STOCHASTICGW – User manual and Tutorial (version 2.0)

Vojtěch Vlček, 1,2 Christopher Arntsen, 3 Wenfei Li, 1 Roi $Baer, ^4$ $Eran\ Rabani, ^{5,6}$ and Daniel Neuhauser 1

¹ Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, University of California, Los Angeles California 90095, USA.

² After July 1st, 2018: Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, University of California, Santa Barbara California 93106, USA

³ Department of Chemistry,

Youngstown State University, Youngstown, Ohio 44555

⁴ Fritz Haber Center for Molecular Dynamics, Institute of Chemistry, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem 91904, Israel

⁵ Department of Chemistry,

University of California, Berkeley, California 94720, USA

⁶ The Sackler Center for Computational Molecular Science, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv 69978, Israel

Contents

1	Introduction							
2	License							
3	Overview							
4	Code status							
5	Downloading, compilation and installation							
	5.1	Downloading and installation	8					
	5.2	Compilation	8					
	5.3	Implementation	8					
6	Input files							
	6.1	Brief overview of the input files	10					
	6.2	Detailed description of the files and flags	10					
7	Out	Output 19						
8	Utilities							
	8.1	Extracting wavefunctions from Quantum ESPRESSO runs	21					
9	Tutorial 2							
	9.1	${\rm H_2}$: Combined Stochastic and Deterministic treatment	22					
	9.2	$H_2 \colon$ Extracting wavefunctions from Quantum ESPRESSO and running GW/PBE	24					
		9.2.1 (ii) running pw2bgw.x utility	26					
	9.3	C_{60} : Fully stochastic calculation	28					
10	Ack	nowledgements	30					

1 Introduction

This manual details **stochasticGW**, a software for large scale linear-scaling G_0W_0 stochastic calculations. The code combines the success of the G_0W_0 approximation, a quantitative approach for vertical ionization energies and electron affinities, with the ability of stochastic methods to tackle very large systems. The methodology was introduced and detailed in several recent references, especially:

- Ref. I: D. Neuhauser, Y. Gao, C. Arntsen, C. Karshenas, E. Rabani and R. Baer,
 Breaking the theoretical scaling limit for predicting quasiparticle energies:
 The stochastic GW approach, Phys. Rev. Lett., 113, 076402 (2014).
 https://journals.aps.org/prl/abstract/10.1103/PhysRevLett.113.076402
- Ref. II: V. Vlcek, E. Rabani, D. Neuhauser and R. Baer, Stochastic GW calculations for molecules, J. Chem. Theo. Comput. 13, 4997 (2017). https://arxiv.org/abs/1612.08999
- Ref. III: V. Vlcek, W. Li, R. Baer, E. Rabani and D. Neuhauser, Turbo-boosting GW beyond > 10,000 electrons using fractured stochastic orbitals, to be placed on the Arxiv (2018)
- \rightarrow Sections: 3, 5 & 9 If this is your first time using this manual, read the Overview and Downloading and compilation section, and then jump to the Tutorial.

2 License

Unless otherwise stated, all files distributed in this package are licensed under the following terms:

STOCHASTICGW

Developed by: stochasticGW, University of California, Los Angeles http://www.stochasticgw.com/

Permission is hereby granted, free of charge, to any person obtaining a copy of the **STOCHASTICGW** software and associated documentation files (the "Software"), to deal with the Software without restriction, including without limitation the rights to use, copy, modify, merge, publish, distribute, sublicense, and/or sell copies of the Software, and to permit persons to whom the Software is furnished to do so, subject to the following conditions:

- 1. Redistributions of source code must retain the above copyright notice, this list of conditions and the following disclaimers.
- 2. Redistributions in binary form must reproduce the above copyright notice, this list of conditions and the following disclaimers in the documentation and/or other materials provided with the distribution.
- 3. Neither the names of **stochasticGW**, stochasticGW, University of California, Los Angeles, nor the names of its contributors may be used to endorse or promote products derived from this Software without specific prior written permission.

THE SOFTWARE IS PROVIDED "AS IS", WITHOUT WARRANTY OF ANY KIND, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO THE WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY, FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE AND NONINFRINGEMENT. IN NO EVENT SHALL THE CONTRIBUTORS OR COPYRIGHT HOLDERS BE LIABLE FOR ANY CLAIM, DAMAGES OR OTHER LIABILITY, WHETHER IN AN ACTION OF CONTRACT, TORT OR OTHERWISE, ARISING FROM, OUT OF OR IN CONNECTION WITH THE SOFTWARE OR THE USE OR OTHER DEALINGS WITH THE SOFTWARE.

You are under no obligation whatsoever to provide any bug fixes, patches, or upgrades to the features, functionality or performance of the source code ("Enhancements") to anyone; however, if you choose to make your Enhancements available either publicly, or directly to **STOCHBSTICGW** University of California, Los Angeles, without imposing a separate written license agreement for such Enhancements, then you hereby grant the following license: a non-exclusive, royalty-free perpetual license to install, use, modify, prepare derivative works, incorporate into other computer software, distribute, and sublicense such enhancements or derivative works thereof, in binary and source code form.

3 Overview

STOCHASTICGW calculates a matrix element of the self-energy in the G_0W_0 approximation

$$\Sigma\left(\omega\right) = \left\langle \phi \middle| \hat{\Sigma}\left(\omega\right) \middle| \phi \right\rangle,\tag{1}$$

where ϕ is a single particle orbital of the molecule studied (typically a HOMO or LUMO), associated with a DFT Hamiltonian \hat{H} ; $\hat{\Sigma}$ is the self-energy operator, composed of a static exchange component (X) and a polarization part (P)

$$\left\langle \phi \middle| \hat{\Sigma} \left(\omega \right) \middle| \phi \right\rangle = \left\langle \phi \middle| \hat{\Sigma}_{X} \middle| \phi \right\rangle + \left\langle \phi \middle| \hat{\Sigma}_{P} \left(\omega \right) \middle| \phi \right\rangle, \tag{2}$$

where the latter is a Fourier transform

$$\left\langle \phi \middle| \hat{\Sigma}_{P} \left(\omega \right) \middle| \phi \right\rangle = \int e^{i\omega t} \left\langle \phi \middle| \hat{\Sigma}_{P} \left(t \right) \middle| \phi \right\rangle dt.$$
 (3)

In the G_0W_0 approximation the coordinate representation of $\hat{\Sigma}_P(t)$ is extremely simple:

$$\Sigma_P(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}', t) = G_0(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}', t) W_P(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}', t^+), \qquad (4)$$

where we introduced the non-interacting Green's function and the dynamical part of the effective interaction.

