**THE STUDENT TEACHERS’ VERBAL AND**

**NON-VERBAL REINFORCEMENT DURING TEACHING PRACTICE IN MICROTEACHING CLASS**

**A Thesis Proposal**



By:

Di Adha Wulandari

NIM D75215087

**ENGLISH TEACHER EDUCATION DEPARTMENT**

**FACULTY OF TARBIYAH AND TEACHERS TRAINING**

**SUNAN AMPEL STATE ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY**

**SURABAYA**

**2019**

1. **Research Background**

A teacher is expected to have good teaching skills in order to conduct an effective teaching and learning process. Uzer Usman stated that there are eight basic teaching skills that must be mastered by a teacher[[1]](#footnote-1). Those are questioning, reinforcement, variation, explaining, close and set induction, coaching small group discussion, classroom management, teaching small group and individual. These eight basic teaching skills play important role in a successful teaching and learning.

One ofnecessary basic teaching skills is reinforcement. Slavin stated that reinforcement is any consequence that strengthens behavior[[2]](#footnote-2). Similarly, Uzer Usman defined reinforcement as teacher’s positive response towards students’ behavior[[3]](#footnote-3). To put it simply, reinforcement is a skill to response students’ behavior during teaching and learning process. Psychologically, everyone wants to be appreciated on what they have done so does student. In teaching and learning process, reinforcement is given as an appreciation or positive response of the teacher towards student’s intended behavior, participation, and achievement. When a student receives reinforcement from a teacher such as praise words, then the student will be happy because his/her work is appreciated by the teacher. As the result, his/her happiness of being appreciated will increase his/her willingness to study more in order to get the same positive response from the teacher. It is essential to make students aware of certain desirable behavior that makes them received reinforcement. Once students realized it, they will perform the intended behavior again in the future. The best time to give reinforcement is as soon as the student performed desirable behavior. So that, the student will know which behavior or response is reinforced.

Reinforcement is divided into two called verbal and non-verbal reinforcement[[4]](#footnote-4). Verbal reinforcement is given through words or sentences as like complementing students or congratulating them for what they have done. While, non-verbal reinforcement is given through gesture, proximity, activity, token/symbol, contact and partial. Irawan stated that teacher must owned reinforcement skill because reinforcement provides support for students to improve their performance[[5]](#footnote-5). In addition, reinforcement skill is important for teachers, as it can increase students’ motivation and active participation in learning which can help them to have an effective teaching-learning. It is supported by Moore who explained that reinforcement is a long recognized and essential skill for classroom teacher[[6]](#footnote-6). It means that reinforcement is one of important aspects to support learning process run well. Moreover, in teaching learning process there are some interactions that happen in classroom management. The interaction among the teachers and the students can be built by giving punishment, reward, encouragement and reinforcement. Interaction that happen will make situation in classroom can be controlled and managed, because it shows the communication and feedback each other. It is clear stated that reinforcement is one kind of interaction in the classroom, so that the teacher should know how to use interaction especially in giving reinforcement[[7]](#footnote-7).

In microteaching class, teacher candidates are trained basic teaching skills including reinforcement. Here, microteaching program is proposed as a program to train the teacher candidates about basic teaching skills and teaching competences[[8]](#footnote-8). This program enables them to learn and practice various skills in teaching. Moreover, the teacher candidates can gain sensation of experiencing a real practice teaching through microteaching. In line with it, Tarbiyah and Teacher Training Faculty conducted PPL (Program Pengalaman Langsung) which commonly known as *peer teaching, teaching practice* or *microteaching[[9]](#footnote-9)*. According to Pedoman Praktik Pengalaman (PPL) which published on 2018 by Tarbiyah and Teacher Training Faculty of UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, PPL or teaching practice is one of program that made to apply all the teaching theories from the previous semester in a real-time school condition and situation[[10]](#footnote-10). Ambili Remesh viewed microteaching as a training technique for teacher to learn teaching skills[[11]](#footnote-11). Microteaching itself is divided into two types namely PPL 1 which also well-known as peer-teaching, teaching practice or microteaching and PPL 2 or internship program where candidate of teacher faced real classroom teaching. This program is held in sixth semester. The number of students in each class is about 12 to 15 students and duration for having teaching practice in microteaching class is only around 20 minutes. Students who enroll teaching practice class are called student-teachers[[12]](#footnote-12).

Based on researcher’s previous experience as the preliminary data, during teaching practice program (PPL 1) academic year 2018/2019 in Microteaching class at UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, researcher found that most of student teachers had implemented reinforcement in their teaching practice. It could be seen from their teaching practice performance that was done by student teachers while practicing teaching practice in Microteaching class. During their teaching practice, student teachers who become the teacher gave reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal forms to their friends who play a role as students for all of them who performed positive behavior and participate in any activities. As the reinforcement, student teachers praised them by saying “you are very smart”, “good” and the like as verbal reinforcement. Likewise, student teachers gave the students snack, applause, smile and the like as non-verbal reinforcement.

In fact, student teachers’ performance in giving reinforcement still needs to be improved. Some student teachers who take a role as the teacher have not been able to give reinforcement optimally. It can be seen from their teaching practice performance. Researcher’s experiences, shows that some student teachers give reinforcement in inappropriate way. For example, student teachers who role as teacher praise certain student for his/her correct answer without mentioning certain name of the students there to make it clearer to whom that praise words (reinforcement) is given to. As the result, students are confused and feel not appreciated especially for student who give correct answer. Furthermore, if the same case happens in real classroom it may cause ineffective teaching-learning and students’ demotivation. So that, giving reinforcement appropriately is very important especially for student teachers as teacher to be in the future. Thus, English Teacher Education Departement (ETED) has accredited with A mark since 2015. It means that the students of ETED need to fulfill the expectation of upgraded teaching skills as like reinforcement.

As that problem occurred, it is essential to have further research on how verbal and non-verbal reinforcement is given by student teachers and it is also important for student teachers to become aware of the reinforcement role in teaching and learning. For this reason, researcher is interested on this phenomenon and is going to conduct a research on reinforcement specifically in English teaching-learning done by EFL student teachers’ during teaching practice (PPL 1) academic year 2019/2020 in microteaching class at ETED (English Teacher Education Department) of UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya. In the end, the result of this study is expected to give contribution to the development of student teachers’ basic teaching skills as teacher candidate including reinforcement. Besides, this research can be a stimulus for further researcher to conduct a research either in the same area or in different area with the present research.

Regarding to that issue, there are some researches that have been conducted by some researcher related to this topic. The first research is from Aulia Fitrianti, Zulaiha and Kustiono (2018), under the title *Type of Verbal and Non-Verbal Reinforcement Given by Teacher in Elementary School*[[13]](#footnote-13). This research is conducted to identify the forms of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by teacher during teaching in Elementary School along with its conversational fragment context (semantic and pragmatic) that show the use of reinforcement form in learning. The result of the study revealed that the reinforcement form that provided by the teacher is in forms of adjective verbal, numeral words, news sentence, and interjection word. Thus, non-verbal reinforcement given by teachers is in forms of gestures and expression movement. The reinforcement that is rarely provided by the teacher on its implementation is interjection form.

The second research entitled *An Analysis of Teachers’ Reinforcement toward Student’s Interaction in Teaching Speaking At SMPN 7 Padang* by Yuli Eka Putri (2017)[[14]](#footnote-14). The aims of this research is to describe types of reinforcement that are the most frequentl*y* used reinforcement in teaching speaking at SMPN 7 Padang. The result of this study show that the teacher used both verbal and non-verbal reinforcement in teaching speaking and non-verbal reinforcement is type of reinforcement that is most frequently used during teaching learning.

The third research is*Study of The Relationship between Student and Teachers In Terms Of Reinforcement in Primary Schools of The Allahabad[[15]](#footnote-15).* This research was done by Vivek Kumar Stephen and Dr. Prem Prabha Singh (2017). It was a journal article which published on *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science* in 2017. This research is mainly discussed about the relationship between teachers and students’ performance in term of reinforcement given by teachers in Primary school of Allabahad District. This research reported that there is a significant relationship between reinforcement and academic performance of the students of the Primary schools of the Allahabad district. The study suggests that, there should be enrichment for reinforcement programs which can involve teacher to deepen their knowledge on reinforcement.

The fourth research was done by N. N. S. Mandah1 and O. L. Gbarato (2016). It was a journal article which published on British Journal Of Education, Society and Behavioural Science in 2016. The title is *The Influence of Reinforcement Skill on Academic Performance of Secondary School Physic Students in Obio-Akpor Lga, Rivers State Nigeria[[16]](#footnote-16).* This research is mainly discussed about the effectiveness of the reinforcement skill in teaching and its influence on the academic performance of secondary school Physics students. The finding of this study reported that teachers’ reinforcement skill influences the academic performance in Physics by grabbing students’ attention, engaging students’ to participate actively in classroom activities, and improving students’ willingness in learning.

