

Problem 27.2 We will first calculate

$$\langle j_1 j_2 (j_{12}) j_3 ; j | j_2 j_3 (j_{23}) j_1 ; j \rangle$$

by direct expansion in terms of the $|j_1 m_1\rangle, |j_2 m_2\rangle, |j_3 m_3\rangle$ states. From Prob. 26.1, we had
the solution of

$$\begin{aligned} & |j_1 j_2 (j_{12}) j_3 ; j m\rangle \\ &= \sum_{\substack{m_{12}, m_3 \\ m_1, m_2}} |j_1 m_1\rangle |j_2 m_2\rangle |j_3 m_3\rangle \\ &\quad \times \langle j_1 j_2 ; m_1 m_2 | j_{12} m_{12} \rangle \langle j_{12} j_3 ; m_{12} m_3 | j m \rangle \end{aligned}$$

Similarly, we have

$$\begin{aligned} & |j_2 j_3 (j_{23}) j_1 ; j m\rangle \equiv |j_{23} j_1 ; j m\rangle \\ &= \sum_{m_{23}, m_1'} |j_{23} j_1 ; m_{23} m_1'\rangle \langle j_{23} j_1 ; m_{23} m_1' | j m \rangle \\ &= \sum_{m_{23}, m_1'} |j_{23} m_{23}\rangle |j_1 m_1'\rangle \langle j_{23} j_1 ; m_{23} m_1' | j m \rangle \\ &= \sum_{\substack{m_{23}, m_1' \\ m_2', m_3'}} |j_2 j_3 ; m_2' m_3'\rangle \langle j_2 j_3 m_2' m_3' | j_{23} m_{23} \rangle |j_1 m_1'\rangle \\ &\quad \times \langle j_{23} j_1 ; m_{23} m_1' | j m \rangle \\ &= \sum_{\substack{m_{23}, m_1' \\ m_2', m_3'}} |j_2 m_2'\rangle |j_3 m_3'\rangle |j_1 m_1'\rangle \\ &\quad \times \langle j_2 j_3 ; m_2' m_3' | j_{23} m_{23} \rangle \langle j_{23} j_1 ; m_{23} m_1' | j m \rangle \end{aligned}$$

Recall from Prob. 26.1, that

$$\begin{aligned} & \langle j_1 j_2 (j_{12}) j_3 ; j | j_2 j_3 (j_{23}) j_1 ; j \rangle \\ &= \langle j_1 j_2 (j_{12}) j_3 ; j m | j_2 j_3 (j_{23}) j_1 ; j m \rangle \\ &\text{is independent of } m. \end{aligned}$$

Prob. 27.2 cont'd

$$\begin{aligned}
 & \therefore \langle j_1 j_2 (j_{12}) j_3 ; j | j_2 j_3 (j_{23}) j_1 ; \rangle \\
 &= \sum_{\substack{m_{12}, m_3 \\ m_1, m_2 \\ m_{23}, m'_1 \\ m'_2, m'_3}} \langle j_1 j_2 ; m_1 m_2 | j_1 j_2 (j_{12}) j_3 ; m_{12} m_3 \rangle \langle j_1 m_1 | j_2 j_3 ; m_{23} m'_1 | j' m \rangle \\
 &\quad \times \langle j_2 j_3 ; m'_2 m'_3 | j_2 j_3 (j_{23}) j_1 ; m_{23} m'_1 | j' m \rangle \\
 &\quad \times \left(\langle j_1 m_1 | \langle j_2 m_2 | \langle j_3 m_3 | \cdot | j_2 m'_2 \rangle | j_3 m'_3 \rangle | j_1 m'_1 \rangle \right) \\
 &\qquad \qquad \qquad \delta_{m_1 m'_1} \delta_{m_2 m'_2} \delta_{m_3 m'_3} \\
 &= \sum_{m_{12} m_{23} m_1 m_2 m_3} \langle j_1 j_2 ; m_1 m_2 | j_1 j_2 (j_{12}) j_3 ; m_{12} m_3 \rangle \langle j_1 j_2 j_3 ; m_{12} m_3 | j' m \rangle \\
 &\quad \times \langle j_2 j_3 ; m_2 m_3 | j_2 j_3 (j_{23}) j_1 ; m_{23} m_1 | j' m \rangle \\
 &\quad [\text{using the phase convention that all C-G coefficients are real}]
 \end{aligned}$$

