

93403Q



934032

NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

Scholarship 2010 History

2.00 pm Saturday 20 November 2010

Time allowed: Three hours

Total marks: 48

QUESTION BOOKLET

There are two topics. Choose ONE topic and complete the task concerning that topic, using the documents and resources provided in this booklet.

EITHER: Topic One: England 1558–1667 (pages 2–17)

OR: Topic Two: New Zealand in the Nineteenth Century (pages 18–32)

Write your response in Answer Booklet 93403A.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–32 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

YOU MAY KEEP THIS BOOKLET AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.

Your performance will be evaluated using the following historical skills:

- | | |
|----------------|--|
| Skill 1 | Effectively communicate sophisticated, substantiated argument. |
| Skill 2 | Develop informed and perceptive judgements about the nature of historical evidence and/or historical research. |
| Skill 3 | Critically evaluate historical narratives in a sustained manner. |
| Skill 4 | Demonstrate a thorough and perceptive understanding of historical relationships in selected contexts and settings. |
| Skill 5 | Synthesise, with perception and insight, ideas relevant to the historical context(s) and setting(s). |
| Skill 6 | Demonstrate an understanding of the critical underpinnings and scope of a historical question/context. |

Each skill will be assigned a mark out of 8.

You have three hours to complete this examination.

EITHER: TOPIC ONE: ENGLAND 1558–1667

TASK

Your task is to prepare an article for a history journal arising from the study of the following sources and your own knowledge, in which you **analyse and evaluate the extent to which Elizabeth I should be regarded as a great Queen**.

KEY IDEA

In his introduction in the book to commemorate the 2003 Exhibition about Elizabeth I at the National Maritime Museum, historian David Starkey writes that “Elizabeth is extraordinary. She looks extraordinary. She behaves in an extraordinary way. And, as a woman moving effortlessly in a man’s world, she is doubly extraordinary.” He ends by stating that “Elizabeth was that rarest of rulers. Not only was she great; she was also admirable.” However, a number of historians have been less dazzled by Elizabeth I, arguing that the ‘success’ of her reign from 1558 to 1603 was either due to good fortune or to the creation of a mystique, rather than her own political ability in governing the realm. Even Francis Bacon, one of her courtiers, commended her for what she did not do, rather than what she did. Should Elizabeth I be regarded as Elizabeth the Great or were her actions not hers but those of her trusted courtiers and councillors?

INSTRUCTIONS

Use both **your own knowledge** and **evidence from at least SEVEN of the sources** provided on pages 3–17. (Note: each letter represents ONE source.)

In your article you should:

- respond to the view expressed in the key idea and statement in the instructions above, and communicate your own substantiated argument concerning the extent to which **Elizabeth I should be regarded as a great Queen**
- integrate relevant ideas about this historical issue from the evidence in the sources and your own knowledge to develop your argument
- demonstrate an understanding of historical relationships relevant to this historical issue, such as cause and effect, past and present, specific and general, continuity and change, and pattern and trends
- make judgements about the nature of historical evidence concerning this historical issue
- evaluate historians’ interpretations and the views of contemporaries that relate to this historical issue
- demonstrate an understanding of this historical issue through breadth, depth, and balanced coverage.

Your article should be written in a formal and fluent style. The article should have an introduction that outlines your argument, a series of sequentially presented paragraphs, and a reasoned conclusion. You do not need to provide footnotes, endnotes, or a bibliography.

RESOURCES

TOPIC ONE: ENGLAND 1558–1667

SOURCE A

A1: Phoenix of the World

She [Elizabeth] is by far the best-remembered figure ... of what her people felt for her?

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Source: A.L. Rowse, *The England of Elizabeth* (London: The Reprint Society, 1953), pp 30–32.

SOURCE A (continued)**A2: History's Greatest 'Corporate Turnaround'**

She [Elizabeth] used her formidable intellect ... and of willowy, ethereal figure.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Alan Axelrod, *Elizabeth I CEO: Strategic Lessons from the Leader Who Built an Empire* (New Jersey: Prentice Hall Press, 2000), pp 16 – 17.

