

Pācittiya #21: Unauthorized Exhortation of Nuns

On this occasion the Buddha, the Blessed One, was dwelling at Sāvatti, at Jeta's Grove, in Anāthapiṇḍika's park. Furthermore, on this occasion, senior monks exhorting nuns were receivers of robes, almsfood, lodgings, supplies for the sick, and medicinal equipment. Then [some] group-of-six monks thought, "Venerables, at present senior monks exhorting nuns are receivers of robes, almsfood, lodgings, supplies for the sick, and medicinal equipment. Come, Venerables, we [will] also exhort nuns." Then the group-of-six monks approached the nuns and said: "Sisters, approach us as well; we will also exhort."

Then those nuns approached the group-of-six monks; after approaching and paying respects to the group-of-six monks, they sat to one side. Then the group-of-six monks, after giving just a brief⁴⁸⁹ Dhamma talk, spent the day with animal talk, then dismissed [the nuns]: "Go, sisters." Then those nuns approached the Blessed One; after approaching and paying respects to the Blessed One, they stood to one side. While they were standing to one side, the Blessed One said to those nuns: "Nuns, perhaps the exhortation was a success?" "Bhante, how could the exhortation be a success! The group-of-six gentlemen, after giving just a brief Dhamma talk, spent the day with animal talk, then dismissed [us]!" Then the Blessed One instructed, encouraged, energized, and gladdened those nuns with a Dhamma talk. Then those nuns - instructed, encouraged, energized, and gladdened by the Blessed One's Dhamma talk - after paying respects to and venerating the Blessed One, left.

Then the Blessed One, on account of this issue, on account of this incident, after convoking the community of monks, questioned the group-of-six monks: "Is it true that you, monks, after giving just a brief Dhamma talk to the nuns, spent the day with animal talk, then dismissed [them]?" "It is true, Blessed One." The Buddha, the Blessed One, reprimanded... "How is it that you, foolish men, after giving just a brief Dhamma talk to the nuns and spending the day with animal talk, will dismiss [them]! This is not, foolish men, for the faith of the faithless..." After giving a Dhamma talk, he announced to the monks: "Monks, I allow [you] to authorize a nun-exhorter. And thus, monks, it is to be authorized. First, a monk is to ask. Having been asked, the community is to be notified by an experienced, competent monk:

"Bhantes, may the community hear me. When the community is ready, the community may authorize the monk Such-name as a nun-exhorter. This is the notification.

"Bhantes, may the community hear me. The community authorizes the monk Such-name as a nun-exhorter. Any venerable who approves of this - authorization as a nun-exhorter for the monk Such-name - may be silent; whoever does not approve may speak.

"A second time I speak of this matter.. A third time I speak of this matter: Bhantes, may the community hear me. The community authorizes the monk Such-name as a nun-

⁴⁸⁹ *Paritta*. This can also mean "insignificant."

exhorter. Any venerable who approves of this – authorization as a nun-exhorter for the monk Such-name – may be silent; whoever does not approve may speak.

“The monk Such-name is authorized by the community as a nun-exhorter. The community approves, therefore it is silent; thus do I hold it.”

Then the Blessed One, after reprimanding the group-of-six monks in various ways for being difficult to put up with... “And thus, monks, you may recite this training rule:

“If any unauthorized monk exhorts nuns: a Pācittiya.”

And thus this training rule was designated for the monks by the Blessed One.

On a [later] occasion, authorized senior monks exhorting nuns were still receivers of robes, almsfood, lodgings, supplies for the sick, and medicinal equipment. Then the group-of-six monks thought, “Venerables, at present authorized senior monks exhorting nuns are still receivers of robes, almsfood, lodgings, supplies for the sick, and medicinal equipment. Come, Venerables, having gone outside the boundary and authorized each other as nun-exhorters, we will exhort nuns.” Then the group-of-six monks, having gone outside the boundary and authorized each other as nun-exhorters, approached nuns and said this: “Sisters, we are also authorized. Approach us as well. We will also exhort.”

