

# Recitations 8

## [Definitions used today]

- Correspondences: nonempty valued, single valued, closed valued, compact valued, convex valued, closed graph, convex graph, upper hemi-continuity, lower hemi-continuity, continuity.
- Sequential characterization of uhc and lhc, Berge (1963) maximum theorem

This section comes from math appendix chapter 5 - Correspondences Let  $\Theta \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n, X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$ .

**Definition 0.1.** A correspondence  $\Gamma:\Theta\rightrightarrows X$  is a map s.t.  $\Gamma(\Theta)\subseteq X$ .  $(\Gamma:\Theta\to 2^X)$ 

**Definition 0.2.** (Graph of correspondence).  $Gr(\Gamma) = \{(\theta, x) : \theta \in \Theta, x \in \Gamma(\theta)\}$ 

Definition 0.3. (Properties of correspondences).

- 1. not empty valued if  $\Gamma(\theta) \neq \emptyset \quad \forall \theta$
- 2. single valued if  $|\Gamma(\theta)| = 1 \quad \forall \theta$
- 3. **closed valued** if  $\Gamma(\theta)$  is closed set  $\forall \theta$
- 4. **compact valued** if  $\Gamma(\theta)$  is compact set  $\forall \theta$
- 5. convex valued if  $\Gamma(\theta)$  is convex set  $\forall \theta$
- 6. closed (graph) if  $Gr(\Gamma)$  is closed subset of  $\mathbb{E} \times X$
- 7. convex (graph) if  $Gr(\Gamma)$  is convex on  $\Theta \times X$

**Lemma 0.4.**  $Gr(\Gamma)$  is closed graph  $\iff \forall_{\theta:\theta_n\to\theta}\forall_{x_n\to x}: x_n\in\Gamma(\theta_n) \Rightarrow x\in\Gamma(\theta)$ 

**Lemma 0.5.** Gr( $\Gamma$ ) is convex graph  $\iff \forall_{\theta}, \theta', x \in \Gamma(\theta), x' \in \Gamma(\theta')$  it holds that  $\lambda x + (1 - \lambda)x' \in \Gamma(\theta\lambda + (1 - \lambda)\theta') \forall_{x \in [0,1]}$ 

**Lemma 0.6.**  $\Gamma:\Theta \rightrightarrows X$  has closed graph  $\Rightarrow$  it is closed valued. If X is compact, than  $\Gamma$  is also compact valued.

**Definition 0.7.** (Upper Hemi-Continuity) Let  $\Gamma: \Theta \rightrightarrows X$  be a correspondence.

- $\Gamma$  is said to be **upper hemi-continuous** (uhc) at a point  $\theta \in \Theta$  if and only if for all open sets  $V \subseteq X$  such that  $\Gamma(\theta) \subseteq V$ , there exists an open set  $U \subseteq \Theta$  such that  $\theta \in U$  and for all  $\theta' \in U$  it holds that  $\Gamma(\theta') \subseteq V$
- A compact valued correspondence  $\Gamma: \Theta \rightrightarrows X$  is u.h.c. at  $\theta \in \Theta$  if and only if for every  $\{\theta_n\} \subset \Theta$  such that  $\theta_n \to \theta$  and every sequence  $\{x_n\} \subset X$  such that  $x_n \in \Gamma(\theta_n)$  there exits a convergent subsequence  $\{x_{n_k}\}$  such that  $x_{n_k} \to x \in \Gamma(\theta)$

$$\forall_{\theta_n \to \theta} \forall_{x_n \in \Gamma(\theta_n)} \exists_{\left\{x_{n_k}\right\}} x_{n_k} \to x \in \Gamma(\theta)$$

**Definition 0.8.** (Lower Hemi-Continuity). Let  $\Gamma: \Theta \rightrightarrows X$  be a correspondence.

- $\Gamma$  is said to be **lower hemi-continuous** (1hc) at a point  $\theta \in \Theta$  if and only if for all open sets  $V \subseteq X$  such that  $\Gamma(\theta) \cap V \neq \emptyset$ , there exists an open set  $U \subseteq \Theta$  such that  $\theta \in U$  and for all  $\theta' \in U$  it holds that  $\Gamma(\theta') \cap V \neq \emptyset$
- A correspondence  $\Gamma: \Theta \rightrightarrows X$  is l.h.c. at  $\theta \in \Theta$  if for all  $x \in \Gamma(\theta)$  and all sequences  $\{\theta_n\} \subset \theta$  such that  $\theta_n \to \theta$  there exits a sequence  $\{x_n\} \subset X$  such that  $x_n \in \Gamma(\theta_n)$  and  $x_n \to x$

$$\forall_{\theta_n \to \theta} \forall_{x \in \Gamma(\theta)} \exists_{x_n \in \Gamma(\theta_n)} x_n \to x$$

**Definition 0.9.** (Continuity)  $\Gamma$  is said to be continuous at a point  $\theta \in \Theta$  if it is both UHC an LHC.

