Columbia University

IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK

THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF ARCHITECTURE PLANNING AND PRESERVATION

400 AVERY HALL

Pamela Jerome, AIA, LEED[™] AP Fall Semester 2014 Mondays: 11:00 - 1:00 PM, Rm 300, Avery Hall Course #: A6318

INTERNATIONAL CULTURAL SITE MANAGEMENT

Course Description

Impetus for the preservation of cultural heritage has developed through the recognition of sites as non-renewable resources. Training is readily available in the specific tasks required to implement preservation, such as documentation and conservation. Far less attention has been paid to the larger, more complex and comprehensive issues of management, the process by which the individual components of preservation are fit together and either succeed or fail.

The result has been a less than methodical approach to cultural site management. To address this lack of consistency, the Australian national committee of ICOMOS (International Council on Monuments and Sites) proposed the Burra Charter, which expanded the premises of the Venice Charter. This document is increasingly being adopted by organizations that have stewardship over sites as a practical method of planning and implementing a holistic approach to site management. The Burra Charter revolves around the identification of site significance, which is then used to define and guide the management policy within ethical, scientific, social, political and financial contexts.

This course will utilize the preservation process outlined in the Burra Charter as the basis for a rational, values-based approach to managing cultural sites. Using the framework of the World Heritage Convention, and its requirements for authenticity and integrity in order to achieve Outstanding Universal Value, this course has an international focus and will review case studies from both historic and archaeological sites. It is divided into three parts: the first focuses on the compilation of background information and identification of the key interested parties; it then progresses to the analysis of site significance and assessment of existing conditions and management constraints; and finally, the development of the management policy and strategies for its implementation are reviewed. The delicate balancing act between cultural enhancement and exploitation are explored, as well as the need to periodically monitor and reassess management policy.

Several case studies are presented by recognized experts. Many of the case studies are World Heritage sites. Students learn to critically evaluate the management process, and to recognize the needs of the various interested constituents. The class will become familiar with the various disciplines required to perform the series of tasks that make up the complex mosaic of management. Issues of over-visitation and the necessity of defining carrying capacity are discussed.

Requirements of the class include the course readings, preparation of a statement of significance and research assignments/class project. In addition, students will have the opportunity to take a field trip to one of the class case studies, Frank Lloyd Wright's masterpiece, Fallingwater.

Syllabus •

Class 1: Introduction: definition of cultural resource management.

9/8/14

Aims and logistics of the course. Identification of cultural heritage and exploration of the management process as defined by the Burra Charter. Other important charters and documents. Justification for the preservation of sites. International organizations and supervisory bodies involved in cultural heritage management and preservation.

Case studies: Sana'a and Shibam, Yemen.

Class 2:

Field trip: Class project.

9/15/14

Meet at Dyckman Farmhouse Museum, 4881 Broadway at 204th Street, Manhattan

Guest speaker: Susan DeVries, Director

Class 3:

National and regional planning.

9/22/14

Review of the larger cultural resource management context. Importance and use of national inventories as a tool for managing sites and prioritizing decisions. Comparison of the efficacy of national management policies versus those which evolve through significance assessment of individual sites within the context of other similar sites.

Case studies: Santa Fe, NM and Tarim, Yemen

Class 4: 10/6/14

The management process: background information and significance assessment.

Compiling existing data and creating inventories of significant sites. Graphic, written and oral documentation. Understanding changes over time from original to current use. Identification of key interested parties. The politics of preservation. Analysis of documentation to identify the values of the site and relationships to the interested parties. Understanding and evaluating cultural, use and emotional values. Preparing the formal statement of significance. Introduction to the planning process.

Guest speaker: Sandeep Sikka, WASA/Studio A

Case study: Nako Research and Preservation Project (NRPP), Upper Kinnaur, India

Class 5:

The management process: condition assessment.

9/29/14

The process of condition assessment and planning for the condition survey. Establishment of base line documentation. Review of climatic conditions and other natural phenomena affecting the site. Implementation of environmental monitoring. The need for sampling and materials analysis. The use of remote sensing and other non-destructive techniques. Conservation ethics.