The difference between the previous researches with the upcoming research is focus, subject point of view and research location. In term of focus, the first study focuses on types of reinforcement based on its conversational fragments context. Similarly, the second previous research is dealing with types of reinforcement that are used by teacher especially in teaching speaking. On the other hand, focus of the third and fourth previous research is on the influence of reinforcement towards students’ academic performances but in different level of education. The third study examined the influence of reinforcement on students’ academic performance in Primary school of Allahabad District. In contrast, the fourth research specified reinforcement influence on the academic performance of secondary school Physics students.

Conversely, the upcoming research focuses on how verbal and non-verbal reinforcement is given by EFL student teachers. Besides, types of reinforcement given by EFL student teachers to student as individual and group. In addition, student response on the types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by student teacher will be discussed as well. The subject of this research is EFL student teacher in English Teacher Education Departement (ETED) at UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya who takes PPL 1 course in academic year 2019/2020 and stand in 6th semester. Microteaching class at ETED of UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya is chosen as location of the research. A qualitative research will be employed in this research and the instruments that will be used to gain the data are observation, interview and audiovisual material.

1. **Research Questions**

In relation to the research background previously outlined above, the problem of the research can be formulated as the following questions:

1. What are the types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by student teachers during teaching practice in Microteaching class?
2. How do student teachers give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement during teaching practice in Microteaching class?
3. What are students’ responses toward verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by student teachers during teaching practice in Microteaching class?
4. **Objectives of the Research**

Derived from formulated problem above, this research will be aimed to:

1. Find out the types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by student teachers during teaching practice in Micro Teaching class.
2. Describe the way student teachers give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement during teaching practice in Microteaching class.
3. Find out students’ responses toward verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by student teachers during teaching practice in Micro Teaching class.
4. **Significance of the Research**

The finding of the study is expected to give contribution for student, researcher and the other researcher. In particular, this study can be one of sources in recognizing and realizing one of teacher’s basic skills called reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal that must be mastered by a teacher.

For student who take PPL I program in 6th semester (student teacher), the finding of this study can be a reflection for them related to their performance in giving reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal form during teaching practice in Microteaching class. So, it can provide information and reflection on student teachers’ strength and weakness in giving reinforcement in their teaching practice. The findings of this research can be used either for student teachers who are taken as subject of the research or the candidate of student teachers in the next academic year. In addition, the finding of this research can also be guidance for student on how to give reinforcement appropriately in teaching and increase student’s awareness on the use of reinforcement during teaching and learning process.

For researcher, this research would give additional knowledge on how to give reinforcement in appropriate way and give new experience in conducting a research. Besides, the result of this research can be used as input for the researcher to be a professional teacher in the future.

For other researcher, the result of this research can be used as an input to conduct further research dealing with reinforcement either in practice teaching at Microteaching class or real teaching at school with different aspects.

Furthermore, the finding of this study can be used as input and reflection to upgrade student teachers’ skill and professional development in teaching as they will have internship program (PPL II) at school in the next academic year.

1. **Scope and Limitation**

Uzer Usman stated that there are eight teacher’s basic skills in teaching[[17]](#footnote-17). They are questioning, variation, explaining, set induction and closure, coaching small group discussion, classroom management, reinforcement and one-self teaching. However, the scope of this research is only on one of teacher’s basic skills in teaching namely reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal. Verbal reinforcement includes in form of words and sentences. While, non-verbal reinforcement covers reinforcement in forms of gesture, proximity, activity, symbol/token contact and partial. In relation to research questions, the researcher will focus on three things. First, the types of reinforcement that given by EFL student teachers is emphasized on verbal and non-verbal reinforcement which is specifically given to student as an individual and a group. Second, the way verbal and non-verbal reinforcement is given by the EFL student teachers during their teaching practice in Microteaching class. Third, student’s responses on types of reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal given by student teachers during teaching practice in microteaching class.

In addition, the reinforcement here belongs to teaching practice in English Language Learning. Specifically, the data is taken from students who do teaching practice in microteaching class through video recording to collect data on student teachers’ verbal and non-verbal reinforcement. Purposely, there will be eight videos from eight microteaching classes, so one video from each class. The data will be analyzed with theory from Uzer Usman about reinforcement.

Subject of this research is student teacher of the sixth semester at State Islamic University of Sunan Ampel Surabaya in academic year 2019/2020. The researcher will collect the data from several Microteaching class in academic year that have been mention above. The researcher is going to take 1 participant in each Microteaching class available at the time. Totally, there will be 8 student teachers taken as subject from all of 8 Microteaching classes.

1. **Definition of Key Terms**

In order to avoid misinterpretation on certain terms used in this research, the researcher provides and clarifies several definitions of some key terms in detail as the following:

1. Reinforcement

Reinforcement is any response both in verbal and non-verbal which modify students’ behavior in order to give feedback on their behavior either as a support or correction[[18]](#footnote-18). In this study, reinforcement means student teachers’ response as a teacher towards any behavior, achievement or activity which performed by their peers who play a role as student during teaching practice in Microteaching class both verbal and non-verbal.

1. Verbal reinforcement

Verbal reinforcement is kinds of reinforcement that expressed through verbal language. It can be in form of words such as good, yes, correct and the like[[19]](#footnote-19). In this study, verbal reinforcement is any response given by student teachers role as teacher in form of words or sentence.

1. Non-verbal reinforcement

Non-verbal reinforcement is kinds of reinforcement that expressed through non-verbal language such as smile, clapping, thumbs up and the like[[20]](#footnote-20). In this study, non-verbal reinforcement refers to any response given by student teachers role as teacher in form of gesture, proximity, activity, token/symbol, contact and partial.

1. Student Teacher

Garvey defines student teacher as college students who practice teaching skills in a short teaching exercise with limited number of learner and limited teaching objective[[21]](#footnote-21). Student teacher in this study can be defined as student of ETED of UINSA in the sixth semester who takes PPL I course in academic year 2019/2020 and do teaching practice in given duration which about 20 minutes in each section with their peer as students. There will be 12-15 student teachers in each microteaching class.

1. Teaching Practice

Teaching practice is a teaching by design in a situation and location that have been set up before which enable informal teaching practice to be conducted with other trainees acting as students and one of them will be the teacher, to formally assessed lesson[[22]](#footnote-22). The teaching practice in this research is defined as students’ experience in teaching as a teacher in the classroom. There are two teaching practice which is conducted by English Education Department. They are peer teaching (PPL I) which is done in Microteaching class during the sixth semester and real teaching which is done at school within two months long. However, this study is only focus on peer teaching (PPL I) academic year 2019/2020.

1. Microteaching

N. N. S. Mandah1 and O. L. Gbarato defined Microteaching as a process that offers trainee teachers the opportunity to acquire certain teaching skills in order to be competent in a teaching process[[23]](#footnote-23). Bell also defined that Microteaching is a chance for having students to practice peer teaching in order to get experience in creating lesson plan and delivering material[[24]](#footnote-24). In this study, microteaching is teaching practice program conducted by English Education Department of UINSA Surabaya and enrolled by Student of ETED in academic year 2019/2020. They will have 20 minutes for practice teaching and their friends as the students.

1. **Theoretical Framework**
2. Reinforcement

According to Uzer Usman, reinforcement is any response both in verbal and non-verbal which modify students’ behavior in order to give feedback on their behavior either as a support or correction[[25]](#footnote-25). In another word, reinforcement is a response towards behavior which can increase the possibility of repeating behavior. It is supported by Ratna Wilis Dahar who stated that behavior which reinforced is more likely to increase in term of frequency, scale, or probability to be repeated in the future[[26]](#footnote-26). Similarly, Budiningsih argue that reinforcement is an essential stimulus to give in order to enable feedback in form of words, praise, support or confession verbally and non-verbally which can make different impression to students[[27]](#footnote-27). Reinforcement that is delivered by teacher in the class will give new sensation for students as learner such as being more appreciated. The way teacher deliver it can show how sincere the teacher is in expressing reinforcement for students. Therefore, students’ will be more engage in teaching learning process. Gerson stated that giving reinforcement is a strategy to modify students’ behavior and reinforce students’ response in learning [[28]](#footnote-28). The use of reinforcement modifies students’ behavior positively as it makes students realized that certain behavior is desirable. Once they realized it, they tend to repeat the same or similar behavior later.

1. Purpose Of Giving Reinforcement

There are some purposes of giving reinforcement such as increase students’ attention in learning, make learning process easier, maintain students’ motivation, control students’ misbehavior, develop and manage one-self in learning, guide students to divergent thinking and self-initiative[[29]](#footnote-29).

1. Types of Reinforcement

Uzer Usman stated that reinforcement is divided into two namely verbal reinforcement and non-verbal reinforcement.

1. Verbal reinforcement

Verbal reinforcement is usually expressed in form of praising words, appreciation, agreement and the like. For instance, *good; very good; correct; smart; yes, a hundred for you !* [[30]](#footnote-30). Besides words, verbal reinforcement can also be given in form of sentence as like *you present the material well, you are talented student* and the like.

1. Non-verbal reinforcement

Non-verbal reinforcement do not use any kinds of expression like in verbal reinforcement instead of using reinforcement through gesture, proximity, contact, activity, token/symbol, and partial[[31]](#footnote-31).