The starting point (used for G_0 and W), is a Kohn-Sham Hamiltonian which is constructed from ground state orbitals ϕ . At the moment (version 2.0) the **STOCHASTICGW** code is limited to LDA and GGA starting points – this restriction will be lifted in the upcoming versions of the code. Orbitals ϕ are represented on a real-space grid and have to be supplied by the user.

The matrix element of the self-energy is evaluated as a statistical average over multiple stochastic realizations - the number of Monte Carlo samples. The stochastic approach uses multiple resolutions of the identity with random functions for several purposes:

- Separating the product of G_0 and W_P , converting the calculation of Σ_P into evaluating a matrix element of W_P .
- Evaluating a matrix element of W_{PR} (where the R subscript indicates a causal, i.e., retarded effective interaction) by stochastic TDH (time-dependent Hartree, yielding RPA) or stochastic TDDFT.
- Converting the matrix elements of W_{PR} to matrix elements of W_P (the time-ordered effective interaction) through a stochastic fragment basis approach (Ref. III).

The eventual method scales practically linearly (or better) with system size; for details of the method and scaling read Refs. I & II and, for the closest description to the present version, Ref. III

The program outputs the matrix element of the polarization self-energy, $\left\langle \phi \middle| \hat{\Sigma}_P \left(\omega \right) \middle| \phi \right\rangle$, over a wide range of frequencies, as well as the exchange self-energy $\left\langle \phi \middle| \hat{\Sigma}_X \middle| \phi \right\rangle$. The code also prints the estimate of the quasiparticle energy

of state ϕ for the given number of Monte Carlo samples, obtained from solving the quasiparticle equation:

$$\varepsilon = \varepsilon_{KS} + \left\langle \phi \middle| \hat{\Sigma}_X + \hat{\Sigma}_P \left(\varepsilon \right) - \hat{v}_{xc} \middle| \phi \right\rangle, \tag{5}$$

where $\varepsilon_{\rm KS}$ is Kohn-Sham eigenvalue of the eigenstate ϕ and \hat{v}_{xc} is the (mean-field) exchange-correlation potential. The **input** and output are detailed in the sections below.

4 Code status

Several items in this 2.0 version have not been implemented or tested. Specifically, note that:

- The code has not been tested for open-shell systems.
- The core-shell exchange correction is implemented but not tested.
- \bullet LDA and GGA functionals are implemented using Libxc.
- The numbers of points in each dimension, nx, ny, nz need all to be even.
- The maximum angular momentum in the nonlocal pseudopotentials needs to be 1 or 2 or 3. If it is 1 then it is necessary to have lloc=2.

5 Downloading, compilation and installation

5.1 Downloading and installation

STOCHASTICGW is a Fortran code requiring Open MPI parallelization; The tgz tar file is available from:

https://github.com/stochasticGW/stochasticGW

For installation, first unpack the archive:

```
tar -xzvf sgw-v2.0.tgz
```

Upon unpacking, you will get a directory sgw-v2.0 with a README file and 3 subdirectories:

```
examples/ PP/ README src/
```

The installation of the package is detailed then in README and is repeated here.

! → An installation of the FFTW library (version 3.1 or higher) is a prerequisite; it can be downloaded from http://www.fftw.org.

5.2 Compilation

In the src directory you will find a makefile that needs a little modification depending on your system settings, as described below.

Edit makefile and specify your parallel compiler (FCMPI), FFTW library (FFTFLG) and LIBXC library (LIBXC). The flags for the parallel compiler (MPIFLG) can usually be left unaltered.

The supplied header of makefile reads:

```
FCMPI = mpif90
MPIFLG = -DMPI -03
FFTFLG = -lfftw3
XC = XCI/*.f90
LIBXC = -lxcf90 -lxc
```

The **STOCHASTICGW** code is built simply by writing:

make

in the src directory.

After successful compilation, the **stochasticGW** executable, **sgw.x**, will be found in the **src** directory.

Make sure sgw.x has been created

5.3 Implementation

Now you are ready to implement the code. Then, say you want to run it in a directory you will call \sim /mygwrun. Go there, and copy the H₂ example input, the executable, and pseudopotentials to this directory:

```
mkdir ~/mygwrun
cd ~/mygwrun
```

```
cp ~/sGW_v2/examples/H2/* .
cp ~/sGW_v2/src/sgw.x .
cp -r ~/sGW_v2/PP/ .
```

At this point, your mygwrun directory should contain the following:

cnt.ini counter.inp INPUT log_h2example PP random.inp sgw.x wf.txt where PP is a directory (with pseudopotentials). All these files are inputs except for log_h2example.

To run the H₂ example (from the Tutorial) on, say, 30 cores, write

```
mpirun -n 30 ./sgw.x >& log &
```

The output file log should match log_h2example.

After the H₂ test is finished, you can run any other molecule/material you want. You'll need to change a few items, detailed below and in the Tutorial.

- Change INPUT as needed especially make sure that you change ntddft to be between 8 and 30.
- Change the atomic coordinates (cnt.ini).
- Bring your own wf.txt (or better yet, wf.bin) file that contains the occupied DFT energies and functions.
- And remember to include in PP/ any pseudopotential you need.

6 Input files

6.1 Brief overview of the input files

Two groups of input files are required in the working directory. One set includes general parameters, and the other system-specific files.

Seed, labels and flags

random.inp: seed file for the random number generator.

counter.inp: a label file with a counter for modifying the random number input and

for labeling the input. Using this file simplifies working simultaneously on

multiple runs.

INPUT: general input file with flags and parameters.

System specific files

cnt.ini: atomic position file (in Angstroms or atomic units).

*UPF/*fhi: pseudopotential files (only two formats are currently supported). These

files should be placed in a subdirectory of the working directory, PP/

wf.txt or wf.bin: text or binary file with all occupied (and possibly a few unoccupied) wave-

functions.

orb.txt (optional) : an orbital wavefunction (" ϕ " in the previous discussion) for which the self-

energy matrix element is needed. Usually this file will not be given and

instead ϕ will be extracted from wf.txt or wf.bin.

