Affluence and Influence?
A Discussion of Hamel (2018): Pre-Analysis Plan

Derek Holliday

University of California - Los Angeles

May 23, 2018

Overview of Plan

Question

Do city governments provide fewer services to the poor (relative to the rich)?

Question

Do city governments provide fewer services to the poor (relative to the rich)?

Data

311 Service Requests from Boston (2015 - Present), geocoded by census tract, coded for request fulfillment and fulfillment time.

Overview of Plan

Question

Do city governments provide fewer services to the poor (relative to the rich)?

Data

311 Service Requests from Boston (2015 - Present), geocoded by census tract, coded for request fulfillment and fulfillment time.

Empirical Strategy

OLS (fulfillment/time on census-tract median income) with neighborhood fixed effects.

Theoretical Considerations

- Are the same people responsible for policy input versus output? Are their motivations similar?

Theoretical Considerations

- Are the same people responsible for policy input versus output? Are their motivations similar?
- Are request fulfillments attributed to elected officials? Are avenues of recourse electoral?

Theoretical Considerations

- Are the same people responsible for policy input versus output? Are their motivations similar?
- Are request fulfillments attributed to elected officials? Are avenues of recourse electoral?
- Story may be less about contemporary distributions of services and more about historical bureaucratic holdovers.

Data Considerations

- Have to believe 311 calls are a common avenue through which heterogeneous income levels access similar public services. Is this true?

- Have to believe 311 calls are a common avenue through which heterogeneous income levels access similar public services. Is this true?
    - Potential solution: code calls be topic of request.
    - Nature of the request may also be indicative of past service failures.

Data Considerations

- Have to believe 311 calls are a common avenue through which heterogeneous income levels access similar public services. Is this true?
    - Potential solution: code calls be topic of request.
    - Nature of the request may also be indicative of past service failures.
- Data on who ends up fulfilling requests?

Empirical Strategy Considerations

- Understandable tension between precise identification and capturing lingering variance between tracts

Empirical Strategy Considerations

- Understandable tension between precise identification and capturing lingering variance between tracts
  - Fixed effects won't capture anything that varies between census tracts within neighborhoods

Empirical Strategy Considerations

- Understandable tension between precise identification and capturing lingering variance between tracts
    - Fixed effects won't capture anything that varies between census tracts within neighborhoods
    - … but it's unclear whether you want to tie down everything that isn't income.

Empirical Strategy Considerations

- Understandable tension between precise identification and capturing lingering variance between tracts
  - Fixed effects won't capture anything that varies between census tracts within neighborhoods
  - ... but it's unclear whether you want to tie down everything that isn't income.
- Consider non-OLS model types (Logit for binary, Poisson/Negative Binomial for time data).

Two ways this could go: policy evaluation or underpinnings of service inequities. Empirical strategy will depend on which avenue you choose.