
MODULE *Config*

INSTANCE *Naturals*

INSTANCE *FiniteSets*

INSTANCE *Sequences*

INSTANCE *TLC*

GenerateTestCases \triangleq FALSE

Nil \triangleq "<nil>"

Change \triangleq "Change"

Rollback \triangleq "Rollback"

Commit \triangleq "Commit"

Apply \triangleq "Apply"

Pending \triangleq "Pending"

Complete \triangleq "Complete"

Aborted \triangleq "Aborted"

Failed \triangleq "Failed"

Done \triangleq { *Complete*, *Aborted*, *Failed* }

Node \triangleq { "node1" }

NumTransactions \triangleq 3

NumTerms \triangleq 2

NumConns \triangleq 2

NumStarts \triangleq 2

Path \triangleq { "path1" }

Value \triangleq { "value1", "value2" }

A transaction *log*. Transactions may either request a set of changes to a set of targets or rollback a prior change.

VARIABLE *transaction*

A record of per-target proposals

VARIABLE *proposal*

A record of per-target configurations

VARIABLE *configuration*

A record of target masterhips

VARIABLE *mastership*

A record of node connections to the target

VARIABLE *conn*

The target state

VARIABLE *target*

A sequence of state changes used for model checking.

VARIABLE *history*

$vars \triangleq \langle transaction, proposal, configuration, mastership, conn, target, history \rangle$

LOCAL *Transaction* \triangleq INSTANCE *Transaction*

LOCAL *Configuration* \triangleq INSTANCE *Configuration*

LOCAL *Mastership* \triangleq INSTANCE *Mastership*

LOCAL *Target* \triangleq INSTANCE *Target*

AppendChange(*p*, *v*) \triangleq
 $\wedge Transaction!AppendChange(p, v)$

RollbackChange(*i*) \triangleq
 $\wedge Transaction!RollbackChange(i)$

ReconcileTransaction(*n*, *i*) \triangleq
 $\wedge i \in \text{DOMAIN } transaction$
 $\wedge Transaction!ReconcileTransaction(n, i)$
 $\wedge GenerateTestCases \Rightarrow$
 LET *context* $\triangleq [node \mapsto n, index \mapsto i]$
 IN $Transaction!Test!Log(context)$

ReconcileConfiguration(*n*) \triangleq
 $\wedge Configuration!ReconcileConfiguration(n)$
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle transaction, proposal, history \rangle$
 $\wedge GenerateTestCases \Rightarrow Configuration!Test!Log([node \mapsto n])$

ReconcileMastership(*n*) \triangleq
 $\wedge Mastership!ReconcileMastership(n)$
 $\wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle transaction, proposal, configuration, target, history \rangle$
 $\wedge GenerateTestCases \Rightarrow Mastership!Test!Log([node \mapsto n])$

ConnectNode(*n*) \triangleq
 $\wedge Target!Connect(n)$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{transaction}, \text{proposal}, \text{configuration}, \text{mastership}, \text{history} \rangle \\
\text{DisconnectNode}(n) & \triangleq \\
& \wedge \text{Target!Disconnect}(n) \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{transaction}, \text{proposal}, \text{configuration}, \text{mastership}, \text{history} \rangle \\
\text{StartTarget} & \triangleq \\
& \wedge \text{Target!Start} \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{transaction}, \text{proposal}, \text{configuration}, \text{mastership}, \text{history} \rangle \\
\text{StopTarget} & \triangleq \\
& \wedge \text{Target!Stop} \\
& \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle \text{transaction}, \text{proposal}, \text{configuration}, \text{mastership}, \text{history} \rangle
\end{aligned}$$

Formal specification, constraints, and theorems.