**Lemma 0.10.** (u.h.c and Closed graph) Let  $\Gamma:\Theta \rightrightarrows X$ . If  $\Gamma$  is u.h.c, then  $\Gamma$  is closed (has a closed graph).

**Lemma 0.11.** (Closed graph and u.h.c.) Let  $\Gamma:\Theta \rightrightarrows X$ . If X is compact and  $\Gamma$  is closed (has a closed graph), then  $\Gamma$  is u.h.c.

- Recitations 8 2

**Theorem 0.12.** (Berge (1961) of Maximum) Let  $\Theta \subseteq \mathbb{R}^m$  and  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$ , let  $f : \Theta \times X \to \mathbb{R}$  be a continuous function and  $\Gamma : \Theta \rightrightarrows X$  a nonempty, compact valued, continuous correspondence. Define:

$$v(\theta) = \max_{x \in \Gamma(\theta)} f(x, \theta) \quad G(\theta) = \{x \in \Gamma(\theta) \mid f(x, \theta) = v(\theta)\}$$

Then

- $v:\Theta \to X$  is continuous
- $G: \Theta \rightrightarrows X$  is nonempty and compact valued, and UHC

Proof. The proof is divided in three parts. First it is proven that G is nonempty and compact valued, then that it is u.h.c. and finally that v is continuous.

- 1. G is nonempty valued and compact valued.
  - Let  $\theta \in \Theta$ , by hypothesis  $\Gamma(\theta)$  is compact and nonempty. since  $f(\cdot, \theta)$  is continuous a maximum is attained on  $\Gamma(\theta)$  by the extreme value theorem (Weierstrass). This proves that  $G(\theta)$  is nonempty for arbitrary  $\theta$ .
  - Let  $\theta \in \Theta$ , by hypothesis  $\Gamma(\theta)$  is compact and nonempty. since  $G(\theta) \subseteq \Gamma(\theta)$  it follows that  $G(\theta)$  is bounded, it is left to show closedness to establish compactness. Let  $x_n \to x$  and  $x_n \in G(\theta)$  for all n. Clearly  $x_n \in \Gamma(\theta)$  for all n, since  $\Gamma$  is closed valued it follows that  $x \in \Gamma(\theta)$ , so its feasible. By definition of G we have  $v(\theta) = f(x_n, \theta)$  for all n, since f is continuous we get  $v(\theta) = \lim_{n \to \infty} f(x_n, \theta) = f(x, \theta)$ , then by definition  $x \in G(\theta)$ , which proves closedness.
- 2. G is u.h.c. Consider  $\theta \in \Theta$ , a sequence in  $\Theta$  such that  $\theta_n \to \theta$  and a sequence in X such that  $x_n \in G(\theta_n)$  for all n. Note that  $x_n \in \Gamma(\theta_n)$ . since  $\Gamma$  is u.h.c. there exists a subsequence  $x_{n_k} \to x \in \Gamma(\theta)$  Now consider  $z \in \Gamma(\theta)$ . since  $\Gamma$  is l.h.c. there exists a sequence in X such that  $z_n \in \Gamma(\theta_n)$  and  $z_n \to z$ . In particular the subsequence  $\{z_{n_k}\}$  also converges to z since  $x_n \in G(\theta_n)$  and  $z_n \in \Gamma(\theta_n)$  it follows that  $f(x_n, \theta_n) \geq f(z_n, \theta_n)$ . since f is continuous in both arguments we get by taking limits:  $f(x, \theta) \geq f(z, \theta)$ . since the inequality holds for arbitrary  $z \in \Gamma(\theta)$  we get the result:  $x \in G(\theta)$ . This proves u.h.c.
- 3. v is continuous. Let  $\theta \in \Theta$  and  $\theta_n \to \theta$  an arbitrary sequence converging to  $\theta$ . Consider an arbitrary sequence in X such that  $x_n \in G(\theta_n)$  for all n. Let  $\bar{v} = \limsup v(\theta_n)$ . By proposition 2.9 there is a subsequence  $\{\theta_{n_k}\}$  such that  $v(\theta_{n_k}) \to \bar{v}$ . since G is u.h.c. there exists a subsequence of  $\{x_{n_k}\}$  (call it  $\{x_{n_{kl}}\}$ ) converging to a point  $x \in G(\theta)$ . Then

