WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

WT/DS388/1 G/L/880 G/SCM/D82/1 G/AG/GEN/80 8 January 2009

(09-0027)

Original: English/

Spanish

CHINA – GRANTS, LOANS AND OTHER INCENTIVES

Request for Consultations by Mexico

The following communication, dated 19 December 2008, from the delegation of Mexico to the delegation of China and to the Chairman of the Dispute Settlement Body, is circulated in accordance with Article 4.4 of the DSU.

The Government of Mexico hereby requests consultations with the Government of the People's Republic of China ("PRC") pursuant to Articles 1 and 4 of the Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes, Article XXII:1 of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994 ("GATT 1994"), Articles 4 and 30 of the Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures ("SCM Agreement"), and Article 19 of the Agreement on Agriculture, with regard to certain measures offering grants, loans, and other incentives to enterprises in China. As required by Article 4.2 of the SCM Agreement, a Statement of Available Evidence is attached to this request for consultations.

- A. These grants, loans, and other incentives are reflected in the following measures, as well as in any amendments or any related or implementing measures:
- I. The instruments below relate to the *China World Top Brand* Programme:
 - CWTB-1. *Circular on Carrying Out Evaluation of Products to Be Recognized as China World Top Brand*¹;
 - CWTB-2. Circular on Application of China World Top Brands in 2006²;
 - CWTB-3. *Circular on Application of China World Top Brands in* 2008³;
 - CWTB-4. *Measures for the Administration of Chinese Name-Brand Products*⁴;

¹ GZJZ [2005] No. 95.

² ZJZH [2006] No. 11.

³ ZJZH [2008] No. 23.

⁴ AQSIQ Order No. 12 (29 December 2001).

- CWTB-5. Notice Concerning the Issuing of Opinions on Promoting the Brand-Driven Strategy & Its Incentive Measures⁵;
- CWTB-6. Notices Concerning Printing and Distributing the Implementation Regulation on Economic Development Fund Supporting Industrial Technology Progress in Futian District Shenzhen⁶;
- CWTB-7. Notices of Gansu Provincial People's Government Concerning Printing and Distributing Incentive Methods for Enterprises Entitled with Famous Brand Products in Gansu Province⁷;
- CWTB-8. Notice on Methods of Implementing Brand Praise and Incentive for Industrial Enterprises in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region⁸;
- CWTB-9. Several Related Policies on Implementation of Guiyang's Science and Technology Development Planning During the "Eleventh Five-Year Plan" (2006-2010)⁹;
- CWTB-10. Opinions of the Party Committee and People's Government of Jinhua City on Promoting the Building of "Jinhua Brand"¹⁰;
- CWTB-11. Circular of Jiujiang Municipal People's Government on Adjusting and Enriching the Incentive Policy for Creating a City of Brand¹¹;
- CWTB-12. Circular on Printing and Distributing the Method of Nanhai District, Foshan City for Supporting and Awarding Independent Innovation, Brand Drive and Enterprise IPO¹²;
- CWTB-13. Opinions of Nanping Municipal People's Government on Supporting Development of Key Industrial Enterprise¹³;
- CWTB-14. Opinions on Promoting Fast and Healthy Development of Characteristic Manufacturing Industry through Implementing Industrial Upgrading Projects¹⁴;
- CWTB-15. Circular of Sichuan Provincial People's Government on Printing and Distributing the "Opinions on Forcefully Pressing Ahead Industrial Brands Strategy in Sichuan"¹⁵;

⁵ FFB [2007] No. 274.

⁶ FBF [2007] No. 53.

⁷ GZF [2007] No. 72.

⁸ Gui Zheng Ban Fa [2007] No. 42.

⁹ ZFF [2006] No. 51.

¹⁰ SW [2006] No. 21.

¹¹ JZW [2007] No. 93.

¹² NF [2007] No. 128.

¹³ Nan Zheng Zong [2007] No. 219.

¹⁴ QWF [2007] No. 20.

¹⁵ CFF [2007] No. 38.

- CWTB-16. *Circular on Forwarding the Detailed Reward Rules for the Strategy of Drive with Top Brands in Suzhou City*¹⁶;
- CWTB-17. *Circular on Forwarding the Policy Measures for Pushing on the Strategy of Drive with Top Brands*¹⁷;
- CWTB-18. Notice Issued by the Office of Wenzhou Municipal Government for the Distribution of Quality & Branding Award Management Measures in Wenzhou¹⁸;
- CWTB-19. Opinions of Wuyi County Party Committee and People's Government on Further Encouraging and Promoting the Development of SMEs¹⁹;
- CWTB-20. Notices Concerning Printing and Distributing the Implementing Regulations Issued by the Bureau of Finance and the Economic Development Administration of Xiamen to Support the Development of High Quality Well-Known Products in Xiamen²⁰;
- CWTB-21. Suggestions on Supporting Key Industrial Enterprises Issued by the People's Government of Yandu District, Yancheng City²¹;
- CWTB-22. Suggestions on Accelerating the Implementation of Brand Strategy²²;
- CWTB-23. Circular on Ensuring Proper Use and Management of Guangdong Brand Development Fund²³;
- CWTB-24. Notice of Issuing the Directive on Supporting the Development of Name Brands for Export.²⁴
- II. The instruments below relate to the *Chinese Famous Export Brand* Programme:
 - FXB-1. Circular of the General Office of the State Bureau of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine for Issuing the "Measures for the Control of Evaluation of Chinese Famous-Brand Products (for Trial Implementation)"²⁵;
 - FXB-2. Notice of General Office of Ministry of Commerce Concerning Recommending Candidates of "Chinese Export Famous Brands" ?

