environment suggests a master narrative centered on ecological concerns, but even if he is right in that, Mirzeler should surely have wondered if such an emphasis on environmental concerns might have had something to do with his own presence. He should have wondered, too, if seeing such emphasis in the environment was rather a template for the master narrative of the present day than the master narrative of the original stories. That is, after all, a standard epistemological exercise for a 21st-century anthropologist.

I think it is because of his idea of an environmental meta-narrative that Mirzeler emphasizes the storytellers' great creativity. For instance, he mentions the wide range of adventures in Nayeche's journey and the many different contexts, but in stressing their inventiveness he pays too little attention to what the storytellers don't change. Specifically, the fact that the stories discuss essentially political issues—marriage, cattle theft, and land use—warrants a closer analysis of the structural aspects of these stories. As an example of what I mean, in most of the stories Mirzeler cites, Nayeche is a young woman, but one 75-year-old Turkana woman cited thinks of Nayeche as old (p. 279). Nayeche represents the first Jie to be married into the Turkana, so her age is a political statement, for a postmenopausal Nayeche is clearly unable to bear children, and the story therefore denies any sense of indebtedness to the Jie. Unfortunately, such classical readings based on critical textual analysis of original oral sources remain outside the scope of Mirzeler's analysis.

On reading the conclusion, this absence of systematic critical textual analysis becomes distinctly problematic. Mirzeler addresses his argument mainly against historians. Lamphear's reconstruction of the region's chronological history is indeed outdated, probably even incorrect, but that is not to say that oral traditions have no historical dimension at all. An oral tradition can easily contain political clues, something that Mirzeler has overlooked because of his own concern with ecology and his fascination with the storytellers' creativity. His remark that "local people do not recall information beyond three generations" (p. 7) can hardly be used to bolster his argument, because that is true everywhere—Mirzeler has apparently failed to consider that oral traditions often preserve evidence on political history within their narrative structures. I therefore found the tone and argument of Mirzeler's conclusion rather odd, coming after an ethnographic experience that he had reported with so much professional dedication and respect.

Finally, a note about rabbits. In Africa and beyond, the hare is well known as a trickster, an image undoubtedly derived from his habit of living socially in groups and sleeping in the open fields. But the hare is not a rabbit, who lives with his family, in his burrow. U.S. popular culture has confused, or shall we say "reimagined," the crafty hare as a rabbit—think of Br'er Rabbit, Bugs Bunny, even Roger Rabbit, more recently—probably because the two creatures look rather alike. In the end, though, for a European like me, I'm afraid it is rather too off-putting, even sometimes surreal, to read in Mirzeler's study so many stories about rabbits in Northern Uganda.

#### REFERENCE CITED

O'Neill, Peter, and Frank Muhly Jr., dirs., with Peter Schmidt  
1988 *The Tree of Iron*. 57 min. Centre of African Studies, University of Florida. Gainesville.

## The Joy of Noh: Embodied Learning and Discipline in Urban Japan by Katrina L. Moore

Albany: State University of New York Press, 2014. 140 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12419

**Shinko Kagaya**  
*Williams College*

Katrina Moore describes her ethnographic account of *noh* and its amateur practitioners as follows: "This book is a study of women's cultivation of self in later life within communities of learning in urban Japan" (p. 2). Her tightly composed monograph is based on fieldwork spanning eight years and draws from both English and Japanese sources. These include extensive interviews, experiential data, and Moore's own observations. By delving into the practice of regular lessons and recitals, Moore fostered insider ties with the Sumire Kai training center, a *noh* community led by a dynamic female master who was 78 years old at the time of Moore's first encounter. Her analysis regards cultural pursuits as "a tool for establishing social distinction and reproducing social inequality," after Pierre Bourdieu's 1984 *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste*. However, Moore expands her argument by demonstrating how such pursuits yield additional gains, such as "the quest for new social relations outside of the family network, the new desire of physical mastery," "the quest for growth in later life," and "the quest for *mushin*," a state free of self but in which all senses are aware of the present (pp. 103–104).

The concise chapters, all between 6 to 26 pages, offer deep and engaging insights that could only have been acquired

through the author's direct experience with and respect for the teacher and disciples of the Sumire Kai community and with the acceptance of the author into that community. "Introduction," besides offering a general outline of the book, provides background information on how lifelong learning has been promoted by the government and people of Japan from the postwar era to the present. The first chapter, "Amateur Noh Practitioners," gives a brief history of both professional and amateur women practitioners of *noh* and emphasizes the art form's postwar popularity. The second chapter, which is the longest, provides a detailed biography of the master of the Sumire Kai, her childhood, married life, and evolving relationship with *noh* training. The ensuing chapter explains a trainee's learning process. Here she addresses the ineffable, such as how a learner's corporeality matures through continued training, and also the practical, such as the rather high cost of monthly training fees and semiannual recitals. One disciple likened it to "a *mud swamp*" because it can be challenging to extricate oneself from the obligations one enters into as a disciple (p. 67). The fourth chapter, "Peeling Away of Identity," goes more deeply into the effects of *noh* training, emphasizing not only the formation but also the dissolution of identities, the revelation of a new expanded self, and the importance of such experiences in later life, both physically and mentally. The final chapter starts with a wonder-filled journey of a former physicist's "acceptance" of her present self, revealing that "acceptance is a central aspect of maturity" (p. 99).

As the cultivation of self in later life has relevance globally, this book's implications go far beyond Japan. Moore draws on relevant theoretical literature to situate her study from a broader perspective. At the same time, a Japanese audience in particular might greatly benefit from a translation of Moore's work, as it is closest to the world of noh, where the art form continues to thrive. Furthermore, with Japan's aging population, the sustenance of quality in later life is an issue of ever-increasing relevance.

Moore's work is concisely written and has broad implications. However, I would have liked clearer and more thorough data and analyses of the amateur practitioners of noh and the relevance and implications of these to both the larger picture of the noh world and the aging Japanese society. For example, the book closes with the following statement: "Given the future expansion in the number of senior citizens in Japan, there is ample room for this traditional performing art to be adopted as an art form that engenders health and well-being among older persons" (p. 107). Although the rapid increase of the elderly population is established fact, that does not necessarily allow for

an increase in the number of later-life amateur practitioners of noh, especially considering Japan's stagnant economy, expensive noh training fees, and the already declining number of noh professional and amateur practitioners. Further, Moore writes, "In 2011, 17.4 percent of Japanese over sixty were engaged in learning activities (Cabinet Office, Government of Japan 2012, 42)" (p. 3). Among these, even roughly, what was the percentage of noh practitioners? Of that, what percentage was women? Inclusion of such details might have been helpful. Lastly, I wonder if the following attribute is peculiar to the Japanese traditional performing arts: "One is considered to acquire a particular skill and transform the body through this acquisition at the same time" (p. 23). Nonetheless, *The Joy of Noh* offers a valuable contribution, particularly to the fields of Japanese studies, anthropology, sociology, gerontology, and performance studies.

#### REFERENCE CITED

Bourdieu, Pierre

1984 *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste*.  
Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

## Unmanageable Care: An Ethnography of Health Care Privatization in Puerto Rico by Jessica M. Mulligan

New York: New York University Press, 2014. 320 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12421

Alexa S. Dietrich  
Wagner College

Although its modest subtitle declares it *An Ethnography of Health Care Privatization in Puerto Rico*, Jessica Mulligan's *Unmanageable Care* provides an object lesson in the ethnography of institutions and the challenges of ethical research. As a well-versed scholar of the island, in addition to being an insurance industry insider, Mulligan's work is rich in historical and contextual data. However, like the best studies of Puerto Rico, her book has implications that radiate far from its tropical shores.

Mulligan's text is an inherently critical one, deftly weaving throughout the analysis vignettes of the failure of privatization to meet the needs of everyday people. However, one of its great strengths is that it was not initially conceptualized as a critical, theory-driven study in search of ethnographic support. As an employee in the pseudonymous "Acme," one of several private insurance companies tasked with managing Medicare services in Puerto Rico, what started out as a job to support her time in the field eventually became the focus of her research. The access afforded her was unparalleled in terms of ethnographic data while at the same time

rife with potential issues in the ethical considerations of human subjects. Mulligan describes her approach to research in the Introduction, providing a detailed appendix that directly addresses her negotiation of her position as an ethical researcher and employee. This will be of significant value as required reading for neophyte fieldworkers.

Her analysis of the problems of marketized health care traces the cultural transition from health care as a right, conceptualized by President Lyndon Johnson's Great Society policies. The shift toward managed care was precipitated by the emergence of a perspective within U.S. policy circles that increasingly moved away from collective responsibility toward personal "choices" and discourses on deservedness of beneficiaries. From her post within Acme, Mulligan was in a unique position to observe how the privatization of insurance and patients' needs collide within the "contact zone" (pp. 24–26) of her Compliance Department. Her utilization of the "contact zone" as a framing device—a place where problems come but are not necessarily solved—is a significant contribution to the ethnography of health care, in particular the emerging ethnography of insurance.

The book is divided into two parts: Part I (chs. 1–3) describes the structure of privatized insurance administration; Part II (chs. 4–6) demonstrates the impact of the system. Beginning with the history of colonialism's effect on health,

Mulligan takes on the tricky task of explaining the process through which Puerto Rico began trying to deliver health care for all: La Reforma. The program, grounded in neoliberal perspectives, presumed that private companies would de facto be more efficient and innovative. Health reform also became a symbol of the island's future, as it was tied to pro-statehood politics. The inherent conflicts between all these interests had unintended negative consequences for care delivery; for example, the privatization of public hospitals caused a drastic reduction in the number of interns and residents being trained and delivering care in those hospitals.

Chapter 2 explores the impact of profit-motivated ideologies on the management of the insurance companies, mainly through the eyes of Acme employees. As popular management discourses filtered through company hierarchies and profit potentials rose, employees were viewed as expendable, similar to Fordist factory (and Caribbean "factory in the field") production models. Mulligan suggests that because the system was made (through, e.g., legislation), it can therefore be unmade. However, it is unclear whether the necessary incentives are present. Chapter 3 illustrates the effect these systems have on patients' experiences.

Part II of *Unmanageable Care* furthers the critique of corporatized healthcare, focusing on the prominence of quanti-

tative analysis (ch. 4), the processing of complaints (ch. 5), and barriers to the use of market solutions for healthcare (ch. 6). With careful attention to recent works in the critical anthropology of healthcare, Mulligan uses her data to interrogate the practice of measuring quality and to challenge whether these measurements result in improved quality of care. She also applies a nuanced analytic touch to concerns that insurance employees are incentivized to deny claims or neglect complaints. Mulligan's study demonstrates that, for the most part, there is a mismatch between the system and people's needs, as "the maze of categories, definitions, and timeframes" prevents effective resolution of patient problems (p. 164).

Mulligan does an excellent job of, as she puts it, "tak[ing] seriously" the potential of market-based solutions to reducing healthcare costs, as they are "the only item on the menu" for most policymakers (p. 207). Here again, a case study of Puerto Rico offers lessons for health insurance systems worldwide, showcasing how market solutions often fail in the context of communities with complex social, economic, and health-related needs. While methodologically appealing to anthropologists, this book also has broader implications for those seeking healthcare solutions for disadvantaged populations in resource-constrained settings.

## Lessons from Fort Apache: Beyond Language Endangerment and Maintenance by M. Eleanor Nevins

Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013. 280 pp

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12420

Pamela Innes

University of Wyoming

In *Lessons from Fort Apache*, Eleanor Nevins sets out to contribute "a precedent and a set of interpretive tools that facilitate recognition of differences in orientation between the ostensibly cooperative, but sometimes clashing, parties to 'saving' a language" (p. 3). From several years' experience assisting language programs run by the White Mountain Apache, including a three-year stretch of intensive ethnographic fieldwork, she illustrates where and how differences in orientation can occur. The examples presented show there is good reason for linguists to be aware of alternative orientations to language endangerment, but the author does not always remain focused on language revitalization efforts.

The first two chapters introduce readers to the political, linguistic, and social environment of the Fort Apache Reservation. Nevins then compares expectations and ideological foundations that she has identified among its residents with those held by academic linguists. She contends that

while linguists and residents of Fort Apache use the same vocabulary when speaking of the language as endangered, the semantic content of the terms differs between the two groups. She demonstrates how the use of endangerment and preservation rhetoric preserves and maintains power imbalances between linguists and the Native communities whose languages they are documenting and revitalizing.