Case studies: St. John's Hall, Fordham University and Solomon R. Guggenheim Museum

Class 6:

The management process: assessment of the management context.

10/13/14 •

Defining constraints and opportunities. Legal framework, regulations and authorities involved. Available expertise and resources for archaeological excavation, historic restoration or adaptive reuse. Budgetary and time constraints. Current and projected visitor patterns. Staffing organization and resource management. Training opportunities.

Class 7: 10/20/14

The management process: defining the management policy. *Midterm due.*Setting forth principles and policies relating to appropriate uses, fragility of materials and location, conservation interventions, visitation and interpretation,

management structure, future needs. Effective management and cultural

significance preservation. Integration and effect of research and statement of significance on policy. Management objectives.

Class 8:

Review. Midterm presentations.

10/27/14

Presentation of students' midterm projects. Review of previous steps in the management process and synthesis of the process to date for the class case study. Acknowledgment of the fact that these steps are typically not followed because the tendency is to immediately begin defining strategies, and thus, the results are usually poor.

Student presentations of Midterms.

Class 9:

The management process: strategy development.

11/10/14

Specific practices and operational procedures relating to research, conservation and maintenance. Instituting the management objective. Conflicting values and compromises. Training and sustainability. Human resources and education. Disaster preparedness.

Guest speaker: Frank Sanchis, World Monuments Fund.

Case study: TWA Terminal, NYC

Class 11a:

Strategies: visitor management and financial strategies (part 1).

11/17/14

Effective management of cultural tourism. Visitor control and carrying capacities. Infrastructure planning and impact. Site development and marketing. Identification of target visitors and coping with tourism. Threats to resources and impact on conservation. Visitor circulation and safety. Educational and interpretive opportunities. Presentation of the site. Providing for ongoing heritage funds and cyclical maintenance. Involvement and cooperation of the private sector. Identification of funding sources and fundraising. Entrance fee management. Public sector involvement.

Case study: Fallingwater.

Class 11b:

Strategies: visitor management and financial strategies (part 2).

11/17/14

Case studies: Stonehenge and Avebury.

Class 12:

Compilation and implementation of the management plan.

Compilation and production of the management plan. Background and planning documents. Statements of legal responsibility and significance. Description of the site and its condition. Policies and strategies of conservation and management. Case studies: Knossos, Crete; Ellis Island south side; and al-'Amiriya, Rada',

Yemen.

Class 10:

Strategies: legal strategies.

11/24/14

Provision for an administrative structure and specific custodial and/or consultation rights. Mandatory recording and registration. Universal protection of sites and international agreements.

Guest speaker: Barbara Hoffman, Esq.

12/1/14

Draft final due.

Class 13:

Other considerations and monitoring, review and revision.

12/8/14

The role of the site manager. The role of consultants and the importance of good briefs to guide their work. Contracts. Periodic review of policies. Monitoring of conditions and effect of management strategy. Revision and updating of policies when needed.

Case studies: Chan Chan, Peru and Parthenon, Athens.

Class 14:

Final exam: student presentations. Final report due.

12/15/14

Bibliography of Class Readings: Seminar Shelf # 351

Class 1: Introduction: definition of cultural resource management.

Athens Charter (1931)

Venice Charter (1964)

European Convention on the Protection of the Archaeological Heritage (1969?)

Burra Charter (1979, 1999)

Appleton Charter for the Protection and Enhancement of the Built Environment (1983)

Charter for the Conservation of Historic Towns and Urban Areas (1987)

ICAHM Charter: Charter for the Protection and Management of the Archaeological Heritage (1990)

Charter for the Conservation of Places of Cultural Heritage Value (1992)

Nara Document on Authenticity (1994)

ICOMOS Cultural Tourism Charter (1998)

Proposals Concerning the Desirability of a Standard-Setting Instrument on Historic Urban Landscapes (2011)

Daifuku, Hiroshi, "The significance of cultural property," *The Conservation of Cultural Property* (Paris: UNESCO, 1968)

