#### BT5110: Tutorial 4 — Normal Forms

#### Pratik Karmakar

School of Computing, National University of Singapore

AY25/26 S1





#### Question

Your company, Apasaja Private Limited, is commissioned by *Toko Kopi Luwak* to design the relational schema for the management of their coffee beans, drinks, and cafes.

A coffee bean is fully identified by its unique brand name *or* by the pair (cultivar, region). A drink can be made using a particular coffee bean; the drink name is only unique *per* bean (e.g., "Espresso" with bean "The Waterfall" or with bean "La Bella"). We also record the drink price.

A branch (identified by branch name) may sell zero or more drinks; a drink may be sold by zero or more branches. Each branch records an address, and for each (branch, drink) pair we record the quantity sold.

We are given only an abstract schema:

$$R = \{A, B, C, D, E, F, G, H\}$$
 
$$\Sigma = \{\{A\} \to \{C, E\}, \{A, B\} \to \{D\}, \{F\} \to \{H\}, \{C, E\} \to \{A\}, \{B, C, E\} \to \{D\}, \{A, B, F\} \to \{D, G\}, \{B, C, E, F\} \to \{G\}\}.$$



2 / 11

#### Question

#### 1. Normal Form

- (a) Is R with  $\Sigma$  in 3NF?
- (b) Is R with  $\Sigma$  in BCNF?

#### 2. Normalisation

- (a) Decompose (synthesise) R with  $\Sigma$  into a 3NF decomposition using the lecture algorithm.
- (b) Is the result lossless?
- (c) Is the result dependency preserving?
- (d) Is the result in BCNF?
- (e) Decompose R with Σ into a BCNF decomposition using the lecture algorithm.
- (f) Is the result lossless?
- (g) Is the result dependency preserving?



School of Computing, National University of Singapore

# Criteria for 3NF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \rightarrow \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey or
- A is a prime attribute

# Criteria for 3NF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \rightarrow \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey or
- A is a prime attribute

Known keys (from previous tutorial):  $\{A, B, F\}$  and  $\{B, C, E, F\}$ . Prime attributes:  $\{A, B, C, E, F\}$ .

# Criteria for 3NF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \to \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey or
- A is a prime attribute

Known keys (from previous tutorial):  $\{A, B, F\}$  and  $\{B, C, E, F\}$ . Prime attributes:  $\{A, B, C, E, F\}$ . Consider  $\{A, B\} \rightarrow \{D\}$ :

School of Computing, National University of Singapore

# Criteria for 3NF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \to \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey or
- A is a prime attribute

Known keys (from previous tutorial):  $\{A, B, F\}$  and  $\{B, C, E, F\}$ . Prime attributes:  $\{A, B, C, E, F\}$ . Consider  $\{A, B\} \rightarrow \{D\}$ :

Nontrivial.

# Criteria for 3NF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \to \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey or
- A is a prime attribute

Known keys (from previous tutorial):  $\{A, B, F\}$  and  $\{B, C, E, F\}$ . Prime attributes:  $\{A, B, C, E, F\}$ . Consider  $\{A, B\} \rightarrow \{D\}$ :

- Nontrivial.
- {A, B} is not a superkey.

# Criteria for 3NF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \to \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey or
- A is a prime attribute

Known keys (from previous tutorial):  $\{A, B, F\}$  and  $\{B, C, E, F\}$ . Prime attributes:  $\{A, B, C, E, F\}$ . Consider  $\{A, B\} \rightarrow \{D\}$ :

- Nontrivial.
- {A, B} is not a superkey.
- D is not a prime attribute.

4 / 11

# Criteria for 3NF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \rightarrow \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey or
- A is a prime attribute

Known keys (from previous tutorial):  $\{A, B, F\}$  and  $\{B, C, E, F\}$ . Prime attributes:  $\{A, B, C, E, F\}$ .

Consider  $\{A, B\} \rightarrow \{D\}$ :

- Nontrivial.
- {A, B} is not a superkey.
- D is not a prime attribute.
  - $\Rightarrow$  R with  $\Sigma$  is not in 3NF.



