Seminar Report: Chordy

Pedro Garcia Mota, Pau Espin Pedrol

June 7, 2013

1 Introduction

Introduce in a couple of sentences the seminar and the main topic related to distributed systems it covers.

The aim of this seminar is to implement a distributed hash table structure. Once we have a growing ring we will introduce a store where key-value pairs can be added.

2 Work done

Present the new code that you have added or how you have implemented a required functionality by using small Erlang code snippets (you do not need to copy&paste all the code).

2.1 node1.erl

```
-module(node1).
-\mathbf{export}([\mathbf{start}/1, \mathbf{start}/2, \mathbf{init}/2, \mathbf{node}/3, \mathbf{notify}/3, \mathbf{request}/2,
    stabilize /3]).
-define (Stabilize, 2000).
-define (Timeout, 5000).
start (MyKey) ->
     start (MyKey, nil).
start(MyKey, PeerPid) ->
  timer:start(),
  spawn(fun() -> init(MyKey, PeerPid) end).
init (MyKey, PeerPid) ->
  Predecessor = nil,
  {ok, Successor} = connect(MyKey, PeerPid),
  schedule_stabilize(),
  node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor).
connect (MyKey, nil) ->
  \{ok, \{MyKey, self()\}\};
```

```
connect(_, PeerPid) ->
  Qref = make_ref(),
  PeerPid ! {key, Qref, self()},
  receive
    {Qref, Skey} \rightarrow
      {ok, {Skey, PeerPid}}}
  after ?Timeout ->
    io:format("Timeout: _no_response_from_~w~n", [PeerPid])
  end.
node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor) ->
  receive
    {key, Qref, PeerPid} ->
      PeerPid! {Qref, MyKey},
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor);
    \{ \text{notify }, \text{New} \} \rightarrow
      Pred = notify (New, MyKey, Predecessor),
      node(MyKey, Pred, Successor);
    {request, Peer} ->
      request (Peer, Predecessor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor);
    {status, Pred} ->
      Succ = stabilize (Pred, MyKey, Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Succ);
    stabilize ->
      stabilize (Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor);
    probe ->
      create_probe (MyKey, Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor);
    {probe, MyKey, Nodes, T} ->
      remove_probe (MyKey, Nodes, T),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor);
    \{\text{probe}, \text{RefKey}, \text{Nodes}, T\} \rightarrow
      forward_probe(RefKey, [MyKey|Nodes], T, Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor)
  end.
notify ({Nkey, Npid}, MyKey, Predecessor) ->
  case Predecessor of
    nil ->
      {Nkey, Npid};
    \{Pkey, _{-}\} \rightarrow
      case key: between (Nkey, Pkey, MyKey) of
         true ->
           {Nkey, Npid};
         false ->
           Predecessor
```

```
end
  end.
request (Peer, Predecessor) ->
  case Predecessor of
    nil ->
      Peer ! {status, nil};
    \{Pkey, Ppid\} \rightarrow
      Peer ! {status, {Pkey, Ppid}}}
  end.
stabilize (Pred, MyKey, Successor) ->
  {Skey, Spid} = Successor,
  case Pred of
    nil ->
      Spid ! {notify, {MyKey, self()}},
      Successor;
    \{MyKey, _{-}\} \rightarrow
      Successor;
    \{Skey, _{-}\} \rightarrow
      Spid ! {notify, {MyKey, self()}},
      Successor;
    \{Xkey, Xpid\} \rightarrow
      case key: between (Xkey, MyKey, Skey) of
        true ->
           self() ! stabilize ,
           {Xkey, Xpid};
         false ->
           Spid ! {notify, {MyKey, self()}},
           Successor
  end
end.
stabilize ({_, Spid}) ->
  Spid ! {request, self()}.
create_probe(MyKey, {_, Spid}) ->
  Spid ! {probe, MyKey, [MyKey], erlang:now()},
  io:format("Create_probe_~w!~n", [MyKey]).
remove_probe(MyKey, Nodes, T) ->
  Time = timer : now_diff(erlang : now(), T),
  io:format("Received_probe_~w_in_~w_ms_Ring:_~w~n", [MyKey, Time,
     Nodes]).
forward_probe(RefKey, Nodes, T, {_, Spid}) ->
