

WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

WT/DS316/1/Add.1
G/L/697/Add.1
G/SCM/D62/1/Add.1
7 February 2006

(06-0480)

Original: English

EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES AND CERTAIN MEMBER STATES – MEASURES AFFECTING TRADE IN LARGE CIVIL AIRCRAFT

Request for Consultations by the United States

Addendum

The following communication, dated 31 January 2006, from the delegation of the United States to the delegations of the European Communities, France, Germany, Spain and the United Kingdom, and to the Chairman of the Dispute Settlement Body, is circulated in accordance with Article 4.4 of the DSU.

The United States refers to the 6 October 2004, request by the United States for consultations with the Governments of Germany, France, the United Kingdom, and Spain, and with the European Communities ("EC") (WT/DS316/1), the consultations held on 4 November 2004, and the US request for the establishment of a panel in that dispute (WT/DS316/2). The United States refers also to the statements to the Dispute Settlement Body (WT/DSB/M/191 and WT/DSB/M/194) in connection with the requests for the establishment of a panel, and the EC's *Request for Preliminary Rulings* filed on 26 October 2005, concerning the US request for the establishment of a Panel in the above-captioned dispute.

The United States is prepared, without prejudice either to its position on the EC's preliminary ruling request or to its rights in the panel established on 20 July 2005, to pursue consultations on the measures identified below. Such consultations might, in addition to the purposes outlined in Article 4 of the *Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes* ("DSU"), help to clarify, and if possible, resolve, the issues in the EC's preliminary ruling request.

Therefore, my authorities have instructed me to request consultations with the Governments of Germany, France, the United Kingdom, and Spain (the "member States"), and with the EC, further to Articles 1 and 4 of the DSU, Article XXIII:1 of the *General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994* ("GATT 1994"), and Articles 4, 7, and 30 of the *Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures* ("SCM Agreement") (to the extent that Article 30 incorporates Article XXIII of the GATT 1994) with regard to measures affecting trade in large civil aircraft. This request supplements and does not replace the request for consultations circulated as WT/DS316/1.

The United States considers that measures of the EC and the member States provide subsidies that are inconsistent with their obligations under the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994, including:

- (1) The provision by the member States of financing for large civil aircraft design and development to the Airbus companies¹ ("launch aid").² This financing provides benefits to the recipient companies including financing for projects that would otherwise not be commercially feasible. The non-commercial terms of the financing may include no interest or interest at below-market rates and a repayment obligation that is tied to sales. If the aircraft is not successful, some or all of the financing need not be repaid. Specific examples of the financing at issue include:
 - (a) French financing for the Airbus A300, A310, A320, A330/340, A330-200, A340-500/600, A380, and A350;
 - (b) German financing for the Airbus A300, A310, A320, A330/340, A380, and A350;
 - (c) United Kingdom financing for the Airbus A300, A310, A320, A330/340, A340-500/600, A380, and A350; and
 - (d) Spanish financing for the Airbus A300, A310, A320, A330/340, A340-500/600, A380, and A350.
- (2) In addition to launch aid, the provision by the EC and the member States, through the European Investment Bank ("EIB"), to the Airbus companies, of financing for large civil aircraft design, development, and other purposes. Specific examples of the financing at issue include:³
 - (a) Financing to British Aerospace for the A320 and the A330/A340;
 - (b) Financing to Aérospatiale, Aérospatiale Gramont and Aérospatiale Super Transporteurs for the A300-600 and the A330/340;
 - (c) Financing to Construcciones Aeronauticas SA ("CASA") for the A320 and the A330/340;
 - (d) Financing to Airbus Industrie for the A321; and
 - (e) Financing to EADS for the A380.

¹ The Airbus companies, as referenced throughout this request, include Airbus SAS, its predecessor Airbus GIE and current and predecessor affiliated companies, including each person or entity that directly, or indirectly through one or more intermediaries or relationships, controls or controlled, is or was controlled by, or is or was under common control with Airbus SAS or Airbus GIE, such as parent companies, sibling companies and subsidiaries, including Airbus Deutschland GmbH, Airbus España SL, Airbus France S.A.S., Airbus UK Limited, European Aeronautic Defence and Space Company ("EADS"), and BAE Systems.

² The EC and the member States use different terms to describe the type of financing at issue, such as launch aid, launch investment, repayable launch investment, development support in the form of royalty-based financing, avances remboursables, Rückzahlbare Zuwendungen, Entwicklungsbeihilfen, Zuschüsse zur Entwicklung von zivilen Flugzeugen, anticipo reembolsable, and prestamo reembolsable. Although the United States will hereinafter refer to the financing as "launch aid," the US request is with respect to all such types of financing, regardless of the specific term or terms that the entities providing and receiving the financing use.

³ EIB financing to airline customers for the purchase of new aircraft is not within the scope of this consultation request.

- (3) The provision by the EC and the member States of financial contributions in connection with the construction, creation, development, expansion, upgrade, and use of facilities and other infrastructure for or by Airbus. Specific instances include:
- (a) the expenditure of at least €751 million by the Hamburg government since 2000 to create and develop land, installations, and facilities for the expansion of the Airbus production and assembly site in Hamburg-Finkenwerder, and the provision of this land, installation, and facilities to Airbus for less than adequate remuneration;
 - (b) the grant of at least €6 million by the government of Niedersachsen in 2002 for the Airbus factory in Nordenham;
 - (c) the expenditure of at least DM40 million by the government of Bremen to extend a runway at Bremen airport for use by Airbus and the provision of the extended runway to Airbus for use for cargo and passenger flights for less than adequate remuneration;
 - (d) the expenditure of at least €182 million by the French central government and/or regional, departmental and/or local authorities and bodies (including, but not limited to the *Region Midi-Pyrénées*, the *Département de la Haute Garonne*, the *Communauté de l'Agglomération de Grande Toulouse*, *SETOMIP* and others) to create and develop the AeroConstellation site adjacent to the Toulouse airport, including investment in access roads, taxiways and other specific infrastructure, the provision of land on this site to Airbus for its exclusive use for less than adequate remuneration, and the granting to Airbus of access to, and use of, infrastructure on this site, or linking this site to public infrastructure, for less than adequate remuneration;
 - (e) the grants made by the Spanish central government as well as by Spanish regional authorities to Airbus, including, but not limited to the following grants:
 - (i) the 2001 grant by the Spanish Government of € 2.2 million to EADS-CASA for its site at Sevilla and of € 814,000 to EADS-CASA for its site at La Rinconada, Sevilla;
 - (ii) the 2001 grant by the Andalusian Government of €8.6 million to EADS, CASA and/or Airbus España for its production and maintenance facility in El Puerto de Santa Maria, in Cadiz, in Spain;
 - (iii) the 2002 grant by the Andalusian Government of € 9.3 million to EADS CASA for its facilities at Tablada, Sevilla;
 - (iv) the 2002 grant by the Andalusian Government of € 35.7 million to EADS CASA for its site in Sevilla;
 - (v) the 2003 grant by the Spanish Government of €37.9 million to EADS, CASA and/or Airbus España for its site in Illescas, in Toledo, Spain;
 - (vi) the 2003 grant by the Spanish Government of €43 million to EADS, CASA and/or Airbus España for its site in La Rinconada in Spain;

- (vii) the 2003 grant by the Spanish Government of €5.9 million to EADS, CASA and/or Airbus España for its site in Puerto de Santa Maria in Spain;
 - (viii) the 2003 grant by the Spanish Government of €13.1 million to EADS, CASA and/or Airbus España for its site in Puerto Real in Spain;
 - (ix) the 2003 grant by the Andalusian Government of €17.5 million to EADS, CASA and/or Airbus España for its production and maintenance facility in Puerto Real, in Cadiz, in Spain;
 - (x) the 2004 grant by the Castilla-La Mancha government of € 7.6 million to Airbus España for its production site in Illescas, in Toledo;
 - (xi) the 2004 grant by the Andalusian Government of €61.9 million for an investment project by EADS-CASA in the municipalities of Sevilla and La Rinconada, Sevilla;
 - (xii) the 2004 grant by the Andalusian Government of a further €35.7 million for an investment project by EADS-CASA in the municipalities of Sevilla and La Rinconada, Sevilla; and
 - (xiii) the 2005 grant or grants of at least €22 million and the provision of land by the Spanish government and/or the regional government of Andalusia to EADS-CASA in connection with its site at or near the Sevillian airport of San Pablo;
- (f) the 2002 grant by the Welsh Assembly of £19.5 million for Airbus' Broughton site;
- (g) the 2006 grant by the Welsh Assembly of £5.2 million for Airbus' Broughton site;
- (h) the £230 million "on-site investment" by UK government authorities for Airbus' Broughton site; and
- (i) the £5 million grant by UK authorities (including the Department of Trade and Industry and the South West Development Agency) for the Airbus Composites Centre at Airbus UK Filton.
- (4) The assumption and/or repayment by the EC and the member States of debt and/or losses incurred by Airbus and the forgiveness of debt by the EC and the member States, including:
- (a) The assumption and/or repayment of Airbus debt by the German government between 1975 and 1982;
 - (b) The assumption and/or repayment of Airbus debt by the German government between 1987 and 1995 as part of the "Altlastenhilfe" agreed in 1987⁴ and as part of the 1989

⁴ German Economics Ministry, Press Release, November 1988, reprinted in *Handelsblatt*, "Erklärung des Bundesministeriums für Wirtschaft zur Neustrukturierung der Luftfahrtindustrie," November 3, 1988, p. 24 ; German Monopolkommission, Sondergutachten 18, Zusammenschlussvorhaben der Daimler-Benz AG mit der Messerschmitt-Bölkow-Blohm GmbH, 1989, p. 72, para. 121; German Bundestag, BT-Drs. 13/8409, p. 14; German Bundestag, BT-Drs. 11/4375, pp. 18-19.

aid package for Messerschmitt-Bölkow-Blohm and Deutsche Airbus in the context of the transfer of these companies to Daimler-Benz AG;⁵

- (c) The assumption by the government of Spain of CASA's Airbus-related losses from 1971 through 1989, and the deferral and forgiveness by the government of Spain of the resulting CASA debt;⁶
 - (d) The 1997/98 forgiveness by the German government of debt relating to launch aid for the A320; and
 - (e) The 1998/99 forgiveness by the German government of debt relating to launch aid for the A300, A310, A330 and A340 and other government financing for large civil aircraft development and production (including German government loans and German *Besserungsscheine* (profit-sharing obligations) accumulated by Deutsche Airbus);
- (5) The provision by the EC and the member States of equity infusions and grants, including through government-owned and/or government-controlled banks, to Airbus, including:
- (a) The equity investment made by the German government through Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau ("KfW") in Deutsche Airbus between 1989 and 1992;
 - (b) The return of the shares acquired through the transaction listed in subparagraph (a) to Deutsche Airbus' parent, the Daimler group, without compensation, in 1992;
 - (c) The equity infusions by the French government into Aérospatiale in 1987/1988 and 1988;
 - (d) The equity infusion by or through French government-owned Crédit Lyonnais into Aérospatiale in 1992;
 - (e) The equity infusion by the French government into Aérospatiale in 1993/1994; and
 - (f) The transfer by the French Government of its 45.76 percent share of Dassault Aviation's capital to Aérospatiale in 1998.
- (6) The provision by the EC and the member States of financial contributions for aeronautics-related research, development, and demonstration/evaluation ("R&D"), undertaken by Airbus, whether alone or with others, or in any other way to the benefit of Airbus, including:
- (a) EC funding for civil aeronautics-related R&D projects under the Second (1987-1991), Third (1990-1994), Fourth (1994-1998), Fifth (1998-2002) and Sixth (2002-2006) EC Framework Programs in which Airbus participated. The attachment to this request contains a list of examples of relevant Framework Program projects.

⁵ German Monopolkommission, Sondergutachten 18, Zusammenschlussvorhaben der Daimler-Benz AG mit der Messerschmitt-Bölkow-Blohm GmbH, 1989, p. 75, para. 131; Daimler-Benz AG, 1994 Annual Report, p. 84; Daimler-Benz AG, 1995 Annual Report, p. 66.

⁶ See Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales, Sección Cortes Generales, April 30, 2001, Serie A Núm. 139, pp. 98, 99.

- (b) Funding from the German federal government and from German sub-federal entities for civil aeronautics-related R&D projects in which Airbus participated, including:
 - (i) federal government funding as set forth in the most updated version of the government's Förderkatalog database, since 1990,⁷ including funding under the federal aeronautics research programs *Luftfahrtforschungsprogramm 1* (1995-1998), *Luftfahrtforschungsprogramm 2* (1998-2002), and *Luftfahrtforschungsprogramm 3* (2003-2007);
 - (ii) funding by the German land Bremen under the Airbus Materials & System Technology Centre Bremen (AMST) (2000-2002) and the Airbus Materials & System Technology Centre Bremen II (AMST II) (2002-2006) programs;
 - (iii) funding by the German land Bavaria from the budgets of the *Bayerische Staatsministerium für Wirtschaft, Verkehr und Technologie* (and any predecessor or successor Ministries) (including the budget items "*Zuschüsse und sonstige Ausgaben zur Förderung neuer Technologien und ihrer wirtschaftlichen Verwertung*" and "*Zuschüsse und sonstige Ausgaben zur Förderung von Luft- und Raumfahrttechnologien*"), as well as funding from the "*Offensive Zukunft Bayern*", "*Offensive Zukunft Bayern II*" and "*Hightech Offensive Bayern*" budgets; and
 - (iv) funding by the German land Hamburg under its *Luftfahrtforschungsprogramm* (2000-2005).
- (c) Funding from the government of the United Kingdom since 1990 for civil aeronautics-related R&D projects in which Airbus participated, including
 - (i) under the Civil Aircraft Research and Development Program ("CARAD") as well as any predecessor and successor program thereof, including the Aeronautics Research Programme (ARP);
 - (ii) under the Technology & Strategy Program;
 - (iii) through the Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council ("EPSRC"); and
 - (iv) through the Department of Trade and Industry ("DTI") and the Regional Development Agencies ("RDAs"), such as the South West Development Agency ("SWRDA"), to R&D initiatives involving Airbus, such as the National Composite Network, including the Composite Structures Development Centre based at Airbus UK, Filton.
- (d) Funding from the Spanish government, including regional and local authorities, since 1993 for civil aeronautics-related R&D projects in which Airbus participated, including loans and other financial support provided under:
 - (i) the *Plan I+D para el Sector Aeronautico (Plan Tecnológico Aeronáutico I)* (1993-1998) and the *Plan Tecnológico Aeronáutico II* (1999-2003); and

⁷ Available at <http://www.foerderkatalog.de>.

