

Solution **Section 3.2 – Recursive Definitions and Structural Induction**

Exercise

Find $f(1)$, $f(2)$, $f(3)$, and $f(4)$ if $f(n)$ is defined recursively by $f(0) = 1$ and for $n = 0, 1, 2, \dots$

$$a) \quad f(n+1) = f(n) + 2$$

$$b) \quad f(n+1) = 3f(n)$$

$$c) \quad f(n+1) = 2^{f(n)}$$

$$d) \quad f(n+1) = f(n)^2 + f(n) + 1$$

Solution

$$a) \quad f(1) = f(0) + 2$$

$$= 1 + 2$$

$$= \underline{3}$$

$$f(2) = f(1) + 2$$

$$= 3 + 2$$

$$= \underline{5}$$

$$f(3) = f(2) + 2$$

$$= 5 + 2$$

$$= \underline{7}$$

$$f(4) = f(3) + 2$$

$$= 7 + 2$$

$$= \underline{9}$$

$$b) \quad f(n+1) = 3f(n)$$

$$f(1) = 3 \cdot f(0)$$

$$= 3(1)$$

$$= \underline{3}$$

$$f(2) = 3 \cdot f(1)$$

$$= 3(3)$$

$$= \underline{9}$$

$$f(3) = 3 \cdot f(2)$$

$$= 3(9)$$

$$= \underline{27}$$

$$f(4) = 3 \cdot f(3)$$

$$= 3(27)$$

$$= \underline{81}$$

$$c) \quad f(n+1) = 2^{f(n)}$$

$$\begin{aligned} f(1) &= 2^{f(0)} \\ &= 2^1 \\ &= \underline{2} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} f(2) &= 2^{f(1)} \\ &= 2^2 \\ &= \underline{4} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} f(3) &= 2^{f(2)} \\ &= 2^4 \\ &= \underline{16} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} f(4) &= 2^{f(3)} \\ &= 2^{16} \\ &= \underline{65536} \end{aligned}$$

$$d) \quad f(n+1) = f(n)^2 + f(n) + 1$$

$$\begin{aligned} f(1) &= f(0)^2 + f(0) + 1 \\ &= 1^2 + 1 + 1 \\ &= \underline{3} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} f(2) &= f(1)^2 + f(1) + 1 \\ &= 3^2 + 3 + 1 \\ &= \underline{13} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} f(3) &= f(2)^2 + f(2) + 1 \\ &= 13^2 + 13 + 1 \\ &= \underline{183} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} f(4) &= f(3)^2 + f(3) + 1 \\ &= 183^2 + 183 + 1 \\ &= \underline{33673} \end{aligned}$$

Exercise

Find $f(1)$, $f(2)$, $f(3)$, $f(4)$ and $f(5)$ if $f(n)$ is defined recursively by $f(0) = 3$ and for $n = 0, 1, 2, \dots$

