

## **Pācittiya #79: Criticizing a Legitimate Act of the Saṅgha After Consenting To It**

On this occasion the Buddha, the Blessed One, was dwelling at Sāvattī, at Jeta's grove, in Anāthapiṇḍika's park. Furthermore, on this occasion, [some] group-of-six monks, after engaging in misconduct, when the [disciplinary] action was being performed, rejected it for each one. Furthermore, on this occasion, the Saṅgha was seated together with some kind of business. The group-of-six monks were making robe[s]; they gave the consent of one<sup>664</sup>. Then the Saṅgha, [thinking] “Venerables, this group-of-six monk has come alone; come, we will perform a [disciplinary] action against him,” performed a [disciplinary] action against that one. Then that monk approached the [other] group-of-six monks. The group-of-six monks said to that monk, “Venerable, what did the Saṅgha do?” “Venerable, the Saṅgha performed a [disciplinary] action against me.” “Venerable, we did not give consent for this purpose: ‘it will perform a [disciplinary] action against you.’ If we had known it would perform a [disciplinary] action against you, we would not have given our consent.” Those monks who were of few wishes... denounced, criticized, and castigated: “How is it that group-of-six monks, after giving consent for a legitimate action, will later on engage in criticizing?” ... “Is it true that you, monks, after giving consent for a legitimate action, later on engaged in criticizing?” “It is true, Blessed One.” The Buddha, the Blessed One, reprimanded... “How is it that you, foolish men, after giving consent for a legitimate action, will later on engage in criticizing? This is not, foolish men, for the faith of the faithless... And thus, monks, you may recite this training rule:

**“If any monk, after giving consent for a legitimate action, later on engages in criticizing: a Pācittiya.”**

**Any monk: ...**

**Legitimate action:** Action by permission<sup>665</sup>; action by notification; action with notification as the second; [or] action with notification as the fourth; done in line with Dhamma, Vinaya, [and] the Teacher's instructions: that is called a legitimate action. After giving consent, one criticizes: a Pācittiya offense.

Perceiving a valid act as valid, after giving consent, one criticizes: a Pācittiya offense.  
In doubt about a valid act...: a Dukkāṭa offense.  
Perceiving a valid act as invalid...: non-offense.

Perceiving an invalid act as valid: a Dukkāṭa offense.  
In doubt about a valid act: a Dukkāṭa offense.  
Perceiving an invalid act as invalid: non-offense.

---

<sup>664</sup> That is, they sent one monk to represent the whole group.

<sup>665</sup> *Apalokana-kamma*.

**Non-offense[s]:** Knowing, “The action was not done in line with Dhamma, or it was done factiously, or it was done for someone who did not deserve it,” one criticizes; for one who is crazy; for the first offender.