

# THE TRUTH ABOUT TORSION IN THE CM CASE

PETE L. CLARK AND PAUL POLLACK

ABSTRACT. Let  $T_{\mathbf{CM}}(d)$  be the maximum size of the torsion subgroup of an elliptic curve with complex multiplication over a degree  $d$  number field. We show there is an absolute, effective constant  $C$  such that  $T_{\mathbf{CM}}(d) \leq Cd \log \log d$  for all  $d \geq 3$ .

For a commutative group  $G$ , we denote by  $G[\text{tors}]$  the torsion subgroup of  $G$ .

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The aim of this note is to prove the following result.

**Theorem 1.** *There is an absolute, effective constant  $C$  such that for all number fields  $F$  of degree  $d \geq 3$  and all elliptic curves  $E/F$  with complex multiplication,*

$$\#E(F)[\text{tors}] \leq Cd \log \log d.$$

It is natural to compare this result with the following one.

**Theorem 2** (Hindry–Silverman [HS99]). *For all number fields  $F$  of degree  $d \geq 2$  and all elliptic curves  $E/F$  with  $j$ -invariant  $j(E) \in \mathcal{O}_F$ , we have*

$$\#E(F)[\text{tors}] \leq 1977408d \log d.$$

Every CM elliptic curve  $E/F$  has  $j(E) \in \mathcal{O}_F$ , and only finitely many  $j \in \mathcal{O}_F$  are  $j$ -invariants of CM elliptic curves  $E/F$ . But the improvement of  $\log \log d$  over  $\log d$  is interesting in view of the following result.

**Theorem 3** (Breuer [Br10]). *Let  $E/F$  be an elliptic curve over a number field. There exists a constant  $c(E, F) > 0$ , integers  $3 \leq d_1 < d_2 < \dots < d_n < \dots$  and number fields  $F_n \supset F$  with  $[F_n : F] = d_n$  such that for all  $n \in \mathbb{Z}^+$  we have*

$$\#E(F_n)[\text{tors}] \geq \begin{cases} c(E, F) d_n \log \log d_n & \text{if } E \text{ has CM,} \\ c(E, F) \sqrt{d_n} \log \log d_n & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

Let  $T_{\mathbf{CM}}(d)$  be the maximum size of the torsion subgroup of a CM elliptic curve over a degree  $d$  number field. Theorems 1 and 3 tell us that  $T_{\mathbf{CM}}(d)$  has *upper order*  $d \log \log d$ :

$$0 < \limsup_{d \rightarrow \infty} \frac{T_{\mathbf{CM}}(d)}{d \log \log d} < \infty.$$

To our knowledge, this is the first instance of an upper order result for torsion points on a class of abelian varieties over number fields of varying degree.

Define  $T(d)$  as for  $T_{\mathbf{CM}}(d)$  but replacing “CM elliptic curve” with “elliptic curve”, and define  $T_{-\mathbf{CM}}(d)$  as for  $T_{\mathbf{CM}}(d)$  but replacing “CM elliptic curve” with “elliptic curve *without* CM”. Hindry and Silverman ask whether  $T_{-\mathbf{CM}}(d)$  has upper order  $\sqrt{d} \log \log d$ . If so, the upper order of  $T(d)$  would be  $d \log \log d$  [CCRS13, Conjecture 1].

## 2. PROOF OF THE MAIN THEOREM

## 2.1. Torsion Points and Ray Class Containment

Let  $K$  be a number field. Let  $\mathcal{O}_K$  be the ring of integers of  $K$ ,  $\Delta_K$  the discriminant of  $K$ ,  $w_K$  the number of roots of unity in  $K$  and  $h_K$  the class number of  $K$ . By an “ideal of  $\mathcal{O}_K$ ” we shall always mean a nonzero ideal. For an ideal  $\mathfrak{a}$  of  $\mathcal{O}_K$ , we write  $K^{(\mathfrak{a})}$  for the  $\mathfrak{a}$ -ray class field of  $K$ . We also put  $|\mathfrak{a}| = \#\mathcal{O}_K/\mathfrak{a}$  and

$$\varphi_K(\mathfrak{a}) = \#(\mathcal{O}_K/\mathfrak{a})^\times = |\mathfrak{a}| \prod_{\mathfrak{p}|\mathfrak{a}} \left(1 - \frac{1}{|\mathfrak{p}|}\right).$$

