Camera Based 2D Feature Tracking

This document explains the implementation of Camera Based 2D Feature Tracking. The program is implemented in C++ with a choice to choose from multiple Feature Detectors (SHITOMASI, HARRIS, FAST, BRISK, ORB, AKAZE and SIFT) and Descriptors (BRISK, BRIEF, ORB, FREAK, AKAZE, SIFT) of OpenCV library.

To the end of the document performance evaluations are shown with different combinations of Detectors and Descriptors and top three combinations are mentioned.

1. Data Buffer Optimization:

The below code snippet shows the implementation of a Data Buffer that hold a maximum of two data frames (on MidTermProject_Camera_Student.cpp). It is implemented using a vector, if the size of the vector is "2" and a new data frame must be added to the vector, its first element is removed and then the new data frame is pushed at the back of the vector.

```
//// STUDENT ASSIGNMENT
//// TASK MP.1 -> replace the following code with ring buffer of size dataBufferSize

// push image into data frame buffer

DataFrame frame;
frame.cameraImg = imgGray;
if (dataBuffer.size() >= dataBufferSize)
{
    dataBuffer.erase(dataBuffer.begin());
}
dataBuffer.push_back(frame);

//// EOF STUDENT ASSIGNMENT
```

2. Keypoint Detection:

Multiple Keypoint detectors are implemented using the OpenCV library, namely SHITOMASI, HARRIS, FAST, BRISK, ORB, AKAZE and SIFT. Required detector can be specified as a string and the program uses the detector. The below code snippet shows the implementation that allows for choosing the detector needed as a string (on MidTermProject_Camera_Student.cpp).

```
// extract 2D keypoints from current image
vector<cv::KeyPoint> keypoints; // create empty feature list for current image
string detectorType = "SHITOMASI";
// string detectorType = "HARRIS";
// string detectorType = "BRISK";
// string detectorType = "BRISK";
// string detectorType = "RAKAZE";
// string detectorType = "AKAZE";
// string detectorType = "SIFT";

//// STUDENT ASSIGNMENT
//// TASK MP.2 -> add the following keypoint detectors in file matching2D.cpp and enable string-based selection
//// -> HARRIS, FAST, BRISK, ORB, AKAZE, SIFT

if (detectorType.compare("SHITOMASI") == 0)
{
    detKeypointsShiTomasi(keypoints, imgGray, false);
}
else if (detectorType.compare("HARRIS") == 0)
{
    detKeypointsHarris(keypoints, imgGray, false);
}
else
{
    detKeypointsModern(keypoints, imgGray, detectorType, false);
}
//// EOF STUDENT ASSIGNMENT
```

The function "detKeypointsShiTomasi" (on matching2D_Student.cpp) implements the ShiTomasi detector. Below is its implementation.

```
void detKeypointsShiTomasi(vector<cv::KeyPoint> &keypoints, cv::Mat &img, bool bVis)
    int blockSize = 4;  // size of an average block for computing a derivative covariation matrix over each pixel
    double maxOverlap = 0.0; // max. permissible overlap between two features in %
    double minDistance = (1.0 - maxOverlap) * blockSize;
   int maxCorners = img.rows * img.cols / max(1.0, minDistance); // max. num. of keypoints
   double qualityLevel = 0.01; // minimal accepted quality of image corners
   double k = 0.04;
   double t = (double)cv::getTickCount();
    vector<cv::Point2f> corners;
    cv::goodFeaturesToTrack(img, corners, maxCorners, qualityLevel, minDistance, cv::Mat(), blockSize, false, k);
    for (auto it = corners.begin(); it != corners.end(); ++it)
       cv::KeyPoint newKeyPoint;
       newKeyPoint.pt = cv::Point2f((*it).x, (*it).y);
       newKeyPoint.size = blockSize;
       keypoints.push back(newKeyPoint);
    t = ((double)cv::getTickCount() - t) / cv::getTickFrequency();
    cout << "Shi-Tomasi detection with n=" << keypoints.size() << " keypoints in " << 1000 * t / 1.0 << " ms" << endl;
```