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Init} & \triangleq \\
& \wedge \text{transaction} = [\\
& \quad i \in \{\} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \text{phase} \mapsto \text{Nil}, \\
& \quad \quad \text{change} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{proposal} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{revision} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{values} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \quad p \in \{\} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \quad \quad \text{index} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \quad \quad \text{value} \mapsto \text{Nil}]]], \\
& \quad \quad \text{rollback} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{proposal} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{revision} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{values} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \quad p \in \{\} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \quad \quad \text{index} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \quad \quad \text{value} \mapsto \text{Nil}]]]]], \\
& \wedge \text{proposal} = [\\
& \quad i \in \{\} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \text{transaction} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \text{commit} \mapsto \text{Nil}, \\
& \quad \quad \text{apply} \mapsto \text{Nil}] \\
& \wedge \text{configuration} = [\\
& \quad \text{state} \mapsto \text{Pending}, \\
& \quad \text{term} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \text{committed} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \text{index} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \text{revision} \mapsto 0,
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{values} \mapsto [\\
& \quad p \in \{\} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \text{index} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \text{value} \mapsto \text{Nil}]]], \\
& \text{applied} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \text{target} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \text{index} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \text{revision} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \text{values} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad p \in \{\} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{index} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{value} \mapsto \text{Nil}]]]] \\
& \wedge \text{target} = [\\
& \quad \text{id} \mapsto 1, \\
& \quad \text{running} \mapsto \text{TRUE}, \\
& \quad \text{values} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad p \in \{\} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{index} \mapsto 0, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{value} \mapsto \text{Nil}]]] \\
& \wedge \text{mastership} = [\\
& \quad \text{master} \mapsto \text{CHOOSE } n \in \text{Node} : \text{TRUE}, \\
& \quad \text{term} \mapsto 1, \\
& \quad \text{conn} \mapsto 1] \\
& \wedge \text{conn} = [\\
& \quad n \in \text{Node} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \quad \text{id} \mapsto 1, \\
& \quad \quad \text{connected} \mapsto \text{TRUE}] \\
& \wedge \text{history} = \langle \rangle \\
& \text{Next} \triangleq \\
& \quad \vee \exists p \in \text{Path}, v \in \text{Value} : \\
& \quad \quad \text{AppendChange}(p, v) \\
& \quad \vee \exists i \in \text{DOMAIN transaction} : \\
& \quad \quad \text{RollbackChange}(i) \\
& \quad \vee \exists n \in \text{Node} : \\
& \quad \quad \exists i \in \text{DOMAIN transaction} : \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{ReconcileTransaction}(n, i) \\
& \quad \vee \exists n \in \text{Node} : \\
& \quad \quad \text{ReconcileConfiguration}(n) \\
& \quad \vee \exists n \in \text{Node} : \\
& \quad \quad \text{ReconcileMastership}(n) \\
& \quad \vee \exists n \in \text{Node} : \\
& \quad \quad \vee \text{ConnectNode}(n) \\
& \quad \quad \vee \text{DisconnectNode}(n) \\
& \quad \vee \text{StartTarget}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \vee \textit{StopTarget} \\
\textit{Spec} & \triangleq \\
& \wedge \textit{Init} \\
& \wedge \Box[\textit{Next}]_{\textit{vars}} \\
& \wedge \forall p \in \textit{Path}, v \in \textit{Value} : \\
& \quad \text{WF}_{\langle \textit{transaction}, \textit{proposal}, \textit{configuration}, \textit{mastership}, \textit{conn}, \textit{target}, \textit{history} \rangle}(\textit{Transaction!AppendChange}(p, v)) \\
& \wedge \forall i \in 1 \dots \textit{NumTransactions} : i \in \text{DOMAIN } \textit{transaction} \Rightarrow \\
& \quad \text{WF}_{\langle \textit{transaction}, \textit{proposal}, \textit{configuration}, \textit{mastership}, \textit{conn}, \textit{target}, \textit{history} \rangle}(\textit{Transaction!RollbackChange}(i)) \\
& \wedge \forall n \in \textit{Node}, i \in 1 \dots \textit{NumTransactions} : \\
& \quad \text{WF}_{\langle \textit{transaction}, \textit{proposal}, \textit{configuration}, \textit{mastership}, \textit{conn}, \textit{target}, \textit{history} \rangle}(\textit{Transaction!ReconcileTransaction}(n, i)) \\
& \wedge \forall n \in \textit{Node} : \\
& \quad \text{WF}_{\langle \textit{configuration}, \textit{mastership}, \textit{conn}, \textit{target} \rangle}(\textit{Configuration!ReconcileConfiguration}(n)) \\
& \wedge \forall n \in \textit{Node} : \\
& \quad \text{WF}_{\langle \textit{mastership}, \textit{conn} \rangle}(\textit{Mastership!ReconcileMastership}(n)) \\
& \wedge \forall n \in \textit{Node} : \\
& \quad \text{WF}_{\langle \textit{conn}, \textit{target} \rangle}(\textit{Target!Connect}(n) \vee \textit{Target!Disconnect}(n)) \\
& \wedge \text{WF}_{\langle \textit{conn}, \textit{target} \rangle}(\textit{Target!Start} \vee \textit{Target!Stop}) \\
\textit{Alias} & \triangleq [\\
& \textit{log} \mapsto [\\
& \quad i \in \text{DOMAIN } \textit{transaction} \mapsto [\\
& \quad \textit{change} \mapsto \\
& \quad \quad \text{IF } \textit{transaction}[i].\textit{change}.\textit{proposal} \neq 0 \text{ THEN} \\
& \quad \quad \quad [\textit{commit} \mapsto \textit{proposal}[\textit{transaction}[i].\textit{change}.\textit{proposal}].\textit{commit}, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \textit{apply} \mapsto \textit{proposal}[\textit{transaction}[i].\textit{change}.\textit{proposal}].\textit{apply}, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \textit{values} \mapsto \textit{transaction}[i].\textit{change}.\textit{values}] \\
& \quad \quad \text{ELSE} \\
& \quad \quad \quad [\textit{commit} \mapsto \textit{Nil}, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \textit{apply} \mapsto \textit{Nil}, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \textit{values} \mapsto \textit{transaction}[i].\textit{change}.\textit{values}], \\
& \quad \textit{rollback} \mapsto \\
& \quad \quad \text{IF } \textit{transaction}[i].\textit{rollback}.\textit{proposal} \neq 0 \text{ THEN} \\
& \quad \quad \quad [\textit{commit} \mapsto \textit{proposal}[\textit{transaction}[i].\textit{rollback}.\textit{proposal}].\textit{commit}, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \textit{apply} \mapsto \textit{proposal}[\textit{transaction}[i].\textit{rollback}.\textit{proposal}].\textit{apply}, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \textit{values} \mapsto \textit{transaction}[i].\textit{rollback}.\textit{values}] \\
& \quad \quad \text{ELSE} \\
& \quad \quad \quad [\textit{commit} \mapsto \textit{Nil}, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \textit{apply} \mapsto \textit{Nil}, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \textit{values} \mapsto \textit{transaction}[i].\textit{rollback}.\textit{values}] @@ \\
& \quad \textit{transaction}[i], \\
& \textit{transaction} \mapsto \textit{transaction}, \\
& \textit{proposal} \mapsto \textit{proposal}, \\
& \textit{configuration} \mapsto \textit{configuration}, \\
& \textit{mastership} \mapsto \textit{mastership},
\end{aligned}$$