Lambrinou, Lenna, "Preserving a monument: the example of the Parthenon," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol.12, No. 1 (2010): 60-74

Marquis-Kyle, Peter and Meredith Walker, *The Illustrated Burra Charter. Good Practice for Heritage Places* (Burwood, VIC: Australia ICOMOS, 2004)

Stovel, Herb, "Origins and influence of the Nara Document on Authenticity," APT Bulletin, Vol. 39, Nos. 2-3 (2008): 9-17

US/ICOMOS, "International Cultural Heritage Conventions," Scientific Journal, Vol. II, No. 1 (2000)

Class 2: Field trip.

Dyckman Farmhouse Museum Alliance, "Farm to City

Dyckman Farmhouse Museum Alliance, "The Military Hut at Dyckman"

http://dyckmanfarmhouse.org/resources-for-researchers/

Class 3: National and regional planning.

Cameron, Christina, "From Warsaw to Mostar: the World Heritage Committee and authenticity," APT Bulletin, Vol. 39, Nos. 2-3 (2008): 19-24

"A danger list in danger. In its care for precious places, the UN cultural agency is torn between its own principles and its members' wishes; the principles are losing ground," *Economist* (August 26, 2010)

Feilden, Bernard M and Jukka Jokilehto, "General policy of the Convention," Management Guidelines for World Cultural Heritage Sites (Rome: ICCROM, 1993), 5-10

Jerome, Pamela, "The values-based approach to cultural-heritage preservation," APT Bulletin, Vol. 45, No. 2-3 (2014): 3-8

Mathews, Anne, "Beyond the glare and the blare," Preservation (May/June 2004): 31-35

Mitchell, Nora J., "Considering the authenticity of cultural landscapes," *APT Bulletin*, Vol. 39, Nos. 2-3 (2008): 25-31

Pearson, Michael and Sharon Sullivan, "Documenting the resource," Looking after Heritage Places: the Basics of Heritage Planning for Managers, Landowners and Administrators (Carlton, Victoria: Melbourne University Press, 1995), 82-125

Sullivan, Sharon, "A planning model for the management of archaeological sites," in Marta de la Torre, ed., *The Conservation of Archaeological Sites in the Mediterranean Region* (Los Angeles: Getty Conservation Institute, 1997), 15-26

UNESCO, Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention (Paris: World Heritage Centre, 2013)

UNESCO, "Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape," Annex (11 November 2011), 1-8

Class 4: The management process: background information and significance assessment.

Burke, Sheridan and Susan Macdonald, "Creativity and conservation: managing significance at the Sydney Opera House," APT Bulletin, Vol. 45, No. 2-3 (2014): 31-37

Demas, Martha, "Planning for conservation and management of archaeological sites. A values-based approach," in Jeanne Marie Teutonico and Gaetano Palumbo, eds., *Management Planning for Archaeological Sites* (Los Angeles: J Paul Getty Trust, 2000), 27-54

Johnston, Chris, What Is Social Value? (Canberra: Australian Government Publishing Service, 1994)

Jokilehto, Jukka, The World Heritage List. What is OUV? Defining the Outstanding Universal Value of Cultural World Heritage Properties. Monuments and Sites, XVI (Berlin: ICOMOS, 2008)

Kerr, James Semple, The Conservation Plan: a Guide to the Preparation of Conservation Plans for Places of European Cultural Significance (Sydney: National Trust of Australia, 1985), 22-60

Mason, Randall, "Assessing values in conservation planning: methodological issues and choices," in Marta de la Torre, ed., *Assessing the Values of Cultural Heritage* (Los Angeles: Getty Conservation Institute, 200), 5-30

Pearson, Michael and Sharon Sullivan, "Assessing the value of heritage places," Looking after Heritage Places: the Basics of Heritage Planning for Managers, Landowners and Administrators (Carlton, Victoria: Melbourne University Press, 1995), 126-186

Van Balen, Konraad, The Nara Grid: an evaluation scheme based on the Nara Document on Authenticity," APT Bulletin, Vol. 39, Nos. 2-3 (2008): 39-45

von Droste, Bernd, "The concept of outstanding universal value and its application: 'from the seven wonders of the ancient world to the 1,000 world heritage places today'," *Cultural Heritage Management and Sustainable Development*, Vol. 1, No. 1 (2011): 26-41

Class 5: The management process: condition assessment.

