

93403A



934031

S

SUPERVISOR'S USE ONLY

OUTSTANDING SCHOLARSHIP EXEMPLAR



NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

Scholarship 2016 History

9.30 a.m. Monday 14 November 2016
Time allowed: Three hours
Total marks: 40

ANSWER BOOKLET

Check that the National Student Number (NSN) on your admission slip is the same as the number at the top of this page.

Write your answer in this booklet.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–28 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

YOU MUST HAND THIS BOOKLET TO THE SUPERVISOR AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.

Skills	Mark
Historical ideas	
Argument	
Synthesis	
Historical relationships	
Judgement	
TOTAL	/40

ASSESSOR'S USE ONLY

QUESTION ONE:

PLANNING

Paul Moon.

"convulsions vs. transitions."

Miss Ferguson.

1789

* Sources H1, H3. & A → AJP Taylor.

1769

* Sources G1, G2

historiography.

PLANNING

The notion of 'turning points' are nuanced by each who assess their worth, however, it is this definition of a 'turning point' which should, perhaps, be afforded more attention.

Paul Moon argues that these 'turning points' are "peaks in the historical landscape", in which the "highly disruptive force" of history results in "change" via "convulsions", as opposed to via "tranquil transitions". To an extent, it is true that real 'turning points' must have "enduring significance", however the focus on individual events or years perhaps detracts from a 'turning point's' true nature.

~~Thus the~~ "Turning points" represent incremental change which is a culmination or accumulation of smaller points in history. A true incremental 'turning point' has a significance which is lasting, irreversible and - above all - relevant to a nation or a people wherein it is agreed upon unanimously. To this end, it is not the scale of change observed, but rather a 'turning point's' "enduring significance" to us which determines its significance.

While a true 'turning point's' change is incremental, the year of the French Revolution - 1789 - represents a point in which the nature of change was dramatic. Borne out of frustration in the Third Estate and rising taxes, the French Revolution unified the country now identified as France, but which was previously fragmented. AJP Taylor iterates that "between 1789 and 1794 France changed from a country with many different outlooks and even languages to a single nation. France had created nationalism." Taylor's ~~for~~ role as a historical authority is substantiated by

Niall Ferguson, ~~Abbey~~ describing Taylor as "the Great English historian." Indeed, this would lessen ^{any} ~~any~~ caution I might have when determining Taylor's reliability as a source. "The 'Great English historians' assertions of the emergence of 'liberty', 'equality' and - to a lesser extent - 'fraternity' are historical ideas ~~also~~ ^{expounded} upon in Peter McPhee's 'Liberty or Death', published 2016. McPhee notes that "the transition from absolutism... to a republican fraternity of male citizens had reinforced the subordinate political position of women." Indeed, while both historians agree upon 1789 as a revolutionary 'turning point' for the ideas of "nationalism", "liberty" and "equality", their differing perspectives on "fraternity" and the role of women indicate the ~~stagnant~~ ^{lack} of change ~~realised~~ ^{realised} by women after 1789 - and the continued trend of this struggle for equality still being acknowledged by McPhee in 2016. The ~~historical~~ ^{historical} ideas of hindsight is manifested in McPhee's arguments - in that the dramatic nature of political & social revolution in 1789 failed to foresee, or even address, the notion of gender equality which would continue to exist long after 1789. ~~Like~~ To this end, the French Revolution's role as a 'turning point' is, perhaps, lessened due to the lack of any real change for women. While the dramatic and "convulsive" nature of 1789 showed influences in the 1798 failed uprising in Ireland, and ~~the~~ ^{indeed} the Easter Rising of 1916, the relative lack of influence of the people of NZ perhaps raises questions as to ^{its} the true significance ~~of~~ ^{as} as a 'turning point'.

Philosophers such as Voltaire & Rousseau called for "a just and equal society" ⁱⁿ response to the "absolutism" asserted by McPhee. The two philosophers represent ~~the~~ a period of Enlightenment in which science, reason and exploration were encouraged - a period characterised, in New Zealand at least, by the arrival of Captain Cook in 1769. Nigel Ferguson ~~also~~ argues for economic forces being the most significant in the recognition of 'turning points', ~~the~~ iterating "one attractively simple way of thinking about the world is to say that wealth, and with it power, are shifting from the West to the Rest." Indeed, ~~we~~ might question Ferguson's reliability ~~due~~ to his belittlement of liberalism as the "jaded left" - however ~~that~~ his usefulness is not diminished. This illustration of economic activity is paralleled by ~~James~~ Tupai's uster-colour of barter between an English Naval officer and Māori in 1769. ~~The~~ While an ^{ideology which influenced} ~~the~~ the emergence of "rationalism", "liberty" and "equality" in the French Revolution - i.e. Enlightenment, this ideology also drove the exploration of Capt. Cook and the subsequent economic relations during the Early Contact Period. As a this example of continuity, ~~and~~ ^{perhaps} helps explain why - in 2012 - Ferguson ~~also~~ asserts his theories on "economic forces" which were also a characteristic of ~~Maori~~ Anglo-Māori interaction. Te Horeta te Taniwha's recollection of 1769, from 1852, further substantiates the importance of Māori economic structure - a structure which suggests historians like Harrison Wright's assertions of "Europe's fatal impact" on Māori ^{should} ~~are~~, perhaps, be questioned. Though the time