- (ii) the *Programa de Fomento de Innovación Técnica* ("PROFIT"), including the *Programa Nacional de Aeronáutica* of PROFIT 2000-2003 and the *Subprograma Nacional de Transporte Aéreo* of PROFIT 2004-2007.
- (e) Funding from the French central government since 1990 for civil aeronautics-related R&D projects in which Airbus participated, including R&D funding from the Transport Ministry (*Ministère de l'Équipement, des Transports et du Logement*) and the Defense Ministry (*Ministère de la Défense*). Some of the relevant R&D funding is recorded as "*recherche amont*" in the annual French budgets and described, *e.g.*, in the annual reports prepared by the French Sénat concerning the air transport budget.⁸ Funding may also have come from other French central government budgets. Examples of relevant R&D projects supported by the French central government include:
 - (i) *Aérothermique Transitoire* ("ATRAN");
 - (ii) *Commandes de l'Avion Souple* ("COVAS");
 - (iii) Aircraft anti-icing and de-icing project ("ECLIPPS");
 - (iv) *Modélisation et Simulation de l'Avion Souple* ("MOSAS"); and
 - (v) Aircraft vibration/static testing ("*DTP Tremblement*").
- (f) The provision by the EC and member State governments of preferential, early and/or exclusive access to results of government-funded research (such as data, trade secrets,

⁸ Cf. Sénat, No. 367 (session ordinaire de 1996-1997), Rapport d'Information "Mission de contrôle effectuée sur le soutien public à la construction aéronautique civile," Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation, Chapitre IV at IV. Les Soutiens à la Recherche; Assemblée Nationale, Avis, au nom de la Commission de la Production et des Échanges sur le projet de loi de finances pour 1999 (n° 1078), Tome XIII, Équipement, Transports et Logement, Transports Aériens, p. 15; Sénat, No. 89 (session ordinaire de 1999-2000), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2000, Tome III, Annexe No. 25, Équipement, Transport et Logement: III. - Transports: Transport Aérien et Météorologie et Aviation Civile, p. 88; Sénat, No. 92 (session ordinaire de 2000-2001), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2001, Tome III, Annexe No. 24, Équipement, Transport et Logement: III. - Transports: Transport Aérien et Météorologie et Aviation Civile, p. 79; Sénat, No. 87 (session ordinaire de 2001-2002), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2002, Tome III, Annexe No. 24 Équipement, Transport et Logement: III. - Transports et Sécurité Routière: Aviation et Aéronautique Civiles, p. 22; Sénat, No. 68 (session ordinaire de 2002-2003), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2003, Tome III, Annexe No. 18, Équipement, Transport, Logement, Tourisme et Mer: III. - Transports et Sécurité Routière: Aviation et Aéronautique Civiles, p. 50; Sénat, No. 73 (session ordinaire de 2003-2004), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2004, Tome III, Annexe No. 18 Équipement, Transport et Logement: III. - Transports et Sécurité Routière: Aviation et Aéronautique Civiles, p. 40; Sénat, No. 74 (session ordinaire de 2004-2005), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2005, Tome III, Annexe No. 17 Équipement, Transport, Aménagement du Territoire, Tourisme et Mer: II. - Transports et Sécurité Routière: Aviation et Aéronautique Civiles, p. 50.

intellectual property rights or any other form of research results), including pursuant to the EC's rules concerning the participation in, and the dissemination and exploitation of, research results and/or knowledge from projects and programs funded under the EC Framework Programs listed in subparagraph (a) above and pursuant to the rules governing the access to the results of research funded by the member States under any of the programs listed in subparagraphs (b) through (e) above.

- (g) The provision by research institutions controlled and/or financed by member State governments (including, in particular, ONERA, DLR and DERA/Qinetiq) of civil aeronautics R&D-related financial contributions to Airbus since 1990, including by providing civil aeronautics R&D services to Airbus for less than adequate remuneration; by making payments to Airbus; by providing the results of civil aeronautics-related R&D to Airbus for less than adequate remuneration; by allowing Airbus to exploit the results of civil aeronautics-related R&D undertaken by such research institutions (including the granting of exclusive or early access to data, trade secrets and other knowledge resulting from such R&D); and by allowing Airbus to participate in civil aeronautics-related R&D projects undertaken by such institutions.

The following are examples of projects in which such civil aeronautics R&D-related financial contributions have been made by research institutions controlled and/or financed by member State governments to Airbus:

- (i) The *Deutsches Zentrum für Luft- und Raumfahrt* ("DLR") has provided civil aeronautics R&D-related financial contributions through R&D projects in numerous research areas, including:
- advanced materials and manufacturing technologies, including the development of fibre reinforced lightweight fuselage structures, the development of advanced materials and manufacturing technologies for vertical and horizontal tails for Airbus aircraft, the development of a full-scale A320 carbon fibre composite fuselage (the "Schwarzer Rumpf" / "Black Fuselage" program), the development of adaptive wings for the A380 manufactured from composite materials, the development of hybrid-laminarization technologies, the development of differential-pressure resin-transfer moulding technologies for the A380 and other Airbus aircraft, the development and testing of riblet surfaces, and other projects;
 - aerodynamics and acoustics technologies, including the development of a quiet slat for Airbus, the development of winglets for the A380, the use of vortex generators to reduce noise, the reduction of the A380's wake vortices, the development of slat and flap track configurations for the A380 to reduce highlift-related noise, the improvement of cabin acoustics, and other projects;
 - aircraft development and testing technologies, including the development of aerodynamic simulation and optimization processes (e.g., the DLR R&D projects MEGAFLOW and MEGADESIGN), the improvement of Airbus' design tool "ISSY", the design and valuation of a virtual test station for Airbus, the development and improvement of numerical simulation for aerodynamic flaps, the

construction of a static vibration test station for the A340-500/600 and the A380, and other projects; and

- other technologies, including, for example, the development of certain control units within the "Flexible Aircraft" program, the development of enhanced vision systems, the development and improvement of autopilot technologies, and other projects.
- (ii) The UK Defence Evaluation and Research Agency ("DERA") and its successor Qinetiq have provided civil aeronautics R&D-related financial contributions through R&D projects in numerous research areas, including:
- advanced materials, including through DERA's Structural Materials Centre,⁹ including in the fields of carbon-fiber composite airframe structures (e.g., the "Civil Aircraft Structural Composites - Application, Development and Exploitation" (CASCADE) project), manufacturing methods for advanced aircraft materials¹⁰ (e.g., through structural optimisation and structural hardening techniques),¹¹ lightweight titanium metal-matrix composite technology,¹² and other wing-related materials technology¹³ (e.g., metal/composite interface joints, aluminium/lithium laminates, welded structures, and fibre reinforced laminates of new large wings);¹⁴
 - aerodynamics;¹⁵
 - cabin design, semiotics and seat comfort;¹⁶
 - fuel systems;¹⁷ and
 - modular avionics design.¹⁸
- (iii) The *Office National des Études et des Recherches Aérospatiales* (ONERA) has provided civil aeronautics R&D-related financial contributions through numerous R&D projects, including:

⁹ DTI Press Release, "Partnership to Revolutionise Aircraft Manufacture," September 8, 1998, available at <http://www.gnn.gov.uk/environment/detail.asp?ReleaseID=19917&NewsAreaID=2&NavigatedFromDepartment=False> (attachment 63).

¹⁰ DTI Press Release, "Partnership to Revolutionise Aircraft Manufacture," September 8, 1998, available at <http://www.gnn.gov.uk/environment/detail.asp?ReleaseID=19917&NewsAreaID=2&NavigatedFromDepartment=False>.

¹¹ QinetiQ website, Case studies aviation, Airbus - The World's Largest Airliner.

¹² DTI, Aerospace & Defence Technology Report 2001/2002, p. 6.

¹³ Qinetiq, Press Release, "DTI funding lifts Qinetiq's standing as aerospace world leader in field of polymeric composites," August 19, 2002, available at the QinetiQ website.

¹⁴ QinetiQ website, Case studies aviation, Airbus - The World's Largest Airliner.

¹⁵ DTI Aerospace & Defence Technology Report 2001/2002, p. 4; QinetiQ website, Case studies aviation, Airbus - The World's Largest Airliner.

¹⁶ QinetiQ website, Case studies aviation, Airbus - The World's Largest Airliner.

¹⁷ QinetiQ website, Case studies aviation, Airbus - The World's Largest Airliner.

¹⁸ QinetiQ website, Case studies aviation, Airbus - The World's Largest Airliner.

- *Modélisation Aérothermique des Ecoulements en Ventilation Avion (MAEVA)*;
 - Robust Efficient Automatic Control Laws Design (REAL);
 - *DTP Pilotage*;
 - *Ensemble Logiciel pour la Simulation en Aérodynamique, (elsA)*; and
 - Aircraft vibration/static testing (*Essais pour maîtriser le tremblement des avions*).
- (iv) The *Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS)*, at several of its locations, has provided civil aeronautics R&D-related financial contributions through numerous R&D projects, including:
- Validation of the movement-control software guiding the transportation of the A380 parts, at *Laboratoire d'analyse et d'architecture des systèmes*, Toulouse (LAAS);
 - Software development for the A380 flight controls, at *laboratoire Verimag* at Gières/Grenoble;
 - Development of the statics analyzation tool "Astree" at *École Normale Supérieure* at Liens; and
 - Research on the wake vortex of the A380 at *Institut de recherche sur les phénomènes hors équilibre (IRPHE)*.
- (v) The *Centre National de la Recherche Technologique (CNRT)* has provided civil aeronautics R&D-related financial contributions through numerous R&D projects, including:
- Amélioration des PROpriétés de Surface des alliages de Titane Structuraux en conditions sévères de fonctionnement (APROSUTIS); and
 - Mise en oeuvre par UML des Systèmes Informatiques Certifiés (MUSIC).
- (vi) The *Institut National de Recherche en Informatique et en Automatique (INRIA)* at several of its research units, including the units Futurs, Rhône Alpes and Sophia Antipolis, has provided civil aeronautics R&D-related financial contributions to Airbus through numerous R&D projects, including:
- Environnement de spécification de programmes réactifs synchrones (ESPRESSO);

- Methods, algorithms and software in automatic control (METALAU); and
 - Constraints solving, Optimization Robust Interval Analysis (COPRIN).
- (vii) The *Commissariat à l'Energie Atomique* (CEA) has provided civil aeronautics R&D-related financial contributions through numerous software development projects, including:
- CAVEAT;
 - GATel; and
 - Panorama.
- (h) The granting to Airbus of access to R&D facilities funded or co-funded and/or owned, in whole or in part, by the UK, French, German and/or Spanish governments (including research institutions controlled and/or financed by member State governments such as, in particular, ONERA, DLR and DERA/Qinetiq) for less than adequate remuneration, including, *e.g.*, the provision, by the German, French, and UK governments, of access by Airbus to the wind tunnels operated by ONERA, DLR and DERA/Qinetiq, whether alone or jointly with others, including the wind tunnels operated by European Transonic Windtunnel GmbH ("ETW") and by the DNW Foundation.
- (7) Any amendments, revisions, implementing or related measures to the measures described above.
- (8) Any other measures that involve a financial contribution by the EC or any of the member States that benefit the Airbus companies.

The United States is concerned that the launch aid provided by the EC and the member States to Airbus for the development of large civil aircraft and the EIB loans provided to Airbus appear to be subsidies that are inconsistent with Articles 3.1(a) and (b) and Article 3.2 of the SCM Agreement.

The United States further is concerned that the measures of the EC and the member States that are the subject of this request appear to be causing adverse effects to US interests within the meaning of:

- Article 5(a) of the SCM Agreement because the measures are specific subsidies within the meaning of Articles 1 and 2 of the SCM Agreement that are causing or threatening to cause injury to the U.S. large civil aircraft industry.
- Articles 5(c), 6.3(a), 6.3(b), and 6.3(c) of the SCM Agreement because the measures are specific subsidies within the meaning of Articles 1 and 2 of the SCM Agreement that are causing or threatening to cause serious prejudice to the interests of the United States through displacement and impedance of imports of large civil aircraft of the United States into the EC and third country markets, and through significant price undercutting by large civil aircraft of the EC as compared with the price of large

civil aircraft of the United States in the same markets, and significant price suppression, price depression or lost sales in the same markets.

The United States also is concerned that the measures appear to be inconsistent with Articles III:4 and XVI:1 of the GATT 1994.

Attached please find a statement of available evidence, pursuant to Articles 4 and 7 of the SCM Agreement.

We look forward to receiving your reply to this request and to fixing a mutually acceptable date for consultations.

Statement of Available Evidence

Collin (Yvon), Commission des finances sur le projet de loi de finances pour 1997, Rapport No. 86 (96-97), Tome III Annex no 20;

DTI website at <http://www.dti.gov.uk/aerospace/launch-investment.htm>;

Collin (Yvon), Rapport d'Information No 367 – 1996/1997, Mission de contrôle effectuée sur le soutien public à la construction aéronautique;

European Commission state aid decision concerning reimbursable advances for Airbus program A340-500/600, SG (99) D/586 (January 26, 1999), Aide N369/98;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances sur le projet de loi de finances pour 1991, Rapport No. 85 (90-91), Tome III Annexe 19;

Deutscher Bundestag, BT-Drs. 13/8409, Schriftliche Fragen mit den in der Woche vom 18. August 1997 eingegangenen Antworten der Bundesregierung, questions nos. 21-23 and responses;

Monopolkommission, Zusammenschlussvorhaben der Daimler Benz AG mit der Messerschmitt-Boelkow-Blohm GmbH, Sondergutachten 18, 1989;

Matlack, "Can the Bureaucrats Pump Up R&D?", Business Week, January 24, 2005;

Kevin Done, "EU Politics: European leaders call for unity at Airbus launch," Financial Times, January 19, 2005;

"Jospin pledges to aid Airbus in fight against Boeing", Reuters, March 8, 2000;

Agreement between the Governments of the French Republic, the Federal Republic of Germany, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, the Kingdom of Spain and the Kingdom of Belgium concerning the program Airbus A330/A340' of 25/26 April, 1994;

French Ministry of Transports, Press Release, March 15, 2002, "Accord pour le financement de l'Airbus A380.";

French presidential decision of 29 October 2004, ratifying the Agreement between the Governments of the French Republic, the Federal Republic of Germany, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, the Kingdom of Spain and the Kingdom of Belgium concerning the program Airbus A330/A340' of 25/26 April, 1994, J.O n° 257 of 4 November 2004, p. 18638;

Agreement between the Governments of the French Republic, the Federal Republic of Germany, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, the Kingdom of Spain and the Kingdom of Belgium concerning the program Airbus A320 of February 6, 1991 (Spanish version);

Pams (Gaston), Commission des Affaires Economiques et du Plan, Avis No. 58 (1970);

Coudé du Foresto (Yvon), Commission des finances sur le projet de loi de finances pour 1968, Rapport No. 16 (67-68), Tome III, Annexe No. 29, Transports, II. Aviation Civile;

EADS 2004 Financial Statements/Reference Document;

"Airbus Launches New Line," Calgary Herald, C8 (March 4, 1993);

"Airbus, The Subsidies Roll On", The Economist, February 14, 1987;

"Stockwatch EADS down as A380 breakeven pushed back, eclipsing firm results," AFX International Focus, March 9, 2005;

"EADS' Camus rules out Thales bid, sees A380 breakeven point above 300 planes," AFX International Focus, March 9, 2005;

"Airbus' Leahy sees 2005 orders down at 300-350 as backlog swells," AFX.com, January 12, 2005;

"Finanzierung des Eurofighter ist offenbar gesichert", Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung, May 24, 1997;

Daimler-Benz Annual Reports;

DaimlerChrysler, Form 20-F for the fiscal year ended December 31, 1998, Consolidated Statement of Income, Note F-43;

Deutsche Airbus Annual Reports;

MBB Annual Reports;

ITC Hearing, Inv-No. 332-332, Global Competitiveness of U.S. Advanced Technology Manufacturing Industries: Large Civil Aircraft, April 15, 1993;

"Realizing the Reality of a 20-year Dream", Financial Times, October 14, 1991;

Aerospatiale 1987 Financial Results;

Arthur Reed, "The old and the new", Air Transport World No. 5, Vol. 36, p. 91 (May 1, 1999);

"Airbus lost \$332 Mln in 1999 Amid Contest With Boeing", Bloomberg News, March 3, 2000;

"Airbus in talks with German government on aid for A350 plane", AFX, May 20, 2005;

"France resumes study of public aid for new Airbus A350 plane", AFX, April 12, 2005;

"Airbus asks Spain for A350 development loans", Reuters, May 23, 2005;

"Airbus is requesting launch aid for the A350 from Spain", Expansión, May 21, 2005;

