Skills, Practices, and Aspirations of Small-scale Entrepreneurs in Low-income Settings

Julius Rüschenpöhler*

*UC Berkeley, CEGA

March 04, 2021

Lecture Overview

1 PART I: Lecture

Business Practices

- Business Practices Around the World
- Classical MSME Training
- Extensions of the Classical Approach
- Measurement of Firm Performance
- Mechanisms
- Alternative Approaches

2 PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Around the World Classical MSME Training

Classical Approac Measurement of Firm Performance Mechanisms Alternative

Approaches
Takeaways
PART II: Pap

 Bloom and van Reenen (2010, 2019): Business practices, motivation Business Practice

Business Practices Around the World

Training
Extensions of the

Classical Approach
Measurement of

Mechanisms
Alternative

PART II: Paper Curating Local

Heterogeneity in Business Practices

■ Bloom and van Reenen (2010): Heterogeneity

Business Practice

Business Practices Around the World

Training

Classical Approac

Mechanisms
Alternative

PART II: Paper Curating Local

Value-Added of Business Practices

■ Bloom and van Reenen (2019): Correlation with productivity

Business Practices
Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME

Training

Extensions of the Classical Approac

Measurement of Firm Performance Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Business Practices of Small Firms

■ McKenzie and Woodruff (2009, 2017): Heterogeneity and predictiveness

Business Practice

Business Practices Around the World Classical MSME

Training
Extensions of the

Classical Approach

Measurement of

Mechanisms
Alternative

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Business Practices of Small Firms

■ McKenzie and Woodruff (2009, 2017): Example categories and practices

Business Practices

Around the World
Classical MSME

Training
Extensions of the

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

Firm Performar Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Best Practices for Small Firms

■ McKenzie and Woodruff (2017): Portable best practices

PART I: Lecture
Business Practice
Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach
Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative

History and Prevalence

- At least USD 1 billion per year (to 4-5 million beneficiary entrepreneurs; McKenzie, 2020)
- Classical training programs *precede* evidence that business practices vary and are predictive for productivity
- Examples: Start and Improve Your Business (ILO), Business Edge (IFC), ELSE??

Business Practices
Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the

Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach
Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches

Typical Training Program

Content

Business Practice

Around the V

Classical MSME Training

Classical Approac

Firm Performa Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

PART II: Paper

Typical Training Program

Delivery

Business Practice

Around the Wor

Classical MSME Training Extensions of the

Classical Approac Measurement of

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Impact on Businesses

■ First wave (Karlan and Valdivia, 2011, Field, et al., 2010; Bruhn & Zia, 2013; Bulte et al., 2017; Anderson, Chandy, and Zia, 2018)

Business Practices
Business Practices

Classical MSME Training Extensions of the Classical Approa

Measurement of Firm Performance Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Impact on Businesses

■ Econometric and implementation issues (McKenzie and Woodruff, 2014)

Business Practices
Business Practices

Around the Worl

Classical MSME

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of Firm Performanc Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Impact on Businesses

■ Recent evaluations (McKenzie, 2020)

Business Practice

Around the W

Classical MSME Training

Classical Approac

Firm Performa Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Targeted Training

■ Female entrepreneurs

Business Practice

Around the World Classical MSME Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

Mechanisms
Alternative

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Targeted Training

Young entrepreneurs

Business Practice

Around the World
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

Firm Performar Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Targeted Training

Gazelles

Business Practice

Around the Worl

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Firm Performat
Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

On-site Consulting

 Bloom, et al. (2013); Karlan et al (2015); Bruhn, Karlan & Schoar (2019) PART I: Lecture
Business Practices
Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach
Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches

On-site Consulting

Business Practice

Around the Worl
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of Firm Performanc

Alternative

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Complementary Constraints

■ McKenzie cash JDE paper

Business Practice

Around the Worl

Classical MSME

Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

Mechanisms Alternative

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Complementary Constraints

■ McKenzie cash JDE paper

Business Practice

Around the Worl

Classical MSME

Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

Mechanisms Alternative

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Imprecision of Outcome Measures

■ Confidence Intervals, pic?