1. Gestural Reinforcement, involves the use of facial expression

like smile, laugh, delightful. Besides that, the use of bodily expression as like nodding, thumbs up, clapping and the like.

1. Proximity Reinforcement, involves teacher’s action which reflect her/his interest in students’ performance by moving nearer, standing next to or sitting close to students
2. Contact Reinforcement, involves wiping student’ s head, hand shake or raising student’s hand in the class
3. Activity Reinforcement, involves teacher’s decision to let student chose any activity that they prefer as reinforcement for work
4. Token/symbolic Reinforcement, involves teacher’s decision to give awards, marks sweet comment on books and etc
5. Partial Reinforcement, involves teacher’s response towards student’s incorrect answer or response in learning process[[32]](#footnote-32). For example, when the teacher ask a question and student gives inappropriate answer as what expected, it’s better for the teacher to say “Yes, your answer is good, but you can make it more correct”, so the student will not feel down and he motivates himself to find the correct one.
6. Principals In Giving Reinforcement

There are several principals that should be noticed by a teacher in giving reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal are warmth, enthusiasm, meaningful, and avoid the use of negative response[[33]](#footnote-33). It is important to make sure that the student feel the sincerity of the reinforcement given.

1. Warmth and enthusiasm

Any of teacher’s behavior to students will show his/her sincerity in giving reinforcement to students. Besides that, students will also feel teacher’s warmth and enthusiasm while giving them reinforcement on certain behavior that they do. In this situation, students feel that they are appreciated and welcomed by the teacher. In addition, it can build a comfortable atmosphere in the classroom.

1. Meaningful

One of important thing in giving reinforcement is the meaningful value. Reinforcement should be given as meaningful as it can be because it will help students to understand on what extent they are being reinforced and why the teacher reinforced them. So that, the reinforcement is meaningful as they know that they deserved it.

1. Avoid the use of negative response

The use of negative response will only cause students to be demotivated and stop to develop themselves. Instead of blaming a student who cannot answer certain question it’s better for teacher to switch the question or move to another student.

1. When To Give Reinforcement

It is essential for teacher to know when to give reinforcement to students as it can help teacher to provide effective reinforcement. It can be given in several conditions as the following[[34]](#footnote-34):

1. Students are paying attention to the teacher, their classmate and things that that is being discussed.
2. Students are doing classroom activities such as learning, reading, writing on the whiteboard, doing exercise from a textbook and the like.
3. Students have accomplished their assignment either fully or partially.
4. Students are doing their task with a good quality (neat, careful, and many more).
5. Students behavior in the classroom during teaching and learning process is considered with certain behavior category (appropriate, inappropriate, written, verbal and physic).
6. Individual assignment which involved self-development, self-control, and self-initiation in doing an activity.
7. How To Give Reinforcement

The way to give reinforcement also should be taken into count as it help teacher to give the reinforcement effectively to students. It is divided into four such as individual reinforcement, group reinforcement, immediacy in giving reinforcement and variation in giving reinforcement[[35]](#footnote-35).

1. Individual reinforcement

Student that is being reinforced should be clear. It means that if a teacher intended to give reinforcement to certain student she/he must be able to determine which student should be reinforced. Mention the name of student being reinforced can help teacher to make clear to whom the reinforcement is proposed. It also gives students sense of being appreciated.

1. Group reinforcement

Reinforcement can also be given to group of students. Once a group of students shows good progress in learning, the teacher can reinforce them by giving them something or letting them do activity that they like.

1. Immediacy

Immediacy in giving reinforcement is essential because once the reinforcement delay, it will not be as effective as it should be. Reinforcement is better given as soon as students perform intended behavior.

1. Variation

Variation in giving reinforcement is needed as it can make students bored for receiving the same forms of reinforcement and by the time the reinforcement will not be effective as it is not meaningful anymore for the students. Students should be reinforced variously either in term of the reinforcement types or the way teacher give it to them. Reinforcement will be more beneficial if it is given in different pattern. For instance, firstly reinforcement is given to all classroom members then, to small groups of the class and to students as individual.

1. Impact Of Reinforcement For The Students

Reinforcement gives positive impacts for the students. Several researches have been proved the positive impacts of reinforcement to students. In term of motivation, Kefas reported that reinforcement specifically verbal forms can arouse students’ motivation in learning speaking at SMA Budya Wacana Yogyakarta. Verbal reinforcement from teacher help students to be more motivated in learning English which is difficult for them especially in speaking skill. Students’ responses on questionnaire also replied that they feel proud and motivated when the teacher regularly reinforced them for every improvement they make in speaking skill[[36]](#footnote-36). Similarly, Lailatul Layliyah found that reinforcement also motivates students to get the best Mark in PAI (religious) subject, be more active in the class and submit assignment on time[[37]](#footnote-37).

In another hand, Leandra Pintel discovered that reinforcement can also affect students’ achievement. In this case, she focuses on achievement of 3rd grade students’ spelling. The result of t-test showed that after receiving positive reinforcement in form of rewards, students in treatment group get higher achievement or spelling score on Friday spelling test compare to non-treatment group who do not get the same treatment[[38]](#footnote-38). In addition, Oktavika Trihesty also found the same result as Leandra Pintel’s research but differ on subject and school level. Her research focuses on achievement of 5th grade especially Science (IPA) subject. The average score of teacher’s reinforcement is categorized as high, 63, 02%. It shows that there is significant influence toward students’ achievement. Hence, the average score of 5th grade’s learning result is 74, 41 and categorized as good[[39]](#footnote-39).

From the explanation above, in can be conclude that reinforcement impact students positively such as arouse their learning motivations, increase their participation in classroom, stimulate them to be more discipline, and increase their academic achievement.

1. Students’ Response Toward Reinforcement

Students’ response is any ideas which come up from the students as a result of certain given input which is done in teaching and learning process. Every student will show different response on any input as like assignment and lesson which is delivered by the teacher during classroom teaching. Similarly, students’ response toward reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal forms given by teacher will be varied as well. There are three researchers that have been discovered students’ response on reinforcement. For the first is Dewi Maslichah. K and Haryono who found that students give positive response on Mathematic learning process about SPLDV (Sistem Persamaan Linear Dua Variabe) which applied reinforcement. In total, 92, 63% students give very positive response on the use of reinforcement in Mathematic teaching. It shows that the students happy on the use of reinforcement in classroom. Moreover, students’ positive response on reinforcement also affects their classroom participation positively where they become more active to participate in classroom activities such as raising their hand to answer teachers’ question and being more motivated in doing assignment. As the result, their academic result also increases as 61, 29% students pass the KKM (Kriteria Ketuntasan Minimum) [[40]](#footnote-40). Second, Farida Mukti Sari reported that many students feel happy, exited, and motivated when they received reinforcement from teacher. It can be seen from the interview result where the students said that they are happy, exited and motivated toward reinforcement given by their teacher[[41]](#footnote-41). In addition, reinforcement also makes them easier to understand the lesson. Third, Ihsan Amir and Imam Suyitno found that majority of the student express positive response to teacher in giving reinforcement during Civic Education class. It is supported by students’ response on questionnaire related to teacher’s reinforcement in Civic Education subject[[42]](#footnote-42).

1. **Previous Studies**

Thereare some researches that have been conducted by other researchers in related topic with the upcoming research. Therefore, the researcher mentions the previous researches in order to show the gap and difference between the previous one and the new research being proposed.

1. TYPE OF VERBAL AND NON-VERBAL REINFORCEMENT GIVEN BY TEACHER IN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL[[43]](#footnote-43).

This research was done by Aulia Fitrianti, Zulaiha and Kustiono (2018). This research was a Journal article which published by Universitas Negeri Semarang on Journal Of Primary Education in December 2018. This research is mainly discussed about the form of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by teacher during teaching in Elementary School along with its conversational fragment context (semantic and pragmatic) that show the use of reinforcement form in learning. This research used qualitative study and the instruments are observation and interview. Then, the subject of this research is English teacher in Elementary school. The result of the study revealed that the reinforcement form that is provided by teacher is in forms of adjective verbal, numeral words, news sentence, and interjection word. Thus, non-verbal reinforcement given by teachers is in forms of gestures and expression movement. The reinforcement that is rarely provided by the teacher on its implementation is interjection form.

1. AN ANALYSIS OF TEACHERS’ REINFORCEMENT TOWARD STUDENT’S INTERACTION IN TEACHING SPEAKING AT SMPN 7 PADANG[[44]](#footnote-44).

This research was done by Yuli Eka Putri from STKIP PGRI SUMBAR (2017). This research was a journal article. This research is mainly discussed about types of reinforcement that are generally used by teachers and type of the most frequentl*y* used reinforcement in teaching speaking at SMPN 7 Padang. The design of this research is descriptive research and the instruments used are questionnaire, observation checklist, and field note. The subject of this study is English teacher at SMPN 7 Padang. The result of this study reported that the teacher used both verbal and non-verbal reinforcement in teaching speaking and type of reinforcement that is most frequently used is non-verbal reinforcement.