SOURCE B**B1: Elizabeth's Court**

Sir Robert Naunton served in the early Stuart Court and in the final months of life completed his book, which looks back at the Court of Elizabeth.

The principal note of her reign ... of her prayers on her people.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Sir Robert Naunton, *Fragmenta Regalia or Observations on the Late Queen Elizabeth* (1634), pp 4–9, cited in Donald Stump and Susan M. Felch (ed), *Elizabeth I and Her Age* (New York: W.W. Norton, 2009), pp 641–642.

B2: Royal Maundy Ceremony

*For copyright reasons,
this resource cannot be
reproduced here.*

The Royal Maundy ceremony was performed by the Queen every year on the Thursday before Easter. This miniature shows Elizabeth in the left foreground, wearing a purple-blue long gown and long white apron, about to ritually wash the feet of the poor – poor women are seated in two rows running from the front to the back. Also pictured are choirboys, gentlemen of the Chapel Royal (in copes), courtiers, and gentlemen pensioners holding the pole-axes that signified their role.

Miniature painted by Levina Teerlinc, 1560 cited in Susan Doran, *The Tudor Chronicles 1485–1603* (London: Quercus, 2008), p 272.

SOURCE C**Elizabeth Receiving the Dutch Emissaries**

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

The painting shows Elizabeth I receiving Dutch emissaries in her privy chamber and is an imagined scene, relating to the embassy from the Low Countries that negotiated the treaties of Nonsuch in August 1585. Mary, Queen of Scots is shown on the left. The men standing include the Earl of Leicester, Lord Admiral Howard and Sir Francis Walsingham. The biographer R.E. Richardson has speculated that the woman in black in the centre of the picture may be Blanche Parry, a Lady in Waiting to the Queen, or perhaps the picture is another image of the Queen of Scotland.

Artist Unknown, c 1585. The painting (*Elizabeth Receiving the Dutch Emissaries*) is from the Dutch school;
<http://www.squidoo.com/blanche-parry>

SOURCE D**Elizabeth as Leader in Her First Year**

... That Elizabeth would survive as queen ... had set the pattern for her reign.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Norman Jones, 'Advice to Elizabeth' in *History Today*, vol 58, issue 11, November 2008, pp 14–20.

SOURCE E**E1: An Extract from the Act of Uniformity 1559**

Where at the death of our late sovereign ... and none other or otherwise.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

From *The Statutes of the Realm*, vol. IV, 1819, pp 355–356; cited in Roger Lockyer and Dan O' Sullivan, *Tudor England 1485–1603* (London: Longman, 1993), pp 32–33.

E2: From The Book of Common Prayer, commonly called***The First Book of Queen Elizabeth***

The Elizabethan Prayer Book was based upon that of 1552 but when communion was administered, the Minister was required to combine the words prescribed in 1552 with those of the First Edwardian Prayer Book of 1549, as follows:

And when he [the minister] delivereth the Bread ... and be thankful.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

From *The Book of Common Prayer, Commonly called The First Book of Queen Elizabeth*, 86–86v; cited in Roger Lockyer and Dan O' Sullivan, *Tudor England 1485–1603* (London: Longman, 1993), p 33.

SOURCE F**Queen Elizabeth I Feeds the Dutch Cow**

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

This painting depicts a cow that represents the Dutch provinces. King Philip II of Spain is trying to ride the cow, while Queen Elizabeth I is depicted feeding it. Behind her is William of Orange holding on to the cow's horns. At the back of the cow and holding its tail is the Duke of Anjou.

This image was painted after the visit of the Duke of Anjou to Elizabeth's court in 1581–1582, during which he proposed marriage and discussed England's support in the Netherlands against the Spanish. The date of the painting is about 1583.

Queen Elizabeth I Feeds the Dutch Cow, Anonymous, Flemish school, c 1583.

Cited in S. Adams, 'The succession and foreign policy' in *History Today*, vol 53, no 5, May 2003, p 46.