Alden/Callan/Eaglesham, "Blair signals support for aid to Airbus", Financial Times, April 12, 2005;

"Airbus jobs in balance 'if £400m state aid is denied," The Daily Telegraph, May 30, 2005;

"32,400 jobs at risk over Airbus subsidy," The Independent on Sunday, May 29, 2005;

"Airbus says has applied for UK launch funds for A350," Reuters, May 19, 2005;

"The hidden refundable advances for the Airbus A350," La Tribune, 29 December 2005;

"Aerospace - A350 aid - 'legally binding," Aerospace International, November 1, 2005;

"Germany stands ready to support Airbus on A350," Reuters News, October 7, 2005;

"Airbus: Government Aid Pledges 'Binding," AP, October 7, 2005;

Lynn, Birds of Prey, 1995;

Pintat (Jean-François), Commission des Finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1986, Rapport No 96 (85-86) Tome III Annexe 34, Urbanisme, Logement et Transports, II. Transports, 2. Aviation Civile, 4. Meteorologie;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, projet de loi de finances pour 1987, Rapport No 67, tome III Annexe No 21, Equipement, Logement, Amenagement du territoire et transports, IV Transports, 2. Aviation civile, 4. Meteorologie;

"Vers la Création d'un Fonds Aéronautique," Air & Cosmos, November 20, 1998;

House of Commons, Hansard Written Answers for March 5, 1997, Answer of Mr. Knight to a question by Mr. Ingram;

European Commission, Notice on the Method for Setting the Reference and Discount Rates, OJ (1997) C 273/03;

European Commission, Decision 97/807/EC of 30 April 1997, OJ (1997) L 331/10, Aid granted by Spain to the Aerospace Company Construcciones Aeronáuticas, SA (Casa);

Marcellin (Raymond), Commission des Finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1981, Rapport No. 98 (80-81), Annexe No 28 au Tome III;

"Dissecting Airbus," The Economist, February 16, 1991;

"Airbus and Boeing, The Jumbo War," The Economist, June 15, 1991;

Kim Kaivanto, "UK Launch aid Experience" (June 1997);

5th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 7/4203, 22 October 1975;

6th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 8/1195, 17 November 1977;

7th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 8/3097, 8 August 1979;

8th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 9/986, 6 November 1981;

9th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 10/352, 6 September 1983;

10th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 10/3821, 12 September 1985;

11th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 11/1338, 25 November 1987;

12th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 11/5116, 1 September 1989;

13th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 12/1525, 11 November 1991;

14th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 12/5580, 26 August 1993;

15th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 13/2230, 1 September 1993;

16th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 13/8420, 29 August 1997;

17th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 430/99, 29 July 1999;

18th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 14/6748, 26 July 2001;

19th German Parliament Subsidy Report, Drs. 16/1635, 1 October 2003;

Federal Budget, Budget Plan 09 (Economics Ministry), Part (Kapitel) 02, budget items nos. 683 41, 683 91, 683 94, 862 91, 862 41, 862 91, 892 41, 870 91, 870 93): Titelgruppe 09 (Förderung der Luftfahrtforschung und -technologie) for 1999-2005; Titelgruppe 09 (Förderung der Luftfahrttechnik) for 1980-1998; Titelgruppe 03 (Förderung der Luftfahrttechnik) for 1978-1979; and Titelgruppe 02 (Förderung der Luftfahrttechnik) for 1977;

Federal Budget, Budget Plan 09 (Economics Ministry), Part (Kapitel) 02, budget items 683 41, 862 41, and 892 41 for 1970-1976; budget items 862 01 and 892 04 for 1969; budget item 570 for 1968; and budget item 617 for 1967;

BMWi, Bericht des Koordinators für die Deutsche Luft- und Raumfahrt;

Le Grand (Jean Francois), Commission des Affaires Economiques, projet de loi de finances pour 2001, Avis No. 94 (2000-2001), Tome XIX Aviation Civile et Transport Aerien;

Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales, Congreso de los Diputados, Contestaciones del Gobierno, Serie D, Num. 547, pp. 153 ff (June 5, 2003);

The United Nations International Standard Industrial Classification of All Economic Activities (Revision 3.1; ISIC Rev.3.1; ST/ESA/STAT/SER.M/4/Rev.3.1, E.03.XVII.4, available at <http://unstats.un.org/unsd/cr/family2.asp?Cl=17>);

Deutscher Bundestag, 13. Wahlperiode, Drucksache 13/2238, Answer of Under-Minister for Economics Norbert Lammert of August 30, 1995, to a question by Edelgard Bulmahn, Member of Parliament (SPD);

Cuadernos CDTI, Centro para el Desarrollo Tecnológico Industrial (CDTI) (prepared by the State Secretariat of Industry, Ministry of Science and Technology), July 1993; Balance del Segundo Año del Ministerio de Ciencia y Tecnología, June 2002;

Deutscher Bundestag, BT-Drs. 11/4375, Beteiligung von Daimler-Benz an Messerschmitt-Bölkow-Blohm (MBB) (Industriepolitische Bedeutung, Konzernmacht und demokratische Verfassung, Die Airbus-Subvention);

"Dasa bietet Mitfinanzierung des Eurofighters an," Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung, June 16, 1997, p. 11;

Pams (Gaston), Commission des Affaires Economiques, projet de loi de finances pour 1969, Avis No 42, Tome XII, p. 45;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des Finances, projet de loi de finances pour 1975, Rapport No. 99 (74-75) Annexe 29 Tome III, Transports III, Aviation Civile;

Airbus delivery data (1974-Q1/2005);

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des Finances, Projet de Loi de Finances pour 1979, Rapport No. 74, Annexe No 29 au Tome III, Transport II Aviation Civile et Meteorologie;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des Finances, Projet de Loi de finances pour 1980, Rapport No 50 (79-80), Annexe 28 au Tome III, Transports II Aviation Civile, V Meteorologie;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1970, Rapport No 56 (69-70) Annexe No 25 au Tome IV du 25/11/1969, Transports II Aviation civile;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1976, Rapport No 62 (75 - 76) Annexe No 31 au Tome III, Transports III Aviation civile;

Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales, Congreso de los Diputados, Cuenta General del Estado de 1992, Serie A, Núm. 34, January 13, 1997, p. 122;

Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales, Congreso de los Diputados, Contestaciones del Gobierno, Serie D, Núm. 547, pp. 253 ff (June 5, 2003);

House of Lords written answers for Feb. 25, 1997; House of Lords, written answers for March 19, 1997 (question to Mr. Greg Knight);

House of Commons, Session 2000-01, Trade and Industry, Appendices to the Minutes of Evidence ordered by the House of Commons to be printed 23 January 2001, Appendix 1, Memorandum submitted by the Department of Trade and Industry, Annex 2;

Legrand (Bernard), Commission des Affaires Economiques, projet de loi de finances pour 1979, Avis No. 76 (78-79) Tome XVIII;

Deutscher Bundestag 12. Wahlperiode, Written questions and answers from the Government, Deutscher Bundestag, BT-Drs. 12/1080, Schriftliche Fragen mit den in der Woche vom 19. August 1991 eingegangenen Antworten der Bundesregierung, question no. 85 and response;

"Airbus: Rückzahlung von Entwicklungskosten – Entlastung für Waigel," Handelsblatt, January 10-11, 1998;

"DASA zahlt 1,4 Milliarden DM an den Bund," Frankfurter Allgemeine, January 13, 1998, p. 12;

Collin (Yvon), Commission des Finances, projet de loi de finances pour 2004, Rapport No. 73 (2003-2004), Tome III, Annexe No. 28, Équipement, Transports, Logement, Tourisme et Mer: III. - Transports: Transports et Sécurité Routière: Aviation et Aéronautique Civiles;

Legrand (Bernard), Commission des affaires économiques, Projet de loi de finances pour 1986, Avis n° 98 (85-86) Tome XIX du 21/11/1985, Aviation civile;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, du contrôle budgétaire et des comptes économiques de la nation sur le Projet loi de finances pour 1988, Rapport n° 93, Tome III Annexe n° 20 du 16/11/1987, Equipement, Logement, aménagement du territoire et Transports, IV Transports, 1. Aviation Civile, 3. Météorologie;

Collin (Yvon), Commission des Finances, projet de loi de finances pour 2000, Rapport No. 89 (1999-2000), Tome III, Annexe No. 25, Équipement, Transport et Logement: III. - Transports: Transport Aérien et Météorologie et Aviation Civile;

Le Grand (Jean-Francois), Commission des Affaires Economiques, projet de loi de finances pour 2000, Avis No. 91 (1999-2000), Tome XIX aviation civile;

Sparaco, "Airbus Launches A340-500/600 Stretch", Air Transport, December 15, 1997;

"France Readies A3XX Funding", Aviation Week & Space Technology, p. 38, November 23, 1998;

Collin (Yvon), Commission des Finances, projet de loi de finances pour 2003, Rapport No. 68, (2002-2003), Tome III - Les moyens des services et les dispositions spéciales (Deuxième partie de la loi de finances) - Annexe No. Équipement, Transports, Logement, Tourisme et Mer: III. - Transports et Sécurité Routière: Aviation et Aéronautique Civiles;

Collin (Yvon), Commission des Finances, projet de loi de finances pour 2002, Rapport No. 87 (2001-2002), Tome III, Les Moyens des Services et les Dispositions Spéciales, Annexe No. 24;

EADS IPO prospectus, July 7, 2000;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des Finances, projet de loi de finances pour 1989, Rapport No. 88 (1988-1989), Tome III, Les Moyens des Services et les Dispositions Spéciales, Annexe No. 34;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des Finances, projet de loi de finances pour 1990, Rapport No. 54 (1989-1990), Tome III, Les Moyens des Services et les Dispositions Spéciales, Annexe No. 19;

Assemblée Nationale, Rapport No. 2568, fait au nom de la Commission des Finances, de l'Economie Générale et du Plan sur le Projet de Finances pour 2006 (no. 2540), Annexe No. 24, Recherche et Enseignement Supérieur, Jean-Michel Fourgous;

EFEDATA, "Consejo Ministros MINER Firma Convenio CASA Desarrollo Airbus por 11.348 Millones", December 23, 1998;

"El Estado Aportará 406,5 Millones Hasta 2013 para el Desarrollo del Airbus A380," ABC, October 2, 2003;

"British Agree on Launch Aid for A330/A340," Aviation Week & Space Technology, May 18, 1997, p. 33;

"Britain plans Airbus Aid," New York Times, May 15, 1987, p. 16;

DTI press release, "Margaret Becket announces £123 million public/private partnership with British Aerospace for new Airbus A340-500/600," February 2, 1998;

"UK to Lend Airbus \$200 Million for Aircraft Development," Aviation Daily, February 3, 1998, p. 188;

Hansard, House of Lords, Written Answers for December 15, 1998 (statement by Mr. Battle);

Hansard, House of Lords, Written Answers for February 2, 1998 (statement by Mrs. Beckett);

EADS 2000 Reference Document;

Deutscher Bundestag, BT-Drs. 14/10002, Aufschüttung der Elbe im Mühlenberger Loch für den Bau des Airbus A380 und A400M;

Susan Stern, "Marshall Plan 1947 – 1997 A German View," available at (<http://www.germany-info.org/relaunch/culture/history/marshall.html>);

"Airbus sieht seine Darlehen in Einklang mit internationalen Regeln," Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung, December 21, 2000;

"Regierung unterstützt Airbus A3XX," Berlines Zeitung, 16 November 2000, p. 39;

EADS press release, "EADS issues 15 year – Euro 500 million Eurobond," September 15, 2003;

Press release, Minister of Transportation, "Accord pour le financement de l'Airbus A380," March 15, 2002;

"L'Etat va apporter 1,213 milliard d'Euros remboursable à Airbus France...", Les Echos, March 18, 2002;

"Ministers link Airbus Shake-Up to A3XX Research Funding," Flight International, June 23, 1999;

Collin (Yvon), Commission des Finances, Projet de Loi de Finances pour 2005, Rapport No. 74 (2004-2005), Tome III, Annexe 17;

Press release, Ministry of Science and Technology, "El Ministerio Aportará al Desarrollo [de A380] 376 Millones de Euros Hasta 2013," October 2, 2003;

Notification pursuant to Article XVI:1 GATT and Article 25 SCM, G/SCM/N/16/EEC, April 2, 1997;

Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales, Congreso de los Diputados, November 19, 2003, Núm. 296, Dictámenes de Comisiones sobre iniciativas legislativas, proyecto de ley de presupuestos generales del estado para el año 2004 (p. 15625);

Department of Trade and Industry, UK Government Expenditure Plans 2001-02 to 2003-04 and Main Estimates 2001-02;

"Plane-makers in monsterjet dogfight", Mail on Sunday, March 19, 2000, p. 11;

"BAe Plays Jobs Card in Battle for A3XX Funding", Air Transport Intelligence September 1, 1999;

Gellman, Weber, Hamlin, Aboulafia, A Shadow Critical Project Appraisal: The A380 Program (updated version: July 2004);

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1970, Rapport No 56 (69-70), Tome IV, Annexe No 25, Transports II Aviation civile;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1976, Rapport No 62 (75-76) Tome III, Annexe No 31, Transports III Aviation civile;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1977, Rapport No 65 (76-77) Tome III, Annexe No 31, Transports III Aviation civile et meteorologie;

Legrand (Bernard), Commission des affaires économiques, Projet de loi de finances 1978, Avis No. 90, Tome XVII;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1979, Rapport No 74 (78-79) Tome III, Annexe No 29, Transports II Aviation civile et meteorologie;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1980, Rapport No 50 (79-80) Tome III, Annexe No 28, Transports II Aviation civile, V Meteorologie;

Marcellin (Raymond), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1981, Rapport No 98 (80-81) Tome III, Annexe No 28;

Pintat (Jean-Francois), commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1984, Rapport No 62 (83-84) Tome III, Annexe 33 du 21/11/1983, Transports II aviation civile / IV meteorologie;

Pintat (Jean-Francois), commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1985, Rapport No 69 (84-85) Tome III, Annexe 34, Urbanisme, logement et transports II. Transports 2. Aviation civile – 4. meteorologie;

Legrand (Bernard), Commission des affaires économiques, Projet de loi de finances pour 1986, Avis No. 98 (85-86) Tome XIX, Aviation Civile;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de Loi de finances pour 1987, Rapport n° 67, Tome III Annexe No. 21, Equipement, Logement, Aménagement du territoire et Transports, IV Transports, 2. Aviation civile, 4. Metereologie;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, du contrôle budgétaire et des comptes économiques de la nation sur le Projet loi de finances pour 1988, Rapport n° 93, Tome III Annexe No. 20, Equipement, Logement, aménagement du territoire et Transports, IV Transports, 1. Aviation Civile, 3. Météorologie;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi des finances pour 1989, Rapport n° 88 (88-89), Tome III, Annexe No. 34, Transports et mer II/Aviation civile III/Météorologie;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi des finances pour 1990, Rapport No. 59 (89-90) Tome III, Annexe 19, Equipement, logement, transports et mer III – Aviation civile IV – Météorologie;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1991, Rapport n° 85 (90-91), Tome III, Annexe 19, Equipement, logement, transport et mer;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des Finances, Projet de loi des Finances pour 1992, Rapport n° 92 (91-92) Tome III, Annexes 26, 27 et 41, Equipement, logement, transports et espace II – Transports : 4. Transport aérien et espace III – Météorologie aviation civile;

Romani (Roger), Commission des Finances, Projet de loi des Finances pour 1993, Rapport n° 56 (92-93) Tome III, Annexes 18 et 36, Equipement, logement, transports et espace, II- Transports : Transport aérien, III – Météorologie, Aviation civile;

