

Information Retrieval – Lucene and Trec_Eval

Assignment – 1

Pallavit Aggarwal – 22333721, IS

About Lucene

Lucene's primary goal is to facilitate information retrieval. In order for Lucene to know what "words" are, it analyzes the text during indexing, extracting it to terms. Analysis, in Lucene, is the process of converting field text into its most fundamental indexed representation, terms.

In general, an analyzer tokenizes text by performing any different operations on it, which could include extracting words, discarding punctuation, removing accents from characters, lowercasing (normalizing), removing common words, reducing words to a root form (stemming), or changing words into the basic form (lemmatization). This process is also called tokenization, and the chunks of text pulled from a stream of text are called tokens. Tokens, combined with their associated field name, are terms.

Implementation

Our Scenario is Ad-hoc IR which assumes fixed document collection over a dynamic one, and where the queries cannot be refined.

We use Java 7 as the choice of language of implementation. Plugin and Dependency management is done using Maven, and the libraries used are: lucene-core:8.6.3, lucene-queryparser:8.6.3 and lucene-analyzers-common:8.10.0.

We first read the file cran.all.1400. This file has information split .I <number> where number is 1 – 1400 and values like .I (index), .T (title), .A (author), .W (words) and .B (bibliography). Then we add documents containing Fields to IndexWriter which analyzes the documents using the Analyzer and then creates/open/edit indexes as required and stores/updates them in a Directory.

We use **TextField** instead of StringField to have Indexes analyzed. (Index.Field.Analyzed).

P5

		Similarities ----->		
Analyzers ---->	P5	Classic	BM25	Boolean
	Standard Analyzer	0.36	0.44	0.28
	Whitespace Analyzer	0.33	0.41	0.26
	Stop Analyzer	0.39	0.43	0.33
	English Analyzer	0.42	0.45	0.33

Mean Average Precision

		Similarities ----->		
Analyzers ---->	map	Classic	BM25	Boolean
	Standard Analyzer	0.3365	0.3916	0.2335
	Whitespace Analyzer	0.3001	0.3574	0.0535
	Stop Analyzer	0.3645	0.3918	0.2893
English Analyzer	0.3819	0.4141	0.2914	

Geometric Mean MAP

		Similarities ----->		
Analyzers ---->	gm_map	Classic	BM25	Boolean
	Standard Analyzer	0.1869	0.2226	0.0795
	Whitespace Analyzer	0.1348	0.1834	0.2073
	Stop Analyzer	0.2054	0.2136	0.116
	English Analyzer	0.2451	0.2688	0.1362

Recall-Precision

Similarities ----->					
Analyzers ---->	Rprec		Classic	BM25	Boolean
	Standard Analyzer		0.3279	0.3886	0.2428
	Whitespace Analyzer		0.3015	0.3571	0.2145
	Stop Analyzer		0.3585	0.3873	0.295
	English Analyzer		0.3681	0.3987	0.2829

Above are the results of different Analyzers (given in green) implemented for different Similarities (given in Blue). The best score and second-best score obtained for each set of values have been highlighted with orange and yellow respectively. **For example**, The P5 score which represents the Precision after 5 docs retrieved has values 0.36 for Standard Analyzer implemented with Classic

Similarity, 0.44 for BM25Similarity and 0.28 for BooleanSimilarity but the maximum P5 score observed was for English Analyzer with BM25Similarity.

Analizers

- **Whitespace Analyzer** uses whitespace tokenizer only, no stop word or case-sensitive filter is used.
- **Stop analyzer** uses lower case tokenizer and stop-token filter to remove stop words from token streams.
- **Standard Analyzer** has a tokenizer and a standard(normalizes tokens), lower-case and stop token filter.
- And finally, the **English Analyzer** which implements a standard tokenizer, Standard Filter, EnglishPossesive Filter, Lowercase Filter, Stop filter and PortStemFilter.

Similarities

Different TF-IDF (Common Locally * Rare Globally) implementations

- **Classic Similarity** is the default similarity which is based on the highly optimized Vector Space Model.
- **BM25 Similarity** is an optimized implementation of the successful Okapi BM25 model ($k_1=1.2$ i.e. term frequency saturation , $b=0.75$ i.e. document length penalization factor)
- **Boolean Similarity** is a simple similarity that gives terms a score that is equal to their query boost.