SOURCE G**G1: Elizabeth's Parliaments**

We in our generation ... both are credible.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

J. E. Neale, *Elizabeth I and Her Parliaments 1559–1581* (London: Jonathan Cape, 1964), pp 417–420.

G2: A Contrary View

Despite stresses and strains, parliaments were usually co-operative ... an essential unity of mutual self-interest and devotion to the Crown.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Michael Graves, *Elizabethan Parliaments 1559–1601* (London: Longman, 1987), pp 78–80.

SOURCE H**H1: Elizabeth in Ireland**

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

This image is one of a dozen included in John Derricke's *Image of Irelande*, an extended narrative poem that detailed Henry Sidney's military triumphs against the native Irish. The poem portrays, from an English point of view, the following scene: an Irish chieftain seated at a feast and entertained by a bard and a harp player.

John Derricke, *Image of Irelande* (London: 1581);

<http://www.lib.ed.ac.uk/about/bgalleries/Gallery/researchcoll/ireland.html>

H2: Evaluating Elizabeth's Irish policy

With Tyrone's capitulation ... balancing short-term costs against long-term advantage.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Wallace MacCaffrey, *Elizabeth I* (London: Edward Arnold, 1993), pp 432, 433.

SOURCE I**Gloriana Challenged**

The monarchy of Elizabeth I was founded upon illusion. ... her power was an illusion – and an illusion was her power.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Christopher Haigh, *Elizabeth I* (London: Longman, 1988), pp 7, 9, 20, 146, 164, 172.

SOURCE J**J1: The Frontispiece to the *Perfect Arte of Navigation***

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

John Dee was a famous scholar, astrologer, mathematician and alchemist in Elizabethan England. He was asked to draw up an astrological chart to determine the most propitious day for Elizabeth's coronation, and afterwards he was consulted on a range of subjects. From the 1570s, he became an advocate of the notion of a British empire. In the frontispiece to Dee's book *The General and Rare Memorials pertaining to the Perfect Arte of Navigation*, in which he advocated imperial expansion, Elizabeth is shown at the helm of the Christian ship of Europe. The figure descending from the sun is the Archangel Michael waving a sword and holding a shield while the kneeling woman, Britannia, is beseeching Elizabeth to protect her empire by strengthening her navy. The letters around the border are the hieroglyphics for Britain; in the four corners are Greek letters that have a numerical value that suggest the date of the book's publication.

Cited in Barbara Mervyn, *The Reign of Elizabeth: England 1558–1603* (London: Hodder Murray, 2001), p 254.

SOURCE J (continued)**J2: Some of England's Trade Routes**

For copyright reasons, these resources cannot be reproduced here.

By 1603, there were a number of trading companies exporting cloth and other products as well as importing luxury goods such as silk, spices and oil.

These companies were the Merchant Adventurers, the Muscovy Trading Company, the Levant Company, and the East India Company.

Cited in Barbara Mervyn, *The Reign of Elizabeth: England 1558–1603* (London: Hodder Murrain, 2001), pp 234–235.

SOURCE K**Image Was All?**

Elizabeth justified her right to rule ... In this sense, she was!

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Susan Doran, "Elizabeth I: Gender, Power and Politics" in *History Today*, vol 53 (5), May 2003, pp 29–35.

SOURCE L**Elizabeth's Golden Speech to Parliament (1601)**

Mr Speaker, we have heard your declaration ... that will be more careful and loving.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Cited in Leah S. Marcus, et al (ed), *Elizabeth I: Collected Works* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2000), pp 336–340.

SOURCE M**The “Ditchley Portrait”**

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

This portrait was commissioned by Sir Henry Lee after the Queen’s visit to his manor of Ditchley in Oxfordshire; even if she is portrayed standing in the heavens on a map of England, her feet are clearly standing on Oxfordshire. The words within the cartouche refer to Elizabeth as ‘The Prince of Light’.