$$a) \quad f(n+1) = -2f(n)$$

$$b) \quad f(n+1) = 3f(n) + 7$$

$$c) \quad f(n+1) = 3^{f(n)/3}$$

$$d) \quad f(n+1) = f(n)^2 - 2f(n) - 2$$

Solution

$$a) \quad f(n+1) = -2f(n)$$

$$f(1) = -2f(0)$$

$$= -2(3)$$

$$= \underline{-6}$$

$$f(2) = -2f(1)$$

$$= -2(-6)$$

$$= \underline{12}$$

$$f(3) = -2f(2)$$

$$= -2(12)$$

$$= \underline{-24}$$

$$f(4) = -2f(3)$$

$$= -2(-24)$$

$$= \underline{48}$$

$$f(5) = -2f(4)$$

$$= -2(48)$$

$$= \underline{-96}$$

$$b) \quad f(1) = 3 \cdot f(0) + 7$$

$$= 3(3) + 7$$

$$= \underline{16}$$

$$f(2) = 3 \cdot f(1) + 7$$

$$= 3(16) + 7$$

$$= \underline{55}$$

$$f(3) = 3 \cdot f(2) + 7$$

$$= 3(55) + 7$$

$$= \underline{172}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(4) &= 3 \cdot f(3) + 7 \\
 &= 3(172) + 7 \\
 &= \underline{523}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(5) &= 3 \cdot f(4) + 7 \\
 &= 3(523) + 7 \\
 &= \underline{1576}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 c) \quad f(1) &= 3^{f(0)/3} \\
 &= 3^{3/3} \\
 &= 3^1 \\
 &= \underline{3}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(2) &= 3^{f(1)/3} \\
 &= 3^{3/3} \\
 &= 3^1 \\
 &= \underline{3}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(3) &= 3^{f(2)/3} \\
 &= 3^{3/3} \\
 &= 3^1 \\
 &= \underline{3}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(4) &= 3^{f(3)/3} \\
 &= 3^{3/3} \\
 &= 3^1 \\
 &= \underline{3}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(5) &= 3^{f(4)/3} \\
 &= 3^{3/3} \\
 &= 3^1 \\
 &= \underline{3}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 d) \quad f(1) &= f(0)^2 - 2f(0) - 2 \\
 &= 3^2 - 2(3) - 2 \\
 &= \underline{1}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$f(2) = f(1)^2 - 2f(1) - 2$$

$$= 1^2 - 2(1) - 2$$

$$\underline{= -3}$$

$$f(3) = f(2)^2 - 2f(2) - 2$$

$$= (-3)^2 - 2(-3) - 2$$

$$\underline{= 13}$$

$$f(4) = f(3)^2 - 2f(3) - 2$$

$$= (13)^2 - 2(13) - 2$$

$$\underline{= 141}$$

$$f(5) = f(4)^2 - 2f(4) - 2$$

$$= (141)^2 - 2(141) - 2$$

$$\underline{= 19,597}$$

Exercise

Find $f(2)$, $f(3)$, $f(4)$ and $f(5)$ if $f(n)$ is defined recursively by $f(0) = f(1) = 1$ and for $n = 1, 2, \dots$

$$a) \quad f(n+1) = f(n) - f(n-1)$$

$$b) \quad f(n+1) = f(n)f(n-1)$$

$$c) \quad f(n+1) = f(n)^2 + f(n-1)^3$$

$$d) \quad f(n+1) = f(n) / f(n-1)$$

Solution

$$a) \quad f(2) = f(1) - f(0)$$

$$= 1 - 1$$

$$\underline{= 0}$$

$$f(3) = f(2) - f(1)$$

$$= 0 - 1$$

$$\underline{= -1}$$

$$f(4) = f(3) - f(2)$$

$$= -1 - 0$$

$$\underline{= -1}$$

$$f(5) = f(4) - f(3)$$

$$= -1 - (-1)$$

$$\underline{= 0}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 b) \quad f(2) &= f(1)f(0) \\
 &= (1)(1) \\
 &= \underline{1}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(3) &= f(2)f(1) \\
 &= (1)(1) \\
 &= \underline{1}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(4) &= f(3)f(2) \\
 &= (1)(1) \\
 &= \underline{1}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(5) &= f(4)f(3) \\
 &= (1)(1) \\
 &= \underline{1}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 c) \quad f(2) &= f(1)^2 + f(0)^3 \\
 &= 1^2 + 1^3 \\
 &= \underline{2}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(3) &= f(2)^2 + f(1)^3 \\
 &= 2^2 + 1^3 \\
 &= \underline{5}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(4) &= f(3)^2 + f(2)^3 \\
 &= 5^2 + 2^3 \\
 &= \underline{33}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(5) &= f(4)^2 + f(3)^3 \\
 &= 33^2 + 5^3 \\
 &= \underline{1,214}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 d) \quad f(2) &= \frac{f(1)}{f(0)} \\
 &= \frac{1}{1} \\
 &= \underline{1}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(3) &= \frac{f(2)}{f(1)} \\
 &= \frac{1}{1}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \underline{=1} \\
f(4) &= \frac{f(3)}{f(2)} \\
&= \frac{1}{1} \\
& \underline{=1} \\
f(5) &= \frac{f(4)}{f(3)} \\
&= \frac{1}{1} \\
& \underline{=1}
\end{aligned}$$

Exercise

Determine whether each of these proposed definitions is a valid recursive definition of a function f from the set of nonnegative integers to the set of integers. If f is well defined, find a formula for $f(n)$ when n is nonnegative integer and prove that your formula is valid.

