

DS 760

# Sea Cave Dilemma and Lying

---

Rick W. Lentz

24 September, 2017



## The Sea Cave Dilemma

"A pregnant woman is leading a group of five people out of a cave on a coast is stuck in the mouth of that cave. In a short time the high tide will be upon them, and unless she is unstuck, they will all be drowned except the woman, whose head is out of the cave. Someone has with her a stick of dynamite. There seems no way to get the pregnant woman loose without using the dynamite which will inevitably kill her, but if they do not use it, everyone else will drown."

**What do you think you should do in the case of the pregnant woman in the sea cave? Do you think that means you have more utilitarian or Kantian (deontological) moral instincts?**

I think if, in this situation, I would free her using the dynamite, likely be out of self-preservation.

In retrospect of the act, the strongest argument would come from the utilitarian perspective in that the act was to save the greatest number of lives (the outcome was what mattered). The Kantian moral stance might support this outcome if I considered it is my moral duty to save the others.

**Do you tell white lies and feel comfortable doing so?**

I don't feel comfortable lying. If you don't feel comfortable telling the truth, people will not rely on you as a trusted advisor.

Grandma should be told about the intended outcome of the farm. A discussion will bring up what she wants. This happened to a senior leader in Wisconsin's government. He told the story and promised to live on the farm for a year before selling it. He had to hold the property for several years (until he retired) before doing so.

I have the same view on invidity. Talk to your partner about your needs and work through issues by changing behaviors together. Picking another show that they hate and you enjoy. This is the right option.