

Evaluation Of Birth Certificate Service Delivery In Makassar City: A Qualitative Study Using Dunn's Criteria

Nur Nisa Nila Wardani S¹, Nurlinah², Suhardiman Syamsu³

^{1,2,3}Universitas Hasanuddin, Indonesia

Corresponding author: nilawardanin@gmail.com

Abstract: *This study aims to evaluate the implementation of birth certificate services in Makassar City through the lens of William N. Dunn's six policy evaluation criteria: effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy. Birth certificates are fundamental identity documents required to access essential services such as education, healthcare, and legal protection. Despite national efforts to strengthen civil registration systems, a significant portion of Makassar's population—32.26%—still lacks birth certificates, indicating service delivery challenges at the local level. Using a qualitative approach, data were collected through interviews, observations, and documentation at the Makassar City Population and Civil Registration Office (Disdukcapil). Informants included key staff members and citizens who had engaged in the birth registration process. The findings reveal that while certain standards—such as the presence of service counters, document requirements, and the availability of Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs)—are in place, several core issues persist. These include the absence of an electronic queuing system, inconsistencies in service timelines, overcrowded waiting areas, internet disruptions, and limited staff responsiveness. The study identifies five main barriers: (1) inadequate digital infrastructure; (2) physical space constraints; (3) lack of service differentiation; (4) limited human resource capabilities; and (5) service delays due to bureaucratic bottlenecks. These challenges undermine the effectiveness and accountability of public services in the civil registration sector. Strategic recommendations include improving IT infrastructure, adopting digital queuing systems, expanding service facilities, enhancing communication and transparency, and strengthening staff training in customer service. These measures are essential to align local civil registration services*

¹. INTRODUCTION

The mandate of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia explicitly grants regional governments the authority to manage and administer their own governmental affairs through the principles of regional autonomy and co-administration (UUD 1945, Article 18). This constitutional framework is further reinforced by Law No. 23 of 2014 on Regional Government, which decentralizes governance responsibilities to enhance the quality of public service delivery and promote regional welfare (Law No. 23/2014). Within this legal framework, civil registration—including the issuance of birth certificates—is classified as a mandatory governmental function under basic public services. Such responsibilities are intended to be uniformly implemented across all regions regardless of local disparities in governance capacity (Ministry of Home Affairs, 2021). The decentralization policy thus places considerable emphasis on the capacity of local governments to ensure the availability, accessibility, and quality of administrative services such as birth registration, which is vital for citizens' legal identity and access to basic rights (UNICEF, 2019).

Civil registration is a fundamental component of public administration that ensures every individual's legal recognition before the state. Among various civil registration documents, the birth certificate is one of the most essential as it serves as proof of identity, citizenship, and legal existence, enabling individuals to access a wide range of public services such as education, healthcare, and social protection (UNICEF, 2019). Without a birth certificate, a person may face lifelong barriers to these basic rights, ultimately exacerbating cycles of poverty and marginalization (Ningrum et al., 2024). In Indonesia, the urgency to secure complete birth registration coverage is underscored by the country's commitment to achieving Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) Target 16.9, which aims to provide legal identity for all, including birth registration, by 2030. According to data from the Population and Civil Registration Office (Disdukcapil) of Makassar City, birth certificates are consistently among the top three most frequently requested documents, alongside Family

with the principles of good governance, regional autonomy, and international development goals, particularly SDG 16.9, which targets universal legal identity through birth registration.

Keywords: *Birth Certificate Services, Public Service Evaluation, Civil Registration.*

Cards (KK) and Electronic Identity Cards (E-KTP), particularly due to their close association with civil eligibility and service entitlements (Disdukcapil Makassar, 2024). This reflects not only the importance of such documents in daily civic life but also the operational workload and responsibility borne by local governments in fulfilling their administrative mandate under regional autonomy (Nazira et al., 2021). Given the critical role of birth certificates in enabling access to public services and affirming legal identity, the responsibility for their issuance lies within the organizational structure of regional governments as mandated by Law No. 23 of 2014. In the context of Makassar City, the authority to manage and implement civil registration services has been delegated to the Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil (Disdukcapil), or the Office of Population and Civil Registration. This agency operates as a Type A local government office with expanded functions and responsibilities, managing both population administration services (e.g., Family Cards and Electronic ID Cards) and civil registration services, including birth, death, marriage, and divorce certificates (Disdukcapil Makassar, 2024). The integration of these services under a single institutional entity is intended to streamline operations and facilitate citizens' access to vital documents that form the basis of state-citizen interaction (Firmansyah et al., 2022). To ensure service quality and public trust, Disdukcapil Makassar has adopted an organizational motto that emphasizes humanistic and ethical service values: "Serving with heart, wholeheartedly, carefully, and not arbitrarily." This reflects a commitment not only to procedural compliance but also to responsive and people-centered governance (Ha, 2024; Chien & Thanh, 2022). The institution is further structured into several specialized units, including the Division of Civil Registration Services, which is directly responsible for the issuance of birth certificates. This division operates under the broader organizational hierarchy as stipulated in Peraturan Walikota Makassar Nomor 77 Tahun 2023 (Mayor's Regulation No. 77 of 2023), which delineates the roles and responsibilities of each department. Despite these formal structures and service intentions, recent administrative data and community feedback suggest that service implementation often falls short of expectations—particularly in fulfilling Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) and meeting processing timelines. This situation reinforces the urgency of systematically evaluating the institutional performance of Disdukcapil in delivering equitable and effective civil registration services (Karwur et al., 2022).

Despite the strategic emphasis placed on civil registration by the Government of Indonesia and local administrations, a significant proportion of the population in Makassar City remains without legal documentation, particularly birth certificates. According to data from the Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil (Disdukcapil) Makassar, only 67.74% of the total population had obtained birth certificates by the end of 2024, leaving approximately 32.26%, or 104,350 individuals, unregistered (Disdukcapil Makassar, 2024). This situation underscores a substantial gap in service coverage, particularly troubling considering the pivotal role of birth certificates in facilitating access to education, healthcare, and social protection programs (UNICEF, 2019). The data suggests not only a persistent backlog in administrative performance but also highlights structural challenges in ensuring universal access to civil registration services in a metropolitan area like Makassar. As the demand for legal identity continues to rise in tandem with population growth and government digitization programs, the inability to meet these needs in a timely and equitable manner reveals critical limitations within the existing service delivery model.