between 1769 & 1852 is considerable, Te Horeta ^{- it could be} explaining ~~Māori economic custom as opposed~~ argued - is explaining Māori economic custom is opposed to a specific account - in which case we might ^{be able to} rely on the source when Te Horeta states "and we again went to barter with the goblins of that ship, and the goblins came again and again on shore." As a turning point, 1769 is not agreed upon as 'universally' significant to the people of NZ - with Wright's general view contradicting Te Horeta's specific knowledge. Though the economic relationship during the Early Contact Period developed ^{incrementally} ~~the~~ ^{as} this ~~disparity~~ ^{disparity} shown by Wright perhaps lessens the ^{enduring} significance of 1769 as a 'turning point.'

^{invaded by government troops in 1831} This economic development and incremental change which was a consequence of 1769, led to the ~~the~~ process of structured colonisation following 1840. Just as the continuing English desire to assert superiority continued, so did Māori desire to assert sovereignty - shown by the peaceful resistance of Parikake, ~~in 1831~~. Indeed, the ideas put forth by the two leaders of Parikake - Tohu Kākahi & Te Whiti o Rongomai - were of equality, ~~and~~ liberty and especially - the repudiation of the pre-established. To this end, the ideas were redolent of the revolutionary ideology behind the French Revolution - demonstrating a substantial continuity of thought and judgement. ~~The~~ ~~ANZS~~ Parikake ~~the~~ represented the different perspectives held by Māori at the time, a reality acknowledged by Aroha Harris who states that "the past was often invoked as a

Source of inspiration and a reminder that modern activism was just another in a long line of indigenous movements designed to recover and reassert... tribal authority." While we might question the reliability of this source due to its particular bias, the ideas put forth are recognised by ~~historian~~ historian Dick Scott, whose investigative piece "Ask that Mountain" was described by former Prime Minister Helen Clark as "one of New Zealand's most influential books." Indeed, the recognition of Parihaka in the ~~pre~~ modern era demonstrate the historical relationship between past and present and how, over time, a perspective can evolve. As a turning point, ~~the 1881~~ the invasion of 1881 was not immediately recognised - thus it was not dramatic change which characterised its significance. The ideas of "equality", "liberty" and repudiation of the pre-established are ideas which, while intrinsic to ^{France} 1789, were not influential until after the invasion in 1881 NZ. ~~the~~ Public ~~opinion~~ opinion on Parihaka ~~was~~ ^{was} not measurable until large scale exposure in the early 2000's - upon which it ~~was~~ ^{has} began to be unanimously agreed upon that 1881 was of "enduring significance" to the people of NZ. As such, it is, perhaps, more relevant and *ipso facto* more important to NZ, than the French Revolution of 1789. ~~Indeed, the pacifist message of Parihaka at Chatham, the~~ ~~It is likely that the~~ Indeed, the geographic limitations of Parihaka ^{diminish} as a place do not ~~make~~ ^{diminish} its significance to NZ's sense of nationalhood - demonstrating that significance can also grow over time, especially when its relevance to a country's people also grows through the power of hindsight.

While the nature of change affected by the French Revolution in 1789 was a "violent political upheaval" as interpreted by "the Great English Historian" Taylor, and the Industrial Revolution was a period of history which effected incremental, socio-economic change. ~~was~~ Contrary to Paul Moon's "events" and "peaks in the historical landscape", ~~the~~ from c. 1760 to the mid 19th century, the Industrial Revolution brought about the revolution of industry and ~~production~~. Peter McPhee references the Marxist historian Soboul ~~who~~ stating that "he believed the French Revolution would ~~provide the economic~~ facilitate the growth of a capitalist society, providing the economic basis for a future socialist revolution." Indeed, it could be argued that ~~this~~ this "economic basis" ^{was} ~~is~~ the Industrialisation of Europe and that the emergence of communism in the form of Marx and Engels ^{was} ~~was~~ the beginning of the "Socialist revolution" facilitated by the French Revolution. Indeed, Margaret MacMillan references Fernand Braudel in substantiation of McPhee, stating "he" argued that the ~~main~~ true object of historical research was to look beneath the surface of events and discover the long-term patterns." The usefulness of MacMillan's argument might be made more reliable by the inclusion of similar ideas put forth by McPhee. As a turning point, the Industrial Revolution was not so much ^{an} ~~an~~ "event" but part of Braudel's "longer-term pattern". Indeed, the ~~the~~ historical relationship between that which changed and that which was adopted by the Industrial Revolution from the French Revolution - was the continuation of this "economic basis". ~~At~~ This pattern, it

