

---

MODULE *Config*

---

INSTANCE *Naturals*

INSTANCE *FiniteSets*

INSTANCE *Sequences*

INSTANCE *TLC*

---

CONSTANT *TraceEnabled*, *TraceDepth*

Indicates that a configuration change is waiting to be applied to the network  
CONSTANT *Pending*

Indicates that a configuration change has been applied to the network  
CONSTANT *Complete*

Indicates that a configuration change failed  
CONSTANT *Failed*

Indicates a change is a configuration  
CONSTANT *Change*

Indicates a change is a rollback  
CONSTANT *Rollback*

Indicates a device is connected  
CONSTANT *Connected*

Indicates a device is disconnected  
CONSTANT *Disconnected*

Indicates that an error occurred when applying a change  
CONSTANT *Error*

An empty constant  
CONSTANT *Nil*

The set of all nodes  
CONSTANT *Node*

The set of all devices  
CONSTANT *Device*

ASSUME *Pending* ∈ STRING  
ASSUME *Complete* ∈ STRING  
ASSUME *Failed* ∈ STRING  
ASSUME *Rollback* ∈ STRING

ASSUME  $Connected \in \text{STRING}$   
 ASSUME  $Disconnected \in \text{STRING}$   
 ASSUME  $Error \in \text{STRING}$   
 ASSUME  $Nil \in \text{STRING}$

ASSUME  $\wedge IsFiniteSet(Node)$   
 $\wedge \forall n \in Node :$   
 $\wedge n \notin Device$   
 $\wedge n \in \text{STRING}$   
 ASSUME  $\wedge IsFiniteSet(Device)$   
 $\wedge \forall d \in Device :$   
 $\wedge d \notin Node$   
 $\wedge d \in \text{STRING}$

---

Per-node election state  
 VARIABLE  $leader$

Per-node per-device election state  
 VARIABLE  $master$

A sequence of network-wide configuration changes  
 Each change contains a record of 'changes' for each device  
 VARIABLE  $networkChanges$

A record of sequences of device configuration changes  
 Each sequence is a list of changes in the order in which they  
 are to be applied to the device  
 VARIABLE  $deviceChanges$

A record of device states - either  $Connected$  or  $Disconnected$   
 VARIABLE  $deviceState$

A count of leader changes to serve as a state constraint  
 VARIABLE  $electionCount$

A count of configuration changes to serve as a state constraint  
 VARIABLE  $configCount$

A count of device connection changes to serve as a state constraint  
 VARIABLE  $connectionCount$

---

Node variables  
 $nodeVars \triangleq \langle leader, master \rangle$

Configuration variables

$configVars \triangleq \langle networkChanges, deviceChanges \rangle$

Device variables  
 $deviceVars \triangleq \langle deviceState \rangle$

State constraint variables  
 $constraintVars \triangleq \langle electionCount, configCount, connectionCount \rangle$   
 $vars \triangleq \langle nodeVars, configVars, deviceVars, constraintVars \rangle$

---

This section models leader election for control loops and for devices. Leader election is modelled as a simple boolean indicating whether each node is the leader for the cluster and for each device. This model implies the ordering of leadership changes is irrelevant to the correctness of the spec.

Set the leader for node  $n$  to  $l$   
 $SetNodeLeader(n, l) \triangleq$   
 $\wedge leader' = [leader \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = n = l]$   
 $\wedge electionCount' = electionCount + 1$   
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle master, configVars, deviceVars, configCount, connectionCount \rangle$

Set the master for device  $d$  on node  $n$  to  $l$   
 $SetDeviceMaster(n, d, l) \triangleq$   
 $\wedge master' = [master \text{ EXCEPT } ![n] = [master[n] \text{ EXCEPT } ![d] = n = l]]$   
 $\wedge electionCount' = electionCount + 1$   
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle leader, configVars, deviceVars, configCount, connectionCount \rangle$

---

This section models the northbound *API* for the configuration service.

Enqueue network configuration change  $c$   
 $SubmitChange(c) \triangleq$   
 $\wedge Cardinality(\text{DOMAIN } c) > 0$   
 $\wedge networkChanges' = \text{Append}(networkChanges, [$   

$phase \quad \mapsto Change,$   
 $changes \quad \mapsto c,$   
 $value \quad \mapsto Len(networkChanges),$   
 $state \quad \mapsto Pending,$   
 $incarnation \mapsto 0])$   
 $\wedge configCount' = configCount + 1$   
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle nodeVars, deviceChanges, deviceVars, electionCount, connectionCount \rangle$

 $RollbackChange(c) \triangleq$   
 $\wedge networkChanges[c].phase = Change$   
 $\wedge networkChanges[c].state = Complete$   
 $\wedge networkChanges' = [networkChanges \text{ EXCEPT } ![c].phase = Rollback, ![c].state = Pending]$   
 $\wedge configCount' = configCount + 1$   
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle nodeVars, deviceChanges, deviceVars, electionCount, connectionCount \rangle$

---

This section models the *NetworkChange* reconciler. The reconciler reconciles network changes when the change or one of its device changes is updated.