Result

The scores above are shown when number of retrieved documents are 11250, and number of queries run are 225. The mean average precision and the recall-precision tell us that English Analyzer performs better than others. This could be due the fact that it implements multiple filters. The P5 score which is the Precision after 5 docs retrieved is also the highest for English Analyzer.

		Similarities ----->		
Analyzers --->	num_rel_ret	Classic	BM25	Boolean
	Standard Analyzer	1037	1101	844
	Whitespace Analyzer	960	1030	786
	Stop Analyzer	1075	1089	940
	English Analyzer	1143	1151	954

Another metric that we can consider is the **num_rel_ret** which gives us the total number of relevant documents retrieved over all queries. Out of 1837 num_rel which were constant throughout all trec_evals, above image shows the number of relevant documents retrieved. Here again, English analyzer with the BM25 default similarity has the highest values and the second highest is also the same analyzer with the classic or default similarity.

The command `./trec_eval ../corpus/QRelsCorrectedforTRECEval.txt ../lucene-db/outputs` could've been executed with an -a to provide even more information about the analyzers and their performances like **recall5** and **11-pt_avg**.

As a next step, we can build our own custom analyzer and improve the performance even further for our dataset.

Thank you.

Bibliography

<https://www.baeldung.com/lucene-analyzers>

https://www.tutorialspoint.com/lucene/lucene_analysis.htm

<https://www.infoq.com/articles/similarity-scoring-elasticsearch/>

<https://www.elastic.co/blog/found-bm-vs-lucene-default-similarity>

https://bagua.cct.lsu.edu/dlcurric/modDev/package_modules/MidtermModuleTeam5-TRECEvalFinal.pdf

<https://stackoverflow.com/questions/2602253/how-does-lucene-index-documents?rq=1>

https://www-nlpir.nist.gov/projects/trecvid/trecvid.tools/trec_eval_video/A.README

<https://www.essi.upc.edu/dtim/blog/post/mining-similarity-between-text-documents-using-apache-lucene>

<https://www.javacodegeeks.com/2015/09/lucene-analysis-process-guide.html>

<https://github.com/stmunees/Lucene-Information-Retrieval/blob/master/src/main/java/IR/Searcher.java>

<https://ccc.inaoep.mx/~villasen/bib/AN%20OVERVIEW%20OF%20EVALUATION%20METHODS%20IN%20TREC%20AD%20HOC%20IR%20AND%20TREC%20QA.pdf>

<https://www.lucenetutorial.com/advanced-topics/scoring.html>

https://lucene.apache.org/core/4_0_0/core/org/apache/lucene/search/package-summary.html#scoring

https://lucene.apache.org/core/4_0_0/core/org/apache/lucene/search/similarities/TFIDFSimilarity.html

<https://nlp.stanford.edu/IR-book/html/htmledition/queries-as-vectors-1.html>

<https://github.com/olivernn/cranfield>

<https://github.com/JalajVora/Information-Retrieval-System-using-Apache-Lucene/blob/master/src/LuceneMain.java>

<https://github.com/ddunne6/lucene-cranfield-collection/blob/master/assignment-1/src/main/java/ie/tcd/ddunne6/QueryIndex.java>

<https://github.com/ZhouShengsheng/ci6226-ira-g14>

<https://github.com/Menotron/cs7is3-cranfield-search/tree/master/src/main/java/ie/tcd/cs7is3/cranfield>