$conn \quad \mapsto conn,$
 $target \quad \mapsto target,$
 $history \quad \mapsto history]$

$LimitTransactions \triangleq Len(transaction) \leq NumTransactions$

$LimitTerms \triangleq$
 $\quad \vee mastership.term < NumTerms$
 $\quad \vee \wedge mastership.term = NumTerms$
 $\quad \wedge mastership.master \neq Nil$

$LimitConns \triangleq$
 $\quad \forall n \in DOMAIN \ conn :$
 $\quad \vee conn[n].id < NumConns$
 $\quad \vee \wedge conn[n].id = NumConns$
 $\quad \wedge conn[n].connected$

$LimitStarts \triangleq$
 $\quad \vee target.id < 2$
 $\quad \vee \wedge target.id = 2$
 $\quad \wedge target.running$

$TypeOK \triangleq$
 $\quad \wedge Transaction! TypeOK$
 $\quad \wedge Configuration! TypeOK$
 $\quad \wedge Mastership! TypeOK$

$LOCAL \ IsOrderedChange(p, i) \triangleq$
 $\quad \wedge history[i].type = Change$
 $\quad \wedge history[i].phase = p$
 $\quad \wedge \neg \exists j \in DOMAIN \ history :$
 $\quad \quad \wedge j < i$
 $\quad \quad \wedge history[j].type = Change$
 $\quad \quad \wedge history[j].phase = p$
 $\quad \quad \wedge history[j].index \geq history[i].index$

$LOCAL \ IsOrderedRollback(p, i) \triangleq$
 $\quad \wedge history[i].type = Rollback$
 $\quad \wedge history[i].phase = p$
 $\quad \wedge \exists j \in DOMAIN \ history :$
 $\quad \quad \wedge j < i$
 $\quad \quad \wedge history[j].type = Change$
 $\quad \quad \wedge history[j].index = history[i].index$
 $\quad \wedge \neg \exists j \in DOMAIN \ history :$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge j < i \\
& \wedge \text{history}[j].\text{type} = \text{Change} \\
& \wedge \text{history}[j].\text{phase} = p \\
& \wedge \text{history}[j].\text{index} > \text{history}[i].\text{index} \\
& \wedge \neg \exists k \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{history} : \\
& \quad \wedge k > j \\
& \quad \wedge k < i \\
& \quad \wedge \text{history}[k].\text{type} = \text{Rollback} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{history}[k].\text{phase} = p \\
& \quad \wedge \text{history}[k].\text{index} = \text{history}[j].\text{index}
\end{aligned}$$

