Khoo & Phillips

Start of Block: Consent

Consent   
  
Please consider this information carefully before deciding whether to participate in this research.  
The purpose of this research is to examine which factors influence social judgment and decision-making. You will be asked to make judgments about individuals and actions in social scenarios. We are simply interested in your judgment. The study will take less than 5 minutes to complete, and you will receive $0.25 on Amazon Mechanical Turk. There are no anticipated risks associated with participating in this study. The effects of participating should be comparable to those you would ordinarily experience from viewing a computer monitor and using a mouse or keyboard for a similar amount of time. At the end of the study, we will provide an explanation of the questions that motivate this line of research and will describe the potential implications.  
  
Your participation in this study is completely voluntary and you may refuse to participate or you may  choose to withdraw at any time without penalty or loss of benefits to which you are otherwise entitled. Your participation in this study will remain confidential. No personally identifiable information will be associated with your data. Also, all analyses of the data will be averaged across all the participants, so your individual responses will never be specifically analyzed.   
  
  
If you have questions or concerns about your participation or payment or want to request a summary of research findings, please contact the research manager: Catherine Holland, catherineholland@fas.harvard.edu. For any other problems related to this study, you may also contact the faculty member supervising this work: Fiery Cushman, cushman@fas.harvard.edu.  For questions, concerns, suggestions, or complaints that have not been or cannot be addressed by the researcher, or to report research-related harm, please contact the contact the Committee on the Use of Human Subjects in Research at Harvard University, 1350 Massachusetts Avenue, Suite 935, Cambridge, MA 02138. Phone: 617-496- CUHS (2847). Email: cuhs@harvard.edu.  
Please print or save a copy of this form for your records.  
Agreement:   
The nature and purpose of this research have been sufficiently explained and I agree to participate in this study. I understand that I am free to withdraw at any time without incurring any penalty.Please consent by clicking the button below to continue. Otherwise, please exit the study at this time.

End of Block: Consent

Start of Block: Instructions

Instr You will be presented with a short story and then will be asked questions about it. Please read the story carefully. When you are ready to begin, you can go to the next page.

End of Block: Instructions

Start of Block: MODAL-C

v\_modc The police are on the trail of Fat Tony, a local mobster. This morning, they learn of a rumor that Fat Tony has died at the docks.   
The Chief of the Police assigns Inspector A to examine the evidence at the docks. Meanwhile, the District Attorney assigns Inspector B to review the footage from the security camera at the docks.  
Inspector A takes a good look at the evidence down by the docks, and concludes that it suggests, but does not prove, that Fat Tony died at the docks. The Chief calls Inspector A at the docks and asks him, “What have you found?”  
Inspector A replies, “Fat Tony could have died at the docks.”  
Meanwhile, Inspector B reviews the security camera footage and concludes that the footage proves that Fat Tony did not die at the docks. The District Attorney calls Inspector B and asks him, “What have you found?”  
Inspector B replies, “Fat Tony couldn’t have died at the docks.”

prom\_modc Now please answer the the following questions:

|  |
| --- |
|  |

inc\_modc Remember, Inspector A and Inspector B have looked at different evidence, and have made different claims. We want to know if you think that at least one of the inspector's claims must be false, or if you think it’s possible for both of their claims to be true.  
Please tell us to what extent you agree or disagree with the following statement:  
At least one of the inspector's claims must be false.

