

### Tutorial Problems 1 Solutions

1. The language of sets is ubiquitous in mathematics and is something we will work with often in this course. Loosely, a set is a collection of objects called members, or elements, of the set. We will use the following shorthand notation to indicate certain relationships between sets.
  - $\emptyset$  denotes the empty set. i.e. The set with no members.
  - $a \in A$  means  $a$  is a member of the set  $A$ . It's typical that sets are designated by upper case letters and members of that set by the corresponding lower case letter.
  - $A = B$  means the set  $A$  is equal to the set  $B$ . i.e.  $A$  and  $B$  have exactly the same members and nothing more.
  - $A \subseteq B$  means  $A$  is a subset of  $B$ . i.e. Every element of  $A$  is an element of  $B$ . It may be that  $A$  and  $B$  are equal.
  - $A \subset B$  means  $A$  is a proper subset of  $B$ . i.e.  $A$  is a subset of  $B$  but not equal to  $B$ . You may also see the notation  $A \subsetneq B$  to denote  $A$  is a proper subset of  $B$ .

There are two ways we may define a set: we may list the elements of the set, such as  $A = \{1, 2, 3\}$ , or specify them by a rule, such as  $A = \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x > -1\}$  (you read this as the set of  $x$  such that  $x$  is an integer and  $x$  is greater than -1).

**Definition:** Let  $A$  and  $B$  be sets.

The *intersection* of  $A$  and  $B$  is defined to be the set  $A \cap B = \{x \mid x \in A \text{ and } x \in B\}$ .

The *union* of  $A$  and  $B$  is defined to be the set  $A \cup B = \{x \mid x \in A \text{ or } x \in B\}$  (this is an inclusive or which means that  $x \in A$  or  $x \in B$  or both).

The *difference* of  $A$  and  $B$  is defined to be the set  $A \setminus B = \{x \mid x \in A \text{ and } x \notin B\}$ .

- (a) Let  $A = \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{R} \text{ and } x^2 < 3\}$  and  $B = \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x > -1\}$ . Determine  $A \cap B$ ,  $B \setminus A$ ,  $\mathbb{Z} \setminus B$ , and  $\mathbb{R} \cap A$ .

**Solution:**

$$\begin{aligned} A \cap B &= \{x \mid x \in A \text{ and } x \in B\} \\ &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{R} \text{ and } x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x^2 < 3 \text{ and } x > -1\} \\ &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } -\sqrt{3} < x < \sqrt{3} \text{ and } x > -1\} \\ &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } -1.73 \cdots < x < 1.73 \cdots \text{ and } x > -1\} \\ &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } -1 < x < 1.73 \cdots\} \\ &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } 0 \leq x \leq 1\} \\ &= \{0, 1\} \end{aligned}$$

$$B \setminus A = \{x \mid x \in B \text{ and } x \notin A\}$$

Notice that, for any  $x$ ,  $x \notin A$  is equivalent to  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  and  $x^2 \geq 3$ . Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned}
 B \setminus A &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x > -1 \text{ and } x \in \mathbb{R} \text{ and } x^2 \geq 3\} \\
 &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x > -1 \text{ and } x \geq \sqrt{3}\} \cup \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x > -1 \text{ and } x \leq -\sqrt{3}\} \\
 &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x \geq 2\} \cup \phi \\
 &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x \geq 2\} \\
 &= \{2, 3, 4, \dots\}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{Z} \setminus B &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x \notin B\} \\
 &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x \leq -1\} \\
 &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x \leq -1\} \\
 &= \{-1, -2, -3, \dots\}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{R} \cap A &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{R} \text{ and } x \in A\} \\
 &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{R} \text{ and } x \in \mathbb{R} \text{ and } x^2 < 3\} \\
 &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{R} \text{ and } -\sqrt{3} < x < \sqrt{3}\}
 \end{aligned}$$

- (b) Let  $C = \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x^2 > 4\}$  and  $D = \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x > -1\}$ . Determine  $C \cup D$ ,  $D \setminus C$ ,  $D \cap \emptyset$ ,  $\mathbb{R} \cup D$ .

