

Summary of Halmos' Naive Set Theory

Robin Adams

August 25, 2023

Contents

1	Primitive Terms and Axioms	2
2	Basic Properties and Operations on Sets	4
2.1	The Subset Relation	4
2.2	Comprehension Notation	4
2.3	The Empty Set	5
2.4	Unordered Pairs	5
2.5	Unions	5
2.6	Intersections	6
2.7	Unordered Triples	6
2.8	Relative Complements	7
2.9	Symmetric Difference	9
2.10	Power Sets	10
3	Relations and Functions	12
3.1	Ordered Pairs	12
3.2	Relations	13
3.3	Composition	13
3.4	Inverses	14
3.5	Equivalence Relations	14
3.6	Functions	15
3.7	Families	16
3.8	Inverses and Composites of Functions	18
3.9	Choice Functions	19
4	Equivalence	20
5	Order	21
6	Natural Numbers	25
6.1	Natural Numbers	25
6.2	Arithmetic	29
6.3	Order on the Natural Numbers	34
6.4	Finite Sets	37

Chapter 1

Primitive Terms and Axioms

Let there be *sets*. We assume that everything is a set.

Let there be a binary relation of *membership*, \in . If $x \in A$ we say that x *belongs to* A , x is an *element* of A , or x is *contained in* A . If this does not hold we write $x \notin A$.

Axiom 1.1 (Axiom of Extensionality). *Two sets are equal if and only if they have the same elements.*

Axiom 1.2 (Axiom of Comprehension, Aussonderungsaxiom). *To every set A and to every condition $S(x)$ there corresponds a set B whose elements are exactly those elements x of A for which $S(x)$ holds.*

Definition 1.3. Given a set A and a condition $S(x)$, we write $\{x \in A : S(x)\}$ for the set whose elements are exactly those elements x of A for which $S(x)$ holds.

PROOF: This exists by the Axiom of Comprehension and is unique by the Axiom of Extensionality. \square

Axiom 1.4 (Axiom of Pairing). *For any two sets, there exists a set that they both belong to.*

Definition 1.5 ((Unordered) Pair). For any sets a and b , the *(unordered) pair* $\{a, b\}$ is the set whose elements are just a and b .

PROOF: This exists by the Axioms of Pairing and Comprehension, and is unique by the Axiom of Extensionality. \square

Axiom 1.6 (Union Axiom). *For every set A , there exists a set that contains all the elements that belong to at least one element of A .*

Definition 1.7 (Subset). Let A and B be sets. We say that A is a *subset* of B , or B *includes* A , and write $A \subseteq B$ or $B \supseteq A$, iff every element of A is an element of B .

Axiom 1.8 (Power Set Axiom). *For any set A , there exists a set that contains all the subsets of A .*

Definition 1.9 (Empty). A set is *empty* iff it has no elements; otherwise it is *non-empty*.

Axiom 1.10 (Axiom of Infinity). *There exists a set I such that:*

- *I has an element that is empty*
- *for all $x \in I$, there exists $y \in I$ such that the elements of y are exactly x and the elements of x .*

Definition 1.11 (Ordered Pair). For any sets a and b , the *ordered pair* (a, b) is defined by

$$(a, b) := \{\{a\}, \{a, b\}\} .$$

Definition 1.12 (Power Set). For any set A , the *power set* of A , $\mathcal{P}A$, is the set whose elements are exactly the subsets of A .

PROOF: This exists by the Power Set Axiom and Axiom of Comprehension, and is unique by the Axiom of Extensionality. \square

Definition 1.13 (Cartesian Product). For any sets A and B , the *Cartesian product* $A \times B$ is

$$A \times B := \{p \in \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}(A \cup B) : \exists a \in A. \exists b \in B. p = (a, b)\} .$$

Definition 1.14 (Relation). A *relation* is a set of ordered pairs.

If R is a relation, we write xRy for $(x, y) \in R$.

Given sets X and Y , a relation *between X and Y* is a subset of $X \times Y$.

Given a set X , a relation *on X* is a relation between X and X .

Definition 1.15 (Function). Let X and Y be sets. A *function*, *map*, *mapping*, *transformation* or *operator* f from X to Y , $f : X \rightarrow Y$, is a relation f between X and Y such that, for all $x \in X$, there exists a unique $f(x) \in Y$, called the *value* of f at the *argument* x , such that $(x, f(x)) \in f$.

Definition 1.16 (Family). Let I and X be sets. A *family* of elements of X indexed by I is a function $a : I \rightarrow X$. We write a_i for $a(i)$, and $\{a_i\}_{i \in I}$ for a .

Definition 1.17 (Cartesian Product of a Family of Sets). Let $\{A_i\}_{i \in I}$ be a family of sets. The *Cartesian product* $\times_{i \in I} A_i$ is the set of all families $\{a_i\}_{i \in I}$ such that $\forall i \in I. a_i \in A_i$.

We write A^I for $\times_{i \in I} A$.

Axiom 1.18 (Axiom of Choice). *The Cartesian product of a non-empty family of non-empty sets is non-empty.*

Chapter 2

Basic Properties and Operations on Sets

2.1 The Subset Relation

Theorem 2.1. *For any set A , we have $A \subseteq A$.*

PROOF: Every element of A is an element of A . \square

Theorem 2.2. *For any sets A , B and C , if $A \subseteq B$ and $B \subseteq C$ then $A \subseteq C$.*

PROOF: If every element of A is an element of B , and every element of B is an element of C , then every element of A is an element of C . \square

Theorem 2.3. *For any sets A and B , if $A \subseteq B$ and $B \subseteq A$ then $A = B$.*

PROOF: If every element of A is an element of B , and every element of B is an element of A , then A and B have the same elements, and therefore are equal by the Axiom of Extensionality. \square

Definition 2.4 (Proper Subset). Let A and B be sets. We say that A is a *proper subset* of B , or B *properly includes* A , and write $A \subsetneq B$ or $B \supsetneq A$, iff $A \subseteq B$ and $A \neq B$.

2.2 Comprehension Notation

Theorem 2.5. *There is no set that contains every set.*

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. LET: A be a set.

