Risk Factors for Coronary Artery Calcium Among Patients With Chronic Kidney Disease (from the Chronic Renal Insufficiency Cohort Study)

Jiang He, MD, PhD^{a,*}, Muredach Reilly, MD, PhD^b, Wei Yang, PhD^b, Jing Chen, MD^a, Alan S. Go, MD^c, James P. Lash, MD^d, Mahboob Rahman, MD^e, Chris DeFilippi, MD^f, Crystal Gadegbeku, MD^g, Radhika Kanthety, MD^e, Kaixiang Tao, MS^b, L. Lee Hamm, MD^a, Akinlolu Ojo, MD, PhD^g, Ray Townsend, MD^b, and Matthew Budoff, MD^h, for the CRIC Investigators

Cardiovascular disease is the leading cause of death in patients with chronic kidney disease (CKD). We examined the cross-sectional association between novel risk factors and coronary artery calcium (CAC) measured using electron beam computed tomography or multidetector computed tomography among 2,018 patients with CKD. Using the total Agatston scores, the participants were classified as having no (0), moderate (>0-100), or high (>100) CAC. After adjustment for age, gender, race, study sites, cigarette smoking, previous cardiovascular disease, hypertension, and diabetes, the use of lipid-lowering drugs, body mass index, waist circumference, and cystatin C, several novel risk factors were significantly associated with high CAC. For example, the odds ratios of high CAC associated with 1 SD greater level of risk factors were 1.20 (95% confidence interval 1.04 to 1.38) for serum calcium, 1.21 (95% confidence interval 1.04 to 1.41) for serum phosphate, 0.83 (95% confidence interval 0.71 to 0.97) for log (total parathyroid hormone), 1.21 (95% confidence interval 1.03 to 1.43) for log (homeostasis model assessment-insulin resistance), and 1.23 (95% confidence interval 1.04 to 1.45) for hemoglobin A1c. Additionally, the multivariate-adjusted odds ratio for 1 SD greater level of cystatin C was 1.31 (95% confidence interval 1.14 to 1.50). Serum high-sensitive C-reactive protein, interleukin-6, tumor necrosis factor-α, and homocysteine were not statistically significantly associated with high CAC. In conclusion, these data indicate that abnormal calcium and phosphate metabolism, insulin resistance, and declining kidney function are associated with the prevalence of high CAC, independent of the traditional risk factors in patients with CKD. Additional studies are warranted to examine the causal effect of these risk factors on CAC in patients with CKD. © 2012 Elsevier Inc. All rights reserved. (Am J Cardiol 2012;110:1735–1741)

Prospective cohort studies have documented that cardio-vascular disease (CVD) is the major cause of premature death in patients with chronic kidney disease (CKD). 1-3 Coronary arterial calcium (CAC) independently predicts the risk of CVD over and above the traditional risk factors in the general population. 4 CAC is more common and severe in patients with CKD^{5,6} and is more strongly associated with an increased risk of CVD in patients with end-stage renal disease compared to the general population. 7,8 In a

meta-analysis of 30 cohort studies with 218,080 subjects, the presence of CAC was associated with a three- to fourfold greater risk of CVD in the overall population and more than sixfold greater risk among patients with end-stage renal disease. In the general population, cigarette smoking, obesity, dyslipidemia, hypertension, diabetes, and inflammation are all associated with an increased risk of CAC.^{9–11} These risk factors are common in those with CKD and might partially contribute to increased risk of CAC. 12,13 However, data are sparse on novel risk factors for CAC in patients with predialysis CKD. 14 The Chronic Renal Insufficiency Cohort (CRIC) study included a large group of patients with CKD with a broad spectrum of renal function and co-morbid conditions. More than ½ of CRIC participants underwent electron beam computed tomography (CT) or multidetector CT, which provided an exceptional opportunity to examine the traditional and novel risk factors for CAC in patients with CKD.

Methods

The CRIC study included a racially and ethnically diverse group of men and women aged 21 to 74 years with mild-to-moderate CKD (age-based estimated glomerular fil-

^aTulane University School of Public Health and Tropical Medicine, and School of Medicine, New Orleans, Louisiana; ^bUniversity of Pennsylvania School of Medicine, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania; ^cKaiser Permanente Division of Research, Oakland, California; ^dUniversity of Illinois College of Medicine, Chicago; Illinois; ^cCase Western Reserve University School of Medicine, Cleveland, Ohio; ^fUniversity of Maryland School of Medicine, Baltimore, Maryland; ^gUniversity of Michigan School of Medicine, Ann Arbor, Michigan; and ^hLos Angeles Biomedical Research Institute, Los Angeles County Harbor–UCLA Medical Center, Torrance, California. Manuscript received April 30, 2012; revised manuscript received and accepted July 30, 2012.