**Solution:**

$$\begin{aligned}
 C \cup D &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x^2 > 4 \text{ and } x > -1\} \\
 &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x > 2 \text{ and } x > -1\} \cup \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x < -2 \text{ and } x > -1\} \\
 &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x > 2\} \cup \phi \\
 &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x > 2\} \\
 &= \{3, 4, 5, \dots\}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 D \setminus C &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } -1 < x \leq 2\} \\
 &= \{0, 1, 2\}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$D \cap \phi = \phi$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{R} \cup D &= \{x \mid x \in \mathbb{R} \text{ and } x \in \mathbb{Z} \text{ and } x > -1\} \\
 &= \{0, 1, 2, \dots\}
 \end{aligned}$$

- (c) Let  $E = \{(x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 > x_2\}$  and  $F = \{(x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1^2 + x_2^2 \geq 1\}$ . Determine  $E \cup F$ ,  $E \cap F$ ,  $E \setminus F$ , and  $F \setminus E$ .

**Solution:**

$$E \cup F = \{(x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 > x_2 \text{ or } x_1^2 + x_2^2 \geq 1\}$$

$$E \cap F = \{(x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 > x_2 \text{ and } x_1^2 + x_2^2 \geq 1\}$$

$$E \setminus F = \{(x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 > x_2 \text{ and } x_1^2 + x_2^2 < 1\}$$

$$F \setminus E = \{(x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 \leq x_2 \text{ and } x_1^2 + x_2^2 \geq 1\}$$

2. For each of the following subsets of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ , determine whether they are a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ . Give reasons why or why not in each case.

(a)  $S_a = \{(x_1, x_2, x_3) \mid x_1, x_2, x_3 \in \mathbb{Z}\}$

**Solution:** Notice that  $(0, 0, 0) \in S_a$ , so that  $S_a$  is non-empty. Let  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, x_3) = (1, 1, 1) \in S_a$ . Notice that  $S_a$  is not closed under scalar multiplication, due to the following. Let  $t = 1.5$ ,  $t\mathbf{x} = (1.5, 1.5, 1.5) \notin S_a$ . Therefore,  $S_a$  is not a subspace.

(b)  $S_b = \{(x_1, x_2, x_3) \mid x_1^2 = x_2^3\}$

**Solution:** Notice that  $(0, 0, 0) \in S_b$ , because  $0^2 = 0^3$ , so that  $S_b$  is non-empty. Let  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, x_3) = (1, 1, 1) \in S_b$ , because  $1^2 = 1^3$ . Notice that  $S_b$  is not closed under scalar multiplication, due to the following. Let  $t = 1.5$ ,  $t\mathbf{x} = (1.5, 1.5, 1.5) \notin S_b$ , because  $1.5^2 \neq 1.5^3$ . Therefore,  $S_b$  is not a subspace.

(c)  $S_c = \{(x_1, x_2, x_3) \mid x_1 - 3x_2 + 4x_3 = 0 \text{ and } x_1 = x_2\}$

**Solution:** Notice that  $(0, 0, 0) \in S_c$ , because  $0^2 = 0^3$ , so that  $S_c$  is non-empty. Let  $\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y} \in S_c$ . Then they must satisfy the condition of the set, so  $x_1 - 3x_2 + 4x_3 = 0$ ,  $x_1 = x_2$ ,  $y_1 - 3y_2 + 4y_3 = 0$ ,  $y_1 = y_2$ .

To show that  $S_c$  is closed under addition, we must show that  $\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{y} = (x_1 + y_1, x_2 + y_2, x_3 + y_3)$  satisfies the condition of  $S_c$ . Notice that  $x_1 + y_1 - 3(x_2 + y_2) + 4(x_3 + y_3) = 0$  and  $x_1 + y_1 = x_2 + y_2$ . Hence,  $\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{y} \in S_c$ .

