

## MATTERING PRESS

Mattering Press is an academic-led Open Access publisher that operates on a not-for-profit basis as a UK registered charity. It is committed to developing new publishing models that can widen the constituency of academic knowledge and provide authors with significant levels of support and feedback. All books are available to download for free or to purchase as hard copies. More at [matteringpress.org](http://matteringpress.org).

The Press's work is supported by: Centre for Invention and Social Process (CISP), European Association for the Study of Science and Technology (EASST), Hybrid Publishing Lab, infostreams, Open Humanities Press, and Tetragon.

## MAKING THIS BOOK

Mattering Press is keen to render more visible the unseen processes that go into the production of books. We would like to thank Endre Dányi, who acted as the Press's coordinating editor for this book, the reviewers Anna Tsing and Margaret Wiener, Jenn Tomomitsu for the copy-editing, Tetragon for the production and typesetting, Sarah Terry for the proofreading and Ed Akerboom and infostreams for formatting the html versions of this book.

## COVER

Mattering Press thanks Łukasz Dziedzic for Lato, our incomparable cover typeface. It remains one of the best free typefaces available and is released by his foundry tyPoland under the free, libre and open source Open Font License. Cover art by Julien McHardy.

# MODES OF KNOWING

*Resources from  
the Baroque*

EDITED BY  
**JOHN LAW**  
AND  
**EVELYN RUPPERT**



| MATTERING PRESS

First edition published by Mattering Press, Manchester.

Copyright © John Law and Evelyn Ruppert, chapters by respective authors, 2016.

Cover art © Julien McHardy, 2016.

Freely available online at [www.matteringpress.org/books/practising-comparison](http://www.matteringpress.org/books/practising-comparison)

This is an open access book, and the text and cover art are licensed under a Creative Commons By Attribution Non-Commercial Share Alike license. Under this license, authors allow anyone to download, reuse, reprint, modify, distribute, and/or copy their work so long as the material is not used for commercial purposes and the authors and source are cited and resulting derivative works are licensed under the same or similar license. No permission is required from the authors or the publisher. Statutory fair use and other rights are in no way affected by the above.

Read more about the license at [creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/)



ISBN: 978-0-9931449-8-1 (pbk)

ISBN: 978-0-9931449-9-8 (ebk)

# CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures</i>	7
<i>Contributors</i>	11
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	15
 1 · Modes of Knowing: Resources from the Baroque	
<i>John Law</i>	17
 PART ONE: REFLECTION ON THE BAROQUE	
 2 · On Exceeding Baroque Excess: An Exploration through a Participatory Community Workshop	
<i>Mario Blaser</i>	59
 3 · Fallacy of the Work, Truth of the Performance: What Makes Music Baroque: Historical Authenticity or Ontological Plurality?	
<i>Antoine Hennion</i>	84
 4 · Distributive Numbers: A Post-demographic Perspective on Probability	
<i>Adrian Mackenzie</i>	115
 5 · A Baroque Sensibility for Big Data Visualisations	
<i>Evelyn Ruppert</i>	136
 PART TWO: EXPERIMENTING WITH THE BAROQUE	
 6 · Baroque as Tension: Introducing Turmoil and Turbulence in the Academic Text	
<i>Mattijs van de Port</i>	165

MODES OF KNOWING

- 7 · Innovation with Words and Visuals: A Baroque Sensibility  
*Helen Verran and Brit Ross Winthereik* 197
- 8 · London Stone Redux  
*Hugh Raffles* 224
- 9 · Clafoutis as a Composite: On Hanging Together Felicitously  
*Annemarie Mol* 242