#### Criteria for 3NF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \to \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey or
- A is a prime attribute

#### Criteria for 3NF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \to \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey or
- A is a prime attribute

#### Criteria for BCNF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \to \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey

#### Criteria for 3NF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \to \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey or
- A is a prime attribute

#### Criteria for BCNF

If  $X \to \{A\} \in \Sigma$ :

- $X \to \{A\}$  is trivial or
- X is a superkey

Since not 3NF, cannot be BCNF.

A direct violation:  $\{A\} \rightarrow \{C\}$  is nontrivial and

$$A^+ = \{A, C, E\} \subset R \implies \{A\}$$
 is not a superkey.

So R with  $\Sigma$  is not in BCNF.

School of Computing, National University of Singapore

**Canonical cover:** 
$$\{A\} \to \{C, E\}, \{F\} \to \{H\}, \{C, E\} \to \{A\}, \{B, C, E\} \to \{D\}, \{B, C, E, F\} \to \{G\}\}.$$

Canonical cover:  $\{ \{A\} \to \{C, E\}, \{F\} \to \{H\}, \{C, E\} \to \{A\}, \{B, C, E\} \to \{D\}, \{B, C, E, F\} \to \{G\} \}.$  Candidate keys:  $\{A, B, F\}, \{B, C, E, F\}$ 

Canonical cover:  $\{ \{A\} \to \{C, E\}, \{F\} \to \{H\}, \{C, E\} \to \{A\}, \{B, C, E\} \to \{D\}, \{B, C, E, F\} \to \{G\} \}.$  Candidate keys:  $\{A, B, F\}, \{B, C, E, F\}$ 

Fragments:

$$R_1 = \{A, C, E\}, \quad R_2 = \{F, H\}, R_3 = \{A, C, E\}, \quad R_4 = \{B, C, D, E\}, R_5 = \{B, C, E, F, G\}$$

Canonical cover:  $\{ \{A\} \to \{C, E\}, \{F\} \to \{H\}, \{C, E\} \to \{A\}, \{B, C, E\} \to \{D\}, \{B, C, E, F\} \to \{G\} \}.$ 

Candidate keys:  $\{A, B, F\}, \{B, C, E, F\}$ 

#### Fragments:

$$R_1 = \{A, C, E\}, \quad R_2 = \{F, H\},$$
  
 $R_3 = \{A, C, E\}, \quad R_4 = \{B, C, D, E\},$   
 $R_5 = \{B, C, E, F, G\}$ 

**Remove subsumed/duplicates:**  $R_1$  and  $R_3$  are same. So, we remove  $R_3$ .

A key fragment is not needed (the key  $\{B, C, E, F\} \subseteq \{B, C, E, F, G\}$  is covered).



# 2(b). Is the result dependency preserving?

**Dependency preserving:** Yes, guaranteed by the algorithm (each FD is placed in some fragment, and cover equivalence is preserved).

# 2(b). Is the result dependency preserving?

**Dependency preserving:** Yes, guaranteed by the algorithm (each FD is placed in some fragment, and cover equivalence is preserved). Also:

Lossless: Yes, guaranteed by the 3NF synthesis algorithm.

Dependency projection algorithm: Algorithm 1 ←□→←②→←②→←②→ ② ◆ ③ ◆ ○

$$R_1 = \{A, C, E\}$$

$$\Sigma_1 = \{\{A\} \rightarrow \{C\}, \{A\} \rightarrow \{E\}, \{C, E\} \rightarrow \{A\}\}$$

$$Candidate keys:$$

$$\{A\}, \{C, E\}$$

$$\begin{array}{lll} R_1 = \{A,C,E\} \\ \Sigma_1 = \{\{A\} \rightarrow \\ \{C\},\{A\} \rightarrow \\ \{E\},\{C,E\} \rightarrow \\ \{A\}\} \\ \textbf{Candidate keys:} \\ \{A\},\{C,E\} \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{ll} R_2 = \{F,H\} \\ \Sigma_2 = \{\{F\} \rightarrow \\ \{H\}\} \\ \textbf{Candidate keys:} \\ \{F\} \end{array}$$

<sup>1</sup>Dependency projection algorithm: Algorithm 1

8 / 11

## 2(c). Is the result in BCNF?

$$\begin{array}{lll} R_1 = \{A,C,E\} \\ \Sigma_1 = \{\{A\} \rightarrow \\ \{C\},\{A\} \rightarrow \\ \{E\},\{C,E\} \rightarrow \\ \{A\}\} \\ \textbf{Candidate keys:} \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{ll} R_2 = \{F,H\} \\ \Sigma_2 = \{\{F\} \rightarrow \\ \{H\}\} \\ \textbf{Candidate keys:} \\ \{F\} \end{array}$$