Similarly, for any  $t \in \mathbb{R}$ , we have  $t\mathbf{x} = (tx_1, tx_2, tx_3)$ , so that  $tx_1 - 3tx_2 + 4tx_3 = 0$  and  $tx_1 = tx_2$ , i.e.  $t\mathbf{x} \in S_c$ . Therefore,  $S_c$  is closed under scalar multiplication and  $S_c$  is a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ .

(d)  $S_d = \{(x_1, x_2, x_3) \mid \sin(x_1) = x_3\}$

**Solution:** Notice that  $(0, 0, 0) \in S_d$ , because  $\sin(0) = 0$ , so that  $S_d$  is non-empty. Let  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, x_3) = (\pi/2, 0, 1) \in S_d$ , because  $\sin(\pi/2) = 1$ . Notice that  $S_d$  is not closed under scalar multiplication, due to the following. Let  $t = 2$ ,  $t\mathbf{x} = (\pi, 0, 2) \notin S_d$ , because  $\sin(\pi) = 0 \neq 2$ . Therefore,  $S_d$  is not a subspace.

(e)  $S_e = \{(x_1, x_2, x_3) \mid (x_1 + x_2 + x_3)^2 = 0\}$

**Solution:** Notice that  $(0, 0, 0) \in S_e$ , because  $(0 + 0 + 0)^2 = 0$ , so that  $S_e$  is non-empty. Let  $\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y} \in S_e$ . Then they must satisfy the condition of the set, so  $(x_1 + x_2 + x_3)^2 = 0$ , or equivalently  $x_1 + x_2 + x_3 = 0$ , and  $(y_1 + y_2 + y_3)^2 = 0$ , or equivalently  $y_1 + y_2 + y_3 = 0$ .

To show that  $S_e$  is closed under addition, we must show that  $\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{y} = (x_1 + y_1, x_2 + y_2, x_3 + y_3)$  satisfies the condition of  $S_e$ . Notice that  $(x_1 + y_1 + x_2 + y_2 + x_3 + y_3)^2 = 0$ . Hence,  $\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{y} \in S_e$ .

Similarly, for any  $t \in \mathbb{R}$ , we have  $t\mathbf{x} = (tx_1, tx_2, tx_3)$ , so that  $(tx_1 + tx_2 + tx_3)^2 = 0$ , i.e.  $t\mathbf{x} \in S_e$ . Therefore,  $S_e$  is closed under scalar multiplication and  $S_e$  is a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ .

3 (a) Show that  $\text{span} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \right\} = \text{span} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} \right\}$ .

**Solution:** Denote by  $S_1 = \text{span} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} \right\}$  and  $S_2 = \text{span} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} \right\}$ .

By definition of span, for any  $x \in S_1$ :

$$\mathbf{x} = t_1 \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} + t_2 \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + t_3 \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} t_1 + 2t_3 \\ t_2 + t_3 \\ t_2 + t_3 \end{bmatrix}$$

By definition of span, for any  $x \in S_2$ :

$$\mathbf{y} = a_1 \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix} + a_2 \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} a_1 \\ 2a_1 - a_2 \\ 2a_1 - a_2 \end{bmatrix}$$

For any  $t_1, t_2, t_3 \in \mathbb{R}$ , we can let  $a_1 = t_1 + 2t_3$  and  $a_2 = 2t_2 - t_2 + 3t_3$ , so that

$$\mathbf{y} = \begin{bmatrix} t_1 + 2t_3 \\ t_2 + t_3 \\ t_2 + t_3 \end{bmatrix}$$

Therefore,  $S_1 = S_2$ .

- 3 (b)** Let  $\mathbf{u} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$ ,  $\mathbf{v} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$ , and  $\mathbf{w} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 1 \\ 3 \end{bmatrix}$ . Show that  $\text{span}\{\mathbf{u} + \mathbf{w}, \mathbf{v} - \mathbf{w}\} \subseteq \text{span}\{\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{v}, \mathbf{w}\}$ . Are these spans actually equal?