6.2 Detailed description of the files and flags

FILE: random.inp

A file with 6 lines, each with 4 integer numbers (Fortran format integer*8). These are the seeds for the KISS random-number algorithm. Each line in is a seed for a different random variable used in the StochasticGW algorithm.

FILE: counter.inp

A file with a single integer that labels the output directories and files and also modifies the seed. It alleviates the need for different runs to use different random.inp files when the calculation is repeated to reduce the statistical error (see example below)

Example

Let's say we want nmctot=2000 stochastic samples.^a This can be achieved by a single run with 2000 stochastic samples, or perhaps, due to computer jobs scheduling issues, it may be easier to submit 5 different jobs, each with 400 stochastic samples.

For these 5 jobs we would need, in principle, 5 different random.inp files with totally different values, which is cumbersome. We therefore use counter.inp. Each counter modifies the values of the variables from random.inp. So in our example we would only need to submit 5 different jobs, each with the same random.inp file, and in each run the counter.inp file contains a different integer from, say, 0 to 4 (or any other 5 different integers).

Then, at the end of the 5 runs, average the 5 output quasiparticle energies or 5 output self-energies files.

FILE: INPUT

Main file for flags and parameters. For most variables the default values are appropriate. Examples are shown in the Tutorial.

Specifically, only one set of variables has to be specified in INPUT: the names of the pseudopotentials (variable: pps). Other parameters need to be included in the INPUT file only if they differ from their default values. The format for most variables (except for the pseudopotential names) is:

```
variable name
<value>
<empty line>
```

The order is not important, but no variable should be repeated; lines starting with # are ignored. The input variables are:

pps : a label indicating the beginning of the list of pseudopotentials. After the last pseudopotential put a line starting with #. The pseudopotentials listed must be present in a subdirectory of the working directory (where the INPUT file is) called PP/. It is recommended to use well-tested pseudopotentials. At present, the supported formats are *UPF and *fhi. In addition, the code currently supports only the LDA and GGA functionals.

! \rightarrow Note that the program will issue a warning if the pseudopotential wavefunctions are not properly normalized, but it will then normalize them properly.

scratch : (default: GW_SCRATCH) the prefix of the name of the scratch directory; the
scratch directory is then appended by the counter (from the counter.inp
file).

 $[^]a$ see also the buffer_size variable, which controls the parallelization of multiple stochastic states

Example

If counter.inp contains the number 0, and the relevant segment from INPUT is

scratch
/scratch/john/GW_SCRATCH
<empty line>

then the scratch directory will be /scratch/john/GW_SCRATCH.0

The scratch directory contains several intermediate files. It should be ideally not placed on the main shared disk but on fast disks connected to each core, if such disks are available.

Each core will try to create this scratch directory, unless it was created earlier by another core accessing the same scratch disk.

nmctot : (default: 1000) the number of stochastic realizations used for statistical averaging (Monte Carlo iterations). Typically 300-2000 iterations are needed for acceptable convergence. The error in the output self-energy and quasiparticle energies decreases as $\frac{1}{\sqrt{\text{nmctot}}}$.

If nmctot is larger than the number of MPI processes N_{proc} the calculation will be repeated (nmctot/ N_{proc}) times. For instance: if you set nmctot=1000 and distribute the job over N_{proc} =100 cores, the calculation will be repeated 10 times on each core.

If needed, the program increases nmctot so that $mod(nmctot, N_{proc}) = 0$.

binary: (default: .TRUE.) a logical variable; designating whether the occupied wavefunctions are stored in a binary file wf.bin or a text one wf.txt.

periodic : (default: .FALSE.) a logical variable designating whether the calculation is periodic (restricted to Γ -point sampling).

box : (default: pos) a character*3 variable designating the way the calculation box is constructed. Two values are allowed, pos and sym .

The first choice, pos, implies that the calculation box is (in Bohr!) [0,nx*dx][0,ny*dy][0,nz*dz]. The wavefunctions in wf.txt are then interpreted to start at the corner of this box, (0,0,0). Such box convention is used in Quantum ESPRESSO and most planewave codes. Note that in our code the coordinates in the cnt.ini file need to fit in the box (or more preceisely, if they are given in Angstrom, their values in Bohr need to fit in the box). If they do not fit in the box the program will stop.

The second, sym, assumes that the box of the calculation is [-nx*dx/2,nx*dx/2][-ny*dy/2,ny*dy/2][-nz*dz/2,nz*dz/2] (again in Bohr), i.e., its center is the origin. The wavefunctions in wf.txt are again interpreted to start at the corner of the box, which is now (-nx*dx/2,-ny*dy/2,-nz*dz/2). Again, the coordinates in cnt.ini need to fit in the box (once expressed in Bohr). This symmetric box convention is more natural for non-periodic molecules.

multiplicity: (default: 1) either 1 or 2; 1 indicates a closed-shell calculation, 2 an open

shell. Note: the program was not tested for open-shell systems, and at this stage should be trusted only for closed-shell calculations.

ekcut: (default: 25.0) a cutoff (in Hartree) on the kinetic energy. Even though there is a formal maximum on the kinetic energy on the grid (and the grid is supplied elsewhere, see below) it is numerically better to use a lower cutoff. In practice one should use a value somewhat higher than the depth of the pseudopotentials. For calculations with a new element check the convergence of the calculations with ekcut=15 to 30 Hartree.

gamma: (default: 0.06) energy broadening parameter for Σ_P (Section 3 in Ref. II and the supplementary material in Ref. I). Generally 0.06 should be fine. An increased gamma reduces the computational effort and improves somewhat the statistics, but if gamma is too large the broadening will be too severe leading to wrong quasiparticle predictions.

orb_indx : (default: -1). If orb_indx>0 its value designates the orbital ϕ which will be used in the calculation of the self-energy (e.g., if orb_indx=5 then ϕ is the 5th eigenstate). If orb_indx is -1 then ϕ should be read from orb.txt.

ntddft: (default: 15) the number of stochastic states used in the time-dependent RPA or TDDFT calculation (in the W part of GW). For very small systems, use ~ 30 . For large systems with hundreds of electrons or more, it is enough to use ~ 8 orbitals.

For open-shell systems (multiplicity=2) ntddft denotes the number of stochastic TDRPA/TDDFT states for each spin.