The function "detKeypointsHarris" (on matching2D_Student.cpp) implements the Harris detector. Below is its implementation.

```
void detKeypointsHarris(vector<cv::KeyPoint> &keypoints, cv::Mat &img, bool bVis)
    // Harris Dector parameters
   int apertureSize = 3; // aperture paameter for Sobel operator
int minRe[ponse = 100; // minimum value for a corner in the 8 bit scaled response matrix
    double t = (double)cv::getTickCount();
    cv::Mat dst, dst_norm, dst_norm_scaled;
    dst = cv::Mat::zeros(img.size(), CV_32FC1);
   cv::cornerHarris(img, dst, blockSize, apertureSize, k, cv::BORDER_DEFAULT);
cv::normalize(dst, dst_norm, 0, 255, cv::NORM_MINMAX, CV_32FC1, cv::Mat());
    cv::convertScaleAbs(dst_norm, dst_norm_scaled);
    for (int j = 0; j < dst_norm.rows; j++)
         for (int i = 0; i < dst norm.cols; i++)
             int response = (int) dst norm.at<float>(j, i);
              if (response > minResponse)
                  cv::KeyPoint newKeyPoint;
                  newKeyPoint.pt = cv::Point2f(i, j);
                  newKeyPoint.size = 2 * apertureSize;
                  newKeyPoint.response = response;
                  keypoints.push_back(newKeyPoint);
   t = ((double)cv::getTickCount() - t) / cv::getTickFrequency();
cout << "Harris detection with n=" << keypoints.size() << " keypoints in " << 1000 * t / 1.0 << " ms" << endl;
```

The function "detKeypointsModern" (on matching2D_Student.cpp) implements the FAST, BRISK, ORB, AKAZE and SIFT detectors. They are implemented with default built-in parameters. Below is its implementation.

3. Keypoint Removal:

Out of the Keypoints extracted from the choice of detector, we only need the Keypoints on the preceding vehicle. So, an OpenCV's rectangle is defined and any keypoints outside the rectangle are removed from the vector of keypoints.

```
//// STUDENT ASSIGNMENT
//// TASK MP.3 -> only keep keypoints on the preceding vehicle

// only keep keypoints on the preceding vehicle
bool bFocusOnVehicle = true;
cv::Rect vehicleRect(535, 180, 180, 150);
if (bFocusOnVehicle)
{
    for (auto it = keypoints.begin(); it < keypoints.end(); it++)
    {
        if(!(vehicleRect.contains((*it).pt)))
        {
            keypoints.erase(it);
        }
    }
}</pre>
```

4. Keypoint Descriptor:

BRISK, BRIEF, ORB, FREAK, AKAZE and SIFT Detectors are implemented with a facility to choose the descriptor as a string (as in case of detectors). Below is the code snippet that shows the string variable which helps choose the descriptor.

```
//// STUDENT ASSIGNMENT
//// TASK MP.4 -> add the following descriptors in file matching20.cpp and enable string-based selection based on descriptorType
//// -> BRIEF, ORB, FREAK, AKAZE, SIFT

cv::Mat descriptorS;
string descriptorType = "BRISK"; // BRIEF, ORB, FREAK, AKAZE, SIFT
// string descriptorType = "BRIEF";
// string descriptorType = "ORB";
// string descriptorType = "FREAK";
// string descriptorType = "AKAZE";
// string descriptorType = "SIFT";
descKeypoints((dataBuffer.end() - 1)->keypoints, (dataBuffer.end() - 1)->cameraImg, descriptorType);
//// EOF STUDENT ASSIGNMENT
```

Below shows the implementation of the descriptors using OpenCV implemented in the function "descKeypoints" (on matching2D_Student.cpp). All use the default built in OpenCV parameters.

5. Descriptor Matching:

FLANN matching is implemented. Using a string variable FLANN or Brute Force matching can be chosen. FLANN is implemented in the function "matchDescriptors" (on matching2D_Student.cpp).

6. Descriptor Distance Ratio:

K-NN matching is implemented with number of nearest neighbors as two (k = 2). A string variable can used to perform either the Nearest Neighbor or K-Nearest Neighbor matching. K-NN is implemented in the function "matchDescriptors" (on matching2D_Student.cpp).

```
// perform matching task
if (selectorType.compare("SEL.NN") == 0)
{    // nearest neighbor (best match)
    double t = (double)cv::getTickCount();
    matcher->match(descSource, descRef, matches); // Finds the best match for each descriptor in descl
    t = ((double)cv::getTickCount() - t) / cv::getTickFrequency();
    cout << "SEL_NN with number of matches = " << matches.size() << " found in " << 1000 * t / 1.0 << " ms" << endl;
}
else if (selectorType.compare("SEL_KNN") == 0)
{    // k nearest neighbors (k=2)
    double minDescDistRatio = 0.8;

    double t = (double)cv::getTickCount();

    vector<vector<cv::DMatch>> knn_matches;
    matcher->knnMatch(descSource, descRef, knn_matches, 2);

    for (auto it = knn_matches.begin(); it != knn_matches.end(); it++)
{
        if ((*it)[0].distance < minDescDistRatio * (*it)[1].distance)
        {
            matches.push_back((*it)[0]);
        }
      }
      cout << "Number of matches removed: " << knn_matches.size() - matches.size() << endl;

        t = ((double)cv::getTickCount() - t) / cv::getTickFrequency();
      cout << "SEL_KNN with number of matches = " << matches.size() << " found in " << 1000 * t / 1.0 << " ms" << endl;
}
</pre>
```