- a) $f(0) = 0, f(n) = 2f(n-2)$ for $n \geq 1$
- b) $f(0) = 1, f(n) = -f(n-1)$ for $n \geq 1$
- c) $f(0) = 1, f(n) = f(n-1) - 1$ for $n \geq 1$
- d) $f(0) = 2, f(1) = 3, f(n) = f(n-1) - 1$ for $n \geq 2$
- e) $f(0) = 1, f(1) = 2, f(n) = 2f(n-2)$ for $n \geq 2$
- f) $f(0) = 1, f(1) = 0, f(2) = 2, f(n) = 2f(n-3)$ for $n \geq 3$
- g) $f(0) = 0, f(1) = 1, f(n) = 2f(n+1)$ for $n \geq 2$
- h) $f(0) = 0, f(1) = 1, f(n) = 2f(n-1)$ for $n \geq 2$
- i) $f(0) = 2, f(n) = f(n-1)$ if n is odd and $n \geq 1$ and $f(n) = 2f(n-2)$ if n is even and $n \geq 2$
- j) $f(0) = 1, f(n) = 3f(n-1)$ if n is odd and $n \geq 1$ and $f(n) = 9f(n-2)$ if n is even and $n \geq 2$

Solution

- a) This is invalid, since $f(1) = 2f(1-2) = 2f(-1)$ for $n \geq 1$, $f(-1)$ is not defined.
- b) $f(1) = -f(0) = -1$, this is a valid, since $n = 0$ is provided and each subsequent value is determined by the previous one. $f(n) = (-1)^n$, this is true for $n = 0$ since $(-1)^0 = 1$.
Assume it is true for $n = k$, then
 $f(k+1) = -f(k+1-1) = -f(k) = -(-1)^k = (-1)^{k+1}$
- c) $f(1) = f(0) - 1 = 1 - 1 = 0$, this is a valid.

$$f(2) = f(1) - 1 = 0 - 1 = -1$$

The sequence: 1, 0, -1, -2, -3, ... $\Rightarrow f(n) = 1 - n$

By induction:

The basis step: $f(0) = 1 - 0 = 1$

If $f(k) = 1 - k$

Then $f(k+1) = f(k) - 1 = 1 - k - 1 = 1 - (k+1)$

$$d) f(2) = f(1) - 1 = 3 - 1 = 2$$

$$f(3) = f(2) - 1 = 2 - 1 = 1$$

Given: $f(0) = 2, f(1) = 3$

Then the sequence: 2, 3, 2, 1, 0, ... $\Rightarrow f(n) = 4 - n$

By induction: Basis step: $f(0) = 2$ and $f(1) = 4 - 1 = 3$

If $f(k) = 4 - k$

Then $f(k+1) = f(k) - 1 = 4 - k - 1 = 4 - (k+1)$

$$e) f(2) = 2f(0) = 2 \quad f(1) = 2$$

$$f(3) = 2f(1) = 2(2) = 4 \quad f(4) = 2f(2) = 2(2) = 4$$

$$f(5) = 2f(3) = 2(4) = 8 \quad f(6) = 2f(4) = 2(4) = 8$$

Then the sequence: 1, 2, 2, 4, 4, 8, 8, ... $\Rightarrow f(n) = 2^{(n+1)/2}$

By induction: Basis step: $f(0) = 2^{(0+1)/2} = 1$ and $f(1) = 2^{(1+1)/2} = 2$ and

If $f(k) = 2^{(k+1)/2}$

Then

$$f(k+1) = 2f(k-1) = 2 \cdot 2^{(k-1+1)/2} = 2 \cdot 2^{k/2} = 2^{(k/2)+1} = 2^{(k+2)/2} = \underline{2^{((k+1)+1)/2}}$$

$$f) f(3) = 2f(0) = 2(1) = 2 \quad f(4) = 2f(1) = 2(0) = 0 \quad f(5) = 2f(2) = 2(2) = 4$$

$$f(6) = 2f(3) = 2(2) = 4 \quad f(7) = 2f(4) = 2(0) = 0 \quad f(8) = 2f(5) = 2(4) = 8$$

This is valid, since the values $n = 0, 1, 2$ are given. The sequence: 1, 0, 2, 2, 0, 4, 4, 0, 8, ...

We conjecture the formula

Prove

$$f(n) = 2^{n/3} \text{ when } n \equiv 0(\text{mod } 3)$$

$$f(0) = 2^{0/3} = 1$$

$$f(n) = 0 \text{ when } n \equiv 1(\text{mod } 3)$$

$$f(1) = 0$$

$$f(n) = 2^{(n+1)/3} \text{ when } n \equiv 2(\text{mod } 3)$$

$$f(2) = 2^{(2+1)/3} = 2^1 = 2$$

Assume the inductive hypothesis that the formula is valid for smaller inputs. Then

For $n \equiv 0(\text{mod } 3)$ we have $f(n) = 2f(n-3) = 2 \cdot 2^{(n-3)/3} = 2 \cdot 2^{n/3} \cdot 2^{-1} = 2^{n/3}$ as desired