For a non-stochastic TDRPA/TDDFT propagation, use ntddft = -1. Then a deterministic TDRPA/TDDFT calculation is used for calculating the action of W. In this case all occupied orbitals are excited and propagated. This choice should only be done for small systems, since it increases the computational time considerably. A non-stochastic calculation of the action of W is neither feasible nor needed for large systems, since the stochastic calculation of the action of W is getting progressively better for bigger systems.

units_nuc: (default: Bohr) either Angstrom, or Bohr. Controls the units for the nuclear positions input (in the cnt.ini file).

 $\begin{tabular}{ll} {\tt flg_dyn} : & ({\tt default: .FALSE.}) \ logical \ variable; \ .{\tt FALSE.} \ implies \ an \ RPA \ calculation; \\ .{\tt TRUE.} \ yields \ a \ TDDFT \ calculation \ of \ the \ action \ of \ W \ where \ the \ exchange-correlation \ potential \ is \ updated \ at \ each \ time-step. \\ \end{tabular}$

functional: (default: 1 12) two integers which represent the ID of exchange and correlation functional in libxc, respectively. The default (1 12) is a combination of the Slater exchange and Perdew-Wang LDA correlation functional. A complete list of functional ID can be found on the libxc website https://www.tddft.org/programs/libxc/functionals/. While a few representative ones are listed below:

Exchange:

- 1: Slater exchange (LDA)
- 101: PBE exchange (GGA)

- 106: Becke88 exchange (GGA)
- 109: PW91 exchange (GGA)

Correlation:

- 12: PW correlation (LDA)
- 9: PZ correlation (LDA)
- 7: VMN5 correlation (LDA)
- 131: LYP correlation (GGA)
- 130: PBE correlation (GGA)
- 134: PW91 correlation (GGA)

The following variables could usually be safely kept at their default values: :

dt : (default: 0.05) time step in atomic units for the TD propagation of W (note: 0.05 a.u. $\simeq 1.2$ attosec). If desired, dt could be reduced to 0.03, although 0.05 generally works well.

nxi : (default: 10,000) Number of random spanning vectors (denoted N_{ξ} in Ref.-III). Usually there's no need to change the default.

segment_fraction: (default: 0.003) The ratio of the size of each stochastic vector ξ to the total grid length. See Ref. III. Usually there's no need to change the default.

sm : (default: 0.0001) The perturbation parameter (denoted τ in Eq. 29 in Ref. II). The results should not vary for sm in the range 10^{-5} – 10^{-3} .

scale_vh: (default: 2; but will be set to 1 by the program if periodic) allowed values 1 or 2. Controls whether a Martyna-Tuckerman¹ grid-doubling is used in the TDRPA/TDDFT calculations. If the calculation is periodic, scale_vh would be set in the program to 1 regardless of the input value. For non-periodic molecules, scale_vh formally needs to be set at 2. So since the program automatically sets scale_vh, there is usually no need to touch this variable.

nrppmx : (default: 1200) an upper bound on the number of radial grid points for the pseudopotential. No need to change unless a new pseudopotential with more than 1200 grid points is used.

(default: 1) the number of cores used in each independent stochastic runs. For intermediate or large size systems (hundreds or thousands of electrons) choose the default (1) which uses the least total CPU resources. But for very large systems, the wall-time of the calculation could be too long when using a buffer_size of 1. Generally, it is a good idea to use a buffer_size which either equals to the number of cores on each CPU, or divides it (e.g., if there are 12 cores on each CPU, use a buffer_size of 1,2,3,4,6 or 12).

Also, if buffer_size is >1, aim at having mod(ntddft+1,buffer_size)=0. For instance: if buffer_size is 12, use ntddft=11, 23 or 35. If ntddft is bigger the convergence is somewhat faster, but the effort grows, so values in the range 8-30 are usually the most efficient.

buffer_size :

¹ G.J. Martyna, and M.E. Tuckerman, "A reciprocal space based method for treating long range interactions in ab-initio and force-field-based calculation in clusters", J. Chem. Phys. 110, 2810 (1999),doi:10.1063/1.477923

Example

Let's say that a giant system requires about 1000 Monte Carlo iterations. One could use 1000 cores and then each core will be used for a single Monte Carlo iteration. But say that such a single calculation took 2 days (i.e., each core takes 2 days), while the computer-center allocation limits each run to be 1 day long. In that case, it is necessary to spread each single calculation to several cores. For example, use then a buffer_size of 4 and 4000 mpi cores to do the 1000 Monte-Carlo iterations, and each group of 4 cores will do a single stochastic run. The calculation will then take a shorter wall-time.

Note: to spread the work in each separate run to several cores, we use the mpi_comm_split routine, which divides the cores to subsets, usually labeled as colors. Further details can be found on the web.

FILE: cnt.ini

Nuclear positions in a Cartesian format:

<element name> <x-coordinate> <y-coordinate> <z-coordinate>

The element name is in a 1- or 2-character format (e.g., H or Si). The nuclear units could be in Angstrom or Bohr (the units are specified by the units_nuc variable, the default of which is Bohr), but recall that all other quantities in the code are calculated in atomic units, i.e., Hartree for energies and Bohr for distances.

FILE: wf.txt

A wavefunction input file (required if binary = .FALSE.) with all occupied (and potentially a few unoccupied) eigenstates. The first 6 lines detail the grid used (lengths in Bohr), followed by the multiplicity (which needs to match the default value or, if given, the value in INPUT), and the Kohn-Sham eigenvalues. Then each wavefunction is given, preceded by the state-indicies (and possibly the spin-index, if multiplicity=2). The file contains the state index on the $12^{th}, 14^{th}, \ldots$ lines:

^a a good introduction is in http://www.bu.edu/tech/support/research/ training-consulting/online-tutorials/mpi/more/mpi_comm_split/

```
<number of points along the x direction>
nx
                           <number of points along the y direction>
ny
                           <number of points along the z direction>
nz
dx
                           <grid spacing in the x direction>
                           <grid spacing in the y direction>
dy
                           <grid spacing in the z direction>
dz
                           <multiplicity>
nsp
                            <number of states in this wf.txt file>
nstates
evls
<kohn-Sham eigenvalues>
orbitals
                           <spin-index of 1st orbital>
<1st orbital>
                           spin-index of 2<sup>nd</sup> orbital>
<2^{\rm nd} orbital>
```

Note that the list of Kohn-Sham eigenvalues should include all "nstates" eigenvalues.