 $\{A\}, \{C, E\}$ 

$$R_2 = \{F, H\}$$
  
 $\Sigma_2 = \{\{F\} \rightarrow \{H\}\}\}$   
Candidate keys:  
 $\{F\}$ 

$$R_4 = \{B, C, D, E\}$$

$$\Sigma_4 =$$

$$\{\{B, C, E\} \rightarrow$$

$$\{D\}\}$$
Candidate keys:  

$$\{B, C, E\}$$

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Dependency projection algorithm: Algorithm 1

$$R_{1} = \{A, C, E\}$$

$$\Sigma_{1} = \{\{A\} \rightarrow \{C\}, \{A\} \rightarrow \{E\}, \{C, E\} \rightarrow \{A\}\}$$

Candidate keys:

 $\{A\}, \{C, E\}$ 

$$R_2 = \{F, H\}$$
 $\Sigma_2 = \{\{F\} \rightarrow \{H\}\}$ 
Candidate keys:
 $\{F\}$ 

 $R_4 = \{B, C, D, E\}$  $\Sigma_4 =$  $\Sigma_4 = \{\{B, C, E\} \rightarrow \}$ Candidate keys:  $\{B,C,E\}$ 

$$R_5 = \{B, C, E, F, G\}$$

$$\Sigma_5 = \{\{B, C, E, F\} \rightarrow \{G\}\}$$

$$Condidate keys$$

Candidate keys:  $\{B,C,E,F\}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Dependency projection algorithm: Algorithm 1

$$\begin{array}{l} R_1 = \{A,C,E\} \\ \Sigma_1 = \{\{A\} \rightarrow \\ \{C\},\{A\} \rightarrow \\ \{E\},\{C,E\} \rightarrow \\ \{A\}\} \\ \textbf{Candidate keys:} \\ \{A\},\{C,E\} \end{array}$$

$$R_2 = \{F, H\}$$

$$\Sigma_2 = \{\{F\} \rightarrow \{H\}\}$$

$$Candidate keys:$$

$$\{F\}$$

$$R_4 = \{B, C, D, E\}$$

$$\Sigma_4 =$$

$$\{\{B, C, E\} \rightarrow$$

$$\{D\}\}$$
Candidate keys:
$$\{B, C, E\}$$

$$R_5 = \{B, C, E, F, G\}$$

$$\Sigma_5 = \{\{B, C, E, F\} \rightarrow \{G\}\}$$
Candidate keys: 
$$\{B, C, E, F\}$$

 $\Sigma_1, \Sigma_2, \Sigma_4$  and  $\Sigma_5$  are projected dependencies. We obtain these by projecting  $\Sigma$  on  $R_1, R_2, R_4$  and  $R_5$  respectively.<sup>1</sup>

8 / 11

# 2(c). Is the result in BCNF?

$$\begin{array}{l} R_1 = \{A,C,E\} \\ \Sigma_1 = \{\{A\} \rightarrow \\ \{C\},\{A\} \rightarrow \\ \{E\},\{C,E\} \rightarrow \\ \{A\}\} \end{array}$$
 Candidate keys:

 $\{A\}, \{C, E\}$ 

$$R_2 = \{F, H\}$$

$$\Sigma_2 = \{\{F\} \rightarrow \{H\}\}$$
Candidate keys:
$$\{F\}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} R_4 = \{B,C,D,E\} \\ \Sigma_4 = \\ \{\{B,C,E\} \rightarrow \\ \{D\}\} \\ \textbf{Candidate keys:} \\ \{\texttt{B,C,E}\} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} \textit{R}_5 = \\ \{\textit{B},\textit{C},\textit{E},\textit{F},\textit{G}\} \\ \Sigma_5 = \\ \{\{\textit{B},\textit{C},\textit{E},\textit{F}\} \rightarrow \\ \{\textit{G}\}\} \\ \textbf{Candidate keys:} \\ \{\textit{B},\textit{C},\textit{E},\textit{F}\} \end{array}$$