1. STUDY OF THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN STUDENT AND TEACHERS IN TERMS OF REINFORCEMENT IN PRIMARY SCHOOLS OF THE ALLAHABAD[[45]](#footnote-45)*.*

This research was done by Vivek Kumar Stephen and Dr. Prem Prabha Singh (2017). It was a journal article which published on *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science* in 2017. This research is mainly discussed about the relationship between teachers and students’ performance in term of reinforcement given by teachers in Primary school of Allabahad District. The study employed a Mixed Method design which both quantitative and qualitative data were collected. A total of 500 respondents were selected as participant. They come from 20 schools (10 government and 10 private schools) which had been selected from Allahabad District. Each of the selected school 25 students participated in the study. Data from qualitative and quantitative method gained through check-list, interview and observation. This research reported that there is a significant relationship between reinforcement and academic performance of the students of the Primary schools of the Allahabad district. The study suggests that, there should be enrichment for reinforcement programs which can involve teacher to deepen their knowledge on reinforcement.

1. THE INFLUENCE OF REINFORCEMENT SKILL ON ACADEMIC PERFORMANCE OF SECONDARY SCHOOL PHYSIC STUDENTS IN OBIO-AKPOR Lga, RIVERS STATE NIGERIA[[46]](#footnote-46).

This research was done by N. N. S. Mandah1 and O. L. Gbarato (2016). This was a journal article which published on British Journal Of Education, Society and Behavioural Science in 2016. This research is mainly discussed about the effectiveness of the reinforcement skill in teaching and its influence on the academic performance of secondary school Physics students. Descriptive and quasi experimental research is employed in this research. 120 students and 30 Physics teachers in Public Secondary Schools in Obio/Akpor Local Government Area of Rivers State are the subject in this research. The instruments used in this study are questionnaire and post-test. The finding of this study reported that reinforcement skill influences the academic performance in Physics by grabbing students’ attention, engaging students’ to participate actively in classroom activities, and improving students’ willingness in learning.

1. GUIDANCE AND REINFORCEMENT OF STUDENT VALUE SYSTEM: THE CASE OF ISLAMIC BOARDING SCHOOL YANBU’UL QURAN KUDUS[[47]](#footnote-47)

This research was done by Muhammad Rozikan from IAIN Salatiga (2017). This was a journal article which published on Attarbiyah : Journal Of Islamic Culture and Education in 2017. This research is mainly discussed about the implementation of guidance learning and reinforcement of student value system in which support Hafidz students in memorizing the holy Qur’an. Kinds of reinforcement also little bit different from the two earlier studies has been presented above on the use of academic terms namely *psychological* *reinforcement, social cultural reinforcement, reinforcement of faith, historical reinforcement, philosophical reinforcement and functional approach.* Qualitative approach is used in this study. The qualitative data are obtained from observation, interview, documentation and biographies. The subject of this research is *ustadz* (teacher). The finding of this research shown that the implementation of learning guidance and reinforcement help students to memorize the holy Al-Qur’an.

1. TEACHING TEACHERS THE FIVE PRINCIPLES OF BEHAVIOR REINFORCEMENT: CHANGING CHALLENGING BEHAVIORS IN THE CLASSROOM[[48]](#footnote-48).

This research was done by Francie Murry, Ph.D (2015). It was a journal article which was published on *Journal of Education and Human Development* in 2015. This research is mainly discussed about teachers’ use of the five principles of behavior reinforcement in changing the challenging student behavior. Survey method is used to obtain data from pre and post survey. 34 participants consist of 15 males and 19 females were participated in this study. They are teacher of Elementary school in grade 3 to 6 in inclusive classroom and asked to join a 15-weeks class focus on reinforcement to change students’ behavior. It can be concluded from this research that after joining a behavior management class based on the five principles for behavior reinforcement, they get benefit for changing students’ behavior both social and academic settings. In addition, the result of a paired samples t-test identified significant statistical difference from pre to post survey regarding the teachers’ self-perceived use of five principles for the change challenging student behavior.

Generally, the first and the second previous researches focused on types of reinforcement given by teacher but differ in context. The first research examines types of reinforcement based on its conversational fragment context. In contrast, the second research dealing with types of reinforcement that are used by teacher especially in teaching speaking. The third and fourth previous research is on the influence of reinforcement towards students’ academic performances but in different education level. The third study is conducted in Primary school of Allahabad District. On one hand, the fourth research took place in Secondary school Physics students. The fifth research describes the implementation of guidance learning and reinforcement of student value system in which support Hafidz students in memorizing the holy Qur’an.While, the sixth research investigates teachers’ use of the five principles of behavior reinforcement to increase teachers’ self-esteem in changing the students’ challenging behavior.

Therefore, the upcoming research focuses on how EFL student teachers give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement to the students. Besides, this research will also discuss about types of reinforcement given by EFL student teachers in form of verbal and non-verbal specifically to student as individual and group. Students’ response on the types of reinforcement given during teaching practice in microteaching class will be discussed as well. The subject of this research is EFL student teacher in English Teacher Education Departement (ETED) at UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya who takes PPL 1 course in academic year 2019/2020 and stand in 6th semester. Microteaching class at ETED of UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya is chosen as location of the research. A qualitative research will be employed in this research and the instruments that will be used to gain the data are observation, interview and audiovisual material.

1. **Research Design**

This study attempts to describe phenomena of how verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by student teachers during teaching practice in Microteaching class along with finding out the types of reinforcement that is given and students’ response on it. In this way, such a purpose is best to use qualitative method. The qualitative method enables researcher to gain data related to area of this study. In addition, the qualitative method is able to help in exploring a phenomenon in natural setting by using multiple method in interpreting, understanding, explaining and bringing meaning to them[[49]](#footnote-49). Qualitative method is more concern on understanding situation or phenomenon from participant’s perspective[[50]](#footnote-50). This research will be done during teaching practice in microteaching class academic year 2019/2020 by involving 8 student teachers that are chosen purposively. Researcher will use observation, interview guideline, and audiovisual material to collect data needed and to answer the research questions. The data which has been gathered will be analyzed qualitatively by using Cresswell’s data analysis technique. In addition, Uzer Usman’s theory in theoretical framework is also used to examine, strengthen, and analyze the data in research discussion. Hence, previous studies will be used both as comparison and support to make the result of the present study to be more comprehensive.

1. **Research Subject**

Participants here are someone who has information that is needed for conducting this research, enable the researcher to obtain information from their experiences, has direct participation in phenomenon being investigated, available to interviewed, and free from any pressure[[51]](#footnote-51). In this case, researcher will use purposeful sample. As stated by Cresswell, purposeful sample is a way in determining subject of a research by selecting certain people or sites that is most suitable to help us in understanding a phenomenon being investigated[[52]](#footnote-52).

Therefore, the subject of this research is student teacher of the sixth semester at State Islamic University of Sunan Ampel Surabaya in academic year 2019/2020. Specifically, the target subject of this research is student teacher who takes PPL I course or microteaching class in the sixth semester especially student teachers who used reinforcement during their practice teaching in microteaching class as the aim of the study is to describe the way student teachers give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement during teaching practice in Microteaching class along with finding out the types of reinforcement that is given to student as individual and group. Furthermore, this study also aimed to find out students responses towards verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by student teachers. The researcher is going to take 1 participant in each Microteaching class available at the time. Totally, there will be 8 student teachers taken as subject from 8 Microteaching classes.

1. **Setting of the Research**
2. **Place**

The setting of this research is in English Teacher Education Department of State Islamic university of Sunan Ampel Surabaya, especially in Microteaching class. Here, student teachers have a chance to practice their teaching skills and develop them self to be a professional teacher. Microteaching class is the most suitable place for conducting the research because it enables the researcher to collect data on one of teacher’s basic teaching skills which is called reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal forms as the student teachers perform their teaching skill in this program. Hence, the object of this research is on how student teachers give reinforcement which is performed during teaching practice in microteaching class, types of reinforcement given to student individually and group along with students’ response on reinforcements given. In this academic year, there are 8 microteaching classes from A-H class which are taught by three different lecturers. Researcher is going to take 1 participant from each class. So, in total there will be 8 student teachers taken as participant for this research.

1. **Time**

This research is going to be conducted on April when the new academic year of 2019/2020 and the program of PPL I course in Microteaching class will have been started on that month. So, the researcher can start obtaining data through direct observation during teaching practice in Microteaching class, record student teachers’ teaching practice video and doing interview with several student teachers who take role as student and receive reinforcement (individual/group) from student teachers who become the teacher during teaching practice

1. **Data**

The term data refers to any information gained by the researcher from the participant as the subject in research[[53]](#footnote-53). The data in this research are categorized into one category. That is primary data. The primary data in this research is the data which obtained through first-hand experience. Data which is going to be collected by the researcher is reinforcements which have been produced by student teachers in their microteaching class to reinforce students during teaching practice. The reinforcements will collected through direct observation and student teachers’ teaching practice videos in microteaching class, then will be analyzed using Uzer Usman theory. In this case, researcher will use observation guideline in form of performance checklist to gain data needed on how student teachers give reinforcement along with its types both in verbal and non-verbal. Besides that, student teachers’ responses in interview will also be gathered to find out students’ responses on types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcements given by the student teachers.