could be argued, was the ~~cause~~^{cause} a major factor in the multi-causal origins of climate change - a continuing threat to our present and future. While poets like Wordsworth & Keats noted the ~~importance~~^{importance} of environmental forces at the time, in the present, the issue posed by environmental change make the historical relationship between past and present an idea which must ~~be~~^{be} be acknowledged. As a turning point, however, the Industrial Revolution's environmental ramifications are so intrinsically fluid & evolving so as to preclude any ~~mathematical~~^{mathematical} measurability. To this end, its ~~significant~~^{significant} "enduring significance" to NZ is incremental, though uncertain in its ~~relevance~~^{relevance} reliability to us.

The role of women in the French Revolution is acknowledged by Peter McPhee to have a continuing significance in the present day, which makes the suffragette movement culminating in women gaining the vote in 1893 - in NZ - all the more relevant. William Blomfield's satirical cartoon from 1893 provides insight into the perspective which viewed women's suffrage as inimical to the "natural order." Undoubtedly, the bias in the source ~~noted~~^{demeases} its reliability - however its usefulness ~~to~~^{remains} remains. Following From a Euro-centric lens, ~~After~~^{After} 1893 is significant in its ~~chronological~~^{chronological} intensity - highlighted by Kate Adie who notes that British women gained the vote in 1918 after the Bill passed in the "House of Commons" with "55 opponents" to "385" ~~proponents~~^{proponents}. ~~For the latter, the~~
Indeed, the significance of NZ women getting the vote

some 25 years before those in the colonial 'motherland' demonstrates the NZ's ~~relevance~~ ^{significance} as historically a lead of the ~~front~~ ~~movement~~. It also represents progress from the struggle of women during the French Revolution. Eugene Delacroix's "Liberty Leading the People" depicts "Lady Liberty" as a magnanimous and guiding force. This characteristic is substantiated by Peter McPhee, who notes that "Marianne of the Republic... was a feminine allegory watching protectively over men." To this end, the domestic - almost matronly - ideology for gender roles is both invoked by William Blomfield in 1893 and repudiated by the people of NZ in the fight for women's suffrage. The role of women also played a part in the Easter Rising of 1916 in Ireland - a continuation and example of Fernand Braudel's "long-term patterns". ~~For~~ However, the fact that women gained the right to vote for only men in 1893, perhaps, limits its significance as ~~the~~ a true 'turning point'. The change may have been lasting, but questions might be raised as to its tangible effect. Uniquely, however, its aforementioned "chronological irony" ~~does~~ still holds an "enduring significance" to NZers - an indicator of its importance as a relevant & 'turning point' for the people of NZ.

~~Indeed the struggle for recognition by women~~
~~is~~ The Easter Rising of 1916 in Ireland represents a point in history which draws comparison with the values of "liberty", "equality" ~~and~~ "fraternity" and

"repudiation of the preestablished" is demonstrated by the French Revolution in 1789 and by Parliamentary ~~the independence~~ However, the uprising itself was not effective in making change - it was the slow and incremental evolution of popular Irish public opinion in the aftermath which had the greatest influence as a 'turning point'. Indeed, the seven main individuals at the heart of the revolt: Padraig Pearse, ~~Se~~ Thomas Clarke, Thomas MacDonagh, Eamon Ceannt, Sean Mac Diarmada, Joseph Plunkett and James Connolly are argued - by Irish historian R.F. Foster - to have "sacrificed the holy few to transform the lazy many". ~~the very place, even~~ Indeed, this only catalysing of the rest of Ireland was substantiated by the Independence Proclamation stating "Ireland, through us, ~~calls her children to the~~ summons her children to her flag and strikes for freedom." This 'freedom', as iterated by R.F. Foster, was in response to the perceived "atrocities" perpetrated throughout British colonisation of Ireland - including those of the Olive (Cornwall) described by Antonia Fraser. Interestingly, the struggle ~~by~~ women was extended by the eventual victory of Irish nationalism, ~~as~~ showing the continued and constant presence of this theme. The "feminine allegory" of "Maiden of the Republic" is ~~part~~ drawn upon in the description of Ireland as 'her' - thus the subordination of women was further established by the ~~the~~ transfer of power in Ireland from Britain to the clergy. The significance of 1916 is a

'turning point' is demonstrated by the many 'Irish diaspora' throughout history - including that which included NZ due to the discovery of gold in the 1860s. Indeed, the spiritual ~~the~~ invocation of 1916 resonated with the Irish "community" interested by Pōhoro Arnold - but only in the communities of first & second generation NZers of Irish descent in places such as ~~Wellington~~ ^{Vestport}. In hindsight, these immigrants would not have known the impact which their arrival in NZ would have on NZ - however this does not diminish its significance. As a result, the Irish population & their descendants in NZ make manifest the "enduring significance" of 1916 in NZ, as its memory grows incrementally and irreversibly.