 $\Sigma_1, \Sigma_2, \Sigma_4$  and  $\Sigma_5$  are projected dependencies. We obtain these by projecting  $\Sigma$  on  $R_1, R_2, R_4$  and  $R_5$  respectively.<sup>1</sup>

 $R_1$  with  $\Sigma_1$ ,  $R_2$  with  $\Sigma_2$ ,  $R_4$  with  $\Sigma_4$ , and  $R_5$  with  $\Sigma_5$  satisfy the BCNF criteria individually.

$$R_1 = \{A, C, E\}$$

$$\Sigma_1 = \{\{A\} \rightarrow \{C\}, \{A\} \rightarrow \{E\}, \{C, E\} \rightarrow \{A\}\}$$
Candidate keys:
$$\{A\}, \{C, E\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} R_2 &= \{F,H\} \\ \Sigma_2 &= \{\{F\} \rightarrow \\ \{H\}\} \\ \text{Candidate keys:} \\ \{F\} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} R_4 = \{B,C,D,E\} \\ \Sigma_4 = \\ \{\{B,C,E\} \rightarrow \\ \{D\}\} \\ \textbf{Candidate keys:} \\ \{\text{B,C,E}\} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} R_5 = \\ \{B,C,E,F,G\} \\ \Sigma_5 = \\ \{\{B,C,E,F\} \rightarrow \\ \{G\}\} \\ \textbf{Candidate keys:} \\ \{B,C,E,F\} \end{array}$$

 $\Sigma_1, \Sigma_2, \Sigma_4$  and  $\Sigma_5$  are projected dependencies. We obtain these by projecting  $\Sigma$  on  $R_1, R_2, R_4$  and  $R_5$  respectively.<sup>1</sup>

 $R_1$  with  $\Sigma_1$ ,  $R_2$  with  $\Sigma_2$ ,  $R_4$  with  $\Sigma_4$ , and  $R_5$  with  $\Sigma_5$  satisfy the BCNF criteria individually. Thus the result is in BCNF. (This is not a general case though. There is no guarantee that synthesising a 3NF will yield a BCNF too.)

# Dependency Projection Algorithm

# **Algorithm 1** Dependency Projection Algorithm<sup>2</sup>

```
Require: \Sigma: Set of functional dependencies
Require: R': Set of attributes to project on
Ensure: \Sigma': Projected set of functional dependencies
 1: Initialize \Sigma' \leftarrow \emptyset
 2: for each (lhs \rightarrow rhs) in \Sigma do
        if Ihs is a subset of R' then
 3:
 4: v \leftarrow rhs \cap R'
 5:
           if y is not empty then
 6:
               \Sigma' \leftarrow \Sigma' \cup \{\{\mathsf{lhs} \rightarrow \mathsf{y}\}\}\
           end if
 7:
        end if
 9: end for
10: return \Sigma'
```

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Link to code→ Cell 1: project dependency



$$R = \{A, B, C, D, E\}$$

$$\Sigma = \{ \{ A \} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{ A, B \} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{ B, C \} \rightarrow \{A, D\}, \{ B \} \rightarrow \{A, B\}, \{ C \} \rightarrow \{D\} \}$$

$$R' = \{A, B, C\}$$

$$\Sigma' = \emptyset$$

$$R = \{A, B, C, D, E\}$$

$$\Sigma = \{ \{ A \} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{ A, B \} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{ B, C \} \rightarrow \{A, D\}, \{ B \} \rightarrow \{A, B\}, \{ C \} \rightarrow \{D\} \}$$

$$R' = \{A, B, C\}$$

$$\begin{split} \Sigma' &= \emptyset \\ \{A\} &\to \{A,B,C\} \\ lhs &= \{A\} \text{ is a subset of } R' \\ rhs &= \{A,B,C\} \\ y &= rhs - R' = \{A,B,C\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A,B,C\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' &= \{\{A\} \to \{A,B,C\}\} \end{split}$$

$$R = \{A, B, C, D, E\}$$

$$\Sigma = \{ \{ A \} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{ A, B \} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{ B, C \} \rightarrow \{A, D\}, \{ B \} \rightarrow \{A, B\}, \{ C \} \rightarrow \{D\} \}$$

$$R' = \{A, B, C\}$$

$$R = \{A, B, C, D, E\}$$

$$\Sigma = \{ \{ A \} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{ A, B \} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{ B, C \} \rightarrow \{A, D\}, \{ B \} \rightarrow \{A, B\}, \{ C \} \rightarrow \{D\} \}$$

