



Lesson 7: Set Covering, Packing, and Partitioning

1 Covering Students

The USNA would like for all students to hear a presentation on an update to yard-wide COVID procedures. They decide to send a representative into classes to present the information. The presenter, Hannah, who was an Operations Research major, needs to ensure that every student sees the presentation, but would like to visit as few classes as possible. She develops the following mini-version of the problem in order to help write a model that will solve the large-scale optimization problem.

Let S be the set of students: \rightarrow Need to see presentation, needs to be "covered"

$S := \{ \text{Kyle, Aaron, Ryan, Jordan, Monika, Brandon, Samnang, Adam, Natalie, Joshua} \}$

Let \mathcal{C} be the set of classes:

$\mathcal{C} := \{ \text{Naval history, Fencing, Sailing, Boxing, Wrestling, AMP} \}$

Each element C of \mathcal{C} is itself a set, a subset of S ($C \subseteq S$, for all $C \in \mathcal{C}$):

Naval history	$:= \{ \text{Kyle, Ryan, Monika, Brandon} \}$
Fencing	$:= \{ \text{Kyle, Jordan, Samnang, Natalie} \}$
Sailing	$:= \{ \text{Aaron, Monika, Adam} \}$
Boxing	$:= \{ \text{Aaron, Ryan, Jordan, Samnang} \}$
Wrestling	$:= \{ \text{Jordan, Brandon, Joshua} \}$
AMP	$:= \{ \text{Adam, Natalie, Joshua} \}$

Hannah defines the following set of binary variables:

$$z_C := \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if she should visit class } i \\ 0 & \text{if she should not visit class } i \end{cases}, \text{ for } C \in \mathcal{C}$$

} 6 total classes

$z_F = 1$ if she visits fencing

$z_F = 1 \rightarrow$

- \rightarrow Kyle
- \rightarrow Jordan
- \rightarrow Samnang
- \rightarrow Natalie

\rightarrow Hear the presentation get "covered"

2 Set Covering

1. Write two concrete constraints: one that ensures that Jordan will see the presentation, and one that ensures that Brandon will see the presentation.

Jordan:
 - Fencing
 - Boxing
 - Wrestling

If she visits Fencing, Boxing, or Wrestling he will see the presentation.

$$\underbrace{z_F + z_B + z_W}_{\text{Classes he's in that she visited}} \geq 1$$

At least 1 class he's in

Brandon:
 - N
 - W

$$z_N + z_W \geq 1$$

Note: If she visits Wrestling she visits both Jordan and Brandon.

2. Why are these called **set covering constraints**? (Think of the set of students.)

Make sure Every Student is "covered" by a presentation.

3. How many set covering constraints are needed?

10 → one for each student

→ one constraint for each element in S .

4. Using the same sets as above and the variable z_c , how would we write a general parameterized set covering constraint for the students?

For each student $s \in S$, she needs to visit at least one class c such that student s is in class c .

$$\sum_{\substack{c \in C \\ s \in c}} z_c \geq 1 \text{ for each } s \in S$$

sum across all $c \in C$ such that student $s \in c$

The parameterized constraint above works but is a bit messy. There's another way to parameterize it using what's called an **adjacency matrix**. The adjacency matrix is a matrix where the rows correspond to the classes and the columns correspond to the students.

5. Let the adjacency matrix be $a_{c,s}$ for all $c \in \mathcal{C}$ and all $s \in \mathcal{S}$. Illustrate this matrix.

a_{cs} for all
 $c \in \mathcal{C}$
 $s \in \mathcal{S}$

$$a_{cs} = \begin{matrix} & \begin{matrix} K & A & \dots & J \end{matrix} \\ \begin{matrix} N \\ F \\ S \\ B \\ W \\ A \end{matrix} & \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & & 1 \end{bmatrix} \end{matrix}$$

Parameter where $a_{cs} = 1$
 if student s is in class c

6. Write the parameterized set covering constraints using the adjacency matrix.

$$\sum_{c \in \mathcal{C}} a_{cs} z_c \geq 1 \text{ for all } s \in \mathcal{S}$$

If $s=K$: $\sum_{c \in \mathcal{C}} a_{cK} z_c \geq 1 \rightarrow 1 \cdot z_N + 1 \cdot z_F + 0 \cdot z_S + 0 \cdot z_B + 0 \cdot z_W + 0 \cdot z_A \geq 1$
 $z_N + z_F \geq 1$

Either approach works, it's really up to you when it comes to modeling.

7. Write a condensed ~~linear~~ ^{parameterized} model to find a set of classes that covers all students while requiring the fewest possible presentations using the sets, variables, and parameters defined above.

Objective

min number
 of visited
 classes:

$$\sum_{c \in \mathcal{C}} z_c$$

Constraints

$$\sum_{c \in \mathcal{C}} a_{cs} z_c \geq 1 \text{ for all } s \in \mathcal{S}$$

$$z_c \in \{0, 1\} \quad \forall c \in \mathcal{C}$$

3 Set Packing

Eventually Hannah realizes that no student can stand to hear the presentation multiple times, but that she really wants lots of practice with public speaking. She wants to give the presentation as many times as possible without any student seeing it more than once.

1. Write two concrete constraints: one that ensures that Ryan will see the presentation *at most once*, and one that ensures that Brandon will see the presentation *at most once*.

Ryan: $\sum_B z_N + z_B \leq 1 \rightarrow \text{sees it at most once}$

Brandon: $\sum_W z_N + z_W \leq 1 \rightarrow \text{Brandon sees it at most once}$

2. Why are these called **set packing constraints**? (Think of the set of classes.)

Goal is to cover as many elements from the main set (S) with ~~disjoint~~ ^{no overlap}

3. Write a condensed ~~abstract~~ ^{parametric} model to find a collection of classes that maximizes the number of classes Hannah visits, while not seeing any student more than once.

Objective

Maximize $\sum_{C \in C} z_C$

Constraints

$$z_C \in \{0,1\} \quad \forall C \in C$$

$$\sum_{C \in C} a_{CS} z_C \leq 1 \quad \forall S \in S$$

Hardest to solve \rightarrow not guaranteed to have a solution

4 Set Partitioning

Hannah receives a message of encouragement from the Chief of Staff and is told to be sure to show the presentation to *every single student*. But she still knows that no student can possibly sit through it twice, so she must revise her model again.

1. Write two concrete constraints: one that ensures that Aaron will see the presentation *exactly once*, and one that ensures that Samnang will see the presentation *exactly once*.

$$\begin{array}{l} A: \begin{matrix} S \\ B \end{matrix} \quad z_S + z_B = 1 \\ S: \begin{matrix} F \\ B \end{matrix} \quad z_F + z_B = 1 \end{array} \quad \left. \vphantom{\begin{array}{l} A: \\ S: \end{array}} \right\} \begin{array}{l} \text{Each person} \\ \text{sees the} \\ \text{presentation} \\ \text{exactly once.} \end{array}$$

2. Why are these called **set partitioning constraints**? (Think of the set of students.)

Goal is to partition the main set into a bunch of subsets.

Parameterized

3. Write an abstract model to find a collection of classes that minimizes the number of classes Hannah visits, while seeing every student exactly once.

Objective

$$\min: \sum_{C \in \mathcal{C}} z_C$$

Constraints

$$\begin{array}{l} z_C \in \{0, 1\} \quad \forall C \in \mathcal{C} \\ \sum_{C \in \mathcal{C}} a_{CS} z_C = 1 \quad \forall S \in \mathcal{S} \end{array}$$