Return the set of all network changes prior to the given change

$$\begin{aligned} \text{PriorNetworkChanges}(c) &\triangleq \\ \{n \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges} : n < c\} \end{aligned}$$

Return the set of all completed device changes for network change  $c$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{NetworkCompletedChanges}(c) &\triangleq \\ \{d \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{changes} : \\ \wedge c \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{deviceChanges}[d] \\ \wedge \text{deviceChanges}[d][c].\text{state} = \text{Complete}\} \end{aligned}$$

Return a boolean indicating whether all device changes are complete for the given network change

$$\begin{aligned} \text{NetworkChangesComplete}(c) &\triangleq \\ \text{Cardinality}(\text{NetworkCompletedChanges}(c)) = \text{Cardinality}(\text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{changes}) \end{aligned}$$

Return the set of all incomplete device changes prior to network change  $c$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{PriorIncompleteDevices}(c) &\triangleq \\ \text{UNION } \{ \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges}[n].\text{changes} : \\ n \in \{n \in \text{PriorNetworkChanges}(c) : \neg \text{NetworkChangesComplete}(n)\} \} \end{aligned}$$

Return the set of all devices configured by network change  $c$

$$\text{NetworkChangeDevices}(c) \triangleq \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{changes}$$

Return a boolean indicating whether network change 'c' is complete

$$\begin{aligned} \text{IsCompleteNetworkChange}(c) &\triangleq \\ \wedge \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{phase} = \text{Change} \\ \wedge \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{state} = \text{Complete} \end{aligned}$$

Return the set of all connected devices configured by network change  $c$

$$\text{ConnectedDevices}(c) \triangleq \{d \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{changes} : \text{deviceState}[d] = \text{Connected}\}$$

Return a boolean indicating whether network change  $c$  can be applied

A change can be applied if its devices do not intersect with past device changes that have not been applied

$$\begin{aligned} \text{CanApplyNetworkChange}(c) &\triangleq \\ \wedge \text{Cardinality}(\text{ConnectedDevices}(c) \cap \text{NetworkChangeDevices}(c)) \neq 0 \\ \wedge \text{Cardinality}(\text{NetworkChangeDevices}(c) \cap \text{PriorIncompleteDevices}(c)) = 0 \\ \wedge \vee \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{incarnation} = 0 \\ \vee \text{Cardinality}(\{d \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{changes} : \\ \wedge \text{deviceChanges}[d][c].\text{incarnation} = \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{incarnation} \\ \wedge \text{deviceChanges}[d][c].\text{phase} = \text{Rollback} \\ \wedge \text{deviceChanges}[d][c].\text{state} = \text{Complete}\}) = \\ \text{Cardinality}(\text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{changes}) \end{aligned}$$

Return a boolean indicating whether a change exists for the given device

If the device is modified by the change, it must contain a device change

that's either *Complete* or with the same 'incarnation' as the network change.  
 $HasDeviceChange(d, c) \triangleq$   
 $\wedge c \in \text{DOMAIN } deviceChanges[d]$   
 $\wedge deviceChanges[d][c].incarnation = networkChanges[c].incarnation$

Return a boolean indicating whether device changes have been propagated  
for the given network change

$HasDeviceChanges(c) \triangleq$   
 $Cardinality(\{d \in \text{DOMAIN } networkChanges[c].changes : HasDeviceChange(d, c)\}) =$   
 $Cardinality(\text{DOMAIN } networkChanges[c].changes)$

Add or update the given device changes for the given network change.

If a device change already exists, update the 'incarnation' field.

$CreateDeviceChange(d, c) \triangleq$   
IF  $d \in \text{DOMAIN } networkChanges[c].changes$  THEN  
  IF  $c \in \text{DOMAIN } deviceChanges[d]$  THEN  
    IF  $deviceChanges[d][c].state = Complete$  THEN  
       $deviceChanges[d]$   
    ELSE  
       $[deviceChanges[d] \text{ EXCEPT } ![c].incarnation = networkChanges[c].incarnation,$   
      !  $[c].state = Pending]$   
  ELSE  
     $[x \in \{c\} \mapsto [$   
       $phase \mapsto networkChanges[c].phase,$   
       $state \mapsto Pending,$   
       $value \mapsto networkChanges[c].value,$   
       $incarnation \mapsto networkChanges[c].incarnation]] @@ deviceChanges[d]$   
ELSE  
   $deviceChanges[d]$

Add or update device changes for the given network change

$CreateDeviceChanges(c) \triangleq$   
 $deviceChanges' = [d \in \text{DOMAIN } deviceChanges \mapsto CreateDeviceChange(d, c)]$