  Spid! {probe, RefKey, Nodes, T},
  io:format("Forward_probe_~w!~n", [RefKey]).
```

```
schedule_stabilize() ->
  timer: send_interval(? Stabilize, self(), stabilize).
2.2
     node2.erl
-module(node2).
-export([start/1, start/2, init/2, node/4, notify/4, request/2,
    stabilize /3]).
-define (Stabilize, 2000).
-define (Timeout, 5000).
start (MyKey) ->
     start (MyKey, nil).
start(MyKey, PeerPid) ->
  timer:start(),
  spawn(fun() -> init(MyKey, PeerPid) end).
init (MyKey, PeerPid) ->
  Predecessor = nil,
  {ok, Successor} = connect(MyKey, PeerPid),
  schedule_stabilize(),
  node (MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, []).
connect (MyKey, nil) ->
  {ok, {MyKey, self()}};
connect (_, PeerPid) ->
  Qref = make_ref(),
  PeerPid ! {key, Qref, self()},
  receive
     {\operatorname{Qref}, \operatorname{Skey}} \rightarrow
       \{ok, \{Skey, PeerPid\}\}
  after ?Timeout ->
     io:format("Timeout: _no_response_from_~w~n", [PeerPid])
  end.
node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Store) ->
  receive
     {key, Qref, PeerPid} ->
       PeerPid! {Qref, MyKey},
       node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Store);
     \{ \text{notify }, \text{New} \} \rightarrow
       \{ \operatorname{Pred}, \operatorname{St} \} = \operatorname{notify}(\operatorname{New}, \operatorname{MyKey}, \operatorname{Predecessor}, \operatorname{Store}),
       node(MyKey, Pred, Successor, St);
     {request, Peer} ->
       request (Peer, Predecessor),
       node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Store);
     {status, Pred} ->
```

```
Succ = stabilize (Pred, MyKey, Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Succ, Store);
    stabilize ->
      stabilize (Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Store);
    {add, Key, Value, Qref, Client} ->
      Added = add(Key, Value, Qref, Client, MyKey, Predecessor,
         Successor, Store),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Added);
    {lookup, Key, Qref, Client} ->
      lookup (Key, Qref, Client, MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Store
         ),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Store);
    {handover, Elements} ->
      Merged = storage: merge (Store, Elements),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Merged);
    probe ->
      create_probe (MyKey, Store, Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Store);
    \{\text{probe}, \text{MyKey}, \text{Nodes}, T\} \rightarrow
      remove_probe (MyKey, Store, Nodes, T),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Store);
    {probe, RefKey, Nodes, T} ->
      forward_probe(RefKey, [MyKey|Nodes], Store, T, Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Store)
  end.
add(Key, Value, Qref, Client, MyKey, {Pkey, _}, {_, Spid}, Store) ->
  case key: between (Key, Pkey, MyKey) of
    true ->
      Added = storage:add(Key, Value, Store),
      Client! {Qref, ok},
      Added;
    false ->
      Spid! {add, Key, Value, Qref, Client},
      Store
  end.
lookup(Key, Qref, Client, MyKey, \{Pkey, \_\}, \{\_, Spid\}, Store) \rightarrow
  case key: between (Key, Pkey, MyKey) of
      Result = storage:lookup(Key, Store),
      Client ! {Qref, Result};
    false ->
      Spid! {lookup, Key, Qref, Client}
  end.
notify ({Nkey, Npid}, MyKey, Predecessor, Store) ->
```

```
case Predecessor of
    nil ->
       Keep = handover(Store, MyKey, Nkey, Npid),
       \{\{Nkey, Npid\}, Keep\};
    \{Pkey, _{-}\} \rightarrow
       case key: between (Nkey, Pkey, MyKey) of
         true ->
           Keep = handover(Store, MyKey, Nkey, Npid),
           {{Nkey, Npid}, Keep};
         false ->
           {Predecessor, Store}
      end
  end.
handover (Store, MyKey, Nkey, Npid) ->
  {Keep, Leave} = storage:split(MyKey, Nkey, Store),
