

Replication Exercise: Does Victim Gender Matter for Justice Delivery? Police and Judicial Responses to Women's Cases in India

Chuchu Wen | Priscila Stisman

Introduction

This report will detail our efforts to replicate specific code and outcomes Nirvikar Jassa's 2023 study, *"Does Victim Gender Matter for Justice Delivery? Police and Judicial Responses to Women's Cases in India."*

This paper investigates whether women face disadvantages in accessing justice in India compared to men, focusing on the entire trajectory of cases from police registration to judicial verdicts. The study identifies a pattern of "multi-stage" discrimination against women within the justice system, including delays, reduced chances of cases reaching court, and lower conviction rates for crimes reported by women. By examining these disparities, the study seeks to shed light on how gender influences the outcomes of legal proceedings.

The research leverages a dataset of approximately 418,190 police reports from Haryana (2015–2018), merged with 251,804 judicial records. The methodology incorporates descriptive statistics to quantify gender-based disparities at various stages of the justice process, OLS regression analysis to examine the relationship between complainant gender and justice outcomes, and Structural Topic Modeling (STM) to analyze first-person testimonies in police reports. This approach helps identify the themes and severity of cases, particularly those involving violence against women. Additionally, Topical Inverse Regression Matching (TIRM) is employed to adjust for confounding factors by matching complaints based on text similarity, allowing the study to infer the causal impact of gender on case outcomes.

Our project aims to replicate the Topic Modeling portion of this study, focusing specifically on the Structural Topic Modeling (STM) models, both with and without the inclusion of FREX measures. We also add XXXX

Differences & Similarities

Autopsy

Data Retrieval

Replication Challenges

Replication Successes

Extension

Suggested Improvements

- Easier to access raw data: One of our primary challenges was finding the raw speech data Spirling used in his analysis. Adding this to the Harvard Dataverse repository would be a welcome update, and could help future researchers replicate and innovate at a much easier rate.
-

References

JASSAL N. Does Victim Gender Matter for Justice Delivery? Police and Judicial Responses to Women's Cases in India. *American Political Science Review*. 2024;118(3):1278-1304. doi:10.1017/S0003055423000916

Jassal, Nirvikar, 2023, "Replication Data for: Does Victim Gender Matter for Justice Delivery? Police and Judicial Responses to Women's Cases in India", <https://doi.org/10.7910/DVN/F6UCQT>, Harvard Dataverse, V1