 $R' = \{A, B, C\}$ 

$$\begin{split} \Sigma' &= \emptyset \\ \{A\} &\to \{A,B,C\} \\ lhs &= \{A\} \text{ is a subset of } R' \\ rhs &= \{A,B,C\} \\ y &= \text{rhs } \cap R' = \{A,B,C\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A,B,C\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' &= \{\{A\} \to \{A,B,C\} \} \\ \{A,B\} \to \{A\} \\ lhs &= \{A,B\} \text{ is a subset of } R' \\ rhs &= \{A\} \\ y &= \text{rhs } \cap R' = \{A\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' &= \{\{A\} \to \{A,B,C\},\{A,B\} \to \{A\} \} \end{split}$$

$$R = \{A, B, C, D, E\}$$

$$\Sigma = \{ \{ A \} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{ A, B \} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{ B, C \} \rightarrow \{A, D\}, \{ B \} \rightarrow \{A, B\}, \{ C \} \rightarrow \{D\} \}$$

$$R' = \{A, B, C\}$$

```
\begin{split} \Sigma' &= \emptyset \\ \{A\} &\rightarrow \{A,B,C\} \\ lhs &= \{A\} \text{ is a subset of } R' \\ rhs &= \{A,B,C\} \\ y &= rhs \cap R' = \{A,B,C\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A,B,C\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' &= \{\{A\} \rightarrow \{A,B,C\}\} \\ \{A,B\} \rightarrow \{A\} \\ lhs &= \{A,B\} \text{ is a subset of } R' \\ rhs &= \{A\} \\ y &= rhs \cap R' = \{A\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' &= \{\{A\} \rightarrow \{A,C\},\{A,B\} \rightarrow \{A\}\} \\ \{B,C\} \rightarrow \{A,D\} \\ lhs &= \{B,C\} \text{ is a subset of } R' \\ rhs &= \{A,D\} \\ y &= rhs \cap R' = \{A,D\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' &= \{\{A\} \rightarrow \{A,B,C\},\{A,B\} \rightarrow \{A\},\{B,C\} \rightarrow \{A\}\} \\ \Sigma' &= \{\{A\} \rightarrow \{A,B,C\},\{A,B\} \rightarrow \{A\},\{B,C\} \rightarrow \{A\}\} \\ \end{split}
```

$$R = \{A, B, C, D, E\}$$

$$\Sigma = \{ \{ A \} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{ A, B \} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{ B, C \} \rightarrow \{A, D\}, \{ B \} \rightarrow \{A, B\}, \{ C \} \rightarrow \{D\} \}$$

$$R' = \{A, B, C \}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} \Sigma' = \emptyset \\ \{A\} \to \{A,B,C\} \\ lhs = \{A\} \text{ is a subset of } R' \\ hhs = \{A,B,C\} \\ y = \text{rhs } \cap R' = \{A,B,C\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A,B,C\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' = \{\{A\} \to \{A,B,C\} \} \\ \{A,B\} \to \{A\} \\ lhs = \{A,B\} \text{ is a subset of } R' \\ rhs = \{A\} \\ y = \text{rhs } \cap R' = \{A\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' = \{\{A\} \to \{A,B,C\},\{A,B\} \to \{A\} \} \\ \{B,C\} \to \{A,D\} \\ lhs = \{B,C\} \text{ is a subset of } R' \\ rhs = \{A,D\} \\ y = \text{rhs } \cap R' = \{A,D\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' = \{\{A\} \to \{A,B\},C\},\{A,B\} \to \{A\},\{B,C\} \to \{A\} \} \\ \{B\} \to \{A,B\} \\ lhs = \{B\} \text{ is a subset of } R' \\ rhs = \{A,B\} \\ y = \text{rhs } \cap R' = \{A,B\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A,B\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' = \{\{A\} \to \{A,B\},C\},\{A,B\} \to \{A\},\{B,C\} \to \{A\},\{B\} \to \{A,B\} \} \\ \{A,B\} \\ Y = \text{rhs } \cap R' = \{A,B\} \cap \{A,B,C\} = \{A,B\} \neq \emptyset \\ \Sigma' = \{\{A\} \to \{A,B,C\},\{A,B\} \to \{A\},\{B,C\} \to \{A\},\{B\} \to \{A,B\},C\} \\ \{A,B\} \\ Y = R,B\} \end{array}$$

