

Causal Inference for the Social Sciences

Reading list (Weeks 5+ subject to change)

Pablo Geraldo Bastías

For every topic (two each week), we are going to read relevant literature from across several disciplines (mostly Sociology, Economics, Political Science, Epidemiology, Statistics, and Computer Sciences). Causal inference is an interdisciplinary effort, and no single discipline covers all fronts. Additionally, different disciplines have slightly different ways of explaining and justifying things, and you may find some of them more helpful and illuminating than others. Eventually, I hope you will develop the skill to read across these niches and fill in the gaps when background knowledge is taken for granted.

There is another reason why I believe it is important to broaden the spectrum of one's readings. When doing research, you will encounter cases in which the analytical designs you already know are not really suitable for your application. Lacking good examples, you may be tempted to force your analysis into something known. Or, if you're very committed, you're going to find yourself reinventing the wheel. But it may well be the case that the answer to your question has been found somewhere else! You're just not going to find it if you only search inside your disciplinary journals.

When available, I have included reference textbooks that provide a canonical explanation of the concepts and methods we are covering. To keep up with recent developments, we are also going to read one contemporary review paper every week¹. But, since the idea is to obtain a panorama, not only of the state-of-the-art, but also of the genealogy of the ideas we are discussing in this class and the controversies surrounding them, I have included at least one foundational text each week. This has also a pedagogical use. It is not infrequent for concepts to be presented in a rather transparent and intuitive way at the beginning, only to get obfuscated along the way (but also the other way around!).

The remaining weekly readings will include at least one applied article (to see different empirical strategies in action, to have a template of what credible causal inference may look like, and to provide our class discussions with a common ground), one relatively straightforward methodological piece, and a second, more challenging one. It is fine if you don't get everything in the first pass (in fact, it is expected). It is also fine if you need to pause, read again, find a Youtube video explaining the math (especially if it is from [3Blue1Brown](#)), bring some paper and a pen, and work through some details yourself.

I have marked with an (*) the texts I expect you to start with, because they should help you to understand the rest of the readings (and the class). The references marked as (**) require no particular background, and they should ideally be read before the weekly lecture as they may come as examples in class.

¹I have also collected some slides or video presentations that are particularly good at explaining a new methods or reviewing recent advances.

1 From methods to assumptions

1.1 Why causal inference?

Keywords: theoretical estimand, empirical estimand, estimator, estimate, assumptions

Required

Lundberg, Ian, Rebecca Johnson, and Brandon M. Stewart. 2021. “What Is Your Estimand? Defining the Target Quantity Connects Statistical Evidence to Theory.” *American Sociological Review* 86(3):532–65. doi: 10.1177/00031224211004187. (**)

Morgan, Stephen L. and Christopher Winship (2014). *Counterfactuals and Causal Inference: Methods and Principles for Social Research* (2nd edition), Cambridge University Press, Chapters 1-2 (*)

Suggested

Greenland, Sander. 2022. “The Causal Foundations of Applied Probability and Statistics.” Pp. 605–24 in *Probabilistic and Causal Inference: The Works of Judea Pearl*. Vol. 36. New York, NY, USA: Association for Computing Machinery.

Hernán, Miguel A., John Hsu, and Brian Healy. 2019. “A Second Chance to Get Causal Inference Right: A Classification of Data Science Tasks.” *CHANCE* 32(1):42–49. doi: 10.1080/09332480.2019.1579578.

Holland, Paul W. 1986. “Statistics and Causal Inference.” *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 81(396):945–60. doi: 10.2307/2289064.

Imbens, Guido W. 2022. “Causality in Econometrics: Choice vs Chance.” *Econometrica* 90(6):2541–66. doi: 10.3982/ECTA21204.

Mitra, Nandita, Jason Roy, and Dylan Small. 2022. “The Future of Causal Inference.” *American Journal of Epidemiology* 191(10):1671–76. doi: 10.1093/aje/kwac108.

Ogburn, Elizabeth L., and Ilya Shpitser. 2021. “Causal Modelling: The Two Cultures.” *Observational Studies* 7(1):179–83.

Pearl, Judea, and Dana Mackenzie. 2019. *The Book of Why: The New Science of Cause and Effect*. 1st edition. London: Penguin.

1.2 Potential outcomes to hypothesize, experiments to learn

Keywords: potential outcomes, switching equation, treatment effect, SUTVA, consistency, exchangeability, ignorability, independence, identification, randomization, balance, clusters, blocks

Required

Gerber, Alan S., and Donald P. Green. 2012. *Field Experiments – Design, Analysis, and Interpretation*. Illustrated edition. New York London: W. W. Norton & Company, Chapters 1-3 (*)

Quadlin, Natasha. 2018. “The Mark of a Woman’s Record: Gender and Academic Performance in Hiring.” *American Sociological Review* 83(2):331–60. doi: 10.1177/0003122418762291.

Senn, Stephen. 2013. "Seven Myths of Randomisation in Clinical Trials." *Statistics in Medicine* 32(9):1439–50. doi: 10.1002/sim.5713.

Suggested

Deaton, Angus, and Nancy Cartwright. 2018. "Understanding and Misunderstanding Randomized Controlled Trials." *Social Science & Medicine* 210:2–21. doi: 10.1016/j.socscimed.2017.12.005.

Doan, Long, Natasha Quadlin, and Katharine Khanna. 2024. "Using Experiments to Study Families and Intimate Relationships." *Journal of Marriage and Family* 86(5):1251–71. doi: 10.1111/jomf.12959.

Druckman, James N. 2022. *Experimental Thinking: A Primer on Social Science Experiments*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Elwert, Felix, Tamás Keller, and Andreas Kotsadam. 2023. "Rearranging the Desk Chairs: A Large Randomized Field Experiment on the Effects of Close Contact on Interethnic Relations." *American Journal of Sociology* 128(6):1809–40. doi: 10.1086/724865.