Cartigny (Ernest), Commission des Finances pour 1994, Rapport n° 101 (93-94) Tome III, Annexe No. 21, Equipement, Transports et Tourisme, II. Transports : 4. Transports aériens, 5. Météorologie et Aviation civile;

Cartigny (Ernest), Commission des Finances sur le projet de loi de finances pour 1995, Rapport n° 79 (94/95), Tome III, Annexe No. 21, Equipement, Transports et Tourisme, II. Transports : 4. Transport aérien – 5. Météorologie et Aviation civile;

Collin (Yvon), Commission des Finances sur le projet de loi des Finances pour 1998, Rapport n° 85 (97/98), Tome III, Annexe No. 23, Equipement, transports et logement : II-Transports : Transports aérien et météorologie et aviation civile;

Marini (Philippe), Commission des Finances, Projet de Loi de Finances pour 2004, Rapport No. 73 (2003-2004), Tome III, Annexe No. 18;

German Economics Ministry, Press Release, November 1988, reprinted in Handelsblatt, November 3, 1988;

Deutscher Bundestag, BT-Drs. 13/4244, Unterrichtung durch die Bundesregierung, Bericht zur Lage der deutschen Luft- und Raumfahrtindustrie;

"El gran desafío de la industria aeroespacial europea, integrarse o desaparecer," Economía Industrial No. 314, 1997, p. 15;

Notification by the European Communities pursuant to Article XVI:1 of the GATT 1994 and Article 25 of the Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures, G/SCM/N/3/EEC, March 12, 1996;

Contestaciones del Gobierno, Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales, Congreso de los Diputados, Serie D, Núm. 251, October 18, 2001;

DTI Departmental Reports;

BAE Annual Reports;

"British Aerospace - Final Results," AFX, February 25, 1999, p. 8;

"British Aerospace - Increased profit, dividend and order book for British Aerospace in 1998," M2 Presswire, February 25, 1999, p. 2;

Information from EIB website "Projects and Loans - Loans Activity" for the following loans:

EADS R&D 1&2 (2002);

Aerospatiale Super Transporteurs (1993);

Aerospatiale Super Transporteurs (1997);

Aerospatiale-Gramont A330/340;

Aerospatiale-Gramont A330/340 II;

British Aerospace A320 (1988);

British Aerospace A320 (1989);

British Aerospace Airbus A330/340 (1990);

British Aerospace Airbus A330/340 (1991);

CASA Airbus A-320/330/340 (1989);

CASA Airbus A-320/330/340 (1990);

Airbus Industrie-A321;

'The Innovation 2000 Initiative, Actively Promoting a European Economy based on Knowledge and Innovation', European Investment Bank (http://www.eib.org/Attachments/thematic/i2i_en.pdf);

Statute of the EIB;

Joint Memorandum establishing a framework for co-operation between the community research framework programme and the "Innovation 2000 Initiative" between the European Community and the European Investment Bank;

EIB, "Financing Europe's Future," available at http://www.eib.org/Attachments/general/financing_future_en.pdf;

European Commission, Description of the EIB, available at http://europa.eu.int/institutions/eib/index_en.htm;

EIB website, FAQ Projects & Loans, available at <http://www.eib.org/faq/faq.asp?faq=65>;

EIB Annual Reports 1989, 1990, 1993, 1997, 1998, 1999, 2000;

EIB Financial and Activity Reports 2001, 2002, 2003, 2004;

EIB, Annual Press Conference 2003, Background Note No. 1, February 2003;

Innovation 2010 Initiative, available at www.eib.org/site/index.asp?designation=i2i;

EIB, "Financing facilities," available at <http://www.eib.org/projects/policies/>;

EIB, "Individual Loans," available at <http://www.eib.org/projects/dynamic.asp?cat=37>;

EIB, Research, Development and Innovation, Practical Investors' Guide to EIB Financing;

EIB, The Project Cycle;

Innovation 2010 Initiative, 2000-2002 Review
(<http://www.eib.org/site/dynamic.asp?designation=i2i&sCountChildren=4&childHeaderId=293>);

Overview of projects funded under the i2i program;

EIB Eligibility Guidelines;

Senate Report No. 299 (session ordinaire de 2000-2001), Rapport fait au nom de la Commission des Affaires Economiques et du Plan sur le projet de loi relatif à la réalisation d'un itinéraire à très grand gabarit entre le port de Bordeaux et Toulouse;

Cour des Comptes, Rapport sur L'Exécution des Lois de Finances en Vue du Reglement du Budget de l'Exercice 2001, Titre 2 - Les analyses générales, Chapitre 2 - Les Dépenses, I - Prévisions des Fois de Finances et Dépenses Effectives;

Document accompanying the expropriation law for the Bordeaux-Toulouse road project (Document accompagnant l'arret déclarant l'utilité publique en application de l'article L11-1-1 du code de l'expropriation pour cause d'utilité publique, Ministère de l'Équipement, des Transports et du Logement);

Dow Jones Newswires, "Airbus Tests Logistics of Shipping Jumbo A380 Parts," November 3, 2003;

Port of Bordeaux, Flash Infos 90;

Aquitane Region press release, "Développement durable et retombées économiques de l'A380," April 2, 2003;

Press Release of the Port of Bordeaux, "Installations nautiques pour l'acheminement des éléments de l'A380" (undated);

Hamburgische Bürgerschaft, Drucksache 16/4734, Mitteilung des Senats an die Bürgerschaft, September 5, 2000;

"Airbus invests in the development of the Hamburg plant," Financial Times Deutschland, February 14, 2005;

A REA, A380-Werkserweiterung im Mühlenberger Loch – Eine Bilanz;

Niedersächsische Landtag, Drs. 14/275, Entwurf eines Gesetzes zu dem Staatsvertrag zwischen der Freien und Hansestadt Hamburg und dem Land Niedersachsen über die Planfeststellungsverfahren zum Zwecke der Erweiterung des Daimler-Benz-Aerospace-Airbus-Werkes in Hamburg-Finkenwerder, October 15, 1998;

Hamburgische Bürgerschaft, Drs. 18/1512, Mitteilung des Senats an die Bürgerschaft, 21 December 2004;

Hamburgische Bürgerschaft, Drs. 17/1733, responding to Written Question by MP Maass, October 22, 2002;

Hamburgische Bürgerschaft, Drucksache 17/3641, Mitteilung des Senats an die Bürgerschaft, 11 November 2003;

ReGe Hamburg webpage, available at www.rege-hamburg.de;

Hamburgische Bürgerschaft, Drs. 17/2267, Jahresbericht 2003 des Rechnungshofs über die Prüfung der Haushalts- und Wirtschaftsführung der Freien und Hansestadt Hamburg mit Bemerkungen zur Haushaltsrechnung 2001, February 19, 2003, pp. 1, 150-158;

Heidenhain, Handbuch des europäischen Beihilfenrechts, pp. 177-178;

Commission Notice in State Aid Case C 41/94, Aid to Fritz Egger Spanplattenindustrie GmbH & Co. KG, OJ 1996 C 281/15, p. 18;

European Commission Staff Work Document "Vademecum on Community Rules on State Aid and the Financing of the Construction of Seaport Infrastructures" (January 15, 2002);

Certain Steel Products from Korea, 58 FR 37338, 37346 (July 9, 1993);

"Gewerbeimmobilien in Hamburg" published by the City of Hamburg, available at <http://fhh.hamburg.de/stadt/Aktuell/behoerden/finanzbehoerde/immobilien/mipim-2005/karte-f,property=source.pdf>;

Commission Decision 2002/14/EC "Kimberley-Clark" of July 12, 2000, OJ 2002 L 12/1;

Freie und Hansestadt Hamburg, Landesbetrieb Geoinformation und Vermessung, Geschäftsstelle des Gutachterausschusses für Grundstückswerte in Hamburg, "Der Grundstücksmarkt in Hamburg 2003;

Hamburgische Gesellschaft für Wirtschaftsförderung mbH, Gewerbeimmobilienservice, Industriegebiet Rüschnhalbinsel, Finkenwerder, available at http://www.hamburg-economy.de/immo-service/flaeche2_detail.html;

Jones Lang Lasalle, Gewerbegebietreport Hamburg, August 2004;

"Immobilienstandort Metropolregion Hamburg: Die Logistikbranche boomt dank dem Hafen," Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung, June 3, 2005;

"Airbus! Hark Bohm, Verleger Bauer, Senator Uldall streiten beim Abendblatt. A380: Bringt er wirklich Arbeitsplätze?..." , Hamburger Abendblatt, March 8, 2003;

Industrie- und Handelskammer Berlin ("IHK Berlin"), Langfristige Entwicklung der Mieten für Läden, Büro- und Praxisräume, Gaststätten, Fabrik- und Werkstattgebäude, 2005, p. 2, available at http://www.immowertgutachter.de/gfx/gewerbemieten_in_berlin_2004.pdf (last visited February 2005);

Commission Decision 2002/142/EC, of July 18, 2001, OJ 2002 L 48/20;

Maps published by the German air traffic control agency Deutsche Flugsicherung in the German AIP, dated October 14 and October 28, 2004;

Bremische Bürgerschaft, Antrag (EntschlieÙung) der Fraktion der SPD, Drucksache 12/194, May 16, 1998;

Bremische Bürgerschaft, Plenarprotokoll, 18. Sitzung, 12. Wahlperiode, May 18, 1988;

Airport Bremen, "Gebühren/Entgelte – Auszug aus der Entgeltordnung für den Verkehrsflughafen Bremen, 01.01.2005";

IATA overview of Bremen airport charges from 1989-2005;

Niederschrift über die Sitzung des Straßen-und Verkehrsausschusses, March 13, 2002 (www.varel.de);

Airbus, press release, "Airbus' A380 Final Assembly Facility inaugurated by French President", July 16, 2002 (originally found on http://www.airbus.com/airbus4u/articles_print.asp?ae_id=525);

<http://asp.lafabrique.com/btp.asp>;

"Le président de la République a inauguré hier le chantier de construction du site d'assemblage de L'A380...", Les Echos, July 17, 2002, p. 10;

"La ville maintient sa politique de dette zéro depuis 1999, mais sa communauté d'agglomération s'est fortement endettée pour aménager la zone Aéroconstellation à Blagnac...", Les Echos, April 3, 2003, p. 6;

Aéroconstellation, overview of "investissements publics partagés" at <http://www.aeroconstellation.fr>;

Les autres voies de circulation, list of infrastructure projects in the Département Haute-Garonne, published by the Conseil Général de la Haute-Garonne, available at <http://www.cg31.fr/actioncg31.asp?id=31>;

Articles L-300-1 et seq. of the French Code de l'Urbanisme; Les Fiches Pratiques de l'administration Générale, No. 35, Janvier 2002 ("La Création d'une Zone d'Aménagement Concerté"); Fiches Pratiques Techniques, No. 86, Février 2005 ("La Procédure de ZAC depuis la Loi SRU");

Conseil de la Communauté d'agglomération du Grand Toulouse du vendredi 17 mai 2002, extrait du register des deliberations, autorisation d'occupation temporaire (AOT) des terrains appartenant à l'état: Délégation au Président, No 2002-05-ADU-01;

Aéroconstellation, description from Greater Toulouse area website, available at www.grandtoulouse.org and <http://www.grandtoulouse.org/index.php?pagecode=20>;

Société d'Équipement de Toulouse Midi-Pyrées (SETOMIP) website, available at <http://www.setomip.fr>;

Conseil de Communauté d'Agglomération du Grand Toulouse du Lundi 29 janvier 2001, ZAC Aeroconstellation Phase 1: Dossier de Réalisation, <http://publi.agglo-grandtoulouse.fr/>;

Les Echos, No. 18555, December 19, 2001, p. 12;

Les Echos, No. 19155, May 10, 2004, p. 20;

Conseil de Communauté d'Agglomération du Grand Toulouse du Jeudi 19 avril 2001, 4ième Modification de l'Acte de Création de la ZAC de Grand Noble II, p. 3, available at <http://publi.agglo-grandtoulouse.fr/>;

City of Blagnac, Les Parc d'Activités, available at <http://www.blagnac-eco.com>;

"Les Collectivités Locales Toulousaines ont signé hier un protocole pour constituer une ZAC aéronautique de 220 hectares au nord de l'aéroport de Blagnac, berceau potentiel de l'Airbus de 550 places," Les Echos No. 17994, September 28, 1999, p. 13;

"Air France inaugure son nouveau centre industriel de Blagnac," Air France, April 2, 2004, available at [http://www.airfrance.com/double6/file/Y1/file_Y1.nsf/\(Lookup\)/fr-ENVIR-blagnac/\\$file/DP-w.pdf](http://www.airfrance.com/double6/file/Y1/file_Y1.nsf/(Lookup)/fr-ENVIR-blagnac/$file/DP-w.pdf);

Le Programme Constellation, Quelques Chiffres, "Le ZAC AeroConstellation", available at www.aeroconstellation.com;

"Elyo becomes an Airbus partner," Elyo press release, July 23, 2001;

"Suez partenaire de l'Airbus A380," Le Figaro, Firstinvest.com, February 5, 2002;

ExxonMobil to fuel first A380 flight," ExxonMobil press release, November 2, 2003; "ExxonMobil set to fuel the first A380 flight," ExxonMobil press release, 2001;

Map of the AeroConstellation site, available at <http://www.aeroconstellation.com> and at <http://perso.wanadoo.fr/franceaero/plan/planaccueil.htm>;

Mairie de Toulouse, Capitole Info, Été 2004 - Supplément du N°146: Un dessein pour Toulouse, summer 2004, p. 6, 10;

Agence d'Urbanisme et d'Aménagement du Territoire Toulouse Aire Urbaine, Atlas des Parcs d'Activités de la Haute-Garonne, available at <http://www.auat-toulouse.org>;

Niedersächsischer Landtag, Drs. 14/3447, Entschliessungsantrag der SPD Fraktion, June 5, 2002;

The National Assembly for Wales, Official record, p. 12 (February 7, 2002);

Welsh Enterprise Institute, "Reaching for the Skies or Waiting for the Wings to Fall off? The Welsh Assembly, Grant Aid and British Aerospace," Paper 8, November 2000;

"Airbus UK - setting the pace," the Welsh Assembly Government, press release January 26, 2006;

"Hundreds of new jobs at Airbus," BBC News, January 26, 2006;

House of Commons, Minutes of evidence taken before Welsh Affairs Committee, February 11, 2004;

UK Parliament, Hansard Debates for 21 March 2000 (comments by Mr. Jones);

Order ECO/981/2002 of April 12, 2002 (8621), Ministerio de Economia, Boletín Oficial del Estado Núm. 108, May 6, 2002, p. 16422;

Ley 50/1985 de 27 de diciembre, de Incentivos Regionales para la corrección de desequilibrios económicos interterritoriales, BOE January 3, 1986;

Order ECO/1336/2003 of April 21, 2003 (10823), Ministerio de Economia, Boletín Oficial del Estado Núm. 128, May 29, 2003, p. 20803;

Press Release, Ministry of Economics, "Aprobados Incentivos Regionales para cinco proyectos por 105 millones €," March 6, 2003;

Order ECO/2357/2003 of July 25, 2003 (16574), Ministerio de Economia, Boletín Oficial del Estado Núm. 200, August 21, 2003, p. 32282;

Agreement of July 10, 2001, by the Governing Council of the Regional Government of Andalusia, Boletín Oficial de la Junta de Andalucía, Núm. 96, August 21, 2001, p. 14.290;

Expansión, "Casa y Cepsa reciben ayudas para sus nuevas fábricas en Andalucía," May 16, 2001;