10 / 11

$$R = \{A, B, C, D, E\}$$

$$\Sigma = \{ \{ A \} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{ A, B \} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{ B, C \} \rightarrow \{A, D\}, \{ B \} \rightarrow \{A, B\}, \{ C \} \rightarrow \{D\} \}$$

$$R' = \{A, B, C\}$$

```
\Sigma' = \emptyset
\{A\} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}
lhs = \{A\} is a subset of R'
rhs = \{A, B, C\}
y = rhs \cap R' = \{A, B, C\} \cap \{A, B, C\} = \{A, B, C\} \neq \emptyset
\Sigma' = \{ \{A\} \to \{A, B, C\} \}
{A, B} \rightarrow {A}

{Ihs} = {A, B} is a subset of R'
rhs = \{A\}
y = rhs \cap R' = \{A\} \cap \{A, B, C\} = \{A\} \neq \emptyset
\Sigma' = \{ \{A\} \to \{A, B, C\}, \{A, B\} \to \{A\} \}
\{B,C\} \rightarrow \{A,D\}
lhs = \{B, C\} is a subset of R'
rhs = \{A, D\}
y = rhs \cap R^{1} = \{A, D\} \cap \{A, B, C\} = \{A\} \neq \emptyset
\Sigma' = \{ \{A\} \to \{A, B, C\}, \{A, B\} \to \{A\}, \{B, C\} \to \{A\} \}
\{B\} \rightarrow \{A, B\}
lhs = \{B\} is a subset of R'
rhs = \{A, B\}
v = rhs \cap R' = \{A, B\} \cap \{A, B, C\} = \{A, B\} \neq \emptyset
\Sigma' = \{\{A\} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{A, B\} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{B, C\} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{B\} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{B\}, C\} \}
\{A, B\}\}
\{C\} \rightarrow \{D\}
lhs = \{C\} is a subset of R'
rhs = \{D\}
y = rhs \cap R' = \{D\} \cap \{A, B, C\} = \emptyset
```

$$R = \{A, B, C, D, E\}$$

$$\Sigma = \{ \{ A \} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{ A, B \} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{ B, C \} \rightarrow \{A, D\}, \{ B \} \rightarrow \{A, B\}, \{ C \} \rightarrow \{D\} \}$$

$$\{ C \} \rightarrow \{D\} \}$$

$$R' = \{A, B, C\}$$

```
\Sigma' = \emptyset
\{A\} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}
lhs = \{A\} is a subset of R'
rhs = \{A, B, C\}
y = rhs \cap R' = \{A, B, C\} \cap \{A, B, C\} = \{A, B, C\} \neq \emptyset
\Sigma' = \{ \{A\} \to \{A, B, C\} \}
{A, B} \rightarrow {A}

{Ihs} = {A, B} is a subset of R'
rhs = \{A\}
y = rhs \cap R' = \{A\} \cap \{A, B, C\} = \{A\} \neq \emptyset
\Sigma' = \{ \{A\} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{A, B\} \rightarrow \{A\} \}
\{B,C\} \rightarrow \{A,D\}
lhs = \{B, C\} is a subset of R'
rhs = \{A, D\}
y = rhs \cap R' = \{A, D\} \cap \{A, B, C\} = \{A\} \neq \emptyset
\Sigma' = \{\{A\} \to \{A, B, C\}, \{A, B\} \to \{A\}, \{B, C\} \to \{A\}\}\}
\{B\} \rightarrow \{A, B\}
lhs = \{B\} is a subset of R'
rhs = \{A, B\}
v = rhs \cap R' = \{A, B\} \cap \{A, B, C\} = \{A, B\} \neq \emptyset
\Sigma' = \{\{A\} \rightarrow \{A, B, C\}, \{A, B\} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{B, C\} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{B\} \rightarrow \{A\}, \{B\}, C\} \}
\{A, B\}\}
\{C\} \rightarrow \{D\}
lhs = \{C\} is a subset of R'
rhs = \{D\}
v = rhs \cap R' = \{D\} \cap \{A, B, C\} = \emptyset
\{A, B\}\}
```

Questions?

Drop a mail at: pratik.karmakar@u.nus.edu