* Completely disagree (1)
* (2)
* (3)
* In between (4)
* (5)
* (6)
* Completely agree (7)

Time\_modc Timing

First Click (1)

Last Click (2)

Page Submit (3)

Click Count (4)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel1\_modc Which is more relevant in the conversation between the Chief and Inspector A?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel2\_modc Which is more relevant in the conversation between the District Attorney and Inspector B?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

End of Block: MODAL-C

Start of Block: THINKS-C

v\_thinkC The police are on the trail of Fat Tony, a local mobster. This morning, they learn of a rumor that Fat Tony has died at the docks.   
The Chief of the Police assigns Inspector A to examine the evidence at the docks. Meanwhile, the District Attorney assigns Inspector B to review the footage from the security camera at the docks.  
Inspector A takes a good look at the evidence down by the docks, and concludes that it suggests, but does not prove, that Fat Tony died at the docks. The Chief calls Inspector A at the docks and asks him, “What have you found?”  
Inspector A replies, “I think Fat Tony died at the docks.”  
Meanwhile, Inspector B reviews the security camera footage and concludes that the footage proves that Fat Tony did not die at the docks. The District Attorney calls Inspector B and asks him, “What have you found?”  
Inspector B replies, “I don't think Fat Tony died at the docks.”

prompt\_thinkC Now please answer the the following questions:

|  |
| --- |
|  |

inc\_thinkC Remember, Inspector A and Inspector B have looked at different evidence, and have made different claims. We want to know if you think that at least one of the inspector's claims must be false, or if you think it’s possible for both of their claims to be true.  
Please tell us to what extent you agree or disagree with the following statement:  
At least one of the inspector's claims must be false.

* Completely disagree (1)
* (2)
* (3)
* In between (4)
* (5)
* (6)
* Completely agree (7)

time\_thinkC Timing

First Click (1)

Last Click (2)

Page Submit (3)

Click Count (4)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel1\_thinkC Which is more relevant in the conversation between the Chief and Inspector A?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel2\_thinkC Which is more relevant in the conversation between the District Attorney and Inspector B?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

End of Block: THINKS-C

Start of Block: NONMODAL-C

vign\_nonc The police are on the trail of Fat Tony, a local mobster. This morning, they learn of a rumor that Fat Tony has died at the docks.   
The Chief of the Police assigns Inspector A to examine the evidence at the docks. Meanwhile, the District Attorney assigns Inspector B to review the footage from the security camera at the docks.  
Inspector A takes a good look at the evidence down by the docks, and concludes that it suggests, but does not prove, that Fat Tony died at the docks. The Chief calls Inspector A at the docks and asks him, “What have you found?”  
  
Inspector A replies, “Fat Tony died at the docks.”  
Meanwhile, Inspector B reviews the security camera footage and concludes that Fat Tony did not die at the docks. The District Attorney calls Inspector B and asks him, “What have you found?”  
Inspector B replies, “Fat Tony did not die at the docks.”

prom\_nonc Now please answer the the following questions:

|  |
| --- |
|  |

inc\_nonc Remember, Inspector A and Inspector B have looked at different evidence, and have made different claims. We want to know if you think that at least one of the inspector's claims must be false, or if you think it’s possible for both of their claims to be true.  
Please tell us to what extent you agree or disagree with the following statement:  
At least one of the inspector's claims must be false.

* Completely disagree (1)
* (2)
* (3)
* In between (4)
* (5)
* (6)
* Completely agree (7)

Time\_nonc Timing

First Click (1)

Last Click (2)

Page Submit (3)

Click Count (4)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel1\_nonc Which is more relevant in the conversation between the Chief and Inspector A?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel2\_nonc Which is more relevant in the conversation between the District Attorney and Inspector B?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

End of Block: NONMODAL-C

Start of Block: MODAL-R

v\_modr The police are on the trail of Fat Tony, a local mobster. This morning, they learn of a rumor that Fat Tony has died at the docks.   
The Chief of the Police assigns Inspector A to examine the evidence at the docks. Meanwhile, the District Attorney assigns Inspector B to review the footage from the security camera at the docks.  
Inspector A takes a good look at the evidence down by the docks, and concludes that it suggests, but does not prove, that Fat Tony died at the docks. Afterwards, he goes home. That evening, Inspector A and his wife watch the Chief of Police talking with reporters on TV. The reporters on the news ask the Chief what his investigation had found.   
  