7. Performance Evaluation 1:

Number of Keypoints detected using each detector and the size of their neighborhood is tabulated on all the ten images. Below is the table.

		•	Nı	ımber Of K	eyPoints	Detected a	and Neig	hborhood	Size for E	ach Detect	tor			
Image	SHITOMASSI		HARRIS		FAST		BRISK		ORB		AKAZE		SIFT	
	No. of		No. of		No. of		No. of		No. of		No. of		No. of	
	Keypoin	Neighbor	Keypoin	Neighbor	Keypoin	Neighbor	Keypoin	Neighbor	Keypoin	Neighbor	Keypoin	Neighbor	Keypoin	Neighbor
	ts	hood	ts	hood	ts	hood	ts	hood	ts	hood	ts	hood	ts	hood
Image 1	715	4	190	6	2711	7	1472	12.2	280	23.8	727	3.2	771	7.6
Image 2	680	4	162	6	2660	7	1494	12.6	277	23.6	710	3.1	731	7.7
Image 3	716	4	201	6	2606	7	1480	12.2	280	23.5	705	3	734	5.4
Image 4	705	4	202	6	2604	7	1467	12	282	23.8	724	3	714	5.6
Image 5	699	4	299	6	2587	7	1487	12.5	284	23.6	733	3.1	702	5.1
Image 6	672	4	1454	6	2622	7	1450	12.8	288	23.8	724	3.1	741	5.7
Image 7	690	4	115	6	2611	7	1463	12.4	288	23.6	736	3.2	749	7.4
Image 8	711	4	461	6	2609	7	1412	12.6	289	23.6	720	3.2	745	7.1
Image 9	722	4	328	6	2663	7	1417	12.6	287	23.8	736	3.1	791	6.6
Image 10	698	4	823	6	2669	7	1429	12.2	292	23.6	725	3.1	757	6.1
Average	700.8	4	423.5	6	2634.2	7	1457.1	12.41	284.7	23.67	724	3.11	743.5	6.43

As can be seen from the above table, the BRISK Detector detects highest number of keypoints, whereas ORB detects the least.

Also, the size of neighborhood is constant for ShoTomasi, HARRIS and FAST Detectors with a value of 4, 6, 7 respectively. BRISK, ORB, AKAZE and SIFT detectors have neighborhood of 12.41, 23.67, 3.11, 6.43 respectively. Hence, AKAZE has the least neighborhood.

8. Performance Evaluation 2:

Here the number of keypoints matched for the keypoints found (as shown in the above table in section 7). The below are the tabulations for all combinations of Detectors and Descriptors.

Also, here FLANN matching is used with K-NN with number of nearest neighbors as 2 and descriptor distance ratio is set to 0.8.

		Number of	Matched K	eypoints for Detector:	SHITOMAS	SI					
		Descriptor Used									
Image Number	Image Number	BRISK	BRIEF	ORB	FREAK	AKAZE	SIFT				
Image 1	Image 2	191	283	252	162	Cannot be computed	353				
Image 2	Image 3	193	267	231	181	Cannot be computed	369				
Image 3	Image 4	211	266	263	185	Cannot be computed	370				
Image 4	Image 5	195	265	245	164	Cannot be computed	354				
Image 5	Image 6	197	302	256	161	Cannot be computed	373				
Image 6	Image 7	198	276	233	169	Cannot be computed	357				
Image 7	Image 8	204	260	243	176	Cannot be computed	371				
Image 8	Image 9	202	284	261	176	Cannot be computed	378				
Image 9	Image 10	206	285	236	146	Cannot be computed	360				
Ave	rage	199.6667	276.4444	246.6666667	168.8889	Cannot be computed	365				

