



National  
Qualifications  
2023

# 2023 Religious, Moral and Philosophical Studies

## Advanced Higher

### Finalised Marking Instructions

© Scottish Qualifications Authority 2023

These marking instructions have been prepared by examination teams for use by SQA appointed markers when marking external course assessments.

The information in this document may be reproduced in support of SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is reproduced, SQA must be clearly acknowledged as the source. If it is to be reproduced for any other purpose, written permission must be obtained from [permissions@sqa.org.uk](mailto:permissions@sqa.org.uk).



## **General marking principles for Advanced Higher Religious, Moral and Philosophical Studies**

*Always apply these general principles. Use them in conjunction with the detailed marking instructions, which identify the key features required in candidates' responses.*

- (a) Always use positive marking. This means candidates accumulate marks for the demonstration of relevant skills, knowledge and understanding; marks are not deducted for errors or omissions.
- (b) If a candidate response does not seem to be covered by either the principles or detailed marking instructions, and you are uncertain how to assess it, you must seek guidance from your team leader.
- (c) Where a candidate violates the rubric of the paper and answers both optional 30 mark questions in a section/part, all responses should be marked and the better mark recorded.
- (d) Use the full range of marks available for each question.
- (e) The detailed marking instructions are not an exhaustive list. Award marks for other relevant points.
- (f) Award marks only where points relate to the question asked. Where candidates give points of knowledge without specifying the context, award marks unless it is clear that they do not refer to the context of the question.
- (g) In this question paper the following skills are assessed:
  - knowledge and understanding
  - analysis
  - evaluation.
- (h) For essay questions candidates must integrate these skills with their knowledge, in response to the question or statement. Essay questions may include the following command words:
  - 'How valid . . . '
  - 'To what extent do you agree . . . '
  - 'Discuss . . . '
- (i) For source questions candidates must demonstrate the skills of knowledge, analysis and evaluation in short responses. Source questions always use the following command words:
  - 'Describe . . . '
  - 'Analyse . . . '
  - 'Evaluate . . . '

	<b>26–30</b>	<b>21–25</b>	<b>16–20</b>	<b>11–15</b>	<b>6–10</b>	<b>0–5</b>
<b>Overview</b>	The essay is clearly focussed on the question at all times.	The essay is clearly focussed on the question, but at times refers generally to the topic rather than the question.	The essay is focussed on the question at times but drifts into general comments about the topic.	The essay is focussed more on the topic rather than the question.	The essay is focussed more on the topic than on the question and has information that lacks relevance.	The essay lacks relevance to both the question and/or the topic.
	<b>9–10</b>	<b>7–8</b>	<b>5–6</b>	<b>3–4</b>	<b>1–2</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Knowledge and understanding</b>	KU is consistently in depth, accurate and relevant.	KU is mainly in depth, accurate and relevant.	KU has inconsistent depth but is mainly accurate and relevant.	KU lacks depth overall but is mainly accurate and relevant.	KU lacks depth overall and has issues with accuracy or relevance.	KU is superficial and is not consistently accurate or relevant.
	There is clear evidence that the candidate has drawn together relevant and appropriate information from a range of specific sources or perspectives.	There is clear evidence that the candidate has drawn together mainly relevant and appropriate information from some specific sources or perspectives.	There is some evidence that the candidate has drawn together relevant and/or appropriate information but references to sources and perspectives tend to be more general and limited.	There is evidence that the candidate has attempted to draw together relevant and/or appropriate information but references to sources and perspectives are general in nature and limited.	There is some evidence that the candidate has attempted to draw together relevant and/or appropriate information but references to sources and perspectives are brief, undeveloped, and general in nature.	The essay lacks evidence of sources and perspectives and those used lack relevance and accuracy.