One of the most evident service performance issues concerns the gap between the prescribed service standards and the actual delivery timeframe. According to the official Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) issued by Disdukcapil Makassar, the issuance of a birth certificate is to be completed within one working day. However, in practice, service fulfillment can extend up to 30 working days, particularly during periods of high application volume or when administrative backlogs occur (Disdukcapil Makassar, 2024). This discrepancy between procedural standards and real-world performance raises serious concerns over service efficiency, transparency, and administrative accountability. Moreover, delays in issuance can have legal and social implications for individuals, particularly for newborns and children who may be denied timely access to

essential services if they lack proper identification. The failure to meet SOP benchmarks reflects deeper institutional issues, such as limited human resources, outdated information systems, or inadequate coordination among units involved in document verification, registration, and approval processes (Bennouna et al., 2016).

Beyond technical inefficiencies, structural and administrative challenges within the civil registration system in Makassar further complicate service delivery. Notably, the service counters for population administration and civil registration remain merged, resulting in a lack of differentiation between service categories and an increased burden on staff at the point of service. This integration may be intended to streamline services; however, in practice, it often leads to congestion, user confusion, and longer wait times, particularly when citizens attempt to simultaneously process multiple documents such as Family Cards and birth certificates (Pemerintah Kota Makassar, 2023). Public feedback collected through observation and interviews indicates that users frequently experience delays, unclear information flows, and inconsistent service quality, which undermines public confidence in administrative systems (Jihui et al., 2022). Furthermore, despite the adoption of digital service options such as online applications and automated queuing systems, many residents—particularly those from underserved communities—continue to rely on manual, in-person services due to digital literacy gaps or limited internet access. These realities emphasize the importance of institutional reforms that not only address technical capacity, but also incorporate citizen-centered approaches to improve accessibility, responsiveness, and service equity (Suthar et al., 2019).

In evaluating the implementation of birth certificate services in Makassar City, this study adopts Dunn's (2003) policy evaluation model, which comprises six key criteria: effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy (Adair et al., 2023). These criteria provide a comprehensive analytical framework to assess not only the outcomes of service delivery but also the processes and capacities involved in achieving those outcomes. By applying Dunn's model, the research systematically examines how well the service achieves its intended goals (effectiveness), how resources are utilized (efficiency), whether the services meet a minimum standard (adequacy), how fairly services are distributed among the population (equity), the degree to which services align with citizen needs and expectations (responsiveness), and the precision of service delivery in terms of data and documentation (accuracy). This multidimensional evaluation enables a deeper understanding of the strengths and weaknesses in the current service model, offering evidence-based insights for policy refinement and administrative reform within the context of regional autonomy.

This study presents a significant contribution to the discourse on public service delivery by focusing specifically on the evaluation of birth certificate services, a topic that has been relatively underexplored in both academic and policy literature. While previous studies often focus on general service satisfaction or broader civil registration issues, this research uniquely applies Dunn's (2003) six policy evaluation criteria—effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy—to assess the performance of birth certificate issuance at the local government level. This multidimensional evaluative model enables the study to move beyond surface-level analysis, providing a systematic and structured assessment of how the service operates, what outcomes are achieved, and how well it aligns with public needs and legal standards. The localized focus on Makassar City, an urban area characterized by rapid population growth and administrative complexity, further enhances the novelty of the study by contextualizing policy evaluation within the framework of regional autonomy in Indonesia. By identifying and analyzing the real-world gaps between official service standards (SOPs) and field implementation, the study provides evidence-based insights that are often overlooked in national-level reports (Okoth, 2023; , Koagouw et al., 2021). Moreover, the integration of qualitative, citizen-based evaluations with an established policy analysis framework offers a replicable model for improving service delivery in other regions, making this research not only original but also methodologically robust and policy-relevant.

The urgency of this research stems from the pressing reality that 32.26% of Makassar's population remains without birth certificates, a condition that significantly hampers their ability to access essential public services such as education, healthcare, and social welfare programs (Disdukcapil Makassar, 2024). This administrative exclusion not only perpetuates structural inequality, particularly among children and marginalized groups, but also contravenes legal obligations under both national legislation and international human rights

frameworks, including the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC). Moreover, the disparity between the officially mandated one-day processing period and the actual delay of up to thirty working days underscores a systemic issue of bureaucratic inefficiency and accountability failures. In light of Indonesia's current shift toward digital governance and service integration, ensuring inclusive, efficient, and timely birth registration is no longer optional but a strategic imperative. The findings of this study directly align with global development objectives, particularly SDG 16.9, which calls for the provision of legal identity for all, including birth registration, by 2030. As such, the research holds high relevance not only for improving local administrative practices but also for supporting broader national and international policy goals.

2. METHOD

Type of Research

This study uses a qualitative research approach to examine the implementation of birth certificate services in Makassar City. The qualitative method was selected because it allows for in-depth exploration of real conditions in the field, including service delivery challenges, administrative procedures, and user experiences. Through this approach, the researcher can interact directly with key stakeholders, collect detailed information, and gain a comprehensive understanding of the problems faced by both service providers and the public. The flexibility of this method also enables the researcher to adapt to evolving information needs during the data collection process and capture insights that are grounded in actual field experiences. **Research**

Location and Duration

This study was conducted over a period of approximately two months at the Office of Population and Civil Registration (Disdukcapil) in Makassar City, Indonesia. The selection of this location was based on preliminary observations that revealed various service implementation issues and public dissatisfaction, particularly in the administration of birth certificate services. These issues indicated a gap between the expected service standards and the actual experiences of the public.

Research Subjects and Informants

The main subject of this study is the implementation and evaluation of birth certificate services at the Disdukcapil office in Makassar City. This study employed a purposive sampling technique to select informants who were considered to have sufficient knowledge, experience, and involvement in the process of birth certificate service delivery at the Disdukcapil office in Makassar City. Informants were deliberately chosen based on their roles, responsibilities, and relevance to the research focus. This technique allowed the researcher to obtain rich, targeted information directly from key stakeholders, including service providers and service users. The selected informants were expected to provide credible and relevant data that could address the research objectives effectively. Their insights were crucial in uncovering institutional practices, operational barriers, and public perceptions regarding the implementation of birth certificate services.

Table 1. Research Informant

No.	Informant Type	Number of Informants	Function of Data Collected
1	Head of the Civil Registration Division	1	To understand policy implementation, leadership roles, and service supervision mechanisms.
2	Head of Birth Certificate Section	1	To explore technical procedures, administrative flow, and SOP execution.
3	Service Staff/Officers (Birth Section)	2	To gain insight into day-to-day operations, workflow challenges, and citizen interactions.
4	Community	4	To collect user experiences, satisfaction levels, and perceptions of service delivery.

Members (Service Users)	
Total	8 Informants

Data Sources and Collection Techniques

This study used both primary and secondary data sources. Data were collected through interviews, observations, and documentation to obtain comprehensive insights from field experiences and institutional references. The following table outlines the sources and techniques used.

