Characterising Renaming within OCaml's Module System

Reuben Rowe, Hugo Férée, Simon Thompson, and Scott Owens

Cornell University Department of Computer Science Seminar in Programming Languages Wednesday 28th November 2018

• Renaming (e.g. functions) in (real-world) OCaml is hard!

- · Renaming (e.g. functions) in (real-world) OCaml is hard!
 - usual engineering problems
 - · multi-file programs
 - · preprocessors
 - · build systems ...

- · Renaming (e.g. functions) in (real-world) OCaml is hard!
 - · usual engineering problems
 - · multi-file programs
 - preprocessors
 - · build systems ...
 - but also due to powerful module system
 - functors
 - module types
 - · aliases and constraints ...

- · Renaming (e.g. functions) in (real-world) OCaml is hard!
 - · usual engineering problems
 - · multi-file programs
 - preprocessors
 - · build systems ...
 - but also due to powerful module system
 - functors
 - module types
 - · aliases and constraints ...
- Need a formal mechanism for reasoning about renaming
 - Abstract denotational semantics

```
module A = struct
 let foo = 1
 let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
  include A
 let bar = 3
end
module C = (A : sig val foo : int end)
print int (A.foo + B.foo + C.foo) ;;
print int (A.bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module A = struct
 let foo = 1
 let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
 include A
 let bar = 3
end
module C = (A : sig val foo : int end)
print int (A.foo + B.foo + C.foo) ;;
print int (A.bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module A = struct
 let foo = 1
 let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
  include A
 let bar = 3
end
module C = (A : sig val foo : int end)
print int (A.foo + B.foo + C.foo) ;;
print_int (A. bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module A = struct
 let foo = 1
 let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
  include A
 let bar = 3
end
module C = (A : sig val foo : int end)
print int (A.foo + B.foo + C.foo) ;;
print int (A.bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module A = struct
 let foo = 1
 let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
  include A
 let bar = 3
end
module C = (A : sig val foo : int end)
print_int (A. foo + B.foo + C.foo) ;;
print_int (A.bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module A = struct
 let foo = 1
 let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
                            reference to
  include A ←
                           parent module
 let bar = 3
end
module C = (A : sig val foo : int end)
print_int (A. foo + B.foo + C.foo) ;;
print_int (A.bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module A = struct
 let foo = 1
 let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
                            reference to
  include A ←
                           parent module
 let bar = 3
end
module C = (A : sig val foo : int end)
print_int (A. foo + B. foo + C.foo) ;;
print_int (A.bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module A = struct
 let foo = 1
 let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
                            reference to
  include A ←
                           parent module
 let bar = 3
end
module C = (A : sig val foo : int end)
print_int (A. foo + B. foo + C.foo) ;;
print int (A.bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module A = struct
  let foo = 1
  let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
                            reference to
  include A ←
                           parent module
  let bar = 3
end
module C = (A : sig val foo : int end)
print int (A. foo + B. foo + C. foo ) ;;
print_int (A.bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module A = struct
 let foo = 1
 let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
  include A
 let foo = foo
 let bar = 3
end
module C = (A : sig val foo : int end)
print_int (A. foo + B. foo + C. foo ) ;;
print_int (A.bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module A = struct
 let foo = 1
 let bar = 2
end
module B = struct
 include A
 let foo = foo
 let bar = 3
end
module C = (struct include A
   let foo = foo
 end : sig val foo : int end)
print_int (A. foo + B.foo + C.foo) ;;
print_int (A.bar + B.bar) ;;
```

```
module type Magma = sig
  type t
  val op : t -> t -> t
  val equal : t -> t -> bool
  val choose : unit -> t
end
module M1 : Magma =
                              module M2 : Magma =
struct
                              struct
 type t = int
                                type t = float
 let op x v = ...
                                let op x v = ...
 let equal x v = ...
                                let equal x y = ...
 let choose () = ...
                                let choose () = ...
end
                              end ;;
let x = M1.choose () in M1.equal (M1.op x x) x ;;
let v = M2.choose () in M2.egual (M2.op x x) x ;;
```

```
module type Magma = sig
  type t
  val op : t -> t -> t
  val equal : t -> t -> bool
  val choose : unit -> t
end
module M1 : Magma =
                              module M2 : Magma =
struct
                              struct
 type t = int
                                type t = float
 let op x y = ...
                                let op x v = ...
 let equal x v = ...
                                let equal x y = ...
 let choose () = ...
                                let choose () = ...
end
                              end ;;
let x = M1.choose () in M1.equal (M1.op x x) x ;;
let y = M2.choose () in M2.equal (M2.op x x) x ;;
```

```
module type Magma = sig
  type t
  val op : t -> t -> t
  val equal : t -> t -> bool
  val choose : unit -> t
end
module M1 : Magma =