PROVE: There exists a set B such that $B \notin A$.

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. LET: $B = \{x \in A : x \notin x\}$

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. If $B \in A$ then we have $B \in B$ if and only if $B \notin B$.

$\langle 1 \rangle 4$. $B \notin A$

\square

2.3 The Empty Set

Theorem 2.6. *There exists a set with no elements.*

PROOF: Immediate from the Axiom of Infinity. \square

Definition 2.7 (Empty Set). The *empty set* \emptyset is the set with no elements.

Theorem 2.8. *For any set A we have $\emptyset \subset A$.*

PROOF: Vacuous. \square

2.4 Unordered Pairs

Definition 2.9 (Singleton). For any set a , the *singleton* $\{a\}$ is defined to be $\{a, a\}$.

2.5 Unions

Definition 2.10 (Union). For any set \mathcal{C} , the *union* of \mathcal{C} , $\bigcup \mathcal{C}$, is the set whose elements are the elements of the elements of \mathcal{C} .

We write $\bigcup_{X \in \mathcal{A}} t[X]$ for $\bigcup \{t[X] \mid X \in \mathcal{A}\}$.

PROOF: This exists by the Union Axiom and Comprehension Axiom, and is unique by the Axiom of Extensionality. \square

Proposition 2.11.

$$\bigcup \emptyset = \emptyset$$

PROOF: There is no set that is an element of an element of \emptyset . \square

Proposition 2.12. *For any set A , we have $\bigcup \{A\} = A$.*

PROOF: For any x , we have x is an element of an element of $\{A\}$ if and only if x is an element of A . \square

Definition 2.13. We write $A \cup B$ for $\bigcup \{A, B\}$.

Proposition 2.14. *For any set A , we have $A \cup \emptyset = A$.*

PROOF: $x \in A \cup \emptyset$ iff $x \in A$ or $x \in \emptyset$, iff $x \in A$. \square

Proposition 2.15 (Idempotence). *For any set A , we have $A \cup A = A$.*

PROOF: $x \in A$ or $x \in A$ is equivalent to $x \in A$. \square

Proposition 2.16. *For any sets A and B , we have $A \subseteq B$ if and only if $A \cup B = B$.*

PROOF: For any x , the statement "if $x \in A$ then $x \in B$ " is equivalent to " $x \in A$ or $x \in B$ if and only if $x \in B$ ". \square

Proposition 2.17. *For any sets a and b , we have $\{a\} \cup \{b\} = \{a, b\}$.*

PROOF: Immediate from definitions. \square

2.6 Intersections

Definition 2.18 (Intersection). For any sets A and B , the *intersection* $A \cap B$ is defined to be $\{x \in A : x \in B\}$.

Proposition 2.19. For any set A , we have $A \cap \emptyset = \emptyset$.

PROOF: There is no x such that $x \in A$ and $x \in \emptyset$. \square

Proposition 2.20. For any set A , we have

$$A \cap A = A \text{ .}$$

PROOF: We have $x \in A$ and $x \in A$ if and only if $x \in A$. \square

Proposition 2.21. For any sets A and B , we have $A \subseteq B$ if and only if $A \cap B = A$.

PROOF: For any x , the statement "if $x \in A$ then $x \in B$ " is equivalent to " $x \in A$ and $x \in B$ if and only if $x \in A$ ". \square

Proposition 2.22. For any sets A , B and C , we have $C \subseteq A$ if and only if $(A \cap B) \cup C = A \cap (B \cup C)$.

PROOF: The statement "if $x \in C$ then $x \in A$ " is equivalent to the statement " $((x \in A \wedge x \in B) \vee x \in C) \Leftrightarrow (x \in A \wedge (x \in B \vee x \in C))$ ". \square

Definition 2.23 (Disjoint). Two sets A and B are *disjoint* if and only if $A \cap B = \emptyset$.

Definition 2.24 (Pairwise Disjoint). Let A be a set. We say the elements of A are *pairwise disjoint* if and only if, for all $x, y \in A$, if $x \cap y \neq \emptyset$ then $x = y$.

Definition 2.25 (Intersection). For any nonempty set \mathcal{C} , the *intersection* of \mathcal{C} , $\bigcap \mathcal{C}$, is the set that contains exactly those sets that belong to every element of \mathcal{C} .

We write $\bigcap_{X \in \mathcal{A}} t[X]$ for $\bigcap \{t[X] \mid X \in \mathcal{A}\}$.

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. LET: \mathcal{C} be a nonempty set.

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. There exists a set I whose elements are exactly the sets that belong to every element of \mathcal{C} .

PROOF: Pick $A \in \mathcal{C}$, and take $I = \{x \in A : \forall X \in \mathcal{C}. x \in X\}$.

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. For any sets I, J , if the elements of I and J are exactly the sets that belong to every element of \mathcal{C} then $I = J$.

PROOF: Axiom of Extensionality.

\square

2.7 Unordered Triples

Definition 2.26 ((Unordered) Triple). Given sets a_1, \dots, a_n , define the (*unordered*) *n-tuple* $\{a_1, \dots, a_n\}$ to be

$$\{a_1, \dots, a_n\} := \{a_1\} \cup \dots \cup \{a_n\} \text{ .}$$

2.8 Relative Complements

Definition 2.27 (Relative Complement). For any sets A and B , the *difference* or *relative complement* $A - B$ is defined to be

$$A - B := \{x \in A : x \notin B\} .$$

Proposition 2.28. For any sets A and E , we have $A \subseteq E$ if and only if

$$E - (E - A) = A$$

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. LET: A and E be sets.

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. If $A \subseteq E$ then $E - (E - A) = A$

$\langle 2 \rangle 1$. ASSUME: $A \subseteq E$

$\langle 2 \rangle 2$. $E - (E - A) \subseteq A$

PROOF: If $x \in E$ and $x \notin E - A$ then $x \in A$.

$\langle 2 \rangle 3$. $A \subseteq E - (E - A)$

PROOF: If $x \in A$ then $x \in E$ and $x \notin E - A$.

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. If $E - (E - A) = A$ then $A \subseteq E$.

PROOF: Since $E - (E - A) \subseteq E$.