$$\bar{v} = \lim v(\theta_{k_l}) = \lim f(x_{k_l}, \theta_{k_l}) = f(x, \theta) = v(\theta)$$

where the second equality follows from  $x_{k_l} \in G(\theta_{k_l})$ , the third one from f being continuous and the final one from  $x \in G(\theta)$ . Let  $\underline{v} = \liminf v(\theta_n)$  and by a similar argument we get  $v(\theta) = \underline{v}$  since  $v(\theta) = \liminf v(\theta_n) = \limsup v(\theta_n)$  we get  $v(\theta) = \lim v(\theta_n)$  for arbitrary  $\{\theta_n\}$  converging to  $\theta$ . This proves continuity.

**Theorem 0.13.** (ToM under convexity) Let  $\Theta \subseteq \mathbb{R}^m$  and  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$ , let  $f : \Theta \times X \to \mathbb{R}$  be a continuous function and  $\Gamma : \Theta \Rightarrow X$  a nonempty, compact valued, continuous correspondence. Define:

$$v(\theta) = \max_{x \in \Gamma(\theta)} f(x, \theta) \quad G(\theta) = \{x \in \Gamma(\theta) \mid f(x, \theta) = v(\theta)\}$$

- a If  $f(\cdot,\theta)$  is concave in x for all  $\theta$  and  $\Gamma$  is convex valued then G is convex valued.
- b If  $f(\cdot, \theta)$  is strictly concave in x for all  $\theta$  and  $\Gamma$  is convex valued then G is single valued, hence a continuous function.
- c If f is concave on  $\Theta \times X$  and  $\Gamma$  has a convex graph then v is concave and G is convex valued.
- d If f is strictly concave on  $\Theta \times X$  and  $\Gamma$  has a convex graph then v is strictly concave and G is single valued, hence a continuous function.

**Theorem 0.14.** (ToM under quasi-convexity). Let  $\Theta \subseteq \mathbb{R}^m$  and  $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$ , let  $f : \Theta \times X \to \mathbb{R}$  be a continuous function and  $\Gamma : \Theta \rightrightarrows X$  a nonempty, compact valued, continuous correspondence. Define:

$$v(\theta) = \max_{x \in \Gamma(\theta)} f(x, \theta) \quad G(\theta) = \{x \in \Gamma(\theta) \mid f(x, \theta) = v(\theta)\}$$

- a If  $f(\cdot,\theta)$  is quasi-concave in x for all  $\theta$  and  $\Gamma$  is convex valued then G is convex valued.
- b If  $f(\cdot, \theta)$  is strictly quasi-concave in x for all  $\theta$  and  $\Gamma$  is convex valued then G is single valued, hence a continuous function.

- Recitations 8

- c If f is quasi-concave on  $\Theta \times X$  and  $\Gamma$  has a convex graph then v is quasi-concave and G is quasi-convex valued.
- d If f is strictly quasi-concave on  $\Theta \times X$  and  $\Gamma$  has a convex graph then v is strictly quasi-concave and G is single valued, hence a continuous function.

## Where are we heading?

#### Theorem 0.15. Brouwer's Fixed Point Theorem - continuous function

Let  $S \subset \mathbb{R}$  be nonempty, compact, and convex, and  $f: S \to S$  be a continuous function. Then f has (at least) a fixed point in S, i.e.  $\exists x^* \in S: x^* = f(x^*)$ 

## Theorem 0.16. Tarsky's Fixed Point Theorem - weakly increasing functions

Let  $f:[0,1]^n \to [0,1]^n$ , where  $[0,1]^n = [0,1] \times ... \times [0,1]$ , an n-dimensional cube. If f is nondecreasing, then f has a fixed point in  $[0,1]^n$ .