The program determines the number of states to be read based on the ionic charges provided in the pseudopotential files. If the normalization of any orbital is incorrect a warning is issued but the program continues.

The orbital is given as usual in Fortran with the left-most index (x) varying the fastest. Each orbital should contain $nx \cdot ny \cdot nz$ points.

If the multiplicity is 2 (open-shell), the spin-index of each orbital should be 1 or 2 (indicating an α or β spin). The spin-index is not required if the multiplicity is 1 (closed-shell).

FILE: wf.bin

The wavefunction input file (required if binary = .TRUE.). Analogous to wf.txt. When preparing this binary file from your favorite DFT program output, you should follow the example of the following code segment:

```
real*8 hw(1:nstates)
real*8 orbitals(1:ngrid,1:nstates)
open(9,file='wf.bin',status='old',form='unformatted')
write(9)'nx
                  ',nx
write(9)'ny
                  ',ny
write(9)'nz
                  ,nz
write(9)'dx
                  ',dx
write(9)'dy
                  ',dy
write(9)'dz
                  ',dz
write(9)'nsp
                  ',nsp
write(9)'nstates ',nstates
write(9)'evls
write(9)(hw(i),i=1,nstates)
write(9)'orbitals'
```

```
do i=1,nstates
! ispin: 1 for closed shell; 1 or 2 for open shell.
     write(9)i, ispin(i)
     write(9)u(1:ngrid,i)
enddo
close(9)
```

Each text string in lines 1-9 and 11 is of length 9.

At present, the user needs to prepare wf.bin, but in future versions we would supply preparation routines that process the output of Quantum ESPRESSO, Abinit, and other DFT programs and produce the proper wf.bin file.

FILE: orb.txt

Orbital ϕ for which the quasiparticle energy is sought. This orbital is usually taken from a DFT code. Typically it will be the HOMO or the LUMO. The file is organized similarly to the wavefunction file, and the heading values need to match those in wf.txt or wf.bin

```
<number of points along the x direction>
nx
     <number of points along the y direction>
ny
nz
     <number of points along the z direction>
     <grid spacing in the x direction>
dx
     <grid spacing in the y direction>
dy
     <grid spacing in the z direction>
dz
     <multiplicity>
nsp
     <kohn sham orbital energy for this specific orbital>
orb
     <values of the orbital \phi on the grid>
```

The program issues an error warning if the normalization of ϕ is wrong (but will not stop).

If the orb_indx variable is specified, with a value bigger than 0, then orb.txt is not needed and ϕ will be taken directly from the wavefunction file.

FILE: *UPF/*fhi

A pseudopotential file is needed for each of the elements in the molecule (i.e., each of the different element in cnt.ini). The names of the pseudopotential files are specified by variable pps. The pseudopotentials should be placed in a subdirectory, PP/

At present the program only handles pseudopotentials with a single Kleinman-Bylander² state for each angular momentum. Note that such pseudopotentials are known to have ghost states for heavier elements and some choices of specific

² L. Kleinman and D. M. Bylander, "Efficacious form for model pseudopotentials.", Phys. Rev. Lett. 48, 1425 (1982), https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.48.1425

pseudopotentials. ³ The user should verify that there are no ghost states for each of the pseudopotentials. This can be verified, for example, with a DFT code that uses the Kleinman-Bylander decomposition (e.g., Quantum ESPRESSO). Such a DFT code should be used for checking for ghost states in very small systems (atoms or small molecules) each of which contains one or more of the atoms in the system with its associated pseudopotentials.

Also note that we have not extensively checked/verified pseudopotentials with core-charge exchange corrections.

Future versions of the code would incorporate more general pseudopotentials.

³ A specific example for a problematic pseudopotential is the usual one for hydrogen when lmax=3 is used. Therefore, for H use lmax=1 and lloc=2, see the H.pw-mt_fhi.UPF pseudopotential in the supplied PP directory

7 Output

During the run a standard output (log file) details the input variables, possible errors, warnings, timing and a few additional details, as well as the output energies. We separately supply the self-energy as a function of frequency.

If the calculation is repeated for several Monte-Carlo steps on each core, the variable designating the current step has the range:

$$\texttt{MC_STEP} = 1, ..., \frac{\texttt{nmctot} \times \texttt{buffer_size}}{\texttt{ncores}} \tag{6}$$

(see nmctot and buffer_size for details). The quasiparticle energy is estimated at each cycle together with its stochastic error (see the Tutorial).

Here is an example of the tail of the log_h2example file from the Tutorial, for an MPI run using n cores = 30 cores and with buffer size = 1.

######## Accumulative # of Monte Carlo steps : MC= 120 #######
Completed Monte Carlo steps in each core : MC_STEP= 4

	-0.378696		E		
	-0.424763		<v></v>		
120	-0.646902	0.000000	MC,	<x></x>	+-stat.err
120	0.018595	0.012778	MC,	Sig_R(e_qp)	+-stat.err
120	-0.018666	0.008620	MC,	Sig_R(e_ks)	+-stat.err
120	-0.000045	0.000009	MC,	Sig_I(e_ks)	+-stat.err
120	0.894364		MC,	Z	
120	-0.594063		MC,	Elin	
120	-0.582239	0.012778	MC,	E_qp	+-stat.err
120	0.003750	0.000543	MC,	Ei_qp	+-stat.err

Time: MC_STEP: 4 => time: 306.175140

Time: program end 306.199127

The tail details the MC_STEP = $4^{\rm th}$ calculation step, so nmctot = 120 = MC STEP \times n cores total calculations were done.

The DFT orbital energy is -0.378696, followed by $\langle V \rangle \equiv \langle \phi | \hat{v}_{xc} | \phi \rangle$.

The following lines are all in the same format: number of Monte Carlo samples (120 – denoted MC; since this is the final step of the calculation, it coincides with the value of nmctot); variable name, its statistical error and labels. Specifically:

- Expectation value of the non-local Hartree-Fock exchange, $\langle X \rangle = \left\langle \phi \middle| \hat{\Sigma}_X \middle| \phi \right\rangle$, calculated deterministically, without statistical error.
- Sig_R is the real part of the self-energy evaluated either at the quasiparticle energy (e_qp) or at the starting point KS eigenvalue energy (e_ks).
- Sig_I is the imaginary part of the self-energy.
- Z is the renormalization factor.
- Elin is the often-used but crude linear extrapolation quasiparticle energy estimate based on a renormalization factor Z.
- Finally, E_qp and Ei_qp are the real and imaginary parts of the quasiparticle energy obtained by properly solving Eq. 5.