	Number of Matched Keypoints for Detector: HARRIS										
		Descriptor Used									
Image Number	Image Number	BRISK	BRIEF	ORB	FREAK	AKAZE	SIFT				
Image 1	Image 2	66	77	77	56	Cannot be computed	99				
Image 2	Image 3	66	80	76	63	Cannot be computed	86				
Image 3	Image 4	84	98	96	68	Cannot be computed	110				
Image 4	Image 5	83	109	94	64	Cannot be computed	99				
Image 5	Image 6	128	139	141	113	Cannot be computed	131				
Image 6	Image 7	184	282	275	171	Cannot be computed	398				
Image 7	Image 8	59	49	49	46	Cannot be computed	53				
Image 8	Image 9	186	218	210	138	Cannot be computed	255				
Image 9	Image 10	155	182	166	134	Cannot be computed	181				
Ave	rage	112.3333	137.1111	131.5555556	94.77778	Cannot be computed	156.8889				

	Number of Matched Keypoints for Detector: FAST										
		Descriptor Used									
Image Number	Image Number	BRISK	BRIEF	ORB	FREAK	AKAZE	SIFT				
Image 1	Image 2	609	944	788	539	Cannot be computed	1729				
Image 2	Image 3	642	970	798	545	Cannot be computed	1695				
Image 3	Image 4	581	985	806	557	Cannot be computed	1667				
Image 4	Image 5	644	968	788	545	Cannot be computed	1672				
Image 5	Image 6	650	940	807	560	Cannot be computed	1642				
Image 6	Image 7	626	919	790	549	Cannot be computed	1649				
Image 7	Image 8	617	969	808	534	Cannot be computed	1669				
Image 8	Image 9	595	976	797	587	Cannot be computed	1644				
Image 9	Image 10	647	930	780	540	Cannot be computed	1659				
Ave	rage	623.4444	955.6667	795.777778	550.6667	Cannot be computed	1669.556				

	Number of Matched Keypoints for Detector: BRISK										
		Descriptor Used									
Image Number	Image Number	BRISK	BRIEF	ORB	FREAK	AKAZE	SIFT				
Image 1	Image 2	443	605	341	367	Cannot be computed	810				
Image 2	Image 3	423	635	320	361	Cannot be computed	838				
Image 3	Image 4	433	590	334	351	Cannot be computed	786				
Image 4	Image 5	453	593	341	345	Cannot be computed	824				
Image 5	Image 6	424	600	323	362	Cannot be computed	817				
Image 6	Image 7	415	582	367	367	Cannot be computed	819				
Image 7	Image 8	416	603	328	356	Cannot be computed	820				
Image 8	Image 9	405	588	302	365	Cannot be computed	754				
Image 9	Image 10	410	553	305	369	Cannot be computed	748				
Ave	rage	424.6667	594.3333	329	360.3333	Cannot be computed	801.7778				
					•		•				

	Number of Matched Keypoints for Detector: ORB										
		Descriptor Used									
Image Number	Image Number	BRISK	BRIEF	ORB	FREAK	AKAZE	SIFT				
Image 1	Image 2	123	119	101	61	Cannot be computed	174				
Image 2	Image 3	141	116	113	54	Cannot be computed	177				
Image 3	Image 4	119	114	104	50	Cannot be computed	177				
Image 4	Image 5	123	121	97	60	Cannot be computed	165				
Image 5	Image 6	129	119	104	50	Cannot be computed	170				
Image 6	Image 7	137	125	111	58	Cannot be computed	186				
Image 7	Image 8	132	132	115	59	Cannot be computed	188				
Image 8	Image 9	129	128	92	54	Cannot be computed	189				
Image 9	Image 10	117	123	108	58	Cannot be computed	177				
Ave	rage	127.7778	121.8889	105	56	Cannot be computed	178.1111				

	Number of Matched Keypoints for Detector: AKAZE										
		Descriptor Used									
Image Number	Image Number	BRISK	BRIEF	ORB	FREAK	AKAZE	SIFT				
Image 1	Image 2	316	359	270	251	345	394				
Image 2	Image 3	288	360	240	262	328	404				
Image 3	Image 4	314	335	235	235	344	411				
Image 4	Image 5	287	330	223	240	311	402				
Image 5	Image 6	297	339	221	239	337	410				
Image 6	Image 7	316	377	239	256	345	419				
Image 7	Image 8	311	367	224	281	323	395				
Image 8	Image 9	327	386	262	268	342	430				
Image 9	Image 10	311	369	272	270	331	413				
Ave	rage	307.4444	358	242.8888889	255.7778	334	408.6667				

