



cpp-adp@cpp-adp.ca

Editor/Rédacteur en chef:
MICHAEL VEALL

Co-editors/Co-rédacteurs:
KELLY FOLEY
STEPHEN GORDON
PETER GRAEFE
TAMMY SCHIRLE
ANNA ZAJACOVA

Treasurer/Trésorier:
ROBERT DIMAND

*Journal Manager/
Responsable de rédaction:*
OLIVIER LEBERT

August 16, 2022

Dear Dr. Montcho,

Thank you for submitting “Comparing Public Transfers to Immigrants and Natives in Canada: A National Transfer Accounts Approach (manuscript number 2022049, co-authors Julien Pierre Navaux, Marcell Mérette, and Yves C Carrière) to *Canadian Public Policy/Analyse de politiques*.

We are sorry that this paper has taken 76 days when our target is 60 days. There were some personal issues at this end.

Co-editor Stephen Gordon handled this paper. Unfortunately, while several reviewers were tried, we were only able to secure one report. That referee recommends rejection. Given that report, we do not believe it would be worthwhile for us to continue to seek another report, because it would only take up more of your time and would be very unlikely to change the outcome. We can only accept about one in every three papers submitted.

I do not believe it is necessary for me to go through the report which is self-explanatory. Perhaps the key issues the reviewer emphasizes are the need to acknowledge the nature and the significance of the limitations, questions at least in clarity and perhaps in substance surrounding the decomposition, and a lack of engagement with the literature.

On this last front, you may or may not be fans of these papers (and none of the authors was your referee), but you should probably at least refer to:

Kapsalis, C, “Fiscal Impact of Recent Immigrants to Canada”, *Canadian Public Policy/Analyse de politiques*, June 2021, v 47, 2, 170-179.

Zhang, H., J. Zhong, C.de Chardon, “Immigrants’ Net Direct Fiscal Contribution: How Does It Change over their Lifetime?”, *Canadian Journal of Economics, Revue Canadienne d’économie* November, 2020, v. 53, 4, 1642 – 1662.

Thank you for letting us consider your research.

Sincerely,

 (Mike)