

Individual review (20 mins)

Task 1: Review the report and answer the following questions include pros, cons & any feedback

1. Are the chosen tasks reasonable and adequate?

The chosen tasks are reasonable but the definition of a country that is underperforming is a bit misleading in my opinion. The authors define such a country as one that simply has a low medal count for women, but there are factors such as country population, mountain sport tradition, etc. that have an impact on the country's ability to deliver athletes to the competition. Poland will hardly ever be a leader in Winter Olympics as it lacks the mountain ranges other countries have. Additionally, population size implies generally more athletes from the country will participate to the event and will thus resulting in a higher chance of medal winnings.

2. How well is the chosen design justified?

The design is well justified as the main goal is to show how the medal count progresses through time for each country. The bar map does a very good job showing this in a concise manner, allowing easy comparison among all countries without needing to scroll up and down much.

3. Does the chosen visual idiom incorporate and explain expressiveness principles?

I believe it does. All the data is included and no more than the data needed to prove the task is included. To be honest, the second visualization goes a bit overboard by showing more than needed to address the task. The expressiveness concept says that the idiom should only address the tasks presented and not more, but I don't mind visualizing extra info.

4. Does the chosen visual idiom incorporate and explain effectiveness principles?

The idioms are accurate; channels are very separable; the use of color is good although the choice of pink over white in the first idiom is in my opinion not ideal for visualization (although I recognize using pink for women might convey the point that this is a women medal analysis visualization).

5. Does the visualization design map to chosen tasks

It does. The idioms achieve the tasks in full. The second visualization however does not map to the tasks as it goes beyond what the tasks suppose as their objective. I have nothing against doing extra work personally but from a strict mapping perspective the extra work does not map to any of the tasks very well.

6. Do the conclusions/findings match the tasks

With respect to idiom 1, yes they do. The findings clearly showcase the trend in women medal count. However, as stated above, the conclusion from idiom 2 do not match the task.

7. Additional comments on report

Very nice visualization! I would have considered adding the actual percentage in or next to each pink bar so to make the scores for each bar clear and comparable.

Task 2: Review the solution and answer the following questions with pros, cons & any feedback

1. Does the visualization design map well to chosen tasks?

It does, the tasks are addressed well. This question is identical to one above so I will add pros/cons.

Pros:

- Idiom 1 succinctly and concisely presents all the data needed to fulfill the task successfully
- Idiom 1 is very intuitive.

Cons:

- Besides the addition of the unnecessary idiom (#2), the only con is that the quantities relating to each bar could have been shown by default to give a better idea. Comparisons are easy and intuitive to make with the interactive bar chart, but to an uninformed viewer a medium height bar could represent 100 or 10 medals (there is no way of knowing which)

2. How effectively does the visualization support the chosen tasks?

Very well as all channel encodings present the needed information.

3. Does the visualization include interaction and how its helpful?

The visualization includes a bar chart displaying the medals quantities for each bar. This is very helpful in understanding actual medal quantities and comparing country medal counts in absolute terms.

4. How well does the visualization incorporate the given data?

Very well. The visualization presents all the included data, again except for the actual medal quantities not showing by default but only resulting from interactions.

5. Additional comments on the solution

Very nice job!