^{*}Corresponding author: Tel: (504) 988-5165; fax: (504) 988-1568. *E-mail address:* jhe@tulane.edu (J. He).

tration rate entry criteria 20 to 70 mL/min/1.73 m²); approximately ½ of the cohort had diabetes. A total of 3,612 CRIC participants were recruited from May 2003 to August 2008 from 7 clinical centers in the United States. 15 Patients with cirrhosis, human immunodeficiency virus infection, polycystic kidney disease, or renal cell carcinoma, those requiring dialysis or who had received a kidney transplant, and those taking immunosuppressant drugs were excluded from the CRIC study. Additionally, patients with a history of coronary artery revascularization were excluded from electron beam CT/multidetector CT. Of the CRIC study participants, 1,142 were randomly selected from the entire cohort and stratified by age, gender, race/ethnicity, diabetes status, and estimated glomerular filtration rate for electron beam CT/multidetector CT. In addition, electron beam CT/multidetector CT was performed on all eligible CRIC participants from 3 clinical centers for an ancillary study. A total of 2,018 CRIC participants had CAC data and were included in the present analysis.

The CRIC study was approved by the institutional review boards from each of the participating clinical centers and the scientific and data coordinating center. All participants provided written informed consent. The present study also conformed to the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act guidelines.

All CRIC study data were collected by trained study staff during the baseline and annual clinical visits. All data collection procedures and equipment were standardized across study sites. A baseline medical history questionnaire was administered to obtain information on demographic characteristics, lifestyle risk factors, history of CVD, and the use of medications. Cigarette smokers were defined as participants who had smoked >100 cigarettes in their lifetime. Alcohol drinkers were defined as participants who had a drink of any kind of alcoholic beverage in the previous 12 months. Body weight and height were measured, and the body mass index was calculated as an index for obesity. The waist circumference was measured at the uppermost lateral border of the iliac crest using a Gulick II tape measure. Three seated blood pressure measurements were obtained by trained and certified staff after ≥ 5 minutes of quiet rest. These measurements were performed according to a standard protocol using an aneroid sphygmomanometer, and the average of 3 measurements was used for analysis. 16 Hypertension was defined as systolic blood pressure ≥140 mm Hg and/or diastolic blood pressure ≥90 mm Hg and/or the current use of antihypertensive medications.

Glucose, cholesterol, triglycerides, glycated hemoglobin, phosphate, calcium, total parathyroid hormone, uric acid, hemoglobin, and alkaline phosphatase were measured using standard laboratory methods. High-sensitive C-reactive protein, interleukin-6, tumor necrosis factor- α , homocysteine, and cystatin C were measured using the particle enhanced immunonephelometry method. Fibrinogen was measured using the immunochemical reaction method. Urinary albumin was measured by radioimmunoassay. Diabetes was defined as a fasting glucose of \geq 126 mg/dl, random glucose of \geq 200 mg/dl, and/or the use of insulin or other antidiabetic medication. Estimated glomerular filtration rate was calculated using the 4-variable Modification of Diet in Renal Disease equation after calibrating the serum creatinine

measurements to the Cleveland Clinic Foundation reference values. Thomeostasis model of assessment (HOMA) was calculated to evaluate insulin resistance using the following formula: (fasting serum insulin [μ U/ml] × fasting plasma glucose [mmol/L])/22.5. All laboratory measurements were performed in a centralized laboratory at the University of Pennsylvania.

As a part of the CRIC protocol, a subcohort of participants underwent measurement of CAC with either electron beam CT or multidetector CT at the year 1 visit. Trained and certified technologists scanned all participants twice over phantoms of known physical calcium concentrations. A cardiologist read all computed tomographic scans at a central reading center (Los Angeles Biomedical Research Institute, Harbor UCLA Medical Center, Torrance, California). The total Agatston score, which is a pseudocontinuous variable derived from the plaque densities and their areas in all coronary arteries, was computed. ¹⁹ We used the average Agatston score from the 2 scans in all analyses. From the distribution of the Agatston score in our study participants, we divided the CRIC participants into no (0), moderate (>0–100), or high (>100) CAC.

The baseline characteristics of the participants were summarized as the mean \pm SD for continuous variables and percentages for categorical variables by CAC status. Statistical significance was tested using analysis of variance for continuous variables and chi-square tests for categorical variables. Logarithmic transformation was performed for severely skewed variables to stabilize variances and normalize distributions.

The adjusted odds ratios (ORs) of moderate and high CAC associated with the risk factors were estimated using a multinomial logistic regression model. For the multivariate analysis of traditional risk factors, the backward elimination method was used, and only covariates that were significant (p < 0.05) were retained in the final model. For the multivariate analysis of novel risk factors, age, gender, race, and significant covariates (cigarette smoking, history of hypertension, diabetes, and the use of lipid-lowering drugs, body mass index, and waist circumference) from the final traditional risk factor model, and previous CVD, were adjusted for each novel risk factor in separate models. Furthermore, the serum cystatin C level was adjusted in the multivariate model to control for the confounding effect of kidney function. ORs and 95% confidence intervals (CIs) of moderate and high CAC associated with categorical variables or 1 SD increase in continuous variables are presented. In a sensitivity analysis, the 2-part model, in which binary CAC (0 vs >0) was modeled using Poisson regression with robust variance estimation and log (CAC + 1) was modeled using linear regression among those with CAC >0, was used.²⁰ All analyses were conducted using SAS, version 9.1 (SAS Institute, Cary, North Carolina). All p values were 2-sided, and statistical significance was defined as p < 0.05.

