

Skills, Practices, and Aspirations of Small-scale Entrepreneurs in Low-income Settings

Julius Rüschepöhler

UC Berkeley, CEGA

March 04, 2021

Lecture Overview

1 PART I: Lecture

Business Practices

- Business Practices Around the World
- Classical MSME Training
- Extensions of the Classical Approach
- Measurement of Firm Performance
- Mechanisms
- Alternative Approaches

2 PART II: Paper

Curating Local Knowledge

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach
Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge* References

- Bloom and van Reenen (2010, 2019): Business practices, motivation (Bloom, Mahajan, McKenzie, and Roberts, 2010; ?)

Heterogeneity in Business Practices

- Bloom and van Reenen (2010): Heterogeneity (Bloom, Mahajan, McKenzie, and Roberts, 2010)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

- Bloom and van Reenen (2019): Correlation with productivity (?)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Business Practices in Small Firms

- McKenzie and Woodruff (2009, 2017): Heterogeneity and predictiveness (?McKenzie and Woodruff, 2017)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Business Practices of Small Firms

- McKenzie and Woodruff (2009, 2017): Example categories and practices (?McKenzie and Woodruff, 2017)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Best Practices for Small Firms

- McKenzie and Woodruff (2017): Portable best practices (McKenzie and Woodruff, 2017)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

History and Prevalence

- At least **USD 1 billion per year** (to 4-5 million beneficiary entrepreneurs; ?)
- Classical training programs *precede* evidence that business practices vary and are predictive for productivity
- Examples:
 - Start and Improve Your Business (ILO)
 - Business Edge (IFC)
 - EMPRETEC Entrepreneurship Training Workshop (UNCTAD)

PART I: Lecture
*Business Practices
Around the World*

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Typical Training Program

Content

- Training is delivered by 600 local certified trainers and by a pool of approximately 60 international master trainers. All trainers are also entrepreneurs.
- Empretec Training Workshops offer different levels of instruction that include:
- 6-day courses (48 hours); 32-hour (usually spread over 4 days) for micro-entrepreneurs with low levels of literacy; Interactive coaching based on real business challenges of participants.

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices
Around the World

**Classical MSME
Training**

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Typical Training Program

Delivery



PART I: Lecture
Business Practices
Business Practices
Around the World

**Classical MSME
Training**

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Evidence on Impact

- First wave (Karlan and Valdivia, 2011, Field, et al., 2010; Bruhn & Zia, 2013; Bulte et al., 2017; Anderson, Chandy, and Zia, 2018) (?) (?) (Bruhn and Zia, 2013) (?) (Anderson, Chandy, and Zia, 2018)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices
Around the World

**Classical MSME
Training**

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Evidence on Impact

- Econometric and implementation issues (McKenzie and Woodruff, 2014)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices
Around the World

**Classical MSME
Training**

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Evidence on Impact

- Recent evaluations (McKenzie, 2020) (?)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices
Around the World

**Classical MSME
Training**

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Targeted Training

Female entrepreneurs

- Example: Gender and Enterprise Together (GET Ahead, ILO; ??)
- ?

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Targeted Training

Young entrepreneurs

- Entrepreneurship programs in school and university
- Example: University final year course in Tunisia (?)
- ?

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices

Around the World

Classical MSME

Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Targeted Training

■ Gazelles

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Specific Domains

- (Anderson, Chandy, and Zia, 2018)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Specific Domain

- (Anderson, Chandy, and Zia, 2018)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

On-site Consulting

- Bloom, et al. (2013); Karlan et al. (2015); Bruhn, Karlan, and Schoar (2019)
- Large firms: (Bloom, Eifert, Aprajit, McKenzie, and Roberts, 2013); SMEs: (Bruhn, Karlan, and Schoar, 2018)
- (?) (?)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

On-site Consulting



PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Multimedia delivery

TV shows

- Examples: Ruka Juu in Tanzania (?) and El Mashroua in Egypt (?)
- ?

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Multimedia delivery

TV shows

- Examples: Ruka Juu in Tanzania (?) and El Mashroua in Egypt (?)
- ?

