Main finding in abstract (or title)?

Coding instructions

# Background

We want to ask researchers to evaluate the replication value of a finding based on reading the abstract of the paper in which that finding was reported, plus seeing some information about different quantitative indicators. Our research question is whether the quantitative indicators will have any predictive value once researchers are given contextual information about the design and purpose of the study.

Before we can design a study to investigate this, we need to make sure that the abstract actually summarizes the findings of the paper, which we consider a key piece of information for evaluating replication value. If the abstract does not contain a summary of the findings we will need to extract a summary from elsewhere in the paper.

# Coding instructions

In the column “finding\_in\_abstract” we want to take note on whether the main findings could be found in the title and abstract of a paper.

In “dataset\_B\_main-finding\_coded\_PederMI.tsv” you will find my encoding for the first 10 paper of the dataset. You can also see what I interpreted as the main finding in “main\_finding\_short” and “main\_finding\_long”. Before looking at my data, try coding the first 10 papers yourself. This should give you a better feel for whether we have the same intuitions about what the main findings are in these papers. If we don’t agree, don’t worry. Part of the goal is figuring out if this is an appropriate task to assign to student assistants in the first place.

To verify that the abstract contains a sufficient summary of the main findings, compare against the summary in the first part of the (general) discussion section of each paper. The main findings of the paper are almost always summarized here. If not, look for a summary in the conclusion section (or final paragraph of discussion section).

*Code=1*, if the main findings are summarized in the title or abstract. *Code=0*, if the main findings could not be found summarized in these sections. Note that even if you still had to confirm which findings are the main findings by looking up a different section, but then after confirmation you find that the main findings have been stated in the title or abstract already, it should be coded as 1 (found in abstract).