□

Proposition 2.29. For any set E we have

$$E - \emptyset = E$$

PROOF: $x \in E$ if and only if $x \in E$ and $x \notin \emptyset$. □

Proposition 2.30. For any set E we have

$$E - E = \emptyset .$$

PROOF: There is no x such that $x \in E$ and $x \notin E$. □

Proposition 2.31. For any sets A and E , we have

$$A \cap (E - A) = \emptyset .$$

PROOF: There is no x such that $x \in A$ and $x \in E - A$. □

Proposition 2.32. Let A and E be sets. Then $A \subseteq E$ if and only if

$$A \cup (E - A) = E .$$

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. LET: A and E be sets.

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. If $A \subseteq E$ then $A \cup (E - A) = E$.

$\langle 2 \rangle 1$. ASSUME: $A \subseteq E$

$\langle 2 \rangle 2$. $A \cup (E - A) \subseteq E$

PROOF: If $x \in A$ or $x \in E - A$ then $x \in E$.

$\langle 2 \rangle 3$. $E \subseteq A \cup (E - A)$

PROOF: If $x \in E$ then either $x \in A$ or $x \notin A$. In the latter case, $x \in E - A$.

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. If $A \cup (E - A) = E$ then $A \subseteq E$

PROOF: Since $A \subseteq A \cup (E - A)$.

□

Proposition 2.33. *Let A , B and E be sets. Then:*

1. *If $A \subseteq B$ then $E - B \subseteq E - A$.*

2. *If $A \subseteq E$ and $E - B \subseteq E - A$ then $A \subseteq B$.*

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. LET: A , B and E be sets.

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. If $A \subseteq B$ then $E - B \subseteq E - A$.

PROOF: If $A \subseteq B$, $x \in E$ and $x \notin B$, then we have $x \in E$ and $x \notin A$.

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. If $A \subseteq E$ and $E - B \subseteq E - A$ then $A \subseteq B$.

$\langle 2 \rangle 1$. ASSUME: $A \subseteq E$

$\langle 2 \rangle 2$. ASSUME: $E - B \subseteq E - A$

$\langle 2 \rangle 3$. LET: $x \in A$

$\langle 2 \rangle 4$. $x \in E$

$\langle 2 \rangle 5$. $x \notin E - A$

$\langle 2 \rangle 6$. $x \notin E - B$

$\langle 2 \rangle 7$. $x \in B$

□

Example 2.34. We cannot remove the hypothesis $A \subseteq E$ in item 2 above. Let $E = \emptyset$, $A = \{\emptyset\}$ and $B = \emptyset$. Then $E - B = E - A = \emptyset$ but $A \not\subseteq B$.

Proposition 2.35 (De Morgan's Law). *For any sets A , B and E , we have $E - (A \cup B) = (E - A) \cap (E - B)$.*

PROOF: $(x \in E \wedge \neg(x \in A \vee x \in B)) \Leftrightarrow (x \in E \wedge x \notin A \wedge x \in E \wedge x \notin B)$. □

Proposition 2.36 (De Morgan's Law). *For any sets A , B and E , we have $E - (A \cap B) = (E - A) \cup (E - B)$.*

PROOF: $(x \in E \vee \neg(x \in A \wedge x \in B)) \Leftrightarrow (x \in E \wedge x \notin A) \vee (x \in E \wedge x \notin B)$. □

Proposition 2.37. *For any sets A , B and E , if $A \subseteq E$ then*

$$A - B = A \cap (E - B) .$$

PROOF: If $A \subseteq E$ then we have $(x \in A \wedge x \notin B) \Leftrightarrow (x \in A \wedge x \in E \wedge x \notin B)$. □

Proposition 2.38. *For any sets A and B , we have $A \subseteq B$ if and only if $A - B = \emptyset$.*

PROOF: Both are equivalent to the statement that there is no x such that $x \in A$ and $x \notin B$. □

Proposition 2.39. *For any sets A and B , we have*

$$A - (A - B) = A \cap B .$$

PROOF: $(x \in A \wedge \neg(x \in A \wedge x \notin B)) \Leftrightarrow x \in A \wedge x \in B$. \square

Proposition 2.40. *For any sets A , B and C , we have*

$$A \cap (B - C) = (A \cap B) - (A \cap C) .$$

PROOF: $(x \in A \wedge x \in B \wedge x \notin C) \Leftrightarrow (x \in A \wedge x \in B \wedge \neg(x \in A \wedge x \in C))$. \square

Proposition 2.41. *For any sets A , B , C and E , if $(A \cap B) - C \subseteq E$ then we have*

$$A \cap B \subseteq (A \cap C) \cup (B \cap (E - C)) .$$

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. LET: $x \in A \cap B$

PROVE: $x \in (A \cap C) \cup (B \cap (E - C))$

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. CASE: $x \in C$

PROOF: Then $x \in A \cap C$.

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. CASE: $x \notin C$

PROOF: Then $x \in E$ and so $x \in B \cap (E - C)$.

\square

Proposition 2.42. *For any sets A , B , C and E , we have*

$$(A \cup C) \cap (B \cup (E - C)) \subseteq A \cup B .$$

PROOF: The statement $(x \in A \vee x \in C) \wedge (x \in B \vee (x \in E \wedge x \notin C))$ implies $x \in A \vee x \in B$. \square

Proposition 2.43 (De Morgan's Law). *Let E be a set and \mathcal{C} a nonempty set. Then*

$$E - \bigcup_{X \in \mathcal{C}} X = \bigcap_{X \in \mathcal{C}} (E - X) .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 2.44 (De Morgan's Law). *Let E be a set and \mathcal{C} a nonempty set. Then*

$$E - \bigcap_{X \in \mathcal{C}} X = \bigcup_{X \in \mathcal{C}} (E - X) .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

2.9 Symmetric Difference

Definition 2.45 (Symmetric Difference). For any sets A and B , the *symmetric difference* $A + B$ is defined to be

$$A + B := (A - B) \cup (B - A) .$$

Proposition 2.46. *For any sets A and B , we have*

$$A + B = B + A$$

PROOF: From the commutativity of union. \square

Proposition 2.47. *For any sets A , B and C , we have*

$$A + (B + C) = (A + B) + C .$$

PROOF: Each is the set of all x that belong to either exactly one or all three of A , B and C . \square