¹⁶ SFB [2005] No. 109.

¹⁷ SFB [2005] No. 115.

¹⁸ WZB [2006] No. 147.

¹⁹ Available at: http://www.zjwy.gov.cn/dzwk/wj_style.jsp?fileID=1312.

²⁰ Xiacaiqui [2007] No. 21.

²¹ DZF [2007] No. 102.

²² ZZF [2007] No. 81.

²³ YCF [2007] No. 64.

²⁴ Shang Mao [2005] No. 124.

²⁵ Guozhijian [2001] No. 32.

²⁶ SBMH [2007] No. 25.

- FXB-3. Notice of Issuing the Directive on Supporting the Development of Name Brands for Export²⁷;
- FXB-4. Circular of Changxing County People's Government on Further Promoting Foreign Trade Development²⁸;
- FXB-5. Opinions of Deqing County People's Government on Strengthening the Building of Advanced Manufacturing Bases²⁹;
- FXB-6. Circular on Printing and Distributing the Policy Opinions for Accelerating Innovative Development of Industrial Economy³⁰;
- FXB-7. Notice Concerning the Issuing of Opinions on Promoting the Brand-Driven Strategy & Its Incentive Measures³¹;
- FXB-8. *Circular on Printing and Distributing the "Provisional Regulation on the Use of Fujian Export Brand Development Fund"*³²;
- FXB-9. Circular of the Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation Department of Fujian Province on Recommending Candidate Enterprise for the 2008-2009 "Famous Export Brands the Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation Department of Fujian Province Mainly Cultivates and Develops [Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation Department of Fujian Province]³³;
- FXB-10. Circular on Printing and Distributing the Opinions on Recognizing "Famous Export Brands the Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation Department of Guangdong Province Mainly Cultivates and Develops"³⁴;
- FXB-11. Suggestions on the "Export Brands Particularly Cultivated and Developed by the Department of Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation Department of Guangdong Province" (Revised Edition)³⁵;
- FXB-12. Notices Concerning Alternative Name List Supplementary to the Export Brands Particularly Cultivated and Developed by the Department of Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation of Guangdong Province³⁶;
- FXB-13. Circular on Ensuring Proper Use and Management of Guangdong Brand Development Fund³⁷;

²⁷ Shang Mao [2005] No. 124.

²⁸ CZF [2005] No. 45.

²⁹ DZF [2008] No. 29.

³⁰ CZF [2007] No. 54.

³¹ FFB [2007] No. 274.

³² MCW [2007] No. 17.

³³ MWJMF [2008] No. 31.

³⁴ YWJMJZ [2007] No. 1.

³⁵ Available at: http://www.gddoftec.gov.cn/jsmyc/main/shownews.asp?newsid=299&channalid=16.

³⁶ YWJMJH [2008] 31.

³⁷ YCF [2007] No. 64.

- FXB-14. Notice Regarding Support Policies to Promote the Development of Our City's Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation for 2005³⁸;
- FXB-15. Notice of the Administrative Office of the Hangzhou Municipal People's Government on Revision of the Evaluation and Selection Requirements and Award Measures for the "Golden Dragon Awards" in Hangzhou's Foreign Trade Export³⁹;
- FXB-16. Directives of the Administrative Office of the Hangzhou Municipal People's Government on Promoting the Development of Independent Export Brands⁴⁰;
- FXB-17. Circular of the Provincial Department of Commerce, Development and Reform Commission, Economic Commission, Department of Finance, Department of Science and Technology, Bureau of State Tax, Administration for Industry and Commerce, Bureau of Quality and Technical Supervision, and Entry-Exit Inspection and Quarantine Bureau of Heilongjiang Province and Harbin Customs on Printing and Distributing the "Guiding Opinions of Heilongjiang Province on Supporting the Development of Famous Export Brands⁴¹;
- FXB-18. Circular on Printing and Distributing the Newly Revised "Method for Selection of Henan Famous Export Brands" ;
- FXB-19. Guiding Opinions on Supporting the Development of Henan (Famous) Export Brands in the "11th Five-Year Plan" Period⁴³;
- FXB-20. Notice Regarding Selection of 2007-2008 "Jiangsu Province Export Brands for Focused Cultivation and Development" (44);
- FXB-21. Opinion on Promoting Better and Quicker Development of Private Economy⁴⁵;
- FXB-22. Opinion of the Party Committee and People's Government of Jinhua City on Promoting the Building of "Jinhua Brand"⁴⁶;
- FXB-23. Opinions of Jindong District Party Committee and People's Government of Jinhua City on Accelerating Industrial and Export-Oriented Economic Development⁴⁷;
- FXB-24. Circular of Jiujiang Municipal People's Government on Adjusting and Enriching the Incentive Policy for Creating a City of Brand⁴⁸;

³⁸ Hang Wai Jing Mao Ji Cai [2005] No. 225; Hang Cai Qi Er [2005] No. 602.

³⁹ Hang Zheng Ban [2007] No. 47.