Rollback device change  $c$  for device  $d$

$RollbackDeviceChange(d, c) \triangleq$   
IF  $\wedge c \in \text{DOMAIN } deviceChanges[d]$   
 $\wedge \vee deviceChanges[d][c].phase = Change$   
 $\vee \wedge deviceChanges[d][c].phase = Rollback$   
 $\wedge deviceChanges[d][c].state = Failed$   
THEN  
   $[deviceChanges[d] \text{ EXCEPT } ![c].phase = Rollback, ![c].state = Pending]$   
ELSE  
   $deviceChanges[d]$

Roll back device changes

$RollbackDeviceChanges(c) \triangleq$   
 $deviceChanges' = [d \in \text{DOMAIN } deviceChanges \mapsto RollbackDeviceChange(d, c)]$

Return a boolean indicating whether the given device change is *Failed*  
 $IsFailedDeviceChange(d, c) \triangleq$   
 $\wedge c \in \text{DOMAIN } deviceChanges[d]$   
 $\wedge deviceChanges[d][c].incarnation = networkChanges[c].incarnation$   
 $\wedge deviceChanges[d][c].state = Failed$

Return a boolean indicating whether the given device change is *Complete*  
 $IsCompleteDeviceChange(d, c) \triangleq$   
 $\wedge c \in \text{DOMAIN } deviceChanges[d]$   
 $\wedge deviceChanges[d][c].incarnation = networkChanges[c].incarnation$   
 $\wedge deviceChanges[d][c].phase = Change$   
 $\wedge deviceChanges[d][c].state = Complete$

Return a boolean indicating whether any device change is *Failed* for the given network change  
 $HasFailedDeviceChanges(c) \triangleq$   
 $Cardinality(\{d \in \text{DOMAIN } networkChanges[c].changes :$   
 $IsFailedDeviceChange(d, c)\}) \neq 0$

Return a boolean indicating whether all device changes are *Complete* for the given network change  
 $DeviceChangesComplete(c) \triangleq$   
 $Cardinality(\{d \in \text{DOMAIN } networkChanges[c].changes :$   
 $IsCompleteDeviceChange(d, c)\}) =$   
 $Cardinality(\text{DOMAIN } networkChanges[c].changes)$

Reconcile a network change state  
 $ReconcileNetworkChange(n, c) \triangleq$   
 $\wedge leader[n]$   
 $\wedge networkChanges[c].state = Pending$   
 $\wedge \vee \wedge \neg HasDeviceChanges(c)$   
 $\wedge CreateDeviceChanges(c)$   
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle networkChanges \rangle$   
 $\vee \wedge HasDeviceChanges(c)$   
 $\wedge \vee \wedge networkChanges[c].phase = Change$   
 $\wedge \vee \wedge CanApplyNetworkChange(c)$   
 $\wedge networkChanges' = [networkChanges \text{ EXCEPT}$   
 $! [c].incarnation = networkChanges[c].incarnation + 1]$   
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle deviceChanges \rangle$   
 $\vee \wedge DeviceChangesComplete(c)$   
 $\wedge networkChanges' = [networkChanges \text{ EXCEPT}$   
 $! [c].state = Complete]$   
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle deviceChanges \rangle$   
 $\vee \wedge HasFailedDeviceChanges(c)$   
 $\wedge RollbackDeviceChanges(c)$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{networkChanges} \rangle \\
& \text{TODO} \\
& \vee \wedge \text{networkChanges}[c].\text{phase} = \text{Rollback} \\
& \wedge \text{networkChanges}' = [\text{networkChanges} \text{ EXCEPT} \\
& \quad ![c].\text{state} = \text{Complete}] \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{deviceChanges} \rangle \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{nodeVars}, \text{deviceVars}, \text{constraintVars} \rangle
\end{aligned}$$


---

This section models the *DeviceChange* reconciler.

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{ReconcileDeviceChange}(n, d, c) & \triangleq \\
& \wedge \text{master}[n][d] \\
& \wedge \text{deviceChanges}[d][c].\text{state} = \text{Pending} \\
& \wedge \text{deviceChanges}[d][c].\text{incarnation} > 0 \\
& \wedge \vee \wedge \text{deviceState}[d] = \text{Connected} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{deviceChanges}' = [\text{deviceChanges} \text{ EXCEPT} \\
& \quad \quad ![d] = [\text{deviceChanges}[d] \text{ EXCEPT } ![c].\text{state} = \text{Complete}]] \\
& \vee \wedge \text{deviceState}[d] = \text{Disconnected} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{deviceChanges}' = [\text{deviceChanges} \text{ EXCEPT} \\
& \quad \quad ![d] = [\text{deviceChanges}[d] \text{ EXCEPT } ![c].\text{state} = \text{Failed}]] \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{nodeVars}, \text{networkChanges}, \text{deviceVars}, \text{constraintVars} \rangle
\end{aligned}$$


---

This section models device states. Devices begin in the *Disconnected* state and can only be configured while in the *Connected* state.