Proposition 2.48. *For any set A , we have*

$$A + \emptyset = A .$$

PROOF:

$$\begin{aligned} A + \emptyset &= (A - \emptyset) \cup (\emptyset - A) \\ &= A \cup \emptyset \\ &= A \end{aligned}$$

\square

Proposition 2.49. *For any set A we have*

$$A + A = \emptyset .$$

PROOF:

$$\begin{aligned} A + A &= (A - A) \cup (A - A) \\ &= \emptyset \cup \emptyset \\ &= \emptyset \end{aligned}$$

\square

2.10 Power Sets

Proposition 2.50.

$$\mathcal{P}\emptyset = \{\emptyset\}$$

PROOF: The only subset of \emptyset is \emptyset . \square

Proposition 2.51. *For any set a , we have*

$$\mathcal{P}\{a\} = \{\emptyset, \{a\}\} .$$

PROOF: The only subsets of $\{a\}$ are \emptyset and $\{a\}$. \square

Proposition 2.52. *For any sets a and b , we have*

$$\mathcal{P}\{a, b\} = \{\emptyset, \{a\}, \{b\}, \{a, b\}\} .$$

PROOF: The only subsets of $\{a, b\}$ are \emptyset , $\{a\}$, $\{b\}$ and $\{a, b\}$. \square

Proposition 2.53. *For any nonempty set \mathcal{C} we have*

$$\bigcap_{X \in \mathcal{C}} \mathcal{P}X = \mathcal{P}\left(\bigcap \mathcal{C}\right) .$$

PROOF:

$$\begin{aligned} x \in \bigcup_{X \in \mathcal{C}} \mathcal{P}X &\Leftrightarrow \forall X \in \mathcal{C}. x \subseteq X \\ &\Leftrightarrow \forall X \in \mathcal{C}. \forall y \in x. y \in X \\ &\Leftrightarrow \forall y \in x. \forall X \in \mathcal{C}. y \in X \\ &\Leftrightarrow x \subseteq \bigcap \mathcal{C} \end{aligned}$$

□

Proposition 2.54. *For any set \mathcal{C} we have*

$$\bigcup_{X \in \mathcal{C}} \mathcal{P}X \subseteq \mathcal{P}\bigcup \mathcal{C} .$$

PROOF: If there exists $X \in \mathcal{C}$ such that $x \subseteq X$ then $x \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{C}$. □

Proposition 2.55. *For any set E , we have*

$$\bigcap \mathcal{P}E = \emptyset .$$

PROOF: Since $\emptyset \in \mathcal{P}E$. □

Proposition 2.56. *For any sets E and F , if $E \subseteq F$ then $\mathcal{P}E \subseteq \mathcal{P}F$.*

PROOF: If $E \subseteq F$ and $X \subseteq E$ then $X \subseteq F$. □

Chapter 3

Relations and Functions

3.1 Ordered Pairs

Proposition 3.1. *For any sets a, b, x and y , if $(a, b) = (x, y)$ then $a = x$ and $b = y$.*

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. LET: a, b, x and y be sets.

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. ASSUME: $(a, b) = (x, y)$

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. $a = x$

PROOF: $\{a\} = \bigcap(a, b) = \bigcap(x, y) = \{x\}$.

$\langle 1 \rangle 4$. $\{a, b\} = \{x, y\}$

$\langle 1 \rangle 5$. CASE: $a = b$

$\langle 2 \rangle 1$. $x = y$

PROOF: Since $\{x, y\} = \{a, b\}$ is a singleton.

$\langle 2 \rangle 2$. $b = y$

PROOF: $b = a = x = y$

$\langle 1 \rangle 6$. CASE: $a \neq b$

$\langle 2 \rangle 1$. $x \neq y$

PROOF: Since $\{x, y\} = \{a, b\}$ is not a singleton.

$\langle 2 \rangle 2$. $b = y$

PROOF: $\{b\} = \{a, b\} - \{a\} = \{x, y\} - \{x\} = \{y\}$.

□

Proposition 3.2. *For any sets A, B and X , we have*

$$(A - B) \times X = (A \times X) - (B \times X) .$$

PROOF: Easy. □

Proposition 3.3. *For any sets A and B , we have $A \times B = \emptyset$ if and only if $A = \emptyset$ or $B = \emptyset$.*

PROOF: Easy. □

Proposition 3.4. For any sets A, B, X and Y , if $A \subseteq X$ and $B \subseteq Y$ then $A \times B \subseteq X \times Y$. The converse holds assuming $A \neq \emptyset$ and $B \neq \emptyset$.

PROOF: Easy. \square

3.2 Relations

Definition 3.5 (Domain). The *domain* of a relation R is the set

$$\text{dom } R := \left\{ x \in \bigcup \bigcup R : \exists y. (x, y) \in R \right\} .$$

Definition 3.6 (Range). The *range* of a relation R is the set

$$\text{ran } R := \left\{ y \in \bigcup \bigcup R : \exists x. (x, y) \in R \right\} .$$

Definition 3.7 (Reflexive). Let R be a relation on X . Then R is *reflexive* iff, for all $x \in X$, we have xRx .

Definition 3.8 (Symmetric). Let R be a relation on X . Then R is *symmetric* iff, whenever xRy , then yRx .

Definition 3.9 (Antisymmetric). A relation R is *antisymmetric* iff, whenever xRy and yRx , then $x = y$.

Definition 3.10 (Transitive). Let R be a relation on X . Then R is *transitive* iff, whenever xRy and yRz , then xRz .

Definition 3.11 (Identity Relation). For any set X , the *identity relation* I_X on X is

$$I_X = \{(x, x) : x \in X\} .$$

3.3 Composition

Definition 3.12 (Composition). Let R be a relation between X and Y , and S a relation between Y and Z . The *composite* or *relative product* $S \circ R = SR$ is the relation between X and Z defined by

$$x(S \circ R)z \Leftrightarrow \exists y \in Y (xRy \wedge ySz) .$$

Proposition 3.13. Let R be a relation between X and Y , S a relation between Y and Z , and T a relation between Z and W . Then

$$T(SR) = (TS)R .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Example 3.14. Composition of relations is not commutative in general. Let $X = \{a, b\}$ where $a \neq b$. Let $R = \{(a, a), (b, a)\}$ and $S = \{(a, b), (b, b)\}$. Then $SR = S$ but $RS = R \neq S$.

