

FORECASTING

STAT0010

Alexandros Beskos

a.beskos@ucl.ac.uk

'Lecture 9' Outline

- 1 Forecasting ARMA
 - example: $ARMA(1, 1)$
- 2 Forecasting non-stationary (ARIMA) models
 - example: $ARIMA(0, 1, 1)$
 - example: $ARIMA(1, 1, 0)$
- 3 Measuring forecast performance
 - measures of deviation
 - example: share dealing
 - logarithmic scoring rule

From last week...

Corollary 1

Any stationary **ARMA** process $\{Y_t\}$, can be written as

$$Y_t - \mu = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{t-j}.$$

Corollary 2

Let $\{Y_t\}$ be an invertible **ARMA** process. Then,

$$\mathbb{E}(\epsilon_{T+j} | Y_{1:T}) = \begin{cases} \epsilon_{T+j}, & j \leq 0 \\ 0, & j > 0 \end{cases}$$

Corollary 3

Let $\{Y_t\}$ be a stationary and invertible **ARMA** process. Then,

$$\hat{Y}_{T+h} = \mu + \sum_{j=h}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{T+h-j}, \quad e_T(h) = \sum_{j=0}^{h-1} \psi_j \epsilon_{T+h-j}.$$

Corollary 4

Let Y_t be a stationary and invertible $ARMA(p, q)$ process and let the coefficients $\{\psi_j\}$ be defined as above. Then the h -step ahead forecast error, with origin T , satisfies:

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbb{E}(e_T(h)) &= 0, \\ \text{var}(e_T(h)) &= \sigma^2 \sum_{j=0}^{h-1} \psi_j^2.\end{aligned}$$

Example 5

Let $\{Y_t\}$ be a stationary, invertible $ARMA(1, 1)$ process with mean $\mathbb{E}(Y_t) = \mu$. Find:

- ① \hat{Y}_{T+h} [h -step ahead forecast with origin T]
- ② $e_T(h)$ [h -step ahead forecast error]
- ③ $\mathbb{E}(e_T(h))$ [mean h -step ahead forecast error]
- ④ $\text{var}(e_T(h))$ [variance of h -step ahead forecast error]

1 \hat{Y}_{T+h} :

$$ARMA(1, 1): \quad Y_t = \mu + \phi_1(Y_{t-1} - \mu) + \epsilon_t - \theta_1\epsilon_{t-1}.$$

i.e.

$$Y_{T+h} = \mu + \phi_1(Y_{T+h-1} - \mu) + \epsilon_{T+h} - \theta_1\epsilon_{T+h-1}.$$

Forecast is:

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{Y}_{T+h} &= \mathbb{E}(Y_{T+h} | Y_{1:T}) \\ &= \mathbb{E}(\mu + \phi_1(Y_{T+h-1} - \mu) + \epsilon_{T+h} - \theta_1\epsilon_{T+h-1} | Y_{1:T}) \\ &= \mu + \phi_1(\hat{Y}_{T+h-1} - \mu) + \cancel{\mathbb{E}(\epsilon_{T+h} | Y_{1:T})} - \theta_1\mathbb{E}(\epsilon_{T+h-1} | Y_{1:T}) \end{aligned}$$

$0, [h > 0]$

Now, [from Corollary 2]

$$\mathbb{E}(\epsilon_{T+h-1} | Y_{1:T}) = \begin{cases} \epsilon_T, & h = 1 \\ 0, & h > 1 \end{cases}$$

Hence, (noting $\hat{Y}_T = Y_T$) we have:

$$\hat{Y}_{T+h} = \begin{cases} \mu + \phi_1(Y_T - \mu) - \theta_1\epsilon_T, & h = 1 \\ \mu + \phi_1(\hat{Y}_{T+h-1} - \mu), & h > 1 \end{cases}$$

Hence, answer to part 1 is:

$$\hat{Y}_{T+h} = \begin{cases} \mu + \phi_1(Y_T - \mu) - \theta_1\epsilon_T, & h = 1 \\ \mu + \phi_1(\hat{Y}_{T+h-1} - \mu), & h > 1 \end{cases} \quad \blacksquare$$