⁴⁰ Hang Zheng Ban [2007] No. 10.

⁴¹ Hei Shang Lian Fa [2006] No. 1.

⁴² Yu Shang Mao [2008] No. 1.

⁴³ Yushangmao [2006] No. 13.

⁴⁴ Suwaijingmaomao 2007 No. 122.

⁴⁵ JZF [2007] No. 113.

⁴⁶ SW [2006] No. 21.

⁴⁷ Available at: http://zsj.jindong.gov.cn/news/ZCFG_9214/200811431343.html.

⁴⁸ JZW [2007] No. 93.

- FXB-25. Circular on Printing and Distributing the Method of Nanhai District, Foshan City for Supporting and Awarding Independent Innovation, Brand Drive and Enterprise IPO⁴⁹:
- FXB-26. Notice of the Department of Commerce and Department of Finance of Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region on Printing and Issuing the Administrative Measures of Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region for the Awarding and *Promoting of Brand Export Commodities*⁵⁰;
- FXB-27. Notice of the People's Government of Quanzhou Fengze District on Issuing *Regulations Concerning the Support to Key Enterprises*⁵¹;
- FXB-28. Opinion on Promoting Fast and Healthy Development of Characteristic Manufacturing Industry through Implementing Industrial Upgrading *Projects*⁵²;
- Notice on Printing and Distribution of 2006 Policies for Encouraging the FXB-29. *Development of Foreign Trade & Economic Cooperation in Shandong*⁵³;
- Opinions of Shaoxing Municipal People's Government on Further FXB-30. Encouraging the Development of Open Economy in Urban Areas⁵⁴;
- FXB-31. Circular of Sichuan Provincial People's Government on Printing and Distributing the "Opinions on Forcefully Pressing Ahead Industrial Brands Strategy in Sichuan"⁵⁵;
- FXB-32. Circular on Forwarding the Detailed Reward Rules for the Strategy of Drive with Top Brands in Suzhou City⁵⁶;
- FXB-33. Circular on Forwarding the Policy Measures for Pushing on the Strategy of *Drive with Top Brands*⁵⁷;
- FXB-34. Circular on Forwarding the Opinions of Foreign Trade Office of Tianjin Municipal Government on Accelerating Development of Proprietary Export *Brands of Tianjin City*⁵⁸;
- FXB-35. Circular of Wuxing District People's Government of Huzhou City on Further *Encouraging Foreign Trade Development*⁵⁹;

⁵⁰ Ning Shang (Gui Cai) FA [2006] No. 159.

⁴⁹ NF [2007] No. 128.

⁵¹ Quanfengzhengzong [2008] No. 22.

⁵² QWF [2007] No. 20.

⁵³ LCQ [2006] No. 5.

⁵⁴ SZF [2007] No. 66.

⁵⁵ CFF [2007] No. 38.

⁵⁶ SFB [2005] No. 109. ⁵⁷ SFB [2005] No. 115.

⁵⁸ JZF [2007] No. 005.

⁵⁹ WZF [2005] No. 9.

- FXB-36. *Opinion of Wuyi County Party Committee and People's Government on Further Encouraging and Promoting the Development of SMEs*⁶⁰;
- FXB-37. *Measures for Managing Xiamen's Key Export Enterprise Assistance Fund*⁶¹;
- FXB-38. Notice from the Xiamen Trade Development Bureau and the Xiamen Finance Bureau on the publishing of Measures for Managing Xiamen's Key Export Enterprise Assistance Fund Implementation Plan⁶²;
- FXB-39. CPC Committee of Yinzhou District, Ningbo City People's Government of Yinzhou District, Ningbo City Opinions on Promoting Economic Development of Yinzhou District⁶³;
- FXB-40. Notices on Publication of Interim Procedures on Management of Zhejiang Province Export Brands Fund⁶⁴;
- FXB-41. Notice Concerning Relevant Policies on Promotion of Foreign Trade & Economic Development in 2005⁶⁵;
- FXB-42. Suggestions on Accelerating the Implementation of Brand Strategy⁶⁶;
- FXB-43. Notice Issued by the Office of Wenzhou Municipal Government for the Distribution of Quality & Branding Award Management Measures in Wenzhou⁶⁷;
- FXB-44. Opinions on Accelerating Open Economy of Organizations Directly Under Municipal Government⁶⁸;
- FXB-45. Opinion of Nanping Municipal People's Government on Supporting Development of Key Industrial Enterprises⁶⁹;
- FXB-46. Circular on Printing and Distributing the Interim Measures of Yangzhou City for Administration of the Incentive Fund for Famous-brand Export Products⁷⁰;
- FXB-47. Implementing Rules of Support Policies for Patented Brands of Service Outsourcing Companies by Zhabei District⁷¹;

⁶⁰ Available at: http://www.zjwy.gov.cn/dzwk/wj_style.jsp?fileID=1312.

⁶¹ Xia Fu Ban [2006] No. 117.

⁶² Xiamen Trade Development Gui Cai [2006] No. 268.

⁶³ YYD [2008] No. 1.

⁶⁴ ZCQZ [2006] No. 207.

⁶⁵ ZCQZ [2005] No. 145.

⁶⁶ ZZF [2007] No. 81.

⁶⁷ WZB [2006] No. 147.

⁶⁸ LZF [2004] No. 38.