Alshawabkeh, Yahyah and Fadi Bal'awi, "3D digital documentation, assessment and damage quatification of the al-Deir monument in the ancient city of Petra, Jordan," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 12, No. 2 (2010): 124-145

Conlon, James and Pamela Jerome, "Documenting and representing the historic city of Tarim," in Leslie Rainer, Angelyn Bass Rivera, and David Gandreau, eds., Terra 2008. 10th International Conference on the Study and Conservation of Earthen Architectural Heritage (Los Angeles: J. Paul Getty Trust, 2011), 55-62

Jerome, Pamela, "An introduction to authenticity in preservation," *APT Bulletin*, Vol. 39, Nos. 2-3, (2008): 3-7

Jerome, Pamela S, Norman R Weiss, Allan S Gilbert and John A Scott, "Ethyl silicate as a treatment for marble: conservation of St John's Hall, Fordham University," *APT Bulletin*, Vol. 29, No. 10 (1998): 19-26

Mathien, FJ and TC Windes, "The value of photographic documentation in archaeological research," CRM: Cultural Resources Management, Vol. 12, No. 5 (1989): 1-5

Wheeler, David L, "Archaeologists use technology to avoid invasive excavations," *The Chronicle of Higher Education* (November 20, 1998): A13-A14

Class 6: The management process: assessment of the management context.

Araoz, Gustavo, "World-Heritage Historic Urban Landscapes: defining and protecting authenticity," APT Bulletin, Vol. 39, Nos. 2-3 (2008): 33-37

Feilden, Bernard M and Jukka Jokilehto, "Staffing and personnel services," *Management Guidelines for World Cultural Heritage Sites* (Rome: ICCROM, 1993), 47-58

Fitch, James Marston, "Extended and adaptive use," *Historic Preservation. Curatorial Management of the Built World* (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1982), 165-186

Ganau, Joan, "Invention and Authenticity in Barcelona's Barri Gótic," Future Anterior, Vol. 3, No. 2 (Winter 2006): 10-23

ICOMOS Charter on the Built Vernacular Heritage (1999)

Taruvinga, Pascal and Weber Ndoro, "The vandalism of the Domboshava rock painting site, Zimbabwe. Some reflections on approaches to heritage management," *Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites*, Vol. 6, No. 1 (2003): 3-10

Class 7: The management process: defining the management policy.

de la Torre, Marta, "Values in heritage conservation: a project of the Getty Conservation Institute," APT Bulletin, Vol. 45, No. 2-3 (2014): 19-24

Mora, Paolo, Laura Mora and Paul Philippot, "Problems of presentation," in Nicholas Stanley Price, M Kirby Talley Jr. and Alessandra Melucco Vaccaro, eds., *Historical and Philosophical Issues in the Conservation of Cultural Heritage* (Los Angeles: Getty Conservation Institute, 1996), 343-354

Pearson, Michael and Sharon Sullivan, "Planning for heritage place management," Looking after Heritage Places: the Basics of Heritage Planning for Managers, Landowners and Administrators (Carlton, Victoria: Melbourne University Press, 1995), 187-219

Pwiti, Gilbert, "Let the ancestors rest in peace? Heritage management in Zimbabwe," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 1, No. 3 (1996): 151-160

Schmidt, Hartwig, "Reconstruction of ancient buildings," in Marta de la Torre, ed., *The Conservation of Archaeological Sites in the Mediterranean Region* (Los Angeles: Getty Conservation Institute, 1997), 41-50

Stanley Price, Nicholas, ed., "The conservation and use of ancient theaters," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 1, No. 4 (1996): 247-248

van Oers, Ron, "Managing cities and the historic urban landscape initiative – an introduction," in Ron van Oers and Sachiko Haraguchi, eds., *Managing Historic Cities. World Heritage Papers* 27 (Paris: UNESCO, 2010), 7-17

"The Verona Charter (1997) on the Use of Ancient Places of Performance," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 3, No. 3 (1999): 163-168

Class 8: Review.