Results

Compared to those without CAC, the participants with moderate or high CAC were more likely to be older, male, and current or former smokers and to have a history of

Table 1
Baseline characteristics of study participants stratified coronary artery calcium (CAC) score

Variable	Total Agatston Score					
	$ \begin{array}{c} 0\\ (n = 689) \end{array} $	>0-100 (n = 578)	>100 (n = 751)			
Age (years)	51.9 ± 12.3	59.1 ± 10.2	63.9 ± 8.1	< 0.0001		
Men	41.9%	53.3%	63.6%	< 0.0001		
Race				0.10		
White	47.2%	45.2%	51.3%			
Black	37.4%	36.3%	32.1%			
Other	15.4%	18.5%	16.6%			
High school graduation	83.7%	78.7%	80.4%	0.06		
Physical activity (MET/wk)	6.2 ± 22.0	5.0 ± 19.2	3.6 ± 16.3	0.04		
Cigarette smoking				< 0.0001		
Current	9.0%	10.4%	10.5%			
Former	31.8%	37.7%	49.1%			
Never	59.2%	51.9%	40.3%			
Alcohol consumption	65.0%	62.2%	59.2%	0.08		
Previous cardiovascular disease	11.8%	21.6%	40.9%	< 0.0001		
Previous peripheral arterial disease	2.3%	2.2%	10.1%	< 0.0001		
Previous congestive heart failure	3.3%	5.5%	10.7%	< 0.0001		
Previous stroke	4.5%	9.3%	13.4%	< 0.0001		
Previous myocardial infarction	4.5%	8.7%	25.3%	< 0.0001		
Hypertension	76.4%	89.1%	94.3%	< 0.0001		
Diabetes mellitus	29.6%	46.2%	62.5%	< 0.0001		
Use of lipid-lowering drugs	43.4%	60.2%	77.0%	< 0.0001		
Systolic blood pressure (mm Hg)	122.4 ± 20.1	127.0 ± 21.4	129.4 ± 21.2	< 0.0001		
Body mass index (kg/m ²)	30.4 ± 6.9	31.5 ± 6.7	31.5 ± 6.5	0.002		
Waist circumference (cm)	99.9 ± 16.1	104.3 ± 15.7	106.7 ± 15.1	< 0.0001		
High-density lipoprotein cholesterol (mg/dl)	51.9 ± 17.3	47.9 ± 15.0	47.0 ± 14.5	< 0.0001		
Low-density lipoprotein cholesterol (mg/dl)	109.8 ± 36.5	104.6 ± 34.4	95.8 ± 32.2	< 0.0001		
Calcium (mg/dl)	9.3 ± 0.5	9.3 ± 0.5	9.3 ± 0.5	0.96		
Phosphate (mg/dl)	3.6 ± 0.7	3.7 ± 0.7	3.8 ± 0.7	0.002		
Alkaline phosphatase (U/L)	89.2 ± 32.2	93.1 ± 33.7	92.9 ± 37.5	0.002		
	66.9 ± 64.5	67.0 ± 57.9		0.07		
Total parathyroid hormone (pg/ml)			72.1 ± 81.8			
Log (total parathyroid hormone) (pg/ml)	4.0 ± 0.7	4.0 ± 0.7	4.0 ± 0.7	0.3439		
HOMA-insulin resistance*	5.0 ± 6.4	6.1 ± 7.4	6.8 ± 7.7	< 0.0001		
Log (HOMA-insulin resistance)	1.5 ± 0.6	1.7 ± 0.6	1.8 ± 0.7	< 0.0001		
Hemoglobin A1c (%)	6.2 ± 1.5	6.5 ± 1.5	6.8 ± 1.5	< 0.0001		
Uric acid (mg/dl)	6.9 ± 1.9	7.2 ± 1.8	7.4 ± 1.9	< 0.0001		
Homocysteine (µmol/L)	13.2 ± 5.3	14.3 ± 6.5	15.5 ± 6.0	< 0.0001		
Fibrinogen (mg/dl)	3.9 ± 1.1	4.1 ± 1.2	4.2 ± 1.1	< 0.0001		
High-sensitive C-reactive protein (mg/L)	4.7 ± 7.8	5.0 ± 9.3	4.6 ± 6.9	0.57		
Log (high sensitive C-reactive protein) (mg/L)	1.3 ± 0.8	1.3 ± 0.9	1.3 ± 0.8	0.78		
Interleukin-6 (mg/dl)	2.9 ± 12.5	4.8 ± 21.8	4.0 ± 15.7	0.13		
Log (interleukin-6) (mg/dl)	1.0 ± 0.6	1.1 ± 0.7	1.2 ± 0.6	< 0.0001		
Tumor necrosis factor- α (mg/dl)	3.5 ± 15.1	3.2 ± 6.5	2.8 ± 2.4	0.40		
Log (tumor necrosis factor- α) (mg/dl)	1.2 ± 0.6	1.2 ± 0.5	1.2 ± 0.4	0.06		
Estimated glomerular filtration rate (ml/min/1.73 m ²)	44.4 ± 16.5	42.5 ± 14.7	39.2 ± 13.5	< 0.0001		
Cystatin C (mg/L)	1.4 ± 0.5	1.5 ± 0.5	1.6 ± 0.5	< 0.0001		
24-Hour urine albumin (g/24 hours)	0.6 ± 1.4	0.8 ± 2.0	0.7 ± 1.8	0.28		
Log (24-hour urine albumin) (g/24 hours)	0.3 ± 0.5	0.3 ± 0.6	0.3 ± 0.5	0.61		