                              module M2 : Magma =
struct
                              struct
 type t = int
                                type t = float
 let op x y = ...
                                let op x v = ...
 let equal x v = ...
                                let equal x y = ...
 let choose () = ...
                                let choose () = ...
end
                              end ;;
let x = M1.choose () in M1.equal (M1. op x x) x ;;
let y = M2.choose () in M2.equal (M2.op x x) x ;;
```

```
module type Magma = sig
                                             dependencies
  type t
                                            induced by using
  val op : t -> t -> t
                                              interfaces
  val equal : t -> t -> bool
  val choose : unit -> t
end
module M1 : Magma =
                               module M2 : Magma =
struct
                               struct
  type t = int
                                 type t = float
  let op x y = ...
                                 let op x v = ...
 let equal x y = ...
                                let equal x y = ...
 let choose () = ...
                                let choose () = ...
end
                               end ;;
let x = M1.choose () in M1.equal (M1.op x x) x ;;
let y = M2.choose () in M2.equal (M2.op x x) x ;;
```

```
module type Magma = sig
                                              dependencies
  type t
                                             induced by using
  val op : t -> t -> t
                                                interfaces
  val equal : t -> t -> bool
  val choose : unit -> t
end
module M1 : Magma =
                                module M2 : Magma =
struct
                                struct
  type t = int
                                  type t = float
  let op x y = ...
                                  let op x y = ...
                                 let \overline{\text{equal }} x y = ...
  let equal x y = ...
 let choose () = ...
                                let choose () = ...
end
                                end ;;
let x = M1.choose () in M1.equal (M1. op x x) x ;;
let y = M2.choose () in M2.equal (M2.op x x) x ;;
```

```
module type Stringable =
   sig type t val to_string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
   type t = X.t * Y.t
   let to_string (x, y) =
        X.to_string x ^ " " ^ Y.to_string y
end
```

```
module type Stringable =
 sig type t val to_string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
 tvpe t = X.t * Y.t
 let to string (x, y) =
   X.to string x ^ " " ^ Y.to string v
end
module Int = struct
 type t = int let to_string i = int_to_string i
end
module String = struct
 type t = string let to string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P.to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
```

```
module type Stringable =
 sig type t val to string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
 tvpe t = X.t * Y.t
 let to string (x, y) =
   X.to string x ^ " " ^ Y.to string v
end
module Int = struct
 type t = int let to_string i = int_to_string i
end
module String = struct
 type t = string let to string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P. to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
```

```
module type Stringable =
 sig type t val to string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
 type t = X.t * Y.t
 let to_string (x, y) =
   X.to string x ^ " " ^ Y.to string y
end
module Int = struct
 type t = int let to_string i = int_to_string i
end
module String = struct
 type t = string let to string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P. to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
```

```
module type Stringable =
 sig type t val to string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
 type t = X.t * Y.t
 let to string (x, y) =
   X.to_string x ^ " " ^ Y. to_string y
end
module Int = struct
 type t = int let to_string i = int_to string i
end
module String = struct
 type t = string let to string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P. to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
```

```
module type Stringable =
 sig type t val to_string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
 type t = X.t * Y.t
 let to string (x, y) =
   X.to_string x ^ " " ^ Y. to_string y
end
module Int = struct
 type t = int let to_string i = int_to_string i
end
module String = struct
 type t = string let to string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P. to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
```

```
module type Stringable =
 sig type t val to string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
 type t = X.t * Y.t
 let to string (x, y) =
   X. to_string x ^ " " ^ Y. to_string y
end
module Int = struct
 type t = int let to_string i = int_to_string i
end
module String = struct
 type t = string let to string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P. to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
```

```
module type Stringable =
 sig type t val to string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
 type t = X.t * Y.t
 let to_string (x, y) =
   X. to_string x ^ " " ^ Y. to_string y
end
module Int = struct
 type t = int let to_string i = int_to_string i
end
module String = struct
 type t = string let to_string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P. to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
```

Some Observations

· Basic renamings rely on binding resolution information

 Program structure induces dependencies between basic renamings

 Disparate parts of a program can together make up a single logical meta-level entity