	Number of Matched Keypoints for Detector: SIFT										
		Descriptor Used									
Image Number	Image Number	BRISK	BRIEF	ORB	FREAK	AKAZE	SIFT				
Image 1	Image 2	236	272	Cannot be computed	217	Cannot be computed	292				
Image 2	Image 3	241	277	Cannot be computed	210	Cannot be computed	289				
Image 3	Image 4	237	287	Cannot be computed	204	Cannot be computed	293				
Image 4	Image 5	237	280	Cannot be computed	202	Cannot be computed	282				
Image 5	Image 6	232	262	Cannot be computed	189	Cannot be computed	286				
Image 6	Image 7	219	277	Cannot be computed	177	Cannot be computed	268				
Image 7	Image 8	243	262	Cannot be computed	178	Cannot be computed	294				
Image 8	Image 9	251	279	Cannot be computed	194	Cannot be computed	302				
Image 9	Image 10	259	323	Cannot be computed	202	Cannot be computed	322				
Ave	rage	239.4444	279.8889	Cannot be computed	197	Cannot be computed	292				

9. Performance Evaluation 3:

The time taken for detection, description and matching in milliseconds are logged in a table, as shown below. The average of number of Keypoints detected and matched by their description are considered (from section 7 and 8 tabulations) in the table and percentage of match is also tabulated.

						Percer	itage of Ke	ypoints M	atched and 1	Total Execu	tion Time	in Millisecor	nds.						
Detector /	Descriptor		BRISK		BRIEF				ORB			FREAK			AKAZE			SIFT	
				Total			Total			Total			Total			Total			Total
				time			time			time			time			time			time
				Detector			Detector			Detector			Detector			Detector			Detector
				+Descript			+Descript			+Descript			+Descript			+Descript			+Descript
	Detected		_	or+Match	Matched	Percentage									Percentage				or+Match
	Count	Count	Match	ing (ms)	Count	Match	hing (ms)	Count	Match	hing (ms)	Count	Match	hing (ms)		Match	0 ()	Count	Match	ing (ms)
														Cannot		Cannot			
														be		be			
														compute	Cannot be	compute			
SHITOMASS	700	199	28.428571	39.5	276	39.428571	32.49	246	35.142857	31.7	168	24	82.7		computed	d	365	52.142857	68.9
														Cannot		Cannot			
														be		be			
															Cannot be	compute			
HARRIS	423	112	26.477541	29.5	137	32.387707	27.8	131	30.969267	26.06	94	22.22222	75.2		computed	d	156	36.879433	81.1
														Cannot		Cannot			
														be		be			
													ı		Cannot be	compute			
FAST	2634	623	23.65224	80.3	955	36.256644	52.1	795	30.182232	47.57	550	20.88079	120	d	computed	d	1669	63.363705	305.6
														Cannot		Cannot			
														be		be			
															Cannot be	compute			
BRISK	1457	424	29.100892	488.1	594	40.768703	413.3	329	22.580645	468.9	360	24.708305	522	-	computed	d	801	54.975978	755.3
														Cannot		Cannot			
														be		be			
															Cannot be	compute			
ORB	284			15.85		42.605634	14.25		36.971831		56		63.5		· · · · · · · · ·	d	178		
AKAZE	724	307	42.403315	140.2	358	49.447514	135.1	l	33.425414	-	255	35.220994	188		46.132597	244.9	408	56.353591	213
		l						Cannot		Cannot	l			Cannot		Cannot			
								be		be				be		be			
		l							Cannot be		l			compute	Cannot be	compute			
SIFT	743	239	32.166891	159.7	279	37.550471	171.3	d	computed	d	197	26.514132	247	d	computed	d	292	39.300135	277.1

It is important in our scenario that the Keypoints must be accurately matched, and the entire process runs as quickly as possible. The below table shows the top ten Detector and Descriptor combinations with highest percentage of matching at the top.

Dectector + Descriptor	Matching Percentage	Total Execution Time Per Image (ms)
FAST + SIFT	63.36	305
ORB + SIFT	62.67	176
AKAZE + SIFT	56.35	213
BRISK + SIFT	54.97	755
SHITOMASI + SIFT	52.14	68.9
AKAZE + BRIEF	49.44	135.1
AKAZE + AKAZE	46.13	244.9
ORB + BRISK	44.7	15.85
ORB + BRIEF	42.6	14.25
AKAZE + BRISK	42.4	140.2

As discussed before, it is also important to have the process run as quickly as possible. As can be seen from the above table, the quickest of the top ten combinations with highest matching are given below. So, it is these three combinations of Detectors and Descriptors that best match our need.

- I. ORB + BRIEF
- II. ORB + BRISK
- III. SHITOMASI + SIFT