⁶⁹ Nan Zheng Zong [2007] No. 219.

⁷⁰ YCQ [2007] No. 23; YWJMM [2007] No. 008.

Fig. 71 Economic Commission of Zhabei District, Shanghai (June 2007) available at http://www.shiso.gov.cn/Policy/ZBPolicydetail.aspx?id=77.

- FXB-48. *Notices for Evaluation and Rewards of 2008-2009 Export Brand Particularly Cultivated and Developed in Heilongjiang*⁷²;
- FXB-49. *Measures for the Administration of Famous-Brand (Industrial) Products of Guangdong Province*⁷³;
- FXB-50. *Measures for the Administration of Famous-Brand (Agricultural) Products of Guangdong Province*⁷⁴;
- FXB-51. Circular of Ministry of Commerce, China Export & Credit Insurance Corporation Concerning Utilizing Export Credit Insurance to Support the Development of Name Brand Export.⁷⁵

III. The instruments below:

- L-1. Notice Regarding Support Policies to Promote the Development of Our City's Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation for 2005⁷⁶;
- L-2. Opinions of Jindong District Party Committee and People's Government of Jinhua City on Accelerating Industrial and Export-Oriented Economic Development⁷⁷;
- L-3. Opinions of Shaoxing Municipal People's Government on Further Encouraging the Development of Open Economy in Urban Areas⁷⁸;
- L-4. Notice Concerning Relevant Policies on Promotion of Foreign Trade & Economic Development in 2005⁷⁹;
- L-5. Circular of the Provincial Department of Commerce, Development and Reform Commission, Economic Commission, Department of Finance, Department of Science and Technology, Bureau of State Tax, Administration for Industry and Commerce, Bureau of Quality and Technical Supervision, and Entry-Exit Inspection and Quarantine Bureau of Heilongjiang Province and Harbin Customs on Printing and Distributing the "Guiding Opinions of Heilongjiang Province on Supporting the Development of Famous Export Brands⁸⁰:
- L-6. Opinions on Accelerating Open Economy of Organizations Directly Under Municipal Government⁸¹;

⁷³ Available at: http://www.lawinfochina.com/law/display.asp?db=1&id=2737&keyword=famous%20brand%20guangdong.

⁷² HSMF [2008] No. 37.

Available at: http://www.lawinfochina.com/law/display.asp?db=1&id=2768&keyword=famous%20brand%20guangdong.

⁷⁵ Shang Mao Fa [2005] No. 332.

⁷⁶ Hang Wai Jing Mao Ji Cai [2005] No. 225; Hang Cai Qi Er [2005] No. 602.

⁷⁷ Available at: http://zsj.jindong.gov.cn/news/ZCFG_9214/200811431343.html.

⁷⁸ SZF [2007] No. 66.

⁷⁹ ZCQZ [2005] No. 145.

⁸⁰ Hei Shang Lian Fa [2006] No. 1.

⁸¹ LZF [2004] No. 38.

- L-7. Circular of Nanchang Municipal People's Government on Printing and Distributing the Interim Measures for Administration of Nanchang Foreign Trade Development Fund⁸²;
- L-8. Trial Opinions of Jiangdong District, Ningbo City on Promoting Steady Foreign Trade Development⁸³;
- L-9. Opinions of Jiangdong District, Ningbo City on Promoting Steady Foreign Trade Development⁸⁴;
- L-10. 2005 Policies for Encouraging the Development of Foreign Trade & Economic Cooperation in Shandong⁸⁵;
- L-11. Notice on Printing and Distribution of 2006 Policies for Encouraging the Development of Foreign Trade & Economic Cooperation in Shandong⁸⁶;
- L-12. Notice on Printing and Distribution of 2003 Policies for Encouraging and Expanding Foreign Trade Export to Shandong⁸⁷;
- L-13. 2004 Policies for Encouraging the Development of Foreign Trade & Economic Cooperation in Shandong⁸⁸;
- L-14. Circular of Wuxing District People's Government on Further Encouraging the Development of Open Economy in Urban Areas⁸⁹;
- L-15. *Measures for Managing Xiamen's Key Export Enterprise Assistance Fund*⁹⁰;
- L-16. Notice from the Xiamen Trade Development Bureau and the Xiamen Finance Bureau on the publishing of Measures for Managing Xiamen's Key Export Enterprise Assistance Fund Implementation Plan⁹¹;
- L-17. *Opinions on Further Accelerating the Development of Open Economy* ⁹²;
- L-18. CPC Committee of Yinzhou District, Ningbo City People's Government of Yinzhou District, Ningbo City Opinions on Promoting Economic Development of Yinzhou District⁹³;
- L-19. Notices on Publication of Interim Procedures on Management of Zhejiang Province Export Brands Fund⁹⁴:

⁸⁴ Dong Zheng Fa [2005] No. 25.

⁸² Hong Fu Fa [2007] No. 31.

⁸³ DZF [2004] No. 13.

⁸⁵ Available at: http://shandong.mofcom.gov.cn/aarticle/sjtongzhigg/200502/20050200018389.html.

⁸⁶ LCQ [2006] No. 5.

⁸⁷ LWJMJCZ [2003] No. 180.

⁸⁸ LWJMJCZ [2003] No. 1037.

⁸⁹ SZF [2005] No. 9.

⁹⁰ Xia Fu Ban [2006] No. 117.