A Formal Theory of Renaming: Roadmap

- 1. Programs as ASTs and renamings as operations on them
 - · AST 'locations' allow name-independent representations
- 2. Define a semantic structure that separately captures:
 - Binding resolution information
 - Meta-level program relationships relevant to renaming
 - Information about concrete names
- 3. Map programs onto these semantic structures
 - · formal properties at the 'right level of abstraction'
 - methods for constructing/checking renamings

Renamings as Operations on ASTs

$$\mathsf{AST} \quad \sigma \quad : \quad \mathcal{L}\mathit{oc} \to \mathcal{S}\mathit{yn}$$

Renamings as Operations on ASTs

AST
$$\sigma$$
 : $\mathcal{L}oc \rightarrow \mathcal{S}yn$

A renaming $\sigma \twoheadrightarrow \sigma'$ is a pair of ASTs σ and σ' such that

- 1. $dom(\sigma) = dom(\sigma')$
- 2. $\sigma(\ell) \in \mathcal{V} \Leftrightarrow \sigma'(\ell) \in \mathcal{V}$
- 3. $\sigma(\ell) \notin \mathcal{V} \Rightarrow \sigma(\ell) = \sigma(\ell')$

 $(\mathcal{V} \subseteq \mathcal{S}yn \text{ is the set of value identifiers})$

Renamings as Operations on ASTs

AST
$$\sigma$$
 : $\mathcal{L}oc \rightarrow \mathcal{S}yn$

A renaming $\sigma \twoheadrightarrow \sigma'$ is a pair of ASTs σ and σ' such that

- 1. $dom(\sigma) = dom(\sigma')$
- 2. $\sigma(\ell) \in \mathcal{V} \Leftrightarrow \sigma'(\ell) \in \mathcal{V}$
- 3. $\sigma(\ell) \not\in \mathcal{V} \Rightarrow \sigma(\ell) = \sigma(\ell')$

 $(\mathcal{V} \subseteq \mathcal{S}yn \text{ is the set of value identifiers})$

We define the footprint of a renaming $\sigma \twoheadrightarrow \sigma'$

$$\mathsf{foot}(\sigma,\sigma') = \{\ell \mid \ell \in \mathsf{dom}(\sigma) \land \sigma(\ell) \neq \sigma'(\ell)\}$$

Two Important Questions

1. When is a renaming $\sigma \rightarrow \sigma'$ valid?

- 2. For a given AST σ and $\ell \in \text{decl}(\sigma)$, find σ' such that
 - $\sigma \twoheadrightarrow \sigma'$ is valid
 - foot (σ,σ') is minimal and contains ℓ

An Abstract Semantic Structure

$$\Sigma = (\rightarrowtail, \mathbb{E}, \rho)$$

- $\cdot \rightarrow : \mathcal{L}oc \rightarrow \mathcal{L}oc$ is a binding resolution function
- \mathbb{E} : $\mathcal{L}oc \times \mathcal{L}oc$ is a value extension relation
- $\rho: \mathcal{L}oc \rightarrow \mathcal{I}$ is a syntactic reification function mapping locations to identifiers

An Abstract Semantic Structure

$$\Sigma = (\rightarrowtail, \mathbb{E}, \rho)$$

- $\cdot \rightarrow : \mathcal{L}oc \rightarrow \mathcal{L}oc$ is a binding resolution function
- \mathbb{E} : $\mathcal{L}oc \times \mathcal{L}oc$ is a value extension relation
- $\rho: \mathcal{L}oc \rightarrow \mathcal{I}$ is a syntactic reification function mapping locations to identifiers

 $[\![\sigma]\!]_{\langle \Gamma, \Sigma
angle}$ returns the semantics Σ' of the AST σ

