

# When Callings Are Calling: Crafting Work and Leisure in Pursuit of Unanswered Occupational Callings

Justin M. Berg, Adam M. Grant

The Wharton School, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104  
{bergj@wharton.upenn.edu, grantad@wharton.upenn.edu}

Victoria Johnson

Organizational Studies Program, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109,  
vjohnsn@umich.edu

Scholars have identified benefits of viewing work as a calling, but little research has explored the notion that people are frequently unable to work in occupations that answer their callings. To develop propositions on how individuals experience and pursue unanswered callings, we conducted a qualitative study based on interviews with 31 employees across a variety of occupations. We distinguish between two types of unanswered callings—missed callings and additional callings—and propose that individuals pursue these unanswered callings by employing five different techniques to craft their jobs (task emphasizing, job expanding, and role reframing) and their leisure time (vicarious experiencing and hobby participating). We also propose that individuals experience these techniques as facilitating the kinds of pleasant psychological states of enjoyment and meaning that they associate with pursuing their unanswered callings, but also as leading to unpleasant states of regret over forgone fulfillment of their unanswered callings and stress due to difficulties in pursuing their unanswered callings. These propositions have important implications for theory and future research on callings, job crafting, and self-regulation processes.

**Key words:** work orientation; calling; job crafting; self-regulation; psychological well-being; regulatory focus

**History:** Published online in *Articles in Advance* January 22, 2010.

*Your calling is calling.*  
—Monster.com advertisement

The average American changes jobs 10 times between the ages of 18 and 42 (Bureau of Labor Statistics 2006), and similar trends are occurring in Europe (Alogoskoufis 1995). As traditional career paths are quickly becoming a thing of the past (Briscoe and Hall 2006, Hall and Mirvis 1995), people are increasingly expecting more from their work than financial rewards and promotions (Rousseau et al. 2006). In addition to these extrinsic benefits, individuals often seek occupations that will provide fulfillment of core personal values (Judge and Bretz 1992), meaning and purpose (Wrzesniewski et al. 2003), self-expression (Kahn 1990, Shamir 1991), and opportunities to help others (Grant 2007, Thompson and Bunderson 2003). In short, people in a wide range of work contexts are not only looking for a job; they are also looking for a calling (Bellah et al. 1985, Heslin 2005, Wrzesniewski 2003). Consistent with past research, we define a calling broadly as an occupation that an individual (1) feels drawn to pursue, (2) expects to be intrinsically enjoyable and meaningful, and (3) sees as a central part of his or her identity (e.g., Wrzesniewski et al. 1997).

Research suggests that experiencing work as a calling is associated with a series of psychological benefits, including increased life, health, and job satisfaction

(Hall and Chandler 2005, Heslin 2005, Wrzesniewski et al. 1997). Occupational callings are often associated with feelings of passion—strong emotional inclinations toward work-related activities that individuals find interesting, important, and worthy of their time and energy (Vallerand et al. 2003). Conversely, feeling unable to pursue a calling may undermine psychological well-being by producing a high degree of frustration (Scheier and Carver 1988), disappointment (Bell 1985), or regret (Gilovich and Medvec 1995), which may ultimately hinder job performance (e.g., Wright and Cropanzano 2000). Indeed, recent research suggests that the process of searching for a calling is associated with feelings of discomfort, indecision, and identity confusion (Duffy and Sedlacek 2007).

Although some people may feel that they have found and fulfilled their “one true” occupational calling, others may feel that they have not answered their occupational callings. More than ever before, people are exposed to and encouraged to engage in a wide range of activities and interests, one or more of which may develop into a calling that they feel drawn to pursue in their careers (Schwartz 2004). Many members of Generations X and Y were raised to believe that “you can be anything you want to be” (Twenge 2006, p. 72) and that “anything is possible: never give up on your dreams” (p. 86). As

a result, many individuals experience the pull of occupational callings that are not formally or conventionally part of their chosen occupations. However, little research has addressed how these individuals experience and respond to feeling called to an occupation outside of their current occupational role. Because most adults spend more than half their waking lives at work, unanswered occupational callings are a potentially important concern for both individuals and the organizations that employ them. Accordingly, it is critical to understand how individuals experience and respond to unanswered occupational callings.

To address this unexplored question, we conducted a qualitative study of employees in both the nonprofit and for-profit sectors. We used our findings from interviews with 31 employees to develop propositions on how individuals experience and pursue unanswered occupational callings. More specifically, we identify five techniques that individuals use to pursue their unanswered callings through crafting their jobs and their leisure time, and we examine the pleasant and unpleasant psychological states that individuals associate with the process of using these crafting techniques. We discuss the important implications of our findings for theory and future research on callings, job crafting, and self-regulation.

## Unanswered Occupational Callings

The notion of viewing work as a calling emerged during the Protestant Reformation early in the 16th century. Martin Luther's interpretation of the New Testament preached the importance of heeding the occupational calling (*Beruf*) put forth by God. No longer was monastic renunciation of the material world counted as the chief sign of moral superiority; instead, the diligent and responsible exercise of an occupation was considered the highest moral achievement possible on earth (Weber 1958). Under Luther's influence, the notion of having a calling spread widely through Protestant Europe. Today, although the idea of a calling has become predominantly secular in its meanings and uses (Wrzesniewski 2003), the word still retains a moral connotation, in that it is generally used to describe work thought to benefit the common good (Thompson and Bunderson 2003). The religious origins of "calling" have complicated efforts to converge on a single secular definition (Bunderson and Thompson 2009).

Sociologists Bellah et al. (1985) used "calling" along with "job" and "career" to describe three different orientations that Americans hold toward their work. Those with a job orientation primarily see their work as a means to an end. They tend to work to pay for necessities, support their families, and maximize their leisure time. Those who view their work as a career primarily see work as a pathway to achievement and prestige. They are principally motivated by the challenge

of work and the possibility of enhancing their status through advancement up a social or organizational hierarchy. When individuals hold job and career orientations, their identities tend not to fully overlap with their occupations; they view work as a separate entity from the rest of life. When individuals hold calling orientations, however, their identities and occupations are inseparably linked. Those with a calling orientation imbue their work with personal and social meaning: they perceive it as intrinsically enjoyable and as making valuable contributions to society.

To empirically document the work orientations proposed by Bellah et al. (1985), psychologists developed measures of job, career, and calling orientations and surveyed employees in a variety of occupations to examine the correlates of holding each orientation (Wrzesniewski et al. 1997). They discovered that all three orientations could exist within a single occupation, that participants in several occupations were fairly evenly distributed among the three categories of work orientations, and that each work orientation was associated with certain predictable outcomes. Having a calling orientation was linked to several self-reported benefits, including higher life, health, and job satisfaction, and lower absenteeism than job- and career-oriented respondents. Recent scholarship has expanded the Bellah et al. (1985) calling orientation to provide an alternative secular definition of having a calling (Wrzesniewski et al. 1997). For example, Hall and Chandler (2005) contend that a calling (1) comes from within an individual, (2) serves the individual and/or community, (3) is found after much searching, and (4) provides a sense of purpose, meaning, and fulfillment. They argue that the experience of a calling is associated with both enhanced subjective psychological success and higher objective job performance.

The purported list of benefits connected with viewing work as a calling suggests that answering a calling is a positive experience for individuals. However, researchers have yet to explore how individuals experience and respond to unanswered callings. We define an *unanswered calling* as an occupation that an individual (1) feels drawn to pursue, (2) expects to be intrinsically enjoyable and meaningful, and (3) sees as a central part of his or her identity, but (4) is not formally experiencing in a work role. An unanswered calling is thus an attitude toward a specific occupation that is not part of one's formal occupational role.

Unanswered callings may be more common than ever before. In recent years, the popular press and media, like organizational scholars, have extolled the virtues of having a calling, and often go a step further in stressing the dire importance of finding one's true calling (e.g., Brennfleck and Marie 2005). As Leider and Shapiro (2001, p. 25) admonish, "Until we heed our calling, we're not living authentically; we're adopting someone else's

model for who we should be.” Recently, America’s two largest job search companies launched advertising campaigns urging job seekers to “follow your heart” (Careerbuilder.com 2008) and “find your calling” (Monster.com 2008). These companies are both responding and contributing to recent dramatic changes in Western cultural and employment landscapes that have provided individuals with more opportunities to develop callings. Today, individuals are exposed to—and can consider—many more occupational choices than in the past (Schwartz 2004, Twenge 2006). The explosion of choice begins as early as secondary school, where children are given opportunities to explore a wide variety of subjects, ranging from math and science to history, social studies, and languages. As children advance through the school system, the number of elective courses available in fields such as engineering, art, music, theater, psychology, government, creative writing, and economics continues to rise, and students are encouraged to pursue their interests in multiple extracurricular activities in the domains of athletics, politics, drama, music, the arts, and religion. The range of possible interests to which students are exposed continues to expand as they attend college, with a broadened scope of course offerings and an abundance of extracurricular clubs and volunteering opportunities. Throughout their education, students come in contact with many subjects and activities that may develop into occupational callings that they feel drawn to pursue in their careers.

Because many members of Generations X and Y have internalized the idealistic belief that they can become anything they want or dream to be (Twenge 2006), they tend to consider a wide range of potential occupational callings and expect that they will be able to answer these callings. However, for a significant number of employees, the world of work is structured in a way that restricts their ability to pursue all of the occupations that call to them. Even in the more flexible knowledge economy of today, jobs are typically designed so that individuals specialize in a particular set of tasks and are assigned a specific set of responsibilities (Ilgen and Hollenbeck 1991, Mohrman and Cohen 1995). These duties are often highly interconnected and interdependent with the work of other employees, placing social pressure on employees to perform their responsibilities on time and in a prescribed way. In addition, formal policies and monitoring systems enforced by managers often demand standardized work procedures and practices that constrain the level of freedom available to employees in deciding how and when they perform their assigned duties (Hackman and Oldham 1980). Furthermore, by requiring most individuals to work 40 or more hours per week, organizations restrict the time available to allocate to other occupational callings (e.g., Perlow 1999). As a result, individuals may find it difficult to pursue and fulfill all of their occupational callings within one formal

work role; instead, they may feel called toward numerous different occupations, leaving them with one or more unanswered callings.

Feeling called to multiple occupations may not be the only cause of unanswered callings. For a variety of reasons, individuals who feel called to only one occupation may find it difficult to answer this calling. For instance, many individuals forgo their callings in favor of less satisfying but more financially lucrative or socially desirable occupations (Iyengar et al. 2006), and others lack the necessary skills or opportunities to succeed in their callings (Twenge 2006). Still others discover callings in other fields after they have chosen their occupations, when it is difficult or impossible to pursue their callings because their current jobs are firmly embedded in their lives (e.g., Lee et al. 2004). As a result, many individuals may be left with unanswered callings. Despite the likely widespread existence of unanswered callings, little research has explored how individuals experience and respond to unanswered callings. Our objective in this paper is to address these issues.

## Methods

To develop propositions to guide future theory and research on how individuals experience and respond to unanswered callings, we used qualitative methods of data collection and analysis, which are particularly appropriate for building theory on complex, multifaceted processes (Lee et al. 1999). We analyzed our data by taking iterative steps between the data and a developing set of theoretical ideas (Miles and Huberman 1994). We conducted a total of 49 interviews, and our final analysis focuses on 31 interviews with educators at a school and university, as well as employees at a nonprofit advocacy organization and a for-profit manufacturing company. Below, we describe our full process of data collection and analysis, which unfolded in two separate stages.

### Stage 1

*Occupational Selection.* We began by interviewing 20 educators (10 elementary school teachers and 10 university lecturers, who are professors with no formal research responsibilities). In accordance with the logic of extreme case sampling (Eisenhardt 1989), we selected educators because we expected that many educators would experience one or more unanswered callings, for three reasons. First, the field of education often attracts passionate individuals (Neumann 2006) with a variety of strong occupational interests (Buskist et al. 2005). As such, many individuals working in education are likely to have one or more unanswered callings in addition to teaching. Second, although many educators enter the occupation because they feel it is their calling, many educators do not plan to teach for their entire careers. One study found that 43% of entering educators planned

to teach no longer than 10 years (Brookhart and Freeman 1992). This evidence suggests that many educators may have other callings in mind to pursue after teaching. Third, educators often have autonomous job designs that allow for substantial flexibility in what curriculum they teach and how they teach it. This room for agency is likely to provide opportunities to respond to unanswered callings (e.g., Wrzesniewski and Dutton 2001).