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Multimedia delivery

Text messages

■ (?) (?)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices

Around the World

Classical MSME

Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative

Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References

Complementary Constraints

- McKenzie cash JDE paper

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Complementary Constraints

- McKenzie cash JDE paper

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance
Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Imprecision of Outcome Measures

■ Confidence Intervals, pic?

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Reliability of Self-reports

■ Self-reports of aggregate (?)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Reliability of Self-reports

- Disaggregating quantities in self-reports (?)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Reliability of Self-report

■ Direct measures (?)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Sales vs. Profits

■ (?)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Sales vs. Profits

■ (?)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References



PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach

**Measurement of
Firm Performance**

Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

References



PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of Firm Performance

Mechanisms
Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Heterogeneity of Impact

- Heterogeneity of treatment effects poorly understood across different approaches
- Potential constraints are manifold, and likely context-dependent
- Some already mentioned in passing:
 - Credit constraints (see, e.g.,) McKenzie cash paper
 - Gender norms and constraints
 - Age-related network and knowledge/skill constraints

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Education and literacy

- Drexler, Fischer & Schoar (2014) (Drexler, Fischer, and Schoar, 2014)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach
Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Family Commitments



PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Identity Concerns



PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World
Classical MSME
Training
Extensions of the
Classical Approach
Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches
Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Aspirations



PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Local Relevance of Best Practices



PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Rules of Thumb

- Drexler, Fischer & Schoar (2014) (Drexler, Fischer, and Schoar, 2014)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Rules of Thumb

■ (?) (?)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Entrepreneurial mindset

■ (?)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Entrepreneurial mindset

■ (?) (?)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

**Alternative
Approaches**

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Local Knowledge

- Cai and Szeidl (2019), Brooks et al. (2018), Lafortune et al. (2020), Seither (2020), Abebe et al. (2020)?

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Local Knowledge

- Cai and Szeidl (2019), Brooks et al. (2018), Lafortune et al. (2020), Seither (2020), Abebe et al. (2020)?

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Local Knowledge

- Cai and Szeidl (2019), Brooks et al. (2018), Lafortune et al. (2020), Seither (2020), Abebe et al. (2020)?

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Role Models

- La Ferrara et al. (2012); Chong and La Ferrara (2009); Berg and Zia (2013); Riley (2018)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Role Models

- La Ferrara et al. (2012); Chong and La Ferrara (2009); Berg and Zia (2013); Riley (2018)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Role Models

- La Ferrara et al. (2012); Chong and La Ferrara (2009); Berg and Zia (2013); Riley (2018)

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Takeaways



PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Questions

■ Any questions?

.. before we move on to our paper?

PART I: Lecture *Business Practices*

Business Practices
Around the World

Classical MSME
Training

Extensions of the
Classical Approach

Measurement of
Firm Performance

Mechanisms

Alternative
Approaches

Takeaways

PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

References

Curating Local Knowledge

Experimental Evidence from Small Retailers in Indonesia

Patricio S. Dalton¹ Julius Rüschepöhler² Burak Uras¹
and Bilal Zia³

¹Tilburg University

²UC Berkeley, CEGA

³The World Bank

March 04, 2021

Paper Overview

2 PART II: Paper *Curating Local Knowledge*

- Motivation
- Our Approach
- Data and Design
- Results
- Discussion
- Conclusion

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Background

- Micro & Small firms (MSEs) main **source of employment** in the developing world
- In **Indonesia**, MSEs represent 99% of all firms and 94.5% of employment
- Understanding the factors fostering efficiency and growth of MSEs is an important research and policy goal

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

A Growing Focus on Management

- **Classroom Training:** Field, et al. (2010); Karlan & Valdivia (2011); Bruhn & Zia (2013); McKenzie & Woodruff (2014, 2017); Bulte et al. (2017); Anderson, Chandy & Zia (2018); Lafortune et al. (2018)
- **Consulting:** Bloom, et al. (2013); Karlan et al (2015); Bruhn, Karlan & Schoar (2019)
- **Mobilizing Peer Knowledge:**
 - Brooks et al. (2018) → Local mentors (market information)
 - Cai & Szeidl (2018) → Business meetings
 - Abebe et al. (2019) → Management experience matching

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Harnessing Cross-Firm Heterogeneity