## LIST OF FIGURES

<b>FIG. 1.1</b>	Bernini, Ecstasy of Santa Teresa d'Ávila	23
<b>FIG. 1.2</b>	Bernini, Ecstasy of Santa Teresa d'Ávila, Angel (detail)	25
<b>FIG. 1.3</b>	Bernini, Ecstasy of Santa Teresa d'Ávila, Spear (detail)	25
<b>FIG. 1.4</b>	Bernini, Bust of Louis XIV	27
<b>FIG. 1.5</b>	Bernini, Ludovica Albertoni on her Deathbed	27
<b>FIG. 1.6</b>	Caravaggio, Doubting Thomas	28
<b>FIG. 1.7</b>	Bernini, Cappella Cornaro in Santa Maria della Vittoria, Rome	30
<b>FIG. 1.8</b>	Bernini, Ecstasy of Santa Teresa d'Ávila	31
<b>FIG. 1.9</b>	Bernini, Cappella Cornaro in Santa Maria della Vittoria (detail)	32
<b>FIG. 1.10</b>	Bernini, Fontana dei Quattro Fiume, Rome	33
<b>FIG. 1.11</b>	Bernini, Ecstasy of Santa Teresa d'Ávila	35
<b>FIG. 1.12</b>	Bernini, Cappella Cornaro in Santa Maria della Vittoria (detail)	37
<b>FIG. 1.13</b>	Ceiling by Andra Pozzo, Sant'Ignazio, Rome	38
<b>FIG. 3.1</b>	Bach, Horrified on the Wendy Carlos Synthesised-Bach disc	85
<b>FIG. 3.2</b>	Covers of Erato LP, including Albinoni's <i>Adagio</i> by Jean- François Paillard	87
<b>FIG. 3.3</b>	Front and back covers of the book, in French and German. See, in particular, the <i>more recent</i> 2012 version from Buchet-Chastel which mentions 'translated from German'	90
<b>FIG. 3.4</b>	Sleeve of Menuhin's recording: no mention that the score was not written by Mozart	92

<b>FIG. 3.5</b> Fly leaves of the score, unchanged before and after Casadesus' confession; the third one is a web page still selling it as such today ('herausgegeben' just means 'edited')	94
<b>FIG. 3.6</b> Gounod's <i>Ave Maria</i> on a 33 potpourri of <i>Ave Maria</i> (by Bach/Gounod), and one from the marriage airs (by C. Gounod alone)	96
<b>FIG. 3.7</b> The first page of the original sheet music by Gounod, and a modern score	97
<b>FIG. 3.8</b> Photograph of a 'Baroque Music' section from an outlet like FNAC or Virgin	100
<b>FIG. 3.9</b> The cover of the sheet music for <i>Les Indes galantes</i>	101
<b>FIG. 3.10</b> Covers of Erato's <i>Les Indes galantes</i> by Paillard, including the late CD, and of CBS' <i>Les Indes Galantes</i> by Malgoire	103
<b>FIG. 4.1</b> Bivariate Normal Distribution Produced by Gibbs Sampling	119
<b>FIG. 4.2</b> A Variety of Distributions	124
<b>FIG. 4.3</b> Simulated Distributions	127
<b>FIG. 4.4</b> Metropolis-Hastings Algorithm-generated Normal Distribution	128
<b>FIG. 5.1</b> Network Diagram by Martin Hawksey (2011)	149
<b>FIG. 5.2</b> (x)Trees by Agnes Chavez and Alessandro Saccoia (2012)	154
<b>FIG. 6.1</b> Miracle Room in Candeias, Bahia	172
<b>FIG. 6.2</b> Lapinhas	174
<b>FIG. 6.3</b> Igreja de São Francisco, Salvador da Bahia	177
<b>FIG. 6.4</b> Igreja da Matriz, Santo Amaro da Purificação, Bahia	179
<b>FIG. 6.5</b> Gesù, Rome	179
<b>FIG. 6.6</b> Igreja de São Domingos de Gusmão, Bahia	190
<b>FIG. 7.1</b> Diagram of Innovation, reproduced from the draft report presented at the strategy meeting	201
<b>FIG. 7.2</b> A diagram depicting funding sources for the various stages of the innovation process proposed in figure 1	204
<b>FIG. 7.3</b> A baldachin or throne canopy woven in a tapestry workshop established with Flemish craftsmen in Helsingør, Denmark, in the late sixteenth century	216
<b>FIG. 7.4</b> Detail of the central panel of the baldachin	217



## LIST OF FIGURES

<b>FIG. 8.1</b>	London Stone	224
<b>FIG. 8.2</b>	London Tube Map	226
<b>FIG. 8.3</b>	Whirlpool. Copyright 20th Century Fox	230
<b>FIG. 8.4</b>	Copperplate. Copyright Museum of London.	233
<b>FIG. 8.5</b>	Landi. Su concessione del Ministero dei Beni, delle Attività Culturali e del Turismo – Galleria Nazionale di Parma	234
<b>FIG. 8.6</b>	Cannon Street Interior	236
<b>FIG. 8.7</b>	Aubrey	237
<b>FIG. 8.8</b>	Gordon. Courtesy The Covenant Publishing Company Ltd.	239



## CONTRIBUTORS

MARIO BLASER is the Canada Research Chair in Aboriginal Studies at Memorial University of Newfoundland. He is the author of *Storytelling Globalization from the Paraguayan Chaco and Beyond* (Duke University Press, 2010), and co-editor of *Indigenous Peoples and Autonomy: Insights for the Global Age* (University of British Columbia Press, 2010), and *In the Way of Development: Indigenous Peoples, Life Projects and Globalization* (Zed, 2004). His current research examines how heterogeneous life projects fare under the shadow of the Anthropocene.