Glennster, Rachel, and Kudzai Takavarasha. 2013. *Running Randomized Evaluations: A Practical Guide*. Illustrated edition. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Imbens, Guido W., and Donald B. Rubin. 2015. *Causal Inference for Statistics, Social, and Biomedical Sciences: An Introduction*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, Chapters 1-3

Kohavi, Ron. 2020. *Trustworthy Online Controlled Experiments: A Practical Guide to A/B Testing*. 1st edition. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Pager, Devah. 2003. "The Mark of a Criminal Record." *American Journal of Sociology* 108(5):937–75. doi: 10.1086/374403.

Pager, Devah, Rebecca Goldstein, Helen Ho, and Bruce Western. 2022. "Criminalizing Poverty: The Consequences of Court Fees in a Randomized Experiment." *American Sociological Review* 87(3):529–53. doi: 10.1177/00031224221075783.

Rubin, Donald B. 2008. "For Objective Causal Inference, Design Trumps Analysis." *The Annals of Applied Statistics* 2(3):808–40. doi: 10.1214/08-AOAS187.

Sävje, Fredrik. 2021. "Randomization Does Not Imply Unconfoundedness."

Veltri, Giuseppe. 2023. *Designing Online Experiments for the Social Sciences*. 1st edition. Los Angeles London New Delhi Singapore Washington DC Melbourne: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Weisshaar, Katherine, Koji Chavez, and Tania Hutt. 2024. "Hiring Discrimination Under Pressures to Diversify: Gender, Race, and Diversity Commodification across Job Transitions in Software Engineering." *American Sociological Review* 89(3):584–613. doi: 10.1177/00031224241245706.

2 From assumptions to models

2.1 Structural causal model as scaffoldings

Keywords: structural equations, directed acyclic graphs, chain, fork, collider, do-operator, interventional graph, testing graph, backdoor criterion, frontdoor criterion, adjustment formula, non-parametric identification

Required

Elwert, Felix, and Christopher Winship. 2014. “Endogenous Selection Bias: The Problem of Conditioning on a Collider Variable.” *Annual Review of Sociology* 40(1):31–53. doi: 10.1146/annurev-soc-071913-043455. (**)

Morgan, Stephen L. and Christopher Winship (2014). *Counterfactuals and Causal Inference: Methods and Principles for Social Research* (2nd edition), Cambridge University Press, Chapters 3 (*)

Pearl, Judea, Madelyn Glymour, and Nicholas P. Jewell. 2016. *Causal Inference in Statistics: A Primer*. 1st edition. Chichester: Wiley, Chapter 3 (until section 3.7)

Suggested

Akimova, Evelina T., Richard Breen, David M. Brazel, and Melinda C. Mills. 2021. “Gene-Environment Dependencies Lead to Collider Bias in Models with Polygenic Scores.” *Scientific Reports* 11(1):9457. doi: 10.1038/s41598-021-89020-x.

Bareinboim, Elias, Juan D. Correa, Duligur Ibeling, and Thomas Icard. 2022. “On Pearl’s Hierarchy and the Foundations of Causal Inference.” Pp. 507–56 in *Probabilistic and Causal Inference: The Works of Judea Pearl*. Vol. 36. New York, NY, USA: Association for Computing Machinery.

Dawid, A. P. 1995. “Causal Diagrams for Empirical Research: Discussion of ‘Causal Diagrams for Empirical Research’ by J. Pearl.” *Biometrika* 82(4):689–90. doi: 10.1093/biomet/82.4.689.

Dawid, A. Philip. 2010. “Beware of the DAG!” Pp. 59–86 in *Proceedings of Workshop on Causality: Objectives and Assessment at NIPS 2008*. PMLR.

Greenland, Sander, Judea Pearl, and James M. Robins. 1999. “Causal Diagrams for Epidemiologic Research.” *Epidemiology* 10(1):37–48. doi: 10.1097/00001648-199901000-00008.

Griffith, Gareth J., Tim T. Morris, Matthew J. Tudball, Annie Herbert, Giulia Mancano, Lindsey Pike, Gemma C. Sharp, Jonathan Sterne, Tom M. Palmer, George Davey Smith, Kate Tilling, Luisa Zuccolo, Neil M. Davies, and Gibran Hemani. 2020. “Collider Bias Undermines Our Understanding of COVID-19 Disease Risk and Severity.” *Nature Communications* 11(1):5749. doi: 10.1038/s41467-020-19478-2.

Hernán, Miguel A., Sonia Hernández-Díaz, and James M. Robins. 2004. “A Structural Approach to Selection Bias” *Epidemiology* 15(5):615–25. doi: 10.1097/01.ede.0000135174.63482.43.

Imbens, Guido W., and Donald B. Rubin. 1995. “Causal Diagrams for Empirical Research: Discussion of ‘Causal Diagrams for Empirical Research’ by J. Pearl.” *Biometrika* 82(4):694–95. doi: 10.1093/biomet/82.4.694.

Keele, Luke, Randolph T. Stevenson, and Felix Elwert. 2020. "The Causal Interpretation of Estimated Associations in Regression Models." *Political Science Research and Methods* 8(1):1–13. doi: 10.1017/psrm.2019.31.

Knight, Carly R., and Christopher Winship. 2013. "The Causal Implications of Mechanistic Thinking: Identification Using Directed Acyclic Graphs (DAGs)." Pp. 275–99 in *Handbook of Causal Analysis for Social Research*, *Handbooks of Sociology and Social Research*, edited by S. L. Morgan. Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands.

Knox, Dean, Will Lowe, and Jonathan Mummolo. 2020. "Administrative Records Mask Racially Biased Policing." *American Political Science Review* 114(3):619–37. doi: 10.1017/S0003055420000039.

Pearl, Judea. 1995a. "Causal Diagrams for Empirical Research." *Biometrika* 82(4):669–88. doi: 10.1093/biomet/82.4.669.