The last two lines provide CPU wall-timing in seconds.

The quasiparticle energy can also be read directly from the header of the self-energy curve which is provided in the file SigW.txt in the GW_OUTPUT.X directory (where X is the number in counter.inp file). If the run crashes for some reason prior to completion, SigW.txt will contain the most up-to-date information.

Example

Here is a sample SigW.txt file header.

```
# SigW output from stochastic GW
          8192 plotting frequencies
# MC_STEP (Monte Carlo steps on each core)
            30
 Buffer_size (# cores per indep. run)
  MC (accumulative # Monte Carlo runs) =MC_STEP*(N_cores/buffer_size)
  KS energy
  -0.378696352
   -0.646901488
                      0.00000000
  <vxc>
  -0.424763411
 e op real.
                   de op real
  -0.582239330
                      1.27781946E-02
# e_qp_imag,
                   de_qp_imag
    3.74985230E-03
                      5.42658614E-04
                                                      dSigW_real
                    SigW_real
                                    SigW_imag
                                                                      dSigw_imag
```

The header first reports that the file contains the self-energy at 8192 frequency points. It then repeats the information from the output log file on the number of MC steps, the Kohn-Sham energy, the expectation values, the polarization self-energies and the quasiparticle energies. The rest of the file, after the header, contains the frequency-dependent polarization self-energies and their statistical deviation.

Each line of the header is introduced with #, so that it is ignored by many plotting programs. Therefore, the polarization part of the self-energy contained in the SigW.txt file can easily be visualized (see the example in the Tutorial).

Further, intermediate information is placed in the directory GW_WORK.X (where X stands for number specified in counter.inp); it contains files similar to SigW.txt taken at intermediate number of Monte Carlo iterations. It also contains a file (details_output.txt) with detailed information on the run that in case of trouble could be useful for debugging. The scratch directory (specified by the scratch variable) contains intermediate files that can be safely discarded after the run.

8 Utilities

8.1 Extracting wavefunctions from Quantum ESPRESSO runs

We offer two options for converting Quantum ESPRESSO output into stochasticGW input wavefunctions. The first option requires installation of BerkeleyGW code, and only binary IO is supported. Later we provide an example where we extract wavefunctions from Quantum ESPRESSO for an H₂ molecule, and perform GW/PBE calculation on the system.

Option 1

Apart from Quantum ESPRESSO, option 1 also requires installation of the BerkeleyGW code, available from their website: https://berkeleygw.org/download/. This is a two-step conversion. The first step utilizes the pw2bgw.x utility from Quantum ESPRESSO, and the second uses the bgw2sgw.x utility from BerkeleyGW. The input descriptions of the two utilities are available from the Internet:

- http://web.mit.edu/espresso_v6.1/amd64_ubuntu1404/qe-6.1/Doc/INPUT_pw2bgw.html for pw2bgw.x
- http://manual.berkeleygw.org/2.2/bgw2sgw-keywords/ for bgw2sgw.x.

Note that option 1 only produces wavefunction files in binary format.

Option 2

When using the qe2sgw.f90 code, lines 19-22 needs to be modified, where values of four variables should be changed based on the actual runs. The meanings of the four variables are included as comment:

```
!Setting variables
```

```
filename='output' !name of the QE output file
prefix ='h2' !prefix of the QE run
qe_loc ='/home/wenfei/codes/qe-6.1/bin/' !location of the QE executables
flg_bin =.true. !Write in binary or not
```

9 Tutorial

In this section we illustrate using three examples how to execute the program, and discuss the meaning of the most important input variables.

!
The examples presented in this section were selected to quickly illustrate how the **stochasticGW** code works. For production runs the user should carefully investigate the convergence with respect to the grid size, spacing and other parameters.

9.1 H₂: Combined Stochastic and Deterministic treatment

In this example, we calculate the ionization potential of an H₂ molecule. Note that calculations for small molecules require relatively much more effort vs. the extremely large systems for which stochasticGW was developed.

The DFT estimate of the H_2 ionization potential is -10.3 eV, which is too low compared with the experimental result⁴ (-15.4 eV) and is corrected by the GW calculation in the next step. Before we can proceed with running the **STOCHASTICGW** code, we need the occupied wavefunctions, **wf.txt**, which is provided in **examples** directory. User can obtain it from other codes, such as Quantum ESPRESSO⁵ or others.

(i) running the **stochasticGW** code

```
The example INPUT file is:

pps
H.pw-mt_fhi.UPF
#

scratch_path
.

ekcut
15d0

nmctot
120

ntddft
-1

gamma
0.06

binary
F
```

 $^{^4\, \}texttt{http://webbook.nist.gov/cgi/cbook.cgi?ID=C1333740\&Mask=20}$

 $^{^{5}\,\}mathtt{http://www.quantum-espresso.org/wp-content/uploads/Doc/INPUT_PP.html}$

```
orb_indx

1

scale_vh

1

box
sym
```

- ! \rightarrow The user should be familiar with all the input variables listed here. Note specifically:
 - We used scale_vh=1 to expedite the calculation, although formally it needs to be 2.
 - We set ntddft=-1 to indicate that the time-dependent Hartree (RPA) calculation of the effect of W_P should be <u>deterministic</u>, using here the single occupied state.

As explained in Section 5, the working directory should contain and INPUT and several other input files: wf.txt, cnt.ini, counter.inp, random.inp as well as the PP/ pseudopotential directory that needs to contain (at least) the H.pw-mt_fhi.UPF hydrogen pseudopotential file.

For simplicity we assume that the working directory contains also the sgw.x executable.

The stochasticGW calculation is then run; for example, to run on 120 MPI cores, write

```
mpirun -n 120 ./sgw.x >& log
```

The log file prints all parameters and information about all files as well as the starting point energy in Hartree units:

```
<phi|H|phi> from orbital in orb.txt is: -0.378696352
    vs. eorb as read: -0.378631353
```

This orbital energy slightly differs from the DFT input value; this is because the Hamiltonian in the underlying DFT calculation slightly differs from the Hamiltonian constructed in stochasticGW.