The most important turning point, ~~in the~~ which is relevant to all NZers and which affected incremental, irreversible & lasting change ~~was~~ is the Treaty of Waitangi in 1840. While ~~the~~ historians like Harrison Wright argued for "fatal impact" ~~the~~ the historical relationship with the perspectives of Judith Binney and James Belich ~~the~~ argue "acculturation" show the evolution of opinions on which now the majority of NZ agrees. Marcus King's "The Treaty of Waitangi" depicts Māori as culturally & politically inferior to the British colonists which perhaps helps to support Wright's claims. However, Te Hōreata's recollections, in conjunction with the

"historiography of Birney & Bolton provide a
 contemporary & revised account which is more
accurate. Indeed, the colonisation which was
 repudiated by the Easter Rising of 1916 is
 manifested successfully in NZ - showing the
absolute essential nature of the signing of the
 Treaty in 1840. While ~~many~~ things did change,
 that which continued ~~is~~ equally significant.
 The Māori desire to assert sovereignty eventuated
 in the 1972 formation of the Waitangi
 Tribunal. British reinforcement of ^{the} perceived
 "superiority" also continued as did the lack
 of regard for the treaty - described by
 Chief Justice Prendergast in 1877 as a "nullity".
 Indeed, however, Pōkela's perception of the
 treaty has reluctantly evolved to be more
 accepting - regardless of what Don Brash's
 "Hobson's Pleasure" may indicate. To this end,
 1840 is agreed upon, an eventuality which
 ultimately has been achieved incrementally and
irreversibly.

Scholarship History Exemplar Comments

Exemplar 1: Outstanding Scholarship

1. Could have planned more. Effective planning might have ensured that the candidate included more of the Historical Relationships & Key Ideas
2. Clearly addresses Question 1 by making specific references to it but also demonstrates their understanding of the context by defining turning points. Teachers of Scholarship candidates should familiarize themselves with the context as specified in the Assessment Specifications – Skill 2
The Candidate effectively addresses the question by using key words i.e. “enduring significance” and “change”. The response would be improved by identifying the years and/or topics of study the candidate intends to integrate into their response.
The Candidate has developed a good independent argument i.e. that trends are more important than specific events & lead to incremental change, which has more enduring significance. Specific links are made back to the argument throughout the article. The conclusion could substantiate the argument a little more. The argument is consistently developed throughout the article – Skill 2
3. This Candidate balances the integration of their own content knowledge i.e. Easter Rising 1916, Parihaka 1881 and the French Revolution and the content in the sources. Most candidates struggled to do this. It is important for the teacher of Scholarship candidates to ensure that the candidates know they only have to refer to one topic they have studied. Many attempt to bring in content from a number of topics and do not do so effectively. It is better to have a strong understanding of fewer topics and be able to apply them to the question asked and the sources provided in a more convincing manner – Skill 3
4. The Candidate also uses no more than six sources. Candidates who tried to use too many sources did not synthesise content & sources well. The articles of those who did this, read like a ‘tour of the sources’ & not a response to the question – Skill 3
5. The Candidate is being critical of the historical narrative for sources A & H1 here by comparing the two – Skill 5
6. The Candidate is being critical of the historical narrative for sources A & H1 here by contrasting them with historical narratives from their own knowledge. Candidates should balance the critical analysis of historical narrative from their own knowledge and the narrative in the sources. – Skill 5
7. The Candidate identifies and perceptively explains many of the Key Ideas associated with turning points i.e. change... Each idea forms the crux of the paragraph. Here the focus is on ...
8. The Candidate is using an example to evaluate the Historical Relationship of Specific and General. The relationship between the two could be explained more. – Skill 4
9. The Candidate is using an example to evaluate the Historical Relationship of Continuity and Change The relationship between the two could be explained more. – Skill 4
10. The Candidate is attempting to judge the source here by referring to bias. The bias needs to be explained more. This is a low level judgement. The point about the cartoon on Page 10 also needs explanation – Skill 5
11. The Candidate is using an example to evaluate the Historical Relationship of Past and Present – Skill 4
12. The Candidate is being critical of the historical narrative here by comparing two– Skill 5
13. The Candidate is using their own knowledge of historical narrative to develop their argument & then goes on to compare the narrative with that of MacMillan and Braudel who are in sources in the Paper – Skill 5