Table 2. Data Sources and Collection Techniques

No.	Data Type	Data Source	Collection Technique	Description
1	Primary Data	Key Informants (Heads of Division/Section, Staff, Citizens)	Interview	Semi-structured interviews to explore perceptions, experiences, and challenges in service delivery.
		Field setting at Disdukcapil Office	Observation	Direct observations on real-time workflow, service interaction, and administrative processes.
		Informant demographic and professional background	Interview/Field Note	Collected during interviews to provide contextual understanding of each respondent's perspective.
2	Secondary Data	Geographical and monographic data of Makassar City	Documentation	Official reports and public records to describe research setting.
		Institutional structure and SOP of Disdukcapil	Documentation	Used to analyze service framework, organizational responsibilities, and legal procedures.
		Service delivery statistics and government publications	Documentation	Support analysis of service coverage, performance indicators, and policy compliance.

Data Analysis Technique

The data in this study were analyzed using an interactive model of analysis involving three key components: data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification. First, data reduction was carried out by selecting, simplifying, and organizing raw field data to focus on information relevant to the research objectives. This step helped eliminate redundancy and sharpen the analytical focus. Next, the reduced data were presented in a systematic format through narratives, matrices, or tables to facilitate interpretation and pattern identification. Finally, the researcher drew conclusions based on the interpreted data while continuously verifying the findings to ensure their consistency and validity. This iterative process allowed the researcher to derive meaningful insights grounded in field realities and supported by triangulated data sources.

3. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

Evaluating The Implementation of Birth Certificate Services in Makassar City Using Dunn's Six Policy Evaluation Criteria

This section presents the findings of the study related to the implementation of birth certificate services at the Office of Population and Civil Registration (Disdukcapil) of Makassar City. The evaluation is based on six criteria formulated by Dunn (2014). **Effectiveness**

To evaluate the effectiveness of birth certificate services at Disdukcapil Makassar, this study examined three key sub-indicators: the availability of a special service counter, the existence of a queuing system, and the adequacy of waiting room facilities. Data were collected through interviews with both officials and service users, supported by field observations. The findings for each sub-indicator are summarized in the table below, including selected respondent statements and the interpretation of each aspect's implementation.

Table 3 Interview Findings and Interpretation on the Effectiveness of Birth Certificate Services

No	Sub-Indicator	Informant	Interpretation
Statement Summary			
1	Special Counter	Head of Civil Registration Lizawati (Citizen) Rizqi (Citizen) Halimah (Citizen) Yusuf Malik (Citizen)	One designated counter for 0–60 day and >60 day birth public perceptions vary due to Division certificates. unclear signage, lack of separation, and centralization. This creates confusion, limits functional effectiveness, and reduces service clarity and satisfaction among users. More than one counter is visible.
6	Queuing System queuing mechanism results in	Head of Civil Registration Lizawati (Citizen) Rizqi (Citizen) Halimah (Citizen) Yusuf Malik (Citizen)	No queuing system; files processed by registration order. The absence of a systematic processed by registration order. Division inefficiencies and the potential for perceived unfairness. This manual process lacks transparency and consistency, especially during peak hours, affecting Yusuf trust and orderly service flow.
3	Waiting Room available, they	Head of Civil Registration are Division	Waiting rooms provided both inside and outside the building. Though waiting rooms are designated by service type.

Rizqi (Citizen)	Amelia Indoor waiting is comfortable; outdoor is hot and less ideal.	Limited seating, discomfort in outdoor areas, and shared
Lizawati (Citizen)	Only general waiting room is available for all services.	usage for all services reduce the efficiency and comfort of the
Halimah (Citizen)	Outdoor seating is available but unspecialized.	waiting process, affecting service quality and user
Crowded because all services are experience. (Citizen) in one area.		Yusuf Malik

The effectiveness of birth certificate services at the Disdukcapil Office of Makassar City, as evaluated through field interviews and observations, demonstrates both progress and persistent challenges in service delivery. While the office has provided a dedicated counter for birth certificate issuance, its utilization remains unclear due to the absence of visible signage, lack of service separation, and overlapping functions with other civil services. This has led to differing perceptions among citizens—some observe one clear counter, while others see multiple or indistinct locations—reflecting a need for better service demarcation and communication. Furthermore, the absence of a structured queuing system is a critical weakness. Currently, services operate on a first-come, first-served basis, determined manually by the order of document submission, with staff calling names verbally. This informal system lacks transparency, consistency, and fairness, especially during high-traffic periods, which undermines trust and operational efficiency. Additionally, while waiting rooms are available inside and outside the building, they are generalized for all types of services, resulting in congestion and discomfort. The indoor room offers better conditions but is limited in seating, while the outdoor area suffers from heat and lack of ventilation, further reducing service quality. The lack of service-specific waiting areas hinders effective flow management and affects the overall user experience. Based on these findings, it can be concluded that although the infrastructure for birth certificate service delivery exists, its organization and implementation are not yet optimal, and thus, the overall effectiveness remains limited in meeting public expectations for clarity, comfort, and fairness.

Efficiency

This section evaluates the efficiency of birth certificate services at Disdukcapil Makassar based on three subindicators: (1) whether staff actively inquire about the public's needs, (2) whether they serve with friendliness and smile, and (3) whether they check all submitted requirements thoroughly. These aspects reflect both administrative behavior and service delivery practices, and they are essential in ensuring time-effective, client-focused public service.

Table 4 Interview Findings and Interpretation on the Efficiency of Birth Certificate Services

No Sub-Indicator	Informant	Statement Summary	Interpretation
1	Staff Ask Head of Civil Service Needs	Staff check requirements; if documents are incomplete, citizens attentiveness by inquiring Division are asked to complete them before public needs and processing.	About Registration documents about providing appropriate
	Lizawati (Citizen)	Two staff members serve outside and inside; they always ask what the type and completeness. This helps	guidance based on service and document citizen needs.
	Observation	Staff at registration desks routinely streamline service flow ask citizens about their purpose and reduce errors in early and documents, then guide them processing stages through the steps.	

2	Staff (Citizen) consistently through warmth in affect the	Serve Lizawati	Staff were polite and helpful.	While staff are mostly with a Smile	courteous, they do not convey friendliness smiles. The lack of visible service interactions may
		Rizqi (Citizen)	Amelia One registration officer was neutral—"sometimes friendly, sometimes not."		
		Halimah (Citizen)	Two officers outside were kind and served well.	Observation	
overall emotional showed flat expressions, especially satisfaction of service in indoor counters. users.					
3	Staff Check Head of Civil All documents are checked, Staff perform thorough All Registration verified, and entered into the document verification and Requirements	Lizawati (Citizen)	Documents are checked carefully; if complete, citizens are moved to the next stage.	Division	system before issuing certificates.
		Rizqi (Citizen)	Amelia Staff review documents, then provide a pickup date. Completion typically takes one week.		provide follow-up schedules accordingly.
		Yusuf (Citizen)	Malik Two staff check the requirements outside; if documents are complete, pickup date is given.		This step is critical to ensuring administrative accuracy, although some delays still occur during the issuance stage due to procedural backlogs.
		Observation Staff receive documents, validate them, input data, and coordinate verification and e-signature before issuing the certificate.			