Agreement of July 30, 2002, by the Governing Council of the Regional Government of Andalusia, Boletín Oficial de la Junta de Andalucía, Núm. 126, October 29, 2002, p. 21.003;

Press Release of the Consejería de Innovación, Ciencia y Empresa de la Junta de Andalucía, "El Consejo aprueba ayudas de 44.9 millones de euros para los proyectos aeronáuticos de EADS-CASA en Sevilla";

Agreement of July 29, 2003, by the Governing Council of the Regional Government of Andalusia, Boletín Oficial de la Junta de Andalucía, Num. 193, October 7, 2003, p. 21.178;

Junta de Andalucía, Referencias del Consejo de Gobierno, "La Junta respalda con una ayuda de 17.5 millones de euros la ampliación de la factoría de Airbus en Puerto Real", July 29, 2003;

Diario de Sevilla, "La Junta acumula mas de 100 millones en ayudas al sector," July 30, 2003;

Press Releases, Government of Castilla-La Mancha, "Aprobados mas de 7.5 millones de euros para la modernización de la planta de Airbus en Illescas (Toledo)", March 16, 2004; and "Las ayudas a Airbus España permitiran crear 274 nuevos empleos en cuatro años en la region", March 17, 2004;

Agreement of October 19, 2004, by the Governing Council of the Regional Government of Andalusia, Boletín Oficial de la Junta de Andalucía, Núm. 211, October 28, 2004, p. 24.457;

Cinco Dias, "Andalucía entrega 62 millones a la planta de EADS en Sevilla", October 20, 2004;

Expansion, "La Junta concede su mayor ayuda industrial a Eads", October 20, 2004;

"German Airbus Partner Warns of Possible Finance Problems," Michael Feazel, Aviation Week & Space Technology, 15 December 1986, p. 33;

"US Officials Protesting German Aid for Airbus," New York Times, November 7, 1988;

"Luftfahrtindustrie, Neue Namen und Strukturen, Bündelung der Kräfte," Handelsblatt Nr. 239, December 12, 1989;

"Daimler-Benz/MBB/Deutsche Airbus GmbH verlegt Sitz nach Hamburg," Handelsblatt Nr. 224, November 20, 1989;

"West Germany Poised to Agree Financing of Stake in Airbus," Financial Times, November 2, 1988;

"German Managers near Completion of Deutsche Aerospace Framework," Aviation Week & Space Technology, January 29, 1990;

"Deutsche Airbus to Change Name on October 1," Bloomberg News, August 21, 1992;

Aérospatiale Annual Reports 1985 to 1999;

Aérospatiale – Matra Annual Report 1999;

"Corporate Strategies, France: Aérospatiale Reveals Earnings/Losses by Sector," from 96WS0219A Paris AIR & COSMOS/AVIATION INTERNATIONAL September 6, 1996;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi des finances pour 1989, Rapport n° 88 (88-89), Tome III Annexe 34 du 21/11/1988, Transports et mer II/Aviation civile III/Météorologie;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi des finances pour 1990, Rapport n° 59 (89-90) Tome III Annexe 19 du 21/11/1989, Equipement, logement, transports et mer III – Aviation civile IV – Météorologie;

Fortier (Marcel), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1991, Rapport n° 85 (90-91) Tome III Annexe 19, Equipement, logement, transport et mer;

EC Guidelines for the Calculation of the Amount of the Subsidy in Countervailing Duty Investigations, OJ C 394, 17.12.1998, p. 6;

Rose M. D'Sa, European Community Law on State Aid (London: 1998), p. 329;

Commission Communication to the EC Member States, Application of Articles 92 and 93 of the EEC Treaty and of Article 5 of Commission Directive 80/723/EEC to public undertakings in the manufacturing sector, OJ C307/3, 13 November 1993;

Communication from the Commission, Community Guidelines Applying Articles 87 and 88 of the Treaty to the Granting of Urgency and/or Restructuring Aid to Firms in Difficulty, available at http://europa.eu.int/comm/competition/state_aid/others/difficulty/en.pdf;

Commission notice pursuant to Article 93(2) EEC concerning aid by France to Compagnie des Machines Bull, C 37/91, France [1992] OJ C244/2 ("Bull");

Commission Decision 95/422/ECSC concerning State Aid to the ECSC Steel Undertakings Neue Maxhütte Stahlwerke GmbH et al., OJ L253/22 (1995), at 4;

"Accord annonce en juillet dernier – Le Credit Lyonnais finalise son entrée dans Aérospatiale", Les Echos, January 13, 1993;

"Credit Lyonnais to Buy 20% Stake in Aérospatiale from French Government," Aviation Week & Space Technology, August 3, 1992;

"Credit Lyonnais: Gestion par Temps de Crise", Les Echos, January 7, 1993, p. 14;

Eric Leser, "Un apport bienvenu d'argent frais: Le Crédit Lyonnais controlera 20% du capital d'Aérospatiale," Le Monde, July 25, 1992;

Commission Decision 95/547/EC, of 26 July 1995, OJ (1995) L308/92;

"Credit Lyonnais Chairman Appointed by Socialists," Financial Times, September 13, 1988;

"France Pledges Subsidy to Aerospace Group," New York Times, February 3, 1994;

"Aérospatiale posts FFfr2.3bn loss," Financial Times, March 26, 1993;

Martine Laronche, "Face à une conjoncture difficile, Aérospatiale obtient de l'Etat une dotation de 2 milliards de francs", Le Monde, February 4, 1994;

"EMC obtient 500 millions de francs de dotation en capital," Les Echos, January 24, 1994;

"Airbus receives \$850 million order from AIG's International Lease Finance," Wall Street Journal, September 8, 1994, at 3B;

"Après plusieurs mois d'attente – Aérospatiale recevrait les 3 milliards de dotation réclamés", Les Echos, January 6, 1994, p. 9;

"EC to Review France's Aérospatiale Capital Injection", Aerospace Daily, February 9, 1994, p. 218;

Press Release of the Ministry of Economics and the Ministry of Defense, February 2, 1994;

"Aérospatiale reçoit de l'Etat deux milliards au lieu de trois," La Tribune Desfosses, February 3, 1994, p. 10;

"Aérospatiale recapitalisée à hauteur de 2 milliards," Les Echos, February 3, 1994, p. 10;

"La question des hommes et surtout celle des parités entre Aérospatiale et Matra sont les deux derniers points à régler avant que le dossier de la fusion puisse être transmis, dès cette fin de semaine, à la Commission de privatisation", Les Echos, January 11, 1999, p. 9;

Senate Report No. 89 (session ordinaire de 1999-2000), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour

2000, Tome III, Annexe No. 25, Équipement, Transport et Logement: III. - Transports: Transport Aérien et Météorologie et Aviation Civile, pp. 50-54;

Collin, Senate Report No 414 (1998-1999), "l'Industrie Aéronautique Européenne ou l'Impératif de l'Union";

Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales, Cuenta General del Estado de 1992, Serie A, Núm. 34 (January 13, 1997), p. 122, 123;

Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales, Congreso de los Diputados, Cuenta General del Estado de 1997, Serie A, Núm. 139, Tribunal de Cuentas (April 30, 2001), p. 89, 99;

Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales, Congreso de los Diputados, Cuenta General del Estado de 1998, Serie A, Núm. 176, Tribunal de Cuentas (July 17, 2001), p. 84;

European Commission, Challenges for European Aeronautics, available at http://europa.eu.int/comm/research/aeronautics/why/challenges_en.html;

European Commission, European Research in Aeronautics, Dietrich Knoerzer (Bucharest, December 10, 2004);

European Commission, Technology Platforms. From Definition to Implementation of a Common Research Agenda, 2004;

European Commission, The Competitive and Sustainable Growth Programme, 1998-2002 Project Synopses: New Perspectives in Aeronautics, 2003;

European Commission, STAR 21. Strategic Aerospace Review for the 21st Century. Creating a Coherent Market and Policy Framework for a Vital European Industry (July 2002);

European Commission, Proposal for a Decision of the European Parliament and of the Council concerning the seventh framework programme of the European Community for research, technological development and demonstration activities (2007 to 2013), April 6, 2005, COM(2005)119 final;

"EC Sets out Aerospace Priorities in Seventh Framework," Flight International (May 24, 2005);

European Commission, The Sixth Framework Programme. Aeronautics and Space, available at http://europa.eu.int/comm/research/fp6/p4/index_en.html;

Jack Metthey and Herbert von Bose, European Commission (DGXII/CII-01), On the Up, Euroabstracts June 1999;

More Open Electrical Technologies (MOET), October 18, 2004 (Version 1), available at http://www.aerosme.com/download/WorkshopFP6Call3/abstracts/MOET_181004.pdf;

"The Wrong Stuff", Flight International (February 15, 2005);

Council Decision of 28 September 1987 concerning the framework programme for Community activities in the field of research and technological development (1987 to 1991) (87/516/Euratom, EEC) OJ L 302/1 (October 24, 1987);

Council Decision of 20 June 1989 adopting a specific programme for the dissemination and utilization of scientific and technological research results (Value) 1989 to 1992 (89/412/EEC) OJ L 200/23 (July 13, 1989);

European Commission, BRITE/EURAM Area 5, Specific Activities Relating to Aeronautics, Synopses of Projects Supported Under the 1989 Call for Proposals, Commission of the European Communities, EUR 13210 EN, 1990;

European Commission, Industrials & Materials Technologies Brite-EuRam II, Synopses of Current Projects, including Projects Running Under Brite and Brite/EuRam, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities;

European Commission, Fourth Framework Programme, Aeronautics Related Research, Synopses of Current Projects Selected Under the 1995 Call for Proposals (1996);

Council Decision of 14 March 1989 on a specific research and technological development programme in the field of industrial manufacturing technologies and advanced materials applications (Brite/Euram) (1989 to 1992) (89/237/EEC) OJ L 98/18 (April 11, 1989);

BRITE-EURAM, Making a Lasting Impression on Europe, European Commission (2002);

European Commission, Industrial and Materials Technologies programme: Area 3, Aeronautics: Synopses of Current Aeronautics Projects 1993. Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg. EUR 15292 EN (1993);

Council Decision of 19 December 1991 adopting the work programme for the implementation of the specific programme of research and technological development in the field of industrial and materials technologies (1991 to 1994) (91/679/EEC) OJ L 375/18 (December 31, 1991);

Council Decision of 9 September 1991 adopting a specific programme of research and technological development in the field of industrial and materials technologies (1990 to 1994) (91/506/EEC), OJ L 269/30 (September 25, 1991);

Malroux et al., Evaluation of the IMT programme - area 3, Aeronautics (1990-1994). Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, Luxembourg. EUR 16948 EN (1996);

Call for proposals for the specific programme of research and technology development in the field of industrial and materials technologies, Area 3, Aeronautics (1992-1994), (91/C333/11) OJ C 333/14 (December 24, 1992);

Council Decision of 23 April 1990 concerning the framework programme of Community activities in the field of research and technological development (1990 to 1994) (90/221/Euratom, EEC), OJ L 117/28 (May 8, 1990);

Council Decision of 29 April 1992 on the dissemination and exploitation of knowledge resulting from the specific programmes of research and technological development of the Community (92/272/EEC), OJ L 141/1 (May 23, 1992);

Commission Regulation (EC) No 1990/94 of 26 July 1994 adopting the implementing provisions for the rules laid down in the first paragraph of Article 8 of Council Decision 92/272/EEC on the

dissemination and exploitation of knowledge resulting from the specific programmes of research aid technological development of the Community OJ L 200/4 (August 2, 1994);

Council Decision of 27 July 1994 adopting a specific programme for research and technological development, including demonstration, in the field of industrial and materials technologies (1994-1998) (94/571/EC), OJ L 222/19;

First call for proposals for the specific programme for research and technological development, including demonstration, in the field of industrial and material technologies (1994-1998)(Areas 1, 2, and 3) (94/C357/03) OJ C 357/3 (December 15, 1994);

Call for proposals for R&TD actions in the specific programmes for research and technological development, including demonstration, in the field of industrial and material technologies (1994 to 1998) and in the field of information technologies (1994 to 1998) (97/C329/10) OJ C 329/13 (October 31, 1997);

Decision No 1110/94/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 26 April 1994 concerning the fourth framework programme of the European Community activities in the field of research and technological development and demonstration (1994 to 1998), OJ L 126/1 (May 18, 1994);

Decision No 616/96/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 25 March 1996 adapting Decision No 1110/94/EC concerning the Fourth framework programme of the European Community activities in the field of research and technological development and demonstration (1994-1998) following the accession of the Republic of Austria, the Republic of Finland and the Kingdom of Sweden to the European Union OJ L 86/69 (04/04/1996);

Decision No 2535/97/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 1 December 1997 adapting for the second time Decision No 1110/94/EC concerning the fourth framework programme of the European Community activities in the field of research and technological development and demonstration (1994 - 1998), OJ L347/1 (12/18/1997);

Council Decision of 21 November 1994 concerning the rules for the participation of undertakings, research centres and universities in research, technological development and demonstration activities of the European Community (94/763/EC), OJ L 306/8;

Council Decision of 21 November 1994 concerning the rules for the dissemination of the research results from the specific programmes of research, technological development and demonstration of the European Community (94/762/EC), OJ L 306/5;

Commission Regulation (EC) No 2897/95 of December 15, 1995 on the implementation of Article 1 of Council Decision No 94/762/EC concerning the rules for the dissemination of the research results from the specific programmes of research, technological development and demonstration of the European Community, OJ L 304/11 (December 16, 1995);

Council Decision of January 25, 1999 adopting a specific program for research, technological development and demonstration on competitive and sustainable growth (1998 - 2002) (1999/169/EC), OJ L 64/40 (March 12, 1999);

Decision No 182/1999/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 22 December 1998 concerning the fifth framework programme of the European Community for research, technological development and demonstration activities (1998 to 2002), OJ L26/1 (February 1, 1999);

Council Decision of 22 December 1998 concerning the rules for the participation of undertakings, research centres and universities and for the dissemination of research results for the implementation of the fifth framework programme of the European Community (1998-2002) (1999/65/EC), OJ L26/46 (February 1, 1999);

Commission Regulation (EC) No 996/1999 of 11 May 1999 on the implementation of Council Decision 1999/65/EC concerning the rules for the participation of undertakings, research centers and universities and for the dissemination of research results for the implementation of the fifth framework programme of the European Community (1998-2002), OJ L 122/9 (May 12, 1999);

Call for proposals for indirect RTD actions under the specific programme for research, technological development and demonstration on competitive and sustainable growth (1999/C361/05) OJ C 361/7 (December 15, 1999);

Call for proposals for indirect RTD actions under the specific programme for research, technological development and demonstration on competitive and sustainable growth (2000/C155/09) OJ C 155/9 (June 6, 2000);

Call for proposals for indirect RTD actions under the specific programme for research, technological development and demonstration on competitive and sustainable growth (2000/C359/07) OJ C 359/23 (December 14, 2000);

Call for proposals for indirect RTD actions under the specific programme for research, technological development and demonstration on competitive and sustainable growth (2001/C159/07) OJ C 159/7 (June 1, 2001);

Decision No 1513/2002/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 27 June 2002 concerning the sixth framework programme of the European Community for research, technological development and demonstration activities, contributing to the creation of the European Research Area and to innovation (2002 to 2006), OJ L 232/1 (August 29, 2002);

Regulation (EC) No 2321/2002 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 16 December 2002 concerning the rules for the participation of undertakings, research centers and universities in, and for the dissemination of research results for, the implementation of the European Community Sixth Framework Programme (2002-2006), OJ L355/23 (December 30, 2002);

European Commission, FP6 Budget, available at <http://www.cordis.lu/fp6/budget.htm>;