  Npid! {handover, Leave},
  Keep.
request (Peer, Predecessor) ->
  case Predecessor of
    nil ->
       Peer ! {status, nil};
    {Pkey, Ppid} \rightarrow
       Peer ! {status, {Pkey, Ppid}}}
  end.
stabilize (Pred, MyKey, Successor) ->
  {Skey, Spid} = Successor,
  case Pred of
    nil ->
       Spid ! {notify, {MyKey, self()}},
       Successor;
    \{MyKey, _{-}\} \rightarrow
       Successor;
    \{Skey, _{-}\} \rightarrow
       Spid ! \{\text{notify}, \{\text{MyKey}, self()\}\},\
       Successor;
    \{Xkey, Xpid\} \rightarrow
       case key: between (Xkey, MyKey, Skey) of
         true ->
           self() ! stabilize ,
           {Xkey, Xpid};
         false ->
           Spid ! {notify, {MyKey, self()}},
           Successor
  end
end.
```

```
stabilize(\{ , Spid \}) \rightarrow
  Spid ! {request, self()}.
create_probe(MyKey, Store, {_, Spid}) ->
  Spid ! {probe, MyKey, [MyKey], erlang:now()},
  io:format("Create_probe_~w!_Store_~w~n", [MyKey, Store]).
remove_probe(MyKey, Store, Nodes, T) ->
  Time = timer: now_diff(erlang:now(), T),
  io:format("Received_probe_~w_in_~w_ms_Ring:_~w_Store_~w~n", [MyKey
      , Time, Nodes, Store).
forward_probe(RefKey, Nodes, Store, T, {_, Spid}) ->
  Spid ! {probe, RefKey, Nodes, T},
  io:format("Forward_probe_~w!_Store_~w~n", [RefKey, Store]).
schedule_stabilize() ->
  timer: send_interval(? Stabilize, self(), stabilize).
2.3
    node3.erl
  -module(node3).
-\mathbf{export}([\mathbf{start}/1, \mathbf{start}/2, \mathbf{stop}/0, \mathbf{init}/2, \mathbf{node}/5, \mathbf{notify}/4, \mathbf{request})
    /3, stabilize /4, monit /1]).
-define (Stabilize, 2000).
-define (Timeout, 5000).
start (MyKey) ->
     start (MyKey, nil).
start (MyKey, PeerPid) ->
  timer:start(),
  spawn(fun() -> init(MyKey, PeerPid) end).
stop() ->
  \mathbf{exit}(\mathbf{self}()).
init (MyKey, PeerPid) ->
  Predecessor = nil,
  {ok, Successor} = connect(MyKey, PeerPid),
  schedule_stabilize(),
  node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, nil, []).
connect (MyKey, nil) ->
  \{ok, \{MyKey, nil, self()\}\};
connect (_, PeerPid) ->
  Qref = make_ref(),
  PeerPid ! \{\text{key}, \text{Qref}, \text{self}()\},
```

```
receive
    {Qref, Skey} \rightarrow
      MonitorRef = monit(PeerPid),
      {ok, {Skey, MonitorRef, PeerPid}}
  after ?Timeout ->
    io:format("Timeout: _no_response_from_~w~n", [PeerPid])
  end.
node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Next, Store) ->
  receive
    {key, Qref, PeerPid} ->
      PeerPid! {Qref, MyKey},
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Next, Store);
    \{ \text{notify }, \text{New} \} \rightarrow
      {Pred, St} = notify (New, MyKey, Predecessor, Store),
      node (MyKey, Pred, Successor, Next, St);
    {request, Peer} ->
      request (Peer, Predecessor, Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Next, Store);
    \{ status, Pred, Nx \} \rightarrow
      {Succ, Nxt} = stabilize(Pred, Nx, MyKey, Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Succ, Nxt, Store);
    stabilize ->
      stabilize (Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Next, Store);
    {add, Key, Value, Qref, Client} ->
      Added = add(Key, Value, Qref, Client, MyKey, Predecessor,
          Successor, Store),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Next, Added);
    {lookup, Key, Qref, Client} ->
      lookup (Key, Qref, Client, MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Store
          ),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Next, Store);
    {handover, Elements} ->
      Merged = storage:merge(Store, Elements),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Next, Merged);
    { 'DOWN', Ref, process, _, _} ->
      {Pred, Succ, Nxt} = down(Ref, Predecessor, Successor, Next),
