

CS 7301 ADVANCED OPTIMIZATION IN ML - ASSIGNMENT 2

Rohith Peddi, RXP190007

May 8, 2021

1

(10 points total) In this assignment, you will prove the submodularity (or non-submodularity) of the following five functions. Denote $V = 1, \dots, n$ as a ground set, $X \subseteq V$ as a subset and $f : 2^V \Rightarrow R$ as a set function.

PROPERTIES

A function $f : 2^V \Rightarrow R$ is submodular if for every $A \subseteq B \subseteq V$ and $e \in V \setminus B$ it holds that

$$f(A \cup e) - f(A) \geq f(B \cup e) - f(B) \quad (1)$$

1.1

(2 Points) Modular Function $m(X) = \sum_{j \in X} m(j)$

SOLUTION

From (1) for sets A, B such that $A \subseteq B \subseteq V$.

$$\begin{aligned} f(A \cup e) - f(A) &= \sum_{j \in A \cup e} m(j) - \sum_{j \in A} m(j) \\ &= \sum_{j \in A} m(j) + m(e) - \sum_{j \in A} m(j) \\ &= m(e) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
f(B \cup e) - f(B) &= \sum_{j \in B \cup e} m(j) - \sum_{j \in B} m(j) \\
&= \sum_{j \in B} m(j) + m(e) - \sum_{j \in B} m(j) \\
&= m(e)
\end{aligned}$$

As $f(A \cup e) - f(A) \geq f(B \cup e) - f(B) \implies m(e) \geq m(e)$ (TRUE)

$f(S)$ satisfies the property of submodularity.

1.2

(2 Points) Set Cover Function $f(X) = w(\Gamma(X))$

where $\Gamma(i)$ is the set of items covered by item i , and $\Gamma(X) = \sup_{i \in X} \Gamma(i)$.

SOLUTION

From (1) for sets A, B such that $A \subseteq B \subseteq V$.

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(A \cup e) - f(A) &= w(\Gamma(A \cup e)) - w(\Gamma(A)) \\
 &= w(\sup_{i \in A \cup e} \Gamma(i)) - w(\sup_{i \in A} \Gamma(i)) \\
 &= \sum_{i \in \Gamma(A \cup e)} w(i) - \sum_{i \in \Gamma(A)} w(i) \\
 &= \sum_{i \in \Gamma(e) \setminus \Gamma(A)} w(i) + \sum_{i \in \Gamma(A)} w(i) - \sum_{i \in \Gamma(A)} w(i) \\
 &= \sum_{i \in \Gamma(e) \setminus \Gamma(A)} w(i)
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(B \cup e) - f(B) &= w(\Gamma(B \cup e)) - w(\Gamma(B)) \\
 &= w(\sup_{i \in B \cup e} \Gamma(i)) - w(\sup_{i \in B} \Gamma(i)) \\
 &= \sum_{i \in \Gamma(B \cup e)} w(i) - \sum_{i \in \Gamma(B)} w(i) \\
 &= \sum_{i \in \Gamma(e) \setminus \Gamma(B)} w(i) + \sum_{i \in \Gamma(B)} w(i) - \sum_{i \in \Gamma(B)} w(i) \\
 &= \sum_{i \in \Gamma(e) \setminus \Gamma(B)} w(i)
 \end{aligned}$$

As $A \subseteq B \subseteq V$ and $|\Gamma(e) \setminus \Gamma(A)| \geq |\Gamma(e) \setminus \Gamma(B)|$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \sum_{i \in \Gamma(e) \setminus \Gamma(A)} w(i) &\geq \sum_{i \in \Gamma(e) \setminus \Gamma(B)} w(i) \\
 f(A \cup e) - f(A) &\geq f(B \cup e) - f(B) \text{ Assuming } \forall i, w(i) \geq 0
 \end{aligned}$$

Thus set cover function is submodular.

1.3

(2 Points) Facility Location $f(X) = \sum_{i \in V} \max_{j \in X} s_{ij}$

SOLUTION

From (1) for sets A, B such that $A \subseteq B \subseteq V$.