**Participant Selection.** We expected university lecturers to provide more extreme cases of unanswered callings than the elementary teachers for three reasons: (1) lecturers are required to have more training than teachers, so they may have more complex career histories and exposure to different occupations; (2) because lecturers select a more specific academic discipline in which to specialize, they may have a calling to work in an occupation related to this specialty; and (3) lecturers have more autonomy than teachers, which may afford them greater flexibility in responding to unanswered callings.

We began recruiting participants in the midwestern United States with electronic messages explaining that we were seeking hour-long interviews with educators about their career paths. The 10 elementary teachers who participated (nine female, one male) included six classroom teachers, a media/library specialist, a specialist in English as a second language, and a classroom teacher with part-time administrative duties. The 10 lecturers (three female, seven male) came from a variety of academic disciplines, including business, social science, English, and foreign language; four had part-time administrative duties in addition to teaching. We included only lecturers with no formal research responsibilities.

**Data Collection.** We developed a protocol of standard questions to provide a semistructured framework for examining unanswered callings. The first author conducted all 20 interviews. When relevant but incomplete responses arose, the interviewer often posed follow-up questions to probe for further information. The protocol was divided into four phases, each of which served a distinct purpose (see the appendix for a detailed description). In the first phase, the interviewer asked respondents questions concerning their feelings about their current occupation. Using a seven-point Likert-type scale, one being “not at all similar to me” and seven being “very much similar to me,” participants provided a numerical rating using Wrzesniewski et al. (1997) “calling, job, career” work orientation paragraphs. The calling orientation paragraph consists of several statements that describe people who see their work as highly enjoyable, meaningful, and an important part of who they are. The job orientation paragraph describes people who see their work as a means to supporting themselves, their families, and their leisure time. The career orientation paragraph describes people who see their work

as a means of advancing up a hierarchy toward promotions, status, and challenge. Participants rated the extent to which each of these paragraphs captured their feelings about their current occupations and then explained why they selected this rating.

In the second phase, the interviewer established a rough timeline of participants’ career paths and sought to identify their unanswered callings. To accomplish this, he asked questions to probe for any occupations other than teaching that they felt drawn to pursue, which addressed the first and fourth criteria of our aforementioned definition of an unanswered calling. Then, to address the second and third criteria, for each occupation mentioned, he asked participants, “Imagine you were currently working in [occupation mentioned]. Using the same 1–7 scale, how similar would the individuals described in the [calling] paragraph be to you? Why did you choose this rating?” To focus our questioning in the remaining two stages of the interviews and throughout our data analysis, we deemed any occupation rated five or higher as an “answered calling” if the participant currently worked in the occupation, and an “unanswered calling” if the participant did not currently work in the occupation but claimed that he or she felt drawn to pursue it. We chose five as our cutoff because the anchor for a five indicated at least moderate agreement that the calling paragraph described participants’ feelings about the focal occupation.

In the third phase, the interviewer explored how the participants responded if they indeed had one or more unanswered callings. During the first 10 interviews with elementary teachers, a clear pattern emerged: participants described instances of crafting their jobs and using their leisure time to pursue unanswered callings. To target this emergent pattern in our subsequent interviews, we changed our protocol, modifying questions to explore salient themes that developed during the qualitative research process. We added the following questions to our interview protocol:

- Have you actively incorporated any aspects of [unanswered calling] into your job? If so, how?
  - Which of these aspects are required by your job and which ones are not?
  - How do you feel about these aspects?
  - Have you actively incorporated any aspects of [unanswered calling] into your life outside of work? If so, how, and how do you feel about these aspects?

Finally, the fourth phase asked participants to describe the thoughts, feelings, and actions that followed from their experiences with unanswered callings. The interviews were tape recorded and transcribed; they lasted between 20 and 90 minutes and averaged approximately 39 minutes.

**Data Analysis.** We began our analysis by identifying each participant’s unanswered calling(s) by recording all

the occupations that he or she described being drawn to pursue and rated a five or higher on the calling paragraph. We found that our data from these 20 interviews focused primarily on individuals with multiple callings, as the majority of educators in our sample rated teaching as a calling but also viewed other occupations as callings. To examine how participants responded to having multiple callings, we used a three-phase process in which we generated themes through iterative cycles of comparing the data with a developing set of codes (Miles and Huberman 1994).

In the first phase of data analysis, we explored the general pattern that had emerged within the first several interviews: respondents pursued unanswered callings in their work and leisure time. We extracted all of the quotes from our data that involved efforts to pursue an unanswered calling at work or during leisure time and split all these codes into two subcategories: job crafting and leisure crafting. In the second phase, we further analyzed the codes within these two subcategories by repeating several cycles of searching for more specific themes until no new themes emerged, which revealed three job crafting techniques and two leisure crafting techniques.

While analyzing the job and leisure crafting codes, we noticed that respondents described their crafting techniques as influencing their thoughts and feelings. This observation led into our third phase of data analysis, where we extracted all the quotes in which participants linked a psychological state with the experience of having and pursuing their unanswered callings, which revealed that respondents associate this process with both pleasant and unpleasant states. Searching for more specific themes within these codes uncovered a total of four psychological states: two that are pleasant and two that are unpleasant. Finally, we revisited the interviews to ensure that no relevant codes were missed. We then moved on to the second stage of our data collection and analysis.

## Stage 2

Compared with many other occupations, educators have a relatively high degree of autonomy in structuring and conducting their work. As a result, educators may have an unusually high degree of opportunity to pursue their unanswered callings within their formal occupational roles. To create a contrast with the level of autonomy provided by teaching, we conducted a second stage of data collection and analysis, obtaining data from employees in both the nonprofit and for-profit sectors. The first author gained permission to interview 29 employees (13 from a nonprofit political advocacy organization in the midwestern United States and 16 from a for-profit manufacturing company in the southeastern United States) for a separate but related study aimed at exploring job crafting more generally in two different organizations (see Berg et al. 2010).

*Occupation and Participant Selection.* The nonprofit organization's mission was to advocate for the economic advancement of women. At the time of the study, it was an all-female organization with 17 full-time employees. We expected that many employees in this organization would have unanswered callings for two reasons: (1) employees who select the nonprofit sector are often passionate about helping others and may want to help in other ways beyond what their current occupations provide; and (2) employees toward the bottom of nonprofit hierarchies often hold jobs that include mostly administrative tasks, which may not fully satisfy their desires to help others (Grant 2007), leaving them with callings toward other occupations. To recruit participants, the executive director announced at an all-staff meeting that university researchers were seeking people to participate in an hour-long interview and a brief follow-up survey. A sign-up sheet was passed around, and 13 employees volunteered to participate in the study. The sample included two main hierarchical levels: a lower level that included two coordinators and three associates, and a higher level that included two senior employees and six directors. The formal job descriptions of employees at the lower level involved mostly administrative, logistical, and routine tasks, whereas employees at the higher level were responsible for strategizing, innovating, and supervising the lower level. Lower-level employees had considerably less autonomy in structuring and conducting their work than higher-level employees.

The for-profit manufacturing company, a leader in the natural personal care product industry, employed approximately 400 people. We selected this organization to provide data from work contexts that were substantially more constrained than both our educator and nonprofit employee samples. The names of the 16 participants (6 female, 10 male) were randomly drawn out of a hat so that the sample consisted of four employees from each of four different occupational groups: maintenance technicians, compounders (i.e., employees who mix bulk ingredients), customer service representatives, and marketing brand managers. These groups were selected to explore a diverse array of occupations on both the manufacturing (maintenance, compounding) and administrative (customer service, marketing) sides of the organization. Employees in maintenance, compounding, and customer service generally had substantially less autonomy in structuring and conducting their work than marketing employees.

Based on the interview data and conversations with the executive director at the nonprofit organization and the vice president of human resources at the for-profit company, we estimate the relative order of all of the occupational groups included in this study with respect to their autonomy to be as follows, beginning with the highest level of autonomy: (1) university lecturers, (2) nonprofit senior employees and directors (higher

level), (3) elementary teachers, (4) for-profit marketing employees, (5) nonprofit coordinators and associates (lower level), and (6) for-profit maintenance, compounding, and customer service employees. Because our interviews involved extensive discussion of how, why, and when participants were able to change the boundaries of their jobs, we were able to establish a well-informed approximation of the autonomy provided to each occupational group. Overall, these samples provide data from a relatively diverse assortment of occupations, both in terms of tasks and organizational contexts.

**Data Collection and Analysis.** This stage involved both a qualitative interview and quantitative survey portion for each participant. We created a section of the interview protocol, which was devised for a study exploring job crafting more broadly (Berg et al. 2010), to focus on the process of job crafting to pursue unanswered callings. The section asked respondents the following series of questions: (1) Do you have a dream occupation other than your own, or another occupation that you feel drawn to pursue? (2) If so, what about this occupation appeals to you? (3) Have you actively incorporated any aspects of (occupation) into your current job? (4) If so, why did you incorporate these aspects? (5) How has incorporating these aspects affected you? The interviewer repeated these questions for every occupation that each respondent mentioned. We took note of the occupations that were brought up during this section of the interview as “possible unanswered callings.” Then, within 6 weeks of being interviewed, each of the 16 participants (8 nonprofit, 8 for-profit) who mentioned one or more occupations during this section completed an online survey that included Wrzesniewski et al. (1997) work orientation paragraphs. After the respondents rated the similarity of the three work orientation paragraphs to their views of their current occupations, the survey asked them to rate the calling paragraph for each possible unanswered calling they mentioned in their interview. They were prompted in the survey in the same fashion as the educators were in their interviews, using the same seven-point Likert-type scale: “Imagine you were currently working as a [possible unanswered calling]. How similar would the people described in the paragraph be to you?”

We searched for themes and found that the three job crafting techniques and the four psychological states (two pleasant and two unpleasant) that we discovered in the educator interviews were all prevalent in this second source of data. Then, we combined our first and second sources of data and analyzed them as one data set, which helped us elaborate some of our previous findings. The additional data enabled us to break down each of the two unpleasant psychological states into two more specific subtypes, revealing a total of four unpleasant states.

Even though the interview questions targeted job crafting to pursue unanswered callings, three respondents discussed instances of leisure crafting, so we coded these as well. Our final set of findings included two types of unanswered callings, five crafting techniques, and four psychological states.

## Pursuing Unanswered Occupational Callings

Our analysis of participants’ calling paragraph ratings for their current occupations, as well as the other occupations that they feel drawn to pursue, revealed that participants fall into three distinct categories: (1) *no callings* (do not view any occupation as a calling), (2) *answered callings* (view only their current occupation as a calling), and (3) *unanswered callings* (have one or more callings other than their current formal occupational role). Because our objective was to examine unanswered callings, we dropped the participants in the no callings and answered callings groups and used the unanswered callings group to build our theoretical model. This omitted 3 elementary teachers, 5 nonprofit employees, and 10 manufacturing employees, resulting in a final sample of 31 employees.

In the sections that follow, we articulate a set of propositions regarding the crafting techniques and psychological states that participants in our study associated with having and pursuing unanswered callings. These propositions are meant to serve as a preliminary conceptual framework and guide for future research on unanswered callings. Table 1 contains participants’ pseudonyms, as well as their ratings of their current occupations on Wrzesniewski et al. (1997) work orientation paragraphs and their ratings of each unanswered calling on the calling paragraph.

## Crafting Techniques and Pleasant Psychological States

To align their experiences with their motivations to pursue their unanswered callings, participants described taking active steps to craft or alter their jobs and leisure activities in pursuit of their unanswered callings. Participants who described these crafting techniques often associated them with two categories of pleasant psychological states, which map onto the two core dimensions of psychological well-being: enjoyment and meaning (McGregor and Little 1998, Ryan and Deci 2001). Enjoyment is primarily equated with hedonic well-being (happiness, a favorable balance of positive and negative affect, and satisfaction), whereas meaning is primarily equated with eudaimonic well-being (a sense of purpose and personal growth).<sup>1</sup> Participants explained that the job and leisure crafting techniques often brought about the kinds of enjoyable and meaningful experiences that they associate with pursuing their unanswered callings.