Agnew, Neville, Heather Griffin, Mary Wade, Terence Tebble and Warren Oxnam, "Strategies and techniques for the preservation of fossil tracksites: an Australian example," in David D Gillete and Martin G Lockley, eds., *Dinosaur Tracks and Traces* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989)

Class 9: The management process: strategy development.

Andrews, Thomas D. and Susan Buggey, "Authenticity and Aboriginal cultural landscapes," *APT Bulletin*, Vol. 39, Nos. 2-3 (2008): 63-71

Clark, Kate, "Values-based heritage management and the Heritage Lottery Fund," APT Bulletin, Vol. 45, No. 2-3 (2014): 65-71

Feilden, Bernard M and Jukka Jokilehto, "Maintenance programme," Management Guidelines for World Cultural Heritage Sites (Rome: ICCROM, 1993), 41-46

Feilden, Bernard M and Jukka Jokilehto, "Treatments and authenticity," *Management Guidelines for World Cultural Heritage Sites* (Rome: ICCROM, 1993), 59-76

Jerome, Pamela, Norman Weiss and Hazel Ephron, "Fallingwater part 2: materials-conservation efforts at Frank Lloyd Wright's masterpiece," *APT Bulletin*, Vol. 37, No. 2-3 (2006): 3-12

Titchen, Sarah M, "Some comments on the implementation of the 1972 UNESCO World Heritage Convention," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 1, No. 4 (1996): 235-242

Weiss, Norman, Pamela Jerome and Stephen Gottlieb, "Fallingwater part 1: materials-conservation efforts at Frank Lloyd Wright's masterpiece," APT Bulletin, Vol. 32, No. 4 (2001): 44-56

Class 10: Strategies: legal strategies.

Demas, Martha, "Ephesus," in Marta de la Torre, ed., *The Conservation of Archaeological Sites in the Mediterranean Region* (Los Angeles: Getty Conservation Institute, 1997), 127-149

Feilden, Bernard M and Jukka Jokilehto, "Management of World Heritage Sites," Management Guidelines for World Cultural Heritage Sites (Rome: ICCROM, 1993), 23-34

Hoffman, Barbara, ed., Art and Cultural Heritage: Law, Policy and Practice (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006) Introduction, Part 4: Protecting World Heritage, Part 5: 245-49

Hutt, S, CM Blanco, WE Stern and SN Harris, Cultural Property Law: A Practitioner's Guide to the Management, Protection, and Preservation of Heritage Resources (Chicago, IL: American Bar Association, 2004)

Karaim, Reed, "What lies beneath?" Preservation (September/October 2001): 44-51

Mathews, Anne, "Making the list," Preservation (July/August 1998): 64-73

Randall, Frederika, "Pompeii sees the light," Preservation (July/August 1998): 20-22

Class 11a: Strategies: visitor management and financial strategies (part 1).

The ICOMOS Charter for the Interpretation and Presentation of Cultural Sites (Ename Charter) (2008)

ICOMOS, Cultural Tourism: Tourism at World Heritage Cultural Sites: The Site Manager's Handbook (Sri Lanka: ICOMOS, 1994)

ICOMOS, International Charter on Cultural Tourism (1999)

Lyon, Jo, "The Temple of Mithras: changing heritage values in the City of London 1954-2006," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 9 No. 1 (2007): 5-37

Ndoro, Webber and Gilbert Pwiti, "Marketing the past: the 'Shona village' at Great Zimbabwe," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 2, No. 1 (1997): 3-8

Padopoulou, Evi, "Restoration and the public: results of a visitors' survey on the restoration of the Acropolis monuments," *Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites*, Vol. 10, No. 2 (2008): 132-156