Pearl, Judea. 1995b. "Rejoinder to Discussions of Causal Diagrams for Empirical Research." *Biometrika* 82(4):702–10. doi: 10.2307/2337339.

Robins, James M. 1995. "Discussion of Causal Diagrams for Empirical Research by J. Pearl." *Biometrika* 82(4):695–98. doi: 10.2307/2337335.

Rosenbaum, Paul R. 1995. "Causal Diagrams for Empirical Research: Discussion of 'Causal Diagrams for Empirical Research' by J. Pearl." *Biometrika* 82(4):698–99. doi: 10.1093/biomet/82.4.698.

Shalizi, Cosma Rohilla, and Andrew C. Thomas. 2011. "Homophily and Contagion Are Generically Confounded in Observational Social Network Studies." *Sociological Methods & Research* 40(2):211–39. doi: 10.1177/0049124111404820.

Westreich, Daniel, and Sander Greenland. 2013. "The Table 2 Fallacy: Presenting and Interpreting Confounder and Modifier Coefficients." *American Journal of Epidemiology* 177(4):292–98. doi: 10.1093/aje/kws412.

2.2 Identification strategies as research templates

Keywords: identification strategies, identification assumptions, credibility ladder, (non-)parametric assumptions, as-if-random, observational studies, quasi-experiments, natural experiments

Required

Imbens, Guido W. 2024. "Causal Inference in the Social Sciences." *Annual Review of Statistics and Its Application* 11(Volume 11, 2024):123–52. doi: 10.1146/annurev-statistics-033121-114601.

Keele, Luke, and William Minozzi. 2013. "How Much Is Minnesota Like Wisconsin? Assumptions and Counterfactuals in Causal Inference with Observational Data." *Political Analysis* 21(2):193–216. doi: 10.1093/pan/mps041.

Suggested

Angrist, Joshua D., and Jörn-Steffen Pischke. 2010. "The Credibility Revolution in Empirical Economics: How Better Research Design Is Taking the Con out of Econometrics." *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 24(2):3–30. doi: 10.1257/jep.24.2.3.

Imbens, Guido W. 2020. "Potential Outcome and Directed Acyclic Graph Approaches to Causality: Relevance for Empirical Practice in Economics." *Journal of Economic Literature* 58(4):1129–79. doi: 10.1257/jel.20191597.

Lewbel, Arthur. 2019. "The Identification Zoo: Meanings of Identification in Econometrics." *Journal of Economic Literature* 57(4):835–903. doi: 10.1257/jel.20181361.

Steiner, Peter M., Yongnam Kim, Courtney E. Hall, and Dan Su. 2017. "Graphical Models for Quasi-Experimental Designs." *Sociological Methods & Research* 46(2):155–88. doi: 10.1177/0049124115582272.

Winship, Christopher, and Stephen L. Morgan. 1999. "The Estimation of Causal Effects from Observational Data." *Annual Review of Sociology* 25(Volume 25, 1999):659–706. doi: 10.1146/annurev.soc.25.1.659.

3 Blocking backdoor paths

3.1 Modeling $E(Y|X)$: regression adjustment and imputation

Keywords: adjustment set, admissible set, adjustment formula, deconfounding, regression analysis, (partial) linear model, imputation, g-computation

Required

Angrist, Joshua D., Jorn-steffen Pischke, and Jörn-steffen Pischke. 2009. *Mostly Harmless Econometrics – An Empiricist’s Companion*. Illustrated edition. Princeton: Princeton University Press, Regression Chapter (*)

Cinelli, Carlos, Andrew Forney, and Judea Pearl. 2024. "A Crash Course in Good and Bad Controls." *Sociological Methods & Research* 53(3):1071–1104. doi: 10.1177/00491241221099552.(**)

Chatton, Arthur, and Julia M. Rohrer. 2024. "The Causal Cookbook: Recipes for Propensity Scores, G-Computation, and Doubly Robust Standardization." *Advances in Methods and Practices in Psychological Science* 7(1). doi: 10.1177/25152459241236149.

Suggested

Brand, Jennie E., and Yu Xie. 2010. "Who Benefits Most from College?: Evidence for Negative Selection in Heterogeneous Economic Returns to Higher Education." *American Sociological Review* 75(2):273–302. doi: 10.1177/0003122410363567.

Breen, Richard, Seongsoo Choi, and Anders Holm. 2015. "Heterogeneous Causal Effects and Sample Selection Bias." *Sociological Science* 2:351–69. doi: 10.15195/v2.a17.

Bruns-Smith, David, Oliver Dukes, Avi Feller, and Elizabeth L. Ogburn. 2024. "Augmented Balancing Weights as Linear Regression."

Chattopadhyay, Ambarish, and José R. Zubizarreta. 2023. "On the Implied Weights of Linear Regression for Causal Inference." *Biometrika* 110(3):615–29. doi: 10.1093/biomet/asac058.

Goldsmith-Pinkham, Paul, Peter Hull, and Michal Kolesár. 2024. “Contamination Bias in Linear Regressions.” *American Economic Review* 114(12):4015–51. doi: 10.1257/aer.20221116.

Hainmueller, Jens, and Chad Hazlett. 2014. “Kernel Regularized Least Squares: Reducing Misspecification Bias with a Flexible and Interpretable Machine Learning Approach.” *Political Analysis* 22(2):143–68. doi: 10.1093/pan/mpt019.

Hazlett, Chad, and Tanvi Shinkre. 2024. “Demystifying and Avoiding the OLS ‘Weighting Problem’: Unmodeled Heterogeneity and Straightforward Solutions.”

Imbens, Guido, and Yiqing Xu. 2024. “LaLonde (1986) after Nearly Four Decades: Lessons Learned.”

Mazrekaj, Deni, Kristof De Witte, and Sofie Cabus. 2020. “School Outcomes of Children Raised by Same-Sex Parents: Evidence from Administrative Panel Data.” *American Sociological Review* 85(5):830–56. doi: 10.1177/0003122420957249.