$\text{Order} \triangleq$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge \forall i \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{history} : \\
& \quad \vee \text{IsOrderedChange}(\text{Commit}, i) \\
& \quad \vee \text{IsOrderedChange}(\text{Apply}, i) \\
& \quad \vee \text{IsOrderedRollback}(\text{Commit}, i) \\
& \quad \vee \text{IsOrderedRollback}(\text{Apply}, i) \\
& \wedge \forall i \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{transaction} : \\
& \quad \wedge \text{transaction}[i].\text{change.proposal} \neq 0 \\
& \quad \wedge \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[i].\text{change.proposal}].\text{apply} = \text{Failed} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{transaction}[i].\text{rollback.proposal} \neq 0 \Rightarrow \\
& \quad \quad \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[i].\text{rollback.proposal}].\text{apply} \neq \text{Complete} \\
& \quad \Rightarrow \forall j \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{transaction} : (j > i \Rightarrow \\
& \quad \quad (\text{transaction}[j].\text{change.proposal} \neq 0 \Rightarrow \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[j].\text{change.proposal}].\text{apply} \neq \text{Complete}))
\end{aligned}$$

$\text{LOCAL } \text{IsChangeCommitted}(i) \triangleq$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge \text{transaction}[i].\text{change.proposal} \neq 0 \\
& \wedge \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[i].\text{change.proposal}].\text{commit} = \text{Complete} \\
& \wedge \text{transaction}[i].\text{rollback.proposal} \neq 0 \Rightarrow \\
& \quad \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[i].\text{rollback.proposal}].\text{commit} \neq \text{Complete}
\end{aligned}$$

$\text{LOCAL } \text{IsChangeApplied}(i) \triangleq$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge \text{transaction}[i].\text{change.proposal} \neq 0 \\
& \wedge \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[i].\text{change.proposal}].\text{apply} = \text{Complete} \\
& \wedge \text{transaction}[i].\text{rollback.proposal} \neq 0 \Rightarrow \\
& \quad \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[i].\text{rollback.proposal}].\text{apply} \neq \text{Complete}
\end{aligned}$$

$\text{Consistency} \triangleq$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge \forall i \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{transaction} : \\
& \quad \wedge \text{IsChangeCommitted}(i) \\
& \quad \wedge \neg \exists j \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{transaction} : \\
& \quad \quad \wedge j > i \\
& \quad \quad \wedge \text{IsChangeCommitted}(j) \\
& \quad \Rightarrow \forall p \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{transaction}[i].\text{change.values} : \\
& \quad \quad \wedge \text{configuration.committed.values}[p] = \text{transaction}[i].\text{change.values}[p]
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \wedge \forall i \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{transaction} : \\
& \quad \wedge \text{IsChangeApplied}(i) \\
& \quad \wedge \neg \exists j \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{transaction} : \\
& \quad \quad \wedge j > i \\
& \quad \quad \wedge \text{IsChangeApplied}(j) \\
& \Rightarrow \forall p \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{transaction}[i].\text{change.values} : \\
& \quad \wedge \text{configuration.applied.values}[p] = \text{transaction}[i].\text{change.values}[p] \\
& \quad \wedge \wedge \text{target.running} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{configuration.applied.target} = \text{target.id} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{configuration.state} = \text{Complete} \\
& \quad \Rightarrow \text{target.values}[p] = \text{transaction}[i].\text{change.values}[p]
\end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Safety} \triangleq \Box(\text{Order} \wedge \text{Consistency})$$

THEOREM $\text{Spec} \Rightarrow \text{Safety}$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Terminates}(i) & \triangleq \\
& \wedge i \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{transaction} \\
& \wedge \text{transaction}[i].\text{phase} = \text{Change} \rightsquigarrow \\
& \quad \wedge \text{transaction}[i].\text{change.proposal} \neq 0 \\
& \quad \wedge \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[i].\text{change.proposal}].\text{commit} \in \text{Done} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[i].\text{change.proposal}].\text{apply} \in \text{Done} \\
& \wedge \text{transaction}[i].\text{phase} = \text{Rollback} \rightsquigarrow \\
& \quad \wedge \text{transaction}[i].\text{rollback.proposal} \neq 0 \\
& \quad \wedge \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[i].\text{rollback.proposal}].\text{commit} \in \text{Done} \\
& \quad \wedge \text{proposal}[\text{transaction}[i].\text{rollback.proposal}].\text{apply} \in \text{Done}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Termination} & \triangleq \\
& \forall i \in 1 \dots \text{NumTransactions} : \Diamond \text{Terminates}(i)
\end{aligned}$$

$$\text{Liveness} \triangleq \text{Termination}$$

THEOREM $\text{Spec} \Rightarrow \text{Liveness}$