Pearson, Michael and Sharon Sullivan, "Visitor management and interpretation," Looking after Heritage Places: the Basics of Heritage Planning for Managers, Landowners and Administrators (Carlton, Victoria: Melbourne University Press, 1995), 277-306

Rossi, Alana M and Esmée Webb, "The consequences of allowing unrestricted tourist access at an Aboriginal site in a fragile environment: the erosive effect of trampling," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 9, No. 4 (2007): 219-236

Sivan, Renée, "The presentation of archaeological sites," in Marta de la Torre, ed., *The Conservation of Archaeological Sites in the Mediterranean Region* (Los Angeles: Getty Conservation Institute, 1997), 51-59

Vafedari, Azadeh, "Visitor management and the development of sustainable cultural tourism and local community participation at Chogha Zanbil, Iran," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 10, No. 3 (2008): 264-304

Class 11b: Strategies: visitor management and financial strategies (part 2).

Baxter, Ian and Christopher Chippendale, "From 'national disgrace' to flagship monument. Recent attempts to manage the future of Stonehenge," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 5, No. 3 (2002): 151-184

Class 12: Compilation and implementation of the management plan.

Cleere, Henry, "Management plans for archaeological sites: a World Heritage template," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 12, No. 1 (2010): 4-12

Feilden, Bernard M and Jukka Jokilehto, "Management by resource projects," *Management Guidelines for World Cultural Heritage Sites* (Rome: ICCROM, 1993), 35-40

Kienzle, Peter, "Conservation and reconstruction at the Palace of Minos at Knossos," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 2, No. 2 (1997) 121-124

Malouchou-Tufano, Fani, "Thirty years of anastelosis works on the Athenian Acropolis, 1975-2005," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 8, No. 1 (2006) 27-38

Papadopoulos, John K, "Knossos," in Marta de la Torre, ed., *The Conservation of Archaeological Sites in the Mediterranean Region* (Los Angeles: Getty Conservation Institute, 1997), 93-125

Papageorgiou, Loucia, "The unification of archaeological sites of Athens: the birth of an archaeological park?" Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 4, No. 3 (2000): 176-184

Pearson, Michael and Sharon Sullivan, "Implementing heritage place management," Looking after Heritage Places: the Basics of Heritage Planning for Managers, Landowners and Administrators (Carlton, Victoria: Melbourne University Press, 1995), 220-276

Rössler, Mechtild, "Applying authenticity to cultural landscapes," APT Bulletin, Vol. 39, Nos. 2-3 (2008): 47-52

Class 13: Other considerations and monitoring, review and revision.

Bandarin, Francesco, Jyoti Hosagrahar and Frances Sailer Albernaz, "Why development needs culture," *Cultural Heritage Management and Sustainable Development*, Vol. 1, No. 1 (2011): 15-25

Gibson, McGuire, "Culture as afterthought: US planning and non-planning in the invasion of Iraq," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 11, Nos. 3-4 (2009): 333-339

Johnston, Chris, "Inhabiting place: social significance in practice in Australia," APT Bulletin, Vol. 45, No. 2-3 (2014): 65-71

Jones, Sîan, "Experiencing authenticity at heritage sites: some implications for heritage management and conservation," *Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites*, Vol. 11, No. 2 (2009): 133-147

Ko, Jennifer, "Regional authenticity: an argument for reconstruction in Oceania," *APT Bulletin*, Vol. 39, Nos. 2-3 (2008): 55-61

O'Neill, Tom, "Saving Places," National Geographic (October 2002): 58-73

Pearson, Michael and Sharon Sullivan, "Some current issues and future concerns," Looking after Heritage Places: the Basics of Heritage Planning for Managers, Landowners and Administrators (Carlton, Victoria: Melbourne University Press, 1995), 307-319

Perring, Dominic, "Archaeology and the post-war reconstruction of Beirut," Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites, Vol. 11, Nos. 3-4 (2009): 296-314