**Table 1** Participants' Pseudonyms, Unanswered Callings, and Work Orientation Ratings

Number	Pseudonym	Org.—Position (1–7 calling rating)	Unanswered callings (1–7 rating)	Job rating	Career rating
Additional callings					
1	Fannie	Elementary school—Teacher (6)	Family law (7)	1	1
2	Greta	Elementary school—Teacher (5)	Gardening (6)	3	1
3	Linda	Elementary school—Teacher (6)	Law (5)	1	1
4	Mary	Elementary school—Teacher (6)	Music (7), speech therapy (5)	1	1
5	Vera	Elementary school—Teacher (5)	Music (7), ministry (6), adoption advocacy (5)	1	1
6	Abe	University—Lecturer (6)	Music (6), painting (5)	1	1
7	Andy	University—Lecturer (6)	Writing (6)	1	5
8	Carl	University—Lecturer (6)	Consulting (7), higher-ed administration (6)	5	4
9	Craig	University—Lecturer (6)	Therapy (5)	1	1
10	Gary	University—Lecturer (7)	Music (6)	1	3
11	Mindy	University—Lecturer (5)	Business management (5)	1	1
12	Peggy	University—Lecturer (5)	Pediatric psychology (6), counseling (5)	3	1
13	Rick	University—Lecturer (6)	Music (6), ministry (6), politics (5), consulting (5)	2	1
14	Tom	University—Lecturer (5)	Language education training (7)	3	1
15	Anna	NP—Program coordinator (5)	Advocacy for issues facing Africa (7)	1	5
16	Cathy	NP—Policy director (7)	Stand-up comedy (5)	1	1
17	Erin	NP—Policy associate (5)	Maternal child health extension (7)	2	5
18	Paula	NP—Senior policy associate (5)	University professor (5)	5	1
19	Maya	FP—Customer service rep. (5)	Marketing (6)	1	7
20	Phil	FP—Compounder (5)	Photography (5)	2	5
21	Paul	FP—Maintenance technician (5)	Production training/supervising (6)	2	6
22	Tracy	FP—Customer service rep. (7)	Spanish–English translation (7)	6	6
Missed callings					
23	Amy	Elementary school—Teacher (4)	Computer animation (7), personal training (7)	7	1
24	Sally	Elementary school—Teacher (3)	Sales (7)	2	2
25	Thelma	University—Lecturer (4)	Therapy (5)	3	5
26	Emma	NP—Comm. associate (2)	Magazine editing (7)	5	6
27	Netta	NP—Senior program manager (3)	Nursing (5)	5	5
28	Tammy	NP—Associate director (4)	Teacher (5)	4	4
29	Wendy	NP—Program coordinator (3)	IT professional (6)	1	7
30	Cal	FP—Customer service rep. (2)	Improvisational comedy (6)	5	6
31	Cara	FP—Brand manager (3)	Creative directing (6)	4	7

Note. Org., organization; NP, nonprofit political advocacy organization; FP, for-profit manufacturing firm; IT, information technology; Comm., communications.

**Job Crafting Techniques.** Consistent with Wrzesniewski and Dutton (2001), our findings reveal that people do not simply accept the tasks and roles that managers outline for them. Instead, they actively shape their lives at work to incorporate or emphasize aspects of their unanswered callings. Whereas classic job design theory focuses on managers designing jobs for employees (Hackman and Oldham 1980), job crafting captures the ways in which employees actively change the behavioral, relational, and cognitive boundaries of their jobs to alter their experiences and identities at work (Wrzesniewski and Dutton 2001). Our data analysis induced three types of job crafting techniques that participants describe using to create opportunities for pursuing their unanswered callings: task emphasizing, job expanding, and role reframing. In the following sections, we explain these techniques and how participants often associate them with pleasant psychological states of enjoyment and meaning. We also provide illustrative examples of each technique in Table 2.

**Task emphasizing.** Task emphasizing involves highlighting tasks that are already formally a part of one's job to pursue an unanswered calling, either by (1) changing the nature of an assigned task to incorporate aspects of an unanswered calling or by (2) dedicating additional time, energy, or attention to an assigned responsibility that is related to an unanswered calling. Participants describe how task emphasizing in either of these ways helps them pursue their unanswered callings through an existing component of their job. Paula, a senior policy associate with an unanswered calling for university teaching, illustrates an example of the first task emphasizing subtype. She describes how she changed the nature of her meetings with her intern to incorporate her unanswered calling for teaching college students, which provides her with enjoyment and meaning.

I've gone out of my way to make sure that whenever I meet with [our intern], at least half of the meeting is just me explaining... what we're doing, why, what are the techniques we're using, what are the challenges we're facing... I just really enjoy it. I guess it makes me feel

**Table 2** Crafting Techniques

Technique	Explanation	Illustration
Job crafting		
Task emphasizing ( <i>highlighting assigned tasks to pursue an unanswered calling</i> )	Changing the nature of an assigned task to incorporate aspects of an unanswered calling	"I still get to help families in my job...like when I run events here in the library, I make sure to talk with students and parents not just about media stuff, which is my job, but also about them as people.... So I feel like there are parallels there...[because] I'm doing something valuable and something good." (Fannie)
	Dedicating additional time, energy, or attention to an assigned task that is related to an unanswered calling	"I try to use the technology [involved in my job] as much as possible.... I have a Smart Board in my room. I'm on the technology district committee, and the technology committee for our school. I really like being on those committees. I'm excited that I'm going to start to be able to use more technology in the classroom." (Amy)
Job expanding ( <i>adding tasks to pursue an unanswered calling</i> )	Taking on short-term or temporary tasks to incorporate aspects of an unanswered calling	"We had a request into the office for someone to speak at a university a couple months ago, and so I volunteered.... It gave me a chance to talk with a whole group of college students about what we do, and why, and how we're effective. I really enjoyed it and it was really exciting and fun for me." (Paula)
	Increasing the number of tasks continually expected of individual to incorporate aspects of an unanswered calling	"I think I've become kind of the go-to person on a junior level for just anything that has to do with communications or writing, someone who's not at the management level. So I work with a lot of the other Associates when they have ideas or questions about writing and things like that.... It makes me feel like I'm important.... It's not exactly the writing that I want to do in my life, but I think it's helped me understand the nuances of word choice and how to message things, and I enjoy it." (Emma)
Role reframing ( <i>altering one's perception of a role to pursue an unanswered calling</i> )	Establishing a cognitive connection to align the conventional social purpose of a job responsibility with an unanswered calling	"I think the question for me has always been kind of, 'How can I grow and how can I make a contribution?' And therapy felt that to me. I mean, I thought I could make a contribution just in other people's lives, and I knew that in hearing their stories and being intimate, on that sort of intellectual level with them, would make a contribution to their lives. And it seems to me that teaching is really about the whole of the student and the faculty member. It's about their interaction, and about how what you're talking about in class might relate to what you are living in your life. It's not therapy in the sense that you don't intrude on the privacy of folks, but I really think if education doesn't help you live more joyfully and creatively and love better, then it's not worth much." (Craig)
	Broadening the conventional social purpose of a job responsibility to incorporate an unanswered calling	"I often liken teaching to being a musician because when I'm in front of a classroom, I put on my performance face. I can be talking in a rather soft voice like this to you outside a classroom, and as soon as I enter that classroom, [Guitarist Gary] the performer is on. And it's the same way with music; you kind of put on your stage face.... It's entertaining education: edu-tainment. And I'm doing that all the time. I'm trying to make class time interesting and fun and entertaining because research on education demonstrates when people are in a good mood, they tend to learn better and learn more.... I remember when I was performing and I had my rock band and my other bands, the high which I got from playing in front of people was very similar to the high which I get from performing teaching in front of people." (Gary)
Leisure crafting Vicarious experiencing	Seeking fulfillment through others' participation in an unanswered calling	"Whenever we do go to a concert or musical theater.... I will fantasize a little bit and daydream about if I was the one up there singing, or I was the one up there playing the piano.... I really don't think I have the talent to really do anything very important from the musical end, but I'm happy that I still have it in my life for my own enjoyment." (Mary)
Hobby participating	Pursuing leisure and volunteer activities related to an unanswered calling	"I'm not going to retire from either. As long as I can hold a guitar in my hands, I'm going to be playing. And as long as I can stand in front of a class and teach, and somebody lets me, I'm going to be doing that.... Music more so. I can see somebody getting too old to teach. But I can't imagine somebody, or at least I can't imagine myself, ever getting too old to at least once in a while, pick up my instrument and play it. Because it's just a different world. It's a totally different world." (Abe)



like I'm fulfilling... a little bit of that part of my other passion of working with college students... [to] kind of foster their passion for social justice and kind of bring them alongside.

Meetings with her intern were already a part of Paula's job, but she altered this task to involve more teaching, enabling her to experience enjoyment and meaning that she associates with pursuing her unanswered calling for being a university professor. Tom, a lecturer who has an unanswered calling for being a professional trainer of language educators, illustrates an example of the second subtype of task emphasizing. Because Tom's administrative duties require him to train new lecturers, he does not need to take on extra tasks. Instead, he explains how emphasizing this existing aspect of his job by devoting more time to it provides him with enjoyable and meaningful experiences.

Fall term, they need more training from me.... So what I try to do is be around the office, have the door open so they can come on by and talk to me and ask me questions. I really like working with instructors and figuring out the issues that they're having. It teaches me a lot, and makes me think back to what I was doing when I was a first year instructor and how to handle these things.... So for very selfish reasons, I do this job because it allows me to do things that I like to do. It's noble in the sense that [I'm] helping the future of America, but at the same time, I'm feeding my own needs of what I want from my job.

By allocating more time to training new lecturers, Tom uses the task emphasizing technique to create additional opportunities to pursue his unanswered calling. These examples illustrate how individuals with unanswered callings emphasize aspects of their existing tasks to enhance their experiences of enjoyment and meaning, giving them a sense of fulfillment for their unanswered callings.

**Job expanding.** Job expanding involves adding tasks to incorporate aspects of an unanswered calling, either by (1) taking on short-term, temporary tasks or by (2) adding new tasks to a job. Tracy, a customer service representative at the manufacturing firm, provides an example of the first subtype of job expanding. To pursue her unanswered calling for Spanish–English translating, she often volunteers her translating abilities, which she finds enjoyable and meaningful.

Within the company I've volunteered to do the Spanish–English translating whenever they need help.... I feel great about it because, for one, I love translating. I was an interpreter for Immigration for about nine years, and I just really enjoy it. And then I love that fact that the employees here know that someone can help them, because sometimes they come to the front office and they need something, and they can't communicate. And I just feel good about helping more, making sure that they understand.

Although Tracy is not required to perform translating services, expanding her job by taking on temporary translating duties has enabled her to pursue her unanswered calling at work.

Carl, a university lecturer, employs the second subtype of job expanding. To pursue his unanswered calling for academic consulting, he increased the number of tasks required of him by taking on administrative duties, which allows him to satisfy his strong interests in generating new programs and designing sustainable curricula more than his lecturer job previously permitted. He explains how these extra responsibilities give him a sense of meaningful personal achievement.

What [makes me] happy about consulting is putting professionalism into use. I have expertise in curriculum creation and setting programs that the university could put into use. I think that the world would be a better place if [my expertise] was put into use.... [So] I have taken on an administrative role and what I do like about administration is building [and] creating programs.... This is something I do like and I put a lot of work into... [and] doing it properly gives me some sort of personal achievement. For someone like myself, such a realization is a kind of fringe benefit of the job.

Unlike Tracy, who took on temporary duties, Carl expanded the number of tasks formally required of him to permanently incorporate aspects of his unanswered calling into his job. Tracy and Carl demonstrate how expanding a job can incorporate aspects of an unanswered calling into one's work experiences, fostering experiences of enjoyment and meaning.

