Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF)

Request for Comments: 8389

S. Jiang

Category: Standards Track

ISSN: 2070-1721

B. Liu

Y. Fu

CNNIC

Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd

J. Dong

Y. Chen

Tsinghua University

December 2018

Definitions of Managed Objects for Mapping of Address and Port with Encapsulation (MAP-E)

Abstract

This memo defines a portion of the Management Information Base (MIB) for Mapping of Address and Port with Encapsulation (MAP-E) for use with network management protocols.

Status of This Memo

This is an Internet Standards Track document.

This document is a product of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). It represents the consensus of the IETF community. It has received public review and has been approved for publication by the Internet Engineering Steering Group (IESG). Further information on Internet Standards is available in Section 2 of RFC 7841.

Information about the current status of this document, any errata, and how to provide feedback on it may be obtained at https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8389.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (c) 2018 IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document. Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

Fu, et al. Standards Track [Page 1]

Table of Contents

1.	Introduction	2
2.	The Internet-Standard Management Framework	2
	Terminology	
4.	Structure of the MIB Module	3
	4.1. The mapMIBObjects	3
	4.1.1. The mapRule Subtree	3
	4.1.2. The mapSecurityCheck Subtree	3
	4.2. The mapMIBConformance Subtree	4
5.	Definitions	4
6.	IANA Considerations	.12
7.	Security Considerations	.12
8.	References	.13
	8.1. Normative References	.13
	8.2. Informative References	.14
Acknowledgements		.15
Aut	chors' Addresses	.16

1. Introduction

Mapping of Address and Port with Encapsulation (MAP-E) [RFC7597] is a stateless, automatic tunneling mechanism for providing an IPv4 connectivity service to end users over a service provider's IPv6 network.

This document defines a portion of the Management Information Base (MIB) for use with monitoring MAP-E devices.

2. The Internet-Standard Management Framework

For a detailed overview of the documents that describe the current Internet-Standard Management Framework, please refer to section 7 of RFC 3410 [RFC3410].

Managed objects are accessed via a virtual information store, termed the Management Information Base or MIB. MIB objects are generally accessed through the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP). Objects in the MIB are defined using the mechanisms defined in the Structure of Management Information (SMI). This memo specifies a MIB module that is compliant to the SMIv2, which is described in STD 58, RFC 2578 [RFC2578], STD 58, RFC 2579 [RFC2579] and STD 58, RFC 2580 [RFC2580].

Fu, et al. Standards Track [Page 2]

3. Terminology

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "NOT RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in BCP 14 [RFC2119] [RFC8174] when, and only when, they appear in all capitals, as shown here.

4. Structure of the MIB Module

The IF-MIB [RFC2863] defines generic managed objects for managing interfaces. Each logical interface (physical or virtual) has an ifEntry. Tunnels are handled by creating a logical interface (ifEntry) for each tunnel. Each MAP-E tunnel endpoint also acts as a virtual interface that has a corresponding entry in the IF-MIB. Those corresponding entries are indexed by ifIndex. The MAP-E MIB is configurable on a per-interface basis, so it depends on several parts (ifEntry) of the IF-MIB [RFC2863].

4.1. The mapMIBObjects

4.1.1. The mapRule Subtree

The mapRule subtree describes managed objects used for managing the multiple mapping rules in MAP-E.

According to [RFC7597], the mapping rules are divided into two categories: Basic Mapping Rule (BMR) and Forwarding Mapping Rule (FMR). According to Section 4.1 of [RFC7598], an F-flag specifies whether the rule is to be used for forwarding (FMR). If set, this rule is used as an FMR; if not set, this rule is BMR only and MUST NOT be used for forwarding. A BMR can also be used as an FMR for forwarding if the F-flag is set. So, the RuleType definition in the MAP-E MIB (see Section 5) defines bmrAndfmr to specify this scenario.

4.1.2. The mapSecurityCheck Subtree

The mapSecurityCheck subtree provides statistics for the number of invalid packets that have been identified. [RFC7597] defines two kinds of invalid packets:

- o The Border Relay (BR) will validate the received packet's source IPv6 address against the configured MAP domain rule and the destination IPv6 address against the configured BR IPv6 address.
- o The MAP node (Customer Edge (CE) and BR) will check that the received packet's source IPv4 address and port are in the range derived from the matching MAP rule.

Fu, et al. Standards Track [Page 3]

4.2. The mapMIBConformance Subtree

The mapMIBConformance subtree provides conformance information of MIB objects.