 $\llbracket \cdot \rrbracket$ parameterized by the 'context' semantics $\langle \Gamma, \Sigma \rangle$ The environment Γ gives meaning to identifiers 'in scope'

```
module type Stringable =
 sig type t val to_string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
struct
 type t = X.t * Y.t
 let to string (x, y) =
         X.to string x ^ " " ^ Y.to string v
end
module Int = struct
 type t = int let to string i = int to string i
end
module String = struct
 type t = string let to_string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print endline (P.to string (0, ("!=", 1)));;
```

```
module type Stringable =
  sig type t val to_string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
struct
  type t = X.t * Y.t
 \overline{\text{let}} to string (x, y) =
          X.to string x ^ " " ^ Y.to string v
end
module Int = struct
  type t = int let to string i = int to string i
end
module String = struct
  type t = string let to_string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P.to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
```

```
module type Stringable =
  sig type t val to_string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
struct
  type t = X.t * Y.t
  \widehat{let} to string (x, y) =
          X.to_string x ^ " " ^ Y.to_string y
end
module Int = struct
  type t = int let to string i = int to string i
end
module String = struct
  type t = string let to_string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P.to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
```

```
module type Stringable =
  sig type t val to_string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
struct
  type t = X.t * Y.t
  let to\string (x, y) =
         X.to_string x ^ " " ^ Y.to_string y
end
module Int = struct
  type t = int let to string i = int to string i
end
module String = struct
 type t = string let to_string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P.to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
```

```
module type Stringable =
  sig type t val to_string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
struct
  type t = X.t * Y.t
  let to\string((x, v) =
         X.to_string x ^ " " ^ Y.to_string v
end
module Int = struct
  type t = int let to string i = int to string i
end
module String = struct
  type t = string let to_string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print_endline (P.to_string (0, ("!=", 1))) ;;
                                                          10/20
```

Interpreting Programs: Value Extension Relation

```
module type Stringable =
  sig type t val to_string : t -> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) (Y : Stringable) = struct
struct
 type t = X.t * Y.t
 let to string (x, y) =
         X.to string x ^ " " ^ Y.to string v
end
module Int = struct
 type t = int let to string i = int to string i
end
module String = struct
 type t = string let to_string s = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print endline (P.to string (0, ("!=", 1)));;
```

Interpreting Programs: Value Extension Relation

```
module type Stringable =
  sig type t val to_string :\ t \> string end
module Pair (X : Stringable) \((Y \): Stringable) = struct
struct
  type t = X.t * Y.t
  let\to_string (x, y) =

✓ X.to_string x ^ " " ^ Y to_string v

end
module Int = struct
  type t = int let to string i = int to string i
end
module String = struct
  type t = string let to string's = s
end
module P = Pair(Int)(Pair(String)(Int)) ;;
print endline (P.to string (0, ("!=", 1)));;
```

Semantic Equivalence

We define an 'up-to-renaming' equivalence

•
$$(\rightarrowtail_1, \mathbb{E}_1, \rho_1) \sim (\rightarrowtail_2, \mathbb{E}_2, \rho_2)$$
 iff

- $\rightarrowtail_1 = \rightarrowtail_2$
- · $\mathbb{E}_1 = \mathbb{E}_2$
- · dom(ρ_1) = dom(ρ_2)
- $\rho_1(\ell) \in \mathcal{V} \Leftrightarrow \rho_2(\ell) \in \mathcal{V}$
- $\rho_1(\ell) \notin \mathcal{V} \Rightarrow \rho_1(\ell) = \rho_2(\ell)$
- $\Gamma \sim \Gamma'$ iff
 - $\cdot \ (\exists v \ \Gamma(v) = \ell) \Leftrightarrow (\exists v \ \Gamma'(v) = \ell)$
 - $\Gamma(x) = \Gamma'(x)$ (x is a module or module type identifier)

Distinguishing Valid Renamings

A valid renaming is one that preserve the equivalence:

• $\sigma \twoheadrightarrow \sigma'$ valid w.r.t. $\langle \Sigma, \Gamma \rangle$ when $\exists \Sigma' \sim \Sigma, \Gamma' \sim \Gamma$ such that $\llbracket \sigma \rrbracket_{\langle \Sigma, \Gamma \rangle} \sim \llbracket \sigma' \rrbracket_{\langle \Sigma', \Gamma' \rangle}$

Distinguishing Valid Renamings

A valid renaming is one that preserve the equivalence:

•
$$\sigma \twoheadrightarrow \sigma'$$
 valid w.r.t. $\langle \Sigma, \Gamma \rangle$ when $\exists \Sigma' \sim \Sigma, \Gamma' \sim \Gamma$ such that $\llbracket \sigma \rrbracket_{\langle \Sigma, \Gamma \rangle} \sim \llbracket \sigma' \rrbracket_{\langle \Sigma', \Gamma' \rangle}$

This does indeed induce an equivalence relation on programs

Theorem (1) $P \rightarrow P$ is valid (when [P] defined)

- (2) if $P \rightarrow P'$ is valid then so is $P' \rightarrow P$
- (3) if $P \rightarrow P'$ and $P' \rightarrow P''$ are valid then so is $P \rightarrow P''$