**Role reframing.** Role reframing involves altering one's perception of the meaning of his or her work to match an unanswered calling, either by (1) establishing a cognitive connection to align the conventional social purpose of a job responsibility with an unanswered calling or by (2) broadening the conventional social purpose of a job responsibility to incorporate an unanswered calling. Anna, a program coordinator at the nonprofit organization, provides an illustration of the first subtype of role reframing. She has an unanswered calling to be a professional advocate for issues facing Africa, and she establishes meaningful connections between her job and this unanswered calling.

I feel good about the work that I do and it's one of those things where you're not just filing stuff or putting stuff away. When I do file something, you can trace that all the way to the end to somebody out there... who used [our website] and got their dream job. That's a good feeling.... I'm a huge activist for African women and girl children who've been orphaned by AIDS, and I think while the topic isn't the same, certainly the behavior and the intentions here match what I do elsewhere. So whenever I leave here, it's not like, "Yay! I'm going to go do finally what I want to do." There's a connection there. Like I said, while the content or the subject matter's not

the same, the actions and the purpose is, I think, the same. And so it's a continuation. So I guess I get a similar sense of validation to a certain extent.

Because Anna sees her work as serving a similar social purpose as her unanswered calling, she describes being able to gain a parallel sense of meaning and fulfillment, or “validation,” as she put it, for her unanswered calling within the context of her current occupation.

Abe, the lecturer who was mentioned above with respect to his unanswered callings for music and painting, gives an illustration of the second role reframing subtype. He has broadened the role he assumes while teaching to incorporate his calling for performing music by approaching teaching as a performance, and believes this framing fosters meaningful interactions with students.

Teaching is a performance... and I'd say the same thing would be true with a rock musician... I find myself ending up doing all kinds of, like, unconventional things in my classrooms... that's something that I bring over from my music experience. Because, I mean, when you're on stage, it's just like, “Hello, Wisconsin!”... and you get that rapport going with them. So I can, like, walk from the stage all the way up to the back of the classroom on the tops of the tables. I've done that any number of times. It really changes the whole dynamic of what we're doing... I bring students up on stage. I'll tell jokes. I'll throw things out to the audience. Whatever it takes to engage them.

Although Abe's expanded framing of his lecturer role may seem unique, another lecturer, Gary, employs a nearly identical example of role reframing (see Table 2). These examples illustrate how reframing the social purpose of the work can help people find enjoyment and meaning in pursuing their unanswered callings through their formal occupational roles.

*Unanswered callings, job crafting, and enjoyment and meaning.* In summary, participants described pursuing their unanswered callings through task emphasizing, job expanding, and role reframing. They discussed how these efforts helped them feel a sense of fulfillment for their unanswered callings by providing the kinds of enjoyable and meaningful experiences at work that they associate with pursuing their unanswered callings. These linkages are consistent with existing theory on job crafting (Wrzesniewski and Dutton 2001), as well as theoretical perspectives on person–environment fit (Caplan 1987), coping (Folkman and Moskowitz 2004), and self-regulation (Scheier and Carver 1988). Applying these theories, we propose that unanswered callings lead individuals to recognize that their work situations are misaligned with their personal values, needs, and preferences. This misalignment motivates individuals to seek out alignment by crafting their jobs through task emphasizing, job expanding, and role reframing, and these techniques create better alignment between their

ideal and actual work experiences, resulting in enhanced enjoyment and meaning at work. We capture these relationships with two propositions.

**PROPOSITION 1.** *The presence of unanswered callings motivates individuals to engage in the job crafting techniques of (a) task emphasizing, (b) job expanding, and (c) role reframing.*

**PROPOSITION 2.** *Pursuing unanswered callings through job crafting techniques increases the likelihood of experiencing enjoyment and meaning at work.*

*Leisure Crafting Techniques.* In addition to crafting their jobs, we discovered that participants pursue their unanswered callings outside the domain of work using two “leisure crafting” techniques, which are similar to the job crafting techniques in that they involve people exercising initiative, agency, and proactivity to create opportunities for experiencing states of enjoyment and meaning that they associate with pursuing their unanswered callings as formal occupations. These findings expand the boundaries of when, where, and how an occupational calling can be pursued, and also indicate that the concept of job crafting should, in some situations, be extended beyond the strict boundaries of organizational life to include leisure time as well. In so doing, our research draws attention to the importance of the work–leisure interface for future research on job crafting and callings.

Because leisure time is usually more flexible than work time, individuals often use leisure crafting techniques to pursue unanswered callings in ways that would be difficult or impossible to do at work. Anna, who has an unanswered calling for Africa-related advocacy, provides an illustration of how some unanswered callings are difficult to incorporate using the job crafting techniques, and are thus more suited for leisure crafting.

I worked with at-risk youth looking for summer jobs, and I would always bring articles and conversations that I was having at [Africa advocacy] meetings. There was always a disconnect. It didn't make sense to them. They weren't interested. And because I was so into it, I always took that as an insult and an affront to me, and so after a while, I realized that I had to keep it in my [nonwork] life and stop bashing the kids with things that they didn't care about.

Anna's failed efforts to craft her unanswered calling into her occupation led her to realize that she could pursue it more effectively in her leisure time. This is consistent with theory and research on the work–leisure interface that suggests that individuals often pursue opportunities in their leisure time to make up for what they lack in their work time (Miller and Weiss 1982). We therefore

**Table 3** Prevalence of Missed vs. Additional Callings and Job Crafting Techniques by Occupational Group

Occupational group (from weakest to strongest situation)	Missed callings	Additional callings	Average number of job crafting techniques (No. of techniques/No. of participants)
(1) University lecturers	10% (1/10 participants)	90% (9/10 participants)	3.1 (31/10)
(2) Nonprofit senior employees and directors (higher level)	50% (2/4 participants)	50% (2/4 participants)	2.75 (11/4)
(3) Elementary teachers	29% (2/7 participants)	71% (5/7 participants)	2.1 (15/7)
(4) For-profit marketing employees	100% (1/1 participants)	0% (0/1 participants)	2 (2/1)
(5) Nonprofit coordinators and associates (lower level)	50% (2/4 participants)	50% (2/4 participants)	1.75 (7/4)
(6) For-profit maintenance, compounding, and customer service employees	20% (1/5 participants)	80% (4/5 participants)	1.2 (6/5)

*Notes.* Consistent with the preceding discussion, there was a strong negative correlation between the strength of situation (dummy-coded 1–6 as displayed above) and the number of job crafting techniques reported by participants,  $r = -0.63$ ,  $p < 0.001$ . This finding corroborates our interpretation that individuals reported greater job crafting in weak situations. We did not include the average number of leisure crafting techniques described by each group because only the interview protocol for our first round of interviews (with the two groups of educators) included questions that specifically probed for leisure crafting—our second round of interviews included only questions that probed for job crafting. However, comparing the average number of leisure crafting techniques described by the two groups of educators supports our proposition that feeling unable to pursue unanswered callings at work motivates individuals to pursue leisure crafting, because teachers—who face a stronger situation than lecturers—averaged 2.0 leisure crafting techniques, whereas lecturers averaged 1.2 leisure crafting techniques.

propose that individuals resort to leisure crafting techniques when job crafting is difficult or ineffective.

**PROPOSITION 3.** *When individuals feel unable to pursue their unanswered callings through job crafting, they are more likely to utilize leisure crafting techniques.*

A key factor that appeared to influence whether participants used job or leisure crafting techniques was the strength of the situation. Strong situations are those in which individuals feel a high degree of pressure to behave in a prescribed manner, and weak situations are those in which individuals have greater autonomy and discretion to choose their own courses of action (Mischel 1973). In other words, strong situations place more constraints on individuals' behavior than weak situations. In weak situations, individuals are likely to engage in considerable job crafting; in strong situations, individuals are likely to feel that job crafting techniques are more difficult or impossible to undertake (Wrzesniewski and Dutton 2001). Our data provide support for this pattern. In Table 3, the six occupational groups included in our sample are listed according to the strength of the situation faced by participants in each group, beginning with the highest degree of autonomy and thus the weakest situation (university lecturers), along with the average number of job crafting techniques described by a participant in each group. The number of job crafting techniques for each participant inversely relates to the group's relative situation strength (e.g., university lecturers, who face the weakest situation, have the highest average number of job crafting techniques, whereas for-profit maintenance, compounding, and customer service employees, who face the strongest situation, have the lowest average).

**PROPOSITION 4.** *The strength of the situation shapes whether individuals are more likely to use job or leisure crafting techniques, such that (a) in weak situations, job crafting techniques are more common, whereas (b) in strong situations, leisure crafting techniques are more common.*

Now that we have explained *when* individuals use leisure crafting techniques, we discuss *how* individuals pursue their unanswered callings through the use of two leisure crafting techniques: vicarious experiencing and hobby participating.

*Vicarious experiencing.* Vicarious experiencing involves seeking fulfillment through other people's participation in an unanswered calling—including family, friends, or celebrities—which provides the sort of enjoyable and meaningful experiences that one associates with pursuing the unanswered calling as his or her own occupation. For example, Vera was able to find fulfillment by experiencing her unanswered calling for music vicariously through her children.

I was interested in a lot of things, but not super passionate about any one of them, except for music . . . . If I had majored in music, I would have probably been a teacher in orchestra and taught violin lessons. [It] would be very much of who I was. I played violin, and I think more of my friends would have been in that field, because I would have been performing in groups too. [But] I'm glad that I did go into education, because we later did Suzuki Violin with our daughters. So my husband and I both practiced with the kids and [attended] lots of concerts . . . . I got fulfillment for doing the music thing through helping our daughters . . . and that has been an important part of my life.

Rick also employs the vicarious experiencing technique to pursue his unanswered calling for music, which affords him enjoyable involvement in activities he could not otherwise experience.

I've been very, very lucky, because I have friends who do some of the things that I didn't get to do, so I get to experience [them] vicariously. I have a friend who is a huge...top-stratum opera star, but I've known him since before he became an opera star. So I'm going to New York to hear him star in *Julius Caesar* at the Met. And he says, "You know, just give me a call a couple of days ahead and I'll arrange for you to come backstage"...so I get to touch worlds that I don't live in.

As these examples demonstrate, people do not necessarily have to experience their callings firsthand. Instead, they may find ways to pursue their unanswered callings vicariously through other people.

**Hobby participating.** Hobby participating involves engaging in activities and volunteer positions outside of work that individuals perceive as related to an unanswered calling, which may facilitate experiences of enjoyment and meaning in lieu of pursuing the unanswered calling in a formal occupational role. It is important to note that this technique does not merely involve participating in a hobby that one enjoys; rather, it is a technique that individuals use in their pursuits of unanswered callings. As such, we coded hobby participating as occurring when individuals described the engagement in the hobby as motivated not purely by enjoyment or interest, but also by the desire to pursue an unanswered occupational calling in their leisure time. For example, Peggy, a lecturer, pursues her unanswered calling for child psychology by volunteering at an organization that cares for ill children.

For the last five years, I have been a volunteer at the Ronald McDonald House.... It's the house where families stay when their children are sick and in the hospital.... I think there is something to be said about consistency of interest and things you find fulfilling. This goes back well beyond the very fact that I was interested in children and illness. [It] goes back to experience I had in high school working at a children's hospital in Philadelphia, working in their play therapy area, watching kids dealing with illness, and wanting to understand that better and make a difference in things like that. So that's been there for a long time, so it doesn't surprise me that even in my volunteer work, I seek out something that also feeds that interest.

Peggy actively sought this volunteer position, creating meaningful opportunities to pursue her longtime calling for an occupation in which she helps ill children. Another example of hobby participating comes from the lecturer Andy. Although he views teaching as a calling, he has a stronger unanswered calling to be a professional

writer, which he pursues in his leisure time to find meaning in fulfilling his identity as a writer.

Part of the reason I am working as a lecturer is because I am trying to write a novel. So that pays no bills at the moment, but that, in my heart of hearts, is more important to me than the teaching.... If somebody said I had to stop writing, I would have no idea who I was, as a person.