Proposition 3.15. A relation R is transitive if and only if $RR \subseteq R$.

PROOF: Easy. \square

3.4 Inverses

Definition 3.16 (Inverse). Let R be a relation between X and Y . The *inverse* or *converse* R^{-1} is the relation between Y and X defined by

$$yR^{-1}x \Leftrightarrow xRy .$$

Proposition 3.17. *For any relation R , we have*

$$\text{dom } R^{-1} = \text{ran } R .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.18. *For any relation R , we have*

$$\text{ran } R^{-1} = \text{dom } R .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.19. *Let R be a relation between X and Y , and S a relation between Y and Z . Then*

$$(SR)^{-1} = R^{-1}S^{-1} .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.20. *A relation R is symmetric if and only if $R \subseteq R^{-1}$.*

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.21. *Let R be a relation between X and Y . Then*

$$I_Y R = R I_X = R .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.22. *A relation R on a set X is reflexive if and only if $I_X \subseteq R$.*

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.23. *Let R be a relation on a set X . Then R is antisymmetric iff $R \cap R^{-1} \subseteq I_X$.*

PROOF: Easy. \square

3.5 Equivalence Relations

Definition 3.24 (Equivalence Relation). Let R be a relation on X . Then R is an *equivalence relation* iff it is reflexive, symmetric and transitive.

Definition 3.25 (Partition). Let X be a set. A *partition* of X is a pairwise disjoint set of nonempty subsets of X whose union is X .

Definition 3.26 (Equivalence Class). Let R be an equivalence relation on X . Let $x \in X$. The *equivalence class* of x with respect to R is

$$x/R := \{y \in X : xRy\} .$$

We write X/R for the set of all equivalence classes with respect to R .

Definition 3.27 (Induced). Let P be a partition of X . The relation *induced* by P is X/P where $x(X/P)y$ iff there exists $X \in P$ such that $x \in X$ and $y \in X$.

Theorem 3.28. *Let R be an equivalence relation on X . Then X/R is a partition of X that induces the relation R .*

PROOF: Easy. \square

Theorem 3.29. *Let P be a partition of X . Then X/P is an equivalence relation on X , and $P = X/(X/P)$.*

PROOF: Easy. \square

3.6 Functions

Definition 3.30 (Onto). Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$. We say f maps X *onto* Y iff $\text{ran } f = Y$.

Definition 3.31 (Image). Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$ and $A \subseteq X$. The *image* of A under f is

$$f(A) := \{f(x) : x \in A\} .$$

Definition 3.32 (Inclusion Map). Let Y be a set and $X \subseteq Y$. Then the *inclusion map* $i : X \hookrightarrow Y$ is the function defined by $i(x) = x$ for all $x \in X$.

Proposition 3.33. *For any set X , the identity relation I_X is a function $X \rightarrow X$.*

PROOF: Easy. \square

Definition 3.34 (Restriction). Let $f : Y \rightarrow Z$ and $X \subseteq Y$. The *restriction* of f to X is the function $f \upharpoonright X : X \rightarrow Z$ defined by

$$(f \upharpoonright X)(x) = f(x) \quad (x \in X) .$$

Given sets X, Y and Z with $X \subseteq Y$, if $f : X \rightarrow Z$ and $g : Y \rightarrow Z$, we say g is an *extension* of f to Y iff $f = g \upharpoonright X$.

Definition 3.35 (Projection). Given sets X and Y , the *projection* maps $\pi_1 : X \times Y \rightarrow X$ and $\pi_2 : X \times Y \rightarrow Y$ are defined by

$$\pi_1(x, y) = x, \quad \pi_2(x, y) = y \quad (x \in X, y \in Y) .$$

Definition 3.36 (Canonical Map). Let X be a set and R an equivalence relation on X . The *canonical map* $\pi : X \rightarrow X/R$ is the map defined by $\pi(x) = x/R$.

Definition 3.37 (One-to-One). A function $f : X \rightarrow Y$ is *one-to-one*, or a *one-to-one correspondence*, iff, for all $x, y \in X$, if $f(x) = f(y)$ then $x = y$.

Proposition 3.38. Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$. Then the following are equivalent:

1. f is one-to-one.
2. For all $A, B \subseteq X$, we have $f(A \cap B) = f(A) \cap f(B)$.
3. For all $A \subseteq X$, we have $f(X - A) \subseteq Y - f(A)$.

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.39. Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$. Then f maps X onto Y if and only if, for all $A \subseteq X$, we have $Y - f(A) \subseteq f(X - A)$.

PROOF: Easy. \square

3.7 Families

Proposition 3.40 (Generalized Associative Law for Unions). Let $\{I_j\}_{j \in J}$ be a family of sets. Let $K = \bigcup_{j \in J} I_j$. Let $\{A_k\}_{k \in K}$ be a family of sets indexed by K . Then

$$\bigcup_{k \in K} A_k = \bigcup_{j \in J} \bigcup_{i \in I_j} A_i .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.41 (Generalized Commutative Law for Unions). Let $\{I_j\}_{j \in J}$ be a family of sets. Let $f : J \rightarrow J$ be a one-to-one correspondence from J onto J . Then

$$\bigcup_{j \in J} I_j = \bigcup_{j \in J} I_{f(j)} .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.42 (Generalized Associative Law for Intersections). Let $\{I_j\}_{j \in J}$ be a nonempty family of nonempty sets. Let $K = \bigcup_{j \in J} I_j$. Let $\{A_k\}_{k \in K}$ be a family of sets indexed by K . Then

$$\bigcap_{k \in K} A_k = \bigcap_{j \in J} \bigcap_{i \in I_j} A_i .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.43 (Generalized Commutative Law for Intersections). Let $\{I_j\}_{j \in J}$ be a nonempty family of sets. Let $f : J \rightarrow J$ be a one-to-one correspondence from J onto J . Then

$$\bigcap_{j \in J} I_j = \bigcap_{j \in J} I_{f(j)} .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.44. *Let B be a set and $\{A_i\}_{i \in I}$ a family of sets. Then*

$$B \cap \bigcup_{i \in I} A_i = \bigcup_{i \in I} (B \cap A_i)$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.45. *Let B be a set and $\{A_i\}_{i \in I}$ a nonempty family of sets. Then*

$$B \cup \bigcap_{i \in I} A_i = \bigcap_{i \in I} (B \cup A_i)$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Definition 3.46 (Projection). Let $\{A_i\}_{i \in I}$ be a family of sets and $i \in I$. The projection function $\pi_i : \times_{i \in I} A_i \rightarrow A_i$ is defined by $\pi_i(a) = a_i$.