The efficiency of birth certificate services in Makassar, based on the three measured sub-indicators, shows a moderate level of procedural effectiveness combined with areas for improvement. Firstly, it is evident that staff consistently ask citizens about their service needs at the registration desk and provide guidance on the required documents. This approach not only saves time but also reduces repeated visits due to incomplete submissions. Secondly, in terms of hospitality, the data indicate that while most staff are polite and provide clear instructions, they do not always serve with a visible smile or warm demeanor. Although not directly affecting procedural output, this lack of emotional engagement could influence public perception and satisfaction. Lastly, the document-checking process is conducted thoroughly. Staff are attentive in matching citizen documents with service requirements, ensuring that incomplete files are returned for correction and that complete submissions are promptly entered into the system. However, some delays in issuing birth certificates—up to one week—were reported, usually caused by verification and signature bottlenecks. Overall, the Disdukcapil office has established an efficient operational flow in initial service contact and document handling, but service quality can be enhanced through better emotional interaction and reduced waiting times at the issuance stage.

Adequacy

Adequacy refers to the degree to which the resources and standards available for public service delivery meet the required needs to produce the expected outcomes—in this case, effective birth certificate services. This

indicator is evaluated through two sub-indicators: the availability of sufficient work tools and infrastructure for staff, and the presence of clear service guidelines or operational standards.

Table 5 Interview Findings and Interpretation on the Adequacy of Birth Certificate Services

Indicator		Informant	Statement Summary	Interpretation	No
Sub-					
1	Availability of Work Tools	Head of Civil Registration Division	Staff are equipped with computers and internet network to perform birth certificate services.	The Disdukcapil office in Makassar has adequately provided essential infrastructure to support service delivery. The availability	
		Observation	Registration desks and indoor counters have tables, chairs, computers, and stationery available.	of computers, internet, and workspaces contributes positively to operational readiness and enables staff to fulfill tasks efficiently.	
2	Availability of Service Guidelines (SOP/SPM)	Head of Civil Registration Division	SOPs and minimum service standards are in place as reference for service implementation.	Service personnel are guided by clearly established SOP and minimum service standards, ensuring consistency and	
		Observation	SOP and SPM documents are posted and followed, including detailed workflow and document requirements.	accountability in task execution. These formal guidelines improve procedural discipline and help reduce administrative errors.	

Based on the findings from interviews and direct observation, the adequacy of birth certificate service provision at Disdukcapil Makassar is generally satisfactory. The staff are supported with adequate infrastructure such as computers, internet access, stationery, and designated working spaces both at the registration desk and at specialized service counters. These provisions enable employees to perform their duties efficiently and comfortably. In addition to physical tools, the presence of established Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) and Minimum Service Standards (SPM) further supports administrative clarity and procedural consistency. These guidelines detail the service flow—from document verification to electronic data entry and document issuance—thereby reducing potential for procedural errors. The availability of such structured documents ensures that all personnel follow a unified protocol, which is crucial in maintaining the reliability and quality of administrative services. Overall, the adequacy of both tools and institutional support systems at Disdukcapil plays a vital role in enabling smooth and effective service delivery in birth certificate administration. **Equity**

Equity in public service refers to the fair and equal treatment of all citizens, ensuring that no one is discriminated against in accessing civil registration services, particularly birth certificate issuance. This study evaluated equity based on three sub-indicators: accessibility clarity of requirements and the quality of information delivered to the public.

Table 6 Interview Findings and Interpretation on the Equity of Birth Certificate Services

No	Sub-Indicator	Informant	Statement Summary	Interpretation
1	Accessibility	Head of Civil Registration Division	All citizens are entitled to obtain birth certificates under two categories: General and Delayed.	Disdukcapil Makassar provides inclusive access for all individuals, regardless of age or delay in application. The classification between timely and delayed registration ensures equal rights for all citizens to legal identity, reinforcing the equity principle in service delivery.
2	Clarity Requirements	of Head of Civil Registration	Requirements are posted on banners and boards, easily visible to the public.	The office ensures requirement transparency by displaying them in various formats and locations. Citizens clearly understand what documents are needed before applying. This proactive dissemination contributes to service equity by reducing barriers related to bureaucratic complexity or misinformation.
		Lizawati (Citizen)	Required documents include parents' marriage book, ID cards, witnesses, and letter from neighborhood.	
		Rizqi Amelia (Citizen)	Requirements are a birth assistant's letter, family card, ID cards, marriage certificate, and witnesses.	
		Halimah (Citizen)	Brought birth assistant's letter, marriage certificate, and IDs.	
		Observation	Posters, banners, and handouts with requirement lists are posted both indoors and outdoors.	
3	Information	Head of Civil Registration Division	Staff inform citizens about SOP, SPM, service categories, and document requirements.	Disdukcapil officers maintain communication with citizens through verbal explanations and informational postings. The clarity of information reduces confusion and ensures all citizens, regardless of background or literacy level, are equally informed about the procedures and expectations of the service process.
		Halimah (Citizen)	Staff notify citizens based on the type of birth certificate and completion schedule.	

The equity of birth certificate service delivery at Disdukcapil Kota Makassar is reflected in its inclusive, transparent, and citizen-friendly practices. The institution ensures that all citizens—regardless of age or time since birth—are entitled to register for a birth certificate, with options provided for both timely and delayed registrations. This categorization fosters inclusivity and prevents the marginalization of individuals who were unable to register their birth on time. Moreover, Disdukcapil has taken proactive steps to ensure procedural clarity by posting visible banners, public service boards, and printed handouts that outline the necessary documents and application flow. Such visibility aids all citizens, especially those unfamiliar with the bureaucratic process. Furthermore, the institution actively communicates service information through its staff, ensuring that applicants receive explanations of requirements, expected processing times, and distinctions between service types. These efforts show that Disdukcapil Makassar promotes equitable service access through both policy implementation and front-line interaction, helping to bridge potential knowledge or accessibility gaps among diverse community members.

Responsiveness

Responsiveness reflects how well public services meet citizens' expectations and satisfaction. In the context of civil registration, it includes the honesty and transparency shown by service providers in communicating procedures, timelines, and costs. This study evaluates responsiveness based on two sub-indicators: honesty of staff in providing service-related information and openness regarding service fees.