Peggy and Andy illustrate how people utilize their leisure time to pursue their unanswered callings through hobbies and volunteer positions that facilitate the kinds of enjoyment and meaning associated with undertaking their unanswered callings as formal occupations. However, although Andy is able to gain some fulfillment for his writing calling through leisure crafting, he struggles to balance his hobby with his calling for teaching. Andy is not alone in experiencing unpleasant psychological states associated with having and pursuing unanswered callings. Later, we revisit this darker side of unanswered callings, continuing Andy's story.

In the meantime, it is important to note that although participants described that the leisure crafting techniques helped them feel that they were fulfilling their unanswered callings by providing the kinds of enjoyable and meaningful experiences that they associate with pursuing their callings, they experienced enjoyment and meaning not in the work domain, but rather in the domain in which they used the techniques. For example, Peggy experienced enjoyment and meaning while volunteering at the Ronald McDonald House, and Andy experienced enjoyment and meaning while writing at home. These observations suggest that the psychological impact of crafting activities is domain specific, a notion that is consistent with theory and research on domain-specific memory (Baddeley 1982) and the work–nonwork interface (e.g., Rothbard 2001, Sonnentag 2003). These theoretical perspectives suggest that individuals' experiences in one domain have stronger cognitive and emotional effects in that domain than they do in spilling over into other domains. Thus, we propose the following.

**PROPOSITION 5.** *Pursuing unanswered callings through leisure crafting techniques increases the likelihood of experiencing enjoyment and meaning outside of work.*

### **Missed and Additional Callings: Distinct Psychological Experiences**

Having noted several patterns that our participants display as ways of crafting their jobs and leisure time in pursuit of their unanswered callings, we turn our attention to differences between participants in the psychological experience of unanswered callings. As we analyzed the data from our 31 participants with unanswered callings, we noticed that participants described two different types of unanswered callings, which we refer to as "missed callings" and "additional callings" (see Table 1). Participants with missed callings (9) are

those who do not view their current occupation as a calling but have one or more unanswered callings, and participants with additional callings (22) are those who view their current occupation as a calling and have one or more unanswered callings. In our sample, the majority of the additional callings occurred among educators, and most of the missed callings occurred among the non-profit and for-profit employees.

Although we found that participants with missed and additional callings described the same basic crafting techniques to align their work and leisure experiences with their unanswered callings, these groups discuss different types of motivations for doing so. Participants with missed callings describe a desire to make up for the forgone fulfillment of their unanswered callings, whereas participants with additional callings usually describe a desire to expand the number of callings that they are able to pursue beyond their answered calling to create an ideal balance among their multiple callings.

An illustration of the motivation to pursue a missed calling comes from Amy, an elementary teacher who has a missed calling for computer animation.

If I knew what I know now, I would have pursued computer animation . . . I would love it. It would be very much a part of my life, because I could use my creativity. But being married, I didn't have an option. The classes that I took I really, really enjoyed, but it just came to a dead end. If you wanted to go any further, you [had] to go to California or Texas . . . I do think about how it would be better if I could have done that.

Unlike Amy, who yearns for forgone fulfillment of her missed calling, Abe illustrates the motivation to supplement one's occupation with additional callings:

I'm very happy leading a . . . diverse lifestyle. I would not want to be pigeonholed into doing one thing. I wouldn't want to only be teaching. I wouldn't want to only be playing music. I wouldn't want to only be painting. I love the fact that I can do all of those things, because I think all of those things make each of the other things that much richer.

This distinction between missed and additional callings helps to explain the psychological experiences of individuals with unanswered callings. In the sections below, we explain how individuals with missed and additional callings tended to report different motivations for pursuing their unanswered callings, different experiences of unpleasant psychological states as a result of pursuing their unanswered callings, and different reactions to these unpleasant psychological states.

*The Pursuit of Missed vs. Additional Callings: The Role of Regulatory Focus.* Our participants described different motivations for pursuing missed versus additional callings. Individuals with missed callings tended to focus on the desire to make up for negative experiences, and individuals with additional callings tended

to focus on the desire to expand positive experiences. To gain further insight into the genesis of these motivations, we turned to regulatory focus theory (Brockner and Higgins 2001), which is the core psychological theory that explains how individuals' motivations and emotional experiences differ as a function of whether they are focusing on avoiding negative outcomes or attaining positive outcomes. According to regulatory focus theory, when individuals experience a prevention-focused state, they attend to avoiding negative outcomes, which leads them to feel high-activation negative emotions if they fail (e.g., agitation, anger, anxiety) and low-activation positive emotions if they succeed (e.g., calm, relief). On the other hand, when individuals experience a promotion-focused state, they attend to attaining positive outcomes, which leads them to feel low-activation negative emotions if they fail (e.g., dejection, disappointment) and high-activation positive emotions if they succeed (e.g., cheerfulness, pride). Thus, a prevention-focused state heightens attention and sensitivity to negative outcomes, whereas a promotion-focused state heightens attention and sensitivity to positive outcomes (Brockner and Higgins 2001).

Regulatory focus theory also suggests that negative experiences give rise to prevention-focused states, whereas positive experiences give rise to promotion-focused states (Brockner and Higgins 2001). Building on this notion, we propose that individuals are motivated to pursue missed callings when negative experiences at work trigger prevention-focused psychological states, whereas individuals are motivated to pursue additional callings when positive experiences outside work trigger promotion-focused psychological states. In this section, we elaborate on this important distinction between the motivations of participants with missed and additional callings.

Participants with missed callings often articulated that their desires to pursue their unanswered callings were triggered by negative experiences at work. As they reflected on their dissatisfaction with their current jobs, they experienced a prevention-focused state (Brockner and Higgins 2001) in which they sought to avoid and reduce this dissatisfaction, which opened their minds to the possibility of pursuing their missed callings to fill the void left in their work experiences. For example, Amy stated that she began thinking about pursuing her missed calling for computer animation when she realized that teaching was not "fun anymore, because we're just drilling the kids and just forcing them to learn and I don't think it's the best for the kids, and also it's definitely not best for the teachers. . . . it's really hard . . . . Would I go back to it? I probably wouldn't have gone into teaching . . . . I would have gone into computers." Similarly, Cara also described being motivated to pursue her missed calling for creative directing to avoid the unpleasant experience of boredom in her job.

Creative director is a dream job for me . . . . When I stop doing [creative work] and just focus on the day to day, like emails . . . or customer complaints . . . I miss out on the excitement . . . the job just becomes dry . . . . So I try to keep abreast of the new products that are coming out on the market . . . and [ask] how can we use that and maybe change what we're doing or make ours even stronger . . . . I think that's the fun part of marketing.

These examples illustrate how participants with missed callings typically described pursuing their callings as a result of undesirable experiences at work that they sought to prevent. This pattern is consistent with recent social psychological research suggesting that when negative events trigger prevention-focused states, individuals often cope by pursuing their passions, which helps to ward off undesirable feelings (McGregor 2006). Thus, we propose that prevention-focused states triggered by negative events at work motivate individuals to pursue missed callings.

**PROPOSITION 6.** *Individuals with missed callings are more motivated to pursue these callings when negative work experiences trigger prevention-focused states.*

Participants with additional callings, on the other hand, often described their desires to pursue their unanswered callings as triggered by positive experiences outside work. As they reflected on the enjoyment and meaning that exposure to this additional calling provided, they appeared to experience a promotion-focused state in which they sought to approach additional callings, which they expected to provide further enjoyment and meaning through balancing their multiple callings. For instance, Abe explained how pleasant experiences with fine art and music in his leisure time motivate him to pursue these additional callings through job crafting and further leisure crafting.

As I paint . . . I begin to see things different . . . in ways that maybe I didn't see before. Same thing with music . . . . I have come to approach teaching the same way . . . . In all three of those things, because they are creative undertakings . . . each of those worlds work well with the other worlds . . . . Painting is a way of working out my problems in two dimensions, teaching is a way of working my problems out in three dimensions, and music is a way of working out my problems in an ephemeral dimension.

Peggy provides another example; she described being inspired to incorporate her unanswered calling for pediatric psychology into her job by her positive experiences of volunteering for an organization that helps ill children: "When I first started volunteering there, we got involved with a family where the child needed a heart. We did a lot to help out . . . . I've actually incorporated it into classes I've taught . . . . My students had to do work at the hospital with kids." These examples illustrate how participants with additional callings typically described how positive experiences outside of

work motivated them to pursue their additional callings through job and leisure crafting. This pattern is consistent with social psychological research on mood maintenance, which suggests that when individuals have a positive experience, they attempt to savor it and incorporate it into other domains of their lives to extend its impact (Carlson et al. 1988). Thus, we propose that promotion-focused states triggered by positive events outside of work motivate individuals to pursue additional callings.

**PROPOSITION 7.** *Individuals with additional callings are more motivated to pursue these callings when positive experiences outside work trigger promotion-focused states.*

*The Experience of Missed vs. Additional Callings: Unpleasant Psychological States.* Wrzesniewski and Dutton (2001) argued that efforts to craft a job to match one's needs and preferences can lead to increased experiences of meaning and the expression of valued identities. Our findings suggest that job and leisure crafting to pursue unanswered callings can indeed bring greater enjoyment and meaning to one's work experience, but along with these pleasant states, the crafting techniques can also be linked with unpleasant states of regret and stress. This is often due to the crafting techniques having ironic backfiring or boomerang effects (e.g., Wegner 1994). Whereas the dominant view in existing research is that callings are psychologically pleasant experiences (e.g., Hall and Chandler 2005, Heslin 2005, Wrzesniewski et al. 1997), our research suggests that individuals may experience mixed or ambivalent emotions (Fong 2006, Pratt 2000) in pursuing their unanswered callings. In particular, enjoyment and meaning may be accompanied by regret over forgone fulfillment of unanswered callings or stress due to difficulty in carrying out crafting techniques.

To shed light on these experiences of regret and stress, we focus on the differences between the unpleasant states described by participants with missed and additional callings. We identified these differences by comparing the unpleasant states discussed by participants in each group. We found that they tended to describe different subtypes of regret and stress: those seeking to compensate for missed callings tended to describe long-term regret and frustration, whereas those seeking to supplement their occupations with additional callings tended to describe intermittent regret and overload (see Table 4).

We attribute these unpleasant states to four challenges of pursuing unanswered callings, two of which have been theorized as challenges in job crafting more generally: (1) individuals have a finite amount of time, energy, and attention to devote to crafting; and (2) individuals often depend on others to enable or accommodate their crafting efforts (Berg et al. 2010). The other two are challenges specifically pertaining to pursuing unanswered callings: (3) some of the crafting techniques