However, in this particular case, we can go further. Note

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{Y}_{T+2} &= \mu + \phi_1(\hat{Y}_{T+1} - \mu) \\ &= \mu + \phi_1(\mu + \phi_1(Y_T - \mu) - \theta_1\epsilon_T - \mu) \\ &= \mu + \phi_1^2(Y_T - \mu) - \phi_1\theta_1\epsilon_T. \end{aligned}$$

Similarly:

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{Y}_{T+3} &= \mu + \phi_1(\hat{Y}_{T+2} - \mu) \\ &= \mu + \phi_1(\mu + \phi_1^2(Y_T - \mu) - \phi_1\theta_1\epsilon_T - \mu) \\ &= \mu + \phi_1^3(Y_T - \mu) - \phi_1^2\theta_1\epsilon_T. \end{aligned}$$

By induction:

$$1 \quad \hat{Y}_{T+h} = \mu + \phi_1^h(Y_T - \mu) - \phi_1^{h-1}\theta_1\epsilon_T. \quad \blacksquare$$

② $e_T(h)$: In general, to find error, recall it is convenient to find MA representation. $\{Y_t\}$ is $ARMA(1, 1)$; hence

$$\begin{aligned}
 (1 - \phi_1 B)(Y_t - \mu) &= (1 - \theta_1 B)\epsilon_t \\
 Y_t - \mu &= (1 - \theta_1 B)(1 - \phi_1 B)^{-1}\epsilon_t \\
 &= (1 - \theta_1 B) \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} (\phi_1 B)^j \epsilon_t \quad [\{Y_t\} \text{ stationary}] \\
 &= (1 - \theta_1 B) \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \phi_1^j B^j \epsilon_t \\
 &= \left(\sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \phi_1^j B^j - \theta_1 \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \phi_1^k B^{k+1} \right) \epsilon_t \\
 &= \left(1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \phi_1^j B^j - \theta_1 \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \phi_1^k B^{k+1} \right) \epsilon_t \\
 &= \left(1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \phi_1^j B^j - \theta_1 \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \phi_1^{\ell-1} B^{\ell} \right) \epsilon_t \quad [\ell = k + 1]
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}Y_t - \mu &= \left(1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \phi_1^j B^j - \theta_1 \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \phi_1^{\ell-1} B^{\ell}\right) \epsilon_t \\&= \left(1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \left(\phi_1^j - \theta_1 \phi_1^{j-1}\right) B^j\right) \epsilon_t \\&= \epsilon_t + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \left(\phi_1^j - \theta_1 \phi_1^{j-1}\right) \epsilon_{t-j} \\&= \epsilon_t + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (\phi_1 - \theta_1) \phi_1^{j-1} \epsilon_{t-j} \\&=: \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{t-j},\end{aligned}$$

where

$$\psi_j := \begin{cases} 1, & j = 0 \\ (\phi_1 - \theta_1) \phi_1^{j-1} & j \geq 1 \end{cases}$$

We want $e_T(h) = Y_{T+h} - \hat{Y}_{T+h}$, with $Y_{T+h} = \mu + \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{T+h-j}$. Recall [from Corollary 3 or c.f. lecture 8], that $\hat{Y}_{T+h} = \mathbb{E}(Y_{T+h} | Y_{1:T})$

$$\begin{aligned}
 &= \mathbb{E}\left(\mu + \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{T+h-1} \mid Y_{1:T}\right) \\
 &= \mu + \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \psi_j \mathbb{E}(\epsilon_{T+h-j} \mid Y_{1:T}) \\
 &= \mu + \sum_{j=h}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{T+h-j}, \quad \left[\mathbb{E}(\epsilon_{T+h-j} \mid Y_{1:T}) = \begin{cases} \epsilon_{T+h-j}, & j \geq h \\ 0, & j < h \end{cases} \right]
 \end{aligned}$$