Passaretta, Giampiero, and Jan Skopek. 2021. “Does Schooling Decrease Socioeconomic Inequality in Early Achievement? A Differential Exposure Approach.” *American Sociological Review* 86(6):1017–42. doi: 10.1177/00031224211049188.

3.2 Modeling $E(D|X)$: matching and weighting

Keywords: propensity score, greedy matching, optimal matching, inverse probability weighting, calibration weighting, balance in expectation, balance in sample

Required

Hainmueller, Jens. 2012. “Entropy Balancing for Causal Effects: A Multivariate Reweighting Method to Produce Balanced Samples in Observational Studies.” *Political Analysis* 20(1):25–46. doi: 10.1093/pan/mpr025.

Stuart, Elizabeth A. 2010. “Matching Methods for Causal Inference: A Review and a Look Forward.” *Statistical Science* 25(1):1–21. doi: 10.1214/09-STS313.

Zhou, Xiang. 2019. “Equalization or Selection? Reassessing the ‘Meritocratic Power’ of a College Degree in Intergenerational Income Mobility.” *American Sociological Review* 84(3):459–85. doi: 10.1177/0003122419844992.

Suggested

Abadie, Alberto, and Guido W. Imbens. 2011. “Bias-Corrected Matching Estimators for Average Treatment Effects.” *Journal of Business & Economic Statistics* 29(1):1–11. doi: 10.1198/jbes.2009.07333.

Abadie, Alberto, and Guido W. Imbens. 2016. “Matching on the Estimated Propensity Score.” *Econometrica* 84(2):781–807. doi: 10.3982/ECTA11293.

Brand, Jennie E., and Juli Simon Thomas. 2014. “Job Displacement among Single Mothers: Effects on Children’s Outcomes in Young Adulthood.” *American Journal of Sociology* 119(4):955–1001. doi: 10.1086/675409.

- Chattopadhyay, Ambarish, Christopher H. Hase, and José R. Zubizarreta. 2020. "Balancing vs Modeling Approaches to Weighting in Practice." *Statistics in Medicine* 39(24):3227–54. doi: 10.1002/sim.8659.
- Dehejia, Rajeev H., and Sadek Wahba. 1999. "Causal Effects in Nonexperimental Studies: Reevaluating the Evaluation of Training Programs." *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 94(448):1053–62. doi: 10.2307/2669919.
- Dehejia, Rajeev H., and Sadek Wahba. 2002. "Propensity Score-Matching Methods for Nonexperimental Causal Studies." *The Review of Economics and Statistics* 84(1):151–61.
- Hazlett, Chad. 2016. "Kernel Balancing: A Flexible Non-Parametric Weighting Procedure for Estimating Causal Effects." *SSRN Electronic Journal*. doi: 10.2139/ssrn.2746753.
- Imbens, Guido W. 2015. "Matching Methods in Practice: Three Examples." *The Journal of Human Resources* 50(2):373–419.
- Kim, Kwangho, Bijan A. Niknam, and José R. Zubizarreta. 2024. "Scalable Kernel Balancing Weights in a Nationwide Observational Study of Hospital Profit Status and Heart Attack Outcomes." *Biostatistics* 25(3):736–53. doi: 10.1093/biostatistics/kxad032.
- Morgan, Stephen L., and David J. Harding. 2006. "Matching Estimators of Causal Effects: Prospects and Pitfalls in Theory and Practice." *Sociological Methods & Research* 35(1):3–60. doi: 10.1177/0049124106289164.
- Rosenbaum, Paul R. 2009. *Design of Observational Studies*. 2010th edition. New York: Springer-Verlag New York Inc.
- Rosenbaum, Paul R. 2020. "Modern Algorithms for Matching in Observational Studies." *Annual Review of Statistics and Its Application* 7(Volume 7, 2020):143–76. doi: 10.1146/annurev-statistics-031219-041058.
- Rosenbaum, Paul R., and Donald B. Rubin. 1983. "The Central Role of the Propensity Score in Observational Studies for Causal Effects." *Biometrika* 70(1):41–55. doi: 10.1093/biomet/70.1.41. Rubin, Donald B. 2006. *Matched Sampling for Causal Effects*. 1st edition. Cambridge University Press.
- Sekhon, Jasjeet S. 2009. "Opiates for the Matches: Matching Methods for Causal Inference." *Annual Review of Political Science* 12(1):487–508. doi: 10.1146/annurev.polisci.11.060606.135444.
- Wolfe, Joseph D., Mieke Beth Thomeer, and Shawn Bauldry. 2024. "Twentieth-Century Change in the Educational Costs of Adolescent Childbearing." *American Journal of Sociology* 129(6):1763–91. doi: 10.1086/729819.
- Zubizarreta, José R. 2015. "Stable Weights That Balance Covariates for Estimation With Incomplete Outcome Data." *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 110(511):910–22. doi: 10.1080/01621459.2015.1023805.
- Zubizarreta, José R., Ricardo D. Paredes, and Paul R. Rosenbaum. 2014. "Matching for Balance, Pairing for Heterogeneity in an Observational Study of the Effectiveness of for-Profit and Not-for-Profit High Schools in Chile." *The Annals of Applied Statistics* 8(1):204–31. doi: 10.1214/13-AOAS713.

4 As-good-as-random assignment

4.1 Using the side-door: instrumental variables

Keywords: instrument, as-if-random, exogeneity, exclusion restriction, monotonicity, homogeneity, principal strata, compilers, local average treatment effect

Required

Felton, Chris, and Brandon M. Stewart. 2024. “Handle with Care: A Sociologist’s Guide to Causal Inference with Instrumental Variables.” *Sociological Methods & Research* 00491241241235900. doi: 10.1177/00491241241235900. (*)

Lal, Apoorva, Mackenzie Lockhart, Yiqing Xu, and Ziwen Zu. 2024. “How Much Should We Trust Instrumental Variable Estimates in Political Science? Practical Advice Based on 67 Replicated Studies.” *Political Analysis* 32(4):521–40. doi: 10.1017/pan.2024.2.