1. **Source of Data**

The source of data in this study are observation, student teachers’ teaching practice video, and interview. Here, observation and student teachers’ teaching practice video employed as source of data on the way student teachers give reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal during teaching practice in Microteaching class along with the types of reinforcement which is given to student as individual and group. Besides that, student teacher’s respond on interview also used as the source of data related to their response on types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by student teacher who role as teacher in Microteaching class. In addition, the data is obtained from student teachers who enroll microteaching class, academic year 2019/2020. There will be 8 students teachers chosen as participant and each of them will be taken from 8 microteaching classes available.

1. **Data Collection Technique**

Creswell stated that in qualitative research data is collected from various forms of data[[54]](#footnote-54). They are documents, observations, interviews and audiovisual materials. There are four basic types of data collection techniques in qualitative research as shown in table 1.1 below[[55]](#footnote-55):

**Table 1.1 Qualitative data collection types, options, advantages and limitations**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Data Collection Types** | **Option within types** | **Advantages of the type** | **Limitation of the types** |
| Observations | * Complete participant—researcher conceals role * Observer as participant-role of researcher is known * Participant as observer—observation role secondary to participant role * Complete observer—researcher observes without participating | * Researcher has a first-hand experience with participant * Researcher can record information as is occurs * Unusual aspects can be noticed during observation * Useful exploring topics that may be uncomfortable for participants to discuss | * Researcher may be seen as intrusive * Private information may be observed that researcher cannot report * Researcher may not have good attending and observing skills * Certain participants (e.g., children) may present special problems in gaining rapport |
| Interviews | * Face-to-face, one-on-one,in-person interview * Telephone—researcher interviews by phone * Focus group—researcher interviews participants in a group * E-mail internet interview | * Useful when participants cannot be directly observed * Participants can provide historical information * Allows researcher control over the line of questions | * Provides indirect information filtered through views of interviewees * Provides information in a designated place rather than the natural field setting * Researcher’s presence may bias responses * Not all people are equally articulate and perceptive |
| Documents | * Public documents, such as minutes of meetings, or newspapers * Private documents, such as journals, diaries, or letters | * Enables a researcher to obtain the language and words of participants * Can be accessed at a time convenient o researcher-an unobtrusive source of information * Represents data which are thoughtful in that participants have given attention to compiling them * As written evidence, it saves a researcher the time and expense of transcribing | * Not all are equally articulate and perceptive * May be protected information unavailable to public or private access * Requires the researcher to search out the information in hard-to-find places * Requires transcribing or optically scanning for computer entry * Materials may be incomplete * The documents may not be authentic or accurate |
| Audiovisual Materials | * Photograph * Videotapes * Art objects * Computer software * Film | * May be an unobtrusive method of collecting data * Provides an opportunity for participants to directly share their reality * It is creative in that it captures attention visually | * May be difficult to interpret * May not be accessible publicly or privately * The presence of an observer (e.g. photographer) may be disruptive and affect responses |

*Note: this table includes material taken from Merriam (1998), Bagdan & Biklen (1992) and Creswell (2007)*

In order to obtain valid data researcher used three kinds of data collection techniques such as observation, interview, and audiovisual material with some considerations. Observation is used to collect data needed through direct observation in research location and presence of the researcher will be fully as researcher without contributing in any activities run there. At the same time, audiovisual material is employed in this research as it can capture events or activities which are happening at the time both visual and audio. In this case, researcher will also record student teachers’ performance in teaching practice during microteaching class. In order to have rich sight on various angles of the video recording, researcher will also copy the video from student teachers. Then, for the interview, the researcher will conduct face-to-face interview as it enables researcher to gain the data directly to the participants and deeper information might be collected. Here are detail explanations of the three data collection techniques used in this research:

1. Observation

According to John.W Creswell, observation data is in which the researcher takes field notes on the behavior and activities of the individuals at the research location[[56]](#footnote-56). In this study, the researcher will conduct an observation in order to get depth sight on how student teachers give reinforcement during teaching practice in Microteaching class. In this point, the researcher is going to collect data on how student teachers give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement. The data will be obtained using performance checklist which reflect student teachers’ performance in giving reinforcement. This performance checklist is made based on theoretical framework above to make sure that the data is really capture the problem being investigated. In the same way, types of reinforcement enacted by student teacher either verbal or non-verbal also gained using the performance checklist.

1. Interview

According to Donald Ary and others, interview is kind of tool to collect the data widely and usually regard as ground method[[57]](#footnote-57). Data which derived directly from what someone thinks, feels, and beliefs are collected by using interview[[58]](#footnote-58). In this study, the researcher will interview student teachers who become “students” during teaching practice in Microteaching using interview guideline which contains some questions about students’ response on the types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement that are given by student teachers during teaching practice in microteaching class.

. 3. Audiovisual Materials

1. Video recording

The researcher considers about the use of video recording for obtaining data needed in this study. The video recording is a video record of student teachers’ who become a “teacher” during teaching practice in Microteaching class. The file of the video recording can be copied from the student teachers and can be taken by the researcher during the observation in microteaching class. This kind of data collection technique will help researcher to get valid data for this research. Video recording can also help researcher to do crosscheck on data that have been taken from direct observation in the class in order to make sure that researcher doesn’t miss any part related to research data on the way student teachers give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement. Besides, video recording can also help researcher to get data on types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given to student as individual and group.

1. Audio recording

Tape recorder is used as the tool for researcher to collect data from interview session. This tool can help researcher to crosscheck the answer of the participants in interview session with researcher’s interview note on students’ response toward types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement they received during teaching practice. So, the researcher can make sure that the data needed is collected well. Then, student teachers’ recorded responses will be transcribed and analyzed by the researcher.

**Table 1.2 Figure of Research Design**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **No** | **Research Question** | **Subject** | **Data Collection Technique** | **Instrument** |
| 1. | What are the types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given by student teachers during teaching practice in Microteaching class? | Student Teachers  (role as *teacher* during teaching practice in micro teaching class) | Observation and audiovisual materials (video recording) | Performance checklist and photograph |
| 2. | How do student teachers give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement skill during teaching practice in Microteaching class? | Student Teachers  (role as *teacher* during teaching practice in micro teaching class) | Observation and audiovisual materials  (video recording) | Performance checklist and video recorder |
| 3. | What are students’ responses on the types of student teachers’ verbal and non-verbal reinforcement during teaching practice in Microteaching class? | Student Teachers  (role as *students* during teaching practice in micro teaching class) | Interview and audiovisual materials  (audio recording) | Interview guideline and audio recorder |

1. **Research Instrument**

Data which is collected in this research are required to carry out the findings of this study. All of data can be collected by using several instruments below :

1. Main Instrument

In this research, the main instrument is the researcher itself. Through direct observation researcher will collect student teacher’s video on their teaching practice in Microteaching class. Student teachers’ performance in giving reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal during teaching practice will be used as the main data in this research.

1. Instrument Tools

The following tools are employed for obtaining data needed in this research:

1. Performance checklist

Performance checklist will be constructed based on Uzer Usman theory on reinforcement. Data will be taken during direct observation in Micro Teaching class. It is presented in the form of table that contains several aspects such as how to give reinforcement and also kinds of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement along with its descriptors. (see Appendix)

1. Interview guideline

The researcher uses interview guideline to gain data for the third research question. Student teachers who play role as student during teaching practice will be interviewed by semi-structural interview guideline (questions). In this type of interview, the researcher wants to know specific and deep information about their response on types of reinforcement given by student teachers who role as teacher during teaching practice[[59]](#footnote-59). (see appendix)

1. Recorder

In this research, researcher will used two types of recorder. They are audio and visual recorder. Audio recorder is used to obtain data from interview section which will be done orally. On the other hand, video recorder is used to collect data from direct observation. It is very important as it can help researcher to collect the data well, avoid missing certain part during the interview and observation. It also used to keep data safely from any damage or risk of being lost. Recorder here can be represented by mobile phone.

1. **Data Analysis Technique**

The researcher will analyze the data that has been obtained from observation, interview, and audiovisual material by using descriptive qualitative method. After conducting observation and collecting videos from student teachers who had teaching practice in microteaching class, researcher will analyze the data by using Uzer Usman’s theory on reinforcement. The method will try to analyze data by looking the common issue that recur and identify the main theme that summarize all the views which have collected[[60]](#footnote-60). Furthermore, researcher will have a discussion with English lectures that more expert in teaching field, especially teaching English. According to Creswell, the data analysis in descriptive qualitative method uses general procedure data analysis technique as shown on figure below[[61]](#footnote-61):

Interpreting meaning of Themes/ Description

Interrelating Themes/Description

(based on the theory in Literature Review)

Coding the Text for Themes/Descriptions to be used in the Research Report

Validating the accuracy of the information

Coding the data

Reading through all the data

Organizing and Preparing Data for Analysis

Raw Data

(student teachers’ teaching practice video, audio recording on interview and observation result)

**Figure 1.3 Data analysis in Qualitative research adapted from Creswell**

1. **Research Stages**

The process of this research will be done as these stages below :

1. Take a preliminary research

Student in the sixth semester have to take PPL I Course as they passed the pre-request course(s). PPL I course is a course that obligate student to have teaching practice during sixth semester. This course is conducted in Microteaching class. The aims of this program are to develop students’ professional skill in teaching and to implement all of theories that have been studied in previous semester related to teaching.