	9–10	7–8	5–6	3–4	1–2	0
Analysis	The analysis clearly identifies specific issue(s) related to the question.	The analysis identifies specific issue(s) related to the question, but the depth is uneven at times.	The analysis identifies a mix of specific and general issue(s) that are related to the question and there is insufficient depth and explanation of them.	The analysis identifies some general issue(s) related to the question and there is insufficient depth or explanation.	The analysis identifies a few issue(s), but they are not clearly related to the question and coverage is superficial.	Any analysis often fails to identify issues and those that have been identified are not clearly related to the question and superficial.
Evaluation	The explanation of issues takes account of a range of clearly identified perspectives and demonstrates a clear understanding of their relevance to the question.	The explanation of issues takes account of some perspectives and demonstrates a good understanding of their relevance to the question.	The issues are explained and there is evidence of some understanding of their relevance to the question which at times is general in nature.	The issues are explained and there is evidence of some understanding of their relevance to the question at times, but which is generally superficial.	The issues are briefly explained but there is evidence of some understanding of their relevance to the topic but not to the question.	There is evidence of some understanding of the topic but not the question.
	9–10	7–8	5–6	3–4	1–2	0
Evaluation	The evaluation is insightful, valid, and clearly reasoned.	The evaluation is valid, may be insightful and is mainly clearly reasoned.	The evaluation is valid but not consistently and clearly reasoned.	The evaluation is valid but not clearly reasoned and lacks sufficiency.	There is limited valid evaluation, but it is not clearly reasoned and lacks sufficiency.	The evaluation either lacks validity or relevance to the issue/question.
Evaluation	It has relevant judgements on the issues and/or perspectives on the issues.	It has mainly relevant judgements on the issues and/or perspectives on the issues.	It has some relevant judgements on the issues and/or perspectives on the issues.	It has relevant judgements on the issues and/or perspectives on the issues, however it is simply a judgement with brief reasoning.	It may have judgements on the issues but there is some brief reasoning behind them.	
Evaluation	Conclusions have successfully been woven throughout the essay/drawn at the conclusion of the essay.	Mainly clear conclusions have been drawn.	There has been some attempt to draw conclusions, but they lack depth.	There has been some attempt to draw brief conclusions but they lack depth.	Conclusions may be restricted to closing comments.	

## Marking instruction for each question

### Section 1 – Philosophy of religion

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
1.		30	<p><b>Knowledge and Understanding may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• cosmological arguments, for example Aquinas, Leibniz, and Kalam</li><li>• scientific responses, for example Big Bang Theory</li><li>• relevant sources.</li></ul> <p><b>Analysis may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• implications of scientific responses to the cosmological argument</li><li>• consequences of scientific responses to the cosmological argument</li><li>• connections between scientific responses to the cosmological argument</li><li>• explanations of relevant sources.</li></ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• counter-arguments of scientific responses to the cosmological argument</li><li>• judgements of scientific responses to the cosmological argument</li><li>• conclusions throughout</li><li>• overall conclusions.</li></ul>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
2.		30	<p><b>Knowledge and Understanding may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• teleological arguments, for example Aquinas', Paley, and arguments from Intelligent design</li> <li>• scientific responses, for example Newtons Laws and the Theory of Evolution</li> <li>• relevant sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of scientific responses to the teleological argument</li> <li>• consequences of scientific responses to the teleological argument</li> <li>• connections between scientific responses to the teleological argument</li> <li>• explanations of relevant sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments of scientific responses to the teleological argument</li> <li>• judgements of scientific responses to the teleological argument</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
3.		30	<p><b>Knowledge and Understanding may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• atheist arguments</li> <li>• scientific responses, for example Empirical evidence, Big Bang Theory and Theory of Evolution</li> <li>• incoherency of the God of classical theism</li> <li>• the improbability of God</li> <li>• relevant sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of scientific responses to atheism</li> <li>• consequences of scientific responses to atheism</li> <li>• connections between scientific responses to atheism</li> <li>• explanations of relevant sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments of scientific responses to atheism</li> <li>• judgements of scientific responses to atheism</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
4.	(a)	5	<p>This question requires candidates to demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective of the source.</p> <p>Possible knowledge and understanding marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• accurate, relevant and developed points which demonstrate an understanding of the perspective, that is, what is meant by the ‘Kalam argument’.</li> </ul> <p>Award 1 mark per point.</p> <p><b>Possible Response:</b></p> <p>The Kalam argument is based on the causal principle maintaining that nothing can be the cause of itself, and that everything which has a beginning has a cause. The universe cannot be infinite because the present exists as a result of a series of past events. As the universe began it too must have a cause. God does not need a cause because He is timeless and didn’t begin.</p>
	(b)	5	<p>This question requires candidates to demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective of the source.</p> <p>Possible analysis marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• demonstrate, through interpretation or paraphrasing, a clear understand of the sources.</li> </ul> <p>Do not award marks for simply quoting points from the source. Candidates must paraphrase or interpret them to gain credit.</p> <p>Award 1 mark per point.</p> <p><b>Possible Response:</b></p> <p>By stating, ‘everything that begins has a cause of its existence’ William Lane Craig shows that he is basing his argument on the causal principle. The use of the word ‘everything’ shows that he believes there cannot be exceptions to this rule. He acts as if it is an <i>a priori truth</i> – true by definition. By going on to say that, ‘since the universe began’ it is also reasonable to conclude that he is rejecting the notion of an infinite regress. By saying that ‘the universe has a cause of its existence’, it also shows that he would reject Quantum Theory and the idea that something can come from nothing.</p>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
(c)		5	<p>This question requires candidates to assess the validity or invalidity of the perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible evaluation marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• insightful, valid and clearly reasoned judgements on the source.</li> </ul> <p>Award 1 mark per point.</p> <p><b>Possible Response:</b></p> <p>I disagree with William Lane Craig because the causal principle is not an <i>a priori</i> truth as it's only true in our experience, and our experience is very limited. I also disagree because Heisenberg's uncertainty principle demonstrated that matter can be unpredictable and there do appear to be spontaneous events when particles appear from nothing. However, I agree with William Lane Craig because these events are not devoid of causal conditions. Even if the causal principle is only an inductive generalisation, it is still a very strong one. I also agree because it makes more sense to say that the world came about intentionally, rather than by chance or accident, because otherwise it has no purpose.</p>

