

Saṅghādisesa #12: Rejecting Admonishment

On this occasion the Buddha, the Blessed One, was dwelling at Kosambī, in Ghosita's Park. Furthermore, on this occasion, Venerable Channa engaged in misconduct. [Other] monks said, "Venerable Channa, don't act like that. That is not allowed." He said, "What is it to you, Venerable, that you think I am to be spoken to? I should speak to you. The Buddha is ours, the Dhamma is ours, the Dhamma was realized by our young master. Just as a great wind when it is blowing might push together grass, sticks, and fallen leaves; or just as a river coming down a mountain might push together foliage, moss, and ferns; in the same way, from various names, clans, births, and families you have been swept together when you have gone forth. What is it to you, Venerable, that you think I am to be spoken to? I should speak to you. The Buddha is ours, the Dhamma is ours, the Dhamma was realized by our young master."

Those monks who were of few wishes... denounced, criticized, and castigated: "how is it that Venerable Channa, when being spoken to by the monks in accordance with Dhamma, will make himself impossible to speak to?" Then those monks, after reprimanding Venerable Channa in many ways, reported this matter to the Blessed One... "Is it true that you, Channa, when being spoken to by the monks in accordance with Dhamma, made yourself impossible to speak to?" "It is true, Blessed One." The Buddha, the Blessed One, reprimanded... "How is it that you, foolish man, when being spoken to by the monks in accordance with Dhamma, will make yourself impossible to speak to? This is not, foolish man, for the faith of the faithless... And thus, monks, you may recite this training-rule:

"If a monk is by nature difficult to speak to, and when being spoken to by the monks in accordance with Dhamma about the training-rules included in the [Pātimokkha] recitation, he makes himself impossible to speak to, [saying] 'The Venerables should not say anything to me - good or bad. I also will not say anything to the Venerables - good or bad. Let the Venerables refrain from speaking to me,' that monk is to be spoken to by the [other] monks in this way: 'The Venerable should not make himself impossible to speak to. Let the Venerable make himself possible to speak to. Let the Venerable speak to the monks in accordance with Dhamma. The monks will also speak to the Venerable in accordance with Dhamma. For in this way there is development for the Blessed One's assembly - that is, by speaking to one another and rehabilitating²⁶⁵ one another.' And when that monk is being spoken to in this way by the [other] monks, if he holds on to that same [position], that monk is to be admonished by the [other] monks up to a third time for the relinquishment of that [position]. When admonished up to the third time, if he relinquishes that [position] that is skillful. If he does not relinquish [that position]: a Saṅghādisesa."

²⁶⁵ *Vuṭṭhāpana*. Lit. "causing to rise out of." That is, out of misbehavior.

If a monk is by nature difficult to speak to: He is difficult to speak to, endowed with qualities that make [him] difficult to speak to, intolerant, an irreverent receiver of instruction.

About the training-rules included in the recitation: About the training-rules included in the Pātimokkha.

By the monks: By other monks.

In accordance with Dhamma: A training-rule which was designated by the Blessed One is called “in accordance with Dhamma.” When being spoken to with reference to that [rule], one makes oneself impossible to speak to, [saying] “The Venerables should not say anything to me – good or bad. I also will not say anything to the Venerables – good or bad. Let the Venerables refrain from speaking to me.”

That monk: The monk who is by nature difficult to speak to.

By the monks: By other monks.

This is to be said by those who see [and] those who hear: “The Venerable should not make himself impossible to speak to. Let the Venerable make himself possible to speak to. Let the Venerable speak to the monks in accordance with Dhamma. The monks will also speak to the Venerable in accordance with Dhamma. For in this way there is development for the Blessed One's assembly – that is, by speaking to one another and rehabilitating one another.” A second time as well it is to be said. A third time as well it is to be said. If he relinquishes, that is skillful; if he does not relinquish: a Dukkaṭa offense. After hearing, they do not speak: a Dukkaṭa offense. After taking that monk to the midst of the Saṅgha, this is to be said: “The Venerable should not make himself impossible to speak to... rehabilitating one another.” A second time as well it is to be said. A third time as well it is to be said. If he relinquishes, that is skillful; if he does not relinquish: a Dukkaṭa offense. The monk is to be admonished. And thus, monks, [he] is to be admonished: the Saṅgha is to be notified by an experienced, competent monk -

“Bhantes, may the Saṅgha hear me. This monk, named such-and-such, when being spoken to by the monks in accordance with Dhamma, makes himself impossible to speak to. He does not relinquish that point. When the Saṅgha is ready, the Saṅgha may admonish the monk named such-and-such to bring about the relinquishing of that view. This is the notification.

“Bhantes, may the Saṅgha hear me. This monk, named such-and-such, when being spoken to by the monks in accordance with Dhamma, makes himself impossible to speak to. He does not relinquish that point. The Saṅgha admonishes the monk named such-and-such to bring about the relinquishing of that point. Any Venerable who approves of admonishing the monk named such-and-such to bring about the relinquishing of that point may be silent; whoever does not approve may speak.

“A second time as well I speak of this matter...

“A third time as well I speak of this matter. Bhantes, may the Saṅgha hear me. This monk, named such-and-such, when being spoken to by the monks in accordance with Dhamma, makes himself impossible to speak to. He does not relinquish that point. The Saṅgha admonishes the monk named such-and-such to bring about the relinquishing of that point. Any Venerable who approves of admonishing the monk named such-and-such to bring about the relinquishing of that point may be silent; whoever does not approve may speak.

“The monk named such-and-such has been admonished by the Saṅgha to bring about the relinquishing of that point. The Saṅgha approves, therefore it is silent; thus do I hold it.”

With the notification: a Dukkaṭa. With the two proclamations: [two] Thullaccayas. When the proclamations are finished: a Saṅghādisesa offense. For one who commits [this] Saṅghādisesa, the Dukkaṭa with the notification and the Thullaccayas with the two proclamations subside.

Saṅghādisesa: ...

Perceiving it as a valid act when it is a valid act, one does not relinquish: a Saṅghādisesa offense.

In doubt when it is a valid act...: a Saṅghādisesa offense.

Perceiving it as not a valid act when it is a valid act...: a Saṅghādisesa offense.

Perceiving it as a valid act when it is not a valid act: a Dukkaṭa offense.

In doubt when it is not a valid act: a Dukkaṭa offense.

Perceiving it as not a valid act when it is not a valid act: a Dukkaṭa offense.

Non-offense[s]: For one who is not admonished; for one who relinquishes; for one who is crazy; for the first offender.