**Solution:** Denote by  $S_1 = \text{span}\{\mathbf{u} + \mathbf{w}, \mathbf{v} - \mathbf{w}\}$  and  $S_2 = \text{span}\{\mathbf{u}, \mathbf{v}, \mathbf{w}\}$ , so that  $S_1 = \text{span} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 0 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 0 \\ -2 \end{bmatrix} \right\}$

and  $S_2 = \text{span} \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 1 \\ 3 \end{bmatrix} \right\}$ .

By definition of span, for any  $x \in S_1$ :

$$\mathbf{x} = t_1 \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 0 \\ 4 \end{bmatrix} + t_2 \begin{bmatrix} -2 \\ 0 \\ -2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 4t_1 - 2t_2 \\ 0 \\ 4t_1 - 2t_2 \end{bmatrix} = (4t_1 - 2t_2) \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} = t \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

where  $t = 4t_1 - 2t_2 \in \mathbb{R}$ .

By definition of span, for any  $x \in S_2$ :

$$\mathbf{y} = a_1 \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ -1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + a_2 \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix} + a_3 \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ 1 \\ 3 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2a_1 + 2a_3 \\ -a_1 + a_2 + a_3 \\ a_1 + a_2 + 3a_3 \end{bmatrix}$$

Thus, for any  $t$ , let  $a_1 = 0$ ,  $a_2 = -t/2$ ,  $a_3 = t/2$ . Notice that

$$\mathbf{y} = \begin{bmatrix} t \\ 0 \\ t \end{bmatrix}$$

so that  $\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{y} \in \mathbf{S}_2$ . It follows that  $S_1 \subseteq S_2$ .

In the following, we will show that  $S_1 \neq S_2$  by showing that there exists  $\mathbf{y} \in \mathbf{S}_2$  such that  $\mathbf{y} \notin \mathbf{S}_1$ . Let

$a_1 = 0$ ,  $a_2 = 1$ , and  $a_3 = 0$ . Notice that  $\mathbf{y} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} \notin \mathbf{S}_1$ . Therefore,  $S_1 \subset S_2$ .

4. Let  $W = \{\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{z}, \mathbf{w}\}$  be a set of four vectors in  $\mathbb{R}^n$ . Suppose that  $\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{y} - 5\mathbf{z} + \mathbf{w}$  and  $\mathbf{z} = \mathbf{x} - \mathbf{y}$ .
- (a) Is the set  $\{\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{w}\}$  linearly independent? How about the set  $\{\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}, \mathbf{w}\}$ ? Explain your answers.

**Solution:**

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{x} &= \mathbf{y} - 5\mathbf{z} + \mathbf{w} \\ \mathbf{x} &= \mathbf{y} - 5(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{y}) + \mathbf{w} \\ 6\mathbf{x} - 6\mathbf{y} - \mathbf{w} &= \mathbf{0}\end{aligned}$$

Therefore, the set  $\{\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{w}\}$  is, by definition, linearly dependent.

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{x} &= \mathbf{y} - 5\mathbf{z} + \mathbf{w} \\ \mathbf{x} &= (\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{z}) - 5\mathbf{z} + \mathbf{w} \\ 0\mathbf{x} + 6\mathbf{z} - \mathbf{w} &= \mathbf{0}\end{aligned}$$

Therefore, the set  $\{\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}, \mathbf{w}\}$  is, by definition, linearly dependent.

- (b) Can you conclude anything about the linear independence or dependence of the set  $\{\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z}\}$ ?