      node(MyKey, Pred, Succ, Nxt, Store);
    probe ->
      create_probe (MyKey, Store, Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Next, Store);
    \{\text{probe}, \text{MyKey}, \text{Nodes}, T\} \rightarrow
      {\tt remove\_probe}\,(MyKey,\ Store\ ,\ Nodes\ ,\ T)\ ,
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Next, Store);
    \{\text{probe}, \text{RefKey}, \text{Nodes}, T\} \rightarrow
      forward_probe(RefKey, [MyKey|Nodes], Store, T, Successor),
      node(MyKey, Predecessor, Successor, Next, Store);
    stop \rightarrow
```

```
stop()
  end.
add(Key, Value, Qref, Client, MyKey, {Pkey, _, _}, {_, _, Spid},
   Store) ->
  case key: between (Key, Pkey, MyKey) of
    true ->
      Added = storage:add(Key, Value, Store),
      Client ! {Qref, ok},
      Added;
    false ->
      Spid! {add, Key, Value, Qref, Client},
      Store
  end.
lookup (Key, Qref, Client, MyKey, {Pkey, _, _}, {_, _, Spid}, Store)
  ->
  case key: between (Key , Pkey , MyKey) of
    true ->
      Result = storage:lookup(Key, Store),
      Client ! {Qref, Result};
    false ->
      Spid! {lookup, Key, Qref, Client}
  end.
notify({Nkey, _, Npid}, MyKey, Predecessor, Store) ->
  case Predecessor of
    nil ->
      Nref = monit(Npid),
      Keep = handover(Store, MyKey, Nkey, Npid),
      {{Nkey, Nref, Npid}, Keep};
    \{Pkey, Pref, _\} \rightarrow
      case key: between (Nkey, Pkey, MyKey) of
        true ->
          demonit (Pref),
          Nref = monit(Npid),
          Keep = handover (Store, MyKey, Nkey, Npid),
          {{Nkey, Nref, Npid}, Keep};
        false ->
          monit (Npid),
          {Predecessor, Store}
      end
  end.
handover (Store, MyKey, Nkey, Npid) ->
  {Keep, Leave} = storage:split(MyKey, Nkey, Store),
  Npid! {handover, Leave},
  Keep.
```

```
request (Peer, Predecessor, {Skey, Sref, Spid}) ->
  case Predecessor of
    nil \rightarrow
       Peer ! {status, nil, {Skey, Sref, Spid}};
    {Pkey, Pref, Ppid} ->
       Peer ! {status, {Pkey, Pref, Ppid}, {Skey, Sref, Spid}}
  end.
stabilize (Pred, Nx, MyKey, Successor) -> %monitor
  {Skey, Sref, Spid} = Successor,
  case Pred of
    nil ->
       Spid ! \{\text{notify}, \{\text{MyKey}, \mathbf{nil}, \mathbf{self}()\}\},\
       {Successor, Nx};
    \{MyKey, -, -\} \rightarrow
       {Successor, Nx};
    \{Skey, \_, \_\} \rightarrow
       Spid ! {notify, {MyKey, nil, self()}},
       {Successor, Nx};
    \{Xkey, \_, Xpid\} \longrightarrow
       case key: between (Xkey, MyKey, Skey) of
         true ->
           Xref = monit(Xpid),
           demonit (Sref),
           self() ! stabilize ,
           {{Xkey, Xref, Xpid}, Successor};
         false ->
           Spid ! {notify, {MyKey, nil, self()}},
           {Successor, Nx}
  end
end.
stabilize(\{ , , , Spid \}) \rightarrow
  \%io: format("168 Spid ~w~n", [Spid]),
  Spid ! {request, self()}.
monit (Pid) ->
  erlang: monitor (process, Pid).
demonit (nil) ->
  ok;
demonit (MonitorRef) ->
  erlang: demonitor (MonitorRef, [flush]).
down(Ref, \{ \_, Ref, \_ \}, Successor, Next) \rightarrow
  {nil, Successor, Next};
```

```
down(Ref, Predecessor, {_, Ref, _}, {Nkey, _, Npid}) ->
  self() ! stabilize ,
  Nref = monit(Npid),
  {Predecessor, {Nkey, Nref, Npid}, nil}.
create_probe(MyKey, Store, {_, _, Spid}) ->
  Spid ! {probe, MyKey, [MyKey], erlang:now()},
  io:format("Create_probe_~w!_Store_~w~n", [MyKey, Store]).
remove_probe(MyKey, Store, Nodes, T) ->
  Time = timer: now_diff(erlang:now(), T),
  io:format("Received_probe_~w_in_~w_ms_Ring:_~w_Store_~w~n", [MyKey
     , Time, Nodes, Store]).
forward_probe(RefKey, Nodes, Store, T, {_, _, Spid}) ->
  Spid! {probe, RefKey, Nodes, T},
  io:format("Forward_probe_~w!_Store_~w~n", [RefKey, Store]).
schedule_stabilize() ->
  timer: send_interval(? Stabilize, self(), stabilize).
```