For $n \equiv 1(\text{mod } 3)$ we have $f(n) = 2f(n-3) = 2 \cdot 0 = 0$ as desired

For $n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$ we have $f(n) = 2f(n-3) = 2 \cdot 2^{(n-3+1)/3} = 2 \cdot 2^{(n+1)/3} \cdot 2^{-1} = 2^{(n+1)/3}$ as desired

g) $f(2) = 2f(3)$ This is not valid, since $f(3)$ has not been defined

h) $f(2) = 2 \cdot f(1) = 2(1) = 2$ $f(3) = 2f(2) = 2(2) = 4$

This is *invalid*, because the value at $n = 1$ is defined in 2 conflicting ways, first as $f(1) = 1$ and then as $f(1) = 2f(1-1) = 2f(0) = 2(0) = 0$

i) $f(1) = f(0) = 2$ $f(2) = 2f(0) = 2(2) = 4$

$f(3) = f(2) = 4$ $f(4) = 2f(2) = 2(4) = 8$

This is *invalid*, since we have a conflict for odd $n \geq 3$.

On one hand $f(3) = f(2)$, but the other hand $f(3) = 2f(1)$.

However, $f(1) = f(0) = 2$ and $f(2) = 2f(0) = 4$, so these apparently conflicting rules tell us that $f(3) = 2 \cdot 2 = 4$ on the other hand. We got the same answer either way.

The sequence: 2, 2, 4, 4, 8, 8, ...

j) $f(1) = 3f(0) = 3(1) = 3$ $f(2) = 9f(0) = 9(1) = 9$

$f(3) = 3f(2) = 3(9) = 27$ $f(4) = 9f(2) = 9(9) = 81$

The sequence: 1, 3, 9, 27, 81, ...

This is a valid, since we conjecture the formula $f(n) = 3^n$

By induction: Basis step: $f(0) = 3^0 = 1$

If $f(k) = 3^k$

Then $f(k+1) = 3f(k) = 3 \cdot 3^k = \underline{3^{k+1}}$

Exercise

Give a recursive definition of the sequence $\{a_n\}$, $n = 1, 2, 3, \dots$ if

a) $a_n = 6n$ b) $a_n = 2n + 1$ c) $a_n = 10^n$ d) $a_n = 5$

e) $a_n = 4n - 2$ f) $a_n = 1 + (-1)^n$ g) $a_n = n(n+1)$ h) $a_n = n^2$

Solution

a) $a_1 = 6$

$a_2 = 12 = 6 + 6$

$a_3 = 18 = 12 + 6$

\vdots

$$\rightarrow \underline{a_{n+1} = a_n + 6} \quad \text{with } a_1 = 6 \quad \text{for all } n \geq 1$$

$$b) \quad a_1 = 3$$

$$a_2 = 5 = 3 + 2$$

$$a_3 = 7 = 5 + 2$$

$$\vdots \quad \vdots$$

$$\rightarrow \underline{a_{n+1} = a_n + 2} \quad \text{with } a_1 = 3 \quad \text{for all } n \geq 1$$

$$c) \quad a_1 = 10$$

$$a_2 = 10^2 = 10 \cdot 10$$

$$a_3 = 10^3 = 10 \cdot 10^2$$

$$\vdots \quad \vdots$$

$$\underline{a_{n+1} = 10a_n} \quad \text{with } a_1 = 10 \quad \text{for all } n \geq 1$$

$$d) \quad a_1 = 5$$

$$a_2 = 5$$

$$a_3 = 5$$

$$\vdots \quad \vdots$$

$$\underline{a_{n+1} = a_1} \quad \text{with } a_1 = 5, \quad \text{for all } n \geq 1$$

$$e) \quad a_1 = 2$$

$$a_2 = 6 = 2 + 4$$

$$a_3 = 10 = 6 + 4$$

$$\vdots \quad \vdots$$

$$\underline{a_{n+1} = a_n + 4} \quad \text{with } a_1 = 2, \quad \text{for all } n \geq 1$$

$$f) \quad a_1 = 1 - 1 = 0,$$

$$a_2 = 1 + 1 = 2$$

$$a_3 = 1 - 1 = 0$$

$$\vdots \quad \vdots$$

The sequence alternate: 0, 2, 0, 2, ...

$$\underline{a_n = a_{n-2}} \quad \text{with } a_1 = 0, a_2 = 2, \quad \text{for all } n \geq 3$$

$$g) \quad a_1 = 1(2) = 2$$

$$a_2 = 2(3) = 6$$

$$a_3 = 12$$

$$\vdots \quad \vdots$$

The sequence alternate: 2, 6, 12, 20, 30, ...