⁹¹ Xiamen Trade Development Gui Cai [2006] No. 268.

⁹² XZF [2007] No. 1.

⁹³ YYD [2008] No. 1.

⁹⁴ ZCQZ [2006] No. 207.

- L-20. Circular on Changxing County People's Government on Further Promoting Foreign Trade Development⁹⁵;
- L-21. Notices Concerning Printing and Distributing the Implementation Regulation on Economic Development Fund Supporting Industrial Technology Progress in Futian District Shenzhen⁹⁶;
- L-22. Notice Issued by the Office of Wenzhou Municipal Government for the Distribution of Quality & Branding Award Management Measures in Wenzhou⁹⁷;
- L-23. Notice of the Administrative Office of the Hangzhou Municipal People's Government on Revision of the Evaluation and Selection Requirements and Award Measures for the "Golden Dragon Awards" in Hangzhou's Foreign Trade Export⁹⁸;
- L-24. Directives of the Administrative Office of the Hangzhou Municipal People's Government on Promoting the Development of Independent Export Brands⁹⁹;
- L-25. Notice of the People's Government of Quanzhou Fengze District on Issuing Regulations Concerning the Support to Key Enterprises¹⁰⁰;
- L-26. Notice on Recommending of Alternative Name List for 2005-2006 "Export Brand Merchandise in Shanghai" ;
- L-27. Implementing Rules of Support Policies for Patented Brands of Service Outsourcing Companies by Zhabei District¹⁰²;
- L-28. Notice of Shanghai Municipal Commission of Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation for Carrying out Confirmation of 2007-2008 "Export Brands in Shanghai" 103;
- L-29. *Measures on Promoting the Development of the City Open Economy in* 2006^{104} ;
- L-30. *Notices for Evaluation and Rewards of 2008-2009 Export Brand Particularly Cultivated and Developed in Heilongjiang*¹⁰⁵;

⁹⁶ FBF [2007] No. 53.

⁹⁵ CZF [2005] No. 45.

⁹⁷ WZB [2006] No. 147.

⁹⁸ Hang Zheng Ban [2007] No. 47.

⁹⁹ Hang Zheng Ban [2007] No. 10.

¹⁰⁰ Quanfengzhengzong [2008] No. 22.

¹⁰¹ HJMMC [2005] No. 143.

Economic Commission of Zhabei District, Shanghai (June 2007) available at http://www.shiso.gov.cn/Policy/ZBPolicydetail.aspx?id=77.

¹⁰³ *Available at:* http://www.1128.org/html/dzzw/ggl/2008/08/doc45735.shtml.

¹⁰⁴ Available at: http://www.zh.gov.cn/English/Investment/Policy/200802/t20080218_19097.htm.

¹⁰⁵ HSMF [2008] No. 37.

- L-31. Notice Regarding Support Policies to Promote the Development of Our City's Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation for 2005¹⁰⁶;
- L-32. Notice Regarding Selection of 2007-2008 "Jiangsu Province Export Brands for Focused Cultivation and Development". 107
- B. The measures listed in Section A above appear to provide enterprises in China with grants, loans, and other incentives contingent upon export performance. Accordingly, the measures appear to be inconsistent with Article 3 of the SCM Agreement. Additionally, to the extent that these measures provide subsidies for agricultural products, they appear to be inconsistent with Articles 3, 9, and 10 of the Agreement on Agriculture. The measures also appear to be inconsistent with the PRC's obligations under paragraph 12.1 of Part I of its Accession Protocol¹⁰⁸, as well as paragraph 1.2 of Part I of its Accession Protocol (to the extent that it incorporates paragraph 234 of the Report of the Working Party on the Accession of China)¹⁰⁹, which forms part of the terms of accession agreed between the PRC and the WTO and is an integral part of the Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization. Finally, the grants, loans, and other incentives appear to be inconsistent with Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 to the extent that the measures benefit Chinese-origin products and not imported products.

Mexico reserves the right to raise further factual and legal claims during the course of the consultations. It looks forward to receiving the PRC Government's response in order to set a mutually convenient date for consultations.

109 WT/MIN(01)/3.

¹⁰⁶ Hang Wai Jing Mao Ji Cai [2005] No. 225; Hang Cai Qi Er [2005] No. 602.

¹⁰⁷ Suwaijingmaomao 2007 No. 122.

¹⁰⁸ WT/L/432.

Statement of Available Evidence

- 1. Circular of the General Office of the State Bureau of Quality Supervision, Inspection and Quarantine for Issuing the "Measures for the Control of Evaluation of Chinese Famous-Brand Products (for Trial Implementation)" 110;
- 2. Circular on Carrying Out Evaluation of Products to Be Recognized as China World Top Brand¹¹¹;
- *3. Circular on Application of China World Top Brands in* 2006¹¹²;
- 4. *Circular on Application of China World Top Brands in* 2008¹¹³;
- 5. *Measures for the Administration of Chinese Name-Brand Products*¹¹⁴;
- 6. Product Quality Law of the People's Republic of China¹¹⁵;
- 7. Decision of the State Council Concerning Several Issues on Further Strengthening Product Ouality Work¹¹⁶;
- 8. Notice Concerning the Issuing of Opinions on Promoting the Brand-Driven Strategy & Its Incentive Measures¹¹⁷;
- 9. Notice Concerning Printing and Distributing the Implementation Regulation on Economic Development Fund Supporting Industrial Technology Progress in Futian District Shenzhen¹¹⁸;
- 10. Notice of Gansu Provincial People's Government Concerning Printing and Distributing Incentive Methods for Enterprises Entitled with Famous Brand Products in Gansu Province¹¹⁹;
- 11. Notice on Methods of Implementing Brand Praise and Incentive for Industrial Enterprises in Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region¹²⁰;
- 12. Several Related Policies on Implementation of Guiyang's Science and Technology Development Planning During the "Eleventh Five-Year Plan" (2006-2010)¹²¹;

¹¹⁰ Guozhijian [2001] No. 32.

