
**PLANNING FOR RETAIL
PLAN A6109.001**

Spring 2014

TUESDAY 11:00 - 1:00; 323M FAYERWEATHER

Prof. Stacey Sutton

ss3115@columbia.edu Office: 204 Buell Hall

Office Hours: Tuesday 3:00 - 5:00 and by appointment

COURSE DESCRIPTION:

In cities and towns across the country, banal and unsavory retail corridors have been transformed into quaint and alluring shopping destinations. Some neighborhoods previously considered “under-retailed” are now experiencing commercial growth and diversification. In contrast, neighborhoods long-celebrated for distinctive shopping and dining options are increasingly populated by banal national chain stores and suburban-style shopping establishments. Although retail amenities are critical determinants of healthy, sustainable and resilient communities, planning for retail is, arguably, more idiosyncratic than many other aspects of planning (e.g., housing, redevelopment, transportation, etc.).

It’s generally agreed that retail access, density, diversity and quality inform popular perceptions about places as sites for consumption, work, habitation and investment. But this is little agreement about the appropriate retail mix within a locality. How far are consumers willing to travel for different types of amenities and via different modes of transit? Are there reasonable tradeoffs between retail density and quality? Should commercial corridors be planned or should they develop organically? If planning is warranted, what types of policies, programs and tools are needed to support commercial development and sustainability? Although these and other questions undergird well-functioning commercial corridors, answers are rarely clear cut.

The purpose of this “applied” graduate seminar is to develop conceptual and analytical tools necessary to assess local retail need and recommend a retail strategy. In this seminar you will: (1) learn popular perspectives about retail development; (2) learn retail planning tools, such as conducting a retail land-use inventory, leakage analysis, consumer preference survey, traffic/demand analysis, and more; (3) learn how to use public and private data sources appropriate for analysis; (4) develop a retail plan (for a NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) retail site in the Melrose section of the Bronx)

NYC HPD – Planning for Retail Project

Under the New Housing Marketplace Plan (NHMP), which guided affordable housing development in the city for the last ten years, HPD’s top priority was expanding New York’s stock of affordable housing. While there were, and still are, initiatives and programs designed to meet the needs of specific populations (e.g. extremely low income families, senior citizens, homeless populations, etc.)

and/or integrate affordable housing with other amenities, like neighborhood retail, transit, open space, and community facility space, the main goal was preserving existing affordable units and bringing new ones online.

Now that the NHMP has come to a close, the City and HPD leadership are highly interested in exploring opportunities that take a more holistic approach to neighborhood redevelopment. This means making housing investments that don't just create or preserve affordable units, but also create jobs, increase accessibility to needed goods and services, and, in general, expand economic opportunities in the neighborhoods HPD serves.

Affordable housing with ground floor retail represents a tremendous opportunity to advance these goals. The agency is committed to building its mixed-use development capacity and strengthening its efforts to revitalize neighborhoods. Your workshop will enhance HPD's ability to analyze neighborhood retail development opportunities and improve the agency's capacity to match commercial space with local demand. Additionally, because the workshop will focus on an actual site, your students' analyses can help inform decision-making around the development process.

COURSE MATERIAL:

ECONSULT – “Commercial Corridors: A Strategic Investment Framework for Philadelphia” (March 2009) http://www.econsult.com/commercial_corridors.htm

- Main Report - Chapters 1 - 12
- Appendices

I will share examples / tools throughout the semester

COURSE ASSIGNMENTS:

Week 4 – 2/11:

- Neighborhood Characteristics: socioeconomic, demographic, transit, housing attributes, access to amenities, “comparable” neighborhoods, borough and citywide averages

Week 6 – 2/25:

- Retail Inventory (Historical): retail mix, performance (sales + employees),

Week 9 – 3/25:

- Corridor/Site Characteristics (Contemporary): use, vacancy, character, condition, retail mix, competition, institutional support
- Consumer Preference Survey and Analysis
- Pedestrian / Vehicular Traffic Behavior

Week 11 – 4/8:

- Leakage Analysis

Week 13 & 14 – 4/22 & 4/29

- Presentation of Leakage Analysis and Site Analysis
- Presentation of Recommendations

COURSE SCHEDULE:

PART I: THE COMMERCIAL CORRIDOR AS SITE FOR PLANNING

Week 1 COMMERCE, CONSUMPTION AND CORRIDORS

1/21

What constitutes a “good” retail corridor, and who is it good for? What does the corridor tell us about the neighborhood? What is the role for planners in shaping retail dynamics?