An elliptic curve  $E$  defined over a field of characteristic 0 has *complex multiplication (CM)* if  $\text{End } E \supsetneq \mathbb{Z}$ ; then  $\text{End } E$  is an order in an imaginary quadratic field. We say  $E$  has  $\mathcal{O}$ -CM if  $\text{End } E \cong \mathcal{O}$  and  $K$ -CM if  $\text{End } E$  is an order in  $K$ .

**Lemma 4.** *Let  $K$  be an imaginary quadratic field and  $\mathfrak{a}$  an ideal of  $\mathcal{O}_K$ . Then*

$$\frac{h_K \varphi_K(\mathfrak{a})}{6} \leq \frac{h_K \varphi_K(\mathfrak{a})}{w_K} \leq [K^{(\mathfrak{a})} : K] \leq h_K \varphi_K(\mathfrak{a}).$$

*Proof.* This follows from [Co00, Corollary 3.2.4].  $\square$

**Theorem 5.** *Let  $K$  be an imaginary quadratic field,  $F \supset K$  a number field,  $E/F$  a  $K$ -CM elliptic curve and  $N \in \mathbb{Z}^+$ . If  $(\mathbb{Z}/N\mathbb{Z})^2 \hookrightarrow E(F)$ , then  $F \supset K^{(N\mathcal{O}_K)}$ .*

*Proof.* The result is part of classical CM theory when  $\text{End } E = \mathcal{O}_K$  is the maximal order in  $K$  [Si94, II.5.6]. We shall reduce to that case. There is an  $\mathcal{O}_K$ -CM elliptic curve  $E'_F$  and a canonical  $F$ -rational isogeny  $\iota: E \rightarrow E'$  [CCRS13, Prop. 25]. There is a field embedding  $F \hookrightarrow \mathbb{C}$  such that the base change of  $\iota$  to  $\mathbb{C}$  is, up to isomorphisms on the source and target, given by  $\mathbb{C}/\mathcal{O} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}/\mathcal{O}_K$ . If we put

$$P = 1/N + \mathcal{O} \in E[N], \quad P' = 1/N + \mathcal{O}_K \in E'[N],$$

then  $\iota(P) = P'$  and  $P'$  generates  $E'[N]$  as an  $\mathcal{O}_K$ -module. By assumption  $P \in E(F)$ , so  $\iota(P) = P' \in E'(F)$ . It follows that  $(\mathbb{Z}/N\mathbb{Z})^2 \hookrightarrow E'(F)[\text{tors}]$ .  $\square$

**Remark 6.** *In fact one can show — e.g., using adelic methods — that for any  $K$ -CM elliptic curve  $E$  defined over  $\mathbb{C}$ , the field obtained by adjoining to  $K(j(E))$  the values of the Weber function at the  $N$ -torsion points of  $E$  contains  $K^{(N\mathcal{O}_K)}$ .*

## 2.2. Squaring the Torsion Subgroup of a CM Elliptic Curve

**Theorem 7.** *Let  $K$  be an imaginary quadratic field, let  $F \supset K$  a field extension, and let  $E/F$  be a  $K$ -CM elliptic curve. Suppose that for positive integers  $a$  and  $b$  we have an injection  $\mathbb{Z}/a\mathbb{Z} \times \mathbb{Z}/ab\mathbb{Z} \hookrightarrow E(F)$ . Then  $[F(E[ab]) : F] \leq b$ .*