#### Theorem 0.17. Kakutani's Fixed Point Theorem - u.h.c. correspondence

Let  $S \subset \mathbb{R}$  be nonempty, compact, and convex, and  $\Gamma: S \rightrightarrows S$  be a nonempty, convex-valued, and u.h.c. correspondence. Then  $\Gamma$  has a fixed point in S, i.e.  $\exists x^* \in S: x^* \in \Gamma(x^*)$ 

Since S is compact, u.h.c. is equivalent to  $\Gamma$  having a closed graph.

#### Theorem 0.18. Fixed Point Theorem - l.h.c. correspondence

Let  $S \subset \mathbb{R}$  be nonempty, compact, and convex, and  $\Gamma: S \rightrightarrows S$  be a nonempty, convex-valued, closed-valued, and l.h.c. correspondence. Then  $\Gamma$  has a fixed point in S.

**Definition 0.19.** Aggregate excess demand  $Z: \bar{\Delta} \to \mathbb{R}^{\ell}$  is defined as

$$Z(p) = \sum_{i \in I} x_i(p, e_i) - \sum_{i \in I} e_i.$$

#### Theorem 0.20. Easy Existence Theorem

Let  $Z: \Delta \to \mathbb{R}^l$  be a continuous function that is bouded from below, satisfying Walras' Law and the boundary condition:  $p_n \to p \in \partial \Delta \Rightarrow ||Z(p_n)|| \to \infty$ . Then  $\exists p^* \in \Delta$  such that  $Z(p^*) = 0$ .

Outline:

- Z is defined on  $\Delta$  not  $\bar{\Delta}$
- Define  $\mu: \bar{\Delta} \Rightarrow \bar{\Delta}$  that is nonempty, convex-valued, u.h.c. Use Kakutani's to find a fixed point in  $\bar{\Delta}$
- Argue that the fixed point is in  $\Delta$  and it is CE.

Define  $\mu: \bar{\Delta} \rightrightarrows \bar{\Delta}$  by

$$\mu(p) = \begin{cases} \{\bar{q} \in \bar{\Delta} | \bar{q} \in argmax_{q \in \bar{\Delta}} q \cdot Z(p) \}, & \text{if } p \in \Delta \\ \{\bar{q} \in \bar{\Delta} | \bar{q} \cdot p = 0 \}, & \text{if } p \in \partial \Delta \end{cases}$$

## Question 1

Let  $\Gamma: \Theta \rightrightarrows X$  be a correspondence.

- 1. Show that if a correspondence  $\Gamma$  has a closed graph then it is closed valued.
- 2. If  $\Gamma$  is compact valued and u.h.c then  $\Gamma$  has a closed graph.
- 3. If X is compact and  $\Gamma$  has a closed graph then  $\Gamma$  is u.h.c.

Solution 1 i) Suppose  $\Gamma$  has closed graph let  $\theta_n \subset \Theta$  be such that  $\theta_n = \theta$ . Let  $x_n$  be s.t.  $x_n \in \Gamma(\theta_n)$  and  $x_n \to x$ . WTS:  $x \in \Gamma(\theta)$ .

 $(\theta_n, x_n) \to (\theta, x)$   $\theta_n$  by construction  $x_n by assumption$ . Moreover  $(\theta_n, x_n) \in Gr(\Gamma)$ . Therefore since graph is close then  $(\theta, x) \in Gr(\Gamma)$ . It means that  $x\Gamma(\theta)$  so  $\Gamma(\theta)$  is a closet set. ii) Let  $x \in X$ . Consider any  $\{x_n\} \in X$  s.t.  $x_n \to x$  and  $\{y_n\} \in Y$  s.t.  $y_n \in \Gamma(x)$  and  $y_n \to y$ . Since  $\Gamma$  is u.h.c., there exists a convergent subsequence  $\{y_{n_k}\}$  such that  $\lim_{n_k \to \infty} y_{n_k} \in \Gamma(x)$ . Then  $y = \lim_{n \to \infty} y_n = \lim_{n \to \infty} y_{n_k} \in \Gamma(x)$ . Thus,  $\Gamma$  is closed.

Let Y be compact and  $\Gamma$  be closed. Since closed graph implies closed-valued,  $\Gamma$  is compact-valued. Let  $x \in X, x_n \to x$  and  $\{y_n\} \subset Y$  such that  $\forall n, y_n \in \Gamma(x_n)$ . Since Y is compact, there exists convergent subsequence  $y_{n_k} \to y$ . Since  $\Gamma$  is closed,  $y \in \Gamma(x)$ . Thus  $\Gamma$  is u.h.c.