**Table 4 Unpleasant Psychological States**

	Missed callings	Additional callings
Regret over forgone fulfillment of unanswered calling(s)	<p>Long-term regret: Ongoing adverse thoughts about forgone fulfillment of a missed calling, prompting contemplation about opportunities to pursue the missed calling in the future.</p> <p>Illustration: “I do get some competition in teaching. Like right now we’re working with Smart Boards in the classroom, and in order to use that I have to learn about it. So it’s constantly something where you’re learning. So there’s a little bit of competition that I like...but there’s just not a lot of competition in teaching overall.... When I chose to be a teacher, there didn’t seem to be as many options at that time. I just kind of fell into it.... I knew I was in that career path. I have thought about sales as a better fit all along and would have preferred sales, but you can’t just stop. I had to kind of finish so many years in teaching.... But I don’t have too much regret because I know I can move on to a career in sales after teaching.” (Sally)</p> <p><i>Mentioned by four of the nine participants with missed callings</i></p>	<p>Intermittent regret: Transient adverse thoughts about forgone opportunity for a more ideal balance of multiple callings, prompting justifications about why the current balance is better.</p> <p>Illustration: “[When] I see people who have taken this thing and focused it and driven it to this level of achievement that makes them stand out, I think, ‘Wow! That’s amazing, that would be very cool to do that.’ ... And I get one of those fleeting regrets, but it’s short-lived. Because even if I had the voice, which I didn’t, even if I’d had the actual raw musical talent, the path you have to travel to get to there would be rough.... And I did consider music as a kid, and decided I was too high strung to do it, because I would sit and practice the piano and just get too nervous and worked up over not being able to be perfect. So we ruled that out.” (Rick)</p> <p><i>Mentioned by six of the 22 participants with additional callings</i></p>
Stress due to difficulty in pursuing unanswered calling(s)	<p>Frustration: Feelings of aggravation as a result of challenges or constraints in pursuing a missed calling, making salient the specific obstacles that limit an individual’s pursuit of the missed calling.</p> <p>Illustration: “I enjoy technology and doing things online, and learning more about that. It’s frustrating, though, because while I may be really excited about some things, not everybody else is always really excited about those same things. And so not everything that I come across I’m able to take all the way through.... Making phone calls, setting up appointments, setting up board meetings is not really what I enjoy doing. So that stuff does get slacked off on. It’s something that I’m trying to balance, and understand that while I might not like all the aspects of the way my job description is written, I need to do those or otherwise I can be great at everything else, but I’m still not a very good employee. So that’s difficult, balancing that.” (Wendy)</p> <p><i>Mentioned by five of the nine participants with missed callings</i></p>	<p>Overload: Onerous stress as a result of trying to find an ideal balance among multiple callings, making salient the trade-offs necessary to pursue multiple callings.</p> <p>Illustration: “I work my [tail] off. No, I’m not satisfied because...there are several things involved. There is an issue of time. My salary is less than \$50,000 a year. Considerably less. Now I brought into my department and into my program—I can’t remember, but something around \$130,000—just last year in grants, and you look at it, and you say, ‘Well, the balance...there is no balance here.’ I’m not being paid in time, and I’m not being paid in money.... But I’m glad I took [on the administrative duties], because doing it properly gives me some sort of personal achievement. For someone like myself, such a realization is a kind of fringe benefit of the job. So even though it’s extra unpaid work, I’m glad I have it.” (Carl)</p> <p><i>Mentioned by seven of the 22 participants with additional callings</i></p>

involve only passive, brief, or limited exposure to unanswered callings; and (4) some unanswered callings are more structurally difficult to incorporate into work and leisure than others. In the following sections, we discuss how these challenges help to explain the emergence of the unpleasant states described by participants.

*Regret over forgone fulfillment of unanswered calling(s).* Regret refers to feelings of sorrow and disappointment that are conjured up due to counterfactual thinking, or thoughts about “what could have been” (e.g., Gilovich and Medvec 1995, van Dijk and Zeelenberg 2005). Participants often described experiencing regret when job or leisure crafting techniques exposed them to desir-

able aspects of their unanswered callings that were previously somewhat “out of sight, out of mind” (e.g., Simons and Chabris 1999) and therefore partially shielded from being desired goals (Shah et al. 2002). We found that participants with missed versus additional callings described different experiences of regret over forgone fulfillment of their unanswered callings. Participants with missed callings often described experiencing long-term regret when crafting did not provide them with the level of fulfillment that they desired, leaving them feeling sorrow about the forgone fulfillment. This is illustrated by the experience of Sally, an elementary school teacher who has a missed calling for a career in

sales. To pursue her unanswered calling, she employs the role reframing technique by establishing a connection between learning new technology for her classroom and the competitive environment of sales. However, even though the role reframing technique provides her with some enjoyment and meaning, her crafting efforts fall short of providing a desirable level of fulfillment because her teaching role is not conducive to providing the level of competition she desires, leading to some long-term regret (see Table 4).

Similarly, Thelma utilizes the task emphasizing technique by trying to get to know her students on a personal level to pursue her missed calling to be a therapist. Although this gives her some enjoyment, she nonetheless describes experiencing long-term regret for not answering her calling.

My favorite part of my job is the one-on-one time with students, which is what therapy is all about. . . . It is sort of difficult to know that there's another occupation out there that's more suited for me. I feel kind of in a holding pattern. I've been really limited in my choices because of my husband's school situation. It'd be nice to have more freedom of choice.

Thelma's and Sally's situations illustrate how the crafting techniques can give individuals some exposure to their unanswered callings, but fall short of providing them with ample opportunity to pursue their missed callings, leading to long-term feelings of regret.

Whereas participants with missed callings tended to describe experiencing regret over the long term, participants with additional callings tended to describe experiencing sporadic and short-lived episodes of regret, which we labeled as intermittent regret. We found that intermittent regret is likely to occur when a crafting technique creates only passive, brief, or limited exposure to forgone opportunities for fulfilling additional callings, conjuring up counterfactual thoughts about what it might be like to have a different balance among multiple callings. Rick illustrates this in his remarks in Table 4; he describes how he encounters intermittent regret while employing the vicarious experiencing technique to pursue his additional calling for music. Although his vicarious experiences are enjoyable and meaningful, he expresses that being exposed to his unanswered calling sometimes produces temporary regrets about what it would be like if he pursued a career in music further. Mary, who has an unanswered calling for music, describes a strikingly similar experience of intermittent regret.

There are times where I will go to a concert and hear a great musician doing something or even go to the theater and see the people on stage in this play bringing all that enjoyment to the public, and I will have pangs of regret that, "I wonder if I had really pursued this. . . ." Just a quick pang of regret, and then I'm done with it. Because ultimately, I just don't think I have the talent to really do anything very important from the musical end, and I'm happy that I still have it in my life for my own enjoyment.

These two examples illustrate how brief or limited exposure to unanswered callings through crafting techniques can lead individuals with additional callings to experience intermittent regret. However, individuals often described preventing regret from extending long term by justifying why their current situations are preferable to their counterfactual visions of a different balance among multiple callings.

**PROPOSITION 8.** *Pursuing unanswered callings through job and leisure crafting techniques increases the likelihood of experiencing regret, such that (a) individuals with missed callings are more likely to experience long-term regret, whereas (b) individuals with additional callings are more likely to experience intermittent regret.*

*Stress due to difficulty in pursuing unanswered calling(s).* Stress refers to adverse feelings, such as anxiety, fear, irritation, pressure, and sadness, that are caused by an imbalance between the individual's motivations and abilities and the environment's requirements and supports (e.g., Ganster and Schaubroeck 1991). We found that participants with both missed and additional callings discussed experiencing stress in pursuit of their unanswered callings, but they tended to describe different kinds of stress. Participants with missed callings usually described frustration or feelings of aggravation about being blocked or prevented from achieving a goal (Carver and Scheier 1990) when they encountered obstacles in their efforts to pursue missed callings, such as "red tape" or resistance from others. Such obstacles led to the frustrating realization that their formal job responsibilities limited the amount of time, energy, and attention they could allocate to crafting techniques—and thus to experiencing enjoyment and meaning with respect to their unanswered callings. Wendy illustrates this frustration in Table 4, and her nonprofit colleague Emma describes a similar frustrating situation presented by the challenge of convincing her supervisor to accommodate her crafting.

I want to do more writing work, but I think a lot of what's difficult about my job is that I get a lot of things in the communications department that is grunt work. I wish I could take that out of my job description, but I can't. I don't know really how to deal with that. . . . so that's caused some job dissatisfaction. I think if my supervisor were someone who was not sharp tongued, or if she was more lax, I would feel better about saying that this is what I would like my responsibilities to be like, or if I felt like she supported me in shaping my job like that, then I could do more of what I want to do and it would be better.

These examples illustrate how the demands and constraints of occupying a formal work role can frustrate individuals' desires to pursue their missed callings through job crafting, making salient to them the particular barriers that impede their crafting efforts.



Whereas participants with missed callings usually described stressful states of frustration, participants with additional callings usually described stressful states of overload. Overload is a form of stress that involves the feeling of being overwhelmed by demands, requirements, or expectations (Rizzo et al. 1970). Since individuals who have the motivation to pursue additional callings find themselves juggling multiple callings, including their current occupations, they are especially susceptible to overload. Experiences of overload often make salient to participants the trade-offs that are necessary to juggle multiple callings. Carl provides an example of overload in Table 4. His efforts to pursue his additional calling for academic consulting by taking on administrative duties contributes to an onerous level of stress, making salient the trade-off he faces between the enjoyment and meaning that the extra tasks provide him and the added stress of these responsibilities. Carl's struggle resembles Andy's story, which began in our earlier discussion of hobby participating. Andy reflected on the stress involved in attempting to strike a balance between his callings.

Teaching is very interesting and stimulating, but it has its downsides like any other job. Sometimes you carry things around with you; like I need to e-mail this student, or I need to discipline this student . . . . But it's also wonderful. So I never dread going to work . . . . But the anxiety I have, and the existential doubts I have, are more just, sort of, being aware that my own aspirations are never smooth, as smooth as I would want . . . . Again, I like teaching. I like having some contact with the wider world. I think it does me good. And so even though it takes up more of my writing time than I'd like, if somebody said, "You don't have to teach anymore," I would probably still do some in addition to just trying to write.

Together, Andy's and Carl's examples illustrate that because time, energy, and attention are finite resources, efforts to craft one's job and leisure time in pursuit of additional callings can lead to overload, making salient to individuals the trade-offs involved in juggling their multiple callings.

**PROPOSITION 9.** *Pursuing unanswered callings through job and leisure crafting techniques increases the likelihood of experiencing stress, such that (a) individuals with missed callings are more likely to experience frustration, whereas (b) individuals with additional callings are more likely to experience overload.*

## Discussion

### Theoretical Implications

Our propositions pave the way for future research to build, test, and refine theory about the nature, pursuit, and experience of unanswered callings, as well as about job crafting. In particular, our distinction between

missed and additional callings extends theoretical perspectives on callings in three key ways. First, the majority of past research has defined a calling orientation as an attitude or disposition that describes an individual's relation to the broad domain of work (e.g., Hall and Chandler 2005, Wrzesniewski et al. 1997). In contrast, our conceptualization ties an individual's sense of calling to one or more specific occupations. Second, our findings suggest that individuals may have multiple occupational callings, as many participants described feeling called to more than one occupation. Third, the distinction between missed and additional callings accentuates the value of an expanded conceptualization of callings that includes multiple callings, each of which may be answered or unanswered by one's current occupation.

Regarding the experience of unanswered callings, our propositions offer implications for emotion theories. Our findings invite consideration of the possibility that the duration of regret that individuals feel depends on whether they have missed or additional callings. Although researchers have shown that the duration of regret tends to last longer for inactions than actions (Gilovich et al. 1998), they have paid little attention to situational differences that influence temporal patterns of regret. Our propositions suggest that individuals with additional callings are less prone to long-term regret than individuals with missed callings, whose dissatisfaction with their current occupations makes it difficult to ward off counterfactual thoughts and disappointments. Interestingly, this pattern among participants with missed callings to experience longer-term regret emerged in our interviews for both actions ("I chose the wrong occupation") and inactions ("I should have undertaken a different occupation"). These findings imply that individuals engaging in the process of pursuing additional callings may be relatively buffered against longer-term regret, whereas the process of pursuing missed callings may involve greater susceptibility to longer-term regret.

Finally, our findings have two meaningful implications for theory and research on job crafting. First, we extend the concept of job crafting outside the domain of work to illustrate how individuals express initiative, agency, and proactivity in shaping their leisure activities to pursue their unanswered callings. Our findings highlight that individuals are able to use crafting techniques to pursue their occupational callings outside the workplace, which expands the boundaries of when and how an occupational calling can be fulfilled and accentuates the important role that the work-leisure interface may play in crafting research (cf. Wrzesniewski and Dutton 2001). Our propositions suggest that leisure crafting is more likely to be undertaken to compensate for difficulties in job crafting within strong situations. Second, we answered calls to explore the dark sides of job crafting (e.g., Grant and Ashford 2008) by illuminating how the very crafting techniques that bring enjoyment and

meaning can also expose individuals to unpleasant states of regret and stress. These findings uncover a double-edged sword of pleasure and pain that may underlie the experiences of having and pursuing unanswered callings: such experiences appear to be, at best, mixed blessings.

### Unanswered Questions on Unanswered Callings

Our study raises important questions about how individuals come to experience themselves as having missed versus additional callings. Although our data provide limited insight into this issue, we speculate here about several possible explanations. First, our study hints that, over time, the affective events that individuals experience may influence whether individuals not only pursue—but also experience—missed or additional callings. As negative affective events accumulate, individuals may be more likely to make sense of their current occupations as unfulfilling, and if they feel called to another occupation, they will construe their callings as missed. As positive affective events build up, individuals may tend to make sense of their current occupations as fulfilling, leading to the interpretation of other callings as additional. Furthermore, theories of self-regulation suggest that the behavioral options chosen by individuals will depend on how they interpret and attribute their unpleasant psychological states of regret and stress at work (Martin et al. 1993, Weiner 1986). For example, individuals with missed callings may be inclined to attribute their unpleasant states to general, stable features of their jobs and occupations, resulting in the desire to find a new occupation, whereas individuals with additional callings may be inclined to attribute their unpleasant states to specific challenges of using crafting techniques, resulting in the desire to try new forms of crafting.