Business Practice

Around the Worl

Classical MSME

Training

Extensions of the Classical Approac

> Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms Alternative Approaches

Reliability of Self-reports

■ Self-reports of aggregate

Measurement of Firm Performance

Reliability of Self-reports

■ Disaggregating quantities in self-reports

Business Practice

Around the World Classical MSME Training

Extensions of the

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms Alternative Approaches

Reliability of Self-report

Direct measures

Business Practice

Around the Worl Classical MSME Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms Alternative

Alternative Approaches

Sales vs. Profits

Business Practice

Around the World

Extensions of the

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Sales vs. Profits

Business Practice

Around the World

Extensions of the

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Business Practices

Around the World
Classical MSME

Extensions of the

Classical Approac

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Business Practice

Around the World
Classical MSME

Extensions of the

Classical Approac

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Heterogeneity of Impact

- Heterogeneity of treatment effect poorly understood across different approaches
- Potential constraints are manifold, and likely context-dependent

Business Practice

Business Practices Around the World Classical MSME Training

Classical Approach Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

PART II: Paper Curating Local

Education

■ Drexler, Fischer & Schoar (2014)

Mechanisms

Family Commitments

Business Practice

Around the World Classical MSME

Extensions of the Classical Approac

Measurement of Firm Performan

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Identity Concerns

Business Practice

Around the Worl

Extensions of the Classical Approac

Measurement of Firm Performan

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Aspirations

Business Practice

Around the Worl Classical MSME

Extensions of the Classical Approac

Measurement of

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Local Relevance of Best Practices

Business Practice

Around the Worl

Extensions of the Classical Approac

Measurement of Firm Performan

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Approaches Takeaways

Rules of Thumb

■ Drexler, Fischer & Schoar (2014)

Rules of Thumb

Business Practice

Around the Worl

Classical MSME

Extensions of the Classical Approac

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanism

Alternative Approaches

Local Knowledge

■ Cai and Szeidl (2019), Brooks et al. (2018), Lafortune et al. (2020), Seither (2020), Abebe et al. (2020)?

Business Practice

Around the Work
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

Measurement o Firm Performar Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Local Knowledge

■ Cai and Szeidl (2019), Brooks et al. (2018), Lafortune et al. (2020), Seither (2020), Abebe et al. (2020)?

Business Practice

Around the Work
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

Measurement o Firm Performar Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Local Knowledge

■ Cai and Szeidl (2019), Brooks et al. (2018), Lafortune et al. (2020), Seither (2020), Abebe et al. (2020)?

Business Practice

Around the Work
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

Measurement o Firm Performar Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Role Models

■ La Ferrara et al. (2012); Chong and La Ferrara (2009); Berg and Zia (2013); Riley (2018)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practice

Around the World Classical MSME Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

Mechanisms

Alternative

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Role Models

■ La Ferrara et al. (2012); Chong and La Ferrara (2009); Berg and Zia (2013); Riley (2018

Business Practice

Around the World Classical MSME Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

> Firm Performa Mechanisms Alternative

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Role Models

■ La Ferrara et al. (2012); Chong and La Ferrara (2009); Berg and Zia (2013); Riley (2018)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practice

Around the World Classical MSME Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach Measurement of

Mechanisms

Alternative

Alternative Approaches Takeaways

Takeaways

Business Practice

Around the Worl

Extensions of the Classical Approac

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Takeaways

Questions

■ Any questions?

.. before we move on to our paper?

Business Practice

Around the Worl Classical MSME Training

Classical Approac

Firm Performance

Alternative Approaches

Takeaways

Curating Local Knowledge

Experimental Evidence from Small Retailers in Indonesia

Patricio S. Dalton¹ Julius Rüschenpöhler² Burak Uras¹ and Bilal Zia³

¹Tilburg University

²UC Berkeley, CEGA

³The World Bank

March 04, 2021

Paper Overview

- 1 PART I: Lecture
 Business Practices
- 2 PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge
 - Motivation
 - Our Approach
 - Data and Design
 - Results
 - Discussion
 - Conclusion

Business Practices

PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge

Our Approach Data and Design Results

Conclusio

Background

- Micro & Small firms (MSEs) main **source of employment** in the developing world
- In Indonesia, MSEs represent 99% of all firms and 94.5% of employment
- Understanding the factors fostering efficiency and growth of MSEs is an important research and policy goal