Sharkey, Patrick, Gerard Torrats-Espinosa, and Delaram Takyar. 2017. “Community and the Crime Decline: The Causal Effect of Local Nonprofits on Violent Crime.” *American Sociological Review* 82(6):1214–40. doi: 10.1177/0003122417736289. (**)

Suggested

Angrist, Joshua D., Guido W. Imbens, and Donald B. Rubin. 1996. “Identification of Causal Effects Using Instrumental Variables.” *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 91(434):444–55. doi: 10.1080/01621459.1996.10476902.

Borusyak, Kirill, and Peter Hull. 2023. “Nonrandom Exposure to Exogenous Shocks.” *Econometrica* 91(6):2155–85. doi: 10.3982/ECTA19367.

Doyle, Joseph, John Graves, and Jonathan Gruber. 2019. “Evaluating Measures of Hospital Quality: Evidence from Ambulance Referral Patterns.” *The Review of Economics and Statistics* 101(5):841–52. doi: 10.1162/rest_a_00804.

Greenland, Sander. 2000. “An Introduction to Instrumental Variables for Epidemiologists.” *International Journal of Epidemiology* 29(4):722–29. doi: 10.1093/ije/29.4.722.

Harding, David J., Jeffrey D. Morenoff, Anh P. Nguyen, and Shawn D. Bushway. 2018. “Imprisonment and Labor Market Outcomes: Evidence from a Natural Experiment.” *American Journal of Sociology* 124(1):49–110. doi: 10.1086/697507.

Hernán, Miguel A., and James M. Robins. 2006. “Instruments for Causal Inference: An Epidemiologist’s Dream?” *Epidemiology* 17(4):360. doi: 10.1097/01.ede.0000222409.00878.37.

Imbens, Guido W. 2010. “Better LATE Than Nothing: Some Comments on Deaton (2009) and Heckman and Urzua (2009).” *Journal of Economic Literature* 48(2):399–423. doi: 10.1257/jel.48.2.399.

Imbens, Guido W. 2014. “Instrumental Variables: An Econometrician’s Perspective.” *Statistical Science* 29(3):323–58. doi: 10.1214/14-STS480.

Imbens, Guido W., and Donald B. Rubin. 1997. “Bayesian Inference for Causal Effects in Randomized Experiments with Noncompliance.” *The Annals of Statistics* 25(1):305–27. doi: 10.1214/aos/1034276631.

- Kirk, David S. 2009. "A Natural Experiment on Residential Change and Recidivism: Lessons from Hurricane Katrina." *American Sociological Review* 74(3):484–505. doi: 10.1177/000312240907400308.
- Labrecque, Jeremy, and Sonja A. Swanson. 2018. "Understanding the Assumptions Underlying Instrumental Variable Analyses: A Brief Review of Falsification Strategies and Related Tools." *Current Epidemiology Reports* 5(3):214–20. doi: 10.1007/s40471-018-0152-1.
- Legewie, Joscha, and Thomas A. DiPrete. 2012. "School Context and the Gender Gap in Educational Achievement." *American Sociological Review* 77(3):463–85. doi: 10.1177/0003122412440802.
- Mellon, Jonathan. 2024. "Rain, Rain, Go Away: 194 Potential Exclusion-Restriction Violations for Studies Using Weather as an Instrumental Variable." *American Journal of Political Science* n/a(n/a). doi: 10.1111/ajps.12894.
- Robins, James M., and Sander Greenland. 1996. "Identification of Causal Effects Using Instrumental Variables: Comment." *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 91(434):456–58. doi: 10.2307/2291630.
- Sovey, Allison J., and Donald P. Green. 2011. "Instrumental Variables Estimation in Political Science: A Readers' Guide." *American Journal of Political Science* 55(1):188–200. doi: 10.1111/j.1540-5907.2010.00477.x.
- Swanson, Sonja A., and Miguel A. Hernán. 2013. "Commentary: How to Report Instrumental Variable Analyses (Suggestions Welcome)." *Epidemiology* 24(3):370. doi: 10.1097/EDE.0b013e31828d0590.
- Swanson, Sonja A., and Miguel A. Hernán. 2014. "Think Globally, Act Globally: An Epidemiologist's Perspective on Instrumental Variable Estimation." *Statistical Science* 29(3):371–74.
- Swanson, Sonja A., and Miguel A. Hernán. 2018. "The Challenging Interpretation of Instrumental Variable Estimates under Monotonicity." *International Journal of Epidemiology* 47(4):1289–97. doi: 10.1093/ije/dyx038.
- de Vaan, Mathijs, and Toby Stuart. 2019. "Does Intra-Household Contagion Cause an Increase in Prescription Opioid Use?" *American Sociological Review* 84(4):577–608. doi: 10.1177/0003122419857797.

4.2 Peeking through the window: regression discontinuity

Keywords: running variable, threshold, local effect, extrapolation, local randomization, continuity of potential outcomes, sorting, sharp rdd, fuzzy rdd

Required

Rauscher, Emily. 2016. "Does Educational Equality Increase Mobility? Exploiting Nineteenth-Century U.S. Compulsory Schooling Laws." *American Journal of Sociology* 121(6):1697–1761. doi: 10.1086/685443.