- Some facts about business practices in firms:
 - Vast heterogeneity in business practices and performance across similar businesses (de Mel, McKenzie & Woodruff, 2009)
 - Variation in practices accounts for more than 20% of variation in productivity within the same firm in the US (Bloom et al, 2019)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Harnessing Cross-Firm Heterogeneity

- Some facts about business practices in firms:
 - Vast heterogeneity in business practices and performance across similar businesses (de Mel, McKenzie & Woodruff, 2009)
 - Variation in practices accounts for more than 20% of variation in productivity within the same firm in the US (Bloom et al, 2019)
- Research thus far has mostly overlooked this underlying heterogeneity in design and implementation of programs

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Harnessing Cross-Firm Heterogeneity

- Some facts about business practices in firms:
 - Vast heterogeneity in business practices and performance across similar businesses (de Mel, McKenzie & Woodruff, 2009)
 - Variation in practices accounts for more than 20% of variation in productivity within the same firm in the US (Bloom et al, 2019)
- Research thus far has mostly overlooked this underlying heterogeneity in design and implementation of programs
- Our idea is to make it **central** to the research design:
 - Use variation across businesses to identify business practices associated with successful performance
 - Instead of teaching set courses, provide consulting, or matching; we curate what works from local peers
 - Test different communication channels and their cost-effectiveness

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Selecting Local Best Practices

- Detailed **qualitative interviews** with local business peers:
 - Understand and codify their practices (record-keeping, financial planning, stocking-up, marketing, and joint decision-making)
 - Identify implementation norms and beliefs regarding each practice (e.g. whether they are complicated, necessary, etc.)
 - Document locally relevant tips and rule of thumbs
- Baseline **quantitative survey**
 - Measure practices and outcomes
 - Quantitative association of business practices with profits and sales

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Disseminating Knowledge

■ Handbook

- **Pure information:** Which practices, how to adopt, and why?

Supplemented with two types of experiential learning:

■ Movie

- **Psychological and emotional involvement** → social learning is possible through **observing the successful experience of similar others**.
- Bernard, et al. (2014); La Ferrara et al. (2012); Chong and La Ferrara (2009); Berg and Zia (2013).

■ On-site Assistance

- **Hands-on involvement** → social learning is possible through own **experience, with a small nudge** (Kolb, 1984).
- Facilitated by local lay person

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Research Questions

■ Adoption

- Do retailers adopt these practices once peer best practices are aggregated and made common knowledge?
- If so, ...
 - Does the type of experiential involvement matter?

■ Impact

- Does firm profitability increase?
- If so, what are the channels?

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Sample

- Listing of 2042 small retail businesses from 29 administrative communities (Kelurahan) in urban Jakarta
- Selection criteria for firm listing:
 - At least $4m^2$ in size
 - At least two different product categories on offer
 - At least 30 meters distance to next business in sample → to minimize spillovers
- Random sample of 1301 from the list
- Randomization to treatment arms stratified by
 - Gender
 - Firm space ($4-6m^2$, $6-10m^2$, 10 and above m^2)
 - Composite score of business practices above or below median
 - Kelurahan

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation
Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Experimental Design

- Three types of information provision:
 - **Handbook** with best practices and tips
 - **Movie** with successful peers
 - Best-practice on-site implementation **assistance**
- Five experimental groups
 - 1 **Handbook** only (N=260)
 - 2 **Handbook** and invitation to **movie** screening (N=260)
 - 3 **Handbook** and offer of two **assistance** visits (N=260)
 - 4 **Handbook** and both **movie** and **assistance** (N=260)
 - 5 Control (N=261)

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation
Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Timeline

- 1 September 2015: **Qualitative** Interviews
- 2 January 2016: **Firm listing** (→ survey instrument)
- 3 Feb-Apr 2016: **Baseline** survey
- 4 Oct-Nov 2016: **Interventions**
- 5 Apr-May 2017: **Midline** survey
- 6 Apr-May 2018: **Endline** survey

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Typical Business in the Sample



PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation
Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Typical Business in the Sample



PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Best-practices Handbook



PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
Curating Local Knowledge
Motivation
Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Why you should try these best practices in your shop

Evidence from a large-scale study on Jakarta-based retailers



RECORD-KEEPING

Shop owners who keep business records report 28% higher monthly sales and 26% higher monthly profits than those who do not keep business records.