5. Definitions

```
The following MIB module imports definitions from [RFC2578],
[RFC2579], [RFC2580], [RFC2863], and [RFC4001].
  MAP-E-MIB DEFINITIONS ::= BEGIN
  IMPORTS
     MODULE-IDENTITY, OBJECT-TYPE, mib-2,
     Unsigned32, Counter64
        FROM SNMPv2-SMI
                                         --RFC 2578
     TEXTUAL-CONVENTION
        FROM SNMPv2-TC
                                         --RFC 2579
      ifIndex
        FROM IF-MIB
                                         --RFC 2863
     InetAddressIPv6, InetAddressIPv4,
     InetAddressPrefixLength
         FROM INET-ADDRESS-MIB
                                         --RFC 4001
     OBJECT-GROUP, MODULE-COMPLIANCE
        FROM SNMPv2-CONF;
                                        --RFC 2580
  mapMIB MODULE-IDENTITY
  LAST-UPDATED "201811260000Z"
   ORGANIZATION
      "IETF Softwire Working Group"
   CONTACT-INFO
      "Yu Fu
       No. 4 South 4th Street, Zhongguancun
       Beijing 100190
       China
       Email: eleven711711@foxmail.com
       Sheng Jiang
       Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd
       Q14, Huawei Campus, No. 156 Beiging Road
       Hai-Dian District, Beijing 100095
       China
       Email: jiangsheng@huawei.com
       Bing Liu
       Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd
```