Ditchley Portrait, Marcus Gheerhaerts the Younger, c. 1592;

http://www.divasthesite.com/images/Queen_Elizabeth_I/Queen_Elizabeth_I_29.jpg

OR: TOPIC TWO: NEW ZEALAND IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY

TASK

Your task is to prepare an article for a history journal arising from study of the following sources and your own knowledge. **In your article, you must analyse and evaluate the extent of Julius Vogel's significance as a leader in nineteenth century New Zealand.**

KEY IDEA

In her 1996 biography of Julius Vogel, historian Raewyn Dalziel wrote “whatever one feels about Vogel's stormy and quite extraordinary career, the mark he made was permanent. Vogel was a political adventurer who contributed more to the development of New Zealand and possessed a greater vision of its place in the world than any other leader of nineteenth-century New Zealand”. However, Vogel is not unanimously regarded as a hero of nineteenth-century New Zealand history. Dalziel goes on to acknowledge that despite his ‘visionariness’ and farsightedness, Vogel was a controversial figure whose name could arouse hostile emotions in New Zealand. In 1899, the *Lyttelton Times* wrote that “as a statesman, Vogel always fell short of the heroic”. Should this controversial figure and his policies on the progression of nineteenth-century New Zealand be regarded as an historical hero or hound?

INSTRUCTIONS

Use both **your own knowledge** and **evidence from at least SEVEN of the sources** provided on pages 19–31. (Note: each letter represents ONE source.)

In your article you should:

- respond to the statement in the instructions which is explained in the key idea, and communicate your own substantiated argument concerning the extent of **Julius Vogel's significance as a leader in nineteenth-century New Zealand**
- integrate relevant ideas about this historical issue from the evidence in the sources and your own knowledge to develop your argument
- demonstrate an understanding of historical relationships relevant to this historical issue, such as cause and effect, past and present, specific and general, continuity and change, and pattern and trends
- make judgements about the nature of historical evidence concerning this historical issue
- evaluate historians' interpretations and the views of contemporaries that relate to this historical issue
- demonstrate an understanding of this historical issue through breadth, depth, and balanced coverage.

Your article should be written in a formal and fluent style. The article should have an introduction that outlines your argument, a series of sequentially presented paragraphs, and a reasoned conclusion. You do not need to provide footnotes, endnotes, or a bibliography.

RESOURCES

TOPIC TWO: NEW ZEALAND IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY

SOURCE A

A Biography of Vogel

During the 1868 parliamentary session ... in part by borrowing, but with little success.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Raewyn Dalziel, "Vogel, Julius 1835–1899" *Dictionary of New Zealand Biography*, updated 22 June 2007; <http://www.dnzb.govt.nz>.

SOURCE B**B1: Leaps and Bounds**

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

This cartoon was published as a supplement to the *Evening Post* in May 1887. The cartoon shows Premier Vogel (as a kangaroo) being hounded to a cliff edge marked 'Rack and ruin' and pursued by dogs labelled 'Extravagance', 'Borrowing', 'Deficits', and 'Protection'. In the background are huntsmen on horseback.

William Hunter, 1887, Cited in <http://timeframes.natlib.govt.nz/>

B2: Vogel as 'Scapegoat'

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

This cartoon, commenting on the July 1887 election, was published as a supplement in 'Truth' in September 1887. Shown are Members of Parliament who sought re-election. From left to right as portrayed in the cartoon: G. Fisher is giving conflicting election promises; Grey is pushing and Atkinson and Bryce are pulling a wheelchair containing Vogel (as a bound goat). The scene is a path in front of craggy mountains, where vultures are hovering.

Bock and Cousins, 1887, Cited in <http://timeframes.natlib.govt.nz/>

SOURCE C**C1: The Long Depression**

The years from 1865 were also bad for many Europeans ... whose properties appreciated in value because of the improved communications.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

W. B. Sutch, *Poverty and Progress: A Reassessment* (Wellington: A.H. & A. W. Reed, 1969), pp 84–85.

SOURCE C (continued)**C2: Stagnation**

The aftermath of the crisis of 1878–1879 was a severe downsizing ... a fall in real income.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

W. J. Gardner, 'A Colonial Economy' in W. H. Oliver with B. R. Williams (eds.), *The Oxford History of New Zealand* (Auckland, Oxford University Press, 1991), p 75.