Constructing Valid Renamings

 $\ell \in \text{dom}(\sigma)$ is a declaration of σ when it is a value identifier (i.e. $\sigma(\ell) \in \mathcal{V}$) and there is $\ell' \in \text{dom}(\sigma)$ such that

$$\begin{split} \sigma(\ell') &= \mathsf{val} \ v_\ell \ : \ \dots \\ \sigma(\ell') &= \mathsf{let} \ v_\ell \ = \ \dots \\ \sigma(\ell') &= \mathsf{let} \ v_\ell \ = \ \dots \\ \end{split}$$

Theorem Let $\llbracket P \rrbracket = (\rightarrowtail, \mathbb{E}, \rho)$, ℓ be a declaration in P and v a fresh value identifier, then $P \twoheadrightarrow P'$ is a valid renaming, where $P' = P[\ell' \mapsto v \mid \ell' \in [\ell]_{\mathbb{E}} \lor \exists \ell'' \in [\ell]_{\mathbb{E}}. \ell' \rightarrowtail \ell'']$

 $([\ell]_{\mathbb{E}} \text{ denotes the } \mathbb{E}\text{-equivalence class containing } \ell)$

Characterising Valid Renamings

We define the dependencies of a renaming $\sigma \twoheadrightarrow \sigma'$ by:

$$\mathsf{deps}(\sigma,\sigma') = \{\ell \mid \ell \in \mathsf{foot}(\sigma,\sigma') \text{ and } \ell \text{ a declaration of } \sigma\}$$

Theorem If P woheadrightarrow P' is valid, with $\llbracket P \rrbracket = (\rightarrowtail, \mathbb{E}, \rho)$, and let $L = \{\ell \mid \ell \in \mathsf{deps}(P, P') \lor \exists \ell' \in \mathsf{deps}(P, P'). \ell \rightarrowtail \ell'\}$; then

- 1. $L \subseteq \text{foot}(P, P')$
- 2. $\ell \rightarrow \bot$ for all $\ell \in \text{foot}(P, P') \setminus L$

Theorem If P woheadrightarrow P' is valid, with $[\![P]\!] = (\rightarrowtail, \mathbb{E}, \rho)$, then deps(P, P') has a partitioning that is a subset of $\mathcal{L}oc_{/\mathbb{E}}$

Adequacy of the Semantics

We define a denotational semantics (P) of the operational meaning of programs

- Extends the model defined by Leroy (POPL '95)
- But module types contribute to the meaning of programs

Theorem If P woheadrightarrow P' is a valid renaming, then (P) = (P')

Adequacy of the Semantics

We define a denotational semantics (P) of the operational meaning of programs

- Extends the model defined by Leroy (POPL '95)
- But module types contribute to the meaning of programs

Theorem If $P \rightarrow P'$ is a valid renaming, then (P) = (P')

We do not have a completeness result since valid renamings must preserve shadowing

Roтor: A Prototype Renaming Tool

- · Developed in OCaml itself
 - · Allows reuse of the compiler infrastructure
- Approximates the approach discussed
 - Only intra-file binding information provided by compiler
 - Inter-file binding information remains as logical paths
- Tested on 2 large codebases
 - · Jane Street public libraries (~900 files, ~3000 test cases)
 - OCaml compiler (~500 files, ~2650 test cases)

Experimental Results: Jane Street Codebase

Rebuild Succeeded (37%) Avg.

	Files	Hunks	Deps	Hunks/File
Max	50	128	1127	5.7
Mean	5.0	7.5	24.0	1.3
Mode	3	3	19	1.0

Rebuild Failed (63%) Av	S) Avg.
-------------------------	---------

	Files	Hunks	Deps	Hunks/File
Max	66	305	3365	8
Mean	7.0	12.0	133.4	1.4
Mode	3	3	1	1.0

Experimental Results: OCaml Compiler Codebase

Rebuild Succeeded (68%) Avg.

	Files	Hunks	Deps	Hunks/File
Max	19	59	35	15.0
Mean	3.8	5.9	1.6	1.5
Mode	3	3	1	1.0

Nebulla lalled (32 70) Avg.	Rebuild	Failed	(32%)	Avg.
-----------------------------	---------	--------	-------	------

	Files	Hunks	Deps	Hunks/File
Max	83	544	56	14.2
Mean	10.2	23.3	10.8	1.7
Mode	4	4	1	1.0

Conclusions

- We have developed a framework for formally describing and reasoning about renaming in OCaml
- Based on a compositional, denotational semantics for a core calculus
- Enables precise statements describing relevant concepts at the right abstraction level
- Implemented a prototype renaming tool based on this approach