¹¹¹ GZJZ [2005] No. 95.

¹¹² ZJZH [2006] No. 11.

¹¹³ ZJZH [2008] No. 23.

¹¹⁴ AQSIQ Order No. 12 (29 December 2001).

¹¹⁵ Adopted at the 30th Meeting of the Standing Committee of the Seventh National People's Congress on 22 February 1993.

¹¹⁶ Issued by Document Guofa No. 24 [1999] of the State Council on 25 December 1999.

¹¹⁷ FFB [2007] No. 274.

¹¹⁸ FBF [2007] No. 53.

¹¹⁹ GZF [2007] No. 72.

¹²⁰ Gui Zheng Ban Fa [2007] No. 42.

¹²¹ ZFF [2006] No. 51.

- 13. Opinions of the Party Committee and People's Government of Jinhua City on Promoting the Building of "Jinhua Brand" ;
- 14. Circular on Jiujiang Municipal People's Government on Adjusting and Enriching the Incentive Policy for Creating a City of Brand¹²³;
- 15. Circular on Printing and Distributing the Method of Nanhai District, Foshan City for Supporting and Awarding Independent Innovation, Brand Drive and Enterprise IPO (NF [2007] No. 128);
- 16. Opinions of Nanping Municipal People's Government on Supporting Development of Key Industrial Enterprise¹²⁴;
- 17. Opinions on Promoting Fast and Healthy Development of Characteristic Manufacturing Industry through Implementing Industrial Upgrading Projects¹²⁵;
- 18. Circular of Sichuan Provincial People's Government on Printing and Distributing the "Opinions on Forcefully Pressing Ahead Industrial Brands Strategy in Sichuan" ;
- 19. Circular on Forwarding the Detailed Reward Rules for the Strategy of Drive with Top Brands in Suzhou City¹²⁷;
- 20. Circular on Forwarding the Policy Measures for Pushing on the Strategy of Drive with Top Brands¹²⁸;
- 21. Notice Issued by the Office of Wenzhou Municipal Government for the Distribution of Quality & Branding Award Management Measures in Wenzhou¹²⁹;
- 22. Opinions of Wuyi County Party Committee and People's Government on Further Encouraging and Promoting the Development of SMEs¹³⁰;
- 23. Notice Concerning Printing and Distributing the Implementing Regulations Issued by the Bureau of Finance and the Economic Development Administration of Xiamen to Support the Development of High Quality Well-Known Products in Xiamen¹³¹;
- 24. Suggestions on Supporting Key Industrial Enterprises Issued by the People's Government of Yandu District, Yancheng City¹³²;
- 25. Suggestions on Accelerating the Implementation of Brand Strategy¹³³;

¹²³ JZW [2007] No. 93.

¹²² SW [2006] No. 21.

¹²⁴ Nan Zheng Zong [2007] No. 219.

¹²⁵ OWF [2007] No. 20.

¹²⁶ CFF [2007] No. 38.

¹²⁷ SFB [2005] No. 109.

¹²⁸ SFB [2005] No. 115.

¹²⁹ WZB [2006] No. 147.

¹³⁰ Available at: http://www.zjwy.gov.cn/dzwk/wj_style.jsp?fileID=1312.

¹³¹ Xiacaiqui [2007] No. 21.

¹³² DZF [2007] No. 102.

¹³³ ZZF [2007] No. 81.

- 26. Circular on Ensuring Proper Use and Management of Guangdong Brand Development Fund¹³⁴;
- 27. Notice of Issuing the Directive on Supporting the Development of Name Brands for Export¹³⁵;
- 28. Notice of General Office of Ministry of Commerce Concerning Recommending Candidates of "Chinese Export Famous Brands" ;
- 29. Circular of Changxing County People's Government on Further Promoting Foreign Trade Development¹³⁷;
- 30. Opinions of Deqing County People's Government on Strengthening the Building of Advanced Manufacturing Bases¹³⁸;
- 31. Circular on Printing and Distributing the Policy Opinions for Accelerating Innovative Development of Industrial Economy¹³⁹;
- 32. Circular on Printing and Distributing the "Provisional Regulation on the Use of Fujian Export Brand Development Fund" ;
- 33. Circular of the Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation Department of Fujian Province on Recommending Candidate Enterprise for the 2008-2009 "Famous Export Brands the Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation Department of Fujian Province Mainly Cultivates and Develops" 141;
- 34. Circular on Printing and Distributing the Opinions on Recognizing "Famous Export Brands the Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation Department of Guangdong Province Mainly Cultivates and Develops" (142);
- 35. Suggestions on the "Export Brands Particularly Cultivated and Developed by the Department of Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation Department of Guangdong Province" (Revised edition)¹⁴³;
- 36. Notice Concerning Alternative Name List Supplementary to the Export Brands Particularly Cultivated and Developed by the Department of Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation of Guangdong Province¹⁴⁴;
- 37. Notice Regarding Support Policies to Promote the Development of Our City's Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation for 2005¹⁴⁵:

¹³⁵ Shang Mao [2005] No. 124.