Data are presented as mean \pm standard deviation or percentages.

clinical CVD, hypertension, diabetes, or the use of lipidlowering medications, and were less likely to be physically active (Table 1). On average, participants with CAC had greater systolic blood pressure levels, body mass index, and waist circumference and lower levels of high-density lipoprotein cholesterol, low-density lipoprotein cholesterol, and estimated glomerular filtration rate. In addition, participants with CAC had greater than average levels of serum phosphate, HOMA-insulin resistance, glycated hemoglobin, uric acid, homocysteine, fibrinogen, log (interleukin-6), and cystatin C.

In the age-, gender-, race-adjusted model, current and former cigarette smoking, a history of hypertension, diabetes, and the use of lipid-lowering medication, systolic blood pressure, body mass index, and waist circumference were positively associated with the odds of CAC, and high-density lipoprotein cholesterol, low-density lipoprotein cho-

^{*} HOMA-insulin resistance = (fasting serum insulin [\(\mu\)U/ml] \times fasting plasma glucose [mmol/L])/22.

Table 2
Multivariate-adjusted odds ratios (ORs) and 95% confidence intervals (CIs)* of moderate (>0-100) and severe (>100) coronary artery calcium (CAC) associated with traditional risk factors

Variable	Age-, Gender-	, Race-Adjusted OR (95% CI)	Multivariate-Adjusted OR (95% CI) [†]			
	Moderate (>0–100)	High (>100)	p Value for Trend	Moderate (>0–100)	High (>100)	p Value for Trend	
High school graduation	0.86 (0.62–1.17)	0.94 (0.68–1.30)	0.61				
Physical activity (19.2 MET/wk)	1.00 (0.89-1.11)	0.95 (0.84-1.09)	0.74				
Smoking			0.006			0.004	
Current	1.37 (0.91-2.06)	1.98 (1.30-3.01)		1.51 (0.97-2.34)	2.31 (1.45-3.70)		
Former	0.98 (0.76-1.27)	1.34 (1.04-1.74)		0.97 (0.74-1.27)	1.31 (0.98-1.74)		
Alcohol consumption	0.95 (0.74-1.22)	0.77 (0.60-1.00)	0.11				
Hypertension	2.11 (1.50-2.97)	4.06 (2.70-6.11)	< 0.0001	1.77 (1.22-2.57)	2.24 (1.43-3.51)	0.0004	
Diabetes mellitus	2.10 (1.64-2.68)	4.60 (3.55-5.95)	< 0.0001	1.65 (1.26-2.16)	3.25 (2.44-4.34)	< 0.0001	
Use of lipid-lowering drugs	1.66 (1.31-2.11)	3.37 (2.60-4.35)	< 0.0001	1.37 (1.06-1.78)	2.56 (1.92-3.40)	< 0.0001	
Systolic blood pressure (21.1 mm Hg)	1.15 (1.02–1.31)	1.30 (1.15-1.48)	0.0002				
Body mass index (6.7 kg/m ²)	1.21 (1.07-1.36)	1.32 (1.17-1.49)	< 0.0001	0.89 (0.69-1.14)	0.69 (0.53-0.90)	0.02	
Waist circumference (15.9 cm)	1.26 (1.11–1.42)	1.49 (1.31-1.68)	< 0.0001	1.29 (1.00-1.66)	1.66 (1.27-2.17)	0.001	
High-density lipoprotein cholesterol (15.8 mg/dl)	0.80 (0.70-0.91)	0.79 (0.69–0.90)	0.0002				
Low-density lipoprotein cholesterol (34.9 mg/dl)	0.93 (0.83–1.04)	0.75 (0.66–0.85)	< 0.0001				
Estimated glomerular filtration rate (15.1 ml/min/1.73 m ²)	0.90 (0.80–1.01)	0.70 (0.62–0.79)	< 0.0001				

^{*} OR were calculated using multinomial logistic regression models.

lesterol, and estimated glomerular filtration rate had an inverse association (Table 2). In the final model selected by backward elimination, cigarette smoking, history of hypertension, diabetes, and lipid-lowering medications, and waist circumference were positively and significantly associated with the odds of CAC, and body mass index was inversely and significantly associated with the odds of CAC.