*Proof. Step 1:* Let  $\mathcal{O} = \text{End } E$ . For  $N \in \mathbb{Z}^+$ , let  $C_N = (\mathcal{O}/N\mathcal{O})^\times$ . Let  $E[N] = E[N](\overline{F})$ . As an  $\mathcal{O}/N\mathcal{O}$ -module,  $E[N]$  is free of rank 1. Let  $\mathfrak{g}_F = \text{Aut}(\overline{F}/F)$ , and let  $\rho_N: \mathfrak{g}_F \rightarrow \text{GL}_2(\mathbb{Z}/N\mathbb{Z})$  be the mod  $N$  Galois representation associated to  $E/F$ . Because  $E$  has  $\mathcal{O}$ -CM and  $F \supset K$ , we have

$$\rho_N: \mathfrak{g}_F \rightarrow \text{Aut}_{\mathcal{O}} E[N] \cong \text{GL}_1(\mathcal{O}/N\mathcal{O}) \cong (\mathcal{O}/N\mathcal{O})^\times = C_N.$$

Let  $\Delta$  be the discriminant of  $\mathcal{O}$ . Then  $e_1 = 1$ ,  $e_2 = \frac{\Delta + \sqrt{\Delta}}{2}$  is a  $\mathbb{Z}$ -basis for  $\mathcal{O}$ . The induced ring embedding  $\mathcal{O} \hookrightarrow M_2(\mathbb{Z})$  is given by  $\alpha e_1 + \beta e_2 \mapsto \begin{bmatrix} \alpha & \frac{\beta\Delta - \beta\Delta^2}{4} \\ \beta & \alpha + \beta\Delta \end{bmatrix}$ . So

$$C_N = \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} \alpha & \frac{\beta\Delta - \beta\Delta^2}{4} \\ \beta & \alpha + \beta\Delta \end{bmatrix} \mid \alpha, \beta \in \mathbb{Z}/N\mathbb{Z}, \text{ and } \alpha^2 + \Delta\alpha\beta + \left(\frac{\Delta^2 - \Delta}{4}\right)\beta^2 \in (\mathbb{Z}/N\mathbb{Z})^\times \right\}.$$

From this we easily deduce the following useful facts:

- (i)  $C_N$  contains the homotheties  $\left\{ \begin{bmatrix} \alpha & 0 \\ 0 & \alpha \end{bmatrix} \mid \alpha \in (\mathbb{Z}/N\mathbb{Z})^\times \right\}$ .
- (ii) For all primes  $p$  and all  $A, B \geq 1$ , the natural reduction map  $C_{p^{A+B}} \rightarrow C_{p^A}$  is surjective and its kernel has size  $p^{2B}$ .

**Step 2:** Primary decomposition reduces us to the case  $a = p^A$ ,  $b = p^B$  with  $A \geq 0$  and  $B \geq 1$ . By induction it suffices to treat the case  $B = 1$ : i.e., we assume  $E(F)$  contains full  $p^A$ -torsion and a point of order  $p^{A+1}$  and show  $[F(E[p^{A+1}]) : F] \leq p$ .

**Case  $A = 0$ :**

- If  $\left(\frac{\Delta}{p}\right) = 1$ , then  $C_p$  is conjugate to  $\left\{ \begin{bmatrix} \alpha & 0 \\ 0 & \beta \end{bmatrix} \mid \alpha, \beta \in \mathbb{F}_p^\times \right\}$ . If  $\alpha \neq 1$  (resp.  $\beta \neq 1$ ) the only fixed points  $(x, y) \in \mathbb{F}_p^2$  of  $\begin{bmatrix} \alpha & 0 \\ 0 & \beta \end{bmatrix}$  have  $x = 0$  (resp.  $y = 0$ ). Because  $E(F)$  contains a point of order  $p$  we must either have  $\alpha = 1$  for all  $\begin{bmatrix} \alpha & 0 \\ 0 & \beta \end{bmatrix} \in \rho_p(\mathfrak{g}_F)$  or  $\beta = 1$  for all  $\begin{bmatrix} \alpha & 0 \\ 0 & \beta \end{bmatrix} \in \rho_p(\mathfrak{g}_F)$ . Either way,  $\#\rho_p(\mathfrak{g}_F) \mid p - 1$ .
- If  $\left(\frac{\Delta}{p}\right) = -1$ , then  $C_p$  acts simply transitively on  $E[p] \setminus \{0\}$ , so if we have one  $F$ -rational point of order  $p$  then  $E[p] \subset E(F)$ , so  $\#\rho_p(\mathfrak{g}_F) = 1$ .
- If  $\left(\frac{\Delta}{p}\right) = 0$ , then  $C_p$  is conjugate to  $\left\{ \begin{bmatrix} \alpha & \beta \\ 0 & \alpha \end{bmatrix} \mid \alpha \in \mathbb{F}_p^\times, \beta \in \mathbb{F}_p \right\}$  [BCS15, §4.2]. Since  $E(F)$  has a point of order  $p$ , every element of  $\rho_p(\mathfrak{g}_F)$  has 1 as an eigenvalue and thus  $\rho_p(\mathfrak{g}_F) \subset \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \beta \\ 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix} \mid \beta \in \mathbb{F}_p \right\}$ , so has order dividing  $p$ .

