

Assignment #9

MACS 30000, Dr. Evans

Due Friday, Dec. 14 at 5:30pm

1. **Referee report with extension (10 points).** When a researcher submits a paper to a journal, the journal editor usually sends the paper to two or more referees who are experts on the subject of the paper and can comment on its **validity, accuracy, relevance, and quality.** Pretend that you have received one of the papers (of your choice) in Table 1 below as a referee. You are to write a referee report that is **three-to-five pages long and covers the following areas.** Note that the final area to cover is different from a referee report. At the end of your referee report, I want you to suggest an extension of the methods or research question of the paper that one (or you) could execute as a research project.
 - (a) Do the author(s) adequately **define a research question?** What is the research question?
 - (b) Do the author(s) **compellingly answer** the research question?
 - (c) Are the **methods of answering the research question appropriate and sufficient?**
 - (d) How well do the author(s) put their paper in context of the **broader literature?** Are they **missing any citations?** Do they have **any unnecessary citations?**
 - (e) Please identify and correct any **grammatical, spelling, or style errors in the body of the text and in the references.**
 - (f) Propose an extension of either the methods of this paper for the research question, or an extension of the research question using the methods, or both. Describe specifically the extended research question and methods (and maybe data).

Table 1: Options of papers to referee

Field	Paper reference
Economics	<i>Athey (2018, forthcoming)</i> <i>Brumm and Scheidegger (2017)</i>
Political Science	<i>Bonica (2018, forthcoming)</i> <i>Gentzkow et al. (2018)</i>
Psychology	<i>Sanchez et al. (2018)</i> <i>Yourganov et al. (2014)</i>
Sociology	<i>Kozlowski et al. (2018)</i> <i>Mao et al. (2017)</i>

References

- Athey, Susan**, “The Impact of Machine Learning on Economics,” in Joshua Gans Ajay K. Agrawal and Avi Goldfarb, eds., *The Economics of Artificial Intelligence: An Agenda*, National Bureau of Economic Research <https://www.nber.org/chapters/c14009.pdf> 2018, forthcoming.
- Bonica, Adam**, “Inferring Roll Call Scores from Campaign Contributions Using Supervised Machine Learning,” *American Journal of Political Science*, 2018, forthcoming.
- Brumm, Johannes and Simon Scheidegger**, “Using Adaptive Sparse Grids to Solve High-dimensional Dynamic Models,” *Econometrica*, September 2017, 85 (5), 1575–1612.
- Gentzkow, Matthew, Jesse M. Shapiro, and Matt Taddy**, “Measuring Group Differences in High-dimensional Choices: Method and Application to Congressional Speech,” NBER Working Paper 22423, National Bureau of Economic Research, <http://web.stanford.edu/~gentzkow/research/politext.pdf> August 2018.
- Kozlowski, Austin C., Matt Taddy, and James A. Evans**, “The Geometry of Culture: Analyzing Meaning through Word Embeddings,” under review, Knowledge Lab, University of Chicago, <https://arxiv.org/pdf/1803.09288.pdf> 2018.
- Mao, Andrew, Lili Dworkin, Siddharth Suri, and Duncan J. Watts**, “Resilient Cooperators Stabilize Long-run Cooperation in the Finitely Repeated Prisoners Dilemma,” *Nature Communications*, January 2017, p. p. 13800.
- Sanchez, Alessandro, Stephan C. Meylan, Mika Braginsky, Kyle E. MacDonald, Daniel Yurovsky, and Michael C. Frank**, “chilides-db: A Flexible and Reproducible Interface to the Child Language Data Exchange System,” under review, Communication and Learning Laboratory, University of Chicago, <https://callab.uchicago.edu/papers/smbmyf-brm-underreview.pdf> 2018.
- Yourganov, Grigori, Tanya Schmah, Nathan W. Churchill, Marc G. Berman, Cheryl L. Grady, and Stephen C. Strother**, “Pattern Classification of fMRI Data: Applications for Analysis of Spatially Distributed Cortical Networks,” *NeuroImage*, August 2014, 96 (1), 117–132.