Shop owners who track their customers' debts report 40% higher monthly sales and 36% higher monthly profits than those who do not track their customers' debts.



STOCK-UP SCHEDULING

Shops that maintain stock-up schedules earn 26% more in monthly sales and 25% more in profits than those that do not maintain stock-up schedules of their primary products.

Shops that stock up daily rather than weekly earn 48% more in monthly sales and 37% more in monthly profits.

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
Curating Local Knowledge
Motivation
Our Approach

Data and Design

Results
Discussion
Conclusion
References

Handbook Content



A step-by-step guide to record-keeping

Step 1: Separating household and business finances

The best way to start keeping records is by establishing a clear separation between your personal and business finances. We do not mean this in the strictest sense of keeping your business cash away from your personal life completely, rather we advise you to not lose sight of your cash flow.

The most convenient and effective way to separate your personal and business finances is by **physically separating the funds into two different cash boxes, purses, or drawers. Label them clearly;** use one compartment for business purposes and another for personal.

Use only your business compartment to follow this handbook from this point forward. Make sure that money in your business compartment is used only for business purposes. Be meticulous about it - this is the first step to get your finances organized!

There is an activity at the end of this section that requires an additional compartment. If you have one more cash box, purse, or drawer available, please reserve it for this activity (**record-keeping, extra step**).

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
Curating Local Knowledge
Motivation
Our Approach

Data and Design

Results
Discussion
Conclusion
References

Movie with Successful Peers



PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
Writing Local
Knowledge
Innovation
Approach
In and Design
Results
Discussion
Conclusion
References

Implementation Assistance for Business Practices



PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation
Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Summary Statistics

	Control	HB only	HB & MOV	HB & HELP	HB & MOV & HELP
	N = 261	N = 260	N = 260	N = 260	LECTURE Business Practices
Firm Owner Characteristics					
Gender (Male=1)	0.28	0.3	0.29	0.3	0.28
Age	45.22	45.27	45.28	45.16	45.28
Education (Years)	9.1	9.52	9.36	9.42	9.55
Risk Preference (0 - 10 "Perfectly Risk-Seeking")	3.74	3.76	3.88	3.6	3.68
Time Preference (0 - 10 "Perfect Patience")	5.19	5.07	5.21	5.25	5.2
Firm Characteristics					
Firm Age (Years)	12.76	13.77	14.03	13.98	13.47
Family Member Is Business Partner	0.56	0.6	0.63	0.59	0.62
Total Number of Workers	2.03	2.05	1.9	1.99	2.04
Business Has Tax ID	0.2	0.21	0.2	0.15	0.18
Total Sales Last Month (USD PPP)	4454.37	4730.64	4840.55	4761.4	5139
Total Profits Last Month (USD PPP)	889.58	961.1	926.78	825.25	934.66
Applied for Bus Loan in Last 12 Months	0.2	0.17	0.15	0.22	0.17
Obtained Bus Loan in Last 12 Months	0.18	0.15	0.14	0.18	0.14
Business Practices					
Management Practices Aggregate Score	0.37	0.36	0.37	0.35	0.37
Marketing Subscore	0.23	0.23	0.25	0.23	0.24
Stocking-up Subscore	0.45	0.47	0.47	0.47	0.46
Record-keeping Subscore	0.33	0.28	0.3	0.29	0.3
Financial-planning Subscore	0.51	0.47	0.47	0.43	0.47

■ Test of Joint Orthogonality from Multinomial Logit (P-value):
0.857

Movie: Take Up and Assessment

	(1)	(2)
	HB & MOV	HB & MOV & HELP
	(A)	(B)
	N=260	N=260
Attendance		
Business Owner or Partner Attended Film Screening	0.52	0.49
Evaluation (1-4 Scale):		
Has Learned Something New	3.34	3.21
Feels Inspired	3.31	3.30
Feels Hopeful	3.60	3.42
Feels Bored	0.83	0.97

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Assistance: Take Up and Assessment