Hence, [from Corollary 3 or c.f. lecture 8]

$$\begin{aligned}
 e_T(h) &= \mu + \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{T+h-j} - \mu - \sum_{j=h}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{T+h-j} \\
 &= \sum_{j=0}^{h-1} \psi_j \epsilon_{T+h-j}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$e_T(h) = \sum_{j=0}^{h-1} \psi_j \epsilon_{T+h-j}$$

In the $ARMA(1, 1)$ case,

$$\psi_j := \begin{cases} 1, & j = 0 \\ (\phi_1 - \theta_1)\phi_1^{j-1} & j \geq 1 \end{cases}$$

Hence, for $ARMA(1, 1)$:

$$\textcircled{2} \quad e_T(h) = \epsilon_{T+h} + (\phi_1 - \theta_1) \sum_{j=1}^{h-1} \phi_1^{j-1} \epsilon_{T+h-j}. \quad \blacksquare$$

Therefore

$$\textcircled{3} \quad \mathbb{E}(e_T(h)) = 0. \quad \blacksquare$$

And [from Corollary 4]

$$\text{var}(e_T(h)) = \sigma^2 \sum_{j=0}^{h-1} \psi_j^2 = \sigma^2 \left(1 + (\phi_1 - \theta_1)^2 \sum_{j=1}^{h-1} \phi_1^{2j-2} \right)$$

(Sum is geometric series)

$$\textcircled{4} \quad \text{var}(e_T(h)) = \sigma^2 \left(1 + (\phi_1 - \theta_1)^2 \frac{1 - \phi_1^{2h-2}}{1 - \phi_1^2} \right). \quad \blacksquare$$

ARMA Forecasting Summary

- 1 Write model equation for Y_{T+h}
- 2 Put hats on everything ('hat', $\hat{\cdot}$ means expectation conditional on $Y_{1:T}$)
- 3 Calculate \hat{Y}_{T+1} using $\hat{Y}_{T+j} = Y_{T+j}$, for $j \leq 0$, and

$$\hat{\epsilon}_{T+j} := \mathbb{E}(\epsilon_{T+j} | Y_{1:T}) = \begin{cases} 0, & j > 0 \\ \epsilon_{T+j}, & j \leq 0 \end{cases}$$

- 4 Calculate \hat{Y}_{T+2} using above (together with the value of \hat{Y}_{T+1})
- 5 Similarly, calculate \hat{Y}_{T+h}
- 6 To find error properties, find sequence of coefficients ψ_j in the following MA representation of the model:

$$Y_t - \mu = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{t-j},$$

and use $\mathbb{E}(e_T(h)) = 0$, and $\text{var}(e_T(h)) = \sigma^2 \sum_{j=0}^{h-1} \psi_j^2$

For non-stationary models, an **MA** representation does not exist—recall, e.g. $(1 - \phi_1 B)Y_t = \epsilon_t \Rightarrow Y_t = (1 - \phi_1 B)^{-1}\epsilon_t = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \phi_1^j \epsilon_{t-j}$ which only exists (converges) if $|\phi_1| < 1$.

However, recall

$$\text{var}(e_T(h)) = \sigma^2 \sum_{j=0}^{h-1} \psi_j^2,$$

i.e., variance of h -step error (with finite h) only depends on first h -many values of ψ_j . Therefore, we can proceed in a similar way as before.

Remark 6 (Caveat: non-stationary error variance increases without bound)

Recall that, for stationary models, as $h \rightarrow \infty$:

$$\text{var}(e_T(h)) \rightarrow \text{var}(Y_t).$$

However for nonstationary models $\text{var}(e_T(h))$ diverges. (Because $\sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \psi_j^2 \not\leq \infty$ for nonstationary models.)

Example 7 (Forecasting $ARIMA(0, 1, 1)$ models)

Find the h -step ahead forecast and associated error. Show mean error is zero. Find error variance.