**Solution:** No. It depends on the vectors  $\mathbf{y}$  and  $\mathbf{w}$ . Let's take some examples from  $\mathbb{R}^3$ . Notice that if  $\mathbf{y} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$  and  $\mathbf{w} = \begin{bmatrix} -1 \\ -1 \\ -1 \end{bmatrix}$ , then we have  $\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{y} - 5\mathbf{z} + \mathbf{w} = -5\mathbf{z}$ , it follows that  $\mathbf{x} + 5\mathbf{z} = \mathbf{0}$  and so  $\mathbf{x}$  and  $\mathbf{z}$  are linearly dependent. However, if we let  $\mathbf{x} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$ ,  $\mathbf{z} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$ ,  $\mathbf{y} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ -1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$ , and  $\mathbf{w} = \begin{bmatrix} 6 \\ 6 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$ , we can check that  $\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{y} - 5\mathbf{z} + \mathbf{w}$  and  $\mathbf{z} = \mathbf{x} - \mathbf{y}$ . However, the system  $t_1\mathbf{x} + t_2\mathbf{z} = \mathbf{0}$  only has the trivial solution  $t_1 = 0$  and  $t_2 = 0$  (equivalently, that  $\mathbf{x} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$  and  $\mathbf{y} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$  are not multiples of one another). Therefore,  $\mathbf{x}$  and  $\mathbf{z}$  will be linearly independent in this case.

5. Let  $A$  and  $B$  be subspaces of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ .

- (a) Show that  $A \cap B$  is a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ .

**Solution:** Because  $A$  and  $B$  are subspaces of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ , then  $(0, 0, 0) \in A$  and  $(0, 0, 0) \in B$ , so that  $(0, 0, 0) \in A \cap B = S_a$  and  $S_a$  is non-empty. Let  $\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y} \in S_a$ , then  $\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y} \in A$  and  $\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y} \in B$ . But  $A$  is a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ , so that  $A$  is closed under addition, i.e.  $\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{y} \in A$ . Similarly,  $B$  is a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ , so that  $B$  is closed under addition, i.e.  $\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{y} \in B$ . Therefore,  $\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{y} \in A \cap B = S_a$ . It follows that  $S_a$  is closed under addition.

Furthermore,  $A$  is closed under scalar multiplication, i.e.  $t\mathbf{x} \in A$ , for any  $t \in \mathbb{R}$ , and  $B$  is closed under scalar multiplication, i.e.  $t\mathbf{x} \in B$ , for any  $t \in \mathbb{R}$ . Therefore,  $t\mathbf{x} \in A \cap B = S_a$ , for any  $t \in \mathbb{R}$ , so that  $S_a$  is closed under scalar multiplication. Therefore,  $S_a$  is a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ .

- (b) Find an example of subspaces  $A$  and  $B$  to show  $A \cup B$  is not necessarily a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ .

**Solution:** Let  $A = \{(x_1, 0, 0) \mid x_1 \in \mathbb{R}\}$  and  $B = \{(0, x_2, 0) \mid x_2 \in \mathbb{R}\}$ , which are clearly non-empty sets. Let  $\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{z} \in A$ , and notice that  $\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{z} \in A$  and  $t\mathbf{x} \in A$ , for all  $t \in \mathbb{R}$ . Thus,  $A$  is a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ . Similarly, we can show that  $B$  is a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ .

Let  $\mathbf{x} \in A$  and  $\mathbf{y} \in B$ . Notice that  $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, 0, 0)$  and  $\mathbf{y} = (0, y_2, 0)$ . It follows that  $\mathbf{x} + \mathbf{y} = (x_1, y_2, 0)$  which doesn't belong to either  $A$  or  $B$ . Therefore,  $A \cup B$  is not closed under addition and  $A \cup B$  is not a subspace.

(c) Is  $A \setminus B$  ever a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ ? Why or why not?

**Solution:** Notice that  $A \setminus B = A \cap \overline{B}$ , where  $\overline{B}$  is the complement of the set  $B$ , i.e.  $\overline{B} = \{x \mid x \notin B\}$ . Because  $B$  is a subspace, then  $B$  contains the origin  $(0, 0, 0)$ , which means that  $\overline{B}$  does not contain the origin. Thus,  $A \setminus B = A \cap \overline{B}$  does not contain the origin. It follows that  $A \setminus B$  is not a subspace.

Notice that if  $B$  is not a subspace, say for example  $B = \phi$ , then  $A \setminus B = A \cap \overline{B} = A \cap \mathbb{R}^3 = A$  may be a subspace. An example of this is  $A = \{(x_1, 0, 0) \mid x_1 \in \mathbb{R}\}$ , which we have proved in 5 (b) to be a subspace.