Nevins moves on to show why a tribally directed language program developing interactive computer materials intended to be made available to the reservation's schools was canceled. She attributes cancellation in part to concern about the change from interactional teaching strategies to computer-based methods. She relates this to community apprehension about the diminution of family-based teaching of language and interactional standards. While her arguments are persuasive, she never speaks to the fact that the program with which she was affiliated appeared to involve a very select few of the teachers who had developed language programs in the many schools on the reservation. One is left to wonder whether greater communication and cooperation with several families and schools might have altered the outcome, but this is never addressed.

Chapter 4 presents an article published in 2008, analyzing how references taken primarily from popular media and branded products become names for new neighborhoods in a manner consistent with place-naming conventions described by Keith Basso (1992, 1996). Nevins shows that this practice masks the distance between the Apache and their neighbors because the seemingly shared names are understood and interpreted very differently by the two communities. Exactly how this relates to issues of language endangerment remains unexplained. Certainly, linguists may miss transfers of practice like this, but, because this involves manipulation of English forms, one wonders what a person concerned about Apache language maintenance is supposed to conclude from the inclusion of this chapter.

Nevins then introduces readers to Apache orthographic and rhetorical strategies she identifies as means of validating Apache culture. The orthographic system developed by Silas John is presented as a means of presenting the validity and power of his religious visions on a level equal to that occupied by Christian teachings. Speakers use the rhetorical features discussed in the second section of the chapter to present positive evaluative stances toward Apache culture that counter less positive stance positions in preceding narrative. Again, while Nevins makes a convincing argument for finding these to signal resistance to the roles and characterizations often applied to the Apache, their applicability for linguists working to help maintain the language is not made clear.

Nevins returns to her stated goal in the next two chapters, focusing again on topics directly applicable to language programs: reasons why religious content (ch. 7)

and certain genres of stories (ch. 6) may not be deemed appropriate for inclusion in school-based programs. In both chapters, she demonstrates that excluding this content from school programs reinforces the community's ideology about the power of both realms. Respecting community desires to keep these elements out of language pedagogy symbolizes an understanding that these are potent areas of knowledge.

The concluding chapter would have been a perfect place to offer readers some ideas of how Nevins would have modified the programs with which she was involved so as to better serve the community, demonstrate respect for intergenerational means of teaching, and, perhaps, mitigate criticism from the Fort Apache population. Instead, readers are left with the observations that linguists should attend to community concerns, should consider both oblique and direct critiques of programs as indicating areas for improvement, and should allow that perspectives on what it means to call a language "endangered" may differ. All are worthwhile suggestions, but reflections on how she thinks the situation at Fort Apache may have been altered if she had applied these ideas would have made this a more satisfying and helpful book.

#### REFERENCES CITED

- Basso, Keith  
1992 *Western Apache Language and Culture: Essays in Linguistic Anthropology*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press.
- Basso, Keith  
1996 *Wisdom Sits in Places: Language and Landscape among the Western Apache*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.

## Japanoise: Music at the Edge of Circulation by David Novak

Durham: Duke University Press, 2013. 304 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12422

Jennifer Milioto Matsue  
*Union College*

David Novak, in *Japanoise: Music at the Edge of Circulation*, argues that Noise is neither a scene nor a genre but, rather, exists through circulation. Based on ethnographic research from 1998 to 2008 in Tokyo, Osaka, and Kyoto, as well as numerous locations in North America, Novak employs the term *Japanoise* to refer to the broad style that is generally understood as originating in Japan yet not assigned to a specific locality. Circulation becomes the theoretical center for the book, with the idea of "feedback" encapsulating the ways in which Noise results from constant looping back on itself and, in doing so, comments on the modern society in which it is produced—particularly regarding our complicated relationship with technology. As such, Novak's ethnographic work

spirals "into the particular sounds, sensations, and things of Noise and spins back to its scenic networks and stories. If not ethnography 'on the ground,' then, this is ethnography 'in the circuit,' following Noise through the overlapping, repetitive channels of its social and sonic feedback" (p. 27).

Novak explores the various circuits that create Noise within several themes and the work of specific "Noisicians," including the Incapacitants, Hijokaidan, and Merzbow. Though he relies on the details of performers to illustrate his arguments, he primarily navigated Noise through recordings and the shops that sell them rather than these individuals or physical sites in which they perform. Japan thus remains an important locus for global fans, but most find their way to Noise through records, which are expensive and hard to find, increasing their allure. Recordings, however, risk falsely canonizing Noise, a concern for some Noisicians (p. 89).



Nevertheless, listening to recordings in public establishments, such as jazz cafés (*jazu kissaten*), became a crucial performative act, particularly following World War II. These listening establishments fostered a “hyperactive” listening experience, especially expanding urban Japanese’s knowledge of foreign forms. Listening to recordings in fact became so popular that in some cases doing so replaced live experiences. The tradition of listening to underground recorded music continued with more experimental creativity in the 1970s, with clientele at one such location, Drugstore in Kyoto, exploring the production of sounds that ultimately solidified into Noise. Novak notes, however, that “before becoming a description for a specific genre, ‘Noise’ was a general assignation for any off-the-map sounds; weird records, so extreme-sounding that they escaped generic categories of music” (p. 108).

Novak here positions Noise actually as “antigenic,” arguing it “was named as a genre, so it must be categorizable through some common musical characteristics. But the sounds and performances that fell under the umbrella of Noise were too inconsistent to be characterized with quick-and-dry summaries of sound aesthetics, audiences, or regional histories” (p. 117). Noise thus stylistically avoids categorization as genre, but by being circulated through recordings it became “recognized as a meaningful form of music in itself” (p. 120). Therefore an artist’s work may be understood as Noise even if not intended—and even if the performer resists this very label.

Novak next returns explicitly to the idea of feedback, first through the actual equipment of Noisicians, who employ guitar pedals, distortion, and feedback loops, and second with broader social implications. He relates Noise to experimentation in art music, likening it in some ways to John Cage’s indeterminacy. But Novak further clarifies

that “noise’s feedback instead represents a transformative personal struggle, in which the performer’s intentions are subverted by an out-of-control relationship with an electronic system” (p. 156). In addition, Noise’s appeal lies in part in the “out-of-controlness” embodied in its sound production. Noisicians often use broken equipment, or “circuit bend” factory-produced equipment, or instruments can be made from scrap by manipulating the circuits. “But these junk electronics are more than just an adaptation of technology: they demonstrate how original sound-making contexts are created by feeding back the circuits of consumer gear” (p. 165). Noisicians, for example, “prevent themselves from learning to ‘play’ feedback, to reveal the outcome of human confrontation with an uncontrollable technological environment” (p. 167). In this way, for Novak,

noisicians grind the gears of the machine, spitting out unresolved difference in their creative reinventions of musical history and out-of-control embodiments of technology. They weave consumer electronics into a positive loop of aesthetic connections between human and machine. But this feedback must go on, repeating and building, until the whole thing collapses on itself. [p. 168]

For Novak, Japanoise is actually a critique of Japan’s identification as a technoculture, which made sense in Japan of the 1990s as people became disillusioned, individually oriented, and skeptical of technology (p. 189). “As electronic goods increasingly came to symbolize Japan’s economic power, Japanoise made an art out of destroying electronic gear on stage” (p. 173). Indeed, “Noise’s aesthetic mechanisms—its obsolete analog junk, its sounds of malfunction, its performance of automatism and mechanical breakdown—are all attempts to mark the pain and struggle of remaining human in the midst of a dangerous technological world” (p. 197).

## Being German, Becoming Muslim: Race, Religion, and Conversion in the New Europe by Esra Özyürek

Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2014. 192 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12423

Lucia Volk

San Francisco State University

In 136 brisk pages of text, Esra Özyürek introduces her readers to German converts to Islam, a group that has received little attention in debates about Islam in Europe. Estimates of the number of German converts range from tens of thousands to one hundred thousand out of an estimated four million Muslims in Germany; they are a minority within a minority. Stipulating that the German Enlightenment posits a “natural” and “rational” tendency of human beings to embrace the idea

of God and act morally (p. 31) and condemning Turkish and Arab patriarchal practices as “detrimental accretions” (p. 36), German converts claim to be both better Germans and better Muslims.

During repeated fieldwork visits in Germany between 2006 and 2013, Özyürek interviewed 66 converts and 14 native-born Muslims at a variety of Islamic organizations, mosques, language classes, lectures, and picnics in cosmopolitan, multicultural, politically left-leaning Berlin. As a native Turkish citizen and self-identified “cultural Muslim,” the author felt scrutinized by German converts who disparaged Turkish immigrants for their lack of “systematic knowledge” of Islam (pp. 61–65).

The Muslim community in Germany is relatively young—half of them were born after the 1990s—due to the higher-than-average birth rates among immigrants (p. 16). According to Özyürek, “conversion to Islam is almost always a result of a meaningful relationship between a Muslim and a non-Muslim” (p. 22). In particular, young German women convert to Islam after they fall in love with Muslim men, and, increasingly, young men “convert to Islam through contact with native-born Muslim friends with whom they drink, smoke marijuana, and enjoy graffiti and hip hop” (p. 21). The important connections between (sexual) desire, intimacy, and conversion unfortunately remain outside the author’s analysis, which draws mainly on Fatima El-Tayeb’s “ethnic queering” and W. E. B. DuBois’s “double-consciousness” (pp. 6–7). With the help of the agency-driven idea of “ethnic queering,” Özyürek demonstrates that German Muslims’ “multipositional alternative communities” challenge established sociocultural, ethnic, and religious boundaries. With the structure-driven concept of “double-consciousness,” we come to understand that German Muslims see themselves through the critical eyes of both mainstream Germans and immigrant Muslims.

Germans interested in Islam face first and foremost a language barrier, because the majority of mosques in Germany employ imams who conduct their sermons in Turkish or Arabic. A German woman interested in Islam may also be discouraged from attending lectures at mosques by traditional imams, who recommend she stay at home and be “nice to her husband” (p. 44). Both are cultural barriers, which help explain the efforts to create a German Muslim space. Examples include Deutschsprachiger Muslimkreis (DMK, German-speaking Muslim Circle), where women outnumber men on the board; the Moroccan Murabitun-inspired Weimar Community of Potsdam, whose members, at first sight, “look like hippies” (p. 55); Muslimische Jugend Deutschlands (MJD, Muslim Youth of Germany), a group made up of second-generation immigrants or children of mixed marriages who gather in an ethnically inclusive German-speaking environment and whose members meet with Christian and Jewish youths to debate their faiths. In

these predominantly educated, middle-class circles founded in the early 1990s, Özyürek witnessed dismissive criticism of Turkish migrant Muslims’ linguistic ghettos and impure, culture-crusted practice.

The critique of native-born Muslims continues among German Salafi Muslims, who purportedly draw their membership from less educated and more marginal members of society. Salafis promote a return to Islam’s original texts, free of subsequent, allegedly misleading interpretations. At the Al-Nur Mosque in Berlin, Özyürek regularly witnessed public conversions of young men and women after Sunday sermons; one was even taped by a CNN television crew. Public conversions were also posted to YouTube by the prominent German convert and Salafi preacher Peter Vogel (Abu Hamza), who spoke at the Al-Nur congregation after his return from training in Saudi Arabia. Özyürek later states that many German converts find their way to Salafism after their conversion. Trying to build a new Muslim identity, they turn to Salafism with its clear rules and certain answers. Older converts eventually move to a “more flexible” view of Islam (p. 118). From this perspective, Salafism becomes a kind of a training wheel that helps people learn to ride their new bicycle. This is certainly not the Salafism we read about in the news in the context of European youths joining the ranks of ISIS fighters in Iraq and Syria.

The most significant contribution of Özyürek’s book is her detailed and empathetic depiction of individual German converts’ lives. In particular, her two East German case studies are compelling. No singular “German Islam” exists; instead, a wide array of beliefs and practices compete in the marketplace of religious ideas. Class matters, as does ethnicity, linguistic ability, age, and gender. “Many converts to Islam are not simply Germans but also have marginalized identities as such” (p. 8). The book is important for anyone who seeks to understand Islam from a transnational perspective, one that goes beyond easy European citizen–Muslim immigrant dichotomies. To what extent these documented conversions lead to socially transformative or concrete political consequences in German society remains to be fleshed out.

## Speculative Markets: Drug Circuits and Derivative Life in Nigeria by Kristin Peterson

Durham: Duke University Press, 2014. 256 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12424

**Neil Carrier**  
*University of Oxford*

While counterfeit and substandard pharmaceutical drugs have become a source of concern in many parts of the world,

Nigeria appears to have been especially affected. That country’s fight against such dangerous goods is a gripping story, with plenty of villains and heroes. Among the latter is Dora Akunyili, former head of the National Agency for Food and Drug Administration and Control (NAFDAC), feted for her campaigns against this trade in medicines that are often no better than placebos and sometimes downright poisonous.