Table 5 Interview Findings and Interpretation on the Responsiveness of Birth Certificate Services

No	Sub-Indicator	Informant	Statement Summary	Interpretation
1	Staff honesty in communication	Lizawati	If requirements are complete, the process continues; if not, documents are returned and corrections requested.	Disdukcapil officers are perceived as generally honest and responsible in interacting with citizens. They inform applicants
		Rizqi Amelia	Honesty depends on the officer, but some are consistent with scheduled completion dates.	
		Halimah	Officers are honest when explaining service outcomes.	
2	Openness about service fees	Lizawati	Officers clearly state that birth certificate services are free of charge.	The transparent communication regarding free-of-charge services helps prevent informal payments and promotes accountability. The clarity provided supports ethical service delivery and enhances user satisfaction.
		Rizqi Amelia	Birth certificate service is "gratis" (free) without any additional cost.	

The findings suggest that Disdukcapil Makassar exhibits a good level of responsiveness through the behavior of its staff in handling birth certificate services. Citizens perceive officers as honest in verifying documents and clearly communicating whether requirements are complete or need revision. This honesty helps to manage expectations and avoid procedural confusion. Furthermore, staff consistently inform citizens that there are no costs associated with processing birth certificates, reinforcing transparency and preventing the possibility of informal payments or exploitation. However, there were minor indications that consistency in adhering to promised service timelines may vary depending on the officer. Despite this, the general perception

among service users remains positive, indicating that the office has fostered a culture of responsible and transparent communication in line with responsive public service principles.

Accuracy in public service delivery refers to the precision and appropriateness of service outcomes, reflected through staff diligence and courteous behavior. In the case of birth certificate issuance, accuracy ensures that all documents are correctly processed, citizens' needs are met, and the service experience is respectful and satisfying.

Table 6 Interview Findings and Interpretation on the Accuracy of Birth Certificate Services

No	Sub-	Informant	Statement Summary	Interpretation
Indicator				
1	Staff Head of Civil Officers conduct “cek dan Disdukcapil staff demonstrate Diligence in Registration ricek” (double-check) of sufficient diligence by Work	Lizawati (Citizen)	If something is missing or incorrect, the file is returned to be completed before processing.	Division submitted documents. conducting detailed verification of citizen documents. This procedural rigor helps reduce administrative errors and ensures accurate issuance of birth certificates.
		Rizqi Amelia (Citizen)	If the document is correct, it is processed; if not, it is returned.	
		Halimah (Citizen)	Staff are careful and detail-oriented in reviewing submitted documents.	
2	Staff Politeness	Rizqi Amelia	Some officers are polite, Despite minor variability, most (Citizen) while others may seem staff maintain respectful indifferent. interaction with service users,	
		Halimah (Citizen)	Staff are friendly and provide contributing to a positive courteous service. service experience. Courtesy improves citizen satisfaction and reflects the agency's commitment to professional service.	

The findings reveal that Disdukcapil Makassar has implemented satisfactory practices in ensuring the accuracy of its birth certificate services. Staff are observed to be careful in reviewing document completeness and correctness through repeated verification steps before final approval and issuance. This level of diligence minimizes the risk of data entry errors and supports legal validity of documents. Moreover, the interpersonal behavior of staff though slightly inconsistent is generally characterized by respectful and polite communication, which enhances the overall public service experience. However, broader observations indicate systemic limitations such as a lack of separate service counters, absence of queuing systems, and limited comfort in waiting areas. In addition, some procedural inefficiencies—such as slow internet access and service delays have undermined the consistency of delivery. These gaps suggest that while accuracy in core procedures is acceptable, there is room for improvement in supporting systems and service quality to reach optimal performance levels.

Key Challenges and Barriers in the Implementation of Birth Certificate Services at the Makassar City Civil Registration Office

Despite efforts to improve civil registration services, various obstacles remain in the implementation process at the Disdukcapil office in Makassar. These constraints include infrastructural limitations, technical issues, and gaps in service management. Identifying these challenges is crucial for developing targeted interventions and improving public service quality.

Table 7 Summary of Identified Obstacles in Birth Certificate Services at Disdukcapil Makassar

No	Sub-Indicator (Obstacle)	Informant(s)	Statement Summary	Interpretation
1	Limited Office and Waiting Room Capacity	Head Division; Observations	of Office space is small; shared waiting area for all services; some citizens must wait outside due to overcrowding.	The physical infrastructure is insufficient, limiting comfort and potentially reducing access for vulnerable populations.
2	Poor Internet Connectivity	Head Division; Kasi Kelahiran	of National system-based service requires stable internet; poor connectivity delays data entry and document issuance.	Unstable internet is a major barrier to timely service delivery, especially in a digitally dependent system.
3	No Electronic Queue System	Citizens; Observations	Citizens are served based on document arrival time, not a formal queue.	The absence of a digital queuing system reduces orderliness, leads to inefficiency, and may cause perceived unfairness.
4	Lack of Friendly Facial Expressions	Citizens	Some staff are polite but do not smile or express friendliness; others appear indifferent.	The lack of emotional engagement can negatively affect user experience and flat or <u>perceptions of service quality</u> .
5	Service Delays Standards	Citizens; Staff	Although SOP states 1-day completion, actual processing may take 7+ days due to public trust and various constraints (e.g., accountability in service <u>blanko shortages, workload</u>).	Beyond SOP undermines practice and trust in service timelines.
6	Lack of Citizens Counters	Citizens; Birth certificate handled at the same counter	Birth certificate services are handled at the same counter as other services, leading to confusion and congestion.	The absence of dedicated Specialized Observations and organization, especially for high-demand services like birth certificates.

The findings reveal a number of persistent obstacles in the delivery of birth certificate services in Makassar City. First, the limited physical space of both the office and waiting areas has created congestion, especially during peak hours, forcing some citizens to wait outside with minimal comfort. Second, the reliance on internet-based national systems has been hampered by poor connectivity, significantly delaying service processes. Third, the absence of a digital queue system results in disorganized service order and potential inequity. Additionally, staff members, although professional, often lack expressions of friendliness, which impacts emotional satisfaction and user engagement. The delays in service completion—extending beyond the SOP's 1-day promise—further frustrate citizens, reflecting systemic inefficiencies. Finally, the lack of specialized counters for birth certificate issuance causes confusion and slows down the service flow. These challenges collectively demonstrate that while structural and procedural elements are in place, practical implementation gaps must be addressed to improve the overall effectiveness, responsiveness, and fairness of civil registration services.

Strategic Recommendations for Service Improvement

Based on the synthesis of findings and barriers, this section presents strategic and actionable recommendations to improve the quality, efficiency, and equity of birth certificate services at the Disdukcapil office in Makassar City. These strategies are aligned with the principles of regional autonomy, public service accountability, and digital transformation.

