

Philosophical Logic Problem Set 5

i. Prove by induction

Consider arbitrary PC model $M = \langle D, I \rangle$

Prove by induction that for all PC-uff ϕ , if variable assignments g and h for M agree on the free variables in ϕ , then $V_{M,g}(\phi) = V_{M,h}(\phi)$.

Base case

Consider arbitrary PC-uff ϕ such that $c(\phi) = 0$, i.e. number of connectives $c(\phi) = 0$. Then ϕ is a basic uff $\pi a_1 \dots a_n$. $I(\pi) = I(\pi)_{M,h}$. $I(a_i) = I(a_i)$ if a_i is a constant, $g(a_i)$ if a_i is a variable. a_i is free each of a_1, \dots, a_n is free in ϕ , so $g(a_i) = h(a_i)$ for each of these, if it is a variable, $g(a_i) = h(a_i)$, so $I(a_i)_{M,g} = I(a_i)_{M,h}$ for $a_i \in \{a_1, \dots, a_n\}$. $V_{M,g}(\phi) = 1$ iff $\langle I(a_1)_{M,g}, \dots, I(a_n)_{M,g} \rangle \in I(\pi)_{M,g}$ iff $\langle I(a_1)_{M,h}, \dots, I(a_n)_{M,h} \rangle \in I(\pi)_{M,h}$ iff $V_{M,h}(\phi) = 1$. So for such ϕ , $V_{M,g}(\phi) = V_{M,h}(\phi)$.

Induction Hypothesis

Given n , for all $m < n$, if for all ϕ such that $c(\phi) = m$, if g and h agree on free variables in ϕ , then $V_{M,g}(\phi) = V_{M,h}(\phi)$.

Induction Step

Consider arbitrary PC-uff ϕ such that $c(\phi) = n$. Then $\phi = \neg \psi$, $\psi \rightarrow k$ or $\forall a \psi$.

Suppose $\phi = \neg \psi$. Then $V_{M,g}(\phi) = 1$ iff $V_{M,g}(\psi) = 0$ iff by IH, $V_{M,h}(\psi) = 0$ iff $V_{M,h}(\phi) = 1$, so $V_{M,g}(\phi) = V_{M,h}(\phi)$.

Suppose $\phi = \psi \rightarrow k$. Then $V_{M,g}(\phi) = 1$ iff $V_{M,g}(\psi) = 0$ or $V_{M,g}(k) = 1$ iff by IH, $V_{M,h}(\psi) = 0$ or $V_{M,h}(k) = 1$ iff $V_{M,h}(\phi) = 1$, so $V_{M,g}(\phi) = V_{M,h}(\phi)$.

Suppose $\phi = \forall a \psi$. Then $V_{M,g}(\phi) = 1$ iff $\forall u \in D: V_{M,g,a}(\psi) = 1$. Every free variable in ψ except a is a free variable in ϕ , so g and h agree on these. Then g_a and h_a agree on these. By construction, g_a and h_a agree on a . So g_a and h_a agree on the free variables in ψ . $V_{M,g}(\phi) = 1$ iff $\forall u \in D: V_{M,g,a}(\psi) = 1$ iff $\forall u \in D: V_{M,h,a}(\psi) = 1$ iff $V_{M,h}(\phi) = 1$, so $V_{M,g}(\phi) = V_{M,h}(\phi)$.

By cases, for ϕ such that $c(\phi) = n$, if g and h agree on the free variables in ϕ , then $V_{M,g}(\phi) = V_{M,h}(\phi)$.

By induction, for all PC-uff ϕ , if g and h agree on the free variables, then $V_{M,g}(\phi) = V_{M,h}(\phi)$.

ii. Prove the given claim by strong induction over the complexity $c(\phi)$ of ϕ .

Base case.

$c(\phi) = 0$. ϕ is some basic uff $\pi a_1 \dots a_n$. $I(\pi)_{M,g} = I(\pi)_{M,h}$. For $a_i \in \{a_1, \dots, a_n\}$, if a_i is a constant, then $I(a_i)_{M,g} = I(a_i)_{M,h}$. If a_i is a variable, then $I(a_i)_{M,g} = g(a_i)$ and $I(a_i)_{M,h} = h(a_i)$. Since g and h agree on the free variables in ϕ , $g(a_i) = h(a_i)$. So $I(a_i)_{M,g} = I(a_i)_{M,h}$. $\langle I(a_1)_{M,g}, \dots, I(a_n)_{M,g} \rangle \in I(\pi)_{M,g}$ iff $\langle I(a_1)_{M,h}, \dots, I(a_n)_{M,h} \rangle \in I(\pi)_{M,h}$ iff $V_{M,g}(\phi) = 1$ iff $V_{M,h}(\phi) = 1$.