## Section 2

### Part A – Religious Experience

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
5.		30	<p><b>Knowledge and Understanding may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Swinburne's argument about religious experience</li><li>• James's argument about religious experience</li><li>• Otto's argument about religious experience</li><li>• other arguments about religious experience</li><li>• relevant sources.</li></ul> <p><b>Analysis may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• implications of Swinburne's arguments about religious experience</li><li>• consequences of Swinburne's arguments about religious experience</li><li>• connections between Swinburne's arguments about religious experience and other arguments, for example, Otto, James</li><li>• explanations of relevant sources.</li></ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• counter-arguments</li><li>• judgements</li><li>• conclusions throughout</li><li>• overall conclusions.</li></ul>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
6.		30	<p><b>Knowledge and Understanding may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• examples of religious experiences that strengthen or weaken personal relationships with God</li> <li>• examples of understandings of religious experiences</li> <li>• other faith perspectives</li> <li>• relevant sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of religious experiences strengthening or weakening personal relationships with God</li> <li>• consequences of religious experiences strengthening or weakening personal relationships with God</li> <li>• connections between religious experiences and personal relationships with God and other faith perspectives</li> <li>• explanations of relevant sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments</li> <li>• judgements</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
7.		30	<p><b>Knowledge and Understanding may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• examples of psychological accounts of religious experiences</li> <li>• examples of scientific accounts of religious experiences</li> <li>• examples of sociological accounts of religious experiences</li> <li>• relevant sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of psychological accounts of religious experiences</li> <li>• consequences of psychological accounts of religious experiences</li> <li>• connections between psychological accounts of religious experiences and alternative accounts of religious experiences.</li> <li>• explanations of relevant sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments</li> <li>• judgements</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
8.	(a)	5	<p>This question requires candidates to demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective of the source.</p> <p>Possible knowledge and understanding marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• accurate, relevant and developed points which demonstrate an understanding of the perspective, that is, what is meant by ‘psychological accounts of religious experience’.</li> </ul> <p>Candidates will be awarded <b>1 mark</b> per point.</p> <p><b>Possible Response:</b></p> <p>A psychological account of a religious experience is an alternative explanation to the claim that people have had a lifechanging encounter with God. Sigmund Freud was heavily against religion and called it a ‘collective neurosis’ stating that it should be abolished from modern society. Freud claims that religious experiences are nothing more than a delusion. He says that people use this to escape reality to create an alternative, untrue reality. Carl Jung, on the other hand, believed that a religious experience was a natural expression of the collective unconscious.</p>
	(b)	5	<p>Candidates demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible analysis marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• demonstrate, through interpretation or paraphrasing, a clear understanding of the source.</li> </ul> <p>Do not award marks for simply quoting points from the source. Candidates must paraphrase or interpret them to gain credit.</p> <p>Award <b>1 mark</b> per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response:</b></p> <p>This source suggests that when a person experiences an encounter with God, they may not necessarily be aware of what it means to them at the time, for example, if someone had a dream of God talking to them, they would be able to decide if it is a sign that they need to change their life around. It also implies that the unconscious is not a replacement for God but instead, it is the method by which God will communicate with people in a safe and private medium to allow people to interpret it in their own way. Jung also claims that we will never fully understand what a religious experience is, and as it comes from God, we do not have the capacity to begin to comprehend the actions of God and we should not question what God does. This source also suggests that Jung is rather positive and in favour of religious experiences as he seems open to the idea that it is acceptable to not understand the cause of a religious experience.</p>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
(c)		5	<p>Candidates assess the validity or invalidity of the perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible evaluation marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• insightful, valid and clearly reasoned judgements on the source.</li> </ul> <p>Award 1 mark per point.</p> <p><b>Possible response:</b></p> <p>I think this is a valid response to understanding a religious experience to a certain extent, as there is a clear distinction between humanity and the supernatural and it makes sense that anything related to God should be beyond human understanding. For someone to try and begin to understand an intervention from the divine may be too difficult for them and lead to negative consequences for those people. I think it is valid for religious experience to be left unexplained with questions unanswered to allow the person to work through their experience their own way. However, I feel that some may see this response as weak as many non-religious people claim that an experience with God is fictional and Jung's response makes it even more difficult to believe in religious experiences as he says that we don't have the capacity to understand them. Jung's response is a bit of a cop out rather than actually opening the discussion to fully understand and appreciate these experiences which clearly do happen as many people's lives change as a result of them.</p>