The difference between successive terms are 4, 6, 8, 10,

$$\underline{a_n = a_{n-1} + 2n} \quad \text{with } a_1 = 2, \quad \text{for all } n \geq 2$$

$$h) \quad a_1 = 1^2 = 1$$

$$a_2 = 2^2 = 4$$

$$a_3 = 3^2 = 9$$

$$\vdots \quad \vdots$$

The sequence alternate: 1, 4, 9, 16, 25, ...

The difference between successive terms are 3, 5, 7, 9,

$$\underline{a_n = a_{n-1} + 2n - 1} \quad \text{with } a_1 = 1, \quad \text{for all } n \geq 2$$

Exercise

Prove that $f_1^2 + f_2^2 + \dots + f_n^2 = f_n f_{n+1}$ when n is a positive integer and f_n is the n th Fibonacci number.

Solution

For $n = 1$: $f_1^2 = f_1 f_2 = 1 \cdot 1 = 1$ is true since both values are 1

Assume the inductive hypothesis. Then

$$\begin{aligned} f_1^2 + f_2^2 + \dots + f_n^2 + f_{n+1}^2 &= f_n f_{n+1} + f_{n+1}^2 \\ &= f_{n+1} (f_n + f_{n+1}) \\ &= f_{n+1} f_{n+2} \end{aligned}$$

Exercise

Prove that $f_1 + f_3 + \dots + f_{2n-1} = f_{2n}$ when n is a positive integer and f_n is the n th Fibonacci number.

Solution

Using the principle of mathematical induction

For $n=1$: $f_1 = f_2$ is true since both values are 1

Let assume that $f_1 + f_3 + \cdots + f_{2n-1} = f_{2n}$

We need to prove that $f_1 + f_3 + \cdots + f_{2n-1} + f_{2n+1} = f_{2(n+1)}$

$$\begin{aligned} f_1 + f_3 + \cdots + f_{2n-1} + f_{2n+1} &= f_{2n} + f_{2n+1} \\ &= f_{2n+2} \quad (\text{by the definition of the Fibonacci numbers}) \end{aligned}$$

Exercise

Give a recursive definition of

- a) The set of odd positive integers
- b) The set of positive integers powers of 3
- c) The set of polynomial with integer coefficients
- d) The set of even integers
- e) The set of positive integers congruent to 2 modulo 3.
- f) The set of positive integers not divisible by 5

Solution

- a) Off integers are obtained from other odd integers by adding 2.

Thus, we can define this set S as follows $1 \in S$; and if $n \in S$, then $n+2 \in S$.

- b) Powers of 3 are obtained from other powers of 3 by multiplying by 3.

Thus, we can define this set S as follows $3 \in S$; and if $n \in S$, then $3n \in S$.

- c) There are several ways to do this. One that is suggested by Horner's method is as follows. We assume that the variable for these polynomials is the letter x . All integers are in S ; if $p(x) \in S$ and n is any integer, then $xp(x) + n$ is in S .

Another method constructs the polynomials term by term. Its base case is to let 0 be in S ; and its inductive step is to say that if $p(x) \in S$, c is an integer, and n is a nonnegative integer, then

$$p(x) + cx^n \text{ is in } S.$$

- d) Off integers are obtained from other even integers by adding 2.

Thus, we can define this set S as follows $2 \in S$; and if $n \in S$, then $n-2 \in S$ and $n+2 \in S$.

- e) The smallest positive integer congruent to 2 modulo 3 is 2, so $2 \in S$. All the others can be obtained by adding multiples of 3, so the inductive step is that $n \in S$, then $n+3 \in S$

- f) The positive integers no divisible by 5 are the ones congruent to 1, 2, 3, or 4 modulo 5.

Thus, we can define this set S as follows $1 \in S$, $2 \in S$, $3 \in S$, and $4 \in S$; and if $n \in S$, then $n+5 \in S$

Exercise

Let S be the subset of the set of ordered pairs of integers defined recursively by

Basis step: $(0, 0) \in S$.

Recursive step: If $(a, b) \in S$, then $(a+2, b+3) \in S$ and $(a+3, b+2) \in S$

- a) List the elements of S produced by the first five applications of the recursive definition.
- b) Use strong induction on the number of applications of the recursive step of the definition to show that $5 \mid a+b$ when $(a, b) \in S$.
- c) Use structural induction to show that $5 \mid a+b$ when $(a, b) \in S$.