Table 8 Strategic Recommendations for Improving Birth Certificate Services

No	Key Issues Identified	Strategic Recommendation	Expected Outcome
1	Absence of electronic queue system	Implement a digital queuing system with ticket printing or mobile checkin capability	Reduces congestion, ensures fairness, and improves service order and transparency
2	Merged service counters for all types of civil registration	Establish dedicated service counters specifically for birth certificates	Increases clarity, reduces confusion, and shortens waiting time for specialized services
3	Limited space and crowded waiting areas	Expand office infrastructure and optimize waiting room layout; consider outdoor shading improvements	Enhances user comfort and increases capacity for accommodating more citizens
4	Internet connectivity issues	Upgrade to high-speed internet with backup network options	Ensures faster processing, uninterrupted digital data entry, and reduced system downtime
5	Staff behavior not consistently friendly or emotionally engaging	Conduct regular customer service and empathy training for frontline officers	Improves citizen satisfaction and public perception of government professionalism
6	Service delays beyond SOP timeline	Introduce real-time service tracking and complaint-response dashboards	Promotes accountability, reduces uncertainty, and helps monitor staff performance
7	Lack of targeted information dissemination	Develop multichannel communication tools (flyers, SMS updates, website, social media)	Ensures that citizens clearly understand requirements and processes before visiting the office

8	Unclear implementation practice	SOP in	Reinforce internal supervision and SOP compliance auditing	and Enhances consistency in service delivery and reduces errors or delays caused by procedural gaps
---	---------------------------------	--------	--	---

The strategic recommendations proposed are designed to address both systemic and procedural barriers identified in the evaluation of birth certificate services at Disdukcapil Kota Makassar. To enhance service order and fairness, the implementation of a digital queuing system is essential, especially to resolve public concerns about transparency and long wait times. Furthermore, the establishment of dedicated service counters specifically for birth certificate processing would help minimize citizen confusion and streamline administrative workflows. The issue of infrastructure limitations, particularly small and crowded waiting areas, can be mitigated by reconfiguring the physical layout and providing shaded or covered outdoor spaces to ensure comfort and accessibility. The internet connectivity challenge, which significantly affects real-time service delivery, must be addressed through the installation of reliable, high-speed connections with contingency backup. Equally important is the need to improve the quality of public interaction, which can be achieved through regular staff training on empathy, communication, and integrity. This supports a citizen-centric approach in public administration. To reinforce accountability and timeliness, the introduction of real-time tracking systems and dashboards would enable both internal monitoring and public engagement in service performance. Moreover, comprehensive multichannel communication—including printed flyers, SMS updates, and online platforms—should be developed to ensure all citizens are well-informed before accessing services. Lastly, regular internal audits and supervision are crucial to ensure strict compliance with SOPs, bridging the gap between policy and field implementation. Together, these strategies form a coherent framework to improve service quality, accessibility, and equity in civil registration governance under the principles of regional autonomy and public service reform.

Evaluating the Implementation of Birth Certificate Services in Makassar City Using Dunn's Six Policy Evaluation Criteria

The evaluation of birth certificate services at the Makassar City Civil Registry Office (Disdukcapil) using Dunn's (2014) six policy evaluation criteria—effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy—revealed that while some service standards have been met, significant gaps still exist in delivery and citizen satisfaction. In terms of effectiveness, although a special service counter and waiting areas are available, the absence of an electronic queuing system causes disorganization and user dissatisfaction. This reflects Dunn's (2014) notion that effectiveness is not only about completing tasks but achieving intended outcomes with precision. It aligns with Widodo (2001), who argues that public services must be structured, accountable, and citizen-focused to deliver optimal results. Despite the existence of a dedicated counter, citizen experiences show inconsistencies in signage, space, and service clarity, indicating partial fulfillment of this criterion. For efficiency, the service delivery demonstrates procedural compliance where staff inquire about citizens' needs and verify documents thoroughly (Bahari & Lodan, 2023). However, the human interaction aspect remains inconsistent—some staff were reported to lack warmth or friendliness, especially during peak hours. While administrative tasks were handled appropriately, efficiency in service perception and emotional engagement was lacking. This supports Thoha's theory (Widodo, 2001), which emphasizes that efficient public service must combine procedural adequacy with professional, empathetic behavior. Without consistent delivery of both, public satisfaction may falter even if technical tasks are completed. The findings also imply that while standard operating procedures (SOPs) are in place, the performance dimension is influenced by frontline human interaction (Carreon, 2024).

In terms of adequacy and equity, the study finds that Disdukcapil has equipped staff with necessary tools such as computers, internet access, and written guidelines (SOP and SPM). Citizens receive clear, printed instructions regarding service requirements, either through banners, notice boards, or handouts. These measures suggest compliance with minimum service standards as stated in Law No. 25 of 2009 on Public

Services. The differentiation between general and late birth registrations (0–60 days vs. over 60 days) reflects administrative sensitivity toward diverse citizen conditions. Nonetheless, differences in how information is accessed and understood by citizens underscore the need for further improvements in communication and equity in service delivery—particularly for those less digitally literate or geographically distant from the service center (Hasan et al., 2023). Regarding responsiveness and accuracy, staff demonstrated transparency by clearly stating that the services were free of charge and explaining the documentation process thoroughly. Citizens appreciated the honesty and openness of staff when requirements were incomplete or delays occurred. Staff also practiced document verification and repeated data checks to ensure accuracy before issuing official documents (Tonapa et al., 2024). However, consistent with Nugroho's (2014) assertion that policy implementation should be evaluated not to assign blame but to identify gaps, the study found that delays in service completion—sometimes extending beyond the one-day SOP target—were caused by unstable internet connectivity and overcrowded facilities. This suggests that technical and infrastructure improvements are crucial for achieving greater accuracy and public satisfaction (Nenobais et al., 2023).

Key Challenges and Barriers in the Implementation of Birth Certificate Services at the Makassar City Civil Registration Office

The findings of this study highlight several key challenges that hinder the optimal implementation of birth certificate services at the Makassar City Civil Registration Office (Disdukcapil). One of the most critical issues is the limited availability and reliability of internet connectivity, which plays a central role in the administrative process. Given that all services are conducted through an integrated national system managed by the Ministry of Home Affairs, any disruption in the internet connection directly affects the ability of Disdukcapil to register, verify, and issue legal documents promptly. This infrastructure barrier is particularly problematic considering the standard operating procedure (SOP) promises one-day service for birth certificates. In practice, delays of up to 30 working days were reported. This discrepancy not only violates the principle of efficiency but also erodes public trust in the system (Haerati et al., 2024).