However, there is a much-broader story behind their spread in Nigeria, one that relates the country's pharmaceutical industry and market to vast global shifts in manufacturing and trade practices, as well as to national economic decline in the wake of structural adjustment. It is this broader story that Kristin Peterson's important book reveals, showing how cheap and risky medicines in West Africa can tell a far-reaching story of global interconnectedness.

*Speculative Markets* is based on the author's many years of ethnographic research in Nigeria engaging with actors at varied levels of Nigerian pharmaceutical networks, from market traders to owners of import and manufacturing businesses, as well as with those who would regulate the industry. Peterson uses ethnographic encounters deftly, weaving vignettes of her informants into more dense accounts of the processes at once local, national, regional, and global that affect their lives.

It is a book very much in the recent tradition of multisited and multidimensional ethnography, and it shows how all these processes reverberate in the lives of Nigerians. In particular, it describes how international pharmaceutical corporations were once integrated profitably into the Nigerian economy and helped develop local manufacturing and support professional pharmacists. However, global restructuring of the industry in the era of speculative buyouts and mergers led to divestment of these companies from Nigeria, as they sought more profitable markets elsewhere. Furthermore, as poverty bit hard in the wake of structural adjustment, fewer Nigerians could afford the brand-name medicines they had once consumed. As a consequence, the downward pressure on price saw quality diminish to ensure that profits would still be made. All this has dramatically skewed the Nigerian pharmaceutical trade away from serving the actual health needs of its population.

This is not the only global dimension to the story. Indeed, how the contemporary trade in pharmaceuticals connects to other global trades, including that of hard drugs and illicit flows of capital, adds yet more layers of complexity. Another such dimension is the outsourcing of manufacturing

medicines to India and China and their rise as key suppliers of the world's medicines. In this regard, the book offers more examples of the influence those two countries are having on Africa. Indeed, not only are they helping clothe Africans through the textile trade (which, of course, also has its fair share of counterfeit goods), they are helping cure them. However, with the lax regulatory capacity of Nigeria, it is all too obvious that counterfeit medicines are far more risky than counterfeit Giorgio Armani suits and the like.

While excellent in drawing out these global dimensions, the book is especially good in evoking Idumota, the Lagos market where many Igbo traders and others sell at both retail and wholesale the cheap pharmaceuticals. From this market, many other parts of the country are supplied through more or less informal networks. While in the past a relatively simple structure of pharmaceutical companies and pharmacists dealt with the country's needs, now thousands of small-scale traders take their place, attempting to navigate the uncertainties of the market's legal status as well as to speculate on the uncertainties of price to hustle for themselves some profit. This is the "derivative life" of the book's title. Peterson also evokes well the real threats these medicines can bring with a number of case studies of the consumption end (though I'd have liked more on the consumers and how they navigate through the uncertainties and ambiguities of this market).

The book is not the easiest to follow as the reader is led through almost as dizzying a set of pathways as the pharmaceuticals themselves. While more could perhaps have been done to ease the reader's path, we should indeed be dizzy in the face of the complexities and uncertainties of our contemporary world. In this regard, Peterson's work highlights how a multidimensional problem like fake drugs in Nigeria is unlikely to be tackled with single dimension measures aimed at the smugglers. Instead, tackling such a problem requires addressing what Jean and John Comaroff termed the "awkward scale," wherein the local meets the transnational and the global. *Speculative Markets* does a great service by clearing much of the necessary terrain.

## Historically Black: Imagining Community in a Black Historic District by Mieka Brand Polanco

New York: New York University Press, 2014. 208 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12425

**Karla Slocum**

*University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill*

How are narratives of history developed and contested? What are the social and spatial parameters of places conventionally designated as "black communities"? Typically,

these questions are addressed in separate bodies of literature, but in *Historically Black: Imagining Community in a Black Historic District*, Mieka Brand Polanco brings them together. Polanco's engaging ethnographic study focuses on a central Virginia town that she calls "Union" and that, in 1999, was placed on the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) as a "historically black community." Polanco is clear that the story of Union's racial history is up for debate. Of the

residential Union families who produce knowledge of Union's history, Polanco determines that they can be divided into three distinct groups whose differing accounts of Union's history provide a glimpse into "the interplay of history, race and space and whether they add up to community" (p. 40).

The book is laid out in five chapters with the core of her analysis in chapters 2 through 5 where she profiles three different groups of people and how they narrate Union's racial history. While the book's structure is intended to demonstrate distinctions in the narratives, it also usefully interrogates the relationship across the three groups. Chapter 2 centers on the group Polanco terms "history brokers," who are relatively recent white residents of Union. They authored the town's story in the NHRP nomination papers and were heavily invested in "gating Union" as a historically black town. Polanco analyzes the process they led as a rite of passage, shifting Union's status from a typical Central Virginian small suburb to a place of special racial and temporal designation. But, in the chapter that is perhaps the most compelling and engaging to read, there are other useful analytical issues as well—notably whiteness—that Polanco could have explored much further. She nicely lays out the intricate dynamics of how the history brokers carved out a privileged spot for themselves when defining Union for the public, rendering black voices as props but not participants in the process. However, she might have looked more in depth and pointedly at the issues of race and power associated with whites' roles in defining a "black town."

The construction of Union by "descendant residents," who Polanco identifies as longtime African American residents, is the focus of chapter 3. It provides a sharp contrast to the history told by the white history brokers. The contrast isn't as much about narrative content and form as it is about how the past is called upon. Indeed, Polanco says that she is most interested in "when and how is the past invoked" (pp. 83). She wants us to understand that descendant residents narrate Union informally, in present-day, quotidian conversations that divulge race-specific experiences from

the past. Descendant residents' invocations of the past lead to "dynamic narratives that are continually produced . . . patently conscious of their relationship to the present and that affirm a shared sense of community among the speakers" (p. 78).

Cartographic history telling is at the center of chapter 4, a richly textured discussion. Polanco focuses on the mapping of Union by a white octogenarian and former Union resident, Ernest Greene. Greene is essentially Polanco's stand-in for the group she calls "delegitimized historians"—whites who, like descendant residents and unlike the history brokers, do not have a voice in the official narrative of Union. Although the scope of analysis isn't extensive across this group, the analytical choice does not sacrifice a richly detailed exploration of the politics and organization of space and race in Union. Polanco explores Greene's map as an example of how the delegitimized historians deny Union's blackness while spatially and socially centering its white residents.

One of the real gifts of this book is its attention to how the politics of historical narratives of place takes shape. Readers learn that not only is the history of place debated but that the debate unfolds via different forms of narration, from everyday conversation to informal cartography to federal paperwork. In these processes, there are real distinctions in understandings of a history of a place, and those distinctions offer insights into race relations and inequalities. Polanco smartly shows that part of the key to grasping those distinctions requires looking at the diverse ways that the story of a place is told, who tells which story, in which form, and why.

The other main value of this work is its particular attention to race, space, and place in the context of small towns. While Union is not representative of all U.S. "black towns," the book is important for raising discussion of social and cultural issues associated with the intersection of the nonurban place and the black-identified "American" place. There are so few current works on small black-identified communities that Polanco's book is welcome reading for those of us who study such locales. The work is timely and should garner greater attention in anthropology.

## Border Work: Spatial Lives of the State in Rural Central Asia by Madeleine Reeves

Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2014. 312 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12426

**Russell Zanca**

*Northeastern Illinois University*

Since Western anthropologists began conducting fieldwork in the erstwhile Soviet Union from the early 1990s, most ethnography concentrated on well-worn topics, such as

farming, ethnicity, religion, and gender dynamics. Many of these contributions have been in article or chapter form and have been more descriptive than theoretical. Recently, this has begun to change as we opt to publish books and incorporate more theory into them (e.g., Finke 2014; Liu 2012; Rasanayagam 2012). Madeleine Reeves has broken new ground in this regard because her book examines a concept—"borders"—in ways that simultaneously appear

obvious and elusive, especially to the people who live near them, who man them, and who benefit and suffer from their oft-changing manifestations in space and time.

Before Soviet disintegration, borders mattered, although they did not play prominent roles in the lives of Central Asians, who moved relatively freely among neighboring republics after World War II. As scholars, many of us have been intrigued by but written spottily about what the imposition of national borders has meant to people who have been raised to understand ethnonational differences, though not to the degree that they would hinder or separate people in a cultural-geographic zone such as the Ferghana Valley, a place shared by three newly independent countries—Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan. For Reeves, the common experiences in trying to negotiate the peculiarities of border regimes—their establishments, impositions, refusals, corruption, and so on—became at once so overwhelming and novel that those experiences form the gist of a rich work of ethnography about borders as a concept and as a living reality. Reeves's notion of "border work" has multiple meanings: more than a narrative of making and enforcing boundaries, it colorfully details how people encounter borders, how they attempt to circumvent physical and mental obstacles that borders and their agents present, and also how people make borders advantageous through the very work of their lives, be it rearing livestock along borders, trading goods at border crossings, or even ferrying people across nonpoliced borders—a new form of employment.

In her introduction, Reeves emphasizes her concern with trying to explain how her "story" is all about the "messy, contested, and often intensely social business of making territory 'integral.'" She goes on to say that she hopes to contribute to a "global study of borders and bordering . . . of rural Central Asia" (p. 6). Through sophisticated and at times even recondite discussion of theoretical works about moving through space and what people supposedly experience as they transit through bounded polities (drawing on Massey and Moore, pp. 49–56), as well as in her comparative cases of border fixing and border contestations in places such as the Mexico–U.S. border and the border between Chad and Cameroon, Reeves provides profound insights into the contemporary predicaments that Central Asians face in trying to live and thrive in rapidly changing environments that are nationally unified in haste but internationally mobile and vital to material and social well-being.

The book's six chapters comprise conceptual models for subjects from "locations" to "separations." Each chapter's term enables Reeves to demonstrate how remarkably changeable and troublesome the modern history of the Fer-

ghana Valley has been in creating numerous contradictory outcomes in efforts to create coherence and stability.

While Reeves writes insightfully about the complicated efforts by Russian agents and their Soviet descendants to map and establish national territories, her most intelligent positions reflect considerations about the nonethnic character of interethnic conflicts. Therefore, while it may be easy to see a small, violent encounter between Kyrgyz and Tajiks over water as an example of interethnic antagonism, Reeves shows that old or even current ethnic antagonisms really are not at play in the violence itself. This reads queerly until one reads *Border Work*. Furthermore, the fifth chapter, partly entitled "Impersonations," furnishes the sort of fine-grained and stunning ethnographic cases that permit readers to understand how crucial border construction is to the nation-state while it literally alienates people from places and territories that they always considered as native.

*Border Work* reveals many of the author's previous concerns and projects that led her to write this book. Reeves interrogates the border idea based on her substantial survey research with Ferghana Valley people who sought work in Russia, especially in Moscow and St. Petersburg. This becomes germane to her project because Russia was once the caput mundi for the peripheral territories of the U.S.S.R. Today Russia is a foreign country. Still, Russia is not just any foreign country, and Reeves writes wonderfully and revealingly about migration as a uniquely problematic aspect of Eurasian globalization. Despite the racism and opportunities that exist in Russia for Central Asian migrants, Reeves poignantly captures what borders and bordering mean to people who are at once resourceful and desperate to improve their lives. She quotes a man by the name of Abduvali who had recently been deported from Russia to Kyrgyzstan: "You realize when they call you black (racist term—RZ), illegal, that the Soviet Union, it turns out really collapsed" (pp. 136–137).

## REFERENCES CITED

- Finke, Peter  
2014 Variations on Uzbek Identity: Strategic Choices, Cognitive Schemas and Political Constraints in Identification Processes. New York: Berghahn.
- Liu, Morgan  
2012 Under Solomon's Throne: Uzbek Visions of Renewal in Osh. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press.
- Rasanayagam, Johan  
2012 Islam in Post-Soviet Uzbekistan: The Morality of Experience. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.



# The Body in History: Europe from the Palaeolithic to the Future by John Robb and Oliver J. T. Harris, eds.

Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013. 287 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12427

**Kristina Killgrove**

*University of West Florida*

In an effort to cross disciplinary lines and create a comprehensive understanding of the human body from prehistory through the present, editors John Robb and Oliver Harris have brought together in *The Body in History* several essays on the social meaning of bodies. Weaving together archaeological evidence with contemporary social theory, they and their collaborators examine how the body itself is a valid historical question, situated within and constructed by a particular time and place. This focus on the historically contingent social body is novel and far reaching but also leaves little room for discussion of how the physical body is created through sociocultural interactions.