Motivation

A Growing Focus on Management

- Classroom Training: Field, et al. (2010); Karlan & Valdivia (2011); Bruhn & Zia (2013); McKenzie & Woodruff (2014, 2017); Bulte et al. (2017); Anderson, Chandy & Zia (2018); Lafortune et al. (2018)
- Consulting: Bloom, et al. (2013); Karlan et al (2015); Bruhn, Karlan & Schoar (2019)
- Mobilizing Peer Knowledge:
 - Brooks et al. $(2018) \rightarrow \text{Local mentors (market information)}$
 - Cai & Szeidl (2018) → Business meetings
 - Abebe et al. (2019) → Management experience matching

Business Practice

PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge Motivation Our Approach Data and Design Results Discussion



Harnessing Cross-Firm Heterogeneity

- Some facts about business practices in firms:
 - Vast heterogeneity in business practices and performance across similar businesses (de Mel, McKenzie & Woodruff, 2009)
 - Variation in practices accounts for more than 20% of variation in productivity within the same firm in the US (Bloom et al, 2019)

Business Practices

PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge Motivation

Harnessing Cross-Firm Heterogeneity

- Some facts about business practices in firms:
 - Vast heterogeneity in business practices and performance across similar businesses (de Mel, McKenzie & Woodruff, 2009)
 - Variation in practices accounts for more than 20% of variation in productivity within the same firm in the US (Bloom et al, 2019)
- Research thus far has mostly overlooked this underlying heterogeneity in design and implementation of programs

PART I: Lecture
Business Practice

Curating Local

Knowledge

Motivation

Our Approach

Harnessing Cross-Firm Heterogeneity

- Some facts about business practices in firms:
 - Vast heterogeneity in business practices and performance across similar businesses (de Mel, McKenzie & Woodruff, 2009)
 - Variation in practices accounts for more than 20% of variation in productivity within the same firm in the US (Bloom et al, 2019)
- Research thus far has mostly overlooked this underlying heterogeneity in design and implementation of programs
- Our idea is to make it **central** to the research design:
 - Use variation across businesses to identify business practices associated with successful performance
 - Instead of teaching set courses, provide consulting, or matching; we curate what works from local peers
 - Test different communication channels and their cost-effectiveness

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Curating Local Knowledge Motivation



Selecting Local Best Practices

- Detailed qualitative interviews with local business peers:
 - Understand and codify their practices (record-keeping, financial planning, stocking-up, marketing, and joint decision-making)
 - Identify implementation norms and beliefs regarding each practice (e.g. whether they are complicated, necessary, etc.)
 - Document locally relevant tips and rule of thumbs
- Baseline quantitative survey
 - Measure practices and outcomes
 - Quantitative association of business practices with profits and sales

Business Practice

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design



Disseminating Knowledge

Handbook

■ Pure information: Which practices, how to adopt, and why?

Supplemented with two types of experiential learning:

Movie

- Psychological and emotional involvement → social learning is possible through observing the successful experience of similar others.
- Bernard, et al. (2014); La Ferrara et al. (2012); Chong and La Ferrara (2009); Berg and Zia (2013).

In-shop Assistance

- Hands-on involvement → social learning is possible through own experience, with a small nudge (Kolb, 1984).
- Facilitated by local lay person

Business Practice

PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge Motivation



Research Questions

Adoption

- Do retailers adopt these practices once peer best practices are aggregated and made common knowledge?
- If so, ...
 - Does the type of experiential involvement matter?

■ Impact

- Does firm profitability increase?
- If so, what are the channels?

Business Practices

Knowledge

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results



Sample

- Listing of 2042 small retail businesses from 29 administrative communities (Kelurahan) in urban Jakarta
- Selection criteria for firm listing:
 - At least $4m^2$ in size
 - At least two different product categories on offer
 - At least 30 meters distance to next business in sample → to minimize spillovers
- Random sample of 1301 from the list
- Randomization to treatment arms stratified by
 - Gender
 - Firm space $(4-6m^2, 6-10m^2, 10 \text{ and above } m^2)$
 - Composite score of business practices above or below median
 - Kelurahan

PART I: Lecture
Business Practice

Curating Local Knowledge Motivation Our Approach Data and Design

Experimental Design

- Three types of information provision:
 - Handbook with best practices and tips
 - Movie with successful peers
 - Business practice implementation assistance
- Five experimental groups
 - 1 Handbook only (N=260)
 - 2 Handbook and invitation to movie screening (N=260)
 - 3 Handbook and offer of two assistance visits (N=260)
 - 4 Handbook and both movie and assistance (N=260)
 - 5 Control (N=261)