The Chief tells the reporters: “Fat Tony could have died at the docks.”  
Inspector A’s wife knows that Inspector A was examining the evidence at the docks and so she asks him, “Is that right?”  
Inspector A replies, “What the Chief said is true.”  
Meanwhile, Inspector B reviews the security camera footage and concludes that the footage proves that Fat Tony did not die at the docks. That evening he watches the same TV broadcast with his wife, and they also hear the Chief tell the reporters, “Fat Tony could have died at the docks.”   
Inspector B’s wife knows that Inspector B was examining the evidence at the docks and so she asks him, “Is that right?”  
Inspector B replies, “What the Chief said is false.”

prom\_modr Now please answer the the following questions:

|  |
| --- |
|  |

true\_modr Remember, Inspector A and Inspector B have looked at different evidence, and have made different claims. We want to know if you think that at least one of the inspector's claims must be false, or if you think it’s possible for both of their claims to be true.  
Please tell us to what extent you agree or disagree with the following statement:  
At least one of the inspector's claims must be false.

* Completely disagree (1)
* (2)
* (3)
* In between (4)
* (5)
* (6)
* Completely agree (7)

time\_modr Timing

First Click (1)

Last Click (2)

Page Submit (3)

Click Count (4)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel1\_modr Which is more relevant in the conversation between Inspector A's wife and Inspector A?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel2\_modr Which is more relevant in the conversation between Inspector B's wife and Inspector B?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

End of Block: MODAL-R

Start of Block: THINKS-R

v\_thinkR The police are on the trail of Fat Tony, a local mobster. This morning, they learn of a rumor that Fat Tony has died at the docks.   
The Chief of the Police assigns Inspector A to examine the evidence at the docks. Meanwhile, the District Attorney assigns Inspector B to review the footage from the security camera at the docks.  
Inspector A takes a good look at the evidence down by the docks, and concludes that it suggests, but does not prove, that Fat Tony died at the docks. Afterwards, he goes home. That evening, Inspector A and his wife watch the Chief of Police talking with reporters on TV. The reporters on the news ask the Chief what his investigation had found.   
  
The Chief tells the reporters: “I think Fat Tony died at the docks.”  
Inspector A’s wife knows that Inspector A was examining the evidence at the docks and so she asks him, “Is that right?”  
Inspector A replies, “What the Chief said is true.”  
Meanwhile, Inspector B reviews the security camera footage and concludes that the footage proves that Fat Tony did not die at the docks. That evening he watches the same TV broadcast with his wife, and they also hear the Chief tell the reporters, “Fat Tony could have died at the docks.”   
Inspector B’s wife knows that Inspector B was examining the evidence at the docks and so she asks him, “Is that right?”  
Inspector B replies, “What the Chief said is false.”

prompt\_thinkR Now please answer the the following questions:

|  |
| --- |
|  |

inc\_thinkR Remember, Inspector A and Inspector B have looked at different evidence, and have made different claims. We want to know if you think that at least one of the inspector's claims must be false, or if you think it’s possible for both of their claims to be true.  
Please tell us to what extent you agree or disagree with the following statement:  
At least one of the inspector's claims must be false.

* Completely disagree (1)
* (2)
* (3)
* In between (4)
* (5)
* (6)
* Completely agree (7)

time\_thinkR Timing

First Click (1)

Last Click (2)

Page Submit (3)

Click Count (4)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel1\_thinkR Which is more relevant in the conversation between Inspector A's wife and Inspector A?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel2\_thinkR Which is more relevant in the conversation between Inspector B's wife and Inspector B?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