The first two chapters allow Harris and Robb to outline their concept of “body worlds” and to ease the reader into theoretical orientations that will be used in successive chapters. Anyone familiar with Gunther von Hagens’s “Body Worlds” exhibitions immediately brings to mind his posed, dissected bodies. While Harris and Robb seek to subvert the term, referring instead to “the totality of bodily experiences, practices and representations in a specific place and time” (p. 3), the original meaning is never far from one’s mind. Through historical and ethnographic examples, they build their “body worlds” with the scaffolding of theory without weighing the text down in citations. Diagrams explaining their multiscale historical analysis and a table summarizing the European historical characterization of the body act as landmarks to put all readers on the same map.

Six chapters comprise the core of the book, each starting with a vignette based on archaeological or historical data and each situated within a particular time frame. The chapters are organized chronologically, from early human foragers to contemporary European society. Between the Upper Paleolithic and the Neolithic (ch. 3), bodies seem to coalesce from a temporary body created by social and material relationships to bodies that display more permanent ties to a group. Another shift between 3500 and 1500 B.C.E. (ch. 4) spotlights a “relational personhood” (p. 82), which is explored through the transition in burial rites to cremation and through weapons and ornaments that serve to link the body with social identity and politics. Drawing on the idea of the body as a political landscape, chapter 5 details the

abundant research into ancient Greek society and uses classical sculpture in particular as a case study in how the body can be created and controlled as a political object. In chapter 6, the idea of control is taken a step further as theology is introduced as a practical way of creating medieval Christian bodies informed by various religious leaders’ interpretations of sacred tenets. The move to give states control over the body grows out of both religious proscriptions and a reemergence of the long-dormant research fields of anatomy and medicine (ch. 7). In this early modern period prior to the Industrial Revolution, the mind becomes synonymous with culture, and the body with nature. Bodies need to be policed, to be healed, to be corrected, to be legislated. The age of technology is currently creating our bodies (ch. 8). A mammogram can define a body as ill or as well; an ultrasound can create a boy or a girl from a fetus in utero; transplants, prostheses, and amputations can make a body “in/divisible.” This technology, as Harris, Robb, and Maryon McDonald emphasize in this chapter, is inherently social, the result of long-term historical processes. Our bodies may benefit from new technology, but the construction of those bodies is as socially dependent as it ever was.

Themes and examples within this volume are well chosen, and the chapters themselves constitute an interesting whole even as they can be read as individual, stand-alone essays. The work is heavily illustrated, with over 100 images and additional color plates. Many of the figures, however, are not well integrated into the text. A summary table in almost every chapter aids in orienting a reader without much background knowledge to the topic at hand, but this book is not for a general audience, as the terminology and theory sprinkled throughout require an expert to parse them. Finally, the lack of explanation of the socially constructed physical body is disappointing. For example, trepanation and tattooing are mentioned cursorily, repetitive skeletal stress injuries are only obliquely remarked on at the end of the book, and cranial vault modification is not referenced. Given the discussion of the production of modern physical bodies through sociomedical means, the omission of culturally created physical bodies through history is surprising.

As a survey of the changing conception of the human body in Europe, Robb and Harris’s edited volume is packed with disparate information and interpretations that dovetail into a loose historical narrative. This volume will be of interest to researchers specializing in the social construction of the human body.

# Mining Coal and Undermining Gender: Rhythms of Work and Family in the American West by Jessica Smith Rolston

New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2014. 236 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12428

Keri Brondo

University of Memphis

*Mining Coal and Undermining Gender* takes us inside Wyoming's Powder River Basin to explore the role of gender within the male-dominated working culture of coal mining. Daughter of a miner and former employee Jessica Rolston documents how miners work hard to decouple their understandings of gender and kinship within the workplace from dominant gender ideologies. Yet, however hard miners work to "undo" gender, difference persists in social arenas. As with all social constructs, gender is as much "undone" as it is practiced and performed, and Rolston's work both illuminates and deconstructs the force of binary gender ideologies.

After an orientation to labor relationships (part 1), part 2 of *Mining Coal and Undermining Gender* explores kinship at work and home. Here Rolston turns Micaela di Leonardo's notion of "kinwork" (i.e., the unacknowledged work women do in maintaining relationships with extended kin networks) on its head (p. 65). In some cases, practicing kinship is a type of labor, while in others laboring can be a way to practice kinship. Kin-like relationships grow out of the constraints of rotating shiftwork, which confines miners spatially and temporally. Kin ties, both real and fictive, enable miners to connect with others and dignify the workplace; they also serve as a coping mechanism against the stresses of mining labor.

The pulse of mining work minimizes gender distinctions as it induces similar levels of stress on worker bodies; both men and women must adjust their bodies to the rhythm of shiftwork. However, while miners stress that gender difference is absent from the workplace, Rolston finds it ever present. For instance, the absence of bathrooms means that women's work suffers because they cannot as easily attend to bodily functions in the middle of a run. Menstruation, pregnancy, and childbirth add even more pressure on the lives of women, and novice women miners are especially vulnerable (pp. 81–85). Moreover, while miners deeply value a strong work ethic and perceive of work ethic as gender neutral and achievable by both men and women, here again Rolston observes gendered distinctions. Women miners who are "good hands" are often positioned and position themselves as safe and caring operators (pp. 145–164). This social positioning works to integrate them into the workplace in a positive fashion and is read by male operators as "gender neutral."

However, Rolston smartly points out that this positioning as "safe" and "caring" can offset recognition of women's technical expertise and infringe on opportunities for advancement (p. 162).

In part 3 of the book, Rolston grounds her analysis in linguistic anthropology and discourse analysis to explore how the social positioning of miners emerges through interaction. Chapter 5 relies on several transcribed ethnographic instances focused on the categories of "tomboys," "ladies" "girly girls," "bitches," "machos," "softies," and "sissies." While the miners in her study frequently and comfortably positioned themselves, and others, outside of normative notions of masculinity and femininity, they still struggled to find language to capture these moves (p. 143). Both men and women position themselves in opposition to dominant ideas about their gender and instead compare themselves favorably to local categories (e.g., of tomboys or softies). Here is where Rolston's focus on language and discourse is so powerful, as it captures the negotiation and construction of gender identity most precisely. Both genders are criticized if they adhere too closely to gender stereotypes; however, once again, women inevitably are critiqued more harshly.

Chapter 6 contributes to scholarship on sexual harassment in the workplace, as Rolston analyzes joking behavior to tease out the distinction between harassment and consent. Again informed by linguistic anthropology, she draws on several ethnographic moments to illustrate that content alone is not enough to determine meaning; who says what and when they say it determines whether or not miners experience a remark as joking among one's "family" (crew) or as a case of harassment. Accusations of sexual harassment do occur, however, and are reported by men and women. Miners use reports as a method to discipline coworkers who violate cultural norms and expectations for the partially gender-neutral work ethic of crew families (p. 184). Rolston does raise the question—and this reviewer echoes it—of whether women miners feel they are subjected to harassment on a more regular basis than they state yet are simply remaining silent out of their conviction that the mines are "gender neutral."

*Mining Coal and Undermining Gender* will be of considerable interest to anthropologists and other social scientists focused on kinship, gender, and work. The book relies on years of participant-observation and life experience and is incredibly well supported by existing literature on work and family, labor relations, feminist theory, and linguistic anthropology.

# Buddhist Nuns and Gendered Practice: In Search of the Female Renunciant by Nirmala S. Salgado

New York: Oxford University Press, 2013. 336 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12429

Nalika Gajaweera

University of Southern California

Over the past two decades, a central debate within feminist theorizing has been the interrogation of the presumed universality of the category “woman,” resulting in serious analyses of gender essentialism and the liberal configuration of feminist agency. The subject of religion and religious women, especially their representation through liberal feminist frameworks, is often at the center of this debate. Nirmala Salgado’s *Buddhist Nuns and Gendered Practice* is a much-needed critical look at liberal feminist interpretation of the practices of Buddhist religious women.

Drawing on over two decades of field research with female renunciants, particularly those living in Sri Lanka, Salgado examines what she refers to as the “renunciant everyday” of Buddhist nuns in order to speak back to the secular liberal assumptions about freedom, agency, and equality against which Buddhist female renunciants’ (mostly Asian) lives are held accountable. Although Salgado contends that her account is not meant to serve as ethnography, I submit that this is nonetheless a sophisticated example of anthropology as cultural critique.

Salgado argues that the central preoccupation of most scholarly accounts of female renunciants has been to highlight the revival of the higher ordination (*upasampada*) of Theravada nuns in Asia as a political reform movement for freedom against patriarchal norms. Most use what Salgado describes as a “globalatinized” language of rights, empowerment, and equality—a discourse that frames Asian female renunciants’ acceptance of *upasampada* as feminist “resistance” against the conventional family and established patriarchal norms. The central crux of *Buddhist Nuns and Gendered Practice* is, however, to illustrate not only how these feminist “master narratives” rely on colonial (Orientalist) discourses about religion and religious lives of non-Western Others but also to show how such narratives fail to look at Buddhist nun renunciants’ everyday concerns, which primarily include their preoccupation with the religious self-realization of understanding *dukkha* (suffering) and their concern with realizing nirvana—the end of the cycle of rebirth and redeath (*samsara*).

In my eyes, two chapters in the book are particularly compelling in terms of Salgado’s efforts to challenge feminist categories through a nuanced analysis of nuns’ everyday lives. The first is the analysis developed in chapter 7 wherein

the author seeks to question the assumption underlying most feminist explanations of Asian nuns’ eschewal of land ownership. In most accounts, this rejection of property rights is seen as a way for Asian women to affirm their agency by relinquishing their responsibilities as mothers, wives, and daughters of the household. Counter to this liberatory discourse, however, Salgado finds that nuns pursue their religious practice precisely by cultivating connections to residents who live in the area, many of whom are nuns’ own kin and family members. Salgado sensitively explores what she describes as the “tactics” deployed by four nuns who practiced their renunciant lives while remaining intimately connected with family and land through an “economy of religious relations” (p. 199). Attending to these tactics shows how nuns continue to render their kinfolk morally responsible to them and their pursuit of finding religious freedom.

In a second moment of rich analysis in chapter 2, Salgado attends to nuns’ reflection on their decision to become renunciants. Again she argues that most writing about nuns posits women’s renunciation as an opportunity to escape their “double burden” as wife–mother and wage earner. These interpretations, Salgado contends, frame nuns’ lives as problems requiring solutions, particularly through educational empowerment. Salgado’s analysis of the specific conditions under which women made their decision to become nuns and her attention to the vernacular terms these women use to tell their stories of renunciation show a very different sensibility motivating renunciation. Instead, she finds nuns’ understanding their former lives as householders, its hardships and pain, as meditations on Buddhist notions of *samsara*, ultimately enabling a deepening of their *sila* (religious practice).

Although Salgado’s greatest success is challenging secular liberal feminist attempts to translate “third-world” women’s lives into “ready-made secular and juridical concepts” (p. 186), I find her analysis stops short of inquiring what happens when some nuns (as I am sure some must) learn and trade in the language of rights, equality, and empowerment. In what ways are nuns coming to think and make claims for themselves in secular liberal language of rights and feminism? Furthermore, what struggles and contradictions might they encounter, and how do they negotiate this new terrain with other actors like the state, monastics, and the transnational networks?

Overall, *Buddhist Nuns and Gendered Practice* is a formidable achievement by a scholar pushing analyses beyond prescribed theoretical frameworks. It adds to a growing number of feminist critiques taking the liberal universalized

rights discourse as an object of scrutiny rather than a goal to endorse. Salgado's field research at the intersection of Buddhism and Sri Lanka is novel and refreshing, shedding light on an area that is often marginalized in subcontinental South Asian Studies.

As a teaching tool, the book would be ideal for use in a graduate-level course in anthropology or a women's studies course on transnational feminism. It would also be well placed in a religious studies or Buddhist course on women and gender.

## Expulsions: Brutality and Complexity in the Global Economy by Saskia Sassen

Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2014. 304 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12431

**Edward F. Fischer**  
*Vanderbilt University*

I predict that Saskia Sassen's new book will be well received by anthropologists. It offers a compelling metaphor for the structural violence of post-crisis late capitalism, and it builds both on Sassen's influential previous work and recent scholarship by other social scientists (such as Thomas Piketty) engaged in policy debates. Sassen consciously chooses extreme examples in order to illuminate emergent trends and, I suspect, to be provocative in a way that punches up her prose. All bodes well for the reader.