Standard Analyzer scores

Standard Analyzer - Classic Similarity (VSM)		Standard Analyzer - BM25		Standard Analyzer - Boolean	
runid	all Any	runid	all Any	runid	all Any
num_q	all 225	num_q	all 225	num_q	all 225
num_ret	all 11250	num_ret	all 11250	num_ret	all 11250
num_rel	all 1837	num_rel	all 1837	num_rel	all 1837
num_rel_ret	all 1037	num_rel_ret	all 1101	num_rel_ret	all 844
map	all 0.3365	map	all 0.3916	map	all 0.2335
gm_map	all 0.1869	gm_map	all 0.2226	gm_map	all 0.0795
Rprec	all 0.3279	Rprec	all 0.3886	Rprec	all 0.2428
bpref	all 0.6156	bpref	all 0.6501	bpref	all 0.4987
recip_rank	all 0.7487	recip_rank	all 0.7969	recip_rank	all 0.6066
iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.7686	iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.8100	iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.6276
iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.7190	iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.7687	iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.5747
iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.6069	iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.6617	iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.4460
iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.4839	iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.5526	iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.3417
iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.3928	iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.4735	iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.2527
iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.3372	iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.4171	iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.2097
iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.2352	iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.2995	iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.1376
iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.1956	iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.2350	iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.1075
iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.1146	iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.1517	iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.0606
iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.0795	iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.1055	iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.0364
iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0733	iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0976	iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0337
P_5	all 0.3662	P_5	all 0.4436	P_5	all 0.2853
P_10	all 0.2640	P_10	all 0.2987	P_10	all 0.2004
P_15	all 0.2027	P_15	all 0.2305	P_15	all 0.1597
P_20	all 0.1691	P_20	all 0.1893	P_20	all 0.1340
P_30	all 0.1283	P_30	all 0.1422	P_30	all 0.1061
P_100	all 0.0461	P_100	all 0.0489	P_100	all 0.0375
P_200	all 0.0230	P_200	all 0.0245	P_200	all 0.0188
P_500	all 0.0092	P_500	all 0.0098	P_500	all 0.0075
P_1000	all 0.0046	P_1000	all 0.0049	P_1000	all 0.0038

Whitespace Analyzer scores

Whitespace Analyzer - Classic Similarity (VSM)		Whitespace Analyzer - BM25		Whitespace Analyzer - Boolean	
runid	all Any	runid	all Any	runid	all Any
num_q	all 225	num_q	all 225	num_q	all 225
num_ret	all 11250	num_ret	all 11250	num_ret	all 11250
num_rel	all 1837	num_rel	all 1837	num_rel	all 1837
num_rel_ret	all 960	num_rel_ret	all 1030	num_rel_ret	all 786
map	all 0.3001	map	all 0.3574	map	all 0.2073
gm_map	all 0.1348	gm_map	all 0.1834	gm_map	all 0.0535
Rprec	all 0.3015	Rprec	all 0.3571	Rprec	all 0.2145
bpref	all 0.5767	bpref	all 0.6146	bpref	all 0.4588
recip_rank	all 0.7107	recip_rank	all 0.7675	recip_rank	all 0.5469
iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.7255	iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.7802	iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.5743
iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.6746	iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.7345	iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.5208
iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.5427	iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.6235	iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.4024
iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.4396	iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.5105	iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.2995
iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.3380	iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.4259	iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.2163
iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.2915	iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.3688	iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.1809
iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.2084	iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.2609	iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.1302
iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.1608	iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.2025	iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.0975
iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.0969	iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.1294	iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.0529
iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.0672	iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.0855	iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.0311
iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0597	iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0799	iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0268
P_5	all 0.3333	P_5	all 0.4044	P_5	all 0.2658
P_10	all 0.2396	P_10	all 0.2791	P_10	all 0.1809
P_15	all 0.1858	P_15	all 0.2142	P_15	all 0.1461
P_20	all 0.1533	P_20	all 0.1769	P_20	all 0.1224
P_30	all 0.1196	P_30	all 0.1320	P_30	all 0.0942
P_100	all 0.0427	P_100	all 0.0458	P_100	all 0.0349
P_200	all 0.0213	P_200	all 0.0229	P_200	all 0.0175
P_500	all 0.0085	P_500	all 0.0092	P_500	all 0.0070
P_1000	all 0.0043	P_1000	all 0.0046	P_1000	all 0.0035