After the calculation finishes, we look at the end of the log file where the quasiparticle energy is provided :

```
120 -0.582239 0.012778 MC, E_qp +-stat.err
```

This value, which is the solution of Eq. 5, is in the right ballpark (-15.8 ± 0.3 eV compared to the experimental value of -15.4 eV), but shows significant statistical error. Since the statistical error is generally proportional to $1/\sqrt{\text{nmctot}}$, it is necessary to use nmctot $\sim 120 * (0.3/0.05)^2 \sim 4000$ Monte Carlo iterations for a statistical accuracy of 0.05 eV.

The program finds the ε that solves Eq. 5 self-consistently, automatically, i.e., since $\Sigma(\omega)$ is given at all frequencies the program searches for the energy (ε)

where Eq. 5 is fulfilled (or more precisely, the it searches for the closest solution to the Kohn-Sham energy).

It is instructive however to graphically do this procedure, by plotting the real-part of the self-energy from the SigW.txt located here in the GW_OUTPUT.O directory (where O is the number in the counter.inp file).

The SigW.txt file has a header that, for completeness, essentially duplicates the output in the log file, as presented in Section 7. The header was presented in the 9.

After the header the frequency dependent polarization part of the self-energy is given. We concentrate on the first and second columns showing to the frequency (w) and the real part of the self-energy (SigW_real, i.e., $\Sigma_p(\omega)$).

Specifically, we use gnuplot⁶ to find the graphical solution to Eq. 5. As mentioned, lines starting with # are ignored. In the GW_OUTPUT.X directory start gnuplot by typing

gnuplot

and (inside gnuplot) write:

```
gnuplot> set xrange [-1.0:0.0]
gnuplot> set yrange [-1.0:0.0]
gnuplot> p 'SigW.txt' u 1:(-0.37870+0.64690+$2+0.42476) w 1, x w 1
```

The first two lines set the range of the horizontal ω axis (x) and vertical axis to be in a large region in which the quasiparticle energy is expected.

The third line plots the right hand side of Eq. 5, $\varepsilon_{\rm KS} + \left\langle \phi \left| \hat{\Sigma}_X + \hat{\Sigma}_P \left(\varepsilon \right) - \hat{v}_{xc} \right| \phi \right\rangle =$ (-0.37870+0.64690+\$2+0.42476). Here, \$2 stands for the second column of the file, SigW_real= $\Sigma_P(\omega)$. The remaining values in the brackets are the Kohn-Sham orbital energy, exchange part of the self-energy, and negative of the exchange-correlation potential energy, all given in the header.

The second plotted line is the frequency (its values are identical to the horizontal x axis). The crossing of these two curves occurs at the quasiparticle energy, as shown below.

By zooming in we see that the intersection occurs at $\varepsilon = -0.582 \, \text{Hartree} = -15.8 \, \text{eV}$, i.e., close to the value found in the SigW.txt file.

!

If the Kohn-Sham eigenvalue is very far from the predicted quasiparticle energy or the self-energy is very oscillatory, then check the results graphically, since there could be several graphical solutions to Eq. 5.

The calculation should now be repeated with a higher value of nmctot to see how the statistical error decreases with the number of MC samples.

In the production runs, carefully check the value of the energy broadening parameter gamma.

9.2 H₂: Extracting wavefunctions from Quantum ESPRESSO and running GW/PBE

In this example, we generate wavefunctions from Quantum ESPRESSO and prepare them as input for SGW using the two options described in Section 8.1.

⁶ http://www.gnuplot.info/

(i) running Quantum ESPRESSO calculations

The example input file h2.in for pw.x is:

```
&control
    calculation = 'scf'
    restart_mode='from_scratch'
    outdir='./'
    wfcdir='./'
    prefix='h2'
    wf_collect=.true.
    pseudo_dir='./'
&system
    ibrav = 0
   nat = 2,
   ntyp = 1,
    ecutwfc=20
    ecutrho=35
    nbnd=2
    input_dft='pbe'
    assume_isolated='mt'
 &electrons
   electron_maxstep = 100
   conv_thr = 1.0d-10
   mixing_mode = 'plain'
   mixing_beta = 0.7
   mixing_ndim = 8
   diagonalization = 'davidson'
   diago_david_ndim = 4
   diago_full_acc = .true.
CELL_PARAMETERS bohr
   15 0.0 0.0
   0.0 15 0.0
   0.0 0.0 15
ATOMIC SPECIES
   H 1.0
            H.pw-mt_fhi.UPF
ATOMIC_POSITIONS {Bohr}
  H 6.8 7.5 7.5
      8.2 7.5 7.5
K_POINTS automatic
   1 1 1 0 0 0
```

 $! \rightarrow pw2bgw.x$ cannot be used along with 'K_POINTS gamma' option of Quantum ESPRESSO. So even if we are carrying out gamma point calculation, the k-point grid must be specified. To run the Quantum ESPRESSO calculation, write

```
pw.x -i h2.in
```

Example output of the pw.x calculation is stored in output_qe file. It contains the orbital energies obtained with Quantum ESPRESSO, given by:

```
highest occupied, lowest unoccupied level (ev): -10.3360 -0.9439
```

9.2.1 (ii) running pw2bgw.x utility

The input file in example is given by pw2bgw.in:

```
&input_pw2bgw
    prefix = 'h2'
    real_or_complex = 2
    wfng_flag=.true.
    rhog_flag=.true.
/
```

Running the command:

```
pw2bgw.x -i pw2bgw.in
```

will generate two files: WFN and RHO, which contains the wavefunction and electron density in BerkeleyGW format. Example output is given in output pw2bgw.

(iii) running bgw2sgw.x utility

The input file in example is given by bgw2sgw.inp. The values of input files are given by:

```
input_wfn_file WFN
input_rho_file RHO

output_rho_file dens.txt
output_wfn_file wf.bin
output_structure_file cnt.ini
precision_high
```

The actual input file also contains description of the variables. This utility will generate wf.bin, dens.txt and cnt.ini files in the format required by the
!

TOCHRSTICGW code. The cnt.ini file generated by bgw2sgw.x is centered around the middle of the box. Therefore, it should be used along with option:

box pos

in the INPUT file while running **STOCHASTICGW**.