**Case  $A \geq 1$ :** By (ii),  $\mathcal{K} = \ker C_{p^{A+1}} \rightarrow C_{p^A}$  has size  $p^2$ . Since  $(\mathbb{Z}/p^A\mathbb{Z})^2 \hookrightarrow E(F)$ , we have  $\rho_{p^{A+1}}(\mathfrak{g}_F) \subset \mathcal{K}$ . Since  $E(F)$  has a point of order  $p^{A+1}$ , by (i) the homothety  $\begin{bmatrix} 1+p^A & 0 \\ 0 & 1+p^A \end{bmatrix}$  lies in  $\mathcal{K} \setminus \rho_{p^{A+1}}(\mathfrak{g}_F)$ . Therefore  $\rho_{p^{A+1}}(\mathfrak{g}_F) \subsetneq \mathcal{K}$ , so  $\#\rho_{p^{A+1}}(\mathfrak{g}_F) \mid p$ .  $\square$

### 2.3. Uniform Bound for Euler's Function in Imaginary Quadratic Fields

Let  $\mathfrak{a}$  be an ideal in an imaginary quadratic field  $K$ . To apply the results of §2.1, we require a lower bound on  $\frac{\varphi_K(\mathfrak{a})}{|\mathfrak{a}|}$ . For *fixed*  $K$ , it is straightforward to adapt a classical argument of Landau (see the proof of [HW08, Theorem 328, p. 352]). Replacing Landau's use of Mertens' Theorem with Rosen's number field analogue [Ro99], one obtains the following result: let  $\gamma$  denote the Euler–Mascheroni constant, and let  $\chi(\cdot) = \left(\frac{\Delta_K}{\cdot}\right)$  be the quadratic Dirichlet character associated to  $K$ . Then

$$\liminf_{|\mathfrak{a}| \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\varphi_K(\mathfrak{a})}{|\mathfrak{a}| / \log \log |\mathfrak{a}|} = e^{-\gamma} \cdot L(1, \chi)^{-1}.$$

Alas, this result is not sufficient for our purposes. There are two sources of difficulty. First, the right-hand side depends on  $K$ , and can in fact be arbitrarily small (see [BCE50, (4')]). Second, it only addresses limiting behavior as  $|\mathfrak{a}| \rightarrow \infty$ . However, looking back at Lemma 4 we see that a lower bound on  $h_K \frac{\varphi_K(\mathfrak{a})}{|\mathfrak{a}|}$  would suffice. The factor of  $h_K$  allows us to prove a totally uniform lower bound.

**Theorem 8.** *There is a positive, effective absolute constant  $C$  such that for all imaginary quadratic fields  $K$  and all nonzero ideals  $\mathfrak{a}$  of  $\mathcal{O}_K$  with  $|\mathfrak{a}| \geq 3$ , we have*

$$\varphi_K(\mathfrak{a}) \geq \frac{C}{h_K} \cdot \frac{|\mathfrak{a}|}{\log \log |\mathfrak{a}|}.$$

**Lemma 9.** *For a fundamental quadratic discriminant  $\Delta < 0$  let  $K = \mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{\Delta})$ , and let  $\chi(\cdot) = \left(\frac{\Delta}{\cdot}\right)$ . There is an effective constant  $C > 0$  such that for all  $x \geq 2$ ,*

$$(1) \quad \prod_{p \leq x} \left(1 - \frac{\chi(p)}{p}\right) \geq \frac{C}{h_K}.$$

