

93403



S

SUPERVISOR'S USE ONLY

# OUTSTANDING SCHOLARSHIP EXEMPLAR



NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY  
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD  
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

## Scholarship 2015 History

2.00 p.m. Tuesday 24 November 2015

Time allowed: Three hours

Total marks: 40

Check that the National Student Number (NSN) on your admission slip is the same as the number at the top of this page.

You should answer ONE question in this booklet.

Pull out Resource Booklet 93403R from the centre of this booklet.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–28 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

**YOU MUST HAND THIS BOOKLET TO THE SUPERVISOR AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.**

## **CONTEXT: THE RELEVANCE / SIGNIFICANCE / IMPORTANCE OF YOUR STUDY OF HISTORY**

### **INSTRUCTIONS**

Write an article for a history journal in response to ONE of the questions below.

In your article you will:

- integrate your own knowledge with evidence from at least SIX of the twelve sources, A–L, provided in the resource booklet
- analyse and think critically about key ideas relevant to the historical context(s) and setting(s)
- use highly developed knowledge, historical ideas, and skills to develop and communicate a substantiated and balanced argument that demonstrates an understanding of a complex historical context(s) and setting(s)
- evaluate historical relationships such as cause and effect, continuity and change, past and present, specific and general, and patterns and trends
- judge the reliability and usefulness of historical evidence, and evaluate the strengths and limitations of historians' narratives

Your article should be communicated within an effective written format and include:

- an introduction, conclusion, and structured paragraphs that are organised around a focused argument
- a detailed knowledge of chronology
- accurate supporting evidence relevant to the context(s) and setting(s).

Space for planning is provided on pages 3 and 4. Your plan will not be marked.

Begin your answer on page 5.

### **EITHER: QUESTION ONE**

"The story and study of the past, both recent and distant, will not reveal the future, but it flashes beacon lights along the way and it is a useful remedy against despair."

*Barbara Tuchman, Pulitzer Prize-winning American historian*

Analyse and evaluate the extent to which you think Tuchman's statement applies to one or more topics you have studied.

### **OR: QUESTION TWO**

"The charm of history and its enigmatic lesson consists in the fact that, from age to age, nothing changes and yet everything is completely different."

*Aldous Huxley, British novelist and social commentator*

Analyse and evaluate the extent to which you think Huxley's statement applies to one or more topics you have studied.

## PLANNING

"The story and study of the past, both recent and distant, will not reveal the future, but it names beacon lights along the way and is a useful remedy against despair."

The Morocast (1933 - 1939)

Patriarchy in EME (1500s - 1700s)

Relevance/significance/importance

<u>PROVENANCE</u>	<u>EVIDENCE</u>	<u>SOURCE</u>	<u>ARGUMENT</u>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* some people will never want to listen"</li> <li>* "the story of us had we born a little earlier"</li> </ul>	a	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* computers are chewing at the skirts of history"</li> <li>* manipulated into named categories so that they can be programmed into computers. Out comes hopefully a pattern.</li> </ul>	b	HISTORY is individual, each piece of history is unique
		c	HISTORY'S <del>STORY</del> importance can be lost.

## PLANNING

- The importance/relevance/significance of history -
- Highly controversial / debatable
- Decided/rearranged.

P1

- source K B
- source A

Important - but must treat each case individually, despite being able to draw some parallels.

P2

- source C1 → undermines importance.
- source C2 → can draw parallels → significance
- source C3. but must treat each case individually

P3 - holocaust

- source D2
- source D3

P4 - patriarchy

- source I2.
- source I3.
- source J1

P5 - history today

- source K2.

"The study and study of the past, both recent and distant, will not reveal the future, but it flashes ~~the~~ beacon light along the way and is a useful remedy against despair." according to Barbara Tuchman, Pulitzer Prize-winning American historian. History and its relevance/significance/importance is highly contested, with historians not leaving one historical event untouched. Thus, the study of history and its significance, as well as history itself can spark mass controversy and debate. There will always be differing opinions about historical events and their significance. However, one aspect that remains important to consider; is that although some historical events correlate and ~~there can be~~ we are able to draw some parallels, we must treat each case individually, as history has a way of manifesting in new, unold ways. Thus, history can show us glimpses of what some events in the future might entail, ~~however~~ but ~~at the~~ part history will not guide the way forth. ~~and so~~ When analysing history it is therefore important to not get caught up with how past events interlink and how they