European Commission, Commission Inter-Service Group on Technology Platforms, Status Report - Development of Technology Platforms, February 2005;

Council Decision of September 30, 2002 (2002/834/EC) adopting a specific programme for research, technological development and demonstration: 'Integrating the European Research Area' (2002-2006), OJ L294/1;

European Commission, Calls for proposals for indirect RTD actions under the specific programme for research, technological development and demonstration: 'Integrating and strengthening the European Research Area', OJ C 315/1 (December 17, 2002);

European Commission, Calls for proposals for indirect RTD actions under the specific programme for research, technological development and demonstration: 'Integrating and strengthening the European Research Area', OJ C 303/6 (December 13, 2003) (Annexes 1 and 2);

European Commission, Calls for proposals for indirect RTD actions under the specific programme for research, technological development and demonstration: 'Integrating and strengthening the European Research Area', OJ C 79/29 (April 1, 2005) (Annexes 1 and 2);

European Commission, European Research in Aeronautics, Dietrich Knoerzer (Bucharest, December 10, 2004);

Cordis database of FP 6 projects (available at http://dbs.cordis.lu/fep-cgi/srchidadb?CALLER=FP6_PROJ&USR_SORT=EN_QVD+CHAR+DESC&QZ_WEBSRCH=&QM_EP_PGA_A=FP6-AEROSPACE&QM_EP_CY_D=);

FP6 Model Contract (Commission Decision C(2003)3834 dated 23.10.03);

EADS - Chief Technology Office, Research Cooperation with Universities, Yann Barbaux (Berlin, May 12, 2004);

European Commission, Negotiation Guidance Notes for Coordinators of Integrated Projects (IP), Version 2, February 2004;

European Commission, Negotiation Guidance Notes for Coordinators of Specific Targeted Research Projects (STREP) or Specific Targeted Innovation Projects (STIP), Version 3, March 2005;

FP5 Model Contract, available at ftp://ftp.cordis.lu/pub/fp5/docs/moc_rtdp_en_199901.pdf;

FP4 Model Contract;

AeIGT, National Aerospace Technology Strategy, Implementation Report, 2004;

MG4 FP6 Model Consortium Agreement, IMG4 FP6CA version 4 final.doc, November 5, 2004, available at http://www.aerosme.com/download/IMG4FP6CA_final.pdf;

Jürgen Brandt, The Composite Material Research Requirements of the Aerospace Industry, EADS Deutschland;

Dieter Knoerzer, European Research in Aeronautics - Topics of the 3rd Call for Proposals, Den Haag (February 23, 2005);

Technopolis Ltd, The Impact of EU Framework Programmes in the UK, Background Paper, Framework Programme Evaluation Case Studies, July 2004;

Airbus/Dassault presentation, "Advanced and Low Cost Aircraft Structure", October 29, 2003;

AECMA, Aerospace Within the European Research Area, January 2001;

WAVENC project description in Cordis database, available at http://ica.cordis.lu/search/index.cfm?fuseaction=proj.simplifiedocument&PJ_RCN=2901933&CFID=2948649&CFTOKEN=76613992;

European Commission, The European Strategic Agenda for Aeronautics Research and the 7^o FP of the European Commission, Liam Breslin, DG Research - Aeronautics;

Communication from the Commission, Science and technology, the key to Europe's future - Guidelines for future European Union policy to support research, COM(2004) 353 final (June 6, 2004);

NACE 35.3 (Classification of Economic Activities in the European Community);

ISIC 353 (International Standard Industrial Classification of all Economic Activities);

Thierry Pardessus, EADS Airbus France, The Multi-Site Extended Enterprise Concept in the Aeronautical Industry, presentation at Aeronautics Days 2001 (January 2001);

ENHANCE Consortium, The ENHANCE Project's benefits for SMEs, March 2002;

VIVACE consortium website, available at <http://www.vivaceproject.com/content/introduction/intro.php>;

Dietrich Knoerzer, European Commission "European Research in Aeronautics, Addressing Challenges of the 21st Century", WakeNet2 Workshop, Langen, November 30, 2004;

Hans W. Pohl, Airbus Deutschland, Nationale und Europäische Förderprogramme, May 2004;

KATnet-MDAW, available at <http://www.kat-net.com/projects/display.php?id=14>;

Huenecke, EADS Airbus, European Wake Vortex Research Activities - The Role of the EC for the Aircraft Industry, presentation at Aeronautics Days 2001 (January 2001);

de Bruin, NLR, S-Wake: An Assessment of Wake Vortex Safety, presentation at Aeronautics Days 2001 (January 2001);

WAVENC project description at http://ica.cordis.lu/search/index.cfm?fuseaction=proj.simplifiedocument&PJ_RCN=2901933&CFID=2948649&CFTOKEN=76613992;

C-WAKE project description at http://ica.cordis.lu/search/index.cfm?fuseaction=proj.simplifiedocument&PJ_RCN=4639970&CFID=2952581&CFTOKEN=81424297;

Dominique Briere, EADS Airbus SA, Overview on Airbus- Fly-by-Wire Status, presentation at Aeronautics Days 2001 (January 2001) (attachment 55);

Yanez, EADS CASA, Electrically Powered Actuators for Flight Control Surfaces, presentation at Aeronautics Days 2001 (January 2001);

NEVADA project description at http://ica.cordis.lu/search/index.cfm?fuseaction=proj.simplifiedocument&PJ_RCN=2901664&CFID=2950864&CFTOKEN=10471204;

European Commission, Research Themes under FP7, available at http://europa.eu.int/comm/research/future/themes/index_en.cfm;

AeIGT, National Aerospace Technology Strategy, Implementation Report, 2004, Appendix B, The Complementary Framework of EU and National Funding Mechanisms;

Commission of the European Communities, Evaluation of Specific Activities relating to Aeronautics (BRITE/EURAM - Area 5 - 1090/91) Final Report, June 1991;

ACARE, Membership and Mission, www.acare4europe.com/html/about_us2.shtml;

"European Aeronautics Industry Response to FP6 3. Call. View of the Industries Management Groups" by Dominique Ollinger, December 10, 2004;

"Industry Preparation for 6th Framework Programme Participation", by Dale King (January 2003);

ACARE, Strategic Research Agenda, Volume 1, October 2004;

European Commission, Commission Inter-Service Group on Technology Platforms, Status Report - Development of Technology Platforms, February 2005;

European Commission, Thematic Priority 1.4, Aeronautics and Space, Work Programme (2002-2006), Version 2004;

European Commission, Proposal for a Decision of the European Parliament and of the Council concerning the seventh framework programme of the European Community for research, technological development and demonstration activities (2007 to 2013), April 6, 2005, COM(2005)119 final;

European Commission, Guidelines on Proposal Evaluation and Selection Procedures (the Sixth Framework programme);

Dieter Schmitt, Airbus Vice President Research and Future Projects, "VISION 2020 - A Technology Challenge for Europe's Aeronautical Industry" (November 2002);

EADS - Chief Technology Office, Research Cooperation with Universities, Yann Barbaux (Berlin, May 12, 2004);

NEVADA project description from CORDIS database, available at http://ica.cordis.lu/search/index.cfm?fuseaction=proj.simplifiedocument&PJ_RCN=2901664&CFID=2950864&CFTOKEN=10471204;

ENHANCE Consortium, The ENHANCE Project's Benefits for SMEs, March 2002;

EC Commission, Intellectual Property Rights: FP5 versus FP6, DG Enterprise (undated);

European Commission, Community framework for state aid for research and development, OJ C 045, February 17, 1996;

Federal Budget, Budget Plan 30 (Research Ministry), Part (Kapitel) 07, Titelgruppe 13, budget item 685 13-164, number 4 Deutsches Zentrum für Luft- und Raumfahrt e.V. (DLR) for 2004 and 2005;

Federal Budget, Budget Plan 30 (Research Ministry), Part (Kapitel) 08, Titelgruppe 33 (Förderung der Luftfahrtforschung und -technologie) for 1996 to 1999; and Titelgruppe 35 (Deutsche

Forschungsanstalt für Luft- und Raumfahrt e.V.) for 1996 to 2003, including Wirtschaftsplan Deutsches Zentrum für Luft- und Raumfahrt e.V. (DLR) (Appendix to Budget Plan 30, Part 08, Wirtschaftspläne, for budget items 685 50 and 893 50);

Federal Budget, Budget Plan 30 (Research Ministry), Part (Kapitel) 06, Titelgruppe 04 (Förderung der Luftfahrtforschung und der Hyperschalltechnologie) 1989 to 1995; Titelgruppe 07 (Förderung der Luftfahrtforschung und -technologie) 1987 and 1988; Titelgruppe 05 (Förderung der Luftfahrtforschung und -technologie) 1985 and 1986; Titelgruppe 06 (Förderung der Luftfahrtforschung und -technologie) 1981 to 1984; Titelgruppe 05 (Förderung der Luftfahrtforschung und -technologie) 1980; Titelgruppe 05 (Deutsche Forschungsanstalt für Luft- und Raumfahrt e.V. [DLR]) 1989 to 1995, including the "Wirtschaftsplan" for Titelgruppe 05; Titelgruppe 10 (Deutsche Forschungs- und Versuchsanstalt für Luft- und Raumfahrt e.V. [DFVLR]) 1987 and 1988, including the "Wirtschaftsplan" for Titelgruppe 10; Titelgruppe 08 (Deutsche Forschungs- und Versuchsanstalt für Luft- und Raumfahrt e.V. [DFVLR]) 1985 and 1986, including the "Wirtschaftsplan" for Titelgruppe 08; and Titelgruppe 09 (Deutsche Forschungs- und Versuchsanstalt für Luft- und Raumfahrt e.V. [DFVLR]) 1980 to 1984, including the "Wirtschaftsplan" for Titelgruppe 09;

Deutscher Bundestag, BT-Drs. 13/2238, Antwort des Parlamentarischen Staatssekretärs Dr. Norbert Lammert vom 30. August 1995, question no. 22 and response;

Luftfahrtforschungsprogramm 1999-2002, available at http://www.dlr.de/PT-LF/lufo/99_02/Lufo2.html;

Wolf Günther, Bundesministerium für Wirtschaft und Arbeit (Germany), The German National Research Programme, presented at ACARE Aerodays 2005, March 30/31, 2005;

Bundesministerium für Wirtschaft und Arbeit, Luftfahrtforschung. Das Luftfahrtforschungsprogramm des BMWA, available at [BMWA - Technologie und Energie - Luftfahrtforschung](#);

Luftfahrtforschungsprogramm 2003-2007, available at http://www.dlr.de/PT-LF/lufo/03_07/Lufo3.html;

DLR website, available at [PT-DLR Luftfahrtforschung und -technologie](#);

Bundesministerium für Wirtschaft und Arbeit, Innovationsmotor Luftfahrt. Die Luftfahrtforschungsprogramme der Bundesregierung - Bilanz und Ausblick, July 2003, available at <http://www.bmwa.bund.de/Redaktion/Inhalte/Pdf/I/innovationsmotor-luftfahrt.property=pdf.pdf>;

Bericht der High-Level Group, Deutsche Luft- und Raumfahrt: Zukunftsbranche des 21. Jahrhunderts im europäischen und globalen Wettbewerb, July 2001, p. 14, available at http://www.verkehrsforum.de/positionen/pdf_archiv/HLG_Bericht_Jul01.pdf;

BDLI press information, Aerospace Industry Major Driving Force in Germany's Innovation Campaign (March 18, 2004);

Federal Ministry of Education and Research, Report of the Federal Government on Research 2004, available in english at http://www.bmbf.de/pub/bufo_2004_eng_full_version.pdf;

Bundesministerium für Bildung und Forschung, Bundesbericht Forschung 2000, available at <http://www.bmbf.de/pub/bufo2000.pdf>;

Hans W. Pohl, Research & Technology Coordination Airbus Deutschland, Nationale und Europäische Förderprogramme (May 2004);

Airbus, A380: Flying 21st Century Technology, available at http://events.airbus.com/media/press_kits/en/05_a380_technical.asp?en=5;

Horst Winkler (Airbus), Airbus: Erfahrung mit europäischer Kooperation in der Luftfahrtindustrie (November 12, 2002);

Bundesministerium für Wirtschaft und Arbeit, Kurzübersicht Luftfahrtforschung und -technologie (Fachprogramm), available at http://db.bmwa.bund.de/DE_de/WZL_d037312865085262d82c6f86773dc72d_WZL/app.wiz?WDC=index_documents_open&DOC=8578&LEN=1;

European Commission, State Aid Decision, N 741/2002 - Bundesrepublik Deutschland, Luftfahrtforschungsprogramm 2003 - 2007, C(2003) 193;

Hamburgische Bürgerschaft, Drucksache 18/133, Große Anfrage der CDU und Antwort des Senats: Industrie in Hamburg, May 18, 2004, p. 12;

Luftfahrtstandort Hamburg, Projekte des Hamburger Lufo, available at <http://www.luftfahrtstandort-hamburg.de>;

DLR, Freie und Hansestadt Hamburg. Förderung der Luftfahrtforschung und -technologie, available at <http://www.dlr.de/pt-lf/hamburg/hamburg.html>;

Bremische Bürgerschaft, Drucksache 15/1115, April 16, 2002, Mitteilung des Senats vom 16. April 2002 - Technologieoffensive für das Land Bremen, Annex, InnoVision 2010 - Bremer Innovationsoffensive, April 2002;

Freie Hansestadt Bremen, Der Senator für Wirtschaft und Häfen, Wirtschaftsstandort Bremen 2000-2001;

Bremische Bürgerschaft, Drucksache 16/292, June 15, 2004, Mitteilung des Senats vom 15. Juni 2004 (Beleihungsbericht 2003);

Bremer Innovations-Agentur GmbH, Bremen-City of Innovation, September 2004;

Freie Hansestadt Bremen, Wirtschaftssenator Dr. Peter Gloystein: "Luftfahrzeugbau eine der Schlüsselindustrien in Bremen", press release of October 8, 2004, available at http://www2.bremen.de/web/owa/p_anz_presse_mitteilung?pi_mid=112767&pi_back=p_presse%3Fpi_bereich%3DS%26pi_archiv%3D1;

Bremische Bürgerschaft, Drucksache 16/46, October 1, 2003, Mitteilung des Senats vom 30. September 2003 (Beleihungsbericht 2002);

Bremische Bürgerschaft, Drucksache 15/1214, August 13, 2002, Mitteilung des Senats vom 13. August 2002 (Beleihungsbericht 2001);

Bremische Bürgerschaft, Drucksache 15/777, July 25, 2001, Mitteilung des Senats vom 24. Juli 2001 (Beleihungsbericht 2000);

Freie Hansestadt Bremen, Der Senator für Wirtschaft und Häfen, Luft- und Raumfahrtstandort Bremen gestärkt. Wirtschaftsausschüsse beschließen AMST II, press release of March 14, 2002, available at [http://www2.bremen.de/web/owa/extern.p_anz_presse2_mitteilung?pi_mid=52598&pi_back=javascript:history.back\(\)&pi_begriff=AMST+&pi_teilsuche=0;](http://www2.bremen.de/web/owa/extern.p_anz_presse2_mitteilung?pi_mid=52598&pi_back=javascript:history.back()&pi_begriff=AMST+&pi_teilsuche=0;)

Gesetz zur Übertragung von Aufgaben staatlicher Förderung auf juristische Personen des privaten Rechts, May 26, 1998, Gesetzblatt der Freien Hansestadt Bremen, June 2, 1998, No. 21, p. 134; Berichtigung des Gesetzes zur Übertragung von Aufgaben staatlicher Förderung auf juristische Personen des privaten Rechts, Gesetzblatt der Freien Hansestadt Bremen, June 26, 1998, No. 30;