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{Set device } d \text{ state to } \text{Connected} \\
\text{ConnectDevice}(d) & \triangleq \\
& \wedge \text{deviceState}' = [\text{deviceState} \text{ EXCEPT } ![d] = \text{Connected}] \\
& \wedge \text{connectionCount}' = \text{connectionCount} + 1 \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{nodeVars}, \text{configVars}, \text{electionCount}, \text{configCount} \rangle
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{Set device } d \text{ state to } \text{Disconnected} \\
\text{DisconnectDevice}(d) & \triangleq \\
& \wedge \text{deviceState}' = [\text{deviceState} \text{ EXCEPT } ![d] = \text{Disconnected}] \\
& \wedge \text{connectionCount}' = \text{connectionCount} + 1 \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{nodeVars}, \text{configVars}, \text{electionCount}, \text{configCount} \rangle
\end{aligned}$$


---

*Init* and next state predicates

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Init} & \triangleq \\
& \wedge \text{leader} = [n \in \text{Node} \mapsto \text{FALSE}] \\
& \wedge \text{master} = [n \in \text{Node} \mapsto [d \in \text{Device} \mapsto \text{FALSE}]] \\
& \wedge \text{networkChanges} = \langle \rangle \\
& \wedge \text{deviceChanges} = [d \in \text{Device} \mapsto [x \in \{ \} \mapsto [\text{phase} \mapsto \text{Change}, \text{state} \mapsto \text{Pending}]]] \\
& \wedge \text{deviceState} = [d \in \text{Device} \mapsto \text{Disconnected}]
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
&\wedge \text{electionCount} = 0 \\
&\wedge \text{configCount} = 0 \\
&\wedge \text{connectionCount} = 0
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Next} &\triangleq \\
&\vee \exists d \in \text{SUBSET } \text{Device} : \\
&\quad \text{SubmitChange}([x \in d \mapsto 1]) \\
&\vee \exists c \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges} : \\
&\quad \text{RollbackChange}(c) \\
&\vee \exists n \in \text{Node} : \\
&\quad \exists l \in \text{Node} : \\
&\quad \quad \text{SetNodeLeader}(n, l) \\
&\vee \exists n \in \text{Node} : \\
&\quad \exists d \in \text{Device} : \\
&\quad \exists l \in \text{Node} : \\
&\quad \quad \text{SetDeviceMaster}(n, d, l) \\
&\vee \exists n \in \text{Node} : \\
&\quad \exists c \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges} : \\
&\quad \quad \text{ReconcileNetworkChange}(n, c) \\
&\vee \exists n \in \text{Node} : \\
&\quad \exists d \in \text{Device} : \\
&\quad \exists c \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{deviceChanges}[d] : \\
&\quad \quad \text{ReconcileNetworkChange}(n, c) \\
&\vee \exists n \in \text{Node} : \\
&\quad \exists d \in \text{Device} : \\
&\quad \exists c \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{deviceChanges}[d] : \\
&\quad \quad \text{ReconcileDeviceChange}(n, d, c) \\
&\vee \exists d \in \text{Device} : \\
&\quad \text{ConnectDevice}(d) \\
&\vee \exists d \in \text{Device} : \\
&\quad \text{DisconnectDevice}(d)
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{TraceNext} &\triangleq \\
&\vee \text{Next} \\
&\vee \wedge \neg \text{ENABLED } \text{Next} \\
&\quad \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{vars} \rangle
\end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Spec} \triangleq \text{Init} \wedge \Box[\text{TraceNext}]_{\text{vars}}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Inv} &\triangleq \forall c1 \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges} : \\
&\quad \forall c2 \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges} : \\
&\quad \text{LET } d1 \triangleq \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges}[c1].\text{changes} \\
&\quad \quad s1 \triangleq \text{networkChanges}[c1].\text{state} \\
&\quad \quad d2 \triangleq \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges}[c2].\text{changes} \\
&\quad \quad s2 \triangleq \text{networkChanges}[c2].\text{state} \\
&\quad \text{IN}
\end{aligned}$$



$$(c1 > c2 \wedge d1 \in \text{SUBSET } d2 \wedge s1 = \text{Complete}) \Rightarrow s2 = \text{Complete}$$

$$\text{Term} \triangleq \Diamond(\forall c \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{networkChanges} : \text{IsCompleteNetworkChange}(c))$$


---

\\* Modification History

\\* Last modified *Mon Jan 03 01:43:02 PST 2022* by *jordanhalterman*

\\* Created *Wed Sep 22 13:22:32 PDT 2021* by *jordanhalterman*