| may shape the future, but treat each case  
on an individual basis, to be sure that  
the significance/relevance/importance of  
history and historical events does not  
get lost. |

| It is clear that past historical  
events have shaped how many aspects  
of today's society operate today. ~~it is~~  
through Patriarchy in early modern  
England (1500s-1700s) and the forces for  
change during the period; the reformation,  
the British Civil War, the Interregnum and  
the Restoration, it is evident that ~~the~~  
women are no longer restricted to  
the title of a "the weaker vessel",  
thus in source A, "How can we know  
who we are if we don't know who  
we were?" raises the importance of  
history and the significance of  
~~history in shaping~~ studying history,  
especially due to the changes that we  
have witnessed from social trends  
such as history. History connects us  
with our roots, and educates us  
about our past, ~~as without and~~ without history and not knowing  
our history, it is ~~something~~  
somewhat ignorant. Without our |

In short we would not be the same society that we are today. Hence, the importance of acknowledging the past. In source A it notes, "I never knew what the holocaust meant until I saw your program." which suggests the importance of history being integrated into our lives and history or past events becoming more publicised. This is particularly important as in today's society we are continually looking ahead into the future, which ~~this~~ seems almost ironic when we consider that a large proportion of people haven't even learnt about the past. Isn't it only right to learn about the past before looking ahead?

According to source B, "History is the record of human nature" this in itself epitomises the importance of history and overturns critics that history is not relevant. History will always be relevant. ~~Even~~ historical events will always continue to have long-standing repercussions. Perhaps, the most important consequences of history are these repercussions itself. It only takes

Examining the Holocaust (1933-1945)

To prove that this, where ~~the~~ + arguably the most important consequence of this event is the repercussions it has left on the world today. This is evident as the Holocaust contributed to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, right to the "prevention and cure of genocide". Even German President, Joachim Gauck stated at the 2014 70<sup>th</sup> year since the liberation of Auschwitz that "without the ~~the~~ Auschwitz, Germany ~~would~~ would have little identity.", ~~the~~ amplifying the significance and relevance of history, and that historical events will always have repercussions.

Despite the significance and relevance of history, we must treat every historical event on a case by case basis. In source B it states, "computers are already chewing at the morsels of history in the process of quantification.... manipulated into named categories so that they can be programmed into computers. Out comes - hopefully - a pattern..." This suggests that sometimes the

Importance of history can be lost, as we are constantly trying to categorise history and make links between past historical events. However, there is a Barbara Tuchman may be suggesting here in 'Writing History' that there are dangers with doing this, as no one piece of history is the same, and we are constantly trying to find links in order to supposedly gain greater understanding, but in the process we are in fact discrediting historical events and are not acknowledging the individual event itself. Thus, history is important, but we must treat each case independently, or else we run the risk of history losing its credibility.

Jaron Burke in source C1 examines history from a journalists perspective. Although he is not a historian, he raises the important point of how, "it is not surprising that in such circumstances history becomes instrumentalized, re-created, re-interpreted, with astonishing ease and rapidity." This suggests

that although the media does well in letting us be up to date with current affairs, there is the threat that with journalism and the media, there is the potential for history to become distorted. This poses the threat for the future when historians examine these events, as it means that people could be unintentionally, wrongfully educated about events that once took place, due to the ease of how events can become distorted - particularly through journalism.

Consequently, this could undermine the importance of history.

✓ There's the common conception that history repeats itself, and thus why it is important to acknowledge the past. Although this is to some extent true, each case of history is different and we should although we can learn from the past, it does not map out the course for the future - only merely guiding it and signposting some important points. In 02, it is an image of Vladimir Putin pulling across

the 'iron curtain', suggesting he is waging a war on the west. This piece of evidence draws parallels with ~~history~~ Adolf Hitler and ~~the~~ ~~movement~~ as a dictator now in practice he was very much a dictator - much like Putin, and how Hitler was able to pull an 'iron curtain' on Europe. Despite there being similarities between Putin and Hitler, we cannot make the assumption that the ~~the~~ history that Hitler was involved in - the holocaust, which manifest again under Putin. ~~This~~ Although intentionalist historians, such as Lucy Dawidowicz would say that Hitler was entirely responsible for the holocaust, others such as Daniel Goldhagen - who recently and controversially wrote that the holocaust was intended as, "Germans were prepared to participate in the Third Reich's darkest deed". Although there is a ~~juxtaposition~~ juxtaposition between Putin and Hitler, it is not necessarily to say that ~~the~~ history will repeat itself. This is due to there being different social, political and economic

factors now than at the time of the holocaust, so we should not compare past times to now, as there will always be considerable differences.