Let, $g(X) = \max_{i \in X} w_i$

If we can prove $g(X)$ to be submodular, we can conclusively say Facility Location is submodular as it is the sum of submodular functions $g_j(X)$

Consider, $w_i \in \mathbb{R}^+$

$$\begin{aligned} g(A \cup e) - g(A) &= \max_{i \in A \cup e} w_i - \max_{i \in A} w_i \\ &= \max(\max_{i \in A} w_i, w(e)) - \max_{i \in A} w_i \\ &= \max(0, w(e) - \max_{i \in A} w_i) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} g(B \cup e) - g(B) &= \max_{i \in B \cup e} w_i - \max_{i \in B} w_i \\ &= \max(\max_{i \in B} w_i, w(e)) - \max_{i \in B} w_i \\ &= \max(0, w(e) - \max_{i \in B} w_i) \end{aligned}$$

It can be clearly seen that

$$\begin{aligned} \max(0, w(e) - \max_{i \in A} w_i) &\geq \max(0, w(e) - \max_{i \in B} w_i) \text{ as } A \subseteq B \subseteq V \\ \implies g(A \cup e) - g(A) &\geq g(B \cup e) - g(B) \end{aligned}$$

1. So, $g(X)$ is submodular and hence $f(X)$ is submodular when $s_{ij} \geq 0$.
2. If $s_{ij} \in \mathbb{R}$ then submodularity is not guaranteed.

1.4

(2 Points) Dispersion sum $f(X) = \sum_{i,j \in X} d_{ij}$

SOLUTION

From (1) for sets A, B such that $A \subseteq B \subseteq V$.

$$\begin{aligned} f(A \cup e) - f(A) &= \sum_{i,j \in A \cup e} d_{ij} - \sum_{i,j \in A} d_{ij} \\ &= 2 \sum_{i \in A} d_{ie} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} f(B \cup e) - f(B) &= \sum_{i,j \in B \cup e} d_{ij} - \sum_{i,j \in B} d_{ij} \\ &= 2 \sum_{i \in B} d_{ie} \end{aligned}$$

$d_{ij} \geq 0 \implies f(B \cup e) - f(B) \geq f(A \cup e) - f(A) \implies$ violates (1)
So, it is not submodular.

1.5

(2 Points) Feature based function $f(X) = \sum_{i \in I} \psi(m_i(X))$ where ψ is a concave function

SOLUTION

If functions $m_i(X)$, considered in the composition are positive modular then the the function $f(X)$ is submodular.

From (1) for sets A, B such that $A \subseteq B \subseteq V$.

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(A \cup e) - f(A) &= \sum_{i \in I} \psi(m_i(A \cup e)) - \sum_{i \in I} \psi(m_i(A)) \\
 &= \sum_{i \in I} \psi\left(\sum_{j \in A \cup e} mo_i(j)\right) - \sum_{i \in I} \psi\left(\sum_{j \in A} mo_i(j)\right) \\
 &\text{Consider } \sum_{j \in A} mo_i(j) \text{ as } X_i \\
 &= \sum_{i \in I} \psi(X_i + mo(e)) - \sum_{i \in I} \psi(X_i) \\
 &= \sum_{i \in I} \psi(X_i + mo(e)) - \psi(X_i)
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(B \cup e) - f(B) &= \sum_{i \in I} \psi(m_i(B \cup e)) - \sum_{i \in I} \psi(m_i(B)) \\
 &= \sum_{i \in I} \psi\left(\sum_{j \in B \cup e} mo_i(j)\right) - \sum_{i \in I} \psi\left(\sum_{j \in B} mo_i(j)\right) \\
 &\text{Consider } \sum_{j \in B} mo_i(j) \text{ as } Y_i \\
 &= \sum_{i \in I} \psi(Y_i + mo(e)) - \sum_{i \in I} \psi(Y_i) \\
 &= \sum_{i \in I} \psi(Y_i + mo(e)) - \psi(Y_i)
 \end{aligned}$$

If ψ is concave and mo_i is positive modular then

$Y_i \geq X_i$ as $A \subseteq B \subseteq V$

$\psi(X_i + mo(e)) - \psi(X_i) \geq \psi(Y_i + mo(e)) - \psi(Y_i)$

$\sum_{i \in I} \psi(X_i + mo(e)) - \psi(X_i) \geq \sum_{i \in I} \psi(Y_i + mo(e)) - \psi(Y_i)$

$f(A \cup e) - f(A) \geq f(B \cup e) - f(B)$

Thus feature based function is submodular.

2 CODE

Google colab link : Assignment 2