Then those nuns approached the group-of-six monks; having approached and paid respects to the group-of-six monks, they sat to one side. Then the group-of-six monks, after giving just a brief Dhamma talk, spent the day with animal talk, then dismissed [the nuns]: “Go, sisters.” Then those nuns approached the Blessed One; after approaching and paying respects to the Blessed One, they stood to one side. While they were standing to one side, the Blessed One said to those nuns: “Nuns, perhaps the exhortation was a success?” “Bhante, how could the exhortation be a success! The group-of-six gentlemen, having given just a brief Dhamma talk, spent the day with animal talk, then dismissed [us]!” Then the Blessed One instructed, encouraged, energized, and gladdened those nuns with a Dhamma talk. Then those nuns – instructed, encouraged, energized, and gladdened by the Blessed One's Dhamma talk – after paying respects to and venerating the Blessed One, left.

Then the Blessed One, on account of this issue, on account of this incident, having assembled the community of monks, questioned the group-of-six monks: “Is it true that you, monks, having given just a brief Dhamma talk for the nuns, spent the day with animal talk, then dismissed [them]?” “It is true, Blessed One.” The Buddha, the Blessed One, reprimanded... “How is it that you, foolish men, after giving just a brief Dhamma talk for the nuns and spending the day with animal talk, will dismiss [them]! This is not, foolish men, for the faith of the faithless...” After giving a Dhamma talk, he announced to the monks: “Monks, I allow [you] to authorize a monk endowed with eight factors as a nun-exhorter.

[1] “He is virtuous, he dwells restrained by the restraint of the Pātimokkha, he is perfect in conduct and range, seeing danger [even] in tiny faults, he trains having taken up the training-rules;

[2] “He is very learned, he remembers what he has learned, he accumulates learning; those teachings which are good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in their conclusion, with the meaning and phrasing, that declare a completely perfect and totally pure holy life – he has learned much of such teachings, he is a rememberer, verbal reciter, and mental examiner [of them], [they are] well-penetrated by view;

[3] “Furthermore, he has learned by heart both Pātimokkhas⁴⁹⁰ in detail, well divided, well regulated, well investigated, by rule and by attribute;

[4] “He has a good voice and is a good speaker;

[5] “He is pleasant and agreeable for most of the nuns;

[6] “He is competent to exhort nuns;

[7] “He did not commit an offense of a serious nature against someone wearing monastic robes prior to his going-forth under the Blessed One;⁴⁹¹

[8] “He has twenty Rains or in excess of twenty Rains;

“Monks, I allow [you] to authorize a monk endowed with these eight factors as a nun-exhorter.”

Any monk: ...

Unauthorized: Not authorized by an action with the notification as the fourth⁴⁹².

Nuns: Ordained by both communities.

Exhorts: He exhorts with the eight rules of respect⁴⁹³: a Pācittiya offense. He exhorts with another teaching: a Dukkaṭa offense. He exhorts a one-side-ordained⁴⁹⁴ [nun]: a Dukkaṭa offense.

⁴⁹⁰ The rules for both the monks and the nuns.

⁴⁹¹ This could also be translated “... offense of a serious nature *for* someone wearing monastic robes...” The grammar of this sentence gives no clue as to which interpretation is to be preferred. As the rule is about what makes someone qualified to exhort nuns, that seems to favor the translation used in the main body of the text (ie, he never did anything grossly offensive to a nun before he became a monk, and thus is less likely to abuse his position as a nun-exhorter).

⁴⁹² Ie, a total of four statements: a notification and three announcements.

⁴⁹³ *Garudhamma*, rendered here as “rules of respect”, could also be rendered “serious issues”.

⁴⁹⁴ Ie, a nun who has received full ordination from the community of nuns, but whose ordination has not yet been verified by the community of monks.

By the authorized monk: After sweeping the chamber, setting out water for drinking and washing, preparing seats, and obtaining a companion, he is to sit. By the nuns: After going there and paying respects to the monk, they are to sit to one side. By the monk, it is to be asked: “Are you in concord, Sisters?” If they say, “We are in concord, Sir,” [he is to say] “Sisters, do the eight rules of respect persist?” If they say, “They persist, Sir”, [then saying] “This, Sisters, is the exhortation,” [the exhortation] is to be given. If they say, “They do not persist, Sir,” they are to be expounded:

[1] “By a nun ordained for a hundred Rains, welcoming, reverence, *añjali*, and homage are to be performed for a monk ordained that day; having honored, respected, revered, and venerated this teaching, it is not to be passed over for the duration of this life.