Business Practice

Curating Local
Knowledge
Motivation
Our Approach
Data and Design

Timeline

September 2015: Qualitative Interviews

2 January 2016: Listing for Baseline

3 Feb-Apr 2016: Baseline Survey

4 Oct-Nov 2016: Interventions

5 Apr-May 2017: Midline

6 Apr-May 2018: Endline

PART I: Lecture
Business Practice

Curating Local Knowledge Motivation Our Approach Data and Design

Typical Retail Shop in the Sample



Typical Retail Shop in the Sample II



PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

urating Local nowledge

Our Approach **Data and Desig**r

Results

Handbook



Business Practices

PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge

Motivation
Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Conclusio

Handbook Content

Why you should try these best practices in your shop

Evidence from a large-scale study on Jakarta-based retailers





RECORD-KEEPING

Shop owners who <u>keep business records</u> report 28% higher monthly sales and 26% higher monthly profits than those who do not keep business records.

Shop owners who track their customers' debts report 40% higher monthly sales and 36% higher monthly profits than those who do not track their customers' debts.

STOCK-UP SCHEDULING

Shops that <u>maintain stock-up schedules</u> earn 26% more in monthly sales and 25% more in profits than those that do not maintain stock-up schedules of their primary products.

Shops that stock up daily rather than weekly earn 48% more in monthly sales and 37% more in monthly profits.

Business Practice

PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge

Our Approach

Data and Design

Discussion

Handbook Content II



A step-by-step guide to record-keeping

Step 1: Separating household and business finances

The best way to start keeping records is by establishing a clear separation between your personal and business finances. We do not mean this in the strictest sense of keeping your business cash away from your personal life completely, rather we advise you to not lose sight of your rash flow.

The most convenient and effective way to separate your personal and business finances is by physically separating the funds into two different cash boxes, purses, or drawers. Label them clearly; use one compartment for business purposes and another for personal.

Use only your business compartment to follow this handbook from this point forward. Make sure that money in your business compartment is used only for business purposes. Be meticulous about it - this is the first step to get your finance organized:

There is an activity at the end of this section that requires an additional compartment. If you have one more cash box, purse, or drawer available, please reserve it for this activity (record-keeping, extra step).

Business Practice

Curating Local Knowledge

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Conclusion

Movie with Successful Peers



PART I: Lectur

T II: Paper ting Local vledge vation Approach and Design ilts

ılts ussion :lusion

Implementation Assistance for Business Practices



Business Practices

PART II: P Curating Lo Knowledge

Our Approach

Data and Design Results

Summary Statistics

	Control	HB only	HB & MOV	HB & HELP	HB & MOV
		,			& HELP
	N = 261	N = 260	N = 260	N = 260	PARV ±: 260cture
Firm Owner Characteristics					Business Practice
Gender (Male=1)	0.28	0.3	0.29	0.3	PART _O LI _S Paper
Age	45.22	45.27	45.28	45.16	Curating bocal
Education (Years)	9.1	9.52	9.36	9.42	Knowlyd55
Risk Preference (0 - 10 "Perfectly Risk-Seeking")	3.74	3.76	3.88	3.6	Motiv3:68
Time Preference (0 - 10 "Perfect Patience")	5.19	5.07	5.21	5.25	Our App2oach
inicirclete (o - to Terrett raterice)	5.17	5.07	5.21	5.25	7.7
Firm Characteristics					Data and Design
Firm Age (Years)	12.76	13.77	14.03	13.98	Results 13.47
Family Member Is Business Partner	0.56	0.6	0.63	0.59	Discussion 0.62
Total Number of Workers	2.03	2.05	1.9	1.99	Concl25041
Business Has Tax ID	0.2	0.21	0.2	0.15	0.18
Total Sales Last Month (USD PPP)	4454.37	4730.64	4840.55	4761.4	5139
Total Profits Last Month (USD PPP)	889.58	961.1	926.78	825.25	934.66
Applied for Bus Loan in Last 12 Months	0.2	0.17	0.15	0.22	0.17
Obtained Bus Loan in Last 12 Months	0.18	0.15	0.14	0.18	0.14
Business Practices					
Management Practices Aggregate Score	0.37	0.36	0.37	0.35	0.37
Marketing Subscore	0.23	0.23	0.25	0.23	0.24
Stocking-up Subscore	0.45	0.47	0.47	0.47	0.46
Record-keeping Subscore	0.33	0.28	0.3	0.29	0.3
Financial-planning Subscore	0.51	0.47	0.47	0.43	0.47