(iv) running stochasticGW

To run the **STOCHASTICGW** calculation, copy the files wf.bin and cnt.ini to the directory of thw **STOCHASTICGW** run. The example input file is given:

```
pps
H.pw-mt_fhi.UPF
```

```
#
scratch_path
ekcut
15d0
nmctot
120
ntddft
-1
gamma
0.06
binary
orb_indx
scale_vh
1
functional
101 130
box
pos
The output can be interpreted similar to example 1. A reference output is pro-
vided in log option1. And the quasiparticle energy is provided by:
      120
                -0.562074
                                  0.012720
                                                        MC, E_qp
                                                                          +-stat.err
i.e.-15.3 \pm 0.3 eV, compared to the experimental value of -15.4 eV.
```

(v) generating wavefunction using our Fortran code

We also provide an alternative option for generating wavefunction file from Quantum ESPRESSO output. To use that, simply modify the lines in qe2sgw.f90, and compile it with Fortran compiler, then run the resulting executable in the directory containing the Quantum ESPRESSO run. You may choose to produce either in binary of text format. It will generate cnt.ini and wavefunction files. Note that the cnt.ini generated using this code is centered around the origin. So STOCHASTICGW should be ran with the option:

box sym

A reference output is provided in log_option1. Quasiparticle energy calculated in this way is given by:

i.e, -15.25 ± 0.3 eV.

9.3 C_{60} : Fully stochastic calculation

Here we discuss a fully stochastic calculation of the electron affinity of C_{60} ; this system is already big enough to profit from the stochastic treatment, since using all the 120 occupied states for the time propagation is tedious and won't bring a large speedup over conventional approaches. We also illustrate how the timing and accuracy depends on the number of stochastic states (ntddft), on the energy broadening parameter (gamma), and on the nxi and segment_fraction parameters,

The user should first finish the previous example and get familiar with preparation of the input files and the **stochasticGW** output.

We use a grid of 80^3 points, with a spacing of $0.4\,\mathrm{Bohr}$. The LDA estimate of electron affinity is $0.1645\,\mathrm{Hartree}$, i.e., $4.48\,\mathrm{eV}$, which is too high compared with the experimental value of $2.69\,\mathrm{eV}$.

You should copy the files in the example directory \sim /sGW_v2/examples/C60 to your desired directory

```
mkdir ~/mygwrun
   cd ~/mygwrun
   cp ^{\sim}/sGW_v2/examples/C60/* .
   cp ~/sGW_v2/src/sgw.x .
   cp -r ~/sGW_v2/PP/ .
The INPUT file is now:
06-C.LDA.fhi
scratch_path
ekcut
20d0
nmctot
840
ntddft
8
units nuc
bohr
gamma
0.06
binary
orb_indx
121
flg_dyn
box
sym
```

⁷ https://aip.scitation.org/doi/abs/10.1063/1.4881421?journalCode=jcp

Note that for the LUMO energy we use a TDDFT effective potential instead of an RPA (i.e., we set flg_dyn to be T). As explained in Ref. 1, this yields a much better LUMO energy.

In addition, the wf.bin waveufunction file for C_{60} is quite large (almost 1 gigabyte) so it is stored separately and you should download a zipped version of it from

http://www.chem.ucla.edu/dept/Faculty/dxn/pdf/wf.bin.gz and then write

```
gunzip wf.bin.gz
```

The calculation should be again done via mpi, e.g.,

```
mpirun -n 840 ./sgw.x >& log &
```

or, if one wants to use a lower number of cores and get the same exact numbers, use, e.g.,

```
mpirun -n 120 ./sgw.x >& log &
```

albeit the calculation will be then approximately 840/120=7 times slower.

At the end of the calculation, the output file shows a quasiparticle energy (real and imaginary parts) of

```
840 -0.096131 0.001864 MC, E_qp +-stat.err
```

so the real part of the GW quasi-particle energy is $-0.096131 \, a.u. = -2.62 \, eV$ with a statistical error of 0.00186 $\, a.u. = 0.05 \, eV$. This value is very close to the 2.69 $\, eV$ experimental electron affinity of a single C_{60} .

When run on a modern supercomputer, the wall time of the calculation (read in the last few lines of the log file) was only 2994 sec=0.83 hr per each iteration.

For verification, we also ran, beyond this first run, several runs with different parameters: an increased number of stochastic TDDFT states $\mathtt{ntddft=16}$, a reduced energy width $\gamma = 0.04$ and different combination of the stochastic fragment parameters, $\mathtt{nxi=5000-20}$,000 and $\mathtt{segment_fraction=0.001}$, 0.003. There was essentially no change in the results, and the real-part of the quasiparticle energy changed by only 0.03 eV, i.e., less than the statistical error.

Finally, we also ran the RPA simulations (by removing the flg_dyn parameter, which defaults to .false.), leading to a much deeper LUMO,

```
840 -0.124621 0.001648 MC, E_qp +-stat.err i.e., -0.124621 a.u.=-3.39eV.
```

10 Acknowledgements

We are grateful for support by multiple sources.

This work was supported by the Center for Computational Study of Excited-State Phenomena in Energy Materials at the Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, which is funded by the U.S. Department of Energy, Office of Science, Basic Energy Sciences, Materials Sciences and Engineering Division under Contract No. DE-AC02-05CH11231, as part of the Computational Materials Sciences Program.

The work was further supported by the National Science Foundation, grants DMR-1611382 and CHE-1112500 of Daniel Neuhauser, and CHE-1465064 of Eran Rabani.

The Israel Science Foundation supported the work through grant 189/14 to Roi Baer and through a FIRST Program grant (1700/14) to Roi Baer and Eran Rabani. Roi Baer also acknowledges support by the Binational Science Foundation, Grant 2015687.

The code was tested and optimized within the $XSEDE^8$ computational project TG-CHE170058.

The <code>stochasticGW</code> code was mostly self-written, but it has several publicly available routines, primarily the KISS random number generator of George Marsaglia; we use, and slightly modified, the implementation of Jean-Michel Brankart. The <code>stochasticGW</code> package also includes several spline routines from Numerical Recipes.⁹

⁸ J. Towns, T. Cockerill, M. Dahan, I. Foster, K. Gaither, A. Grimshaw, V. Hazlewood, S. Lathrop, D. Lifka, G. D. Peterson, et al. Xsede: accelerating scientific discovery. Comput. Sci. Eng. 16,62 (2014). https://aip.scitation.org/doi/abs/10.1109/MCSE.2014.80

⁹ http://www.nr.com/