Stop Analyzer Scores

Stop Analyzer - getDefaultStopSet Classic Similarity			Stop - BM25		Stop - Boolean	
runid	all Any	runid	all Any	runid	all Any	
num_q	all 225	num_q	all 225	num_q	all 225	
num_ret	all 11250	num_ret	all 11250	num_ret	all 11250	
num_rel	all 1837	num_rel	all 1837	num_rel	all 1837	
num_rel_ret	all 1075	num_rel_ret	all 1089	num_rel_ret	all 940	
map	all 0.3645	map	all 0.3918	map	all 0.2893	
gm_map	all 0.2054	gm_map	all 0.2136	gm_map	all 0.1160	
Rprec	all 0.3585	Rprec	all 0.3873	Rprec	all 0.2950	
bpref	all 0.6363	bpref	all 0.6450	bpref	all 0.5589	
recip_rank	all 0.7795	recip_rank	all 0.7964	recip_rank	all 0.6747	
iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.7959	iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.8090	iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.6994	
iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.7545	iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.7722	iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.6616	
iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.6419	iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.6642	iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.5432	
iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.5331	iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.5597	iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.4150	
iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.4363	iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.4709	iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.3304	
iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.3745	iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.4160	iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.2812	
iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.2660	iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.3027	iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.1874	
iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.2077	iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.2303	iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.1493	
iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.1304	iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.1521	iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.0916	
iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.0906	iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.1066	iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.0662	
iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0834	iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0982	iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0613	
P_5	all 0.3973	P_5	all 0.4347	P_5	all 0.3378	
P_10	all 0.2773	P_10	all 0.2982	P_10	all 0.2422	
P_15	all 0.2139	P_15	all 0.2287	P_15	all 0.1867	
P_20	all 0.1809	P_20	all 0.1898	P_20	all 0.1556	
P_30	all 0.1385	P_30	all 0.1430	P_30	all 0.1212	
P_100	all 0.0478	P_100	all 0.0484	P_100	all 0.0418	
P_200	all 0.0239	P_200	all 0.0242	P_200	all 0.0209	
P_500	all 0.0096	P_500	all 0.0097	P_500	all 0.0084	
P_1000	all 0.0048	P_1000	all 0.0048	P_1000	all 0.0042	

English Analyzer Scores

English - Classic		English - BM25		English - Boolean	
runid	all Any	runid	all Any	runid	all Any
num_q	all 225	num_q	all 225	num_q	all 225
num_ret	all 11250	num_ret	all 11250	num_ret	all 11250
num_rel	all 1837	num_rel	all 1837	num_rel	all 1837
num_rel_ret	all 1143	num_rel_ret	all 1151	num_rel_ret	all 954
map	all 0.3819	map	all 0.4141	map	all 0.2914
gm_map	all 0.2451	gm_map	all 0.2688	gm_map	all 0.1362
Rprec	all 0.3681	Rprec	all 0.3987	Rprec	all 0.2829
bpref	all 0.6753	bpref	all 0.6824	bpref	all 0.5735
recip_rank	all 0.7909	recip_rank	all 0.8164	recip_rank	all 0.6988
iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.8122	iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.8324	iprec_at_recall_0.00	all 0.7209
iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.7859	iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.8024	iprec_at_recall_0.10	all 0.6732
iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.6627	iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.6933	iprec_at_recall_0.20	all 0.5427
iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.5349	iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.5886	iprec_at_recall_0.30	all 0.4094
iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.4554	iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.4927	iprec_at_recall_0.40	all 0.3313
iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.3923	iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.4208	iprec_at_recall_0.50	all 0.2731
iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.2930	iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.3275	iprec_at_recall_0.60	all 0.1927
iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.2304	iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.2604	iprec_at_recall_0.70	all 0.1530
iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.1516	iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.1833	iprec_at_recall_0.80	all 0.0926
iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.0992	iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.1174	iprec_at_recall_0.90	all 0.0678
iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0931	iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.1090	iprec_at_recall_1.00	all 0.0644
P_5	all 0.4222	P_5	all 0.4498	P_5	all 0.3324
P_10	all 0.2889	P_10	all 0.3120	P_10	all 0.2320
P_15	all 0.2216	P_15	all 0.2400	P_15	all 0.1870
P_20	all 0.1847	P_20	all 0.2013	P_20	all 0.1549
P_30	all 0.1458	P_30	all 0.1523	P_30	all 0.1200
P_100	all 0.0508	P_100	all 0.0512	P_100	all 0.0424
P_200	all 0.0254	P_200	all 0.0256	P_200	all 0.0212
P_500	all 0.0102	P_500	all 0.0102	P_500	all 0.0085
P_1000	all 0.0051	P_1000	all 0.0051	P_1000	all 0.0042