1 Model equation:

$$(1 - B)Y_{T+h} = (1 - \theta_1 B)\epsilon_{T+h}.$$

i.e.

$$Y_{T+h} = Y_{T+h-1} + \epsilon_{T+h} - \theta_1 \epsilon_{T+h-1}.$$

2 Put hats on everything ($\hat{\cdot}$ means expectation conditional on $Y_{1:T}$):

$$\hat{Y}_{T+h} = \hat{Y}_{T+h-1} + \hat{\epsilon}_{T+h} - \theta_1 \hat{\epsilon}_{T+h-1}.$$

3 Calculate \hat{Y}_{T+1} . Note, that $\hat{Y}_T = Y_T$, $\hat{\epsilon}_{T+1} = 0$ and $\hat{\epsilon}_T = \epsilon_T$. Hence

$$\hat{Y}_{T+1} = Y_T - \theta_1 \epsilon_T.$$

4 Calculate \hat{Y}_{T+2} . Note, that $\hat{\epsilon}_{T+2} = 0$ and $\hat{\epsilon}_{T+1} = 0$. Hence

$$\hat{Y}_{T+2} = \hat{Y}_{T+1}$$

5 Similarly, for $h > 2$

$$\hat{Y}_{T+h} = \hat{Y}_{T+h-1} = \dots = \hat{Y}_{T+1}$$

- 6 Find **MA** representation, i.e. ψ_j , s.t. $Y_t = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{t-j}$:
 $(1 - B)Y_t = (1 - \theta_1 B)\epsilon_t$,

i.e.

$$\begin{aligned}
 Y_t &= (1 - \theta_1 B)(1 - B)^{-1} \epsilon_t = (1 - \theta_1 B) \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} B^j \epsilon_t \\
 &= \left(\sum_{j=0}^{\infty} B^j - \theta_1 \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} B^{k+1} \right) \epsilon_t \\
 &= \left(1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} B^j - \theta_1 \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} B^{k+1} \right) \epsilon_t \\
 &= \left(1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} B^j - \theta_1 \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} B^k \right) \epsilon_t \quad [k+1 \leftrightarrow k] \\
 &= \left(1 + \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (1 - \theta_1) B^j \right) \epsilon_{t-j}
 \end{aligned}$$

i.e. $\psi_0 = 1$ and $\psi_j = 1 - \theta_1$ for $j > 0$.

$\psi_0 = 1$ and $\psi_j = 1 - \theta_1$ for $j > 0$. We have

$$\mathbb{E}(e_T(h)) = 0,$$

and

$$\begin{aligned}\text{var}(e_T(h)) &= \sigma^2 \sum_{j=0}^{h-1} \psi_j^2 \\ &= \sigma^2 \left(1 + \sum_{j=1}^{h-1} (1 - \theta_1) \right) \\ &= \sigma^2 \left(1 + (1 - \theta_1) \sum_{j=1}^{h-1} 1 \right) \\ &= \sigma^2 (1 + (h-1)(1 - \theta_1)). \quad \blacksquare\end{aligned}$$

Note, $h \rightarrow \infty$, $\text{var}(e_T(h)) \not\rightarrow \infty$.

Example 8 (Forecasting $ARIMA(1, 1, 0)$ models)

Find the h -step ahead forecast and associated error. Show mean error is zero. Find error variance.

1 Model equation:

$$(1 - \phi_1 B)(1 - B)Y_{T+h} = \epsilon_{T+h}.$$

Expand brackets:

$$Y_{T+h} = (1 + \phi_1)Y_{T+h-1} - \phi_1 Y_{T+h-2} + \epsilon_{T+1}.$$

2 Put hats on everything:

$$\hat{Y}_{T+h} = (1 + \phi_1)\hat{Y}_{T+h-1} - \phi_1 \hat{Y}_{T+h-2} + \hat{\epsilon}_{T+1}.$$