End of Block: THINKS-R

Start of Block: NONMODAL-R

vign\_nonr The police are on the trail of Fat Tony, a local mobster. This morning, they learn of a rumor that Fat Tony has died at the docks.   
The Chief of the Police assigns Inspector A to examine the evidence at the docks. Meanwhile, the District Attorney assigns Inspector B to review the footage from the security camera at the docks.  
Inspector A takes a good look at the evidence down by the docks, and concludes that Fat Tony died at the docks.  Afterwards, he goes home. That evening, Inspector A and his wife watch the Chief of Police talking with reporters on TV. The reporters on the news ask the Chief what his investigation had found.   
The Chief tells the reporters: “Fat Tony died at the docks.”  
Inspector A’s wife knows that Inspector A was examining the evidence at the docks and so she asks him, “Is that right?”  
Inspector A replies, “What the Chief said is true.”  
Meanwhile, Inspector B reviews the security camera footage and concludes Fat Tony did not die at the docks. That evening he watches the same TV broadcast with his wife, and they also hear the Chief tell the reporters, “Fat Tony died at the docks.”   
Inspector B’s wife knows that Inspector B was examining the evidence at the docks and so she asks him, “Is that right?”  
Inspector B replies, “What the Chief said is false.”

prom\_nonr Now please answer the the following questions:

|  |
| --- |
|  |

true\_nonr Remember, Inspector A and Inspector B have looked at different evidence, and have made different claims. We want to know if you think that at least one of the inspector's claims must be false, or if you think it’s possible for both of their claims to be true.  
Please tell us to what extent you agree or disagree with the following statement:  
At least one of the inspector's claims must be false.

* Completely Disagree (1)
* (2)
* (3)
* In between (4)
* (5)
* (6)
* Completely agree (7)

time\_nonr Timing

First Click (1)

Last Click (2)

Page Submit (3)

Click Count (4)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel1\_nonr Which is more relevant in the conversation between Inspector A's wife and Inspector A?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

rel2\_nonr Which is more relevant in the conversation between Inspector B's wife and Inspector B?

* What the evidence at the docks reveals about Fat Tony. (1)
* What the security camera footage reveals about Fat Tony. (2)

End of Block: NONMODAL-R

Start of Block: Indexical-C

vign-indc The police are on the trail of Fat Tony, a local mobster. This morning, they learn of a rumor that Fat Tony has died at the docks.  
The Chief of the Police assigns Inspector A to examine the evidence at the docks. Meanwhile, the District Attorney assigns Inspector B to review the footage from the security camera at the docks.  
Inspector A takes a good look at the evidence down by the docks, and concludes that it suggests, but does not prove, that Fat Tony died at the docks. Later that evening, Inspector A gets a call from the Chief. The Chief knows that certificates of appreciation are being given to officers who have served on the police force for at least twenty years, so he asks Inspector A, "How long have you served on the police force?"  
Inspector A replies, “I have served on the police force for twenty years.”  
Meanwhile, Inspector B reviews the security camera footage and concludes that the footage proves that Fat Tony did not die at the docks. Later that evening, Inspector B gets a call from the District Attorney. The District Attorney also knows that certificates of appreciation are being given to officers who have served on the police force for at least twenty years, so he asks Inspector B, "How long have you served on the police force?"  
Inspector B replies, “I have not served on the police force for twenty years.”

prom\_indc Now please answer the the following questions:

|  |
| --- |
|  |

true\_indc Remember, Inspector A and Inspector B have made different claims about working on the police force. We want to know if you think that at least one of the inspector's claims must be false, or if you think it’s possible for both of their claims to be true.  
Please tell us to what extent you agree or disagree with the following statement:  
At least one of the inspector's claims must be false.

* Completely disagree (1)
* (2)
* (3)
* In between (4)
* (5)
* (6)
* Completely agree (7)

time\_indc Timing

First Click (1)

Last Click (2)

Page Submit (3)

Click Count (4)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |

rel1\_indc Who does Inspector A think has served on the police force for twenty years?

* Inspector A (1)
* Inspector B (2)
* The Chief (3)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |

rel2\_indc Who does Inspector B think has **not** served on the police force for twenty years?