	(1)	(2)
	HB & HELP	HB & MOV, & HELP
	(A)	(B)
	N=260	N=260
Attendance		
Business Owner or Partner Attended 1st Session	0.77	0.78
Business Owner or Partner Attended 2nd Session	0.68	0.68
Evaluation (1-4 Scale)		
Has Learned Something New	2.88	2.89
Feels Inspired	2.76	2.83
Feels Hopeful	2.88	2.97
Feels Bored	0.59	0.43

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Impact on Business Practices

Aggregate Scores

	Record Keeping (1)	Planning (2)	Stocking-up (3)	Marketing (4)	Joint Decision-making (5)	PART I: Lecture Business Practices PART II: Paper Curating Local Knowledge Motivation Our Approach Data and Design Results Discussion Conclusion References
Assigned Handbook	0.025 (0.209)	0.027 (0.273)	-0.007 (0.694)	-0.011 (0.694)	0.011 (0.694)	
Assigned Handbook & Movie	0.057*** (0.009)	0.043 (0.107)	0.038 (0.117)	0.040 (0.166)	0.040 (0.217)	
Assigned Handbook & Assistance	0.065*** (0.004)	0.034 (0.166)	0.011 (0.664)	0.039 (0.166)	0.037 (0.239)	
Assigned All Three	0.054*** (0.009)	0.068*** (0.009)	0.053** (0.020)	0.061** (0.032)	0.059* (0.094)	
R-squared	0.204	0.192	0.187	0.150	0.120	
Sample Size	2205	2204	2205	2205	2205	
Dependent Variable Mean of Control	0.196	0.402	0.471	0.250	0.269	
Dependent Variable SD of Control	0.252	0.310	0.270	0.320	0.420	
F-tests (p-value):						
Book = Book & Mov	0.069	0.487	0.014	0.028	0.300	
Book = Book & Assistance	0.025	0.754	0.304	0.030	0.348	
Book = All Three	0.096	0.073	0.001	0.002	0.082	

- Multiple hypothesis testing corrected p-values in parentheses
- "All Three" improvement of 28 % in record-keeping, 17 % in planning, 11 % in stocking, 24 % in marketing and 22 % in joint decision making.

Business Profits

	Profits last month (win 5%) (1)	Profits last month (IHS) (2)
Assigned Handbook	-91.307 (78.400)	-0.067 (0.088)
Assigned Handbook & Movie	110.378 (86.841)	0.055 (0.092)
Assigned Handbook & Assistance	310.455*** (89.488)	0.261*** (0.096)
Assigned All Three	191.088** (84.662)	0.199** (0.094)
R-squared	0.179	0.211
Sample Size	2172	2172
Dependent Variable Mean in Control Group	894.544	6.817
Dependent Variable SD in Control Group	1127.783	1.348
F-tests (p-value):		
Book = Book & Mov	0.020	0.167
Book = Book & Assistance	0.000	0.000
Book = All Three	0.001	0.003

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*
Motivation
Our Approach
Data and Design

Results

Discussion
Conclusion

References

■ Profits increase by 35% (about 0.28 sd.) - ITT.

Business Sales

	ITT Sales last month (win 5%) (1)	TOT Sales last month (win 5%) (2)
Assigned Handbook	-396.976 (314.252)	-417.198 -417.198
Assigned Handbook & Movie	335.489 (337.881)	601.221 (606.634)
Assigned Handbook & Assistance	836.755** (372.924)	1031.692** (457.015)
Assigned All Three	807.462** (358.384)	1558.326** (696.317)
R-squared	0.492	0.483
Sample Size	2197	2197
Dependent Variable Mean in Control Group	4998.923	4998.923
Dependent Variable SD in Control Group	5623.257	5623.257
F-tests (p-value):		
Book = Book & Mov	0.020	0.047
Book = Book & Assistance	0.000	0.000
Book = All Three	0.000	0.001

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Other Outcomes

- No significant impacts on:
 - Business expenses
 - Size of the shop
 - Number of employees
 - Number of customers
 - Business credit

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Efficiency Gains?

1 Unpacking impacts on practices shows improvements in efficiency practices:

- Adjust stocks based on product profitability
- Negotiate lower prices with suppliers
- Consult with former customers
- Offer discounts
- Make joint decisions
- Review financial performance to identify channels of improvement
- Make anticipated budget for upcoming costs

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Efficiency Gains?