¹³⁴ YCF [2007] No. 64.

¹³⁶ SBMH [2007] No. 25.

¹³⁷ CZF [2005] No. 45.

¹³⁸ DZF [2008] No. 29.

¹³⁹ CZF [2007] No. 54.

¹⁴⁰ MCW [2007] No. 17.

¹⁴¹ MWJMF [2008] No. 31.

¹⁴² YWJMJZ [2007] No. 1.

¹⁴³ Available at: http://www.gddoftec.gov.cn/jsmyc/main/shownews.asp?newsid=299&channalid=16.

¹⁴⁴ YWJMJH [2008] 31.

¹⁴⁵ Hang Wai Jing Mao Ji Cai [2005] No. 225; Hang Cai Qi Er [2005] No. 602.

- 38. Notice of the Administrative Office of the Hangzhou Municipal People's Government on Revision of the Evaluation and Selection Requirements and Award Measures for the "Golden Dragon Awards" in Hangzhou's Foreign Trade Export¹⁴⁶;
- 39. Directives of the Administrative Office of the Hangzhou Municipal People's Government on Promoting the Development of Independent Export Brands¹⁴⁷;
- 40. Circular of the Provincial Department of Commerce, Development and Reform Commission, Economic Commission, Department of Finance, Department of Science and Technology, Bureau of State Tax, Administration for Industry and Commerce, Bureau of Quality and Technical Supervision, and Entry-Exit Inspection and Quarantine Bureau of Heilongjiang Province and Harbin Customs on Printing and Distributing the "Guiding Opinions of Heilongjiang Province on Supporting the Development of Famous Export Brands¹⁴⁸;
- 41. Circular on Printing and Distribution the Newly Revised "Method for Selection of Henan Famous Export Brands" ;
- 42. Guiding Opinions on Supporting the Development of Henan (Famous) Export Brands in the "11th Five-Year Plan" Period¹⁵⁰;
- 43. Circular on Carrying Out Survey on the Brand Building Status of the Enterprises with Provincial Famous Export Brands¹⁵¹;
- 44. Notice Regarding Selection of 2007-2008 "Jiangsu Province Export Brands for Focused Cultivation and Development" ;
- 45. Opinions on Promoting Better and Quicker Development of Private Economy¹⁵³;
- 46. Opinions of Jindong District Party Committee and People's Government of Jinhua City on Accelerating Industrial and Export-Oriented Economic Development¹⁵⁴;
- 47. Status for the Support and Cultivation of Famous Export Brands in Jiangxi Province¹⁵⁵;
- 48. Notice of the Department of Commerce and Department of Finance of Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region on Printing and Issuing the Administrative Measures of Ningxia Hui Autonomous Region for the Awarding and Promoting of Brand Export Commodities¹⁵⁶;
- 49. Notice of the People's Government of Quanzhou Fengze District on Issuing Regulations Concerning the Support to Key Enterprises¹⁵⁷:

¹⁴⁶ Hang Zheng Ban [2007] No. 47.

¹⁴⁷ Hang Zheng Ban [2007] No. 10.

¹⁴⁸ Hei Shang Lian Fa [2006] No. 1.

¹⁴⁹ Yu Shang Mao [2008] No. 1.

¹⁵⁰ Yushangmao [2006] No. 13.

¹⁵¹ Available at: http://www.yzwjm.gov.cn/Article_Show.asp?ArticleID=1329.

¹⁵² Suwaijingmaomao 2007 No. 122.

¹⁵³ JZF [2007] No. 113.

¹⁵⁴ Available at: http://zsj.jindong.gov.cn/news/ZCFG 9214/200811431343.html.

¹⁵⁵ Special Commissioner's Office in Shanghai (19-04-2007).

¹⁵⁶ Ning Shang (Gui Cai) FA [2006] No. 159.

¹⁵⁷ Quanfengzhengzong [2008] No. 22.

- 50. Notice on Printing and Distribution of 2006 Policies for Encouraging the Development of Foreign Trade & Economic Cooperation in Shandong¹⁵⁸;
- 51. Opinions of Shaoxing Municipal People's Government on Further Encouraging the Development of Open Economy in Urban Areas¹⁵⁹;
- 52. Circular on Forwarding the Opinions of Foreign Trade Office of Tianjin Municipal Government on Accelerating Development of Proprietary Export Brands of Tianjin City¹⁶⁰;
- 53. Circular of Wuxing District People's Government of Huzhou City on Further Encouraging Foreign Trade Development¹⁶¹;
- 54. Measures for Managing Xiamen's Key Export Enterprise Assistance Fund¹⁶²;
- 55. Notice from the Xiamen Trade Development Bureau and the Xiamen Finance Bureau on the publishing of Measures for Managing Xiamen's Key Export Enterprise Assistance Fund Implementation Plan¹⁶³;
- 56. CPC Committee of Yinzhou District, Ningbo City People's Government of Yinzhou District, Ningbo City Opinions on Promoting Economic Development of Yinzhou District¹⁶⁴;
- 57. Notice on Publication of Interim Procedures on Management of Zhejiang Province Export Brands Fund¹⁶⁵;
- 58. Notice Concerning Relevant Policies on Promotion of Foreign Trade & Economic Development in 2005¹⁶⁶;
- 59. Opinions on Accelerating Open Economy of Organizations Directly Under Municipal Government¹⁶⁷;
- 60. Circular of Nanchang Municipal People's Government on Printing and Distributing the Interim Measures for Administration of Nanchang Foreign Trade Development Fund¹⁶⁸;
- 61. Trial Opinions of Jiangdong District, Ningbo City on Promoting Steady Foreign Trade Development¹⁶⁹;
- 62. Opinions of Jiangdong District, Ningbo City on Promoting Steady Foreign Trade Development¹⁷⁰;