Q14, Huawei Campus, No. 156 Beiging Road

```
Hai-Dian District, Beijing 100095
   China
   Email: leo.liubing@huawei.com
   Jiang Dong
   Tsinghua University
   Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University
   Beijing 100084
   China
   Email: knight.dongjiang@gmail.com
   Yuchi Chen
   Tsinghua University
   Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University
   Beijing 100084
   Email: chenycmx@gmail.com"
DESCRIPTION
  "This MIB module is defined for management of objects for
   MAP-E BRs or CEs.
   Copyright (c) 2018 IETF Trust and the persons identified as
   authors of the code. All rights reserved.
   Redistribution and use in source and binary forms, with or
   without modification, is permitted pursuant to, and subject to
   the license terms contained in, the Simplified BSD License set
   forth in Section 4.c of the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions
   Relating to IETF Documents
   (https://trustee.ietf.org/license-info)."
REVISION "201811260000Z"
DESCRIPTION
 "Initial version. Published as RFC 8389."
 ::= \{ mib-2 242 \}
mapMIBObjects OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= {mapMIB 1}
mapRule OBJECT IDENTIFIER
  ::= { mapMIBObjects 1 }
mapSecurityCheck
               OBJECT IDENTIFIER
  ::= { mapMIBObjects 2 }
-- Textual Conventions Used in This MIB Module
```

```
RulePSID ::= TEXTUAL-CONVENTION
  DISPLAY-HINT "0x:"
  STATUS
               current
  DESCRIPTION
       "Indicates that the Port Set ID (PSID) is represented as
       hexadecimal for clarity."
   SYNTAX
           OCTET STRING (SIZE (2))
RuleType ::= TEXTUAL-CONVENTION
   STATUS
             current
  DESCRIPTION
      "Enumerates the type of the mapping rule. It
      defines three types of mapping rules here:
        bmr: Basic Mapping Rule (not Forwarding Mapping Rule)
        fmr: Forwarding Mapping Rule (not Basic Mapping Rule)
        bmrAndfmr: Basic and Forwarding Mapping Rule
      The Basic Mapping Rule may also be a Forwarding Mapping
      Rule for mesh mode."
  REFERENCE
             "bmr, fmr: Section 5 of RFC 7597.
               bmrAndfmr: Section 5 of RFC 7597, Section 4.1
               of RFC 7598."
   SYNTAX
              INTEGER {
      bmr(1),
      fmr(2),
      bmrAndfmr(3)
       }
mapRuleTable OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF MapRuleEntry
  MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
  STATUS current
  DESCRIPTION
      "The (conceptual) table containing rule information for
      a specific mapping rule. It can also be used for row
      creation."
   ::= { mapRule 1 }
mapRuleEntry OBJECT-TYPE
  SYNTAX MapRuleEntry
  MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
      "Each entry in this table contains the information on a
      particular mapping rule."
       INDEX { ifIndex,
                 mapRuleID }
   ::= { mapRuleTable 1 }
```

```
MapRuleEntry ::=
    SEQUENCE {
     mapRuleID Unsigned32,
mapRuleIPv6Prefix InetAddressIPv6,
mapRuleIPv6PrefixLen InetAddressIPv4,
mapRuleIPv4Prefix InetAddressIPv4,
mapRuleIPv4PrefixLen InetAddressPrefixLength,
mapRuleBRIPv6Address InetAddressIPv6,
mapRulePSID PuloBID
     mapRulePSID
                                     RulePSID,
                                    Unsigned32,
     mapRulePSIDLen
                                   Unsigned32,
     mapRuleOffset
     mapRuleEALen
                                    Unsigned32,
     mapRuleType
                                    RuleType
 }
 mapRuleID OBJECT-TYPE
     SYNTAX Unsigned32 (1..4294967295)
     MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
     STATUS current
     DESCRIPTION
         "A unique identifier used to distinguish mapping
          rules."
      ::= { mapRuleEntry 1 }
-- The object mapRuleIPv6Prefix is IPv6 specific; hence, it does
-- not use the version-agnostic InetAddress.
mapRuleIPv6Prefix OBJECT-TYPE
     SYNTAX InetAddressIPv6
     MAX-ACCESS read-only
     STATUS current
     DESCRIPTION
         "The IPv6 prefix defined in the mapping rule that will be
          assigned to CEs."
      ::= { mapRuleEntry 2 }
 mapRuleIPv6PrefixLen OBJECT-TYPE
     SYNTAX InetAddressPrefixLength
     MAX-ACCESS read-only
     STATUS current
     DESCRIPTION
         "The length of the IPv6 prefix defined in the mapping rule
          that will be assigned to CEs."
      ::= { mapRuleEntry 3 }
-- The object mapRuleIPv4Prefix is IPv4 specific; hence, it does
-- not use the version-agnostic InetAddress.
```

```
mapRuleIPv4Prefix OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX InetAddressIPv4
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
       "The IPv4 prefix defined in the mapping rule that will be
        assigned to CEs."
     ::= { mapRuleEntry 4 }
mapRuleIPv4PrefixLen OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX InetAddressPrefixLength
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
            current
    DESCRIPTION
       "The length of the IPv4 prefix defined in the mapping
        rule that will be assigned to CEs."
     ::= { mapRuleEntry 5 }
-- The object mapRuleBRIPv6Address is IPv6 specific; hence, it does
-- not use the version-agnostic InetAddress.
mapRuleBRIPv6Address OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX InetAddressIPv6
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
       "The IPv6 address of the BR that will be conveyed to CEs.
        If the BR IPv6 address is anycast, the relay must use
        this anycast IPv6 address as the source address in
        packets relayed to CEs."
     ::= { mapRuleEntry 6 }
 mapRulePSID OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX
             RulePSID
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
       "The PSID value algorithmically identifies a set of
        ports assigned to a CE."
    REFERENCE
         "PSID: Section 5.1 of RFC 7597."
     ::= { mapRuleEntry 7 }
mapRulePSIDLen OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Unsigned32(0..16)
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS
             current
```

```
DESCRIPTION
        "The bit length value of the number of significant bits in
        the PSID field. When it is set to 0, the PSID
        field is to be ignored."
     ::= { mapRuleEntry 8 }
 mapRuleOffset OBJECT-TYPE
     SYNTAX
            Unsigned32(0..15)
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
        "The number of the mapRuleOffset is 6 by default to
        exclude the system ports (0-1023). It is provided via
        the Rule Port Mapping Parameters in the Basic Mapping
        Rule."
     DEFVAL {6}
     ::= { mapRuleEntry 9 }
 mapRuleEALen OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Unsigned32(0..48)
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
        "The length of the Embedded Address (EA) defined in
        mapping rule that will be assigned to CEs."
   REFERENCE
         "EA: Section 3 of RFC 7597."
     ::= { mapRuleEntry 10 }
mapRuleType OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX RuleType
    MAX-ACCESS read-only
     STATUS current
     DESCRIPTION
        "Indicates the type of mapping rule.
        '1' represents a BMR.
         '2' represents an FMR.
         '3' represents a BMR that is also an FMR for mesh mode."
     REFERENCE
          "bmr, fmr: Section 5 of RFC 7597.
          bmrAndfmr: Section 5 of RFC 7597, Section 4.1 of
          RFC 7598."
     ::= { mapRuleEntry 11 }
 mapSecurityCheckTable OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF MapSecurityCheckEntry
   MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
    STATUS
             current
```

```
DESCRIPTION
     "The (conceptual) table containing information on
      MAP security checks. This table can be used for
      statistics on the number of invalid packets that
      have been identified."
   ::= { mapSecurityCheck 1 }
mapSecurityCheckEntry OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX MapSecurityCheckEntry
  MAX-ACCESS not-accessible
  STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
      "Each entry in this table contains information on a
      particular MAP security check."
      INDEX { ifIndex }
   ::= { mapSecurityCheckTable 1 }
MapSecurityCheckEntry ::=
  SEQUENCE {
   mapSecurityCheckInvalidv4
                                 Counter64,
   mapSecurityCheckInvalidv6
                                 Counter64
}
mapSecurityCheckInvalidv4 OBJECT-TYPE
    SYNTAX Counter64
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
       "Indicates the number of received IPv4 packets
       that do not have a payload source IPv4 address or
       port within the range defined in the matching MAP
       rule. It corresponds to the second kind of
        invalid packet described in Section 4.1.2."
    ::= { mapSecurityCheckEntry 1 }
mapSecurityCheckInvalidv6 OBJECT-TYPE
   SYNTAX Counter64
   MAX-ACCESS read-only
   STATUS current
   DESCRIPTION
       "Indicates the number of received IPv6 packets that
       do not have a source or destination IPv6 address
       matching a Basic Mapping Rule. It corresponds
       to the first kind of invalid packet described
        in Section 4.1.2."
    ::= { mapSecurityCheckEntry 2 }
-- Conformance Information
```

```
mapMIBConformance OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= {mapMIB 2}
mapMIBCompliances OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { mapMIBConformance 1 }
mapMIBGroups OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { mapMIBConformance 2 }
 -- compliance statements
 mapMIBCompliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
       "Describes the minimal requirements for conformance
       to the MAP-E MIB."
   MODULE -- this module
       MANDATORY-GROUPS { mapMIBRuleGroup , mapMIBSecurityGroup }
   ::= { mapMIBCompliances 1 }
 -- Units of Conformance
 mapMIBRuleGroup OBJECT-GROUP
   OBJECTS {
            mapRuleIPv6Prefix,
            mapRuleIPv6PrefixLen,
            mapRuleIPv4Prefix,
            mapRuleIPv4PrefixLen,
            mapRuleBRIPv6Address,
            mapRulePSID,
            mapRulePSIDLen,
            mapRuleOffset,
            mapRuleEALen,
            mapRuleType }
    STATUS current
    DESCRIPTION
       "The group of objects used to describe the MAP-E mapping
       rule."
    ::= { mapMIBGroups 1 }
mapMIBSecurityGroup OBJECT-GROUP
  OBJECTS {
     mapSecurityCheckInvalidv4,
     mapSecurityCheckInvalidv6 }
  STATUS current
 DESCRIPTION
     "The group of objects used to provide information on the
     MAP-E security checks."
  ::= { mapMIBGroups 2 }
 END
```