Sassen argues that hidden ("subterranean") political-economic processes are eroding societal well-being through the structural violence of exclusion (and the "expulsion" of the title). This will be uncontroversial for most anthropologists and sociologists; indeed, it will feed our healthy skepticism of neoliberal assemblages. Still, Sassen's focus on expulsion is revealing, and in her hands the concept weaves together an analysis that ranges from the derivative instruments of global high finance to new patterns of international land acquisitions (spoiler: China is a big player) to the environmental and human effects of extractive industries.

Sassen's thesis is convincing, and her writing is engaging. Yet, in a few places where I happen to be familiar with the evidence, her use of data was selective. For example, she

glosses over the growth of wealth (and the middle classes) in Brazil and China and the other BRICS in her case for increasing global inequality. She also takes as an implicit baseline for the rise of expulsions during the post-World War II boom years in the United States and Europe (circa 1945–1973). This may well have been a golden age of capitalism, with growing economies and declining inequality, but it was also marked by brutal racial and other exclusions that Sassen mentions only in passing. In another place, she emphasizes that current (2014) debt levels are higher than ever before for countries around the world—although for Latin America, an area oddly excluded from this comparison, this is not true.

Nonetheless, this is a grand work, and at such global scale some of the details can get misrepresented without undermining the whole argument. Such was the case with Eric Wolf's *Europe and the Peoples without History* (1982); Wolf got any number of specifics wrong, but his larger analysis still held. This is also the case with Sassen's book. Her broad thesis of exclusion and expulsion is illuminating and valuable, and she points us toward issues of pressing practical as well as theoretical importance. It is a book that will be read for the big idea and not the small details.

### REFERENCE CITED

- Wolf, Eric  
1982 *Europe and the People without History*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

# A Desolate Place for a Defiant People: The Archaeology of Maroons, Indigenous Americans, and Enslaved Laborers in the Great Dismal Swamp by Daniel O. Sayers

Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2014. 276 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12430

**Diane Wallman**  
University of South Florida

In *A Desolate Place for a Defiant People*, Daniel Sayers transports us to a marginal landscape of Colonial Virginia and North Carolina. The Great Dismal Swamp encompasses an area nearly the size of Rhode Island, and it was home to indigenous Americans, maroons, indentured servants, and enslaved laborers for over three centuries after European contact in the Chesapeake region. Sayers employs a Marxian analytical framework for interpreting the social and economic realities of the swamp. In particular, he deconstructs the modes of production that characterized social relations and interactions from the 17th century leading up to the Civil War. To the colonists, the swamp was a dangerous morass, unordered and unproductive as well as difficult to access prior to the construction of a canal system in the early 19th century. This “untamed” landscape, however, served as an isolated refuge for generations of escaped enslaved laborers and their descendants who chose to defy their roles as chattel in the capitalistic colonial realm.

Sayers’s study focuses on the social relations, labor, uneven geographical development, alienation, and the modes of production that emerged within the swamp among its diverse diasporic communities. The labor systems and social relations inside the swamp differed from the dominant capitalist mode of production (CMP) and the capitalistic enslavement mode of production (CEMP), which both emphasized the exchange value of commodities and created severe alienation. The author identifies what he calls “autoexousian praxis” as the means for the social transformation that occurred within swamp communities. Autoexousia is akin to a stored potential energy within individuals, based on history and experience, which provide people with the ability to make informed choices and engage in creative and transformative action. Sayers argues that the maroons, or “self-extricators,” formulated and organized communities in contrast to and in spite of the CEMP, remaining unalienated from the products of their labor, nature, themselves, and other people. Overall, this approach is refreshing and novel in its focus on alienation and on the rejection of the capitalistic mode of production by individuals and communities.

The archaeological research focused on two primary sites: the nameless site and the cross-canal site. The nameless

site was an isolated island home to a “scission” community—that is, a permanent settlement of maroons that self-exiled to escape slavery. Investigations identified architectural and domestic features dating from the early 17th century through the 19th century, suggesting some spatial variation but temporal continuity in the form and structure of the habitations. The artifacts recovered indicate little to no consumption of outside commodities during the 17th and most of the 18th centuries. The small fragments of objects found were primarily “resuscitated” artifacts produced by indigenous peoples who previously inhabited the swamp, including reworked stone tools and ceramic sherds. The features and material culture also suggest a possible shift in settlement and relations in the 19th century, with increasing integration into external markets. The body of material evidence indicates an emergence of a previously unrecognized mode of production. This “praxis mode of production” allowed for the avoidance of the oppression and material alienation associated with the contemporary capitalist modes. The evidence reveals that, for generations, the scission community acted and lived collaboratively toward this objective.

The cross-canal site was an enslaved laborer settlement associated with the canal and lumber companies that exploited the swamp in the early 19th century. These enslaved laborers were hired out to excavate canals, extract lumber, and produce shingles from the lumber. Excavations indicate that the enslaved laborers who inhabited the canal site were undeniably an integral element of the CEMP but also had increased freedom as they travelled to the interior for raw materials, interacted with swamp maroons, and were generally under less surveillance than enslaved laborers in the surrounding region. The artifacts recovered suggest integration into the external economic system, a possible informal market system, and the consumption and possible caching of commodities for trade with maroons who were on the periphery of the canal company labor system.

Overall, the monograph is well written, with engaging prose and insightful commentary on the nature of capitalist modes of production and the opposition to these oppressive and alienating systems. The evidence of permanent settlements of maroons that persisted for generations in the swamp is alone a worthwhile and significant development, as maroon communities are often seen as temporary, mobile, and transient. As often is the case with ongoing archaeological research, there are points of the analysis that feel unfinished. While somewhat acknowledged, the narrative trends toward



conjecture at these moments, especially when addressing the internal composition and nature of the scission communities. As more research is completed, scholars should look forward to Sayers identifying, with increasing certainty, the patterns

and variation that arose within the swamp communities. To date, this study represents the most comprehensive archaeological study of a permanent maroon community in North America.

## Embattled Bodies, Embattled Places: War in Pre-Columbian Mesoamerica and the Andes by Andrew K. Scherer and John W. Verano, eds.

Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2014. 432 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12432

**Gwen Robbins Schug**

*Appalachian State University*

*Embattled Bodies, Embattled Places* is a collection of papers from a symposium entitled “Conflict, Conquest, and the Performance of War in Pre-Columbian America.” The goal was to situate Pre-Columbian violence in its particular historical and social context and reconstruct the semiotics of violence, its role in ritual performance, power relations, and statecraft. This volume admirably accomplishes its goals, with all of the chapters going far beyond common tropes in the bioarchaeology of violence—as an individual experience, as a manifestation of structural violence, as an expression of vulnerability, or in its relationship to “health” or “stress”—to contextualize violent behavior in its role in identity construction, the performance of social relationships, and ritualized expressions of power and resistance.

The first six chapters examine the conditions for violence in Mesoamerica. Takeshi Inomata considers violence as a social process, which is tied into identity construction and social relations in Pre-Classic and Classic period Lowland Maya society in the Pasion River region. Andrew Scherer and Charles Golden also focus on identity, but they are more concerned with cultural diversity in western Maya lowland polities, where taking and naming captives was a performance designed to achieve different social, political, and economic goals. Matthew Restall takes a deconstructivist approach to Hernan Cortes’s idea that Mayan warfare was highly innovative between 1520–1540 C.E. He demonstrates how a “landscape of war” resulted in regionally diverse narratives of, and approaches to, warfare among Mayan communities, which ultimately led to different outcomes for Spanish incursions.

In a chapter on warfare and conquest in the Late/Terminal Formative period of Oaxaca, Arthur Joyce examines evidence for the predatory expansion model, ultimately rejecting the hypothesis that territorial conquest

resulted in an empire administered from Monte Alban. Using a broad set of criteria for diagnosing territorial violence and warfare, he finds support for elite status rivalry among polities, which he argues drove warfare, raiding, sacrifice, and violent displays. Gerardo Gutierrez uses ethnohistory, linguistics, iconography, and the archaeology of a recurrent “battlefield” in Guerrero to examine the experience of Aztec expansion and how sacrifice here fit into a complex worldview, features of which were shared among many Mesoamerican cultures. Ximena Chavez Balderas also explores multiple interpretations of sacrifice, from the functional and reductionist to the structural and symbolic. Based on osteological evidence from the Templo Mayor (Tenochtitlan), he argues that sacrifice did not involve captives of war; he opines that the victims were more likely exchanged in specialized markets or obtained as tribute from defeated communities.

The second half of the book focuses on Andean populations, with chapters by Elizabeth Arkush, Tiffany Tung, George Lau, J. Marla Toyne, and L. Alfredo Narvaez Vargas demonstrating how violence ordered society. Arkush argues that endemic warfare, violence, and threats of violence were central to the formation of interdependent confederations and the florescence of local identities that in turn exacerbated conflict in the south-central Andes in the Late Intermediate Period. Tung demonstrates how militarism and social violence in Wari society legitimized and ultimately cultivated a specialization in aggression; this resulted in a recursive situation where warriors required war, as much as war had required warriors. Lau approaches Andean conflict from the perspective that violence is not inherently destabilizing but can be a form of social order, a creative and a destructive activity. Toyne contends that a mass killing at Kuelap is unrelated to territorial ambitions but instead represents a destructive and possibly punitive act, the visceral consequences of termination, abandonment, and social reconfiguration in the epicontact period. Dennis Ogburn provides a useful summary of Inca warfare as an imperial strategy, describing modes of submission and their impact on incorporation and resettlement.

Several chapters consider Moche captive sacrifice, whether it primarily occurs in the context of warfare or ritual combat, the source of the captives, and the significance of this practice. Luis Jaime Castillo Butters focuses on political fragmentation, arguing that the highly differentiated, multipolity Moche society created diverse options for social relations between polities, including commerce, negotiation, diplomacy, and other discursive modes, as well as warfare and ritual combat. John Verano is interested in the complexity of using iconographic, archaeological, bioarchaeological, taphonomic, and mortuary evidence to reconstruct patterns of warfare in the Andes. He contends that captive sacrifice represents a longstanding

ritual practice that functioned to affirm power at regional centers and remained hardly changed over 600 years.

This volume is deserving of a large and diverse audience. Scholars from many fields will find value in these chapters, which often seamlessly weave together history, iconography, area studies, and the subfields of anthropology. The volume is a rare example of cross-subdisciplinary excellence. It will serve as a useful reference for students, containing chapters based on strong scholarship that is accessible at many levels. The book admirably accomplishes the editors' goals and provides a stunning example of nuanced interpretation of warfare and violence, history, strategy, power, and performance in American prehistory.

## Broken Links, Enduring Ties: American Adoption across Race, Class, and Nation by Linda J. Seligmann

Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2013. 344 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12433

**Judith Schachter**

*Carnegie Mellon University*

Recently, anthropologists have proven that adoption raises central disciplinary issues not only regarding kinship and family but also race, class, and power. What then does *Broken Links, Enduring Ties* add to the conversation? A great deal. Comparing three types of adoption by Euroamerican parents, author Linda Seligmann “explores the tensions surrounding the making of American families, over two decades” (p. 2). She selects Chinese American (CA), Russian American (RA), and African American (AA) adoptions because these reflect the core cultural constructs that determine “relatedness” in the contemporary United States.

In nine densely packed chapters with the addition of an introduction and conclusion, Seligmann brings the literature on adoption up-to-date through a detailed analysis of the processes of family making in a nation marked by racism, inequities between rich and poor, and hegemonic ideologies of identity and belonging. A concentration on North American adoption allows her to ground abstract concepts in intensely intimate stories, testimony to the trust she earned from a range of individuals (an appendix provides demographic data). *Broken Links, Enduring Ties* makes a unique contribution through its innovative methodology and a robust comparative approach.

Seligmann's book incorporates an impressive array of evidence. In addition to hundreds of interviews, material from the Internet, and references to secondary literature, she plumbs the history of social science theory, pointing to the relevance of traditional texts to a still-understudied topic. Her approach in *Broken Links, Enduring Ties* extends

participation-observation fieldwork, inasmuch as she draws an interpretive framework from her experience as an adoptive parent, disciplined by anthropological training. On this basis, Seligmann extracts texts hitherto missing from adoption literature—for instance, the “religiosity” that pervades transnational and transracial adoption in North America. Most significantly, she uses hidden texts to document the shifts in power between adoptive parents and adoptees over an individual life course and through the two decades of her study.