Skovron, Christopher, and Rocio Titiunik. 2015. "A Practical Guide to Regression Discontinuity Designs in Political Science.", Unpublished manuscript (*)

Suggested

- Aksoy, Ozan. 2016. "Regression Discontinuity Diagnostics Reveal Statistical Anomalies in Turkish Elections." *Electoral Studies* 44:284–92. doi: 10.1016/j.electstud.2016.09.005.
- Aksoy, Ozan, and Francesco C. Billari. 2018. "Political Islam, Marriage, and Fertility: Evidence from a Natural Experiment." *American Journal of Sociology* 123(5):1296–1340. doi: 10.1086/696193.
- Banks, James, and Fabrizio Mazzonna. 2012. "The Effect of Education on Old Age Cognitive Abilities: Evidence from a Regression Discontinuity Design." *The Economic Journal* 122(560):418–48. doi: 10.1111/j.1468-0297.2012.02499.x.
- Bertoli, Andrew, and Chad Hazlett. 2024. "Seeing Like a District: Understanding What Close-Election Designs for Leader Characteristics Can and Cannot Tell Us.", Unpublished manuscript
- Cattaneo, Matias D., Nicolás Idrobo, and Rocío Titiunik. 2020. *A Practical Introduction to Regression Discontinuity Designs: Foundations*. Cambridge University Press.
- Cattaneo, Matias D., and Rocío Titiunik. 2022. "Regression Discontinuity Designs." *Annual Review of Economics* 14(Volume 14, 2022):821–51. doi: 10.1146/annurev-economics-051520-021409.
- Cook, Thomas D. 2008. "'Waiting for Life to Arrive': A History of the Regression-Discontinuity Design in Psychology, Statistics and Economics." *Journal of Econometrics* 142(2):636–54. doi: 10.1016/j.jeconom.2007.05.002.
- De La Cuesta, Brandon, and Kosuke Imai. 2016. "Misunderstandings About the Regression Discontinuity Design in the Study of Close Elections." *Annual Review of Political Science* 19(1):375–96. doi: 10.1146/annurev-polisci-032015-010115.
- Eckles, Dean, Nikolaos Ignatiadis, Stefan Wager, and Han Wu. 2023. "Noise-Induced Randomization in Regression Discontinuity Designs."
- Eggers, Andrew C., Anthony Fowler, Jens Hainmueller, Andrew B. Hall, and James M. Snyder Jr. 2015. "On the Validity of the Regression Discontinuity Design for Estimating Electoral Effects: New Evidence from Over 40,000 Close Races." *American Journal of Political Science* 59(1):259–74. doi: 10.1111/ajps.12127.
- Gilraine, Michael. 2023. "Air Filters, Pollution, and Student Achievement." *Journal of Human Resources*. doi: 10.3368/jhr.0421-11642R2. (Then go and read [this](#) and [this](#))
- Hausman, Catherine, and David S. Rapson. 2018. "Regression Discontinuity in Time: Considerations for Empirical Applications." *Annual Review of Resource Economics* 10(Volume 10, 2018):533–52. doi: 10.1146/annurev-resource-121517-033306.
- Imbens, Guido W., and Thomas Lemieux. 2008. "Regression Discontinuity Designs: A Guide to Practice." *Journal of Econometrics* 142(2):615–35. doi: 10.1016/j.jeconom.2007.05.001.
- Lee, David S., and Thomas Lemieux. 2010. "Regression Discontinuity Designs in Economics." *Journal of Economic Literature* 48(2):281–355. doi: 10.1257/jel.48.2.281.
- Roman, Marcel, Klara Fredriksson, Chris Cassella, Derek Epp, and Hannah Walker. 2025. "The George Floyd Effect: How Protests and Public Scrutiny Changed Police Behavior.", Draft
- Sekhon, Jasjeet S., and Rocío Titiunik. 2012. "When Natural Experiments Are Neither Natural nor Experiments." *American Political Science Review* 106(1):35–57. doi: 10.1017/S0003055411000542.

5 Parallel trends and beyond

5.1 Canonical difference-in-differences

Keywords: parallel trends, two-way fixed effects, event study, absorbing treatment, heterogeneity, staggered adoption, negative weights, forbidden comparison

Required

Angrist, Joshua D., Jorn-steffen Pischke, and Jörn-steffen Pischke. 2009. Mostly Harmless Econometrics – An Empiricist’s Companion. Illustrated edition. Princeton: Princeton University Press, Chapter 5 (until section 5.2) (*)

Liu, Licheng, Ye Wang, and Yiqing Xu. 2024. “A Practical Guide to Counterfactual Estimators for Causal Inference with Time-Series Cross-Sectional Data.” *American Journal of Political Science* 68(1):160–76. doi: 10.1111/ajps.12723.

Torche, Florencia, and Catherine Sirois. 2019. “Restrictive Immigration Law and Birth Outcomes of Immigrant Women.” *American Journal of Epidemiology* 188(1):24–33. doi: 10.1093/aje/kwy218. (**)

Suggested

Card, David, and Alan Krueger. 1993. Minimum Wages and Employment: A Case Study of the Fast Food Industry in New Jersey and Pennsylvania. w4509. Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research. doi: 10.3386/w4509.

Card, David, and Alan B. Krueger. 2000. “Minimum Wages and Employment: A Case Study of the Fast-Food Industry in New Jersey and Pennsylvania: Reply.” *The American Economic Review* 90(5):1397–1420.

Dafoe, Allan. 2018. “Nonparametric Identification of Causal Effects under Temporal Dependence.” *Sociological Methods & Research* 47(2):136–68. doi: 10.1177/0049124115613784.

Donahue, Samuel Thomas, and Gerard Torrats-Espinosa. 2024. “From the Block to the Beat: How Violence in Officers’ Neighborhoods Influences Racially Biased Policing.” *American Journal of Sociology* 734296. doi: 10.1086/734296.

Imai, Kosuke, and In Song Kim. 2019. “When Should We Use Unit Fixed Effects Regression Models for Causal Inference with Longitudinal Data?” *American Journal of Political Science* 63(2):467–90. doi: 10.1111/ajps.12417.

Legewie, Joscha, and Jeffrey Fagan. 2019. “Aggressive Policing and the Educational Performance of Minority Youth.” *American Sociological Review* 84(2):220–47. doi: 10.1177/0003122419826020.