The age-, gender-, race-adjusted and multivariate-adjusted ORs of CAC associated with novel risk factors are listed in Table 3. After adjusting for age, gender, and race, greater levels of serum phosphate, log (HOMA-insulin resistance), glycated hemoglobin, uric acid, homocysteine, fibrinogen, log (interleukin-6), log (tumor necrosis factor- α), cystatin C, and 24-hour urinary excretion of albumin were all significantly associated with greater odds of CAC. In addition, serum alkaline phosphatase was significantly associated with greater odds of high CAC. After adjusting for multiple traditional risk factors, serum phosphate and cystatin C remained significantly associated with overall odds of CAC. In addition, log (HOMA-insulin resistance), glycated hemoglobin, homocysteine, and fibrinogen were significantly associated with greater odds of high CAC. In the multivariate model, including cystatin C, greater levels of calcium, phosphate, log (HOMA-insulin resistance), and glycated hemoglobin were positively, and log (parathyroid hormone) was inversely, associated with greater odds of high CAC.

In the sensitivity analysis using the 2-part model, the presence of CAC (total Agatston score >0) was positively and significantly associated with 1 SD greater levels of phosphate (OR 1.05, 95% CI 1.02 to 1.08; p = 0.001), log (HOMA-insulin resistance) (OR 1.05, 95% CI 1.01 to 1.08, p = 0.004), glycated hemoglobin (OR 1.05, 95% CI 1.02 to 1.09; p = 0.001), fibrinogen (OR 1.03, 95% CI 1.00 to 1.06;

p = 0.03), and cystatin C (OR 1.04; 95% CI 1.01 to 1.07; p = 0.01) after adjusting for multiple covariables in Poisson regression. Log (CAC + 1) was positively and significantly associated with 1 SD greater levels of phosphate (β = 0.19; 95% CI 0.07 to 0.30; p = 0.001), homocysteine (β = 0.13; 95% CI 0.02 to 0.24; p = 0.02), and cystatin C (β = 0.21; 95% CI 0.11 to 0.30; p <0.0001) among participants with CAC >0 after adjustment for multiple covariables in linear regression.

Discussion

The present study has contributed to our understanding of the etiology of CAC among patients CKD in several ways. First, the findings from the present study indicate that, just as in the general population, cigarette smoking, hypertension, diabetes mellitus, dyslipidemia, and obesity are related to an increased risk of CAC among patients with CKD. Second, the results from the present study have shown that calcium and phosphate metabolism might play an important etiologic role in CAC among patients with CKD. Furthermore, the present study has revealed that elevated levels of insulin resistance and glycated hemoglobin are associated with an increased risk of CAC. Finally, the present study found that cystatin C, a measure of kidney function, is independently associated with elevated CAC.

Our study findings are worthwhile because they are based on data from a large sample of patients with CKD. The study outcome (CAC) and numerous traditional and novel CVD risk factors were carefully measured with rigorous quality control. Therefore, our study should provide an accurate estimate of the association between risk factors and CAC. A major limitation of the present analysis was its cross-sectional nature; therefore, the temporal relationship between risk factors and CAC could not be established. The

[†] Variables with p <0.05 were kept in final model using backward selection.

Table 3
Multivariate-adjusted odds ratios (ORs) and 95% confidence intervals (CIs)* of moderate (>0-100) and severe (>100) coronary artery calcium (CAC) associated with novel risk factors