*Proof.* By the quadratic class number formula,  $h_K \asymp L(1, \chi) \sqrt{|\Delta|}$  [Da00, eq. (15), p. 49]. Writing  $L(1, \chi) = \prod_p (1 - \chi(p)/p)^{-1}$  and rearranging, we see (1) holds iff

$$(2) \quad \prod_{p > x} \left(1 - \frac{\chi(p)}{p}\right) \ll \sqrt{|\Delta|},$$

with an effective and absolute implied constant. By Mertens' Theorem [HW08, Theorem 429, p. 466], the factors on the left-hand side of (2) indexed by  $p \leq \exp(\sqrt{|\Delta|})$  make a contribution of  $O(\sqrt{|\Delta|})$ . Put  $y = \max\{x, \exp(\sqrt{|\Delta|})\}$ ; it suffices to show that  $\prod_{p > y} (1 - \chi(p)/p) \ll 1$ . Taking logarithms, this will follow if we prove that  $\sum_{p > y} \chi(p)/p = O(1)$ . For  $t \geq \exp(\sqrt{|\Delta|})$ , the explicit formula gives  $S(t) := \sum_{p \leq t} \chi(p) \log p = -t^\beta/\beta + O(t/\log t)$ , where the main term is present only if  $L(s, \chi)$  has a Siegel zero  $\beta$ . (C.f. [Da00, eq. (8), p. 123].) We will assume the Siegel zero exists; otherwise the argument is similar but simpler. By partial summation,

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{p > y} \frac{\chi(p)}{p} &= -\frac{S(y)}{y \log y} + \int_y^\infty \frac{S(t)}{t^2 (\log t)^2} (1 + \log t) dt \\ &\ll 1 + \int_y^\infty \frac{t^\beta}{t^2 \log t} dt. \end{aligned}$$

Haneke, Goldfeld–Schinzel, and Pintz have each shown that  $\beta \leq 1 - c/\sqrt{|\Delta|}$ , where the constant  $c > 0$  is absolute and effective [Ha73, GS75, Pi76]. Using this to bound  $t^\beta$ , and keeping in mind that  $y \geq \exp(\sqrt{|\Delta|})$ , we see that the final integral is at most

$$\int_{\exp(\sqrt{|\Delta|})}^\infty \frac{\exp(-c \log t / \sqrt{|\Delta|})}{t \log t} dt.$$

A change of variables transforms the integral into  $\int_1^\infty \exp(-cu) u^{-1} du$ , which converges. Assembling our estimates completes the proof.  $\square$

*Proof of Theorem 8.* Write  $\varphi_K(\mathfrak{a}) = |\mathfrak{a}| \prod_{\mathfrak{p}|\mathfrak{a}} (1 - 1/|\mathfrak{p}|)$ , and notice that the factors are increasing in  $|\mathfrak{p}|$ . So if  $z \geq 2$  is such that  $\prod_{|\mathfrak{p}| \leq z} |\mathfrak{p}| \geq |\mathfrak{a}|$ , then

$$(3) \quad \frac{\varphi_K(\mathfrak{a})}{|\mathfrak{a}|} \geq \prod_{|\mathfrak{p}| \leq z} \left(1 - \frac{1}{|\mathfrak{p}|}\right).$$

We first establish a lower bound on the right-hand side, as a function of  $z$ , and then we prove the theorem by making a convenient choice of  $z$ . We partition the prime ideals

with  $|\mathfrak{p}| \leq z$  according to the splitting behavior of the rational prime  $p$  lying below  $\mathfrak{p}$ . Noting that  $p \leq |\mathfrak{p}|$ , Mertens' Theorem and Lemma 9 yield

$$(4) \quad \prod_{|\mathfrak{p}| \leq z} \left(1 - \frac{1}{|\mathfrak{p}|}\right) \geq \prod_{p \leq z} \left(1 - \frac{1}{p}\right) \left(1 - \frac{\left(\frac{\Delta}{p}\right)}{p}\right) \\ \gg (\log z)^{-1} \prod_{p \leq z} \left(1 - \frac{\left(\frac{\Delta}{p}\right)}{p}\right) \gg (\log z)^{-1} \cdot h_K^{-1}.$$