Reading:

- FEUER, ALAN “The Bank Around the Corner,” *The New York Times* (December 23, 2011) [NYT Bank around the corner](#)
- BELLAFANTE, GINIA “Where Optimism Feels Out of Reach,” *The New York Times* (January 14, 2012) [Where Optimism Feels Out of Reach](#)
- Ruth Knack. 2010. “Great Places in America: ... On the Streets Where We Live” *Planning*, American Planning Association Journal

Week 2 THE RETAIL TRADE: MALLS, MARKETS AND MICRO-HOODS

1/28

Forms of retailing and commercial development

Reading:

- Christina M.L. Kelton, Ph.D. and Robert P. Rebelein, Ph.D. “Can we have a high-end retail department store?” *Economic Development Journal* / Winter 2007 / Volume 6 / Number 1 22
- James H. Carr and Lisa J. Servon (2009) Vernacular Culture and Urban Economic Development: Thinking Outside the (Big) Box *Journal of the American Planning Association*, Vol. 75, No. 1, Winter
- Clive Thomas. 2005 (May 21) “The rise of the micro-neighborhood” *New York Magazine*.
- ECONSULT “Commercial Corridors” – Main Report - chapter 1

Week 3 THE NEIGHBORHOOD

2/04

Theories of retail change, methods for analyzing the process and

Reading:

- K. Chapple and J. Jacobus. 2009. “Retail trade as a route to neighborhood revitalization”
- Michael D. Beyard, Michael Pawlukiewicz and Alex Bond (2003) “Ten Principles for Rebuilding Neighborhood Retail” Urban Land Institute
- ECONSULT Commercial Corridors – Main Report - chapter 3

Discuss Neighborhood attributes: socioeconomic and demographic and industry data to collect for Melrose and comparable neighborhoods (Due WEEK 4)

Week 4 THE CORRIDOR

2/11

Assessing the retail environment begins with socioeconomic, demographic and commercial trends in the area.

Reading:

- Elsie Achugbue. 2006. “Nontraditional Market Analyses: Dismantling Barriers to Retail Development in Underserved Neighborhoods” (Social Compact)
- Retail Study Market Analysis (for 125th Street). 2007
- ECONSULT Commercial Corridors – Main Report - chapter 2, 4

DUE: Nhood
Profile

Week 5 GETTING TO KNOW RETAIL DATA

2/18

Reading:

- ECONSULT – Commercial Corridors – Appendices – section IV (p 15-35)
- ECONSULT – Commercial Corridors – Main Report – Chapter 10

Sources:

- Reference USA – historical records available through CU
- NAICS (SIC) - <http://www.census.gov/eos/www/naics/>
- Bureau of Labor Statistics - Consumer Expenditure Survey <http://www.bls.gov/ce/>

Week 6 CONSUMER PREFERENCES

2/25

Reading:

DUE:
Corridor
Profile

- ECONSULT – Commercial Corridors – Main Report – chapter 6
- Salvatore - Consumer preference and choice – chapter 3
- Consumer preference theory

Week 7 SURVEY DESIGN: CONSUMER PREFERENCE AND CORRIDOR USE

3/04

Develop survey tools in class

Week 8 SURVEY IMPLEMENTATION

3/11

SPRING BREAK

Week 9 CORRIDOR ATTRIBUTES, RETAIL NEEDS

3/25

Film: Twilight Becomes Night

DUE:
Survey
Results

- Discuss additional retail needs
- Discuss Leakage Analysis

Week 10 WHAT TYPE OF RETAIL IS BEST?: CONFLICTS BETWEEN INDEPENDENT VS. CHAIN RETAILERS

4/01

Reading:

- A. Dean and R. Sobel. 2008. "Has WalMart buried Mom & Pop?" *Regulation* (Spring)
- S. Mitchell. "Major Flaws Uncovered in Study Claiming Wal-Mart Has Not Harmed Small Business"
- Marlon G Boarnet; Randall Crane; Daniel G Chatman; Michael Manville (2005) "Emerging Planning Challenges in Retail" American Planning Association. *Journal of the American Planning Association*; 71, 4 pg. 433
- Scott Stringer "Saving the Mom & Pops"
- Center for an Urban Future - "chained up"
http://nycfuture.org/content/articles/article_view.cfm?article_id=1297&article_type=6

Week 11 INSTITUTIONAL SUPPORT: ARE BIDS THE BEST STRATEGY?

4/08

DUE:
Preliminary
Leakage
Analysis

Business improvement districts (BIDs) have become an internationally popular strategy for sustaining and bolstering commercial corridors. How well do they work, and for whom? What are their strengths and weaknesses?

Reading:

- The Furman Center. 2007. "The benefits of business improvement districts"
- Jan Gross (2005) Business "Improvement Districts in New York City's Low-Income and High-Income Neighborhoods" *Economic Development Quarterly*, Vol. 19 No. 2, 174-189
- Stacey Sutton (2014, forthcoming) Are BIDs good for businesses?: The Impact of BIDs on Neighborhood Retailers in New York City, *Journal of Planning Education Research*

- Week 12** **RETAIL PLANNING AND POLICY**
4/15 How are zoning and regulatory tools being used across the country to shape retail composition
(Thesis Jury and preserve community character? What types of policies (or “interventions”) might work in
Week) NYC? Are chain stores the problem?
 Reading:
- Zoning and Regulatory Tools - The New Rules Project:
 <http://www.newrules.org/retail/rules/>
 - Patrick Hedlund. 2008. “Trying to find a new formula to tame the spread of chains”
- Week 13** **LEAKAGE ANALYSIS & SITE ANALYSIS**
4/22 How have retailers in your area performed historically? How are they performing currently?
Presentation Relative to what area or type of businesses? How are retail sales and real estate traits
 correlated?
- Week 14** **RECOMMENDATIONS**
4/29
Presentation