6. IANA Considerations

The MIB module in this document uses the following IANA-assigned OBJECT IDENTIFIER values recorded in the SMI Numbers registry:

Descriptor OBJECT IDENTIFIER value
----MAP-E-MIB { mib-2 242 }

7. Security Considerations

There are no management objects defined in this MIB module that have a MAX-ACCESS clause of read-write and/or read-create. So, if this MIB module is implemented correctly, then there is no risk that an intruder can alter or create any management objects of this MIB module via direct SNMP SET operations.

Some of the objects in this MIB module may be considered sensitive or vulnerable in some network environments. This includes INDEX objects with a MAX-ACCESS of not-accessible, and any indices from other modules exposed via AUGMENTS. It is thus important to control even GET and/or NOTIFY access to these objects and possibly to even encrypt the values of these objects when sending them over the network via SNMP. These are the tables and objects and their sensitivity/vulnerability:

mapRuleIPv6Prefix
mapRuleIPv6PrefixLen
mapRuleIPv4Prefix
mapRuleIPv4PrefixLen
mapRuleBRIPv6Address
mapRulePSID
mapRulePSIDLen
mapRuleOffset
mapRuleEALen
mapRuleType

Some of the MIB model's objects are vulnerable because the information that they hold may be used for targeting an attack against a MAP node (CE or BR). For example, an intruder could use the information to help deduce the customer IPv4 and IPv6 topologies and address-sharing ratios in use by the ISP.