## Section 2

### Part B – Medical Ethics

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
9.		30	<p><b>Knowledge and understanding may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• treatment and use of embryos</li><li>• religious responses to the treatment and use of embryos</li><li>• beliefs about beginning of life</li><li>• sanctity of life</li><li>• relevant sources.</li></ul> <p><b>Analysis may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• implications of religious responses to the treatment and use of embryos</li><li>• consequences of religious responses to the treatment and use of embryos</li><li>• connections between beliefs such as beginning of life, sanctity of life and quality of life</li><li>• explanations of sources.</li></ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• counter-arguments</li><li>• judgements</li><li>• conclusions throughout</li><li>• overall conclusions.</li></ul>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
10.		30	<p><b>Knowledge and understanding may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• organ transplants</li> <li>• sanctity of life</li> <li>• organ procurement</li> <li>• organ allocation</li> <li>• religious/non-religious responses</li> <li>• sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of religious/non-religious responses to organ procurement</li> <li>• consequences of religious/non-religious responses to organ procurement</li> <li>• connections between religious and non-religious responses</li> <li>• explanations of sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments</li> <li>• judgements</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
11.		30	<p><b>Knowledge and understanding may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• end of life</li> <li>• sanctity of life</li> <li>• end of life care: medical and social care</li> <li>• assisted dying</li> <li>• religious/non-religious responses</li> <li>• sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Analysis may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• implications of religious/non-religious responses to assisted dying</li> <li>• consequences of religious/non-religious responses to assisted dying</li> <li>• connections between religious and non-religious responses</li> <li>• explanations of sources.</li> </ul> <p><b>Evaluation may include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• counter-arguments</li> <li>• judgements</li> <li>• conclusions throughout</li> <li>• overall conclusions.</li> </ul>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
12.	(a)	5	<p>This question requires candidates to demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective of the source.</p> <p>Possible knowledge and understanding marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• accurate, relevant and developed points which demonstrate an understanding of the perspective, for example, what is meant by ‘assisted dying’.</li> </ul> <p>Award 1 mark per point.</p> <p><b>Possible Response:</b></p> <p>Assisted dying is used to describe assisted suicide or voluntary euthanasia. It can be when someone who is terminally ill asks for help to die as they can't end their own life. For example, Tony Nicklinson had locked in syndrome and could only communicate by blinking, he fought for the right to have legalised assisted dying in the UK as he needed help to end his life. Assisted dying is not legal in the UK but is legal in countries such as the Netherlands and Switzerland. There are also cases where people are not terminally ill but want to have an assisted death rather than having to live with extreme pain or suffering.</p>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
(b)		5	<p>Candidates demonstrate their understanding of the view or perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible analysis marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• demonstrate, through interpretation or paraphrasing, a clear understanding of the source.</li> </ul> <p>Do not award marks for simply quoting points from the source. Candidates must paraphrase or interpret them to gain credit.</p> <p><b>Award 1 mark per point.</b></p> <p><b>Possible Response:</b></p> <p>This source means that if you legalise assisted dying then people will pick up on an underlying message that assisted dying is not just legally acceptable but morally acceptable. A consequence of this could be that people would feel under pressure to ask for assisted dying if they were given a terminal diagnosis because if it were legalised they would consider it more seriously than if it remained illegal. It could also mean that society would put pressure on people with a terminal illness to consider assisted dying. An implication of this could be that vulnerable people would worry about being a burden to their families or the NHS and that they should be choosing assisted dying. This source also links to slippery slope arguments against the legalisation of assisted dying as there could be the unintended consequence that health care staff could pressurise people towards assisted dying.</p>

Question		Max mark	Marking instructions for this question
(c)		5	<p>Candidates assess the validity or invalidity of the perspective as set out in the source.</p> <p>Possible evaluation marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• insightful, valid and clearly reasoned judgements on the source.</li> </ul> <p>Award 1 mark per point.</p> <p><b>Possible Response:</b></p> <p>I agree with the source to an extent as I do think if assisted dying were legalised then more people would consider it as they would see it a valid state sanctioned option. At present, if I had a terminal illness and wanted to die, I would have to go to Switzerland and that would have negative consequences for my family – potentially legally and financially – so I wouldn't do it because of the consequences for them. However, I disagree with the source overall as I think most people already think about assisted dying as an option as they are worried about how they and their family will manage and cope with a terminal diagnosis. Many are also worried about the standard of care they will receive during the dying process so a law to legalise assisted dying won't change what many already consider but cannot legally do. So I disagree with the source overall as I think the message is not subliminal as people consider assisted dying anyway but would like the freedom to make the choice legally in the UK.</p>

[END OF MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]