■ Test of Joint Orthoganality from Multinomial Logit (P-value):

0.857

Movie: Take Up and Assessment

	(1)	(2)
	HB & MOV	HB & MOV
		& HELP
	(A)	(B)
	N=260	N=260
Attendance Business Owner or Partner Attended Film Screening	0.52	0.49
Evaluation (1-4 Scale):		
Has Learned Something New	3.34	3.21
Feels Inspired	3.31	3.30
Feels Hopeful	3.60	3.42
Feels Bored	0.83	0.97

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge Motivation Our Approach Data and Design Results Discussion

Assistance: Take Up and Assessment

(1)	(2)
HB & HELP	HB & MOV,
	& HELP
(A)	(B)
N=260	N=260
0.77	0.78
0.68	0.68
2.88	2.89
2.76	2.83
2.88	2.97
0.59	0.43
	HB & HELP (A) N=260 0.77 0.68 2.88 2.76 2.88

Business Practices

PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge Motivation Our Approach Data and Design Results Discussion

Impact on Business Practices

Aggregate Scores

	Record Keeping	Planning	Stocking-up	Marketing	Joint RT I: Lectu Decision-making Pract
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
Assigned Handbook	0.025	0.027	-0.007	-0.011	PART II: Pape 0.011urating Local
Assigned Handbook & Movie	(0.209) 0.057***	(0.273) 0.043	(0.694) 0.038	(0.694) 0.040	(0.694)owledge 0.040 _{dotivation}
Ü	(0.009)	(0.107)	(0.117)	(0.166)	(0.217) (0.037 Approach
Assigned Handbook & Assistance	0.065*** (0.004)	0.034 (0.166)	0.011 (0.664)	0.039 (0.166)	(0.239) ta and Design
Assigned All Three	0.054*** (0.009)	0.068*** (0.009)	0.053** (0.020)	0.061** (0.032)	0.05% esults (0.094) scussion
	. ,		. ,		Conclusion
R-squared	0.204	0.192	0.187	0.150	0. <mark>120</mark>
Sample Size	2205	2204	2205	2205	2205
Dependent Variable Mean of Control	0.196	0.402	0.471	0.250	0. <mark>269</mark>
Dependent Variable SD of Control F-tests (p-value):	0.252	0.310	0.270	0.320	0.420
Book = Book & Mov	0.069	0.487	0.014	0.028	0.300
Book = Book & Assistance	0.025	0.754	0.304	0.030	0.348
Book = All Three	0.096	0.073	0.001	0.002	0.082

- Multiple hypothesis testing corrected p-values in parentheses
- "All Three" improvement of 28 % in record-keeping, 17 % in planning, 11 % in stocking, 24 % in marketing and 22 % in joint decision making.

Business Profits

	Profits	Profits
	last month	last month
	(win 5%)	(IHS)
	(1)	(2)
Assigned Handbook	-91.307	-0.067
· ·	(78.400)	(0.088)
Assigned Handbook & Movie	110.378	0.055
Ŭ	(86.841)	(0.092)
Assigned Handbook & Assistance	310.455***	0.261***
	(89.488)	(0.096)
Assigned All Three	191.088**	0.199**
	(84.662)	(0.094)
R-squared	0.179	0.211
Sample Size	2172	2172
Dependent Variable Mean in Control Group	894.544	6.817
Dependent Variable SD in Control Group F-tests (p-value):	1127.783	1.348
Book = Book & Mov	0.020	0.167
Book = Book & Assistance	0.000	0.000
Book = All Three	0.001	0.003

■ Profits increase by 35% (about 0.28 sd.) - ITT.