Solution

- a) Apply each recursive step rules to the only element given in the basis step, we see that $(2, 3)$ and $(3, 2)$ are in S .

If we apply the recursive step to these we add $(4, 6)$, $(5, 5)$ and $(6, 4)$.

The next round gives us $(6, 9)$, $(7, 8)$, and $(9, 6)$. Add $(8, 12)$, $(9, 11)$, $(10, 10)$, $(11, 9)$, and $(12, 8)$; and a fifth set of applications adds $(10, 15)$, $(11, 4)$, $(12, 13)$, $(13, 12)$, $(14, 1)$, and $(15, 10)$.

- b) Let $P(n)$ be the statement that $5 \mid a+b$ when $(a, b) \in S$ is obtained by n applications to the recursive step.

For $n = 0$, $P(0)$ is true, since the only element of S obtained with no applications of the recursive step is $(0, 0)$, and $5 \mid 0+0$ ✓

Assume the inductive hypothesis that $5 \mid a+b$ whenever $(a, b) \in S$ is obtained by k or fewer applications of the recursive step, and consider an element obtained with $k+1$ applications of the recursive step. Since the final application of the recursive step to an element (a, b) must applied to an element, that $5 \mid a+b$.

We need to check that this inequality implies $5 \mid a+2+b+3$ and $5 \mid a+3+b+2$.

This is clear, since each is equivalent to $5 \mid a+b+5$ and 5 divides both $a+b$ and 5.

- c) This holds for the basis step, since $5 \mid 0+0$

If this holds for (a, b) , then it also holds for the elements obtained from (a, b) in the recursive step by the same argument as in part (b).

Exercise

Let S be the subset of the set of ordered pairs of integers defined recursively by

Basis step: $(0, 0) \in S$.

Recursive step: If $(a, b) \in S$, then $(a, b+1) \in S$, $(a+1, b+1) \in S$ and $(a+2, b+1) \in S$

- List the elements of S produced by the first five applications of the recursive definition.
- Use strong induction on the number of applications of the recursive step of the definition to show that $a \leq 2b$ whenever $(a, b) \in S$.
- Use structural induction to show that $a \leq 2b$ whenever $(a, b) \in S$.

Solution

- Apply each recursive step rules to the only element given in the basis step, we see that $(0, 1)$, $(1, 1)$ and $(2, 1)$ are in S .

2nd step: $(0, 2)$, $(1, 2)$, $(2, 2)$, $(3, 2)$ and $(4, 2)$.

3rd step: $(0, 3)$, $(1, 3)$, $(2, 3)$, $(3, 3)$, $(4, 3)$, $(5, 3)$ and $(6, 3)$.

4th step: $(0, 4)$, $(1, 4)$, $(2, 4)$, $(3, 4)$, $(4, 4)$, $(5, 4)$, $(6, 4)$, $(7, 4)$ and $(8, 4)$

5th step: $(0, 5)$, $(1, 5)$, $(2, 5)$, $(3, 5)$, $(4, 5)$, $(5, 5)$, $(6, 5)$, $(7, 5)$, $(8, 5)$, $(9, 5)$, and $(10, 5)$

- Let $P(n)$ be the statement that $a \leq 2b$ whenever $(a, b) \in S$ is obtained with no applications of the recursive step.

For the basis step, the only element of S obtained with no applications of the recursive step is $(0, 0)$, then $0 \leq 2 \cdot 0$ is true. Therefore $P(0)$ is true.

Assume that $a \leq 2b$ whenever $(a, b) \in S$ is obtained by k or fewer applications of the recursive step. Consider an element obtained with $k + 1$ applications of the recursive step.

We know that $a \leq 2b$, we need to check this inequality implies $a \leq 2(b+1)$, $a+1 \leq 2(b+1)$, and $a+2 \leq 2(b+1)$.

Thus is clear that $0 \leq 2$, $1 \leq 2$ and $2 \leq 2$, respectively, to $a \leq 2b$ to obtain these inequalities.

- This holds for the basis step, since $0 \leq 0$.

If this holds for (a, b) , then it also holds for the elements obtained from (a, b) in the recursive step, since adding $0 \leq 2$, $1 \leq 2$ and $2 \leq 2$, respectively, to $a \leq 2b$ yields $a \leq 2(b+1)$,

$a+1 \leq 2(b+1)$, and $a+2 \leq 2(b+1)$.