3 Experiments

• Do some small experiments, to start with in one Erlang machine but then in a network or machines. When connecting nodes on different platforms remember to start Erlang in distributed mode (giving a name argument) and make sure that you use the same cookie (-setcookie)

```
Create probe 1!
Forward probe 1!
Forward probe 1!
Received probe 1 in 97 ms Ring: [3,2,1]
probe
5> Pid2 ! probe.
Create probe 2!
Forward probe 2!
Forward probe 2!
Received probe 2 in 95 ms Ring: [1,3,2]
probe
6> Pid3 ! probe.
Create probe 3!
Forward probe 3!
Forward probe 3!
Received probe 3 in 125 ms Ring: [2,1,3]
probe
```

Stabilized vanilla version with 3 nodes and no stores.

• If we now have a distributed store that can handle new nodes that are added to the ring we might try some performance testing. You need several machines to do this. Assume that we have eight machines and that we will use four in building the ring and four in testing the performance.

```
1> N1 = node2:start(1).
                                pid ! {notify, {MyKey, self()}
<0.35.0>
2> P = chordy:connect(N1).
<0.37.0>
3> P ! {add, 0, 0}.
{add,0,0}
[Add] Key added correctly
4> P ! {add, 1, 1}.
[Add] Key added correctly
{add,1,1}reate_probe(MyKey, Store, {_, Spid}) -> 5> P ! {add, 2,12}! {probe, MyKey, [MyKey], erlang:now()},
[Add] Key added correctly reate probe w! Store wwn". [MvKev.
{add,2,2}
6> N1 ! probe probe (MyKey, Store, Nodes, T) ->
6> .
Create probe 1! store [{2,2},{1,1},{0,0}] ang:now(), T)
Received probe 1 in 89 ms Ring: [1] StoreA [{2,2},{1,1},{0,0}]
probe
7> N0 = node2:start(0, N1); Key, Nodes, Store, T, { , Spid} ->
                  ! {probe, RefKey, Nodes, T},
<0.43.0>
8> N1 ! probe: format("Forward probe ~w! Store ~w~n", [RefKey,
Create probe 1! store [{1,1}]
Forward probe 1! Store [{2,2},{0,0}]
Received probe 1 in 175 ms Ring: [0,1] Store [{1,1}]
probe
```

As a first test, we have one node only in the ring and let the four test machines add a number (e.g., 1000) of random elements (key-value pairs) to the ring and then do a lookup of the elements, measuring the time it takes. You can use the test procedure given in 'Appendix A', which should be given with the name of the node to contact.

```
Eshell V5.10.1 (abort with ^G)

1> N1 = node2:start(1).

<0.35.0>

2> P = chordy:connect(N1).

<0.37.0>

3> chordy:test(N1, 1000).

Answers received. Making lookups...

Lookups done. Waiting for values...

Values received. Checking correctness...

Everything correct!

Elapsed Time: 46.763 ms
ok
```