We now let

$j_1 = 1, j_2 = \frac{1}{2}, j_3 = \frac{1}{2}, j = m = 1, j_{12} = \frac{1}{2}, j_{23} = 0$. Then

$$\begin{aligned}
 & \langle j_1, j_2 (\hat{j}_{12}) j_3 ; j \mid j_2 j_3 (\hat{j}_{23}) j_1 ; j \rangle \\
 &= \langle 1, \frac{1}{2} (\frac{1}{2}) \frac{1}{2} ; 1 \mid \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2} (0) 1 ; 1 \rangle \\
 &= \sum_{m_{12} m_{23} m_1 m_2 m_3} \langle \overset{j_1 \ j_2}{1, \frac{1}{2}} ; \underset{m_1 \ m_2}{m_1, m_2} \mid \overset{j_{12}}{\frac{1}{2}}, m_{12} \rangle \langle \overset{j_{12} \ j_3}{\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}} ; \underset{m_{12} \ m_3}{m_{12}, m_3} \mid \overset{j \ m}{1, 1} \rangle \\
 & \quad \times \langle \overset{j_2 \ j_3}{\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}} ; \underset{m_2 \ m_3}{m_2, m_3} \mid \overset{j_{23}}{0, \textcircled{m_{23}}} \rangle \langle \overset{j_{23} \ j_1}{0, 1} ; \underset{\textcircled{m_{23}}}{m_{23}, m_1} \mid \overset{j \ m}{1, 1} \rangle
 \end{aligned}$$

m_{23} can only take the value zero.

Prob. 27.2 cont'd

$$= \sum_{\substack{m_{12} m_2 m_3 \\ m_1}} \langle 1, \frac{1}{2}; m_1 m_2 | \frac{1}{2}, m_{12} \rangle \langle \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; m_{12} m_3 | 1, 1 \rangle \\ \langle \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; m_2 m_3 | 0, 0 \rangle \langle 0, 1; 0 \textcircled{m_1} | 1, 1 \rangle$$

"1 (since in this CG coeff.)
 $0 + m_1 = 1$)

$$= \sum_{m_{12} m_2 m_3} \langle 1, \frac{1}{2}; 1, m_2 | \frac{1}{2}, m_{12} \rangle \langle \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; m_{12} m_3 | 1, 1 \rangle \\ \langle \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; m_2 m_3 | 0, 0 \rangle \underbrace{\langle 0, 1; 0 1 | 1, 1 \rangle}_{= 1 \text{ (since } |1, 1\rangle = |0, 1; 0, 1\rangle)}$$

$$= \sum_{m_{12} m_2 m_3} \langle 1, \frac{1}{2}; 1, m_2 | \frac{1}{2}, m_{12} \rangle \underbrace{\langle \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; m_{12} m_3 | 1, 1 \rangle}_{\substack{\text{for this CG coeff. } \neq 0, m_{12} + m_3 = 1, \\ \text{so } m_{12} = m_3 = \frac{1}{2}}} \langle \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; m_2, m_3 | 0, 0 \rangle$$

$$= \sum_{m_2} \langle 1, \frac{1}{2}; 1, m_2 | \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2} \rangle \langle \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2} | 1, 1 \rangle \underbrace{\langle \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; m_2, \frac{1}{2} | 0, 0 \rangle}_{\substack{\text{non-vanishing of this} \\ \text{CG coeff. requires } m_2 = -\frac{1}{2}}}$$

$$= \underbrace{\langle 1, \frac{1}{2}; 1, -\frac{1}{2} | \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2} \rangle}_{\downarrow} \underbrace{\langle \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2} | 1, 1 \rangle}_{= 1 \text{ [by (27.11)]}} \underbrace{\langle \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}; -\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2} | 0, 0 \rangle}_{= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \text{ [by (27.11)]}}$$

this is of the form

$$\langle l, \frac{1}{2}; m - m', m' | j, m \rangle \text{ where}$$

$$l = 1, m = \frac{1}{2}, m' = -\frac{1}{2}, j = \frac{1}{2} = l - \frac{1}{2}.$$

By (27.38), it is equal to

$$\sqrt{\frac{l + m + \frac{1}{2}}{2l + 1}} = \sqrt{\frac{1 + \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2}}{3}} = \sqrt{\frac{2}{3}}$$

$$\therefore \langle 1, \frac{1}{2} (\frac{1}{2}) \frac{1}{2}; 1 | \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2} (0) 1; 1 \rangle = \boxed{-\sqrt{\frac{1}{3}}}$$

Prob. 27.2 cont'd We will now calculate the above matrix element using a 6-j symbol by means of the formula

$$\langle j_1 j_2 (j_{12}) j_3 ; j \mid j_2 j_3 (j_{23}) j_1 ; j \rangle \\ = (-1)^{j_1 + j_2 + j_3 + j} \sqrt{(2j_{12}+1)(2j_{23}+1)} \begin{Bmatrix} j_1 & j_2 & j_{12} \\ j_3 & j & j_{23} \end{Bmatrix},$$

where the 6-j symbol is given by

$$\begin{Bmatrix} j_1 & j_2 & j_3 \\ l_1 & l_2 & l_3 \end{Bmatrix} = (-1)^{j_1 + j_2 + l_1 + l_2} \Delta(j_1 j_2 j_3) \Delta(l_1 l_2 j_3) \Delta(l_1 j_2 l_3) \Delta(j_1 l_2 l_3) \\ \times \sum_k \frac{(-1)^k (j_1 + j_2 + l_1 + l_2 + 1 - k)!}{\left\{ k! (j_1 + j_2 - j_3 - k)! (l_1 + l_2 - j_3 - k)! (j_1 + l_2 - l_3 - k)! (l_1 + j_2 - l_3 - k)! \right.} \\ \left. \times (-j_1 - l_1 + j_3 + l_3 + k)! (-j_2 - l_2 + j_3 + l_3 + k)! \right\}},$$

$$\text{and } \Delta(abc) \equiv \sqrt{\frac{(a+b-c)!(a-b+c)!(b+c-a)!}{(a+b+c+1)!}}.$$