SNMP versions prior to SNMPv3 did not include adequate security. Even if the network itself is secure (for example by using IPsec), there is no control as to who on the secure network is allowed to access and GET/SET (read/change/create/delete) the objects in this MIB module.

Implementations SHOULD provide the security features described by the SNMPv3 framework (see [RFC3410]), and implementations claiming compliance to the SNMPv3 standard MUST include full support for authentication and privacy via the User-based Security Model (USM) [RFC3414] with the AES cipher algorithm [RFC3826]. Implementations MAY also provide support for the Transport Security Model (TSM) [RFC5591] in combination with a secure transport such as SSH [RFC5592] or TLS/DTLS [RFC6353].

Further, deployment of SNMP versions prior to SNMPv3 is NOT RECOMMENDED. Instead, it is RECOMMENDED to deploy SNMPv3 and to enable cryptographic security. It is then a customer/operator responsibility to ensure that the SNMP entity giving access to an instance of this MIB module is properly configured to give access to the objects only to those principals (users) that have legitimate rights to indeed GET or SET (change/create/delete) them.

8. References

8.1. Normative References

- [RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate
 Requirement Levels", BCP 14, RFC 2119,
 DOI 10.17487/RFC2119, March 1997,
 https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2119.
- [RFC2578] McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J.
 Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Structure of Management Information
 Version 2 (SMIv2)", STD 58, RFC 2578,
 DOI 10.17487/RFC2578, April 1999,
 https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2578.

Fu, et al. Standards Track [Page 13]

- [RFC4001] Daniele, M., Haberman, B., Routhier, S., and J.
 Schoenwaelder, "Textual Conventions for Internet Network
 Addresses", RFC 4001, DOI 10.17487/RFC4001, February 2005,
 https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4001>.

- [RFC8174] Leiba, B., "Ambiguity of Uppercase vs Lowercase in RFC
 2119 Key Words", BCP 14, RFC 8174, DOI 10.17487/RFC8174,
 May 2017, https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc8174.

8.2. Informative References

- [RFC3410] Case, J., Mundy, R., Partain, D., and B. Stewart,
 "Introduction and Applicability Statements for Internet Standard Management Framework", RFC 3410,
 DOI 10.17487/RFC3410, December 2002,
 https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3410.

- [RFC3826] Blumenthal, U., Maino, F., and K. McCloghrie, "The
 Advanced Encryption Standard (AES) Cipher Algorithm in the
 SNMP User-based Security Model", RFC 3826,
 DOI 10.17487/RFC3826, June 2004,
 https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3826.
- [RFC5591] Harrington, D. and W. Hardaker, "Transport Security Model
 for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)",
 STD 78, RFC 5591, DOI 10.17487/RFC5591, June 2009,
 https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5591.
- [RFC5592] Harrington, D., Salowey, J., and W. Hardaker, "Secure Shell Transport Model for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", RFC 5592, DOI 10.17487/RFC5592, June 2009, https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5592.
- [RFC6353] Hardaker, W., "Transport Layer Security (TLS) Transport
 Model for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)",
 STD 78, RFC 6353, DOI 10.17487/RFC6353, July 2011,
 https://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6353.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank the following individuals for their valuable comments: David Harrington, Mark Townsley, Shishio Tsuchiya, Yong Cui, Suresh Krishnan, Bert Wijnen, Ian Farrer, and Juergen Schoenwaelder.

Fu, et al. Standards Track [Page 15]

Authors' Addresses

Yu Fu CNNIC No. 4 South 4th Street, Zhongguancun Beijing 100190 China

Email: eleven711711@foxmail.com

Sheng Jiang Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd Q14, Huawei Campus, No. 156 Beiqing Road Hai-Dian District, Beijing 100095 China

Email: jiangsheng@huawei.com

Bing Liu Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd Q14, Huawei Campus, No. 156 Beiqing Road Hai-Dian District, Beijing 100095 China

Email: leo.liubing@huawei.com

Jiang Dong Tsinghua University Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University Beijing 100084 China

Email: knight.dongjiang@gmail.com

Yuchi Chen Tsinghua University Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University Beijing 100084 China

Email: flashfoxmx@gmail.com