With  $C'$  a large absolute constant to be described momentarily, we set

$$(5) \quad z = (C' \log |\mathfrak{a}|)^2.$$

We must check that  $\prod_{|\mathfrak{p}| \leq z} |\mathfrak{p}| \geq |\mathfrak{a}|$ . The Prime Number Theorem implies

$$\prod_{|\mathfrak{p}| \leq z} |\mathfrak{p}| \geq \prod_{p \leq z^{1/2}} p \geq \prod_{p \leq C' \log |\mathfrak{a}|} p \geq |\mathfrak{a}|,$$

provided that  $C'$  was chosen appropriately. Combining (3), (4), and (5) gives

$$\varphi_K(\mathfrak{a}) \gg |\mathfrak{a}| \cdot (\log z)^{-1} \cdot h_K^{-1} \gg h_K^{-1} \cdot |\mathfrak{a}| \cdot \log(\log(|\mathfrak{a}|))^{-1}. \quad \square$$

#### 2.4. Proof of Theorem 1

Let  $F$  be a number field of degree  $d \geq 3$ , and let  $E/F$  be a  $K$ -CM elliptic curve. We may assume  $\#E(F)[\text{tors}] \geq 3$ . We have  $E(FK)[\text{tors}] \cong \mathbb{Z}/a\mathbb{Z} \times \mathbb{Z}/ab\mathbb{Z}$  for positive integers  $a$  and  $b$ . Theorem 5 gives  $FK \supset K^{(a\mathcal{O}_K)}$ . Along with Lemma 4 we get

$$2d \geq [FK : \mathbb{Q}] \geq [K^{(a\mathcal{O}_K)} : \mathbb{Q}] \geq \frac{h_K \varphi_K(a\mathcal{O}_K)}{3}.$$

By Theorem 7, there is an extension  $L/FK$  with  $(\mathbb{Z}/ab\mathbb{Z})^2 \hookrightarrow E(L)$  and  $[L : FK] \leq b$ . Applying Theorem 5 and Lemma 4 as above we get  $L \supset K^{(ab\mathcal{O}_K)}$  and

$$[L : \mathbb{Q}] \geq [K^{(ab\mathcal{O}_K)} : \mathbb{Q}] \geq \frac{h_K \varphi_K(ab\mathcal{O}_K)}{3},$$

so

$$(6) \quad d = [F : \mathbb{Q}] \geq \frac{[FK : \mathbb{Q}]}{2} = \frac{[L : \mathbb{Q}]}{2[L : FK]} \geq \frac{[L : \mathbb{Q}]}{2b} \geq \frac{h_K \varphi_K(ab\mathcal{O}_K)}{6b}.$$

Multiplying (6) through by  $(ab)^2 = |ab\mathcal{O}_K|$  and rearranging, we get

$$(7) \quad \#E(FK)[\text{tors}] = a^2b \leq 6 \frac{d}{h_K} \frac{|ab\mathcal{O}_K|}{\varphi_K(ab\mathcal{O}_K)}.$$

By Theorem 8 we have

$$(8) \quad \frac{|ab\mathcal{O}_K|}{\varphi_K(ab\mathcal{O}_K)} \ll h_K \log \log |ab\mathcal{O}_K| \leq h_K \log \log (a^2b)^2 \ll h_K \log \log \#E(FK)[\text{tors}].$$

Combining (7) and (8) gives

$$\#E(FK)[\text{tors}] \ll d \log \log \#E(FK)[\text{tors}]$$

and thus

$$\#E(F)[\text{tors}] \leq \#E(FK)[\text{tors}] \ll d \log \log d.$$

## 3. RELATED WORK

Let  $E$  be a  $K$ -CM elliptic curve defined over a number field  $F$ , and let  $P \in E(F)[\text{tors}]$ . Silverberg showed [Si92, Corollary 6.1] that if  $F \supset K$  then  $\varphi(\# \langle P \rangle) \leq 3[F : \mathbb{Q}]$ . It follows that if  $F \not\supset K$  then  $\varphi(\# \langle P \rangle) \leq 6[F : \mathbb{Q}]$ . Later Aoki showed [Ao95, Proposition 8.1] that if  $F \not\supset K$  then  $\varphi(\# \langle P \rangle) \leq 2[F : \mathbb{Q}]$ . Silverberg's and Aoki's bounds are *the real truth*: there are points of order 6 when  $F = \mathbb{Q}$  and of order 7 when  $F = K = \mathbb{Q}(\sqrt{-3})$ .