SOURCE D**D1: Progression under the Liberals**

The Liberal regime marks a profound rupture ... in the New Zealand state's 'velvet glove'.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Tony Ballantyne, 'The State, Politics and Power' in Giselle Byrnes (ed), *The New Oxford History of New Zealand* (Melbourne: Oxford University Press, 2009), p 124.

SOURCE D (continued)**D2: For God's Own Country**

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Cited in <http://timeframes.natlib.govt.nz/>, Reference number: 1/2-058363-F

SOURCE E**E1: Annual Gross and Net Migration to New Zealand, 1840–1870**

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

E2: Annual Gross, Net and Assisted Immigration to New Zealand, 1871–1899

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Statistics New Zealand: Sample of death registers, 'Peopling' project, Ministry for Culture and Heritage;
Cited in <http://www.teara.govt.nz/en/history-of-immigration>

SOURCE F**Towards an Ideal Society**

In 1890, New Zealand had a population of about 900 000 Pākehā. ... the relative equality and freedom impressed them most.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Eric Olssen, 'Towards the Ideal Society' in *The People and the Land, Te Tangata me te Whenua: An Illustrated History of New Zealand 1820-1920*, Bassett, Binney, Olssen (eds), (Wellington: Allen & Unwin, 1990) pp 235-237.

SOURCE G**G1: Immigrant Huts for the First Settlers at Petone Beach**

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

This sketch by William Swainson in 1841 demonstrates the disappointment felt by the migrants of the New Zealand Company schemes with the arrangements made for their arrival in the 1840s

Cited in <http://timeframes.natlib.govt.nz>

G2: The Vogel Immigrants

During the first part of the seventies ... to concentrate on finding work for the unemployed.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Tony Simpson, *The Immigrants: The Great Migration from Britain to New Zealand, 1830-1890* (Auckland: Godwit, 1997), pp 199–200.

SOURCE H**Opposing Views of Vogel**

Just before and just after Vogel's death ... than any other politician of his time.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Raewyn Dalziel, *Julius Vogel: Business Politician* (Auckland: Auckland University Press, 1986), pp 311–313.

SOURCE I**The Development of Infrastructure****I1: Crossing the Rimutaka Road in the Early 1870s**

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

In the early 1870s, people could cross from Wellington to the Wairarapa only by horse or bullock over the Rimutaka Road. A rail connection was opened in 1878.

Cited in <http://timeframes.natlib.govt.nz/>, James Bragge Collection Reference: PA7-30-03

I2: Opening of the Midland Railway at Jacksons, Westland in the 1880s

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Cited in <http://timeframes.natlib.govt.nz/>, James Ring, Reference number: PAColl-3060-044

SOURCE J**J1: Progression**

Progressive colonisation is my term ... was the 'progress industry'.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

James Belich, *Paradise Reforged* (Auckland: Penguin, 2001), p 17.

J2: Prosperity and Progress

We have set ourselves to the task of making New Zealand ... demanded by the great destiny before us.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Julius Vogel, *New Zealand Times*, 21 July 1874, p 167.

J3: A New Era in Colonial Development

The following newspaper article appeared following Premier Stafford's introduction of Vogel's Plan to Parliament in 1870.

The session which has just closed ... is a mere question of time.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Otago Daily Times, 14 September 1870.

SOURCE K**The Unhistoric Story**

Whaling for continents coveted deep in the South

...It is something different, something

Counted on.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Allen Curnow, *Collected Poems 1933–1973* (Wellington: A.H. Reed & A.W. Reed, 1974), pp 79–80.

SOURCE L**Land Monopolists**

Nowadays we are less inclined to condemn ... this work was to prove very valuable.

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

Russell Stone, *Economic Development 1870–1890* (Wellington: Heinemann, 1969), pp 20–21.

Source M is on the following page

SOURCE M**Vogel the Visionary?**

Vogel's inherent dislike of seeing any great source of power lie idle ... Hilda Richmond Fitzherbert, the heroine of the story ...

For copyright reasons, this resource cannot be reproduced here.

R. M. Burdon, *The Life and Times of Sir Julius Vogel* (Christchurch: Caxton Press, 1946), pp 182–183, 210–212.