Second, missed and additional callings are social constructions that are likely to be enabled and constrained by the organizational and occupational contexts in which individuals make sense of their experiences (Weick 1995). Organizational and occupational ideologies can provide rhetoric that legitimates the experience of one's current occupation as a calling or marginalizes the experience of a calling as unprofessional or inappropriate in a work context. This theme is implicit in Amy's statement that "it helps the world become a better place, but I encourage my children and friends not to go into teaching," where she explains that she feels that the philosophy imposed by No Child Left Behind has created such a dominant focus on rote memorization that she is no longer able to experience or express a love of teaching. She resolves the apparent cognitive dissonance that ensues by concluding that teaching was not her calling, and she has missed her calling for computer animation.

Third, individual differences and experiences may also play a role in shaping how individuals construct their unanswered callings as missed versus additional. From a life history standpoint, individuals' past experiences in

occupations may influence how they perceive their current occupation. For example, employees early in their careers may be less likely to view their current occupation as a calling due to seeing their work as a means to explore and advance to a different job, compared with employees later in their careers, who may be more likely to evaluate their work in terms of opportunities to make a difference (Grant and Wade-Benzoni 2009). Consequently, employees early in their careers may lack meaning in their current occupations and therefore construe unanswered callings as missed, whereas employees later in their careers may experience meaning in their current occupations and thus construe unanswered callings as additional. Beyond life history, from a personality standpoint, extensive research has shown that biological propensities toward extraversion increase the sensitivity of the behavioral activation system to rewards, leading extraverts to experience more frequent and intense positive emotions than introverts, whereas biological propensities toward neuroticism increase the sensitivity of the behavioral inhibition system to punishment cues, leading neurotic individuals to experience more frequent and intense negative emotions than emotionally stable individuals (e.g., McCrae and Costa 2003). As a result, extraverts may be more likely than introverts to interpret their current occupations as callings, and thus to experience additional callings, whereas neurotic individuals may be more likely than emotionally stable individuals to view their current occupations in a negative light, and thus to experience missed callings. On a related note, individuals high in openness to experience may be more prone to identifying additional callings, because they tend to be more interested in and engaged with a diverse range of activities (McCrae and Costa 2003). We hope that future research will investigate these ideas in further depth.

### Limitations and Future Directions

Our study is subject to several important limitations that may be resolved in future research. First, the crafting techniques and psychological states identified in our study do not necessarily represent an exhaustive set, and other samples may identify different sets of techniques, states, and other factors that may be relevant to the socially embedded phenomenon of having and pursuing unanswered callings in different settings. Future qualitative research could elaborate our findings and explore additional factors, such as the ways in which organizational cultures, social structures, and interpersonal interactions impact the process of pursuing unanswered callings. Furthermore, because the interview data and numerical ratings were collected at one point in time, our study was based on a single snapshot of participants' thoughts and feelings, which may leave obscure important factors involved in how this complex, dynamic, and longitudinal process unfolds over time. For instance, the

length of time that people experience having unanswered callings may strengthen or weaken their motivations to craft, or the benefits of enjoyment and meaning may be more or less difficult to experience as a calling goes unanswered over time. Second, our approach to determining which occupations participants viewed as unanswered callings was useful for building theory, but yielded a sample featuring wide variance with respect to the strength of unanswered callings, ranging from those who feel a powerful and urgent sense of calling to those for whom a sense of calling is present but relatively less intense. Future longitudinal research could address this issue by using methods that permit a more fine-grained analysis of the strength of participants' unanswered callings.

Third, we hope to see future research use purposeful sampling to investigate the extent to which formally prescribed levels of autonomy and power shape the crafting techniques, as well as the different types of unanswered callings, crafting techniques, and psychological states that emerge in different situations, occupations, and organizational cultures. Because of the limited size of our sample, we could identify only a subset of the possible patterns with respect to the prevalence of missed versus additional callings and job crafting techniques among the six occupational groups in our study. Our findings do provide evidence that the strength of the situation employees face is inversely related to the number of job crafting techniques they are likely to enact (i.e., the stronger the situation, the fewer the job crafting techniques). Also, our sample of educators appears to provide "extreme cases" of having additional callings. To target extreme cases of missed callings, for example, researchers might study restaurant servers in Hollywood or New York City, many of whom may have unsuccessfully tried for an extended period of time to answer their callings for acting. Anesthesiologists may also be relevant, because many of them report that they initially hoped to be surgeons but selected anesthesiology for the fixed hours and less stressful lifestyle (Dorsey et al. 2003).

Finally, our study is circumscribed by the Western culture in which it was conducted. The Protestant work ethic and its emphasis on heeding an occupational calling are powerful cultural values in the United States (Bellah et al. 1985) and similar Western cultures. However, the general notions of occupational callings and the intrinsic nobility or virtue of work are not universal across cultures. Our research methods and findings assume that people are motivated to fulfill callings, but this may not be the case for all Americans or for individuals in other cultural contexts. Future research should address whether unanswered callings are a relevant phenomenon in other national and regional cultures, and if so, explore the impact of cultural values and norms on how individuals respond to unanswered callings.

## Conclusion

The deep sense of personal fulfillment that Western culture encourages individuals to expect from the domain of work often runs counter to the structures and practices that work organizations deem practical for achieving their goals, generating challenges for the individuals who are driven by cultural norms and values to pursue their callings but have limited opportunity to do so within the Western employment system. This misalignment has potentially significant implications for managers and employees more generally. For practicality and efficiency reasons, managers typically seek to design standardized "one-size-fits-all" jobs (Ilgen and Hollenbeck 1991, Mohrman and Cohen 1995), which may leave untapped opportunities to better align employees' jobs with their individual motives and strengths. The job crafting techniques that participants used to pursue their unanswered callings represent bottom-up ways in which employees can customize more fitting job designs for themselves. Many instances of these techniques appear to be beneficial to both the individual and the organization (e.g., Wendy taking initiative to learn more about the software that her organization uses or Paul training new employees). Thus, managers might fruitfully explore the potential benefits of providing employees with autonomy and support to engage in forms of job crafting that are beneficial to the organization, which may foster increased enjoyment and meaning while also serving organizational performance objectives. Managers may also be able to assist employees in crafting their leisure time to pursue their unanswered callings. In recent years, for example, a number of companies have formed strategic alliances with nonprofit organizations that facilitate volunteer work on the part of interested employees; such volunteer programs could provide employees with beneficial connections to their unanswered callings. In conclusion, our research suggests that despite the challenges involved in pursuing unanswered callings, individuals can and do exercise agency to do so. As Gary explains,

When I think about what it would've been like if I pursued a career in music, it reinforces that I'm in the right place, in the right career, but a career that allows me to pursue my other passion at the appropriate level. I listen to music regularly. I get to be an entertainer in the classroom. I play the piano when I'm at home. I have a guitar in my office, which I strum on every once in a while, and when little opportunities come along to form a band, I'll do that. But my career and my life is being a professor.

## Acknowledgments

The authors thank Martha Feldman, four anonymous reviewers, Jane Dutton, Stuart Bunderson, Andy Molinsky, Rick Price, Kathryn Dekas, Melissa Kamin, and members of the Impact Lab for valuable feedback on earlier drafts. They are also grateful to the University of Michigan Organizational Studies Program and Ross School of Business for financial support. This paper is based on the first author's undergraduate honors thesis.

## Appendix

**Table A.1 Stages of Interview Protocol**

Stage 1: Reveal present feelings about work
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What is a typical day like in your job?</li> <li>• On a scale from 1–7, one being not at all similar to you and seven being very much similar to you, how similar are the people in the following paragraphs (adapted from Wrzesniewski et al. 1997) to you? Why did you choose this rating?             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ [<i>Calling Orientation</i>]: For <i>Category A</i> people, work is one of the most important parts of life. They are very pleased that they are in their line of work. Because what they do for a living is a vital part of who they are, it is one of the first things they tell people about themselves. They tend to take their work home with them and on vacations, too. The majority of their friends are from their places of employment, and they belong to several organizations and clubs relating to their work. They feel good about their work because they love it, and because they think it makes the world a better place. They would encourage their friends and children to enter their line of work. Category A people would be pretty upset if they were forced to stop working, and they are not particularly looking forward to retirement.</li> <li>◦ [<i>Job Orientation</i>]: <i>Category B</i> people work primarily enough to earn enough money to support their lives outside of their jobs. If they were financially secure, they would no longer continue with their current line of work, but would really rather do something else instead. To these people, their jobs are basically a necessity of life, a lot like breathing or sleeping. They often wish the time would pass more quickly at work. They greatly anticipate weekends and vacations. If these people lived their lives over again, they probably would not go into the same line of work. They would not encourage their friends and children to enter their line of work. Category B people are very eager to retire.</li> <li>◦ [<i>Career Orientation</i>]: <i>Category C</i> people basically enjoy their work, but do not expect to be in their current jobs five years from now. Instead, they plan to move on to better, higher-level jobs. They have several goals for their futures pertaining to the positions they would eventually like to hold. Sometimes their work seems a waste of time, but they know that they must do sufficiently well in their current positions in order to move on. Category C people can't wait to get a promotion. For them, a promotion means recognition of their good work, and is a sign of their success in competition with coworkers.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Stage 2: Outline career path and identify unanswered callings
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Please tell me the story of how you came to be a teacher, with particular attention on any key milestones, events, or decisions along your career path.             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ Did you actively pursue any other occupations before teaching? Beginning with the earliest:                 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ Why did you pursue this occupation? How did you feel about this occupation? How interested are you in this occupation now?</li> <li>■ Imagine you were currently working in this occupation. Using the same 1–7 scale, how similar would Category A people be to you? Why did you choose this rating?</li> </ul> </li> <li>◦ Are there any other occupations you have considered pursuing? Beginning with the earliest:                 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>■ When did you become interested in this occupation? Why were you interested in this occupation? How strongly do you feel toward this occupation now? What made you decide against pursuing this occupation?</li> <li>■ Imagine you were currently working in this occupation. Using the same 1–7 scale, how similar would Category A people be to you? Why did you choose this rating?</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Stage 3: Examine process of responding to unanswered calling(s)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Please tell me about the difficult decisions you faced on your career path. Beginning with the earliest:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ How did you handle this difficult decision?</li> <li>◦ What are some of the strategies you used to handle this difficult decision?</li> <li>◦ What do you do now to deal with this difficult decision?</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Have you actively incorporated any aspects of [unanswered calling] into your job? If so, how?             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ Which of these aspects are required by your job and which ones are not?</li> <li>◦ How do you feel about these aspects?</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Have you actively incorporated any aspects of [unanswered calling] into your life outside of work? If so, how?             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>◦ How do you feel about these aspects?</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Stage 4: Determine psychological states
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How do you feel about the balance between your current job and [unanswered calling]?</li> <li>• Looking back, how do you feel about your career path?</li> <li>• Do you ever think about what it would have been like if you pursued a different occupation?</li> <li>• How does your career path affect your life now?</li> <li>• What are your plans for the future regarding your career?</li> </ul>

## Endnote

<sup>1</sup>In some instances, enjoyment and meaning can be difficult to distinguish, because they are often inextricably intertwined (King et al. 2006, Ryan and Deci 2001). Accordingly, the participants in this study often described psychological states that we coded as representing both enjoyment and meaning.