Results

Business Sales

	ITT	TOT
	Sales	Sales
	last month	last month
	(win 5%)	(win 5%
	(1)	(2)
Assigned Handbook	-396.976	-417.198
Ü	(314.252)	-417.198
Assigned Handbook & Movie	335.489	601.221
	(337.881)	(606.634)
Assigned Handbook & Assistance	836.755**	1031.692**
	(372.924)	(457.015)
Assigned All Three	807.462**	1558.326**
	(358.384)	(696.317)
R-squared	0.492	0.483
Sample Size	2197	2197
Dependent Variable Mean in Control Group	4998.923	4998.923
Dependent Variable SD in Control Group	5623.257	5623.257
F-tests (p-value):		
Book = Book & Mov	0.020	0.047
Book = Book & Assistance	0.000	0.000
Book = All Three	0.000	0.001

PART I: Lecture

ART II: Paper
urating Local
nowledge
Motivation
Our Approach
Data and Design

Results
Discussion
Conclusion

■ Sales increase by 16% (about 0.15 sd.) ITT → () → () → ()

Other Outcomes

- No significant impacts on:
 - Business expenses
 - Size of the shop
 - Number of employees
 - Number of customers
 - Business credit

Business Practice

Curating Local Knowledge Motivation Our Approach Data and Design Results

Efficiency Gains?

- Unpacking impacts on practices shows improvements in efficiency practices:
 - Adjust stocks based on product profitability
 - Negotiate lower prices with suppliers
 - Consult with former customers
 - Offer discounts
 - Make joint decisions
 - Review financial performance to identify channels of improvement
 - Make anticipated budget for upcoming costs

Business Practices

Curating Loc Knowledge Motivation

Our Approach Data and Design

Discussion

Efficiency Gains?

- Unpacking impacts on practices shows improvements in efficiency practices:
 - Adjust stocks based on product profitability
 - Negotiate lower prices with suppliers
 - Consult with former customers
 - Offer discounts
 - Make joint decisions
 - Review financial performance to identify channels of improvement
 - Make anticipated budget for upcoming costs
- These are non-record-keeping practices. Also, variance in profits among the treated businesses does not converge

PART I: Lecture
Business Practice

Knowledge

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Discussion



Efficiency Gains?

- Unpacking impacts on practices shows improvements in efficiency practices:
 - Adjust stocks based on product profitability
 - Negotiate lower prices with suppliers
 - Consult with former customers
 - Offer discounts
 - Make joint decisions
 - Review financial performance to identify channels of improvement
 - Make anticipated budget for upcoming costs
- 2 These are non-record-keeping practices. Also, variance in profits among the treated businesses does not converge
- 3 Causal-mediation analysis shows that the most important drivers of impact on sales and profits are stocking up and marketing practices.

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

urating Local
nowledge

Intivation
Our Approach
Nata and Design

Knowledge or Aspirations?

- Our interventions could have increased business performance and practice adoption through an increase in business aspirations rather than (or on top of) business knowledge.
- We directly measure business aspirations at baseline, midline, and endline for all shop owners in the sample.
- We elicit short (one year) and long-term (ideal) aspirations on various business dimensions:
 - sales
 - shop size
 - number of customers
 - number of employees
- No treatment effects on aspirations

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge Motivation

> Data and Desig Results Discussion

Conclusion

Business Stealing?

Do treated businesses improve performance at the expense of the control group?

- Shops in Control group **do not decrease** their sales and profits from baseline to endline. They remain the same.
- Shops in Control group that are closer to the treated shops do not suffer bigger losses in sales and profits than those who are further away.

→ No evidence for business stealing

Business Practice

Curating Local
Knowledge
Motivation
Our Approach

Cost-Effectiveness

- Low cost per firm:
 - Cost Handbook alone: USD 100
 - Cost Handbook & Movie: USD 125
 - Cost Handbook & Assistance: USD 125
 - Cost Handbook & Assistance & Movie: USD 150

■ High Benefits

- Up to USD 330 per month in profits.
- Adoption of top practices by retailers.
- Research Design likely scalable and replicable in other settings.

Business Practice

Curating Local Knowledge Motivation Our Approach Data and Design

Takeaways

- Curating local knowledge has value for business growth
- Information alone does not have impact, but behavioral interventions are needed
- These "add-ons" are inexpensive and scalable, making this type of intervention very attractive for policy

PART I: Lectu Business Practi PART II: Pape Curating Local Knowledge Motivation Our Approach Data and Design Results

Conclusion