Based on researchers’ experience, student teacher academic year 2017/2018 has been implemented reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal forms. However, student teachers at the time still need to improve their reinforcement skill because some of them deliver the reinforcement in inappropriate way. Moreover, Reinforcement during teaching practice seems to get little attention because the major attention mostly on student teacher’s management classroom, creativity in designing media, and the like. So that, student teachers’ performance in giving reinforcement gets lower attention compare to other teaching skills.

Therefore, researcher decided to conduct a research on reinforcement to describe the way student teachers give reinforcement both verbal and non-verbal during teaching practice, to find out types of reinforcement that is given by student teachers and students’ responses on the types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement given in the following year (2019/2020) because the researcher wants to examine whether students of ETED have the same problems although they in differ level of studying year. During the teaching practice in Microteaching class, they have to record their performance as one of way to have self-reflection on their teaching practice. This video is used as one of main data in this research because it captures student teachers’ performance in teaching including the way they give reinforcement.

1. Decide the research design

The researcher begins the design of the research being proposed by finding a problem that is interesting to be investigated. Then, researcher starts to write the research question on the things that are going to find in the research and determine title. After that, researcher decides the focus of the research and looking for related literature and theory that meet with the research and can support to conduct the research.

Finally, researcher decided to choose the research design which is fit with researcher’s problem which can help researcher to conduct the upcoming research. In this research, qualitative design is employed as the aims of this research is to describe the way student teachers give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement during teaching practice, to find out types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement that is given by student teachers and to find out students’ responses on types of verbal and non-verbal reinforcement that they received from the student teacher who role as the teacher.

1. Asking for Permission

Before going to conduct research in microteaching class, researcher will ask permission to lecturers who teach PPL course in microteaching class. In this academic year, microteaching class is taught by three different lectures and the total number of the microteaching class is 8 classes from A – H class. Each class consists of 13-15 student teachers. It is important to have permission in each microteaching class to make sure that researcher can conduct the research and gain data needed there.

1. Conduct the research:

a. Collecting data

Data related to the way student teachers give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement and its types enacted by student teachers will be gathered through observation by using performance checklist. Student teachers’ teaching practice video will also be used in the same way. While, interview will be used by the researcher to collect data on students’ responses of given verbal and non-verbal reinforcement and interview guideline is used as a tool to dig intended information on it. In addition, audio recording is also used to record participants’ responses during interview.

b. Analyzing the data

After collecting all data needed, the researcher will be able to analyze the data based on the theoretical framework. In this study, I employed Uzer Usman’s theory on reinforcement.

1. Interviewing subjects

The researcher will ask several particular information that is needed for the research in form of questions. Researcher will use interview guideline to obtain the data and audio recording to record participants’ responses. Then, researcher will transcribe the result of the interview from audio recording, read the transcription thoroughly, code participants’ responses into several themes based on the theory, interpret meaning of the themes and draw conclusion.

1. Combining data

The result of the observation, video analysis and the interview are combined. After relating the analysis of students’ work and the theory in theoretical review, which are also supported by the subjects’ explanation through interview, the researcher will explain the research finding in discussion section.

1. Concluding the result of the research

After all the data has been analyzed, the result of the analysis and the theory are combined, the researcher make the conclusion of the research based on the whole sections of this study that have been discussed.

All of the processes in research stages are illustrated through figure 1.4 below:

**Figure 1.4 Research Stages**

1. **Data Validity**

Qualitative method actually uses “Authenticity” rather than “Validity”, because it means giving fair and honest description, explanation, and information. There are three methods to ensure accuracy of qualitative method data, which are Triangulation, Member Checking, and Auditing[[62]](#footnote-62).

In this study, the researcher will use triangulation. Triangulation is validity checking technique that uses other source in order to check or compare data. There are some kinds of triangulation; source, time, theory, researcher, and method[[63]](#footnote-63). While, Denzin explained that triangulation is divided into four types including methods triangulation, investigators triangulation, theory triangulation, and data source triangulation[[64]](#footnote-64). As stated by Creswell, a multiple methods are needed to get deeper understanding on a phenomenon being investigated[[65]](#footnote-65). The use of single method cannot give a better sight as the multiple methods does. Therefore, method triangulation and investigator triangulation are used in this study. The researcher will use method triangulation to crosscheck the findings of the research. As it used multiple methods, the researcher used three data collection as like observation, interview and audiovisual materials. Besides, investigator triangulation will also be applied. Here, the researcher, expert lecturers, including the advisors also will be contributed to ensure the findings.

**REFERENCES**

Aida, Welven, - Rivi Antoni. 2017. “Basic Components Of Micro Teaching Skill At

Third Year Students FKIP Universitas Pasir Pengaraian”. *Journal of English Education*. Vol. 3 No. 2, December 2017.

Amir, Ihsan, - Imam Suyitno, “Analisis Pemberian Reinforcement Dalam Pembelajaran PKN di SMA Negeri 1 Lamuru Kecamatan Lamuru Kabupaten Bone”, (Makassar: Universitas Negeri Makassar), 96.

Ary, Donald., Lucy Cheser Jacobs and Christine K Sorensen. *Introduction to Research in Education,* Eight edition. Canada: Nelson Education, 2010.

Anderson, Gary - Nancy Arsenault. *Fundamentals of Educational Research,* Second edition. UK : the Taylor & Francis e-Library, 2005.

Bachri, Bachtiar S*. Meyakinkan Validitas Data Melalui Triangulasi pada Penelitian*

*Kualitatif.* Universitas Negeri Surabaya

Bell, Nancy D.“Microteaching:What is it that is going on here?”. *Journal of Linguistics and Education*, Vol.18, 2007.

Budiningsih, Asri. *Belajar dan Pembelajaran*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2012*.*

Coe, Robert, et.al. 2014. “What makes great teaching?”. *Review Of The Underpinning Research Durham University,* 2014.

Creswell, John W. *Research Design Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches,* Third edition. UK: SAGE Publications Inc, 2009.

--------------------*.Educational Research: Planning, Conducting, And Evaluating Quantitative And Qualitative Research,* Fourth edition, Boston: Pearson education, 2012.

-------------------.*Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design Choosing Among Five Traditions,* Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications Inc, 1998.

Dahar, Ratna Wilis. *Teori-Teori Belajar dan Pembelajaran*. Bandung: Erlangga, 2011.

Dawson, Catherine. *Metode Penelitian Praktis.* Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2010.

Denzin, NK. *Sociological Methods.* New York: McGraw Hill, 1978.

Djamarah, Syaiful Bahri, *Guru Dan Anak Didik: Suatu Pendekatan Teoritis Psikologis* (Jakarta: PT RINEKA CIPTA, 2005), 119.

Fraenkel, Jack R, Norman E. Wallen, and Hellen H. Hyun. *How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education.* New York: McGraw-Hill, 2012.

Garvey, Brian. 1978. “Microteaching: Developing the Concept for Practical Training”. *British Journal of Educational Technology,* Vol. No. 2, May 1978. 142.

Gower, Roger, Diane Philips and Steve Walters. *Teaching Practice Handbook.* UK: McMillan, 1983.

Irawan, Prasety. *Teori Belajar, Motivasi, dan Ketrampilan Mengajar.* Jakarta: Dirjen Dikti Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 1997.

K, Dewi Maslichah, – Haryono, “Pemberian Penguatan (*Reinforcement*) Dalam Pembelajaran Matematika Pada Materi Sistem Persamaan Linear Dua Variabel (SPLDV) Di Kelas VII SMP Al-Azhar Menganti Gresik”, Surabaya: UNESA.

Layliyah, Lailatul. Skripsi: *“Pemberian Penguatan (Reinforcement) Dalam Meningkatkan Motivasi Belajar Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) Siswa Di SMP Negeri 18 Malang”*, Malang: Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, 2008.

Moleong, Lexy J. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif.* Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 1991.

Mulyasa. *Menjadi Guru Profesional : Menciptakan Pembelajaran Kreatif dan Menyenangkan*. Bandung : PT Remaja RosdaKarya, 2005.

Murry, Francie. 2015. ”Teaching Teachers the Five Principles of Behavior Reinforcement: Changing Challenging Behaviors in the Classroom”, *Journal* *of Education and Human Development,* 2015*.*

Patton, Michael Quinn - Michael Cochran. *Guide to Using Qualitative Research Methodology.* Medecins San Frontieres, 2002.

Pintel, Leandra. Thesis: *“The Effect Of Positive Reinforcement On The Achievement Of 3rd Grade Students' Spelling”*, New Jersey, USA: Rowan University, 2006.

Putri, Yuli Eka. 2017. “An Analysis Of Teachers’ Reinforcement Toward Student’s Interaction In Teaching Speaking At SMPN 7 Padang”, STKIP PGRI SUMBAR, 2017.