Variable	Age-, Gender-, Race-Adjusted		$Multivariate\text{-}Adjusted^{\dagger}$			Multivariate-Adjusted [‡]			
	Moderate (>0–100)	High (>100)	p Value for Trend	Moderate (>0–100)	High (>100)	p Value for Trend	Moderate (>0–100)	High (>100)	p value for trends
Calcium (0.54 mg/dl)	0.99 (0.87–1.11)	0.97 (0.86–1.10)	0.89	1.05 (0.92–1.19)	1.13 (0.98–1.29)	0.23	1.07 (0.94–1.22)	1.20 (1.04–1.38)	0.04
Phosphate (0.67 mg/dl)	1.26 (1.11-1.43)	1.66 (1.45-1.90)	< 0.0001	1.11 (0.97-1.27)	1.30 (1.13-1.50)	0.001	1.09 (0.94-1.25)	1.21 (1.04-1.41)	0.04
Alkaline phosphatase (34.7 U/L)	1.11 (0.98-1.25)	1.15 (1.02-1.30)	0.07	1.01 (0.89-1.15)	1.01 (0.88-1.15)	0.99	0.99 (0.86-1.13)	0.94 (0.82-1.08)	0.67
Log (total parathyroid hormone, 0.68 pg/ml)	1.03 (0.92–1.17)	1.11 (0.98–1.26)	0.24	0.96 (0.85–1.09)	1.00 (0.87–1.14)	0.78	0.90 (0.77–1.05)	0.83 (0.71–0.97)	0.07
Log (homeostasis model of assessment-insulin resistance, 0.65)	1.37 (1.20–1.56)	1.69 (1.48–1.93)	< 0.0001	1.13 (0.96–1.31)	1.20 (1.03–1.41)	0.08	1.13 (0.96–1.31)	1.21 (1.03–1.43)	0.06
Hemoglobin A1c (1.54%)	1.36 (1.20-1.55)	1.82 (1.59-2.08)	< 0.0001	1.10 (0.93-1.29)	1.22 (1.03-1.44)	0.07	1.10 (0.93-1.30)	1.23 (1.04-1.45)	0.05
Uric acid (1.88 mg/dl)	1.09 (0.96-1.23)	1.19 (1.05-1.35)	0.02	0.98 (0.86-1.12)	1.03 (0.89-1.18)	0.80	0.95 (0.82-1.09)	0.94 (0.81-1.09)	0.66
Homocysteine (5.96 μmol/L)	1.14 (0.99-1.32)	1.32 (1.14-1.52)	0.0006	1.03 (0.90-1.19)	1.14 (1.00-1.31)	0.15	1.01 (0.87-1.16)	1.03 (0.89-1.20)	0.90
Fibrinogen (1.14 mg/dl)	1.25 (1.10-1.41)	1.43 (1.26-1.63)	< 0.0001	1.11 (0.97-1.26)	1.17 (1.01-1.34)	0.09	1.09 (0.95-1.25)	1.09 (0.94-1.26)	0.41
Log (high-sensitivity C-reactive protein, 0.83 mg/L)	1.05 (0.93–1.18)	1.06 (0.93–1.19)	0.63	1.01 (0.89–1.15)	1.01 (0.88–1.17)	0.98	1.00 (0.88–1.14)	0.99 (0.86,1.14)	0.97
Log (interleukin-6, 0.63 mg/dl)	1.20 (1.06-1.37)	1.29 (1.13-1.48)	0.0006	1.11 (0.97-1.26)	1.12 (0.97-1.29)	0.23	1.09 (0.95-1.25)	1.06 (0.91-1.22)	0.45
Log (tumor necrosis factor-α, 0.51 mg/dl)	1.14 (1.00-1.28)	1.17 (1.03-1.33)	0.04	1.07 (0.94-1.21)	1.04 (0.91-1.19)	0.59	1.04 (0.91-1.18)	0.94 (0.81-1.08)	0.30
Cystatin C (0.53 mg/L)	1.24 (1.10-1.41)	1.62 (1.43-1.84)	< 0.0001	1.10 (0.97-1.26)	1.31 (1.14–1.50)	0.0005			
24-Hour urine albumin (1.72 g/24 hours)	1.26 (1.10–1.45)	1.35 (1.17–1.56)	0.0002	1.12 (0.98–1.28)	1.08 (0.93-1.26)	0.27	1.10 (0.96-1.27)	1.01 (0.86-1.18)	0.25

^{*} ORs were calculated using multinomial logistic regression models.

[†] Adjusted for age, gender, race, cigarette smoking, previous clinical CVD, hypertension, and diabetes, use of lipid-lowering drugs, body mass index, and waist circumference.

^{*}Adjusted for age, gender, race, cigarette smoking, previous CVD, hypertension, and diabetes, use of lipid-lowering drugs, body mass index, waist circumference, and cystatin C.

use of a subclinical measurement (CAC) in our study, however, should have minimized the cross-sectional bias owing to the change in risk factors because of the diagnosis of clinical disease. Furthermore, it is unlikely that CAC caused the elevated traditional CVD risk factors, serum calcium and phosphate levels, insulin resistance, or serum cystatin C levels, in patients with CKD and CAC.

Patients with advanced CKD usually develop hyperphosphatemia owing to impaired renal phosphate excretion.¹⁴ Elevated serum levels of calcium, phosphate, and calcium phosphate product were associated with greater CAC in patients with end-stage renal disease receiving hemodialysis⁷ and patients with predialysis CKD.^{21,22} Garland et al²¹ reported that the serum calcium level correlated with the CAC scores in 119 patients with CKD. Adeney et al²² reported that the serum phosphate concentration was associated with a 21% greater prevalence of CAC in 439 patients with CKD from the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis. Our study, with a large sample size, documented the positive and independent associations of serum calcium and phosphate levels with CAC. In addition, we found an inverse and independent association between serum total parathyroid hormone, an important hormone regulating calcium-phosphate metabolism, and CAC. Tsuchihashi et al²³ reported that hypoparathyroidism was associated with a greater serum calcium level and coronary artery disease among 48 patients with end-stage renal disease. The findings from our study, and others, have provided strong evidence that abnormal calcium-phosphate metabolism is probably the most important pathogenetic factor in vascular calcification among patients with CKD. 13,22

Insulin resistance and hemoglobin A1c are associated with greater CAC in the general population and in patients with diabetes. ^{24,25} In a small clinical study, Kobayashi et al²⁶ reported that HOMA-insulin resistance was greater in 17 patients with CKD with total Agatston scores >600 compared to those with a score <600. In that large study of patients with CKD, we found that HOMA-insulin resistance and hemoglobin A1c were positively and independently associated with greater CAC. These findings support the notion that insulin resistance and hyperglycemia are important risk factors for coronary artery disease in patients with CKD.