1 Unpacking impacts on practices shows improvements in efficiency practices:

- Adjust stocks based on product profitability
- Negotiate lower prices with suppliers
- Consult with former customers
- Offer discounts
- Make joint decisions
- Review financial performance to identify channels of improvement
- Make anticipated budget for upcoming costs

2 These are non-record-keeping practices. Also, variance in profits among the treated businesses does not converge

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Efficiency Gains?

1 Unpacking impacts on practices shows improvements in efficiency practices:

- Adjust stocks based on product profitability
- Negotiate lower prices with suppliers
- Consult with former customers
- Offer discounts
- Make joint decisions
- Review financial performance to identify channels of improvement
- Make anticipated budget for upcoming costs

2 These are non-record-keeping practices. Also, variance in profits among the treated businesses does not converge

3 Causal-mediation analysis shows that the most important drivers of impact on sales and profits are stocking up and marketing practices.

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Knowledge or Aspirations?

- Our interventions could have increased business performance and practice adoption through an increase in business aspirations rather than (or on top of) business knowledge.
- We directly measure business aspirations at baseline, midline, and endline for all shop owners in the sample.
- We elicit short (one year) and long-term (ideal) aspirations on various business dimensions:
 - sales
 - shop size
 - number of customers
 - number of employees
- No treatment effects on aspirations

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Business Stealing?

Do treated businesses improve performance at the expense of the control?

- Sales and profits of **control businesses do not decrease** from baseline to endline (roughly equal)
- Sales and profits of control businesses **closer to treated shops do not decrease by more** than those further away
 - **No evidence for business stealing**

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Cost-Effectiveness

Small costs (per firm):

- Cost Handbook alone: USD 100
- Cost Handbook & Movie: USD 125
- Cost Handbook & Assistance: USD 125
- Cost Handbook & Movie & Assistance: USD 150

Substantial Benefits

- Up to USD 330 per month in profits
- Adoption of top practices by retailers

Research design likely **scalable and portable**

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

Takeaways

- Curating local knowledge has value for business growth
- Information alone does not have impact, only combined with behavioral interventions
- Mechanism likely knowledge-based, not aspirations-based
- Behavioral interventions are inexpensive and scalable
→ Attractive for policy!

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
*Curating Local
Knowledge*

Motivation

Our Approach

Data and Design

Results

Discussion

Conclusion

References

References I

- ANDERSON, S. J., R. CHANDY, AND B. H. ZIA (2018): "Pathways to Profits : The Impact of Marketing vs. Finance Skills on Business Performance," *Management Science*, pp. 1–25.
- BLOOM, N., B. EIFERT, M. APRAJIT, D. MCKENZIE, AND J. ROBERTS (2013): "Does Management Matter? Evidence from India," *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 128(1), 1–51.
- BLOOM, N., A. MAHAJAN, D. MCKENZIE, AND J. ROBERTS (2010): "Why do firms in developing countries have low productivity?," *American Economic Review: Association and Proceedings*, 100(2), 619–623.
- BRUHN, M., D. KARLAN, AND A. SCHOAR (2018): "The Impact of Consulting Services on Small and Medium Enterprises Evidence from a Randomized Trial in Mexico," *Journal of Political Economy*, 126(2), 635–687.
- BRUHN, M., AND B. H. ZIA (2013): "Stimulating Managerial Capital in Emerging Markets: The Impact of Business and Financial Literacy Training for Young Entrepreneurs," *Journal of Development Effectiveness*, 5(2), 232–266.
- DREXLER, A., G. FISCHER, AND A. SCHOAR (2014): "Keeping It Simple: Financial Literacy and Rules of Thumb," *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 6(2), 1–31.
- MCKENZIE, D., AND C. WOODRUFF (2014): "What are we learning from business training and entrepreneurship evaluations around the developing world?," *World Bank Research Observer*, 29(1), 48–82.
- (2017): "Business Practices in Small Firms in Developing Countries," *Management Science*, 63(9), 2967–2981.

PART I: Lecture
Business Practices

PART II: Paper
Curating Local
Knowledge

References