In the above summation over k , only those integer values of k are included which do not produce factorials of negative numbers.

We have

$$\begin{aligned} & j_1 j_2 (j_{12}) j_3 ; j \quad j_2 j_3 (j_{23}) j_1 ; j \\ & \langle 1, \frac{1}{2} (\frac{1}{2}) \frac{1}{2} ; 1 \mid \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2} (0) 1 ; 1 \rangle \\ & = (-1)^{1 + \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2} + 1} \sqrt{(2 \cdot \frac{1}{2} + 1)(2 \cdot 0 + 1)} \begin{Bmatrix} 1 & \frac{1}{2} & \frac{1}{2} \\ \frac{1}{2} & 1 & 0 \end{Bmatrix} \\ & = (-\sqrt{2}) \begin{Bmatrix} 1 & \frac{1}{2} & \frac{1}{2} \\ \frac{1}{2} & 1 & 0 \end{Bmatrix} \end{aligned}$$

Prob. 27.2 cont'd

$$\left\{ \begin{matrix} 1 & \frac{1}{2} & \frac{1}{2} \\ \frac{1}{2} & 1 & 0 \end{matrix} \right\} = (-1)^{1+\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2}+1} \Delta(1, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}) \Delta(\frac{1}{2}, 1, \frac{1}{2}) \Delta(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}, 0) \Delta(1, 1, 0)$$

$$\times \sum_k \frac{(-1)^k (1+\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2}+1+1-k)!}{\left\{ k! \left(\frac{1+\frac{1}{2}-\frac{1}{2}-k \right)! \left(\frac{1}{2}+1-\frac{1}{2}-k \right)! (1+1-0-k)! \left(\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2}-0-k \right)! \right.} \\ \left. \times \left(-1-\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2}+0+k \right)! \left(-\frac{1}{2}-1+\frac{1}{2}+0+k \right)! \right\}}$$

The factor involving the sum over k

$$= \sum_k \frac{(-1)^k (4-k)!}{k! (1-k)! (1-k)! (2-k)! (1-k)! (k-1)! (k-1)!}$$

In order for no negative factorials to occur, k in the sum can only take the value $k=1$. Thus

$$\sum_k \dots = \frac{(-1)^1 (4-1)!}{1! 0! 0! 1! 0! 0! 0!} = (-1) 3! = -6$$

$$\text{Also } \Delta(1, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}) = \sqrt{\frac{(1+\frac{1}{2}-\frac{1}{2})! (1-\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2})! (\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2}-1)!}{(1+\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2}+1)!}} = \sqrt{\frac{1! 1! 0!}{3!}} = \sqrt{\frac{1}{6}}$$

$$\Delta(\frac{1}{2}, 1, \frac{1}{2}) = \sqrt{\frac{(\frac{1}{2}+1-\frac{1}{2})! (\frac{1}{2}-1+\frac{1}{2})! (1+\frac{1}{2}-\frac{1}{2})!}{(\frac{1}{2}+1+\frac{1}{2}+1)!}} = \sqrt{\frac{1! 0! 1!}{3!}} = \sqrt{\frac{1}{6}}$$

$$\Delta(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}, 0) = \sqrt{\frac{(\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2}-0)! (\frac{1}{2}-\frac{1}{2}+0)! (\frac{1}{2}+0-\frac{1}{2})!}{(\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2}+0+1)!}} = \sqrt{\frac{1! 0! 0!}{2!}} = \sqrt{\frac{1}{2}}$$

$$\Delta(1, 1, 0) = \sqrt{\frac{(1+1-0)! (1-1+0)! (1+0-1)!}{(1+1+0+1)!}} = \sqrt{\frac{2!}{3!}} = \sqrt{\frac{1}{3}}$$

Gathering the above results we have

$$\langle 1, \frac{1}{2}(\frac{1}{2}) \frac{1}{2}; 1 | \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}(0) 1; 1 \rangle = (-\sqrt{2})(-1)^3 \sqrt{\frac{1}{6}} \sqrt{\frac{1}{6}} \sqrt{\frac{1}{2}} \sqrt{\frac{1}{3}} \cdot (-6)$$

$$= \boxed{-\sqrt{\frac{1}{3}}}, \text{ as before.}$$