Recent investigations have suggested that cystatin C might be a better filtration marker than creatinine, especially at greater glomerular filtration rates.²⁷ Serum cystatin C has been associated with an increased risk of CVD.²⁸ Maahs et al²⁹ reported that cystatin C was modestly predictive of CAC progression in 509 adults with type 1 diabetes. However, Ix et al³⁰ reported that cystatin C was not independently associated with CAC in 6,749 participants in the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis. We identified a strong, independent, and dose–response association between cystatin C and CAC in this CKD patient population. These findings suggest that kidney function, as measured by cystatin C, is an independent risk factor for CAC.

 Go AS, Chertow GM, Fan D, McCulloch CE, Hsu CY. Chronic kidney disease and the risks of death, cardiovascular events, and hospitalization. N Engl J Med 2004;351:1296–1305.

- Shlipak MG, Fried LF, Cushman M, Manolio TA, Peterson D, Stehman-Breen C, Bleyer A, Newman A, Siscovick D, Psaty B. Cardiovascular mortality risk in chronic kidney disease: comparison of traditional and novel risk factors. *JAMA* 2005;293:1737–1745.
- 3. Muntner P, He J, Hamm L, Loria C, Whelton PK. Renal insufficiency and subsequent death resulting from cardiovascular disease in the United States. *J Am Soc Nephrol* 2002;13:745–753.
- 4. Greenland P, Bonow RO, Brundage BH, Budoff MJ, Eisenberg MJ, Grundy SM, Lauer MS, Post WS, Raggi P, Redberg RF, Rodgers GP, Shaw LJ, Taylor AJ, Weintraub WS, Harrington RA, Abrams J, Anderson JL, Bates ER, Grines CL, Hlatky MA, Lichtenberg RC, Lindner JR, Pohost GM, Schofield RS, Shubrooks SJ Jr, Stein JH, Tracy CM, Vogel RA, Wesley DJ. ACCF/AHA 2007 clinical expert consensus document on coronary artery calcium scoring by computed tomography in global cardiovascular risk assessment and in evaluation of patients with chest pain: a report of the American College of Cardiology Foundation Clinical Expert Consensus Task Force. Circulation 2007;115:402–426.
- Kestenbaum BR, Adeney KL, de Boer IH, Ix JH, Shlipak MG, Siscovick DS. Incidence and progression of coronary calcification in chronic kidney disease: the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis. *Kidney Int* 2009;76:991–998.
- Budoff MJ, Rader DJ, Reilly MP, Mohler ER III, Lash J, Yang W, Rosen L, Glenn M, Teal V, Feldman HI; CRIC Study Investigators. Relationship of estimated GFR and coronary artery calcification in the CRIC (Chronic Renal Insufficiency Cohort) Study. Am J Kidney Dis 2011;58:519–526.
- Raggi P, Boulay A, Chasan-Taber S, Amin N, Dillon M, Burke SK, Chertow GM. Cardiac calcification in adult hemodialysis patients: a link between end-stage renal disease and cardiovascular disease? *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2002;39:695–701.
- Rennenberg RJ, Kessels AG, Schurgers LJ, van Engelshoven JM, de Leeuw PW, Kroon AA. Vascular calcifications as a marker of increased cardiovascular risk: a meta-analysis. *Vasc Health Risk Manag* 2009:5:185–197.
- Loria CM, Liu K, Lewis CE, Hulley SB, Sidney S, Schreiner PJ, Williams OD, Bild DE, Detrano R. Early adult risk factor levels and subsequent coronary artery calcification: the CARDIA study. *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2007;49:2013–2020.
- Kronmal RA, McClelland RL, Detrano R, Shea S, Lima JA, Cushman M, Bild DE, Burke GL. Risk factors for the progression of coronary artery calcification in asymptomatic subjects: results from the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA). Circulation 2007;115:2722– 2730.
- Jenny NS, Brown ER, Detrano R, Folsom AR, Saad MF, Shea S, Szklo M, Herrington DM, Jacobs DR Jr. Associations of inflammatory markers with coronary artery calcification: results from the Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis. *Atherosclerosis* 2010;209:226–229.
- Tomiyama C, Higa A, Dalboni MA, Cendoroglo M, Draibe SA, Cuppari L, Carvalho AB, Neto EM, Canziani ME. The impact of traditional and non-traditional risk factors on coronary calcification in pre-dialysis patients. *Nephrol Dial Transplant* 2006;21:2464–2471.
- Baber U, de Lemos JA, Khera A, McGuire DK, Omland T, Toto RD, Hedayati SS. Non-traditional risk factors predict coronary calcification in chronic kidney disease in a population-based cohort. *Kidney Int* 2008;73:615–621.
- Covic A, Kanbay M, Voroneanu L, Turgut F, Serban DN, Serban IL, Goldsmith DJ. Vascular calcification in chronic kidney disease. *Clin Sci (Lond)* 2010;119:111–221.
- 15. Lash JP, Go AS, Appel LJ, He J, Ojo A, Rahman M, Townsend RR, Xie D, Cifelli D, Cohan J, Fink JC, Fischer MJ, Gadegbeku C, Hamm LL, Kusek JW, Landis JR, Narva A, Robinson N, Teal V, Feldman HI; Chronic Renal Insufficiency Cohort (CRIC) Study Group. Chronic Renal Insufficiency Cohort (CRIC) study: baseline characteristics and associations with kidney function. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2009;4: 1302–1311.
- Perloff D, Grim C, Flack J, Frohlich ED, Hill M, McDonald M, Morgenstern BZ. Human blood pressure determination by sphygmomanometry. *Circulation* 1993;88:2460–2470.
- Levey AS, Bosch JP, Lewis JB, Greene T, Rogers N, Roth D. A more accurate method to estimate glomerular filtration rate from serum creatinine: a new prediction equation. Modification of Diet in Renal Disease Study group. *Ann Intern Med* 1999;130:461–470.