3 Calculate \hat{Y}_{T+1} . Note, that $\hat{Y}_T = Y_T$, $\hat{Y}_{T-1} = Y_{T-1}$ and $\hat{\epsilon}_{T+1} = 0$:

$$\hat{Y}_{T+1} = (1 + \phi_1)Y_T - \phi_1 Y_{T-1}.$$

4 Calculate \hat{Y}_{T+2} . Note that $\hat{Y}_{T+1} \neq Y_{T+1}$, $\hat{Y}_T = Y_T$ and $\hat{\epsilon}_{T+2} = 0$:

$$\hat{Y}_{T+2} = (1 + \phi_1)\hat{Y}_{T+1} - \phi_1 Y_T.$$

5 Similarly, for $h > 2$ (n.b. error in course notes)

$$\hat{Y}_{T+h} = (1 + \phi_1)\hat{Y}_{T+h-1} - \phi_1 \hat{Y}_{T+h-2}.$$

6 Find **MA** representation, i.e. ψ_j , s.t. $Y_t = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \psi_j \epsilon_{t-j}$:

$$(1 - \phi_1 B)(1 - B)Y_{T+h} = \epsilon_{T+h},$$

i.e.

$$\begin{aligned} Y_t &= \frac{1}{(1 - \phi_1 B)(1 - B)} \epsilon_t \\ &= \frac{1}{1 - \phi_1} \left(\frac{1}{1 - B} - \frac{\phi_1}{1 - \phi_1 B} \right) \epsilon_t \quad [\text{partial fractions}] \\ &= \frac{1}{1 - \phi_1} \left(\sum_{j=0}^{\infty} B^j - \phi_1 \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \phi_1^j B^j \right) \epsilon_t \\ &= \frac{1}{1 - \phi_1} \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} (1 - \phi_1^{j+1}) B^j \epsilon_t \\ &= \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \frac{1 - \phi_1^{j+1}}{1 - \phi_1} \epsilon_{t-j}. \end{aligned}$$

i.e. $\psi_j = (1 - \phi_1^{j+1}) / (1 - \phi_1)$.

$$\psi_j = (1 - \phi_1^{j+1}) / (1 - \phi_1).$$

we have

$$\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{e}_T(h)) = 0,$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \text{var}(\mathbf{e}_T(h)) &= \sigma^2 \sum_{j=0}^{h-1} \psi_j^2 \\ &= \sigma^2 \sum_{j=0}^{h-1} \left(\frac{1 - \phi_1^{j+1}}{1 - \phi_1} \right)^2. \quad \blacksquare \end{aligned}$$

Note, $h \rightarrow \infty$, $\text{var}(\mathbf{e}_T(h)) \not\rightarrow \infty$.

Question 9 (measuring forecast performance)

Given, at time T , we forecast values $\hat{y}_{T+1}, \hat{y}_{T+2}, \dots, \hat{y}_{T+h}$, and by time $T + h$, we observe actual values $y_{T+1}, y_{T+2}, \dots, y_{T+h}$. How can we assess how good our forecasts are?

Definition 10 (error measures)

- Mean square error

$$FMSE_h(T) := \frac{1}{h} \sum_{j=1}^h (y_{T+j} - \hat{y}_{T+j})^2.$$

- Mean absolute error

$$FMAE_h(T) := \frac{1}{h} \sum_{j=1}^h |y_{T+j} - \hat{y}_{T+j}|.$$

- Mean absolute percentage error

$$FMAPE_h(T) := \frac{1}{h} \sum_{j=1}^h \left| \frac{y_{T+j} - \hat{y}_{T+j}}{y_{T+h}} \right|.$$

All these error measures quantify average deviation from forecasts. However, they do not take into account uncertainty (error variance).

Example 11 (importance of forecast uncertainty!)

Think about buying 1000 shares @ £3.20/share. Forecasts for next month:

Forecaster A: predicts £3.30 **exactly**

Forecaster B: predicts £3.40 \pm 0.20 (error std. dev.)

i.e.

Forecast A: $\mathbb{P}(\text{price} < 3.20) = 0$

Forecast B: $\mathbb{P}(\text{price} < 3.20) = 0.159$ [Assuming price $\sim \mathcal{N}(3.40, 20^2)$]

Now suppose (unfortunately) that next month true price = £3.18.