How does the performance change if we add another node to the ring? Add two more nodes to the ring, any changes? Does it matter if all demonit erlang test machines access the same node or different nodes?

```
Eshell V5.10.1
               (abort with ^G)
1> N1 = node2:start(1).
<0.35.0>
2> P = chordy:connect(N1).
<0.37.0>
3> N2 = node2:start(2,N1).
<0.39.0>
4> chordy:test(N1, 1000) -> waitAdds(
Requests done. Waiting for answers...
Answers received. Making lookups...
Lookups done. Waiting for values...
Values received. Checking correctness...
Everything correct!
Elapsed Time: 51.24 ms
ok
5>
```

```
Eshell V5.10.1
                (abort with ^G)
1> N1 = node2:start(1).
<0.35.0>
2> P = chordy:connect(N1).
<0.37.0>
3> N2 = node2:start(2,N1).
<0.39.0>
4> N3 = node2:start(3,N1).
<0.41.0>
5> N4 = node2:start(4,N1).
<0.43.0>
6> chordy:test(N1, 1000).
Requests done. Waiting for answers...
Answers received. Making lookups...
Lookups done. Waiting for values...
Values received. Checking correctness...
Everything correct!
Elapsed Time: 45.818 ms
ok
7>
```

• Do some experiments to evaluate the behavior of your implementation when nodes can fail.

```
1> N2 = node3:start(2).
<0.35.0>
2> P = chordy:connect(N2).
<0.37.0>
3> P ! {add,0,0}.
{add,0,0}
[Add] Key added correctly
4> P ! {add,1,1}.
[Add] Key added correctly
{add, 1, 1}
5> P ! {add,2,2}.
[Add] Key added correctly
{add,2,2}
6> N0 = node3:start(0,N2).
<0.42.0>
7> N1 = node3:start(1,N2).
<0.44.0>
8> N2 ! probe
8> .
Create probe 2! Store [{2,2}]
Forward probe 2! Store [{0,0}]
Forward probe 2! Store [{1,1}]
Received probe 2 in 155 ms Ring: [1,0,2] Store [{2,2}]
probe
9> NØ ! stop.
71 ref #Ref<0.0.0.67> Predecessor {1, #Ref<0.0.0.77>,<0.44.0>} Successo
71 ref #Ref<0.0.0.79> Predecessor {0, #Ref<0.0.0.79>,<0.42.0>} Successo
stop
10> N2 ! probe
10> .
Create probe 2! Store [{2,2}]
Forward probe 2! Store [{1,1}]
Received probe 2 in 168 ms Ring: [1,2] Store [{2,2}]
probe
11>
```

4 Open questions

• Open Questions. What are the pros and cons of a more frequent stabilizing procedure?

The more frequent de stabilizing procedures are done, the more robust the distributed system will be. On the other hand, frequent stabilizing procedures causes a big overhead

on the sytem because additional messages are sent all the time.

• Do we have to inform the new node about our decision? How will it know if we have discarded its friendly proposal?

The new node will probably have less information than us, so we have to point him to the right direction in order for it to find its proper successor. As we know more stuff than it, for example, we know our own successor, we can know better than him where can it continue looking for its successor.

• What would happen if we didn't schedule the stabilize procedure? Would things still work?

Not at all, cause nodes already in which will be the predecessor of new entering nodes wouldn't be aware of those new nodes entries and shouldn't update their information, so the ring would become malformed.

• Open Questions. What will happen if a node is falsely detected of being dead (e.g. it has only been temporally unavailable)?

It would be discarded and the ring would be temporally change till the apparently dead node would become available again, moment at which the ring would return to its initial topology.

5 Personal Opinion

Your personal opinion of the seminar, including whether it should be included in next year's course or no .

The seminar should be included in the next course as it expands the concepts of name servers and gives the opportunity to implement a naming distributed system similar to DNS, having a better idea of how these systems are implemented.