Her book goes further than earlier studies in linking international with national politics. The critique by CA adoptees that their U.S. parents ignore “the underlying geopolitics that fuel transnational adoption” (p. 111) later reappears when AA adoptees note the futility of an ideology of multiculturalism for erasing racial politics. The critique raised by CA and AA adoptees (less by RA adoptees who “match” their white parents) prompts Seligmann's questioning of the effectiveness of life books, albums, naming practices, and storytelling for rescuing adoptees from the imbalances that underpin all adoption. Her chapter on schooling emphasizes the lull into which parents fall, as they accept genealogy charts that uphold the dogma of biological relatedness. In this chapter, as in others, Seligmann takes adoptive parents to task for failing to challenge the persistent appeal of an as-if-begotten model to allay the problems raised when children are not “like” their parents.

A 21st-century book, *Broken Links, Enduring Ties* leans heavily on the Internet and on conversations members of the triad carry on in this realm. Through these “private–public” chats, Seligmann gleans the viewpoints of adoptees whose voices often vanish under the weight of parental perspectives—a temptation the author does not resist, inasmuch as parental narratives constitute the major part of her

data. Fortunately her sensitivity to hidden texts, common symbols, and creative definitions of “community” counteracts the power that parents exert over accounts of adoption. Her systematic interpretation of online exchanges reveals a reconception of relatedness that openness through contact, heritage trips, culture camps, and other strategies for linking adoptees to their birth origins barely captures. CA, RA, and AA adoptees, Seligmann shows, redefine not only family and kinship but also identity, nationality, and the circuits of power on a global stage.

The questions CA, RA, and AA adoptees ask are not the same, and Seligmann does not slight the contrasts. Yet the value of the book lies in its portrayal of shared probing by adoptees into ideologies that constrict family making in the United States. As adoptees begin to articulate their concerns, the culture of “relatedness” changes beyond the specific instances she documents: “adoptees find themselves resisting racism, biologism, and crusading xenophobia,” creating the foundation for eradicating “normative American

family configurations” (p. 279). In making the claim that adoptees redesign kinship and identity, she rightly shuns the cliché of generational conflict, instead using personal stories to accentuate the complexities of establishing new generational configurations. Seligmann’s claim is grounded in data from adoptees that support the case for an evolving transformation in U.S. views of race, class, nation, and power.

The weaknesses in *Broken Links, Enduring Ties* are the flip side of its strengths. In linking studies of adoption to social science theory, Seligmann occasionally overwhelms the reader with scholarly references. This is particularly true of her use of critical race theory, which brings AA adoptions to the forefront and induces mild reproach for RA adoptions in which children match parents. Yet these are minor flaws in an otherwise outstanding, exciting, and innovative study. *Broken Links, Enduring Ties* will find an audience of scholars, professionals, and advanced students of anthropology, history, and literature.

## Current Flow: The Electrification of Palestine by Ronen Shamir

Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2013. 224 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12434

Leila Hudson

University of Arizona

The strength of this important study is the meticulous reconstruction of how capital, technology, and knowledge came together to lay the electrical grid infrastructure of a dominant Jewish economy and Arab marginalization in British Mandate Palestine. Author Ronen Shamir uses a variety of archives to produce an account of an electricity production monopoly, distribution grid, and consumption regime that stratified localities, classes, and ethnicities. Being “not yet wired” gave a material grounding to Arab exclusion, just as being wired put an amped-up glow on Zionist modernity. The further value of the work is to show the workings of capital on the British administration and urban geography of 1920s Palestine.

The book’s weakness is that assembly theory and actor network theory (ANT) obfuscate the responsibility of actors motivated by ideologies in the formation of social structures. Latourian assemblage tends to describe, anthropomorphize, and even fetishize equipment and circuits, giving systems an eerie automaton quality of a system “eager” to expand. Although its roots are in critical theory, this technique feels at times like a dogmatically positivist form of cultural history that aims to downplay human political inputs except as proximate causes and delivery mechanisms for systems developing apparently under their own inexorable logic.

In this story, there is a fascinating “great man,” Pinhas Rutenberg, whose brilliantly pernicious agency is clearly in evidence but never explored. The framing of the process in ANT and assembly theory relieves Shamir from addressing an extraordinary backstory and the complex motivations of a Bolshevik turned capitalist and founder of the Haganah. That electricity produced, distributed, and marketed by a passionate Zionist and serial double dealer who founded a terror organization that enhanced Zionism and marginalized Arabs is not that surprising and doesn’t need ghosts in machines as explanatory devices. In one of Shamir’s sources, a Zionist official, defending the rights of small Jewish investors to import generators that would free them from Rutenberg’s monopoly, describes Rutenberg as “an astounding combination of resemblance to a steam-roller and a whirlwind” (p. 126). The traditional analogy in which a man is compared to a machine and a force works better than the inverse formulation of machines and forces compared to men. But the conceit of analysis of mechanical “prime movers” at the expense of human “prime movers” is a theoretical short circuit, even if it is a useful experimental stepping stone to a new historical sociology of things.

This makes the title of chapter 2, “Let the Poles Act,” strange and ironic. No theoretical fad can convince the reader to see inanimate objects like electric poles, wires, and transformers as active (even if we do accept the basic Latourian premise that connections and circuits are rarely inert mediators but more complex intermediators that change

relations by their existence). But the Poles whose actions really counted were Polish Jews fleeing the inflationary devastation, punitive tax regimes, and antisemitism of 1920s Poland, tripling the population of Tel Aviv and pouring private capital into the system. These Zionist pioneers and investors played a key role in the story, and like the British and the Palestinian Arabs, they were not always in harmony with steamroller Rutenberg. Ultimately, their capital, their projects, and their openness to European-style public projects redeemed Rutenberg's grandiose failed schemes to get the British administration to be the prime customer of his electrical monopoly.

If Poles seem secondary to poles in this account, it goes without saying that the less pliable Arab electrical consumers and grid skeptics get an even shorter shrift. Their range of ambivalent responses to the Zionist project (skillfully transformed by Rutenberg into politically useful "Arab agitation" in one of many duplicitous rationalizations) became a form of "disassembly" and disenfranchisement, freezing them out of power access and exaggerating the contentiousness of their politics. These people are neglected and objectifiably absent in the book.

To his credit, however, Shamir illuminates very well the structural differences between private Arab landholders, who required individual persuasion, remuneration, compensation, and litigation concerning easements and property damage in the Jaffa circuit, and the Jewish immigrants of mushrooming Tel Aviv, whose European notions of the urban streetscape, privacy bounded by current meters rather than walls, familiarity with the benefits of light and power, and more intimate communications and knowledge of the provider made them more eager to participate. The juiced-up Zionist communities in which local authorities bargained collectively for a public good would be stronger, grow faster, and be constituted for modern power (electrical and political) in contrast to the fragmenting private property rights of the Arab landowners that made them powerful in local relations of the past and short-term contracts and litigations but weak in the national future. Ultimately, Tel Aviv and other Zionist settlements on the grid reaped the lion's share of the long-term benefits of cheap power for their industrial projects and later were able to leapfrog over traditional Arab citrus agriculture to electrically enhanced irrigation that made oranges a cash-crop export of Zionism.

## A Prehistory of Western North America: The Impact of Uto-Aztecan Languages by David Leedom Shaul

Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2014. 400 pp

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12435

**Alan Barnard**

*University of Edinburgh*

This book was originally to be titled *Chasing the Uto-Aztecs: Alternatives in the Prehistory of Western North America*. The present title, apart from being rather clearer in presenting a wider scope, does emphasize the importance of Uto-Aztecan languages as an influence on the linguistic prehistory of North America in general.

Uto-Aztecan is a language family that includes languages spoken over a very wide area, historically from the Pacific to the Rocky Mountains and from the subarctic to Panama. The most numerous groups today are those of central Mexico, but the heart of this language family lies in its point of origin, north of there. This is hardly surprising, but David Shaul makes the point that linguistic prehistory is often complex, and the present study is augmented by considerations of genetic relationships (both of plants and of humans), material culture, and archaeology. Piecing these together can itself be a complex procedure because linguistic relationships are sometimes very different from what is assumed through biological relationships. I have seen this very often in my own ethnographic region of southern Africa,

where over the last 50 years presumed linguistic prehistory has been altered many times over as anthropologists have gradually come to realize that subsistence (hunting and gathering versus pastoralism) has very little to do with human genetics. Cultural complexity is much the same in North America, where Shaul rejects the common view that corn-complex agriculture simply diffused across the U.S. Southwest.

One of the best things about Shaul's book is that he takes little for granted. Thus, he begins his discussion in the first chapter by outlining the basics of what a language family is, what a linguistic isolate is, how to distinguish a cognate from a loan word, and examples of how languages change. Of course, deciphering the linguistic prehistory of North America is more complicated than that—for example, consider the Indo-European family, for which there are written sources over millennia with which to work. He starts with Indo-European examples and then moves on fairly quickly to deal with the Uto-Aztecan family and its overall contribution to the prehistory of North America. There are bibliographic notes and summaries along the way. These will be helpful to students, although in general at least some knowledge of the basics of phonology must be assumed. Some knowledge of the geography of North America helps too, along with an interest in the history of anthropology. However, much

can be picked up easily along the way—for example, the idea of a linguistic area and that of the age-area hypothesis, the principles behind lexicostatistics and such notions as ethnohistory and certain basic concepts in genetics and neuroscience. The author's goal in each case is to move toward a "prehistoric sociolinguistics." This implies an understanding of how speech communities operate and of how they enable the diffusion of terms such as those for aspects of cultivation (of corn, beans, and squash) across linguistic boundaries—although not necessarily of assumptions about the culture complexes sometimes assumed.

Toward the end of the book, Shaul explores comparative mythology as a means for reconstructing prehistoric connections. As he points out, comparative mythology here can mean various things: the cross-cultural comparison of myths, an areal approach to cultural borrowing, taking myth as ethnohistory, and an approach that assumes the continuation of a proto-language into separate languages. He takes the last two as methods with which to reconstruct creation mythology among O'odham and other peoples who speak

languages of the Tepiman subfamily. Thus, while his interest is in linguistics, he makes contributions across the subdisciplines of anthropology too.

I like Shaul's book because it brings together an introduction to linguistic anthropology, provides an example of its use in reconstructing prehistory, and makes an implicit attack on earlier attempts by archaeologists to do the same through ad hoc methods. Instead, he builds his argument on accepted principles in linguistics. Of course, the volume's main appeal will be to area specialists—and perhaps as much to archaeologists as to linguists. However, it should have an appeal beyond that, to scholars interested in its methods as well as its substance. If it has a drawback, it is that the book is rather lengthy and detailed. However, the Uto-Aztecan family is well known, and the detail required is not particularly problematic to understand the argument. There are nine maps and numerous linguistic examples as well as useful summaries along the way. The book should appeal to students, especially of the Southwest, as well as to professional anthropologists.

## Gentleman Troubadours and Andean Pop Stars: Huayno Music, Media Work, and Ethnic Imaginaries in Urban Peru by Joshua Tucker

Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2013. 240 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12436

**Fernando Rios**

*University of Maryland-College Park*

From the late Spanish colonial era to the present day, the *huayno*, a duple-meter Andean music and dance genre with a distinctive galloping pulse, has been one of the most widely cultivated musical expressions in the Andean highlands and valleys of Peru and Bolivia. The first book-length, English-language study on the Peruvian *huayno*, *Gentleman Troubadours and Andean Pop Stars*, examines the urban mestizo *huayno* variant associated with the Ayacucho region in both its traditional voice and acoustic guitar version and the more recent manifestation of the genre, which the author terms "contemporary Ayacuchano *huayno*." Stylistically hybrid, and nowadays often placed in the "fusion music" category in Peruvian record stores, contemporary Ayacuchano *huayno* incorporates the emotion-laden vocal delivery style of Latin American *balada* (pop ballad) crooners along with the Pan-Andean folkloric music tradition's instrumentation (panpipes, *kenas*, *charangos*, *bombo legüero*) and repertoire (e.g., the Bolivian *caporal-saya* and *tinku* genres).