Roth, Jonathan, Pedro H. C. Sant’Anna, Alyssa Bilinski, and John Poe. 2023. “What’s Trending in Difference-in-Differences? A Synthesis of the Recent Econometrics Literature.” *Journal of Econometrics* 235(2):2218–44. doi: 10.1016/j.jeconom.2023.03.008.

Rüttenauer, Tobias, and Ozan Aksoy. 2024. “When Can We Use Two-Way Fixed-Effects (TWFE): A Comparison of TWFE and Novel Dynamic Difference-in-Differences Estimators.”

Tach, Laura, and Allison Dwyer Emory. 2017. "Public Housing Redevelopment, Neighborhood Change, and the Restructuring of Urban Inequality." *American Journal of Sociology* 123(3):686–739. doi: 10.1086/695468.

5.2 Same same but different: variations and extensions

Keywords: matrix completion, trajectory balancing, synthetic control

Abadie, Alberto. 2021. "Using Synthetic Controls: Feasibility, Data Requirements, and Methodological Aspects." *Journal of Economic Literature* 59(2):391–425. doi: 10.1257/jel.20191450.

Abadie, Alberto, Alexis Diamond, and Jens Hainmueller. 2010. "Synthetic Control Methods for Comparative Case Studies: Estimating the Effect of California's Tobacco Control Program." *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 105(490):493–505. doi: 10.1198/jasa.2009.ap08746.

Arkhangelsky, Dmitry, Susan Athey, David A. Hirshberg, Guido W. Imbens, and Stefan Wager. 2021. "Synthetic Difference-in-Differences." *American Economic Review* 111(12):4088–4118. doi: 10.1257/aer.20190159.

Hazlett, Chad, and Yiqing Xu. 2018. "Trajectory Balancing: A General Reweighting Approach to Causal Inference With Time-Series Cross-Sectional Data."

Shen, Dennis, Peng Ding, Jasjeet Sekhon, and Bin Yu. 2023. "Same Root Different Leaves: Time Series and Cross-Sectional Methods in Panel Data." *Econometrica* 91(6):2125–54. doi: 10.3982/ECTA21248.

6 It's mediation all the way down!

6.1 G-methods for SNMs and MSMs (and a bunch of other acronyms)

Blackwell, Matthew, and Adam N. Glynn. 2018. "How to Make Causal Inferences with Time-Series Cross-Sectional Data under Selection on Observables." *American Political Science Review* 112(4):1067–82. doi: 10.1017/S0003055418000357.

Lawrence, Matthew, and Richard Breen. 2016. "And Their Children after Them? The Effect of College on Educational Reproduction." *American Journal of Sociology* 122(2):532–72. doi: 10.1086/687592.

Naimi, Ashley I., Stephen R. Cole, and Edward H. Kennedy. 2017. "An Introduction to g Methods." *International Journal of Epidemiology* 46(2):756–62. doi: 10.1093/ije/dyw323.

Robins, James M., Miguel Ángel Hernán, and Babette Brumback. 2000. "Marginal Structural Models and Causal Inference in Epidemiology." *Epidemiology* 11(5):550–60. doi: 10.1097/00001648-200009000-00011.

Sato, Tosiya, and Yutaka Matsuyama. 2003. "Marginal Structural Models as a Tool for Standardization." *Epidemiology* 14(6):680–86. doi: 10.1097/01.EDE.0000081989.82616.7d.

Sharkey, Patrick, and Felix Elwert. 2011. "The Legacy of Disadvantage: Multigenerational Neighborhood Effects on Cognitive Ability." *American Journal of Sociology* 116(6):1934–81. doi: 10.1086/660009.

Wodtke, Geoffrey T., Felix Elwert, and David J. Harding. 2016. "Neighborhood Effect Heterogeneity by Family Income and Developmental Period." *American Journal of Sociology* 121(4):1168–1222. doi: 10.1086/684137.

Wodtke, Geoffrey T., David J. Harding, and Felix Elwert. 2011. "Neighborhood Effects in Temporal Perspective: The Impact of Long-Term Exposure to Concentrated Disadvantage on High School Graduation." *American Sociological Review* 76(5):713–36. doi: 10.1177/0003122411420816.

6.2 Friends don't let friends (pretend they don't) do mediation analysis

Baron, Reuben M., and David A. Kenny. n.d. "The Moderator-Mediator Variable Distinction in Social Psychological Research: Conceptual, Strategic, and Statistical Considerations."

Blackwell, Matthew, Ruofan Ma, and Aleksei Opacic. 2024. "Assumption Smuggling in Intermediate Outcome Tests of Causal Mechanisms."

Hong, Guanglei. 2015. *Causality in a Social World: Moderation, Mediation and Spill-Over*. 1st edition. Chichester, England: Wiley.

Imai, Kosuke, Luke Keele, and Dustin Tingley. 2010. "A General Approach to Causal Mediation Analysis." *Psychological Methods* 15(4):309–34. doi: 10.1037/a0020761.

Imai, Kosuke, Luke Keele, and Teppei Yamamoto. 2010. "Identification, Inference and Sensitivity Analysis for Causal Mediation Effects." *Statistical Science* 25(1):51–71. doi: 10.1214/10-STS321.

Robins, James M., and Sander Greenland. 1992. "Identifiability and Exchangeability for Direct and Indirect Effects." *Epidemiology* 3(2):143–55.

Robins, James M., Thomas S. Richardson, and Ilya Shpitser. 2022. "An Interventionist Approach to Mediation Analysis." Pp. 713–64 in *Probabilistic and Causal Inference: The Works of Judea Pearl*. Vol. 36. New York, NY, USA: Association for Computing Machinery.

VanderWeele, Tyler. 2015. *Explanation in Causal Inference: Methods for Mediation and Interaction*. Oxford New York, NY: OUP USA.

Wang, Aolin, and Onyebuchi A. Arah. 2015. "G-Computation Demonstration in Causal Mediation Analysis." *European Journal of Epidemiology* 30(10):1119–27. doi: 10.1007/s10654-015-0100-z.

