

FALLACY OF COMPOSITION, FALLACY OF DECOMPOSITION, AND POST HOC FALLACY WORKSHEET

by Dick Brunelle and Steven Reff
©reffeconomics 2009

Identify any fallacies of composition or decomposition in the following dialogue.

Betty Sue and Jim Bob are out on a date. They are at the Pig Out Barbecue Restaurant and the following conversation takes place.

Betty Sue: "Jim Bob, what are you planning on as a major in college next year?"

Jim Bob: "I don't know but it is not important."

Betty Sue: "Why not?"

JB: "Well my high school football team won the Texas State Championship this year. We were the best team in the state. That means that I was the best left offensive tackle in the state. I am not sure if I will finish college, I will be making big bucks in the NFL. Pass the barbecue sauce, please."

BS: "Well, that's great!"

JB: "What are you going to major in, Betty Sue?"

BS: "I am going to major in Chinese. The trade with China has been good for the United States, so everyone in the country is better off. There will be opportunities for people who speak Chinese."

JB: "You all going to move to China?"

BS: "Depends if I am married or not."

JB: "You won't be."

BS: "Why not?"

JB: "Well we have been going out for two years and it has been fun; but it would not be good for me to marry you; so no one else will."

BS : (Tearing up) "You son of a gun!"

JB: "Now Betty Sue, don't jump to conclusions. I still think the world of you but I plan to save 80% of my salary for 20 years, I can't do that and get married."

BS: "Why would you do that?"

JB: "I will be rich at the end of 20 years. If everyone in the country saved at least 40% of his or her salary, everyone would be rich in 20 years. I need another order of pork ribs."

BS: "Well I guess you love money more than you love me!"

JB: "Who said I loved you?"

BS: "You son of gun!"

JB: "Betty Sue, stop saying that. We are in a public restaurant."

BS: "You're right! I should stop insulting the entrée!"

JB: "What does that mean?"

BS: "Never mind. Take me home."

JB: "Can I finish eating?"

BS: "You may not be the best offensive tackle, but you are undoubtedly the most offensive."