John Warren in source 13 is melodramatic in his stance about how history can teach political lessons. He ~~says~~ Warren argues that "British prime minister Neville Chamberlain was dangerously mistaken when he tried to appease Hitler in 1938: the failure to defend Czechoslovakia against Nazi Germany encouraged Hitler's expansion and therefore led to the Second World War." ~~Although,~~ On reflection, we know that Neville Chamberlain was not the sole reason for Hitler's expansion and thus World War II, and that Warren's stance is melodramatic. Despite this, Warren does raise the importance of politics and how politics can play an important role not only ~~also~~ when learning about history, but also about the importance of politics in historical events themselves. This is

It is evident as politics were an important force for patriarchy in early modern England (1500s-1700s) as they cemented a patriarchial society, through the doctrine of couverture, and the law of primogeniture, which meant that women would be less likely to rule the monarch - upholding the trend of patriarchy. Therefore, history should be a warning to politicians to be mindful of how the political sphere has contributed to important historical events that have gone before.

Examining history ensures that history remains alive and present. Lawrence Rees in source D2, 'Forgotten voices of the holocaust' argues that it is crucial that we gain knowledge, as it is important to revisit history. "Adolf Eichmann... opened many people's eyes to the true scale of the holocaust and horror of the holocaust for the first time." This suggests that although people may claim that they 'know' about historical events, as they may have heard the name of a

Historical events used or thrown around before, the reality is that a large proportion of people don't actually realise the full extent nor implications of an event 'important' historical events. Thus, highlighting how important it is to reflect and delve into history to ensure that we are aware of our past before moving forward. This sums this up nicely by Hating, "The history of the holocaust is thus an instructive one, reminding us that it can take many years before a consensus is formed about the importance of past events."

TIM MASON in 'History Today' source I.2. argues how there are so many broad generalisations about history, that we have often yet to acknowledge those that were seen as the minority. ~~He~~ Mason believes that "this kind of work is something much more than a work of review or retrieval: enquiry through memory and oral tradition, enquiring into relation of the axes in the past can change ~~the~~ our whole conception of the

social order and social change." This suggests that once we examine details that were perhaps overlooked that these small details can be just as powerful as large generalisations, because they can spin a whole conception. This is evident in the trend of patriarchy in early modern England. During this period there was the common conception that women were perhaps lost with little to no autonomy. However, when we consider the diary of Lady Hoby, it suggests that patriarchy may have been more dominant in the public arena than in the household as she writes about in her diary of, "weighing wool and paying the bills." This suggests that women had more autonomy than one may think. This possibility overturns orthodox historian, Laurence Weller, who argues that there was a, "distant, harsh, family structure." Lady Hoby's diary aligns more with revisionist historian, Alan Macfarlane who writes, "there was sometimes ideas of love, partnership and companionship. However, there was

always economic partnership." This highlights the importance of history and how it is crucial that we learn about history, so we are aware of our past, and can shape our own conceptions and views about historical events.

Jane Robinson in, "Pandora's Daughters: The Cultural Mission of Empowering Women" in source JJ, states how women were once perceived, particularly during the trend of patriarchy. Robinson states, "some may have progressed beyond pioneering in the male professions... but if they did, they probably became 'insured' in the process, and so they never really counted as ladies at all." This suggests to many people - particularly women, this idea would seem in many ways foreign. Thus, it suggests the importance of learning history in regard to how far we have come.

~~To the past~~ In our current age, women are now achieving great feats, however in many ways, women's achievements should

be more highly acknowledged, when we consider how fundamentally women were always viewed as being 'less' than men. Antonia Fraser, who is a revisionist historian on <sup>111</sup> history, ~ we who read 17<sup>th</sup> century history, with 21<sup>st</sup> century eyes, know nothing would ever be the same again." This highlights how far we have women have come, and that is evident from women's achievements in today's society, that the power of history in comparatively showing us changes overtime.

Overall, the significance/importance/relevance of history is always a topic that will be up for speculation, debate, and will be contested. Although, history can be important in teaching some lessons and key ideas to be mindful of, no two events in the past and the future are/will ever be exactly the same. Thus, "the history and study of the past, both recent and distant, with

not reveal the future, but it names beacon lights along the way and is a useful remedy against despair." We must treat each historical case independently, and although some events may have parallels, no two events will ever be the same. //