- Recitations 8 4

## Question 2

Let consumer budget set at a price  $p \in \Delta^{\ell}(p >> 0)$  and endowment  $e_i$  be

$$B(p, e_i) = \{x \in X_i : p \cdot x \leqslant p \cdot e_i\}$$

- i) Show that  $B(p, e_i)$  is homogenous of degree zero in prices, non-empty valued and compact valued.
- ii) Show that  $B(p, e_i)$  is continuous.

## Solution 2

One, useful, application of the material covered above is to determine properties of the budget correspondence, that indicates the feasible consumption bundles for a consumer given a price vector p and an endowment vector e. Suppose there are l goods, and that the agent has a fixed endowment of each good given by the vector  $e \in \mathbb{R}^l_{++}$ , the price of the goods is a vector  $p \in \Delta$ , where  $\Delta$  is the n-dimensional open simplex. Define the budget set correspondence  $B(\cdot, e) : \Delta \rightrightarrows \mathbb{R}^l_{\perp}$  by

$$B(p,e) = \left\{ x \in \mathbb{R}^l_+ \mid p \cdot x \le p \cdot e \right\}$$

**Theorem 0.21.**  $B(\cdot, e)$  is continuous on prices.

Proof. The claim is proved establishing u.h.c. and l.h.c. of B.

- 2.  $B(\cdot,e)$  is lower hemi-continuous on prices. Let  $p \in \Delta, \{p_n\} \subset \Delta$  with  $p_n \to p$  and  $x \in B(p,e)$ . Define  $\eta_n^i = \max\left\{0, \frac{p_n \cdot x p_n \cdot e}{lp_n^i}\right\}$  and let  $x_n = x \eta_n$  Clearly  $x_n \in B(p_n,e)$  since either  $x \in B(p_n,e)$  or

$$p_n \cdot x_n = p_n \cdot x - \sum_i \max\{p_n^i \left(\frac{p_n \cdot x - p_n \cdot e}{lp_n^i}\right)\} \leq p_n \cdot x - \sum_i p_n^i \left(\frac{p_n \cdot x - p_n \cdot e}{lp_n^i}\right) = p_n \cdot x - (p_n \cdot x - p_n \cdot e) = p_n \cdot e$$

then  $p_n \cdot x_n \leq p_n \cdot e$  Moreover  $x_n \to x$ , since  $x \in B(p,e)$  and  $p_n \to p$  it follows that  $p_n \cdot x - p_n \cdot e \to p \cdot x - p \cdot e \leq 0$ , then  $\eta_n = \max\{0, p_n \cdot x - p_n \cdot e\} \to 0$  which is  $x_n \to x$ . Then B is l.h.c.

3. Note that it wasn't checked if  $x_n \ge 0$  for all n. This is not guaranteed by the construction above. With extra notation it can be guaranteed that  $x_n^i \ge 0$ .

## Question 3

Let consumer i demand correspondence at a price p and endowment  $e_i$  be

$$x_i(p, e_i) = \left\{ x \in B(p, e_i) : x_i \succeq_i y \quad \forall_{y \in B(p, e_i)} \right\}$$

- i) Show that if  $B(p, e_i)$  is compact and  $\succeq_i$  is complete and transitive preorder with upper contour sets  $U_i(x) = \{y \in X_i : y \succeq_i x\}$  that are closed for all  $x \in Xt_i$  then the demand is non-empty.
- ii) Give an example illustrating that compactness is indeed a necessary condition.

#### Solution 3

*Proof.* Since  $B(p,e_i)$  is compact and  $U_i(x)$  are closed for all  $x \in X_i$ ,  $U_i(x) \cup B(p,e_i)$  is also compact for all  $x \in X_i$ . By completeness and transitivity of  $\succeq_i$ , given any subset  $\{x_1,\ldots,x_n\} \subset B(p,e_i)$ , we can rearrange the elements so that  $x_1 \preceq_i x_2 \preceq_i,\ldots,\preceq_i x_n$ . Then the upper contour sets of these allocations satisfy  $U_i(x_1) \supseteq U_i(x_2) \supseteq,\ldots,\supseteq U_i(x_n)$ . Thus

$$U_i(x_1) \cup B(p, e_i) \supseteq U_i(x_2) \cup B(p, e_i) \supseteq \ldots \supseteq U_i(x_n) \cup B(p, e_i).$$