Proposition 3.47. *Let $\{A_i\}_{i \in I}$ and $\{B_j\}_{j \in J}$ be families of sets. Then*

$$\left(\bigcup_{i \in I} A_i \right) \times \left(\bigcup_{j \in J} B_j \right) = \bigcup_{i \in I} \bigcup_{j \in J} (A_i \times B_j) .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.48. *Let $\{A_i\}_{i \in I}$ and $\{B_j\}_{j \in J}$ be nonempty families of sets. Then*

$$\left(\bigcap_{i \in I} A_i \right) \times \left(\bigcap_{j \in J} B_j \right) = \bigcap_{i \in I} \bigcap_{j \in J} (A_i \times B_j) .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.49. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$. Let $\{A_i\}_{i \in I}$ be a family of subsets of X . Then*

$$f \left(\bigcup_{i \in I} A_i \right) = \bigcup_{i \in I} f(A_i) .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Example 3.50. It is not true in general that, if $f : X \rightarrow Y$ and $\{A_i\}_{i \in I}$ is a nonempty family of subsets of X , then $f(\bigcap_{i \in I} A_i) = \bigcap_{i \in I} f(A_i)$.

Take $X = \{a, b\}$ and $Y = \{c\}$ where $a \neq b$. Take $I = \{i, j\}$ with $i \neq j$. Let $A_i = \{a\}$ and $A_j = \{b\}$. Let f be the unique function $X \rightarrow Y$. Then $f(\bigcap_{i \in I} A_i) = f(\emptyset) = \emptyset$ but $\bigcap_{i \in I} f(A_i) = \{c\}$.

3.8 Inverses and Composites of Functions

Definition 3.51 (Inverse). Given a function $f : X \rightarrow Y$, the *inverse* of f is the function $f^{-1} : \mathcal{P}Y \rightarrow \mathcal{P}X$ defined by

$$f^{-1}(B) = \{x \in X : f(x) \in B\} .$$

We call $f^{-1}(B)$ the *inverse image* of B under f .

Proposition 3.52. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$. Then f maps X onto Y if and only if the inverse image of any nonempty subset of Y is nonempty.*

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.53. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$. Then f is one-to-one if and only if the inverse image of any singleton subset of Y is a singleton.*

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.54. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$. Let $B \subseteq Y$. Then*

$$f(f^{-1}(B)) \subseteq B .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.55. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$. Let $A \subseteq X$. Then*

$$A \subseteq f^{-1}(f(A)) .$$

Equality holds if f is one-to-one.

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.56. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$. Let $\{B_i\}_{i \in I}$ be a family of subsets of Y . Then*

$$f^{-1}\left(\bigcup_{i \in I} B_i\right) = \bigcup_{i \in I} f^{-1}(B_i) .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.57. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$. Let $\{B_i\}_{i \in I}$ be a nonempty family of subsets of Y . Then*

$$f^{-1}\left(\bigcap_{i \in I} B_i\right) = \bigcap_{i \in I} f^{-1}(B_i) .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.58. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$ and $B \subseteq Y$. Then $f^{-1}(Y - B) = X - f^{-1}(B)$.*

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.59. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$ be one-to-one. Then the inverse of f as a relation, f^{-1} , is a function $f^{-1} : \text{ran } f \rightarrow X$, and for all $y \in \text{ran } f$, we have $f^{-1}(y)$ is the unique x such that $f(x) = y$.*

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.60. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$ and $g : Y \rightarrow Z$. Then $gf : X \rightarrow Z$ and, for all $x \in X$, we have*

$$(g \circ f)(x) = g(f(x)) .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Example 3.61. Example 3.14 shows that function composition is not commutative in general.

Proposition 3.62. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$ and $g : Y \rightarrow Z$. Then*

$$(gf)^{-1} = f^{-1}g^{-1} : \mathcal{P}Z \rightarrow \mathcal{P}X .$$

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 3.63. *Let $f : X \rightarrow Y$ and $g : Y \rightarrow X$. If $gf = I_X$ then f is one-to-one and g maps Y onto X .*

PROOF: Easy. \square

3.9 Choice Functions

Definition 3.64 (Choice Function). A *choice function* for a set X is a function $f : \mathcal{P}X - \{\emptyset\} \rightarrow X$ such that $f(S) \in S$ for all S .

Proposition 3.65. *Every set has a choice function.*

PROOF: Given a nonempty set X , apply the Axiom of Choice to the family $\{S\}_{S \in \mathcal{P}X - \{\emptyset\}}$. \square

Proposition 3.66. *For any relation R , there exists a function $f \subseteq R$ such that $\text{dom } f = \text{dom } R$.*

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. LET: R be a relation.

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. PICK a choice function g for $\text{ran } R$.

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. LET: $f : \text{dom } R \rightarrow \text{ran } R$ be the function $f(x) = g(\{y \in \text{ran } R : xRy\})$

$\langle 1 \rangle 4$. $f \subseteq R$ and $\text{dom } f = \text{dom } R$.