Wodtke, Geoffrey T., Ugur Yildirim, David J. Harding, and Felix Elwert. 2023. "Are Neighborhood Effects Explained by Differences in School Quality?" *American Journal of Sociology* 128(5):1472–1528. doi: 10.1086/724279.

Zhou, Xiang, and Guanghui Pan. 2023. "Higher Education and the Black-White Earnings Gap." *American Sociological Review* 88(1):154–88. doi: 10.1177/00031224221141887.

7 No catchy name for this one (I'm sorry!)

7.1 Disparities and decompositions

An, Weihua, and Adam N. Glynn. 2021. "Treatment Effect Deviation as an Alternative to Blinder–Oaxaca Decomposition for Studying Social Inequality." *Sociological Methods & Research* 50(3):1006–33. doi: 10.1177/0049124119852387.

Kratz, Fabian. 2024. "Mediation and Decomposition Analysis: Why We Cannot Do What We Think We Can Do, and How Causal Mediation Analysis Can Help Us."

Lundberg, Ian. 2024. "The Gap-Closing Estimand: A Causal Approach to Study Interventions That Close Disparities Across Social Categories." *Sociological Methods & Research* 53(2):507–70. doi: 10.1177/00491241211055769.

Yu, Ang, and Felix Elwert. 2024. "Nonparametric Causal Decomposition of Group Disparities."

7.2 Blocking backdoors (on steroids): machine learning

Athey, Susan, and Guido W. Imbens. 2019. "Machine Learning Methods That Economists Should Know About." *Annual Review of Economics* 11(Volume 11, 2019):685–725. doi: 10.1146/annurev-economics-080217-053433.

Brand, Jennie E., Xiang Zhou, and Yu Xie. 2023. "Recent Developments in Causal Inference and Machine Learning." *Annual Review of Sociology* 49(Volume 49, 2023):81–110. doi: 10.1146/annurev-soc-030420-015345.

Hoffmann, Nathan I. 2023. "Double Robust, Flexible Adjustment Methods for Causal Inference: An Overview and an Evaluation."

Koch, Bernard J., Tim Sainburg, Pablo Geraldo Bastías, Song Jiang, Yizhou Sun, and Jacob G. Foster. 2024. "A Primer on Deep Learning for Causal Inference." *Sociological Methods & Research* 00491241241234866. doi: 10.1177/00491241241234866.

Lundberg, Ian, Jennie E. Brand, and Nanum Jeon. 2022. "Researcher Reasoning Meets Computational Capacity: Machine Learning for Social Science." *Social Science Research* 108:102807. doi: 10.1016/j.ssresearch.2022.102807.

8 All of this for nothing?

8.1 What about [*insert alternative explanation*]? Sensitivity analysis

Altonji, Joseph G., Todd E. Elder, and Christopher R. Taber. 2005. "Selection on Observed and Unobserved Variables: Assessing the Effectiveness of Catholic Schools." *Journal of Political Economy* 113(1):151–84. doi: 10.1086/426036.

Chernozhukov, Victor, Carlos Cinelli, Whitney Newey, Amit Sharma, and Vasilis Syrgkanis. 2024. “Long Story Short: Omitted Variable Bias in Causal Machine Learning.”

Cinelli, Carlos, and Chad Hazlett. 2020. “Making Sense of Sensitivity: Extending Omitted Variable Bias.” *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society Series B: Statistical Methodology* 82(1):39–67. doi: 10.1111/rssb.12348.

Huang, Melody, and Samuel D. Pimentel. 2024. “Variance-Based Sensitivity Analysis for Weighting Estimators Results in More Informative Bounds.” *Biometrika* asae040. doi: 10.1093/biomet/asae040.

Masten, Matthew A., and Alexandre Poirier. 2024. “The Effect of Omitted Variables on the Sign of Regression Coefficients.”

Oster, Emily. 2019. “Unobservable Selection and Coefficient Stability: Theory and Evidence.” *Journal of Business & Economic Statistics* 37(2):187–204. doi: 10.1080/07350015.2016.1227711.

Rosenbaum, Paul R. 2002. “Sensitivity to Hidden Bias.” Pp. 105–70 in *Observational Studies*, edited by P. R. Rosenbaum. New York, NY: Springer.

VanderWeele, Tyler J., and Onyebuchi A. Arah. 2011. “Bias Formulas for Sensitivity Analysis of Unmeasured Confounding for General Outcomes, Treatments, and Confounders.” *Epidemiology* 22(1):42–52.

8.2 What about [*insert alternative population*]? Generalization and transportability

Aronow, Peter M., and Cyrus Samii. 2016. “Does Regression Produce Representative Estimates of Causal Effects?” *American Journal of Political Science* 60(1):250–67. doi: 10.1111/ajps.12185.

Bareinboim, Elias, and Judea Pearl. 2016. “Causal Inference and the Data-Fusion Problem.” *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 113(27):7345–52. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1510507113.

Egami, Naoki, and Erin Hartman. 2021. “Covariate Selection for Generalizing Experimental Results: Application to a Large-Scale Development Program in Uganda.” *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society Series A: Statistics in Society* 184(4):1524–48. doi: 10.1111/rssa.12734.

Egami, Naoki, and Erin Hartman. 2023. “Elements of External Validity: Framework, Design, and Analysis.” *American Political Science Review* 117(3):1070–88. doi: 10.1017/S0003055422000880.

Huang, Melody, Naoki Egami, Erin Hartman, and Luke Miratrix. 2023. “Leveraging Population Outcomes to Improve the Generalization of Experimental Results: Application to the JTPA Study.” *The Annals of Applied Statistics* 17(3):2139–64. doi: 10.1214/22-AOAS1712.

Tipton, Elizabeth, and Erin Hartman. 2023. “Generalizability and Transportability.” in *Handbook of Matching and Weighting Adjustments for Causal Inference*. Chapman and Hall/CRC.