- 18. Matthews DR, Hosker JP, Rudenski AS, Naylor BA, Treacher DF, Turner RC. Homeostasis model assessment: insulin resistance and β-cell function from fasting plasma glucose and insulin concentration in man. *Diabetologia* 1985;28:412–419.
- Agatston AS, Janowitz WR, Hildner FJ, Zusmer NR, Viamonte M Jr, Detrano R. Quantification of coronary artery calcium using ultrafast computed tomography. J Am Coll Cardiol 1990;15:827–832.
- Ma S, Liu A, Carr J, Post W, Kronmal R. Statistical modeling of Agatston score in Multi-Ethnic Study of Atherosclerosis (MESA). PLoS One 2010;5:e12036.
- Garland JS, Holden RM, Groome PA, Lam M, Nolan RL, Morton AR, Pickett W. Prevalence and associations of coronary artery calcification in patients with stages 3 to 5 CKD without cardiovascular disease. *Am J Kidney Dis* 2008;52:849–858.
- Adeney KL, Siscovick DS, Ix JH, Seliger SL, Shlipak MG, Jenny NS, Kestenbaum BR. Association of serum phosphate with vascular and valvular calcification in moderate CKD. J Am Soc Nephrol 2009;20: 381–387.
- 23. Tsuchihashi K, Takizawa H, Torii T, Ikeda R, Nakahara N, Yuda S, Kobayashi N, Nakata T, Ura N, Shimamoto K. Hypoparathyroidism potentiates cardiovascular complications through disturbed calcium metabolism: possible risk of vitamin D(3) analog administration in dialysis patients with end-stage renal disease. Nephron 2000;84: 13–20.

- Qasim A, Mehta NN, Tadesse MG, Wolfe ML, Rhodes T, Girman C, Reilly MP. Adipokines, insulin resistance, and coronary artery calcification. *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2008;52:231–236.
- Anand DV, Lim E, Darko D, Bassett P, Hopkins D, Lipkin D, Corder R, Lahiri A. Determinants of progression of coronary artery calcification in type 2 diabetes role of glycemic control and inflammatory/vascular calcification markers. J Am Coll Cardiol 2007;50:2218–2225.
- Kobayashi S, Oka M, Maesato K, Ikee R, Mano T, Hidekazu M, Ohtake T. Coronary artery calcification, ADMA, and insulin resistance in CKD patients. *Clin J Am Soc Nephrol* 2008;3:1289–1295.
- Stevens LA, Coresh J, Greene T, Levey AS. Assessing kidney function—measured and estimated glomerular filtration rate. N Engl J Med 2006;354:2473–2483.
- Shlipak MG, Sarnak MJ, Katz R, Fried LF, Seliger SL, Newman AB, Siscovick DS, Stehman-Breen C. Cystatin C and the risk of death and cardiovascular events among elderly persons. N Engl J Med 2005;352: 2049–2060.
- Maahs DM, Ogden LG, Kretowski A, Snell-Bergeon JK, Kinney GL, Berl T, Rewers M. Serum cystatin C predicts progression of subclinical coronary atherosclerosis in individuals with type 1 diabetes. *Diabetes* 2007;56:2774–2779.
- Ix JH, Katz R, Kestenbaum B, Fried LF, Kramer H, Stehman-Breen C, Shlipak MG. Association of mild to moderate kidney dysfunction and coronary calcification. J Am Soc Nephrol 2008;19:579–585.