¹⁵⁹ SZF [2007] No. 66.

¹⁵⁸ LCQ [2006] No. 5.

¹⁶⁰ JZF [2007] No. 005.

¹⁶¹ WZF [2005] No. 9.

¹⁶² Xia Fu Ban [2006] No. 117.

¹⁶³ Xiamen Trade Development Gui Cai [2006] No. 268.

¹⁶⁴ YYD [2008] No. 1.

¹⁶⁵ ZCQZ [2006] No. 207.

¹⁶⁶ ZCQZ [2005] No. 145.

¹⁶⁷ LZF [2004] No. 38.

¹⁶⁸ Hong Fu Fa [2007] No. 31.

¹⁶⁹ DZF [2004] No. 13.

¹⁷⁰ Dong Zheng Fa [2005] No. 25.

- 63. 2005 Policies for Encouraging the Development of Foreign Trade & Economic Cooperation in Shandong¹⁷¹;
- 64. Notice on Printing and Distribution of 2003 Policies for Encouraging and Expanding Foreign Trade Export to Shandong¹⁷²;
- 65. 2004 Policies for Encouraging the Development of Foreign Trade & Economic Cooperation in Shandong¹⁷³;
- 66. *Opinions on Further Accelerating the Development of Open Economy*¹⁷⁴;
- 67. Circular on Changxing County People's Government on Further Promoting Foreign Trade Development¹⁷⁵;
- 68. Circular on Printing and Distributing the Interim Measures of Yangzhou City for Administration of the Incentive Fund for Famous-brand Export Products¹⁷⁶;
- 69. Notice on Recommending of Alternative Name List for 2005-2006' "Export Brand Merchandise in Shanghai" 177;
- 70. Implementing Rules of Support Policies for Patented Brands of Service Outsourcing Companies by Zhabei District¹⁷⁸;
- 71. Measures for the Administration of Famous-Brand (Industrial) Products of Guangdong Province 179;
- 72. *Measures for the Administration of Famous-Brand (Agricultural) Products of Guangdong Province* ¹⁸⁰;
- 73. Notice of Shanghai Municipal Commission of Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation for Carrying out Confirmation of 2007-2008 "Export Brands in Shanghai" ;
- 74. *Measures on Promoting the Development of the City Open Economy in* 2006¹⁸²;
- 75. Shanghai Export Brands List of Awardees in 2005-2006¹⁸³;

¹⁷¹ Available at: http://shandong.mofcom.gov.cn/aarticle/sjtongzhigg/200502/20050200018389.html.

¹⁷² LWJMJCZ [2003] No. 180.

¹⁷³ LWJMJCZ [2003] No. 1037.

¹⁷⁴ XZF [2007] No. 1.

¹⁷⁵ CZF [2005] No. 45.

¹⁷⁶ YCQ [2007] No. 23; YWJMM [2007] No. 008.

¹⁷⁷ HJMMC [2005] No. 143.

Economic Commission of Zhabei District, Shanghai (June 2007) available at. http://www.shiso.gov.cn/Policy/ZBPolicydetail.aspx?id=77.

¹⁷⁹ Available at: http://www.lawinfochina.com/law/display.asp?db=1&id=2737&keyword=famous%20brand%20guangdong.

¹⁸⁰ Available at: http://www.lawinfochina.com/law/display.asp?db=1&id=2768&keyword=famous%20brand%20guangdong.

¹⁸¹ Available at: http://www.1128.org/html/dzzw/ggl/2008/08/doc45735.shtml.

¹⁸² Available at: http://www.zh.gov.cn/English/Investment/Policy/200802/t20080218_19097.htm.

¹⁸³ Available at: http://www.maofa.sh.cn/shangbiao/pingpai.asp.

WT/DS388/1, G/L/880, G/SCM/D82/1, G/AG/GEN/80 Page 18

- 11th Five Year Plan Guidelines 184; 76.
- *Notices for Evaluation and Rewards of 2008-2009 Export Brand Particularly Cultivated and Developed in Heilongjian*¹⁸⁵; *77*.
- *78*. Circular of Ministry of Commerce, China Export & Credit Insurance Corporation Concerning Utilizing Export Credit Insurance to Support the Development of Name Brand Export. 186

¹⁸⁴ Available at: http://ghs.ndrc.gov.cn/ghjd/115gyxj/010a.htm. ¹⁸⁵ HSMF [2008] No. 37.

¹⁸⁶ Shang Mao Fa [2005] No. 332.