Raco, J.R. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif.*  Jakarta: Gramedia Widiasarana Indonesia,

2010.

Ratumanan, Gerson. *Belajar dan Pembelajaran.* Surabaya: Unesa University Press,

2002.

Remesh, Ambili. 2014. “Microteaching: An Efficient Technique For Learning Effective Teaching”, *Journal of research in medical sciences*

Rozikan, Muhammad. 2017. “Guidance And Reinforcement Of Student Value System: The Case Of Islamic Boarding School Yanbu’ul Quran Kudus”, *Journal Of* *Islamic Culture and Education,* Vol. 2 No.1, 2017. 128-151

S, Mandah, N. N. - O. L. Gbarato. 2016. “The Influence Of Reinforcement Skill On

Academic Performance Of Secondary School Physic Students In Obio-Akpor Lga, Rivers State Nigeria”. *British Journal Of Education, Society and* *Behavioural Science,*Vol. 17 No. 3, 2016. 1-11.

Sari, Farida Mukti. Skripsi: “*Kemampuan Guru Memberi Penguatan Dalam Pembelajaran Tematik Berbasis KTSP Di SD Kecamatan Ngaliyan Kota Semarang”*, Semarang: Universitas Negerei Semarang, 2015.

Stephen, Vivek Kumar - Prem Prabha Singh. 2017. “Study Of The Relationship Between Student And Teachers In Terms Of Reinforcement In Primary Schools Of The Allahabad”, *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science (IOSR-JHSS),* Vol. 22 No. 12, December 2017. 26-33

Suyono - Hariyanto. *Belajar dan Pembelajaran*. Bandung : PT Remaja RosdaKarya,

2012.

Tim Tarbiyah UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya., *Pedoman Praktik Pengalaman Lapangan I ( PPL 1 ).* Surabaya: TIM Tarbiyah UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2018.

Trihesty, Oktavika. Skripsi: *“Pengaruh Pemberian Penguatan (Reinforcement) Terhadap Hasil Belajar IPA Pada Siswa Kelas V Sd Daerah Binaan 5 Kecamatan Petarukan Kabupaten Pemalang”*, Semarang: Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2015.

Usman, Uzer. *Menjadi Guru Profesiona*l. Bandung : PT Remaja RosdaKarya, 2005.

Z, Kefas Angandrowa D. P., Skripsi*:“The Use Of Verbal Reinforcement To Motivate The 11th Grade Students Of SMA Budya Wacana Yogyakarta To Speak English”,* Yogyakarta: Universitas Sanata Dharma Yogyakarta, 2017.

**Appendices**

**Appendix 1. Performance Checklist**

Name of Student Teacher : Class :

Class : Material :

*How student teacher gives reinforcement to students*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| No. | How to Give Reinforcement | Descriptor(s) | Yes | No | Note |
| 1. | Individual | Teacher mentions student’s name  Teacher clearly point out to one student at the time  Teacher clearly give reinforcement by stating student’s desirable behavior |  |  |  |
| 2. | Group | Teacher mentions group’s name  Teacher clearly point out to a group  Teacher clearly give reinforcement by stating group’s desirable behavior |  |  |  |
| 3. | Immediacy | Teacher gives reinforcement as soon as student perform desirable behavior  Teacher gives reinforcement as soon as group perform desirable behavior |  |  |  |
| 4. | Variation | Teacher gives verbal reinforcement (word & sentence)  Teacher gives non-verbal reinforcement (gestural, token/symbol, partial, proximity, activity & contact)  Teacher gives reinforcement to all of the students  Teacher gives reinforcement to group  Teacher gives reinforcement to individual |  |  |  |

*Types of reinforcement gives by student teacher*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | | Types of reinforcement | | Yes | No | Expression(s) | Note |
| Target of reinforcement | Individual | Verbal | Word |  |  |  |  |
| Sentence |  |  |  |  |
| Non verbal | Gestural |  |  |  |  |
| Token/symbol |  |  |  |  |
| Partial |  |  |  |  |
| Proximity |  |  |  |  |
| Activity |  |  |  |  |
| Contact |  |  |  |  |
| Group | Verbal | Word |  |  |  |  |
| Sentence |  |  |  |  |
| Non verbal | Gestural |  |  |  |  |
| Token/symbol |  |  |  |  |
| Partial |  |  |  |  |
| Proximity |  |  |  |  |
| Activity |  |  |  |  |
| Contact |  |  |  |  |

**Appendix 2. Interview Guideline (student)**

*Interview guideline for Student as an individual*

Name of student : Class :

1. Does the teacher give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement to reinforce student during teaching practice?
2. What are the types of verbal reinforcement that teacher gives when you are able to do intended skill or behavior during teaching practice?
3. What does the teacher say when she gives verbal reinforcements?
4. How does teacher give the reinforcements (verbal)?
5. What do you feel when the teacher gives verbal reinforcement when you are able to do intended skill or behavior during teaching practice?
6. What are the types of non verbal reinforcement that teacher gives when you are able to do intended skill or behavior during teaching practice?
7. What does teacher do when she gives non-verbal reinforcements?
8. How does teacher give the reinforcements (non-verbal)?
9. What do you feel when the teacher gives you non-verbal reinforcement when you are able to do intended skill or behavior during teaching practice?
10. What do you think about reinforcements given by teacher during teaching practice?

*Interview guideline for student in a group*

Name of group : Class :

1. Does the teacher give verbal and non-verbal reinforcement to reinforce student during teaching practice?
2. What are the types of verbal reinforcement that teacher gives when your group is able to do intended skill or behavior during teaching practice?
3. What does the teacher say when she gives verbal reinforcements to your group?
4. How does teacher give the reinforcements (verbal)?
5. What do you feel when the teacher gives verbal reinforcement when your group is able to do intended skill or behavior during teaching practice?
6. What are the types of non verbal reinforcement that teacher gives when your group is able to do intended skill or behavior during teaching practice?
7. What does teacher do when she gives non-verbal reinforcements?
8. How does teacher give the reinforcements (non-verbal)?
9. What do you feel when the teacher gives you non-verbal reinforcement when you are able to do intended skill or behavior during teaching practice?
10. What do you think about reinforcement given by teacher during teaching practice?

1. Uzer Usman, *Menjadi Guru Profesional* (Bandung: PT Remaja RosdaKarya, 2005), 66. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. R Slavin, *Educational Psychology: Theory and Practice.* 9th edition. (Columbus, Ohio: Pearson