IFAM, Technologiebroker Bremen GmbH (TBB), available at [http://www.ifam.fhg.de/index.php?seite=/2804/broker/tbb/;](http://www.ifam.fhg.de/index.php?seite=/2804/broker/tbb/)

IFAM, Jahresbericht 2000, Technologiebroker, available at http://www.ifam.fhg.de/Jahresberichte/jb00/d_jb00_erg_broker1.html;

Invest-in-Bavaria, Bayern - europäischer Top-Standort der Luft- und Raumfahrt, available at <http://www.invest-in-bavaria.de/HighTechCluster/luftraum.html?PHPSESSID=4b03b66f52c9113c9da9335abdcbe55b>

Freistaat Bayern, Haushaltsplan 1999/2000, Einzelplan 07 für den Geschäftsbereich des Bayerischen Staatsministeriums für Wirtschaft, Verkehr und Technologie;

Freistaat Bayern, Haushaltsplan 2001/2002, Einzelplan 07 für den Geschäftsbereich des Bayerischen Staatsministeriums für Wirtschaft, Verkehr und Technologie;

Freistaat Bayern, 2. Nachtragshaushalt 2002, Einzelplan 07, Staatsministerium für Wirtschaft, Verkehr und Technologie;

Freistaat Bayern, Haushaltsplan 2003/2004, Einzelplan 07 für den Geschäftsbereich des Bayerischen Staatsministeriums für Wirtschaft, Verkehr und Technologie;

Freistaat Bayern, Nachtragshaushalt für das Haushaltsjahr 2004, Teil I, Einzelplan 07 für den Geschäftsbereich des Bayerischen Staatsministeriums für Wirtschaft, Verkehr und Technologie;

Freistaat Bayern, Haushaltsplan 2005/2006, Einzelplan 07 für den Geschäftsbereich des Bayerischen Staatsministeriums für Wirtschaft, Verkehr und Technologie;

Freistaat Bayern, Haushaltsplan 1999/2000, Einzelplan 13, Allgemeine Finanzverwaltung;

Freistaat Bayern, Nachtragshaushalt 2000, Einzelplan 13, Allgemeine Finanzverwaltung;

Freistaat Bayern, Haushaltsplan 2001/2002, Einzelplan 13, Allgemeine Finanzverwaltung;

Freistaat Bayern, Haushaltsplan 2003/2004, Einzelplan 13, Allgemeine Finanzverwaltung;

Freistaat Bayern, Haushaltsplan 2005/2006, Einzelplan 13, Allgemeine Finanzverwaltung;

Bayerischer Landtag, Drucksache 14/2210, Interpellation der Fraktion SPD "Erfolgskontrolle der Verwendung der Privatisierungserlöse in den Offensiven "Zukunft Bayern" und "Zukunft Bayern II" sowie Sachstand der High-Tech-Offensive", response by the Bavarian government of November 22, 1999;

DLR, Bayerische Luftfahrtforschungs- und Technologieförderung, available at <http://www.dlr.de/PT-LF/bay/Bayern.html>;

DTI, Aerospace & Defence Technology Report 2001/2002;

Aerospace Innovation and Growth Team, An Independent Report on the Future of the UK Aerospace Industry, June 2003;

Aerospace Innovation and Growth Team, National Aerospace Technology Strategy, Implementation Report, 2004;

DTI, Press Release, "Hewitt announces £30 million hi-tech composites technology network", July 19, 2004;

DTI, Aerospace & Defence Technology Report 2002/2003;

Memorandum submitted by the DTI to the House of Commons Trade and Industry Committee, prepared March 20, 2001;

UK National Advisory Committee for Materials and Structures, Civil Aerospace - Wing Materials and Structure Review, Appendix, undated;

Society of British Aerospace Companies (SBAC), UK Aerospace Facts and Figures 2003, and overview of annual CARAD payments based on SBAC 2003 background information, Chart 27 - Civil Aircraft Research and Demonstration Programme (CARAD) Payments;

Grant Claim Form, DTI Aeronautics Research Program;

House of Commons, written answer of June 11, 1997 by Mr. Battle to a question asked by Mr. Cohen (question no. 2185);

House of Commons, written answer of May 13, 2002 by Alan Johnson to a question by Mr. Chaytor (Column 461W);

DTI press release, "Lord Sainsbury of Turville, A380 Opening Ceremony," September 19, 2002;

DTI press release, "Johnson wings in for UK aerospace industry," July 25, 2002;

UK Defence & Aerospace (D&A) Materials & Structures (M&S) National Advisory Committee (NAC), Annual Report 2000;

Jacqui Smith, then Minister of State at the DTI, Speech at the Opening of the South West Composite Centre, February 15, 2005;

DTI press release, "Partnership to Revolutionise Aircraft Manufacture," September 8, 1998;

DTI, UK Polymer Composites Sector, Foresight Study and Competitive Analysis, October 2001;

JEC Group/Globalcomposites.com, Aerospace, UK work on composites materials for aerospace use, August 8, 2000;

Breaking the Composite Cost Barrier, INTERAVIA, September 2000;

Lee Hibbert, Airbus is flying high over wing streamlining project, Professional Engineering, April 11, 2001, p. 15;

Stuart Birch, The art of wing assembly, Aerospace Engineering Online (undated);

Roger Worsley, Airbus wing assembly, boxing clever, Metalworking Production, May 18, 2001;

Kelly Davis, Matrox 4Sight Helps Automated Wing Assembly Take Flight, Machine Vision Online (undated);

AMTRI, Automatic Wing Box Assembly - AWBA (website updated 2005);

DTI, Press Release, July 19, 2004, Hewitt Announces £30 Million Hi-Tech Composites Technology Network;

DTI presentation held at the UK Aerodays 2005 (May 25, 2005);

DTI, Second Call of the Technology Programme, Advanced Composite Materials and Structures, April 2004;

DTI, Second Call of the Technology Programme, Technologies to Support Environmentally Friendly Transport, April 2004;

DTI, List of Successful Projects from April 2004 Competition;

DTI, Press Release, 2005, £5.2 Million Boost For Innovation In Bristol From The DTI Technology Strategy Funding, January 14;

DTI, The Technology Programme, April 2005 Competition for Funding, Frequently Asked Questions;

EPSRC, Annual Reports & Accounts

EPSRC, Current Grant Portfolio "Aerospace and Defence" (as of July 2005);

EPSRC, Aerospace and Defence, July 2004;

EPSRC, Funding Guide, April 2004;

EPSRC, The Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council, Corporate Brochure, January 2005;

UK House of Commons, Select Committee on Science and Technology, Ninth Report, prepared November 3, 2003, Appendix 25, Memorandum from BAE Systems (dated June 2003);

EPSRC, Intellectual Property, May 2002;

EPSRC website, Why collaborate?;

EPSRC, landing page for the sector report "Aerospace and Defence";

Current Grant Portfolio by Programme (status: July 20, 2005);

EPSRC, International Review of Engineering Research in the United Kingdom, Data Document, August 2004;

EPSRC, Delivery Plan 2005/06-2007/08, May 2005;

Southwest Regional Development Agency, press release, Industry Minister Opens £12 Million Advanced Materials Research Centre in the South West, press release, February 15, 2005;

Commons Hansard Debates, Thursday March 24, 2005 (column 1039);

GKN, press release, Industry Minister Opens GKN Aerospace Technology Facility, June 28, 2005;

Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales, Congreso de los Diputados, Contestaciones del Gobierno, Serie D, Núm. 547 (June 5, 2003), pp. 152, 153;

Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Tourism, Secretary of State for Industry, Plan I+D para el Sector Aeronautico (undated) ("PTA I");

Plan Nacional de Investigación Científica, Desarrollo e Innovación Tecnológica 2004-2007, Order PRE/690/2005 of March 18, 2005, BOE núm. 67 (March 19, 2005), p. 9670;

CDTI, General Information, available at <http://www.cdti.es/webCDTI/esp/informacion/010000000.html>;

Order of July 29, 1999 establishing the regulatory basis and the call for 1999 awards of repayable contributions and R&D projects in the aeronautics sector under the Aeronautic Technological Plan II, BOE núm. 192 (August 12, 1999), p. 29963 ("PTA II");

European Commission, State Aid N 135/1999, Plan Tecnológico Aeronáutico II, decision of May 5, 1999, SG(99) D/3208;

Ministry of Science and Technology, "Evolución del Sistema Valenciano de I+D+I durante 2001," undated (official document distributed to the regional governments);

Ramon Herrero, Ministry for Research, Tourism and Commerce, Aeronautics Research and Development in Spain, ACARE AeroDays, March 31, 2005;

European Commission, State Aid N 432/2000 España, Modificación del régimen N 135/1999 - Plan Tecnológico Aeronáutico II, decision of August 7, 2000, SG(2000)D/106018;

Orden de 7 de marzo de 2000 por la que se regulan las bases, el régimen de ayudas y la gestión del Programa de Fomento de la Investigación Técnica (PROFIT), incluido en el Plan Nacional de Investigación Científica, Desarrollo e Innovación Tecnológica (2000-2003), BOE núm 59 (March 9, 2000), p. 9855;

Javier Alfonso Gil, Antonia Sáez Cala and Maricruz Lacalle Calderón, EADS y las estrategias Territoriales del Sudoeste Europeo: Informe de la Región de Madrid", Universidad Autonoma de Madrid (undated);

Ministerio de Ciencia y Tecnología, Resolución de 10 de mayo de 2001, de la Secretaría de Estado de Política y Tecnológica, por la que se efectúa la convocatoria del año 2001 para la concesión de las ayudas del Programa Nacional de Aeronáutica del Programa de Fomento de Innovación Técnica (PROFIT), incluido en el Plan Nacional de Investigación Científica, Desarrollo e Innovación Tecnológica (2000-2003), BOE núm. 128/2001 (May 29, 2001);

Ministerio de Ciencia y Tecnología, Resolución de 30 de noviembre de 2001, de la Secretaría de Estado de Política y Tecnológica, por la que se efectúa la convocatoria del año 2001 para la concesión de las ayudas del Programa Nacional de Aeronáutica del Programa de Fomento de Innovación Técnica (PROFIT), incluido en el Plan Nacional de Investigación Científica, Desarrollo e Innovación Tecnológica (2000-2003), BOE núm. 299/2001 (December 14, 2001);

Ministerio de Ciencia y Tecnología, Resolución de 6 de noviembre de 2002, de la Secretaría de Estado de Política y Tecnológica, por la que se efectúa la convocatoria del año 2001 para la concesión de las ayudas del Programa Nacional de Aeronáutica del Programa de Fomento de Innovación Técnica (PROFIT), incluido en el Plan Nacional de Investigación Científica, Desarrollo e Innovación Tecnológica (2000-2003), BOE núm. 273/2002 (November 14, 2002);

Ministerio de Ciencia y Tecnología, Resolución de 23 octubre de 2003, de la Secretaría de Estado de Política y Tecnológica, por la que se efectúa la convocatoria del año 2001 para la concesión de las ayudas del Programa Nacional de Aeronáutica del Programa de Fomento de Innovación Técnica (PROFIT), incluido en el Plan Nacional de Investigación Científica, Desarrollo e Innovación Tecnológica (2000-2003), BOE núm. 261/2003 (October 31, 2003);

Ministerio de Ciencia y Tecnología, Orden CTE/3149/2003, de 24 de octubre, por la que se establecen las bases reguladoras y la convocatoria de ayudas para 2003, a Programas de Investigación y Desarrollo Tecnológico orientados a dotar de capacidad de reabastecimiento en vuelo como aviones nodriza a los Aorbus A310 VIP del Ministerio de Defensa Español, BOE núm. 271/2003 (November 12, 2003);

PROFIT 2003. Comites de Evaluación de 21 y 22/4/03, Proyectos y entidades con propuesta favorable de ayuda, P.N. Aeronáutico;

Compañía Española de Sistemas Aeronauticos S.A. ("CESA"), website available at http://www.cesa.aero/espanol/Quienes_ing.htm;

Order PRE/690/2005, de 18 marzo, par la que se regulan las bases, el régimen de ayudas, y la gestión del Plan Nacional de Investigación Científica, Desarrollo e Innovación Tecnológica (2004-2007) en la parte dedicada al fomento de la investigación técnica, BOE núm. 67 (March 19, 2005);

Orden ITC/1038/2005, de 14 de abril, por la que se efectúa la convocatoria del año 2005, para la concesión de las ayudas del Programa de Fomento de la Investigación Tecnológica dentro del Plan

Plan Nacional de Investigación Científica, Desarrollo e Innovación Tecnológica (2004-2007) en la parte dedicada al fomento de la investigación técnica, BOE núm. 95 (April 21, 2005);

Resolución de 19 de noviembre de 2003, de la Secretaria de Estado de Política Científica y Tecnológica, por la que se efectúa la convocatoria del año 2004, para la concesión de las ayudas del Programa de Fomento de la Investigación Tecnológica dentro del Plan Nacional de Investigación Científica, Desarrollo e Innovación Tecnológica (I+D+I 2004-2007) en la parte dedicada al Fomento de la Investigación Técnica, BOE November 20, 2003;

European Commission, State aid decision concerning the Plan de Innovación Tecnológica en el Sector Aeroespacial, State Aid N 48/03 Espana, decision of May 5, 2003, C(2003)1531;

European Commission, State Aid N 73/2004, Ayudas a la Innovación Tecnológica en el Sector Aeroespacial (Modificación del regimen de Ayuda Existente N48/03, decision of April 7, 2004, C(2004)1430);

Sénat, No. 367 (session ordinaire de 1996 / 1997), Rapport d'Information "Mission de contrôle effectuée sur le soutien public à la construction aéronautique civile," Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation, Chapitre IV, IV. Les Soutiens a la Recherche;

Sénat, No. 89 (session ordinaire de 1999-2000), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2000, Tome III, Annexe No. 25, Équipement, Transport et Logement: III. - Transports: Transport Aérien et Météorologie et Aviation Civile, p. 88;

Sénat, No. 92 (session ordinaire de 2000-2001), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2001, Tome III, Annexe No. 24, Équipement, Transport et Logement: III. - Transports: Transport Aérien et Météorologie et Aviation Civile, p. 79;

Sénat, No. 87 (session ordinaire de 2001-2002), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2002, Tome III, Annexe No. 24 Équipement, Transport et Logement: III. - Transports et Sécurité Routière: Aviation et Aéronautique Civiles, p. 22;

Sénat, No. 68 (session ordinaire de 2002-2003), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2003, Tome III, Annexe No. 18, Équipement, Transport, Logement, Tourisme et Mer: III. - Transports et Sécurité Routière: Aviation et Aéronautique Civiles, p. 50;

Sénat, No. 73 (session ordinaire de 2003-2004), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2004, Tome III, Annexe No. 18 Équipement, Transport et Logement: III. - Transports et Sécurité Routière: Aviation et Aéronautique Civiles, p. 40;

Sénat, No. 74 (session ordinaire de 2004-2005), Rapport Général, Commission des Finances, du Contrôle Budgétaire et des Comptes Économiques de la Nation sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2005, Tome III, Annexe No. 17 Équipement, Transport, Aménagement du Territoire, Tourisme et Mer: II. - Transports et Sécurité Routière: Aviation et Aéronautique Civiles, p. 50;

Projet de Loi de Finances 1999 (available at http://www.finances.gouv.fr/pole_ecofin/finances_Etat/LF/1999/plf/depenses/equipement.htm);

Assemblée Nationale, Avis, au nom de la Commission de la Production et des Échanges sur le projet de loi de finances pour 1999 (n° 1078), Tome XIII, Équipement, Transports et Logement, Transports Aériens, p. 15;