* Inspector A (1)
* Inspector B (2)
* The Chief (3)

End of Block: Indexical-C

Start of Block: Indexical-R

vign\_inda The police are on the trail of Fat Tony, a local mobster. This morning, they learn of a rumor that Fat Tony has died at the docks.  
The Chief of the Police assigns Inspector A to examine the evidence at the docks. Meanwhile, the District Attorney assigns Inspector B to review the footage from the security camera at the docks.  
Inspector A takes a good look at the evidence down by the docks, and concludes that it suggests, but does not prove, that Fat Tony died at the docks. Afterwards, he goes home. That evening, Inspector A and his wife watch the Chief of Police talking with reporters on TV. The reporter on the news knows that certificates of appreciation are being given to officers who have served on the police force for at least twenty years, so she asks the Chief, "How long have you served on the police force?"  
  
The Chief tells the reporters: “I have served on the police force for twenty years.”  
Inspector A’s wife knows that Inspector A is on the police force, and so she asks him, “Is that right?”  
Inspector A replies, “What the Chief said is true.”  
Meanwhile, Inspector B reviews the security camera footage and concludes that the footage proves that Fat Tony did not die at the docks. That evening he watches the same TV broadcast with his wife, and they also hear the Chief say to the reporter, “I have served on the police force for twenty years.”  
Inspector B’s wife knows that Inspector B was also on the police force, and so she asks him, “Is that right?”  
Inspector B replies, “What the Chief said is false.”

prom\_inda Now please answer the the following questions:

|  |
| --- |
|  |

true\_inda Remember, Inspector A and Inspector B have made different claims about what the chief said about working on the police force. We want to know if you think that at least one of the inspector's claims must be false, or if you think it’s possible for both of their claims to be true.  
Please tell us to what extent you agree or disagree with the following statement:  
At least one of the inspector's claims must be false.

* Completely disagree (1)
* (2)
* (3)
* In between (4)
* (5)
* (6)
* Completely agree (7)

time\_inda Timing

First Click (1)

Last Click (2)

Page Submit (3)

Click Count (4)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |

rel1\_inda Who does Inspector A think has served on the police force for twenty years?

* Inspector A (1)
* Inspector B (2)
* The Chief (3)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Page Break |  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |

rel2\_inda Who does Inspector B think has **not** served on the police force for twenty years?

* Inspector A (1)
* Inspector B (2)
* The Chief (3)

End of Block: Indexical-R

Start of Block: Demographics

DemoInstr   
     
 In this part of the experiment, we'd like you to answer a series of background questions.  
     
(Your answers to these questions are very helpful, and are for research purposes only. Remember that your responses are entirely anonymous. If you feel uncomfortable with a question in this section, you can leave the question blank.)

Age   
 What is your age?

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Gender   
 What is your gender?

* Male (1)
* Female (2)
* Other (3) \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Ethnicity   
 What is your ethnicity?

* Black / African American (1)
* Hispanic / Latino (2)
* Asian / Pacific Islander (3)
* Native American / American Indian (4)
* White / Caucasian (5)
* Other (6) \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |

Education Please indicate the highest level of education completed.

* Grammar School (1)
* High School or equivalent (2)
* Vocational/Technical School (2 year) (3)
* Some College (4)
* College Graduate (4 year) (5)
* Master's Degree (MS) (6)
* Doctoral Degree (PhD) (7)
* Professional Degree (MD, JD, etc.) (8)
* Other (9)

SES Think of this ladder as representing where people stand in the United States. At the top of the ladder are the people who have the most money, most education, and most respected jobs. At the bottom are the people who have the least money, least education, and least respected jobs or no job. The higher up you are on this ladder, the closer you are to the people at the very top, and the lower you are, the closer you are to the people at the very bottom.  
  
   
   
 ***Where would you place yourself on this ladder? Please select the rung where you think you stand at this time in your life, relative to other people in the United States.***

* Rung 10 (Top Rung) (1)
* Rung 9 (2)
* Rung 8 (3)
* Rung 7 (4)
* Rung 6 (5)
* Rung 5 (6)
* Rung 4 (7)
* Rung 3 (8)
* Rung 2 (9)
* Rung 1 (Bottom Rung) (10)

End of Block: Demographics