\square

Proposition 3.67. *If \mathcal{C} is a set of pairwise disjoint nonempty sets, then there exists a set A such that, for all $C \in \mathcal{C}$, we have $A \cap C$ is a singleton.*

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. LET: f be a choice function for $\bigcup \mathcal{C}$

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. LET: $A = \{f(C) : C \in \mathcal{C}\}$

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. For all $C \in \mathcal{C}$ we have $A \cap C = \{f(C)\}$

\square

Chapter 4

Equivalence

Definition 4.1 (Equivalent). Sets E and F are *equivalent*, $E \sim F$, iff there exists a one-to-one correspondence between them.

Proposition 4.2. *For any set X , equivalence is an equivalence relation on $\mathcal{P}X$.*

PROOF: Easy.

Chapter 5

Order

Definition 5.1 (Partial Order). A *partial order* on a set X is a relation on X that is reflexive, antisymmetric and transitive.

A *partially ordered set* or *poset* is a pair (X, \leq) such that \leq is a partial order on X . We write X for the poset (X, \leq) .

Given a partial order \leq , we write \geq for the inverse of \leq .

We write $x < y$ or $y > x$ for $x \leq y \wedge x \neq y$. When this holds, we say x is *less than y*, *smaller than y*, or a *predecessor* of y ; and y is *greater than x*, *larger than x*, or a *successor* of x .

Proposition 5.2. *For any set X , the relation \subseteq is a partial order on $\mathcal{P}X$.*

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 5.3. *In a poset, we never have $x < y$ and $y < x$.*

PROOF: We would then have $x \leq y$ and $y \leq x$ hence $x = y$ by antisymmetry. But if $x < y$ or $y < x$ then $x \neq y$. \square

Proposition 5.4. *The relation $<$ is transitive.*

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. ASSUME: $x < y$ and $y < z$

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. $x \leq y$ and $y \leq z$

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. $x \leq z$

PROOF: Since \leq is transitive.

$\langle 1 \rangle 4$. $x \neq z$

PROOF: By Proposition 5.3.

\square

Proposition 5.5. *Let $<$ be a transitive relation on X such that we never have $x < y$ and $y < x$. Define \leq by: $x \leq y$ iff $x < y$ or $x = y$. Then \leq is a partial order on X .*

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1.$ \leq is reflexive.

PROOF: By definition.

$\langle 1 \rangle 2.$ \leq is asymmetric.

PROOF: If $x \leq y$ and $y \leq x$, we must have $x = y$, because otherwise we would have $x < y$ and $y < x$.

$\langle 1 \rangle 3.$ \leq is transitive.

$\langle 2 \rangle 1.$ LET: $x \leq y$ and $y \leq z$

$\langle 2 \rangle 2.$ CASE: $x = y$

PROOF: We have $y \leq z$ so $x \leq z$.

$\langle 2 \rangle 3.$ CASE: $y = z$

PROOF: We have $x \leq y$ so $x \leq z$.

$\langle 2 \rangle 4.$ CASE: $x < y$ and $y < z$

PROOF: We have $x < z$ by transitivity, so $x \leq z$.

□

Definition 5.6 ((Strict) Initial Segment). Let X be a poset and $a \in X$. The *(strict) initial segment* determined by a is

$$s(a) := \{x \in X : x < a\} .$$

Definition 5.7 (Weak Initial Segment). Let X be a poset and $a \in X$. The *weak initial segment* determined by a is

$$\bar{s}(a) := \{x \in X : x \leq a\} .$$

Definition 5.8 (Immediate Successor). Let X be a poset and $x, y \in X$. Then y is the *immediate successor* of x , and x is the *immediate predecessor* of y , iff $x < y$ and there is no z such that $x < z < y$.

Definition 5.9 (Least). Let X be a partial order and $a \in X$. Then a is *least* in X iff $\forall x \in X. a \leq x$.

Proposition 5.10. *A poset has at most one least element.*

PROOF: If a and b are least then $a \leq b$ and $b \leq a$, hence $a = b$. □

Definition 5.11 (Greatest). Let X be a partial order and $a \in X$. Then a is *greatest* in X iff $\forall x \in X. x \leq a$.

Proposition 5.12. *A poset has at most one greatest element.*

PROOF: If a and b are greatest then $a \leq b$ and $b \leq a$, hence $a = b$. □

Definition 5.13 (Minimal). Let X be a poset and $a \in X$. Then a is *minimal* iff there is no $x \in X$ such that $x < a$.

Definition 5.14 (Maximal). Let X be a poset and $a \in X$. Then a is *maximal* iff there is no $x \in X$ such that $a < x$.

Definition 5.15 (Lower Bound). Let X be a poset. Let $E \subseteq X$ and $a \in X$. Then a is a *lower bound* for E iff $\forall x \in E. a \leq x$.

Definition 5.16 (Upper Bound). Let X be a poset. Let $E \subseteq X$ and $a \in X$. Then a is an *upper bound* for E iff $\forall x \in E. x \leq a$.

Definition 5.17 (Greatest Lower Bound, Infimum). Let X be a poset. Let $E \subseteq X$ and $a \in X$. Then a is the *greatest lower bound* or *infimum* for E iff a is the greatest element in the set of lower bounds for E .

Definition 5.18 (Least Upper Bound, Supremum). Let X be a poset. Let $E \subseteq X$ and $a \in X$. Then a is the *least upper bound* or *supremum* for E iff a is the least element in the set of upper bounds for E .

Definition 5.19 (Total Order). A partial order \leq on a set X is a *total order*, *simple order* or *linear order* iff, for all $x, y \in X$, either $x \leq y$ or $y \leq x$. We then call the poset (X, \leq) a *linearly ordered set* or a *chain*.

Proposition 5.20. Let R be a partial order on X . Then R is total if and only if $X^2 \subseteq R \cup R^{-1}$.

PROOF: Easy. \square

Proposition 5.21. For any set X , the relation \subseteq is a total order on X iff X is either \emptyset or a singleton.

PROOF: Easy. \square

Theorem 5.22 (Zorn's Lemma). Let X be a poset such that every chain in X has an upper bound. Then X has a maximal element.

PROOF:

$\langle 1 \rangle 1$. PICK a choice function f for X .

$\langle 1 \rangle 2$. LET: \mathcal{X} be the set of chains in X .