Another challenge identified relates to inadequate physical infrastructure, particularly the size and arrangement of service areas and waiting rooms. The main office is unable to accommodate the large number of daily service seekers efficiently. Observations showed that citizens often have to wait in outdoor areas, with limited shade and insufficient seating, which compromises their comfort and dignity. In addition, the absence of a digital queuing system causes disorganization and confusion among service users, leading to a perception of unfairness and inefficiency (Devi et al., 2024). The integration of all services into a single counter for registration and various civil documents also contributes to delays and overcrowding (Bennouna et al., 2016). This reflects a lack of strategic service separation, which according to Widodo (2001), is a necessary element in maintaining functional effectiveness in public institutions.

Human resource issues also emerged as a barrier to quality service. Although staff generally performed their duties with procedural accuracy, there were inconsistencies in interpersonal behavior, such as lack of visible friendliness or empathy during service delivery (Alwany, 2020). While some citizens described staff as helpful and responsive, others noted that some employees were indifferent or mechanical in their approach. Furthermore, the inconsistency in delivering information about timelines and procedural requirements led to citizen confusion, especially for first-time applicants. These findings reflect the need for regular training and supervision to standardize service culture and enhance responsiveness. In line with Dunn's (2014) evaluation framework, these barriers illustrate that even well-structured policies can fall short in practice without sufficient infrastructure, clear communication, and proactive staff engagement (Bennouna et al., 2016; Dilapanga et al., 2023; Alwany, 2020; irfadat, 2022).

Strategic Recommendations for Service Improvement

Based on the evaluation results and identified challenges, several strategic recommendations can be proposed to improve the quality, accessibility, and efficiency of birth certificate services at the Makassar City Civil Registration Office. First and foremost, strengthening digital infrastructure is crucial. Since all civil registration services are now integrated with the national system under the Ministry of Home Affairs, a stable and high-speed internet connection must be ensured at all service points. Investing in a reliable digital backbone not only supports timely data entry and verification but also ensures that the one-day service

commitment stated in the SOP can be realistically achieved. Moreover, the introduction of an electronic queuing system would significantly reduce service disorder, increase fairness in turn-taking, and enhance citizen satisfaction (Rane et al., 2020).

Physical infrastructure improvements are equally important to accommodate the growing number of service users. Creating dedicated service counters for different types of documents, including separate counters for birth certificate services, would improve workflow and reduce congestion. Additionally, improving the waiting area—by expanding its capacity, adding seating, fans, or air conditioning—would make the service environment more humane and dignified, especially for elderly citizens and families with children. Enhancing visibility and readability of service information through well-designed posters, digital screens, and mobile application support can also help bridge gaps in service understanding and reduce dependency on face-to-face interactions (Finger & Pascual, 2023).

Capacity building for staff should be prioritized to foster a more citizen-oriented service culture. Regular training on soft skills, including communication, empathy, and customer engagement, can help standardize staff performance and reduce variability in service experiences. Supervisors should also ensure that staff consistently convey accurate information regarding service timelines, requirements, and procedures (Tariverdi et al., 2023). Furthermore, adopting performance-based evaluations and public feedback mechanisms could motivate staff to improve accountability and responsiveness. All of these strategies are not only aligned with the principles of good governance and regional autonomy, but they also contribute to achieving Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) 16.9, which aims to “provide legal identity for all, including birth registration,” by ensuring equitable, transparent, and inclusive access to civil registration services (Bhatia et al., 2019).

4. CONCLUSION

Evaluation of Birth Certificate Services in Makassar City shows that the implementation of this public service policy is still not fully optimal when analyzed using six policy evaluation criteria according to Dunn. Although the service procedures have been designed in a structured manner, there are significant weaknesses in terms of effectiveness, such as the lack of an adequate queue system, as well as in terms of efficiency which is marked by delays in the service process. In addition, the responsiveness of officers who are not consistent is also an important note, which as a whole reflects that the quality of service has not reached the expected standard. Some of the main obstacles in this service come from inadequate digital infrastructure, especially unstable internet connections, as well as limited physical space and service infrastructure. There are also problems in the form of overlapping service counter functions and the absence of a digital queue system, which ultimately hinders the performance of the Makassar City Population and Civil Registration Office (Disdukcapil) in meeting service standards and reducing the level of community satisfaction. To overcome these challenges, strategic improvements are needed that include improving digital and physical infrastructure, strengthening human resource capacity, and implementing service innovations that are oriented to the needs of citizens. This transformation is important so that the implementation of public services is in line with the principles of accountability, the mandate of regional autonomy, and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) target 16.9 which emphasizes the importance of legal identity for all citizens.

Recommendations

Recommendations that can be implemented include improving internet connectivity and developing a digital system that is integrated in real-time with national databases, in order to speed up the process of issuing documents. In addition, it is necessary to rearrange the physical infrastructure of services, such as separating counters based on the type of service and providing comfortable waiting rooms to reduce congestion. Finally, increasing the capacity of apparatus through regular training in the field of customer service, communication skills, and increased responsiveness, needs to be accompanied by a performance monitoring system and feedback mechanism from the community as a form of continuous control and improvement of service quality.