By focusing on the traditional and contemporary Ayacuchano *huayno* performance styles, ethnomusicologist

Joshua Tucker is able to address several underexamined topics in the fields of Andeanist anthropology, ethnomusicology, popular music studies, and history. His discussion of how, in the early to mid-20th century, the Ayacucho city elite constructed the local urban mestizo *huayno* tradition to serve as the regional musical emblem for the *departamento* (equivalent to a U.S. state), for example, reveals that in certain areas in the Peruvian Andes the elite fashioned nativist ideologies that emphasized Hispanicism to stress the cultural differences separating the mestizo elite from the indigenous masses. In doing so, the Ayacucho city elite opted for an approach that significantly differed from the *indigenista* (Indianist) strategies that elite mestizo nativists favored in Cuzco and Puno, which have received far greater scholarly interest from Peruvianist anthropologists and historians. To my mind, the Ayacucho case that Tucker richly documents bears a resemblance to the regionalist projects that elites crafted in the neighboring Peruvian *departamento* of Arequipa and, in the Bolivian lowlands, the *departamento* of Santa Cruz, although the author does not draw these parallels. At any rate, that Tucker chose to devote considerable attention to the activities of regional elite mestizo cultural organizations is certainly praiseworthy, as Andeanist anthropologists and ethnomusicologists conducting research in rural areas have tended to concentrate on indigenous cultural



practices. The media-centered ethnographic approach that Tucker uses to analyze the emergence, stylistic consolidation, and audience reception of contemporary Ayacuchano huayno, meanwhile, offers a profitable avenue for elucidating the relationship between popular music consumption and sociocultural identity negotiation among urban Lima's emergent Andean bourgeoisie. Few researchers have investigated this sector in much depth, as the vast majority of Peruvianist anthropological and sociological studies on Andean subjects in the urban Lima environment have focused, instead, on working-class experiences. *Gentleman Troubadours and Andean Pop Stars*, moreover, constitutes the first scholarly volume on Andean music that highlights the important but frequently overlooked role that record labels and radio deejays often play in musical genre construction, and for this reason alone this book undoubtedly will quickly become obligatory reading among Latin Americanist popular music researchers. In addition, with this work Tucker makes a valuable contribution to the growing body of interdisciplinary research on the general topic of music and globalization, particularly to recent studies examining the dynamics of transnational musical borrowings occurring within the context of the Global South (rather than between sites in the Global North and South).

*Gentleman Troubadours and Andean Pop Stars* is accessible to those without formal music training, as the book contains few musical transcriptions and employs music theory jargon sparingly, making the volume ideal for use in the classroom for graduate anthropology seminars and area study courses that draw students from a wide range of academic disciplines. As a Bolivianist who regularly offers area study coursework on the music of the Andean countries, I greatly appreciate how the author, in a number of spots in the book, discusses the Ayacuchano huayno in relation to contemporaneous Andean Peruvian musical styles, especially *huayno norteño* (also known as *huayno con arpa*), *huayno testimonial*, and *chicha*, as this clarified to me how these musical traditions resemble and differ from one another in terms of their respective performance styles, aesthetics, indexical associations (e.g., ethnicity, class), and audience. In sum, anthropologists, ethnomusicologists, and popular music scholars who are interested in learning about the fascinating early history of the Ayacuchano huayno and understanding how in the 1990s Peruvian record labels and radio deejays consciously transformed it into a popular music style with cosmopolitan appeal will greatly enjoy reading Joshua Tucker's fine study.

## More Than Two to Tango: Argentine Tango Immigrants in New York City by Anahí Viladrich

Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2013. 272 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12437

**María Susana Azzi**

*Cultural Anthropologist, Fundación Astor Piazzolla*

*More Than Two to Tango: Argentine Tango Immigrants in New York City* offers an informative ethnography of the tango community in New York, including interviews with dancers, musicians, and singers, and considers the issues surrounding the migrant *tangueros*.<sup>1</sup> These issues refer particularly to national and urban identity, marginalization, victimization, globalization, cultural pluralism, discourses of inclusion–exclusion, music's capability to engender community, sound aesthetics, citizenship, minority ethnic groups, social capital, informal networks, language, jobs, health, and the tango's place in mainstream and “world music.” It is important to remark that *tangueros* are Argentines (both male and female) who have left their country of origin.

Argentina was the second-largest recipient of immigration between 1821 and 1932, with the United States of America being first and Canada being third. The tango itself was the acceptance of diversity and the inclusion of marginality within the system. The tango in Argentina was not only a vehicle but also an instrument that accelerated cultural

integration. But what happens with *tangueros* migrations in the 21st century?

William Safran (1991:83–84) suggests that diasporas share “several” of six characteristics: (1) dispersion from an original center, (2) collective memory of the homeland, (3) marginalization by the host country, (4) an idea of return to the homeland, (5) belief in maintaining or restoring the homeland, and (6) having “ethnocommunal consciousness and solidarity” defined in part by the community's relationship to the homeland.

Argentines in the United States have not generally been considered a diaspora: they came in search of a better future, and they did assimilate at a steady pace. When I think of Argentines in the United States, I think of academics, scientists, medical doctors, engineers, entrepreneurs, bank and industrial companies employees, students, and baseball players. Argentines living in New York can join <http://www.meetup.com/argentinos/>, which has 1,014 members, to meet other local Argentine expatriates living in the New York area.

On the contrary, *tangueros* share a common exclusion from the economic, structured, and institutional life in New York City. The consciousness of diaspora is particularly strong among those tango people who have found

their social and economic adjustment to New York difficult. Tangueros are held together by common “rituals”: *milongas* (social tango dancing events) in Manhattan being one of them. As in many diasporic events, milongas in Manhattan include extensive participation of U.S. and non-U.S. tango dancers. Tangueros find themselves mistreated by the host city. Our body continues to be pivotal to our understanding and expression of our place in the global village.

When tangueros leave Argentina, they leave a national, cosmopolitan, barrio, gender identity that is impossible to find or re-create in New York City. Most tangueros are marginal people in Argentina, and it is not clear in the book why they have left their country to live in New York City. Most of them do not speak English; they do not have visas or health insurance. Some of them have other jobs; others don't. Their glamorous presence at milongas in the evenings is not so during the day when many of them can't make ends meet. They rely on informal networks, which become essential to their survival. These networks, however, need to become stronger to truly support marginal people who lack basic needs such as formal and permanent jobs, health insurance, and a good knowledge of the English language. They no longer think of themselves as stable and indivisible units or combinations thereof; instead, we see the self as constantly reinvented and reorganized in interaction with others and with its social and cultural environments.

They have to adapt to a new culture. Who teaches them how to? Is it lack of access to good information? Examples of tango artists who have succeeded in New York abound: they went with a contract, and by way of a con-

tract, they also had health insurance. Visas? It is quite impossible to get visas without new legislation in the United States of America. It is also becoming more and more difficult, particularly after the events of 9/11. So, why move to New York City and leave the *barrio de la infancia y la adolescencia* (the district of their childhood and adolescence), where they still have colleagues, friends, and supporting families?

If I may suggest, instead of blaming the state (whether U.S. or Argentine) for lack of protection, tangueros in New York City should create, with the help of established tango teachers and musicians, a civilian association or foundation in order to protect their rights. We cannot expect the state to embrace migrant tangueros on its own initiative. Tango music and dance and new cultural expressions rising from the tango tradition will remain marginal. We can take comfort in the fact that almost every cultural commodity is marginal these days—marginality is merely a matter of degree. Tango must embrace its marginality and make a modest nest in a splintered marketplace.

#### NOTE

1. A. Adjective: pertaining to the *tango*. B. Noun: a person from the particular culture of tango's adherents and fans, with its distinctive ways of feeling and behaving—that is to say, one thoroughly imbued with tango culture.

#### REFERENCE CITED

Safran, William

1991 *Diasporas in Modern Societies: Myths of Homeland and Return*. *Diaspora* 1(2):83–99.

## New Histories of Pre-Columbian Florida by Neill J. Wallis and Asa R. Randall, eds.

Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2014. 312 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12438

Todd Braje

San Diego State University

One might assume from the title that editors Neill Wallis and Asa Randall's *New Histories of Pre-Columbian Florida* is an updated narrative history of ancient Florida, from the earliest colonizers to first Spanish contact. The volume, however, takes a sharp turn away from traditional conceptions of mere “history” and interpretations of Florida's past as a long, slow process of ecological adaptation on the periphery of southeastern North American cultural developments. Wallis and Randall have gathered together a diverse group of scholars that offer a nuanced reinterpretation of Florida's past. Inspired by agency and practice theories, the authors explore

ancient human societies across Florida at a variety of temporal and spatial scales and offer exciting new insights into the social, ritual, and material lives of indigenous Florida.

Thirteen chapters, along with a brief introduction, cover 7,000 years of Pre-Columbian history across nearly the entire state. Using new methodological approaches and theoretical frameworks, the authors present exciting new evidence for considerable social interaction and long-distance trade networks among Native Floridians and the larger southeastern United States, elaborate expressions of ritual and monumentality, and the dynamic interplay between people and their environments. Many chapters integrate multiple themes that cross-cut issues of monumentality, ritualization, social interactions, coastal adaptations, and much more, resulting in a rich, complex, and interrelated volume that holds together quite well.

One of the prevailing themes in the volume is the reconsideration of monumental constructions as resulting from ideology and ritual rather than enduring subsistence activities. In chapter 1, Asa Randall and colleagues employ high-resolution mapping, radiocarbon dating, and subsurface testing to demonstrate that the St. John's shell mounds served many roles in Archaic society, as dwellings, mortuaries, and ceremonial centers. Theresa Schober, in chapter 2, concludes that the Caloosahatchee shell mounds of southwest Florida represent Calusa landscape modifications on a monumental scale. In chapter 3, Thomas Pluckhahn and Victor Thompson argue that archaeologists should define monumental constructions not by scale but by elaboration and use the Crystal River shell mounds on Florida's west-central Gulf coast as their case study. They team up again in chapter 8 to demonstrate that the extensive earthworks at Fort Center were never linked to intensive maize agriculture and to reconsider the economic and ideological underpinnings that produced these constructions. In chapter 6, Michael Russo and colleagues maintain that the Woodland shell rings of northwest and western Florida resulted from the construction of ideological landscapes rather than daily subsistence activities.

Ritual continues as an important theme in many of the other chapters. Rebecca Saunders and Margaret Wrenn, in chapter 9, analyze the distribution and production of early fiber-tempered pottery in northeast Florida and find that pottery was produced locally, perhaps for specialized rituals at resident shell rings or shell ring complexes. In chapter 10, Ryan Wheeler and Robert Carr employ archaeological and ethnohistorical data to reassess the evidence and context for ritual animal sacrifices at the famous Miami Circle site. Neill Wallis, in chapter 12, finds that "grand-scale" ceremonial events at Parnell Mound in north Florida may represent alternative ritual activities decoupled from surrounding Mississippian politics. In the final chapter, Keith Ashley and Vicki Rolland explore the long history of ritual exchange and mortuary ceremony in northeastern Florida.

The remaining chapters offer synthetic regional overviews or confront issues of human–environmental dynamics in localized areas. In chapter 4, George Leur presents a new regional history for the last 4,000 years of southwest Florida. Similarly, in chapter 11, Nancy Marie White synthesizes new data for Woodland and Mississippian northwest Florida that suggest localized developments but also place the region in the middle of important cultural developments that linked the U.S. southeast. In chapter 5, Robert Austin and colleagues synthesize radiocarbon dates for the Tampa Bay watershed and identify relationships between settlement patterns, natural climatic oscillations, and sea levels. Kenneth Sassaman and colleagues, in chapter 7, employ 4,000 years of archaeological data from the north Gulf coast to explore the impacts of sea level on the past, present, and future of human settlement, economic, and subsistence systems, an interesting application and a call to arms for a state with no plans in place to confront impending sea level rise.

Coupled with Keith H. Ashley and Nancy Marie White's (2012) edited volume, *Late Prehistoric Florida: Archaeology at the Edge of the Mississippian World*, Wallis and Randall's tome is a timely update and expansion of Jerald T. Milanich's (1994) culture historical and ecological treatise, *Archaeology of Precolumbian Florida*. This will be an important volume not only for archaeologists working in the larger U.S. southeast region but also for any anthropologist interested in critically reimagining their places of study beyond traditional evolutionary models of cultural change and moving toward a more nuanced historical and contextual perspective.

#### REFERENCES CITED

- Ashley, Keith H., and Nancy Marie White, eds.  
2012 *Late Prehistoric Florida: Archaeology at the Edge of the Mississippian World*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida.  
Milanich, Jerald T.  
1994 *Archaeology of Precolumbian Florida*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida.

## My Father's Wars: Migration, Memory, and the Violence of a Century by Alisse Waterston

New York: Routledge, 2014. 198 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12439

**Pamela Ballinger**  
*University of Michigan*

With *My Father's Wars*, Alisse Waterston has crafted what she deems an "intimate ethnography," a hybrid genre that blurs the boundaries between scholarship and story, the

academic and the personal. As signaled by her subtitle, *Migration, Memory, and the Violence of a Century*, Waterston explores how her father refashioned himself in response to the multiple violences that successively shattered the communities (Poland and Cuba) that he called home. Waterston's father had already migrated to Havana from Jedwabne before the Holocaust began, transforming himself from Menachem Mendel Wasersztejn to Miguel

Waserstein in the process. World War II offered him the opportunity to enlist in the U.S. military and assume yet another persona—that of Michael Waterston. With unblinking candor, his daughter documents the limits of such reinvention, acknowledging both the intellectual and emotional challenges in putting together a study of what she calls her father’s “injured self.” As she admits, “For me, the most difficult aspect of this project is grasping the sources and consequences of my father’s deep wounds” (p. 129).