## References

- Alogoskoufis, G. 1995. *Unemployment: Choices for Europe*. Centre for Economic Policy Research, London.
- Baddeley, A. D. 1982. Domains of recollection. *Psych. Rev.* **89**(6) 708–729.
- Bell, D. E. 1985. Disappointment in decision making under uncertainty. *Oper. Res.* **33**(1) 1–27.
- Bellah, R. N., R. Madsen, W. M. Sullivan, A. Swidler, S. M. Tipton. 1985. *Habits of the Heart*. Harper & Row, New York.
- Berg, J. M., A. Wrzesniewski, J. E. Dutton. 2010. Perceiving and responding to challenges in job crafting at different ranks: When proactivity requires adaptivity. *J. Organ. Behav.* **31**(2) 158–186.
- Brennfleck, K., K. Marie. 2005. *Live Your Calling: A Practical Guide to Finding and Fulfilling Your Mission in Life*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
- Briscoe, J. P., D. T. Hall. 2006. The interplay of boundaryless and protean careers: Combinations and implications. *J. Vocational Behav.* **69**(1) 4–18.
- Brockner, J., E. T. Higgins. 2001. Regulatory focus theory: Implications for the study of emotions at work. *Organ. Behav. Human Decision Processes* **86**(1) 35–66.
- Brookhart, S. M., D. J. Freeman. 1992. Characteristics of entering teacher candidates. *Rev. Educational Res.* **62**(1) 37–60.
- Bunderson, J. S., J. A. Thompson. 2009. The call of the wild: Zookeepers, callings, and the double-edged sword of deeply meaningful work. *Admin. Sci. Quart.* **54**(1) 32–57.
- Bureau of Labor Statistics. 2006. Number of jobs held by individuals from age 18 to age 42 in 1978–2006 by educational attainment, sex, race, Hispanic or Latino ethnicity, and age. Report, U.S. Department of Labor, Washington, DC. <http://www.bls.gov/news.release.nlsy.t01.htm>.
- Buskist, W., T. Benson, J. F. Sikorski. 2005. The call to teach. *J. Soc. Clinical Psych.* **24**(1) 111–122.
- Caplan, R. D. 1987. Person-environment fit theory and organizations: Commensurate dimensions, time perspectives, and mechanisms. *J. Vocational Behav.* **31**(3) 248–267.
- Careerbuilder.com. 2008. Follow your heart. <http://www.careerbuilder.com>.
- Carlson, M., V. Charlin, N. Miller. 1988. Positive mood and helping behavior: A test of six hypotheses. *J. Personality Social Psych.* **55**(2) 211–229.
- Carver, C. S., M. F. Scheier. 1990. Origins and functions of positive and negative affect: A control-process view. *Psych. Rev.* **97**(1) 19–35.
- Dorsey, R. E., D. Jarjoura, G. W. Rutecki. 2003. Influence of controllable lifestyle on recent trends in specialty choice by US medical students. *J. Amer. Med. Assoc.* **290**(9) 1173–1178.
- Duffy, R. D., W. E. Sedlacek. 2007. The presence of and search for a calling: Connections to career development. *J. Vocational Behav.* **70**(3) 590–601.
- Eisenhardt, K. M. 1989. Building theories from case study research. *Acad. Management Rev.* **14**(4) 532–550.
- Folkman, S., J. T. Moskowitz. 2004. Coping: Pitfalls and promise. *Annual Rev. Psych.* **55** 745–774.
- Fong, C. T. 2006. The effects of emotional ambivalence on creativity. *Acad. Management J.* **49**(5) 1016–1030.
- Ganster, D. C., J. Schaubroeck. 1991. Work stress and employee health. *J. Management* **17**(2) 235–271.
- Gilovich, T., V. H. Medvec. 1995. The experience of regret: What, when, and why. *Psych. Rev.* **102**(2) 379–395.
- Gilovich, T., V. H. Medvec, D. Kahneman. 1998. Varieties of regret: A debate and partial resolution. *Psych. Rev.* **105**(3) 602–605.
- Grant, A. M. 2007. Relational job design and the motivation to make a prosocial difference. *Acad. Management Rev.* **32**(2) 393–417.
- Grant, A. M., S. J. Ashford. 2008. The dynamics of proactivity at work. *Res. Organ. Behav.* **28** 3–34.
- Grant, A. M., K. Wade-Benzoni. 2009. The hot and cool of death awareness at work: Mortality cues, aging, and self-protective and prosocial motivations. *Acad. Management Rev.* **34**(4) 600–622.
- Hackman, J. R., G. R. Oldham. 1980. *Work Redesign*. Addison-Wesley, Reading, MA.
- Hall, D. T., D. E. Chandler. 2005. Psychological success: When the career is a calling. *J. Organ. Behav.* **26**(2) 155–176.
- Hall, D. T., P. H. Mirvis. 1995. The new career contract: Developing the whole person at midlife and beyond. *J. Vocational Behav.* **47**(3) 269–289.
- Heslin, P. A. 2005. Conceptualizing and evaluating career success. *J. Organ. Behav.* **26**(2) 113–136.
- Ilgel, D. R., J. R. Hollenbeck. 1991. The structure of work: Job design and roles. M. D. Dunnette, L. Hough, eds. *Handbook of Industrial and Organizational Psychology*. Consulting Psychologists Press, Palo Alto, CA, 165–207.
- Iyengar, S. S., R. E. Wells, B. Schwartz. 2006. Doing better but feeling worse: Looking for the “best” job undermines satisfaction. *Psych. Sci.* **17**(2) 143–150.
- Judge, T. A., R. D. Bretz. 1992. Effects of work values on job choice decisions. *J. Appl. Psych.* **77**(3) 261–271.
- Kahn, W. A. 1990. Psychological conditions of personal engagement and disengagement at work. *Acad. Management J.* **33**(4) 692–724.
- King, L. A., J. A. Hicks, J. L. Krull, A. K. Del Gaiso. 2006. Positive affect and the experience of meaning in life. *J. Personality Social Psych.* **90**(1) 179–196.
- Lee, T. W., T. R. Mitchell, C. J. Sablinski. 1999. Qualitative research in organizational and vocational psychology, 1979–1999. *J. Vocational Behav.* **55**(2) 161–187.
- Lee, T. W., T. R. Mitchell, C. J. Sablinski, J. P. Burton, B. C. Holtom. 2004. The effects of job embeddedness on organizational citizenship, job performance, volitional absences, and voluntary turnover. *Acad. Management J.* **47**(5) 711–722.
- Leider, R. L., D. A. Shapiro. 2001. *Whistle While You Work: Heeding Your Life's Calling*. Berrett-Koehler, San Francisco.
- Martin, L. L., D. W. Ward, J. W. Achee, R. S. Wyer. 1993. Mood as input: People have to interpret the motivational implications of their moods. *J. Personality Social Psych.* **64**(3) 317–326.
- McCrae, R. R., P. T. Costa Jr. 2003. *Personality in Adulthood: A Five-Factor Theory Perspective*, 2nd ed. Guilford Press, New York.
- McGregor, I. 2006. Offensive defensiveness: Toward an integrative neuroscience of compensatory zeal after mortality salience, personal uncertainty, and other poignant self-threats. *Psych. Inquiry* **17**(4) 299–308.
- McGregor, I., B. R. Little. 1998. Personal projects, happiness, and meaning: On doing well and being yourself. *J. Personality Social Psych.* **74**(2) 494–512.
- Miles, M. B., A. M. Huberman. 1994. *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook*, 2nd ed. Sage, Beverly Hills, CA.
- Miller, L. E., R. M. Weiss. 1982. The work-leisure relationship: Evidence for the compensatory hypothesis. *Human Relations* **35**(9) 763–771.
- Mischel, W. 1973. Toward a cognitive social learning reconceptualization of personality. *Psych. Rev.* **80**(4) 252–283.
- Mohrman, S. A., S. G. Cohen. 1995. When people get out of the box. A. Howard, ed. *The Changing Nature of Work*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco, 365–410.
- Monster.com. 2008. Your calling is calling. Retrieved February 4, 2008, <http://yourcalling.monster.com>.
- Pratt, M. G. 2000. The good, the bad, and the ambivalent: Managing identification among Amway distributors. *Admin. Sci. Quart.* **45**(3) 456–493.
- Perlow, L. A. 1999. The time famine: Toward a sociology of work time. *Admin. Sci. Quart.* **44**(1) 57–81.
- Rizzo, J. R., R. J. House, S. I. Lirtzman. 1970. Role conflict and ambiguity in complex organizations. *Admin. Sci. Quart.* **15**(2) 150–163.
- Rothbard, N. P. 2001. Enriching or depleting? The dynamics of engagement in work and family roles. *Admin. Sci. Quart.* **46**(4) 655–684.

- Rousseau, D. M., V. T. Ho, J. Greenberg. 2006. I-deals: Idiosyncratic terms in employment relationships. *Acad. Management Rev.* **31**(4) 977–994.
- Ryan, R. M., E. L. Deci. 2001. On happiness and human potentials: A review of research on hedonic and eudaimonic well-being. *Annual Rev. Psych.* **52**(1) 141–166.
- Scheier, M. F., C. S. Carver. 1988. A model of behavioral self-regulation: Translating intention into action. L. Berkowitz, ed. *Social Psychological Studies of the Self: Perspectives and Programs*. Advances in Experimental Social Psychology, Vol. 21. Academic Press, San Diego, 303–346.
- Schwartz, B. 2004. *The Paradox of Choice: Why Less Is More*. Harper Perennial, New York.
- Shah, J. Y., R. Friedman, A. W. Kruglanski. 2002. Forgetting all else: On the antecedents and consequences of goal shielding. *J. Personality Social Psych.* **83**(6) 1261–1280.
- Shamir, B. 1991. Meaning, self and motivation in organizations. *Organ. Stud.* **12**(3) 405–424.
- Simons, D. J., C. F. Chabris. 1999. Gorillas in our midst: Sustained inattention blindness for dynamic events. *Perception* **28**(9) 1059–1074.
- Sonnentag, S. 2003. Recovery, work engagement, and proactive behavior: A new look at the interface between nonwork and work. *J. Appl. Psych.* **88**(3) 518–528.
- Thompson, J. A., J. S. Bunderson. 2003. Violations of principle: Ideological currency in the psychological contract. *Acad. Management Rev.* **28**(4) 571–586.
- Twenge, J. M. 2006. *Generation Me: Why Today's Young Americans Are More Confident, Assertive, Entitled—And More Miserable than Ever Before*. Free Press, New York.
- Vallerand, R. J., C. Blanchard, G. A. Mageau, R. Koestner, C. Ratelle, M. Léonard, M. Gagné, J. Marsolais. 2003. Les passions de l'âme: On obsessive and harmonious passion. *J. Personality Social Psych.* **85**(4) 756–767.
- van Dijk, E., M. Zeelenberg. 2005. On the psychology of “if only”: Regret and the comparison between factual and counterfactual outcomes. *Organ. Behav. Human Decision Processes* **97**(2) 152–160.
- Weber, M. 1958. *The Protestant Ethic and The Spirit of Capitalism*. Scribner, New York.
- Wegner, D. M. 1994. Ironic processes of mental control. *Psych. Rev.* **101**(1) 34–52.
- Weick, K. E. 1995. *Sensemaking in Organizations*. Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA.
- Weiner, B. 1986. *An Attributional Theory of Motivation and Emotion*. Springer-Verlag, New York.
- Wright, T. A., R. Cropanzano. 2000. Psychological well-being and job satisfaction as predictors of job performance. *J. Occupational Health Psych.* **5**(1) 84–94.
- Wrzesniewski, A. 2003. Finding positive meaning in work. K. Cameron, J. E. Dutton, R. E. Quinn, eds. *Positive Organizational Scholarship*. Berrett-Koehler, San Francisco, 296–308.
- Wrzesniewski, A., J. E. Dutton. 2001. Crafting a job: Revisioning employees as active crafters of their work. *Acad. Management Rev.* **26**(2) 179–201.
- Wrzesniewski, A., J. E. Dutton, G. Debebe. 2003. Interpersonal sense-making and the meaning of work. *Res. Organ. Behav.* **25** 93–135.
- Wrzesniewski, A., C. McCauley, P. Rozin, B. Schwartz. 1997. Jobs, careers, and callings: People's relations to their work. *J. Res. Personality* **31**(1) 21–33.

Copyright 2010, by INFORMS, all rights reserved. Copyright of Organization Science: A Journal of the Institute of Management Sciences is the property of INFORMS: Institute for Operations Research and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.