[2] “The Rains is not to be lived out by a nun in a residence without a monk; having honored... for the duration of this life.

[3] “Each fortnight, two things are to be expected by the nuns from the community of monks: asking for the Uposatha, and approaching for the exhortation⁴⁹⁵; having honored...”

[4] “Having emerged from the Rains[-retreat], both communities are to be invited⁴⁹⁶ by the nuns by means of three conditions: what has been seen, heard, or suspected; having honored...”

[5] “Having violated a rule of respect, a fortnight-long period of penance is to be performed by the nun in both communities...”⁴⁹⁷

[6] “Having practiced the training of six Dhammas⁴⁹⁸ for two years, ordination is to be sought by a female trainee in both communities...”

[7] “A monk is not to be reviled or censured by a nun in any way whatsoever...”

[8] “From this day forth: admonishment of monks by nuns is prohibited, admonishment of nuns by monks is not prohibited; having honored, respected, revered, and venerated this teaching, it is not to be passed over for the duration of this life.”

If one speaks another teaching⁴⁹⁹ to [nuns] saying “We are in concord, Sir”: a Dukkaṭa offense.

If one speaks the eight rules of respect to [nuns] saying “We are factious, Sir”: a Dukkaṭa offense.

⁴⁹⁵ The nuns can expect to be allowed to ask when the Uposatha is, and to approach for an exhortation.

⁴⁹⁶ *Pavāretabba*. This refers to the Pavāraṇa ceremony, where monastics ask each other for feedback about their conduct.

⁴⁹⁷ One period of penance encompassing both communities.

⁴⁹⁸ The six precepts of a female trainee (*sikkhamānā*).

⁴⁹⁹ An unauthorized monk teaches them something other than the eight rules of respect just listed.

Having not given an exhortation, one speaks another teaching: a Dukkaṭa offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as invalid⁵⁰⁰, perceiving a factious community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as invalid, in doubt about a factious community of nuns, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as invalid, perceiving a factious community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

In doubt about an invalid act, perceiving a factious community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

In doubt about an invalid act, in doubt about a factious community of nuns, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

In doubt about an invalid act, perceiving a factious community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as valid, perceiving a factious community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as valid, in doubt about a factious community of nuns, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as valid, perceiving a factious community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as invalid, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as invalid, in doubt about a concordant community of nuns, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as invalid, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

In doubt about an invalid act, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

In doubt about an invalid act, in doubt about a concordant community of nuns, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

In doubt about an invalid act, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as valid, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as valid, in doubt about a concordant community of nuns, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as valid, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Pācittiya offense.

⁵⁰⁰ Either the authorization procedure was not performed correctly, or the monk was never authorized at all.

Perceiving a valid act as invalid, perceiving a factious community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as invalid, in doubt about a factious community of nuns, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as invalid, perceiving a factious community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

In doubt about a valid act, perceiving a factious community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

In doubt about a valid act, in doubt about a factious community of nuns, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

In doubt about a valid act, perceiving a factious community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as valid, perceiving a factious community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as valid, in doubt about a factious community of nuns, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as valid, perceiving a factious community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as invalid, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as invalid, in doubt about a concordant community of nuns, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as invalid, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

In doubt about a valid act, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

In doubt about a valid act, in doubt about a concordant community of nuns, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

In doubt about a valid act, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as valid, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as factious, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as valid, in doubt about a concordant community of nuns, one exhorts: a Dukkata offense.

Perceiving a valid act as valid, perceiving a concordant community of nuns as concordant, one exhorts: non-offense.

Non-offense[s]: Giving an explanation; giving a line of questioning; being told “Expound, Sir,” one expounds; one asks a question; when asked a question, one speaks; when speaking for the sake of another, nuns hear; to a female trainee; to a female novice; for one who is crazy; for the first offender.