Ministère de La Recherche, Le Projet de Budget Civil de recherche et Développement BCRD 2001, September 21, 2000, p. 27;

EC submission to the WTO Committee in Subsidies and Countervailing Measures G/SCM/N/71/EEC/Add.5 (December 18, 2001);

Sénat, No. 91, Avis (session ordinaire de 1999-2000) présenté au nom de la commission des Affaires économiques et du Plan (1) sur le projet loi de finances pour 2000, Tome XIX Aviation Civile, par M. Jean-François Legrand, pp. 16, 17;

Information ATRAN project, available at http://www.imft.fr/masterDET/Sujet_stage/Stage68-Reulet.Gressier-DMAE.pdf

Information "COVAS" project, ONERA, Département Commande des Systèmes et Dynamique du vol, available at <http://www.cert.fr/dcsd/COVAS>;

Information "ECLIPPS" project, available at [La newsletter n°3 de juillet 2004 - VisionONERA](#);

Information "MOSAS" project, available at <http://www.cert.fr/dcsd/present-a.html>;

Information "DTP Tremblement" project, available at <http://www.onera.fr/ddss/dynamique-structures-moyens/index.php>;

Aerospace Vallée, Aéronautique, Espace, Systèmes Embarqués, Pôle de Compétitivité en Midi-Pyrénées & Aquitaine, available at http://www.drrtmip.cict.fr/etc/AESE_presentation.pdf

DLR website, "German Aerospace Center DLR - the Profile" (available at http://www.dlr.de/dlr/Unternehmen/internal&action=_setlanguage.action?LANGUAGE=en);

Forschung für die Luftfahrt, DLR Report, October 2003;

DLR website, "Erforschung, Entwicklung und Realisierung von Werkstoffen, Bauweisen und Fertigungsverfahren für Faserverbundleichtbaustrukturen," (http://www.dlr.de/fa/institut/faserverbundtechnologie/internal&action=_setlanguage.action?LANGUAGE=ge);

DLR, Forschungs- und Unternehmensbilanz 2003/2004;

DLR, Forschungs- und Unternehmensbilanz 2002/2003;

DLR Jahresbericht 2001/2002;

DLR Jahresbericht 2000/2001;

DLR Jahresbericht 1999/2000;

DLR Jahresbericht 1998/1999;

DLR Jahresbericht 1997/1998;

Das Forschungsunternehmen DLR, Ziele und Strategien, November 1999;

DLR website "Projekträger Luftfahrtforschung und -Technologie," available at <http://www.dlr.de/pt-lf>;

DLR website "Projekträger im DLR Gesundheitsforschung" available at <http://www.pt-dlr.de/pt/gf>;

DLR website "Technologie Marketing" available at <http://www.dlr.de/tm>;

DLR press release, "DLR übernimmt Prototyp des Regionaljets Do 728 für Kabinenforschung," February 16, 2005;

DLR press release, "DLR und ONERA testen erfolgreich den Airbus A380," February 17, 2005;

Bundesministerium für Wirtschaft und Arbeit, Luftfahrtforschung. Das Luftfahrtforschungsprogramm des BMWA, available at BMWA - Technologie und Energie - Luftfahrtforschung;

DLR press release, ILA Berlin, Fachinformationen zum gemeinsamen Stand von DLR und ONERA, Halle 6, May 6, 2004;

Website aeroflight, available at <http://www.aeroflight.co.uk/waf/uk/ukaf-mod-home.htm>;

Website About QinetiQ, available at http://www.qinetiq.com/home/aboutqq/closer_look/glance.html;

QinetiQ press releases "Successful first full financial year operating as a private company," June 29, 2004; and QinetiQ born into a bright commercial future," June 29, 2001;

"QinetiQ appoints £1bn float advisors," ShareCast, August 18, 2005;

"Qinetiq makes £163m push into US," Timesonline, April 3, 2005;

QinetiQ Group plc Annual Review and Summary Financial Information 2002;

Qinetiq Annual Report and Accounts 2004;

Press Release, "DTI funding lifts Qinetiq's standing as aerospace world leader in field of polymeric composites," August 19, 2002;

DTI Aerospace & Defence Technology Report 2001/2002;

DTI Press Release, "Partnership to Revolutionise Aircraft Manufacture," September 8, 1998;

QinetiQ website, Case studies aviation, Airbus - The World's Largest Airliner, available at http://www.qinetiq.com/home/case_studies/aviation/airbus_the_worlds_largest_airliner.html;

The Carlyle Group, Press Release, "Sale of a Stake of QinetiQ PLC to The Carlyle Group," December 5, 2002;

House of Commons, Memorandum submitted by QinetiQ (15 January 2003);

QinetiQ Annual Report and Accounts 2005;

House of Commons, Select Committee on Science and Technology, Sixth Report, written evidence, Appendix 16, Memorandum from QinetiQ, "Opportunities for the Funding of Science and Technology Research Offered by the EU Framework Programmes," April 2003;

ONERA press statement, "L'ONERA: de la science à l'industrie," September 24, 2004;

Website ONERA, presentation, "L'ONERA, Office National d'Études et de Recherches Aérospatiales, est le premier acteur français de la recherche aérospatiale," available at <http://www.onera.fr/presentation-fr/onera-bref.html>;

ONERA, Annual Reports;

"Airbus: un Avion pour Toulouse," available at <http://espritsnomades.perso.cegetel.net/sitegers/AIRBUS.html>;

ONERA press release, "L'ONERA en avance de phase sur le programme A3XX," June 14, 1999;

European Center for Research and Advanced Training in Scientific Computing ("CERFACS"), Scientific Activity Report Jan. 2000-Dec. 2001;

ONERA press release "Contre le bruit autour des aéroports" and IROQUA project description;

ONERA website, Information Processing and Systems Branch, available at <http://www.onera.fr/dcsd-en/free-flight-b20/research-projects.html>;

ONERA website, Information Processing and Systems Branch (Systems Control and Flight Dynamics), available at <http://www.onera.fr/dcsd-en/1998activities.html>;

REAL project description from Cordis database available at <http://cordis.europa.eu/int/en/home.html>;

Information on the REAL project and other ONERA projects, ONERA website, Branche Traitement de l'information et Dynamique du Vol, (Commande des Systèmes et Dynamique du Vol), available at <http://www.onera.fr/dcsd/reussites.html> (last visited December 2005);

ONERA website, Fluid Mechanics and Energetics Branch (Computational Fluid Dynamics and Aeroustics), project website elsA, available at <http://www.onera.fr/dsna-en/elsa>;

ONERA website elsA project, available at <http://elsa.onera.fr/elsA/project/organisation.html>;

Project information from ONERA website, Branche Mécaniques des Fluides et Energétique (Département Aerodynamique Appliquée), available at <http://www.onera.fr/daap/redtrasub> (last visited December 2005);

ONERA - DLR press release "Onera and DLR pave the Way for Integrated European Aerospace Research," June 16, 2001;

CERFACS, Annual Report 2000-2001;

Sénat, No. 91 (session ordinaire de 1999-2000), Avis, Commission des Affaires Économiques et du Plan sur le projet de loi de finances pour 2000, Tome XIX aviation civile;

VisionONERA, La Newsletter, No. 6, February 2005;

Loi no 46-895 du 3 mai 1946 portant création d'un ONERA, modifiée par le décret no 63-385 du 10 avril 1963 et le décret no 84-30 du 11 janvier 1984; Décret no 84-31 du 11 janvier 1984 pris pour l'application de la loi no 46-895 du 3 mai 1946 modifiée et relatif à l'organisation et au fonctionnement de l'ONERA;

ONERA website Centre d'Études et de Recherches Toulouse, available at <http://www.cert.fr/fr/cert/certpres2.html>;

Contrat de Plan Etat-Region Midi-Pyrenées 2000-2006;

Website CNRS, "Que est-ce que le CNRS?";

Le Journal du CNRS, N°166/167, "Itineraire d'un géant," November, December 2003;

Le Journal du CNRS, N°182, "Le CNRS, l'A380 et l'aéronautique de demain," March 2005;

CNRS info, No. 403, July 2002, "Le commandant de bord et son équipage";

CNRT/AE organizational information (available at CNRT - Aéronautique et Espace);

CNRS website Ecrin, available at <http://hydre.auteuil.cnrs-dir.fr/dae/page/chercheur/rencontrer/rencontrerf.htm>;

"Le CNRS et EADS signent un accord de coopération dans le domaine des technologies aérospatiales et des systèmes embarqués," CNRS, Press Release, June 17, 2005 ;

Agence universitaire de la francophonie, Le CNRS et Airbus France signent un accord de coopération scientifique, December 12, 2005, available at http://www.auf.org/imprimer.php3?id_article=244;

CNRS, "Transport aérien; ca plane pour lui ...", available at <http://www2.cnrs.fr/presse/journal/2249.htm#print=1>;

Institut National de Recherche en Informatique et en Automatique (INRIA), ESPRESSO: Environnement de spécification de programmes réactifs synchrones (projet), available at <http://www.inria.fr/recherche/equipes/espresso.fr.html>;

Institut National de Recherche en Informatique et en Automatique (INRIA), Projet METALAU, Méthodes, Algorithmes et Logiciels pour L'automatique, available at <http://www.inria.fr/rapportsactivite/RA2001/metalau/metalau.pdf>;

Centre National de Recherche Technologique Aéronautique et Espace (CNRT-AE), Statuts;

"Renouvellement du CNRT Aéronautique et Espace," press release CNRT (undated);

Website CNRT, Events;

CNRT, List of CNRT company members, <http://www.cnrtae.com/acteurs/entreprises.htm>, list of public institutions members <http://www.cnrtae.com/acteurs/collectivites.htm>, and research themes <http://www.cnrtae.com/themes>;

La recherche aéronautique en Midi-Pyrénées, "Le Conseil Régional soutient le développement de la recherche en aéronautique.";

CNRT website, research themes;

CNRT, Topcased, Atelier Développement Open Source
http://www.cnrtae.com/data/pdf/plaquette_topcased.pdf;

Aérospatiale Vallée, Toolkit in Open-source for Critical Application & Systems Development, available at <http://www.aerospace-valley.com/data/File/TOPCASED.doc>;

La Lettre du Centre National de Recherche Technologique - Aéronautique et Espace, Numéro 1, Décembre 2003;

La Lettre du Centre National de Recherche Technologique - Aéronautique et Espace, Numéro 2, May 2003;

Institut National de Recherche en Informatique et en Automatique (INRIA), Vol direct pour la simulation, available at http://www.inria.fr/actualites/inedit/inedit49_recha.fr.html;

Commissariat à l'Energie Atomique (CEA), presentation Laboratoire Sécurité du Logiciel, Journées SECC, November 15, 2002, available at <http://www.systemes-critiques.org/SECC/Past/Raguideau.ppt>;

The CAVEAT Tool, website CEA/LIST, available at <http://www-list.cea.fr/labos/gb/LSL/caveat/index.html>;

GATeL, a method and a tool for the interactive generation of test sequences, website CEA/LIST, available at <http://www-list.cea.fr/labos/gb/LSL/test/gatel/index.html>;

European Transonic Windtunnel GmbH, Information Brochure;

ETW, User Guide;

German -Dutch Windtunnels, Annual Report 2004;

European Commission, STAR 21. Strategic Aerospace Review for the 21st Century. Creating a Coherent Market and Policy Framework for a Vital European Industry (July 2002);

European Commission, Decision declaring a concentration compatible with the common market and the functioning of the EEA Agreement, Case No. N/M.877, Council Reg (EEC) No. 4064/89, C(97) 2598 final (July 30, 1997);

European Commission, Report of the Group of Personalities, Meeting Society's Needs and Winning Global Leadership. European Aeronautics: A Vision for 2002 (January 2001);

EC External Advisory Group for Aeronautics, Position Paper on Aeronautics for Europe: Recommendations to the European Commission (April 2000);

US General Accounting Office, International Trade: Long-Term Viability of US-European Union Aircraft Agreement Uncertain, GAO/GGD-95-45 (December 1994);

Staff of US House of Representatives Committee on Energy and Commerce, Subcommittee on Oversight and Investigations, Major Issues in United States-European Community Trade, 100th Cong., 1st Session (Comm. Print 1987);

Airclaims, Client Aviation System Inquiry (CASE) database;

European Aeronautics Defence and Space Company (EADS), Annual Reports and Investor Presentations;

The Boeing Company, Annual Reports 1990 - 2005;

Airbus, Global Market Forecasts;

Statement of Lionel Jospin, Prime Minister of France, as reported in the Journal Officiel de la Republique Française, Débats Parlementaires, Compte Rendu Intégral des Séances de Mercredi 8 Mars 2000 (March 8, 2000);

D. Neven and Paul Seabright, European Industrial Policy: The Airbus Case, a simulation study commissioned by the U.K. Department of Trade and Industry (EC/4878);

Gernot Klepper, Entry into the Market for Large Transport Aircraft, European Economic Review 34 (1990);

Airbus, Key Determinants of Competitiveness in the Global Large Civil Aircraft Market;

Thomas Boeder and Gary Dorman, The Boeing/McDonnell Douglas merger: the economics, antitrust law and politics of the aerospace industry, The Antitrust Bulletin (Spring 2000);

UK House of Commons, Trade and Industry Committee, the U.K. Aerospace Industry, Fifteenth Report of Session 2004-05 (March 22, 2005);

UK House of Commons, Answer of Patricia Hewitt, Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, Hansard, column 1088 (March 3, 2005);

R. Baldwin and Paul Krugman, Industrial Policy and International Competition in Wide-Bodied Jet Aircraft, in Trade Policy Issue and Empirical Analysis, ed. Robert Baldwin (The Chicago University Press, 1988);

Matthew Lynn, Birds of Prey (1995);

Aviation Week & Space Technology, "Airbus Redesigns A350" (May 23, 2005);

The Economist, "World Trade Survey" (September 22, 1990);

Airfinance Journal, 2005 Investors' and Operators' Poll (September 2005);

Independent News, "EasyJet snubs Boeing and turns to Airbus" (October 15, 2002);

Business Week, "Giving 'Em Away?" (March 5, 2001);

Seattle Post-Intelligencer, "Boeing pays a price for its line in the sand" (December 8, 2004);

Dow Jones, "Ceske Aeroline: Order for Airbus Jets Worth CZK 10 Billion-12 Billion" (October 15, 2004);

BNA, Daily Report for Executives, Regulation & Law, "EC Signals Readiness to Clear Launch Aid for Airbus Despite U.S. Vow to Go to WTO" (May 20, 2005);

French Sénat, No. 26 (1980-81) MARCELLIN (Raymond), Commission des finances, Projet de loi de finances pour 1981, Rapport No 98, Annexe No 28 ou Tome III du 19/11/1980;

Airline Fleet & Asset Management, "Middle market muddle" (December-January 2000);

Forbes.com, "JetBlue Skies" (January 31, 2001);

Aerospace Daily, "America West Places Orders for A318s, A320s" (October 22, 1999);

Air Transport Intelligence, "Frontier Plans to Complete Airbus Transition By 2005" (October 18, 1999);

Press releases, Boeing and Airbus customers;

Börse Online Magazine, "At the Moment, Airbus has the Better Products" (April 21, 2005);

Speech of Allan McArtor, President, Airbus North America, at the International Aviation Club, (March 8, 2005);

American Aerospace Industry, "Facts and Figures 2003/2004," available at http://www.aia-aerospace.org/stats/facts_figures/ff_03_04/FF03P106.PDF;

Flight International, "Leading from the front at Airbus" (November 29, 2005);

The Weekend Australian, "Lord of the flyers" (December 17, 2005).