REFERENCES

1. Adair, T., Badr, A., Mikkelsen, L., Hooper, J., & López, A. (2023). Global analysis of birth statistics from civil registration and vital statistics systems. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*, 101(12), 768-776. <https://doi.org/10.2471/blt.22.289035>
2. Alwany, T. (2020). Strategi dinas kependudukan dan pencatatan sipil dalam pelayanan kepemilikan akta kelahiran bagi anak-anak panti asuhan di kota makassar. *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan Suara Khatulistiwa*, 5(1), 69-80. <https://doi.org/10.33701/jipsk.v5i1.1124>
3. Bahari, S. and Lodan, K. (2023). Kualitas pelayanan pembuatan akta lahir di dinas kependudukan dan catatan sipil kota batam. *Jurnal Ilmiah Universitas Batanghari Jambi*, 23(1), 801. <https://doi.org/10.33087/jiubj.v23i1.2602>
4. Bennouna, C., Feldman, B., Usman, R., Adiputra, R., Kusumaningrum, S., & Stark, L. (2016). Using the three delays model to examine civil registration barriers in indonesia. *Plos One*, 11(12), e0168405. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0168405>
5. Bennouna, C., Feldman, B., Usman, R., Adiputra, R., Kusumaningrum, S., & Stark, L. (2016). Using the three delays model to examine civil registration barriers in indonesia. *Plos One*, 11(12), e0168405. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0168405>
6. Bhatia, A., Krieger, N., Beckfield, J., Barros, A., & Victora, C. (2019). Are inequities decreasing? birth registration for children under five in low-income and middle-income countries, 1999–2016. *BMJ Global Health*, 4(6), e001926. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjgh-2019-001926>
7. Carreon, A. (2024). Service quality and client satisfaction in calamba city civil registry. *JIP*, 2(8). <https://doi.org/10.69569/jip.2024.0272>
8. Chien, N. and Thanh, N. (2022). The impact of good governance on the people's satisfaction with public administrative services in vietnam. *Administrative Sciences*, 12(1), 35. <https://doi.org/10.3390/admsci12010035>
9. Devi, S., Madani, M., Mustari, N., & Fatmawati, F. (2024). Online-based public service innovation at the makassar city civil registry office. *Journal of Public Representative and Society Provision*, 4(2), 40-52. <https://doi.org/10.55885/jprsp.v4i2.504>
10. Dilapanga, A., Mantiri, J., & Dalipang, G. (2023). Analysis of digital government implementation in public services at the population and civil registration office of minahasa regency. *Technium Social Sciences Journal*, 49(1), 108-113. <https://doi.org/10.47577/tssj.v49i1.9788>
11. Disdukcapil Kota Makassar. (2024). Laporan Tahunan Pelayanan Administrasi Kependudukan Tahun 2024. Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil Kota Makassar.
12. Dunn, W. N. (2014). *Public Policy Analysis*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
13. Finger, M. and Pascual, J. (2023). Digitalizing infrastructure, digital platforms and public services. *Competition and Regulation in Network Industries*, 24(1), 40-53. <https://doi.org/10.1177/17835917231156099>
14. Firmansyah, V., Maulana, M., & Ismowati, M. (2022). The implementation of 'alpukat betawi' as a public service innovation. *Spirit Publik Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 17(2), 190. <https://doi.org/10.20961/sp.v17i2.65149>
15. Government of Indonesia. (1945). *Undang-Undang Dasar Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 1945* [The 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia].
16. Government of Indonesia. (2014). *Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 tentang Pemerintahan Daerah* [Law No. 23/2014 on Regional Government]. Jakarta: Sekretariat Negara Republik Indonesia.
17. Ha, B. (2024). Enhancing state management efficiency through administrative apparatus reforms in vietnam. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Analysis*, 07(04). <https://doi.org/10.47191/ijmra/v7-i04-36>
18. Haerati, H., Fatmawati, F., & Mustari, N. (2024). Partisipasi masyarakat dalam penerbitan akta kelahiran melalui sistem pelayanan berbasis digital. *Manage.Account.Res.Stat.J*, 4(2), 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.59583/mars.v4i2.105>
19. Hasan, Z., Junita, R., Mulia, S., Sofiani, I., & Ali, M. (2023). Analysis of public satisfaction at the bengkalis regency population and civil registration office riau province indonesia. *Jurnal Public Policy*, 9(3), 164. <https://doi.org/10.35308/jpp.v9i3.6579>
20. Irfadat, T. (2022). Manajemen pelayanan publik pada kantor dinas kependudukan dan pencatatan sipil kota makassar. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, 19(1), 91-114. <https://doi.org/10.59050/jian.v19i1.149>
21. Jihui, S., Nyedu, D., & Dong, W. (2022). A novel block chain method for urban digitization governance in birth registration field: a case study. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 19(15), 9309. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph19159309>
22. Karwur, R., Lumingkewas, L., & Langkay, J. (2022). Implementation of bureaucratic reform in population administration services in the digital era. *IJITE*, 2(1), 128-152. <https://doi.org/10.62711/ijite.v2i1.97>
23. Koagouw, E., Kairupan, S., & Mandagi, M. (2021). Implementation the indonesian electronic identity card policy in the office of population's civil registration minahasa regency. *Technium Social Sciences Journal*, 21, 85-96. <https://doi.org/10.47577/tssj.v21i1.3703>
24. Ministry of Home Affairs. (2021). *Pedoman Pelaksanaan Layanan Administrasi Kependudukan di Daerah Otonom* [Guidelines for the Implementation of Civil Registration Services in Autonomous Regions]. Jakarta: MoHA Press.
25. Nazira, H., Ikhsan, I., Marefanda, N., & Hajad, V. (2021). Effectiveness of public services at the population and civil registrasion office of west aceh regency. *Dia Jurnal Ilmiah Administrasi Publik*, 19(2), 411-420. <https://doi.org/10.30996/dia.v19i2.5505>
26. Nenobais, H., BUDIHardjo, B., MAMUaja, F., & NUGROHO, F. (2023). Evaluating the digital bureaucracy policy: population document digitalization in directorate general of population and civil registration. *Iccd*, 5(1). <https://doi.org/10.33068/iccd.v5i1.660>
27. Ningrum, S., Yuliyanti, F., Permana, I., & Bharoto, R. (2024). Quality of service in the preparation of population and civil registration administration documents at the Cirebon regency population and civil registration office. *Asian Journal of Social and Humanities*, 3(1), 171-181. <https://doi.org/10.59888/ajosh.v3i1.386>
28. Nugroho, R. (2014). *Public Policy: Theory, Policy Process, and Application*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.

29. Okoth, P. (2023). Security challenges in civil registration: safeguarding vital information in an evolving landscape. *World Journal of Advanced Research and Reviews*, 19(1), 1051-1071. <https://doi.org/10.30574/wjarr.2023.19.1.1203>
30. Pemerintah Kota Makassar. (2023). Peraturan Wali Kota Makassar Nomor 77 Tahun 2023 tentang Kedudukan, Susunan Organisasi, Tugas dan Fungsi serta Tata Kerja Dinas Kependudukan dan Pencatatan Sipil.
31. Rane, T., Mahanta, T., Islam, S., Gogoi, P., & Gogoi, B. (2020). Civil registration system (crs) for birth and death registration in assam – a rapid assessment. *Clinical Epidemiology and Global Health*, 8(1), 117-122. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cegh.2019.05.006>
32. Suthar, A., Khalifa, A., Yin, S., Wenz, K., Fat, D., Mills, S., ... & Mrkic, S. (2019). Evaluation of approaches to strengthen civil registration and vital statistics systems: a systematic review and synthesis of policies in 25 countries. *Plos Medicine*, 16(9), e1002929. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pmed.1002929>
33. Tariverdi, M., Núñez-del-Prado, M., Leonova, N., & Rentschler, J. (2023). Measuring accessibility to public services and infrastructure criticality for disasters risk management. *Scientific Reports*, 13(1). <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-023-28460-z>
34. Tonapa, C., Anwar, S., Tahier, I., & Pajariato, H. (2024). The impact of administrative services quality on public satisfaction: a case study at the population and civil registration office of luwu timur regency. *International Journal of Law Government and Communication*, 9(38), 227-239. <https://doi.org/10.35631/ijlgc.938015>
35. UNICEF. (2019). Birth registration for every child: Sustainable development starts here. United Nations Children's Fund.
36. Widodo, J. (2001). *Good Governance: A Study of Bureaucratic Accountability and Control*. Surabaya: Insan Cendekia.