Coming to terms with these sources and consequences requires a method that moves from a more distanced lens to a close one, as Waterston alternates between third-person and first-person voice and between historical materials and memories. Likewise, the research relationship with her father alternated between intimacy and distance, with the author cutting ties with her father for several years. When she saw him again, the distance had “opened up the space for my project with him to happen” (p. 149). By ironically loosening “the confines of our intimacy” (p. 151), this shift made possible a new dialogue between parent and child, as well as subject and researcher. Waterston acknowledges the traditions on which this intimate ethnography builds (including reflexive ethnography and work on vulnerability) and, at times, it proves difficult to distinguish precisely wherein lies the novelty of the “intimacy” label. The most innovative aspect of the work may actually be its use of hyperlinks to embed photographs, videos, interactive dialogue platforms, and other sources in the electronic version of the text. Although Waterston describes her father’s life story as an “embodied history” (p. 152), it also becomes an embedded one, one that offers rich possibilities for use in both anthropology and history courses.

In eschewing excessive theorizing, Waterston has created a highly accessible text that will resonate far beyond anthropology. In favoring concision, however, Waterston misses opportunities to make more pointed interventions into the relevant literatures. Describing her discomfort and fear on her first visit to her father’s hometown of Jedwabne (which coincided with the controversy sparked by historian Jan Gross’s [2001] account of how Polish locals there massacred their Jewish fellow villagers), she might have reflected upon debates over the intergenerational transmission of traumatic memories. Likewise, when Waterston recounts her efforts to know the “Other” in Poland by staying with a Polish Catholic family in Jedwabne or her visits to the family’s former synagogue in Havana, she implicitly rejects

a trope of emptiness common to displacement studies but does not engage with relevant debates about the entangled processes of displacement and emplacement. (Nor, despite citing Ruth Behar as a key inspiration, does she engage with Behar’s *An Island Called Home* [2007], which takes up similar questions.) These are quibbles, however, that do not detract from the rich and multilayered story Waterston tells, one that opens up in multiple directions.

The passages devoted to the Waterston family’s transnational experiences shuttling between New York and Havana (and, after the Revolution, Puerto Rico) prove the most vivid. As the text progresses, Waterston’s mother Louise comes into focus, slowly shedding her identity as an “intensely gendered female persona” (p. 103) who yielded to her husband. In her own act of reinvention, Louise earned a college degree late in life and embraced feminism as both an academic and political project. Ultimately, Waterston’s father could (or would) not make the final self-transformation that would have permitted his marriage to survive on a more equitable footing. Although Waterston’s study takes as its primary focus her “father’s wars,” the book ends with her mother’s peaceful death after she had carved out a fulfilling new life. The role of Waterston’s mother as supporting character in this narrative raises questions about the continuing hold of “patriographies.” Some years after the publication of *Dreams from My Father* and his mother’s death, Barack Obama reflected, “I think sometimes that . . . I might have written a different book—less a meditation on the absent parent, more a celebration of the one who was the single constant in my life” (2004, p. xii). Although Waterston’s father remained a demanding and insistent presence in her life, in contrast to the absent paternal figure that haunted Obama, what might a text that foregrounded the struggles (and ultimate peace) of Waterston’s mother have looked like?

## REFERENCES CITED

- Behar, Ruth  
2007 *An Island Called Home: Returning to Jewish Cuba*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.
- Gross, Jan  
2001 *Neighbors: The Destruction of the Jewish Community in Jedwabne, Poland*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Obama, Barack  
2004 *Dreams from My Father: A Story of Race and Inheritance*. New York: Crown.

# Not Trying: Infertility, Childlessness, and Ambivalence

## by Kristin J. Wilson

Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press, 2014. 200 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12440

**Sarah Earle**

*The Open University, UK*

The book *Not Trying* is by no means autobiographical, but it begins with Kristin Wilson's recollection of an encounter with her new fertility doctor in which he asks her, "How're you doing with your plight?" She responds: "I don't really think of it as a plight," and he says, "Well, journey, then," and goes on to suppress an eye roll and an exhalation (p. 3). The opposing concepts of "plight" and "journey," Wilson argues, fail to capture her own experience of infertility, infertility treatment, and then adoption, describing it more as a "slog" than as a journey or a plight. Indeed, these concepts also fail to capture the experiences of the 26 women who participated in her research. However, their experiences were also very dissimilar to those of Wilson's.

This book explores infertility and childlessness in contemporary U.S. society in a way that is both personally and intellectually insightful. The focus is not on women who necessarily define themselves as infertile nor on those who are "desperate to become mothers." The book does not explore the experiences of women who—by accident or by design—are joyfully childfree. Instead, it focuses on women who are somewhere in between all of these categories and who are ambivalent about motherhood, infertility, and its medicalization within a context that places increasing value on motherhood at any price.

*Not Trying* is interesting and novel in many ways. There are also some elements of the book that can be anticipated. For example, Wilson's data suggest that differences such as class, sexual identity, marital status, culture, religion, age, and able-bodiedness serve to differentiate between women's experiences of reproduction. Indeed, she suggests that infertility might well be a label that can only be applied to privileged, white, middle-class, straight, and able-bodied women. Women who are "other" either simply do not see

themselves within this light or cannot reach this privileged status.

One of the especially interesting aspects of the book is a methodological insight into the challenges of recruiting women who are "not trying" to get pregnant or to resolve a state of childlessness. Finding women who defined themselves as "infertile" was nearly impossible, Wilson notes, because the very concept of "infertility" was problematic. Instead, the author sought to recruit women from a hidden population who (a) neither owned nor named their "(in)fertile" status, (b) rejected the status of "childlessness" (in that they may not have resolved, concluded, or thought about their status), and (c) were largely disinvested in any form of medicalization of infertility or treatment regime. In belonging to this ambivalent and hidden population, Wilson argues, women avoided the stigma of being labeled as infertile, childless, or child free.

Wilson reminds us that in an age of increasing reproductive technologies, the imperative to become a mother becomes stronger, although routes into motherhood become more varied and less rooted in traditional forms of kinship. This means that women who choose not to become mothers, who cannot achieve motherhood, who leave it too late to become a mother, or who are altogether ambivalent about their reproductive status and capacity are deemed peculiar because they do not necessarily fit into the master cultural narrative that defines these women as sad, infertile, and desperate for a baby.

Wilson's book is also interesting because it reveals that women who are ambivalent about their reproductive status do not necessarily come to this position at a single moment in which their reproductive capacity is clearly limited or curtailed. Instead, women who are "not trying" come to this realization (if it even is a realization) in fits and starts and as part of a process over time.

All in all, *Not Trying* is a readable account of reproductive ambivalence and resistance focusing on a hitherto hidden group of women, and it provides us with further insight into the reproductive landscape of contemporary U.S. society.



# Telling and Being Told: Storytelling and Cultural Control in Contemporary Yucatec Maya Literatures by Paul M. Worley

Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2013. 216 pp.

DOI: 10.1111/aman.12441

**Timothy W. Knowlton**  
Berry College

*Telling and Being Told* explores the relationship between agency and oral and written storytelling in Yucatec Maya literatures. Although an outgrowth of his doctoral dissertation in comparative literature, anthropologists will find Paul Worley's applications of theory and method familiar. His ongoing oral literature project with Yucatec Maya storytellers is the sort of collaborative ideal of anthropological projects with indigenous language speakers. The author explicitly aligns his definitions of core concepts along the lines of previous work by anthropologists such as Dennis Tedlock, Allan Burns, Juan Castillo Cocom, and Quetzil Castañeda, among others. Furthermore, Worley employs a critical perspective on how previous publications of Yucatec Maya oral literatures (some by anthropologists) often blunted Maya storytellers' agency as subjects in telling their own stories in the process of rendering these oral literatures as "folklore." As such, Worley's monograph is an interesting and valuable work on the contemporary relevance of indigenous languages in the face of the persistent ideologies that cast indigenous literatures as being either irrelevant or simply ancestral to homogenizing national identities.

The monograph addresses four broad arguments. The first of these arguments is that it is necessary to include oral literature in contemporary analyses of indigenous literary production. The second is that storytellers tell oral literatures in performative traditions in which the relationship between past and present is continuously being reevaluated in the telling. Third, storytelling is a form of discursive agency. Fourth, and finally, the prestige of the written word is challenged by those female and male writers who render indigenous literatures as storytelling events in their own literary works.

In the first chapter, Worley introduces the central concepts and themes of his work, particularly the role of storytelling in cultural control. For many contemporary indigenous writers in Mexico and Guatemala, the storyteller is "a position of agency from which one person performs a story and, in doing so, invokes the broader historical memory of an entire community" (p. 27). However, the Yucatec Maya stories published by cultural brokers from Mexico and the United States often imbue their own words with authority while deflecting the Maya storyteller's agency

through the discursive mode of Latin American indigenismo, which Worley labels "the discourse of the *Indio*." Worley demonstrates this contrast in the second chapter through a comparative analysis of versions of "The Dwarf of Uxmal" (published in the 19th century by John Lloyd Stephens of the United States and the Yucatecan friar Estanislao Carrillo) and two contemporary versions that Worley collected in the community of Santa Elena. The monograph's third chapter extends this critical analysis of the "discourse of the *Indio*" to 20th-century publications by Mexican and non-Mexican cultural brokers. Here Worley makes insightful connections between the folklore publications of Yucatecan scholars like Antonio Mediz Bolio and the near-contemporaneous anthropological and archaeological projects of Manuel Gamio and Sylvanus Morley. He goes on to demonstrate how many later 20th-century publications of Yucatec Maya stories by *indigenista* folklorists continued to render their indigenous contemporaries as ahistorical nonagents. Although these projects promoted Yucatán's distinctiveness in contrast with the emphasis on the Aztecs in Mexican national narratives, they still sought "to assimilate the *Indio* as the mestizo's ancestor" (p. 94). Worley rightly criticizes such perspectives, which continue to be expressed today in anthologies of Latin American literature that locate colonial and even contemporary indigenous texts as pre-Columbian "precursors" to national literatures consisting solely of European language works.

The fourth and fifth chapters bring Worley's analysis into the late 20th and early 21st centuries. Worley interprets performances by his collaborator Mariano Bonilla Caamal of stories of the trickster "Juan Rabbit" and "The Waiter and the Gringo." In contrast with the ahistorical nonagent of the *indigenista* folklorists, he argues that Maya storytellers' performances constitute a kind of discursive agency in which stories are related to contemporary realities within an expressly pro-Maya ideological orientation. The final chapter interprets literature by three contemporary female Maya authors (Góngora Pacheco, Martínez Huchim, and Cuevas Cob) whose written works employ the traditional storytelling frame as a means of self-reflexive cultural critique.

As a work of comparative literary criticism, Worley's historical and critical perspectives are laudable. Given his emphasis on storytelling and oral formulae, anthropologists may feel his analysis of performance would have been much enriched by a more sustained engagement with the literature on performance theory in linguistic anthropology from

the last several decades (e.g., Bauman and Briggs 1990). Although Worley also asserts the importance of oral storytelling in Maya communities as “a strategic response to invading Europeans’ destruction of indigenous writing systems” (p. 8), he does not explicitly address the scholarship on orality and literature in Maya hieroglyphic texts (e.g., Hull and Carrasco 2012) nor that on colonial Yucatec Maya adaptations of European stories like “The Tale of the Wise Maiden” that appears in several different Books of Chilam Balam (e.g., Bricker and Miram 2002). These caveats aside, Worley succeeds in his stated goals, and the monograph is an important work on the continuing decolonization of indigenous literatures.

## REFERENCES CITED

- Bauman, Richard, and Charles L. Briggs  
1990 Poetics and Performance as Critical Perspectives on Language and Social Life. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 19: 59–88.
- Bricker, Victoria R., and Helga-Maria Miram, trans. and annotators  
2002 *An Encounter of Two Worlds: The Book of Chilam Balam of Kaua*. Middle American Research Institute Publication, 68. New Orleans: Tulane University.
- Hull, Kerry M. and Michael D. Carrasco, eds.  
2012 *Parallel Worlds: Genre, Discourse and Poetics in Contemporary, Colonial, and Classic Maya Literature*. Boulder: University Press of Colorado.