These results give an  $O(d \log \log d)$  bound on the *exponent* of  $E(F)[\text{tors}]$  and thus  $\#E(F)[\text{tors}] = O((d \log \log d)^2)$ , which was later superseded by Theorem 2. If  $F \not\supset K$ , then  $E(F)[\text{tors}]$  has a cyclic subgroup of index at most 2. Thus the work of Silverberg and Aoki yields Theorem 1 when  $F \not\supset K$ , in fact in the more explicit form

$$\#E(F)[\text{tors}] \leq (4e^\gamma + o(1))d \log \log d, \quad \text{as } d \rightarrow \infty.$$

**Acknowledgments.** We thank Abbey Bourdon, Alice Silverberg, John Voight and the referee. The second author is supported by NSF award DMS-1402268.

## REFERENCES

- [Ao95] N. Aoki, *Torsion points on abelian varieties with complex multiplication*. Algebraic cycles and related topics (Kitasakado, 1994), 1–22, World Sci. Publ., River Edge, NJ, 1995.
- [BCE50] P.T. Bateman, S. Chowla and P. Erdős, *Remarks on the size of  $L(1, \chi)$* . Publ. Math. Debrecen 1 (1950), 165–182.
- [BCS15] A. Bourdon, P.L. Clark and J. Stankewicz, *Torsion points on CM elliptic curves over real number fields*, submitted for publication.
- [Br10] F. Breuer, *Torsion bounds for elliptic curves and Drinfeld modules*. J. Number Theory 130 (2010), 1241–1250.
- [CCRS13] P.L. Clark, B. Cook and J. Stankewicz, *Torsion points on elliptic curves with complex multiplication (with an appendix by Alex Rice)*. International Journal of Number Theory 9 (2013), 447–479.
- [Co00] H. Cohen, *Advanced Topics in Computational Number Theory*. Graduate Texts in Mathematics 193, Springer-Verlag, 2000.
- [Da00] H. Davenport, *Multiplicative Number Theory*. Third edition. Graduate Texts in Mathematics, 74. Springer-Verlag, New York, 2000.
- [Ha73] W. Haneke, *Über die reellen Nullstellen der Dirichletschen  $L$ -Reihen*. Acta Arith. 22 (1973), 391–421. Corrigendum in 31 (1976), 99–100.
- [HS99] M. Hindry and J. Silverman, *Sur le nombre de points de torsion rationnels sur une courbe elliptique*. C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris Sér. I Math. 329 (1999), no. 2, 97–100.
- [HW08] G.H. Hardy and E.M. Wright, *An introduction to the theory of numbers*. Sixth edition. Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2008.
- [GS75] D.M. Goldfeld and A. Schinzel, *On Siegel's zero*. Ann. Scuola Norm. Sup. Pisa Cl. Sci. (4) 2 (1975), 571–583.
- [Pi76] J. Pintz, *Elementary methods in the theory of  $L$ -functions. II. On the greatest real zero of a real  $L$ -function*. Acta Arith. 31 (1976), 273–289.
- [Ro99] M. Rosen, *A generalization of Mertens' Theorem*. J. Ramanujan Math. Soc. 14 (1999), 1–19.
- [Si92] A. Silverberg, *Points of finite order on abelian varieties*. In  *$p$ -adic methods in number theory and algebraic geometry*, 175–193, Contemp. Math. 133, Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, RI, 1992.
- [Si94] J. Silverman, *Advanced Topics in the Arithmetic of Elliptic Curves*, Graduate Texts in Mathematics 151, Springer-Verlag, 1994.