$\langle 1 \rangle 3$. For all $A \in \mathcal{X}$,

LET: $\hat{A} = \{x \in X : A \cup \{x\} \in \mathcal{X}\}$

$\langle 1 \rangle 4$. LET: $g : \mathcal{X} \rightarrow \mathcal{X}$ be the function

$$g(A) = \begin{cases} A \cup \{f(\hat{A} - A)\} & \text{if } \hat{A} - A \neq \emptyset \\ A & \text{if } \hat{A} - A = \emptyset \end{cases}$$

$\langle 1 \rangle 5$. For $\mathcal{T} \subseteq \mathcal{X}$, let us say \mathcal{T} is a *tower* iff:

- $\emptyset \in \mathcal{T}$
- $\forall A \in \mathcal{T}. g(A) \in \mathcal{T}$
- For every chain \mathcal{C} in \mathcal{T} , we have $\bigcup \mathcal{C} \in \mathcal{T}$

$\langle 1 \rangle 6$. LET: \mathcal{T}_0 be the intersection of the set of all towers.

PROOF: The set of all towers is nonempty since \mathcal{X} is a tower.

$\langle 1 \rangle 7$. LET: $A = \bigcup \mathcal{T}_0$

$\langle 1 \rangle 8$. A is a chain in X .

$\langle 2 \rangle 1$. \mathcal{T}_0 is a chain under \subseteq

$\langle 3 \rangle 1$. Given $C \in \mathcal{T}_0$, let us say that C is *comparable* iff, for all $A \in \mathcal{T}_0$, either $A \subseteq C$ or $C \subseteq A$.

$\langle 3 \rangle 2$. For all $A, C \in \mathcal{T}_0$, if C is comparable and $A \subsetneq C$ then $g(A) \subseteq C$.
 PROOF: Since $g(A) - A$ has at most one element, so if $A \subsetneq C \subseteq g(A)$ then $C = g(A)$.
 $\langle 3 \rangle 3$. For $C \in \mathcal{T}_0$ comparable,
 LET: $\mathcal{U}_C = \{A \in \mathcal{T}_0 : A \subseteq C \vee g(C) \subseteq A\}$
 $\langle 3 \rangle 4$. For $C \in \mathcal{T}_0$ comparable, \mathcal{U}_C is a tower.
 $\langle 4 \rangle 1$. LET: $C \in \mathcal{T}_0$ be comparable
 $\langle 4 \rangle 2$. $\emptyset \in \mathcal{U}_C$
 PROOF: Since $\emptyset \subseteq C$.
 $\langle 4 \rangle 3$. $\forall A \in \mathcal{U}_C. g(A) \in \mathcal{U}_C$
 PROOF: By $\langle 1 \rangle 8$.
 $\langle 4 \rangle 4$. For every chain $\mathcal{C} \subseteq \mathcal{U}_C$ we have $\bigcup \mathcal{C} \in \mathcal{U}_C$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 1$. LET: $\mathcal{C} \subseteq \mathcal{U}_C$ be a chain.
 $\langle 5 \rangle 2$. CASE: $\exists A \in \mathcal{C}. g(C) \subseteq A$
 PROOF: Then $g(C) \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{C}$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 3$. CASE: $\forall A \in \mathcal{C}. A \subseteq C$
 PROOF: Then $\bigcup \mathcal{C} \subseteq C$.
 $\langle 3 \rangle 5$. For $C \in \mathcal{T}_0$ comparable, $\mathcal{U}_C = \mathcal{T}_0$.
 $\langle 3 \rangle 6$. For $C \in \mathcal{T}_0$ comparable we have $g(C)$ is comparable.
 PROOF: Since for all $A \in \mathcal{T}_0$ either $A \subseteq C \subseteq g(C)$ or $g(C) \subseteq A$.
 $\langle 3 \rangle 7$. The set of comparable sets in \mathcal{T}_0 is a tower.
 $\langle 4 \rangle 1$. \emptyset is comparable.
 PROOF: $\forall A \in \mathcal{T}_0. \emptyset \subseteq A$
 $\langle 4 \rangle 2$. For all $C \in \mathcal{T}_0$, if A is comparable then $g(C)$ is comparable.
 PROOF: $\langle 3 \rangle 6$
 $\langle 4 \rangle 3$. For every chain $\mathcal{C} \subseteq \mathcal{T}_0$ of comparable sets, we have $\bigcup \mathcal{C}$ is comparable.
 $\langle 5 \rangle 1$. LET: $\mathcal{C} \subseteq \mathcal{T}_0$ be a chain of comparable sets.
 $\langle 5 \rangle 2$. LET: $A \in \mathcal{T}_0$
 $\langle 5 \rangle 3$. CASE: there exists $C \in \mathcal{C}$ such that $A \subseteq C$
 PROOF: Then $A \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{C}$.
 $\langle 5 \rangle 4$. CASE: for all $C \in \mathcal{C}$ we have $C \subseteq A$
 PROOF: Then $\bigcup \mathcal{C} \subseteq A$.
 $\langle 3 \rangle 8$. Every set in \mathcal{T}_0 is comparable.
 $\langle 2 \rangle 2$. LET: $x, y \in A$
 $\langle 2 \rangle 3$. PICK $A, C \in \mathcal{T}_0$ such that $x \in A$ and $y \in C$
 $\langle 2 \rangle 4$. ASSUME: w.l.o.g. $A \subseteq C$
 $\langle 2 \rangle 5$. $x, y \in C$
 $\langle 2 \rangle 6$. $x \leq y$ or $y \leq x$
 PROOF: Since $C \in \mathcal{X}$ so C is a chain.
 $\langle 1 \rangle 9$. PICK an upper bound u for A .
 $\langle 1 \rangle 10$. $A \in \mathcal{T}_0$
 PROOF: Since \mathcal{T}_0 is a chain in \mathcal{T}_0 so $\bigcup \mathcal{T}_0 \in \mathcal{T}_0$.
 $\langle 1 \rangle 11$. $g(A) \in \mathcal{T}_0$
 $\langle 1 \rangle 12$. $g(A) \subseteq A$
 $\langle 1 \rangle 13$. $g(A) = A$

$$\langle 1 \rangle_{14}. \hat{A} - A = \emptyset$$