   International, 2009). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. *Ibid, 66.* [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Uzer Usman, *Menjadi Guru Profesional* (Bandung : PT Remaja RosdaKarya, 2005), 67. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Prasety Irawan, *Teori Belajar, Motivasi, dan Ketrampilan Mengajar* (Jakarta: Dirjen Dikti Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 1997). [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Yuli Eka Putri, “An Analysis Of Teachers’ Reinforcement Toward Student’s Interaction In Teaching Speaking At SMPN 7 Padang”, STKIP PGRI SUMBAR, 2017, 2 [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. *Ibid, 2* [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Welven Aida - Rivi Antoni, “Basic Components Of Micro Teaching Skill At Third Year Students FKIP Universitas Pasir Pengaraian”, *Journal of English Education*, Vol. 3 No. 2, December 2017, 101 [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Tim Tarbiyah UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, *Pedoman Praktik Pengalaman Lapangan I (PPL 1),* (Surabaya: Tim Tarbiyah UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2018), 1. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. *Ibid, 1* [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Ambili Remesh, “Microteaching: An Efficient Technique For Learning Effective Teaching”, *Journal of research in medical sciences* [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. Tim Tarbiyah UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, *Pedoman Praktik Pengalaman Lapangan II ( PPL II ),* (Surabaya: Tim Tarbiyah UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, 2016). [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. Aulia Fitrianti, Zulaiha & Kustiono, “Type Of Verbal And Non-Verbal Reinforcement Given By Teacher In Elementary School”, *Journal Of Primary Education.* Vol. 7 No. 3,December 2018 [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. Yuli Eka Putri, “An Analysis Of Teachers’ Reinforcement Toward Student’s Interaction In Teaching Speaking At SMPN 7 Padang”, STKIP PGRI SUMBAR, 2017, 2 [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. Vivek Kumar Stephen & Prem Prabha Singh, “Study of the relationship between student and teachers in terms of reinforcement in Primary schools of the Allahabad”, *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science (IOSR-JHSS).* Vol. 22 No. 12, December 2017. 26-33 [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. N. N. S. Mandah1 & O. L. Gbarato, (2016), “The Influence Of Reinforcement Skill On Academic Performance Of Secondary School Physic Students In Obio-Akpor Lga, Rivers State Nigeria”, *British Journal Of Education, Society and Behavioural Science.* Vol. 17 No. 3, 2016. 1-11. [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Uzer Usman, *Menjadi Guru Profesional* (Bandung : PT Remaja RosdaKarya, 2005), 67 [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. *Ibid, 73* [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. N. N. S. Mandah1 & O. L. Gbarato, “The Influence Of Reinforcement Skill On Academic Performance Of Secondary School Physic Students In Obio-Akpor Lga, Rivers State Nigeria”, *British Journal Of Education, Society and Behavioural Science.* Vol. 17 No. 3, 2016. 1-11. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. *Ibid, 4* [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. Brian Garvey, “Microteaching: Deloping the Concept for Practical Training”. *British Journal of Educational Technology.* Vol. No. 2, May 1978, 142. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)
22. Roger Gower, et.al., *Teaching Practice Handbook,* (United Kingdom: McMillan, 1983) [↑](#footnote-ref-22)
23. N. N. S. Mandah1 & O. L. Gbarato, “The Influence Of Reinforcement Skill On Academic Performance Of Secondary School Physic Students In Obio-Akpor Lga, Rivers State Nigeria”, *British Journal Of Education, Society and Behavioural Science.* Vol. 17 No. 3, 2016. 1-11. [↑](#footnote-ref-23)
24. Nancy D. Bell, “Microteaching:What is it that is going on here?”. *Journal of Linguistics and Education*, Vol.18, 2007, 24. [↑](#footnote-ref-24)
25. *Ibid,* 73-75 [↑](#footnote-ref-25)
26. Ratna Wilis Dahar, *Teori-Teori Belajar dan Pembelajaran* (Bandung: Erlangga, 2011). [↑](#footnote-ref-26)
27. Asri Budiningsih,. *Belajar dan Pembelajaran* (Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2012*.)*. [↑](#footnote-ref-27)
28. Gerson Ratumanan,. *Belajar dan Pembelajaran (*Surabaya: Unesa University Press, 2002). [↑](#footnote-ref-28)
29. Suyono - Hariyanto, *Belajar dan Pembelajaran* (Bandung : PT Remaja RosdaKarya, 2012), 226-227. [↑](#footnote-ref-29)
30. Uzer Usman, *Menjadi Guru Profesional* (Bandung : PT Remaja RosdaKarya, 2005),73. [↑](#footnote-ref-30)
31. N. N. S. Mandah1 & O. L. Gbarato, “The Influence Of Reinforcement Skill On Academic Performance Of Secondary School Physic Students In Obio-Akpor Lga, Rivers State Nigeria”, *British Journal Of Education, Society and Behavioural Science.* Vol. 17 No. 3, 2016. 1-11 [↑](#footnote-ref-31)
32. Uzer Usman, *Menjadi Guru Profesional* (Bandung : PT Remaja RosdaKarya, 2005), 74. [↑](#footnote-ref-32)
33. *Ibid, 74* [↑](#footnote-ref-33)
34. Syaiful Bahri Djamarah, *Guru Dan Anak Didik: Suatu Pendekatan Teoritis Psikologis* (Jakarta: PT RINEKA CIPTA, 2005), 119. [↑](#footnote-ref-34)
35. Uzer Usman, *Menjadi Guru Profesional* (Bandung : PT Remaja RosdaKarya, 2005), 73. [↑](#footnote-ref-35)
36. Kefas Angandrowa D. P. Z, Thesis*: “The Use Of Verbal Reinforcement To Motivate The 11th Grade Students Of SMA Budya Wacana Yogyakarta To Speak English”,* (Yogyakarta: Universitas Sanata Dharma Yogyakarta, 2017), 44. [↑](#footnote-ref-36)
37. Lailatul Layliyah, Skripsi: “Pemberian Penguatan (Reinforcement) Dalam Meningkatkan Motivasi Belajar Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) Siswa Di SMP Negeri 18 Malang”, (Malang: Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, 2008), 119. [↑](#footnote-ref-37)
38. Leandra Pintel, Thesis: “The Effect Of Positive Reinforcement On The Achievement Of 3rd Grade Students' Spelling”, (New Jersey, USA: Rowan University, 2006), 21. [↑](#footnote-ref-38)
39. Oktavika Trihesty, Skripsi: “Pengaruh Pemberian Penguatan (*Reinforcement*) Terhadap Hasil Belajar IPA Pada Siswa Kelas V Sd Daerah Binaan 5 Kecamatan Petarukan Kabupaten Pemalang”, (Semarang: Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2015), 85. [↑](#footnote-ref-39)
40. Dewi Maslichah K – Haryono, “ Pemberian Penguatan (*Reinforcement*) Dalam Pembelajaran Matematika Pada Materi Sistem Persamaan Linear Dua Variabel (SPLDV) Di Kelas VII SMP Al-Azhar Menganti Gresik”, Surabaya: UNESA [↑](#footnote-ref-40)
41. Farida Mukti Sari. Skripsi: “Kemampuan Guru Memberi Penguatan Dalam Pembelajaran Tematik Berbasis KTSP Di SD Kecamatan Ngaliyan Kota Semarang”, (Semarang: Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2015), 148. [↑](#footnote-ref-41)
42. Ihsan Amir - Imam Suyitno, “Analisis Pemberian Reinforcement Dalam Pembelajaran PKN di SMA Negeri 1 Lamuru Kecamatan Lamuru Kabupaten Bone”, (Makassar: Universitas Negeri Makassar), 96. [↑](#footnote-ref-42)
43. Aulia Fitrianti, Zulaiha & Kustiono, “Type Of Verbal And Non-Verbal Reinforcement Given By Teacher In Elementary School”, *Journal Of Primary Education.* Vol. 7 No. 3, December 2018. [↑](#footnote-ref-43)
44. Yuli Eka Putri, “An Analysis Of Teachers’ Reinforcement Toward Student’s Interaction In Teaching Speaking At SMPN 7 Padang”, STKIP PGRI SUMBAR, 2017, 2 [↑](#footnote-ref-44)
45. Vivek Kumar Stephen & Prem Prabha Singh, “Study of the relationship between student and teachers in terms of reinforcement in Primary schools of the Allahabad”, *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science (IOSR-JHSS).* Vol. 22 No. 12, December 2017. 26-33 [↑](#footnote-ref-45)
46. N. N. S. Mandah1 & O. L. Gbarato, “The Influence Of Reinforcement Skill On Academic Performance Of Secondary School Physic Students In Obio-Akpor Lga, Rivers State Nigeria”, *British Journal Of Education, Society and Behavioural Science.* Vol. 17 No. 3, 2016. 1-11 [↑](#footnote-ref-46)
47. Muhammad Rozikan, “Guidance And Reinforcement Of Student Value System: The Case Of Islamic Boarding School Yanbu’ul Quran Kudus”, *Journal Of* *Islamic Culture and Education.*

    Vol. 2 No. 1, 2017, 128-151. [↑](#footnote-ref-47)
48. Francie Murry,”Teaching Teachers the Five Principles of Behavior Reinforcement: Changing Challenging Behaviors in the Classroom”, *Journal of Education and Human Development.* Vol. 4 No. 4, December 2015, 177-187. [↑](#footnote-ref-48)
49. Gary Anderson - Nancy Arsenault, *Fundamentals of Educational Research,* Second edition (UK : the Taylor & Francis e-Library, 2005), 126 [↑](#footnote-ref-49)
50. Jack R. Fraenkel, et.al., *How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 2012), 10 [↑](#footnote-ref-50)
51. J.R. Raco, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif* (Jakarta: Gramedia Widiasarana Indonesia, 2010), 109 [↑](#footnote-ref-51)
52. John W Creswell, *Educational Research : Planning, Conducting, And Evaluating Quantitative And Qualitative Research,* Fourth edition (Boston: Pearson education, 2012), 206 [↑](#footnote-ref-52)
53. Jack R. Fraenkel, et.al., *How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 2012), 111 [↑](#footnote-ref-53)
54. John W Creswell, *Research Design Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches,* Third editio, (California: SAGE Publications, 2009), 164 [↑](#footnote-ref-54)
55. *Ibid, 167* [↑](#footnote-ref-55)
56. John W Creswell, *Research Design Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (United Kingdom: SAGE Publications Inc ,2009). [↑](#footnote-ref-56)
57. Donald Ary,et.al., *Introduction to Research in Education,* Eight edition (Canada: Nelson Education, 2010),438 [↑](#footnote-ref-57)
58. *Ibid, p. 438* [↑](#footnote-ref-58)
59. Catherine Dawson, *Metode Penelitian Praktis* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2010), 31. [↑](#footnote-ref-59)
60. Michael Quinn Patton - Michael Cochran, *Guide to Using Qualitative Research Methodology* (Medecins San Frontieres, 2002). [↑](#footnote-ref-60)
61. John W. Creswell, *Research Design – Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches,* Third Edition(California: SAGE Publications, 2009), 184-185. [↑](#footnote-ref-61)
62. J.R. Raco, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif* (Jakarta: Gramedia Widiasarana Indonesia, 2010), 134 [↑](#footnote-ref-62)
63. Bachtiar S. Bachri*, Meyakinkan Validitas Data Melalui Triangulasi pada Penelitian Kualitatif* (Surabaya: Teknology Pendidikan, 2010) [↑](#footnote-ref-63)
64. NK Denzin, *Sociological Methods* (New York: McGraw Hill, 1978), 72. [↑](#footnote-ref-64)
65. John W. Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design Choosing Among Five Traditions* (Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications Inc., 1998), 57. [↑](#footnote-ref-65)