- Recitations 8 5

By construction,  $x_k \in U_i(x_k) \cap B(p, e_i)$  for all  $k \in \{1, ..., n\}$ . So  $U_i(x_k) \cap B(p, e_i)$  is nonempty and compact for all  $k \in \{1, ..., n\}$ . Since the intersections are nested, this implies that  $\bigcap_{k=1}^n [U_i(x_k) \cap B(p, e_i)] \neq \emptyset$  for every finite subset  $\{x_1, ..., x_n\} \subseteq B(p, e_i)$ . By the finite intersection property of compact sets,

$$x_i(p, e_i) = \bigcap_{x \in B(p, e_i)} [U_i(x) \cap B(p, e_i)] \neq \emptyset.$$

If the budget set is not compact, demand is often not well-defined. Let  $\ell = 2$ , let  $e_i = (1,1)$  and let consumer i's preferences be represented by the strictly increasing utility function

$$u_i(x, y) = \log x + \log y.$$

Let p = (0,1). Then  $B(p,e_i) = \{(x,y) \in \mathbb{R}_+^{\ell} : x \in [0,\infty), y \leq 1\}$ . This set is obviously not bounded so  $B(p,e_i)$  is not compact.

Suppose that  $x_i(p,e_i) \neq \emptyset$ , i.e.,  $\exists (x,y) \in x_i(p,e_i)$ . Then  $u_i(x,y) \geq u_i(x',y')$  for all  $(x',y') \in B(p,e_i)$ . But  $(x+1,y) \in B(p,e_i)$  and  $u_i(x+1,y) > u_i(x,y)$ . This is a contradiction, so  $(x,y) \notin x_i(p,e_i)$ . Therefore  $x_i(p,e_i) = \emptyset$ .

# Question 4

The consumer problem is often laid out without explicit endowments of the goods, instead the parameters are prices  $p \in \mathbb{R}^l_{++}$  and a nominal income level  $e \in \mathbb{R}_+$ . The set of parameters is  $\Theta = \mathbb{R}^l_{++} \times \mathbb{R}$ . The **indirect utility function** and the **Marshalian demand correspondence** are:

$$v(p,e) = \max_{x \in B(p,e)} u(x) \quad x(p,e) = \{x \in B(p,e) \mid u(x) = v(p,e)\}$$

I take as given that B is a nonempty, convex valued and continuous correspondence, and that u is a continuous function. Show for v and x the following properties on  $\Theta$ .

- a v is a continuous function on  $\Theta$  and x is a nonempty, compact valued, u.h.c. correspondence.
- b v is nondecreasing in r for fixed p and non-increasing in p for fixed xe.
- c v is jointly quasi-convex on (p, e).
- d If u is (quasi) concave then v is (quasi) concave in e for fixed p.
- e If u is (quasi) concave then x is a convex valued correspondence.
- f If u is strictly (quasi) concave then x is a continuous function.

# Solution 4

- a Thm of Max
- b For  $v(\cdot, e)$  non-increasing for fixed e:

$$\forall p > p' \quad B(p, e)(p', e)$$

Hence  $v(p', e) \ge v(p, e)$ 

Similar for  $v(p,\cdot)$  non-decreasing for fix p

c If u concave, take any  $p, p' \in \mathbb{R}^{l}_{++}, \lambda \in [0, 1]$ 

$$v(\lambda p + (1\lambda)p', e) = \max\{u(x)\text{s.t.} \quad [\lambda p + (1\lambda)p'] \cdot xe$$

The budget constraint can be rewritten as

$$\lambda(e - px) + (1\lambda)p'(e - p'x) \ge 0$$

Hence either  $p \cdot x \leq e$  or  $p' \cdot x \leq e$  is true (or both). This means every affordable package when facing  $\lambda p + (1\lambda)p'$  is affordable either when facing p or p', i.e.

$$B(\lambda p + (1\lambda)p', e) \subset B(p, e) \cap B(p', e)$$

$$v(\lambda p + (1\lambda)p') \le \max\{v(p, e), v(p', e)\}$$

which means v is quasi-convex in p holding e fixed. Similar for I when fixed p.  $x(\cdot)$  part comes from Thm of Max under Convexity.

d Thm of Max under Convexity