Forecaster A definitely loses us money! Forecaster B might have put us off buying any shares, i.e. loss = 0! But measures \Rightarrow A is better?!?

measure	A	B
$FMSE_1$	144	484
$FMAE_1$	12	22
$FMAPE_1$	0.038	0.069

Probabilistically, a forecast is a probability distribution of Y_{T+h} , i.e. we have asserted that Y_{T+h} has some density function $f_{Y_{T+h}|Y_{1:T}}$, conditioned on $Y_{1:T}$, with mean \hat{y}_{T+h} and variance $\text{var}(e_T(h))$.

E.g., let $\epsilon_T \sim \mathcal{N}(0, \sigma^2)$. Then $\{Y_t\}$ are normally distributed and the probability forecast asserts

$$Y_{T+h}|Y_{1:T} \sim \mathcal{N}(\hat{y}_{T+h}, \text{var}(e_T(h))) .$$

I.e., density function

$$f_{Y_{T+h}|Y_{1:T}}(y) = (2\pi \text{var}(e_T(h)))^{-1/2} \exp \left(-\frac{(y - \hat{y}_{T+h})^2}{2 \text{var}(e_T(h))} \right) ,$$

quantifies the relative likelihood that the actual value is drawn from our probability forecast. Now take $-\log(\cdot)$ (small value \Rightarrow good forecast):

$$\begin{aligned} -\log f_{Y_{T+h}|Y_{1:T}}(y) &= -\log \left((2\pi \text{var}(e_T(h)))^{-1/2} \right) + \frac{(y - \hat{y}_{T+h})^2}{2 \text{var}(e_T(h))} \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \log 2\pi + \frac{1}{2} \log \text{var}(e_T(h)) + \frac{(y - \hat{y}_{T+h})^2}{2 \text{var}(e_T(h))} \end{aligned}$$

I.e., for an actual value $y = y_{T+h}$, this is

$$-\log f_{y_{T+h}|y_{1:T}}(y_{T+h}) = \text{const.} + \frac{1}{2} \log \text{var}(e_T(h)) + \frac{(y_{T+h} - \hat{y}_{T+h})^2}{2 \text{var}(e_T(h))}$$

Summing these quantities (without const.) over all h -many forecasts...

Definition 12

Define logarithmic scoring rule over forecasts $\hat{y}_{T+1:T+h}$, as

$$\mathcal{L}_h := \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j=1}^h \log \text{var}(e_T(j)) + \frac{(y_{T+j} - \hat{y}_{T+j})^2}{\text{var}(e_T(j))}.$$

Remark 13

Note:

- Small $\mathcal{L}_h \Leftrightarrow$ 'good' forecast
- 1st term: $\log \text{var}(e_T(j))$ large \Leftrightarrow error variance large
- 2nd term: $\frac{(y_{T+j} - \hat{y}_{T+j})^2}{\text{var}(e_T(j))}$ large \Leftrightarrow squared error \gg error variance

If we apply logarithmic scoring rule to the share dealing Example 11, we get

measure	A	B
$FMSE_1$	144	484
$FMAE_1$	12	22
$FMAPE_1$	0.038	0.069
\mathcal{L}_1	∞	3.60

I.e., simple measures of deviation imply (incorrectly) that Forecaster A is better, whereas logarithmic rule (correctly) identifies Forecaster B is better.

Remark 14

In practice, the forecast performance measures can be used as part of the validation procedure, as follows.

- *split data up into two sets:*
 - *'fitting' (or 'training') set [# data points typically = 80% of total data; e.g., for $T = 100$, choose Y_1, \dots, Y_{80} , say]*
 - *validation (or 'hold-out') set [on remaining data Y_{81}, \dots, Y_{100}]*
- *use Box-Jenkins approach only on the **training** set to choose a few good candidate models*
- *for each model:*
 - *generate forecasts*
 - *check forecasting performance by comparing forecasts with your hold-out set*