ANTOINE HENNION is Professor at MINES-ParisTech and the former Director of the Centre for the Sociology of Innovation where he has developed a problematisation of mediation crossing cultural sociology and Science & Technology Studies (STS). He has written extensively on the sociology of music, media and cultural industries, and is now exploring a pragmatist approach to various forms of attachment—from taste and ‘amateurs’, to home care and issues about vulnerability, ageing, and disability. Recent books include *The Passion for Music* (2015), *Le Vin et l’environnement* (with G. Teil, 2011), and *La Grandeur de Bach* (with J.-M. Fauquet 2000).

JOHN LAW is Emeritus Professor in Sociology at the Open University and Honorary Professor in Sociology in the Centre for Science Studies at Lancaster University. His publications have worked through empirical case studies in a range of areas including large technological projects, nature and culture, and postcolonial knowledge relations to develop STS theory and methods in material semiotics. His publications include *After Method, Aircraft Stories*, and *Organising Modernity*.

ADRIAN MACKENZIE is Professor in Sociology at Lancaster University and works at the intersections of science and technology studies, media and cultural studies, and social and cultural theory. He is mainly interested in the overlaps and entanglements associated with network and computational media, with sciences as forms of practice and thought, and with social production of value. Much of his current work also focuses in invention of data-related methods. He is author of *Wirelessness: Radical Empiricism in Network Cultures and Cutting Code: Software and Sociality* (MIT Press, 2010).

ANNEMARIE MOL is Professor of Anthropology of the Body at the University of Amsterdam. She has published *The Body Multiple*, and *The Logic of Care*, and has also co-edited *Differences in Medicine; Complexities and Care in Practice*. Her articles explore human bodies, fluid machines, social topologies, and intranslatable words. Thanks to an ERC Advanced Grant and a Spinoza Prize, she currently works with a spirited team on questions to do with eating and/or normativities.

HUGH RAFFLES teaches anthropology and directs the Graduate Institute for Design, Ethnography & Social Thought at The New School in New York. He is the author of *In Amazonia: A Natural History* (2002) and *Insectopedia* (2010), which will be appearing this year in French and Chinese. His forthcoming book project is an ethnography of stone.

MATTIJS VAN DE PORT is an anthropologist who works at the University of Amsterdam and the VU University Amsterdam. At the latter he holds a chair on 'popular religiosity'. Intrigued by the observation that the world does not comply with our narrations of it, his anthropology is an ongoing exploration of the tensions that follow from this existential given. Recently, he has moved to filmmaking to explore the potential of images to express his research findings. He did fieldwork in Serbia, and the Netherlands, and since 2001 he has been studying the Candomblé religion in Bahia, Brazil.

EVELYN RUPPERT is Professor of Sociology at Goldsmiths, University of London. She works on questions of method, data, and digital life, and is currently leading

a project funded by an ERC Consolidator grant, 'Peopling Europe: How Data make a People' (ARITHMUS; 2014–19). Evelyn is the founding and editor-in-chief of a SAGE open access journal, *Big Data & Society*. Her book, *Being Digital Citizens* (with Engin Isin) was published in April 2015.

HELEN VERRAN and BRIT WINTHEREIK have worked together on several projects since 2010. Helen is Professor II at the Norwegian University of the Arctic at Tromsø and Senior Research Fellow in History and Philosophy, University of Melbourne, Australia. Brit is Associate Professor in the Technologies in Practice Group at IT University of Copenhagen. They are joint book review editors for *Science & Technology Studies*, which brings joy when young scholars approach them with a book they wish to review. Helen is less known for growing bumper crops of organic garlic in a hillside garden. Brit is less known for being a lead singer in a woman's band and for her obsession with composting.



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We are grateful to the participants of ‘The Baroque as Empirical Sensibility’ workshop held from June 11th–13th 2011 at the Manchester Museum. The workshop was sponsored by the UK’s Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC) Centre for Research in Socio-Cultural Change (CRESC) within its crosscutting Social Life of Method theme. The chapters included in this collection come from participants at that workshop and we are especially thankful for their responsiveness to our provocations, endurance, and collegiality. We are also grateful for reviews of an earlier version of this collection by Margaret Wiener and Anna Tsing. Finally we wish to acknowledge funding that supported the publication of this collection as open access: the European Research Council (ERC) funded project led by Evelyn Ruppert (ARITHMUS; ERC-2013 CoG 615588) and the NWO Spinoza Prize awarded to Annemarie Mol.

