

Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF)
Request for Comments: 5816
Updates: [3161](#)
Category: Standards Track
ISSN: 2070-1721

S. Santesson
3xA Security
N. Pope
Thales
March 2010

ESSCertIDv2 Update for [RFC 3161](#)

Abstract

This document updates [RFC 3161](#). It allows the use of ESSCertIDv2, as defined in [RFC 5035](#), to specify the hash of a signer certificate when the hash is calculated with a function other than the Secure Hash Algorithm (SHA-1).

Status of This Memo

This is an Internet Standards Track document.

This document is a product of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). It represents the consensus of the IETF community. It has received public review and has been approved for publication by the Internet Engineering Steering Group (IESG). Further information on Internet Standards is available in [Section 2 of RFC 5741](#).

Information about the current status of this document, any errata, and how to provide feedback on it may be obtained at <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5816>.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2010 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to [BCP 78](#) and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (<http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info>) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

This document may contain material from IETF Documents or IETF Contributions published or made publicly available before November 10, 2008. The person(s) controlling the copyright in some of this

material may not have granted the IETF Trust the right to allow modifications of such material outside the IETF Standards Process. Without obtaining an adequate license from the person(s) controlling the copyright in such materials, this document may not be modified outside the IETF Standards Process, and derivative works of it may not be created outside the IETF Standards Process, except to format it for publication as an RFC or to translate it into languages other than English.

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	2
1.1. Terminology	2
2. Updates to RFC 3161	3
2.1. Changes to Section 2.4.1, Request Format	3
2.2. Changes to Section 2.4.2, Response Format	3
2.2.1. Signature of Time-Stamp Token	3
2.2.2. Verifying the Time-Stamp Token	4
3. Security Considerations	4
4. References	5
4.1. Normative References	5
4.2. Informative References	5

1. Introduction

The time-stamping protocol defined in RFC 3161 [RFC3161] requires that the Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS) SignedData [RFC5652], used to apply a digital signature on the time-stamp token, include a signed attribute that identifies the signer's certificate.

This identifier only allows SHA-1 [SHA1] to be used as the hash algorithm to generate the identifier value.

The mechanism used in [RFC3161] employed ESSCertID from RFC 2634 [ESS]. RFC 5035 [ESSV2] updated ESSCertID with ESSCertIDv2 to allow the use of any hash algorithm.

The changes to RFC 3161 [RFC3161] defined in this document allow ESSCertIDv2 to be used to include an identifier of the signing certificate as defined in RFC 5035 [ESSV2].

1.1. Terminology

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in RFC 2119 [RFC2119].

2. Updates to RFC 3161

2.1. Changes to Section 2.4.1, Request Format

Last paragraph on Page 5.

Old:

If the certReq field is present and set to true, the TSA's public key certificate that is referenced by the ESSCertID identifier inside a SigningCertificate attribute in the response MUST be provided by the TSA in the certificates field from the SignedData structure in that response. That field may also contain other certificates.

New:

If the certReq field is present and set to true, the TSA's public key certificate that is referenced by the ESSCertID [ESS] field inside a SigningCertificate attribute or by the ESSCertIDv2 [ESSV2] field inside a SigningCertificateV2 attribute in the response MUST be provided by the TSA in the certificates field from the SignedData structure in that response. That field may also contain other certificates.

2.2. Changes to Section 2.4.2, Response Format

2.2.1. Signature of Time-Stamp Token

Fifth paragraph on Page 8, just before the definition of TSTInfo.

Old:

The time-stamp token MUST NOT contain any signatures other than the signature of the TSA. The certificate identifier (ESSCertID) of the TSA certificate MUST be included as a signerInfo attribute inside a SigningCertificate attribute.

New:

The time-stamp token MUST NOT contain any signatures other than the signature of the TSA. The certificate identifier (either ESSCertID [ESS] or ESSCertIDv2 [ESSV2]) of the TSA certificate MUST be included as a signerInfo attribute inside a SigningCertificate attribute.

Note: As mentioned in RFC 5035 [ESSV2], the SigningCertificateV2 attribute MUST be used if any algorithm other than SHA-1 is used and SHOULD NOT be used for SHA-1.

Note: For backwards compatibility, in line with RFC 5035, both ESSCertID and ESSCertIDv2 MAY be present. Systems MAY ignore ESSCertIDv2 if RFC 5035 has not been implemented.

2.2.2. Verifying the Time-Stamp Token

Third paragraph on Page 11.

Old:

The purpose of the tsa field is to give a hint in identifying the name of the TSA. If present, it MUST correspond to one of the subject names included in the certificate that is to be used to verify the token. However, the actual identification of the entity that signed the response will always occur through the use of the certificate identifier (ESSCertID Attribute) inside a SigningCertificate attribute which is part of the signerInfo (See Section 5 of [ESS]).

New:

The purpose of the tsa field is to give a hint in identifying the name of the TSA. If present, it MUST correspond to one of the subject names included in the certificate that is to be used to verify the token. However, the actual identification of the entity that signed the response will always occur through the use of the certificate identifier (ESSCertID inside a SigningCertificate attribute or ESSCertIDv2 inside a SigningCertificateV2 attribute) that is part of the signerInfo (see Section 5 of [ESS] and Section 3 of [ESSV2]).

3. Security Considerations

This document incorporates the security considerations of RFC 5035 [ESSV2] with further explanations in this section.

ESSCertID provides a means based on the SHA-1 hash algorithm for identifying the certificate used to verify the signature on a time stamp. The use of ESSCertIDv2 aims to enable implementers to comply with policies that require phasing out all uses of the SHA-1 algorithm.

The update provided by this document is motivated by reasons of interoperability and migration to other hash algorithms rather than mitigating new security issues.

4. References

4.1. Normative References

- [RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", [BCP 14](#), [RFC 2119](#), March 1997.
- [ESS] Hoffman, P., Ed., "Enhanced Security Services for S/MIME", [RFC 2634](#), June 1999.
- [ESSV2] Schaad, J., "Enhanced Security Services (ESS) Update: Adding CertID Algorithm Agility", [RFC 5035](#), August 2007.
- [RFC3161] Adams, C., Cain, P., Pinkas, D., and R. Zuccherato, "Internet X.509 Public Key Infrastructure Time-Stamp Protocol (TSP)", [RFC 3161](#), August 2001.
- [RFC5652] Housley, R., "Cryptographic Message Syntax (CMS)", [RFC 5652](#), September 2009.

4.2. Informative References

- [SHA1] Secure Hash Standard. FIPS Pub 180-1. National Institute of Standards and Technology. 17 April 1995.

Authors' Addresses

Stefan Santesson
3xA Security AB
Sweden

E-Mail: sts@aaa-sec.com

Nick Pope
Thales Information Systems Security
Long Crendon, Aylesbury
United Kingdom

E-Mail: nick.pope@thales-esecurity.com