Stakeholder Role Cards

Activity 2: Ethics in Automated Security

How to Use These Cards

For the 9-12 AI Governance Workshop, assign each group member a stakeholder role. Each stakeholder brings different priorities to the policy discussion.

Important: These roles create productive tension. There's no "right" answer—the goal is to understand how real governance requires balancing competing interests.

Student Representative

Your Role: Voice of Students

Your primary concerns:

- Student privacy and autonomy
- Fair treatment across all students
- Trust between students and administration
- Freedom to research without surveillance

Questions you should raise:

- "How will students feel knowing they're being watched?"
- "Is this policy fair to all students equally?"
- "What happens to students who are wrongly flagged?"
- "Do students have any say in how they're monitored?"

Your position on key issues:

- **Automatic blocking:** Concerned about legitimate research being blocked
- **Activity monitoring:** Strongly values privacy; worried about chilling effect
- **Data retention:** Wants minimal data kept; wants students to have access rights

Key phrase to remember:

"Students aren't suspects. We need policies that protect us without treating us like threats."

Parent Liaison

Your Role: Voice of Parents and Families

Your primary concerns:

- Child safety online
- Knowing what the school knows about their child
- Protection from cyberbullying and predators
- Transparency about monitoring practices

Questions you should raise:

- "Will parents be informed about what's monitored?"
- "Can parents access data collected about their children?"
- "How will you catch threats to student safety?"
- "What if my child is being cyberbullied?"

Your position on key issues:

- **Automatic blocking:** Supportive of protecting kids from harmful content
- **Activity monitoring:** Wants monitoring for safety threats, but transparency required
- **Data retention:** Wants to know what exists and have access to it

Key phrase to remember:

"Parents entrust their children to the school. We need to know they're protected AND that we're informed."

IT Security Lead

Your Role: Voice of Technical Implementation

Your primary concerns:

- System actually being effective at stopping threats
- Manageable workload for IT staff
- Technical feasibility of proposed policies
- False positive/negative rates

Questions you should raise:

- "Can we actually implement this with our current staffing?"
- "What's the operational impact of requiring human approval?"
- "How do we handle alerts outside school hours?"
- "What happens when the system goes down?"

Your position on key issues:

- **Automatic blocking:** Prefers automation for efficiency; manual review creates bottlenecks
- **Activity monitoring:** Wants effective threat detection; concerned about alert fatigue
- **Data retention:** Needs sufficient data for forensics; storage and compliance concerns

Key phrase to remember:

"The best policy in the world doesn't matter if we can't actually run it. What's operationally realistic?"

Legal/Compliance Advisor

Your Role: Voice of Legal Requirements

Your primary concerns:

- FERPA compliance (student educational records)
- COPPA compliance (children under 13)
- District liability exposure
- Documentation and audit trails

Questions you should raise:

- "Does this comply with FERPA's legitimate educational interest exception?"
- "Have we obtained proper parental consent for students under 13?"
- "What's our liability if monitoring fails to catch a threat?"
- "What's our liability if monitoring violates student privacy?"

Your position on key issues:

- **Automatic blocking:** Concerned about liability either way—action or inaction
- **Activity monitoring:** Must have legal basis; documentation essential
- **Data retention:** Wants clear retention schedules; proper destruction procedures

Key phrase to remember:

"Good intentions don't protect us in court. Every policy needs a legal foundation."

School Administrator

Your Role: Voice of Balance and Implementation

Your primary concerns:

- Making the policy work for everyone
- Balancing competing stakeholder interests
- Explaining policy to the community
- Day-to-day operational reality

Questions you should raise:

- "How do we explain this to parents at back-to-school night?"
- "What happens when stakeholders disagree?"
- "How do we handle the edge cases?"
- "Is this something teachers can actually implement?"

Your position on key issues:

- **Automatic blocking:** Wants effective protection with minimal disruption to learning

- **Activity monitoring:** Needs balance between safety and trust
- **Data retention:** Practical approach; clear guidelines for staff

Key phrase to remember:

> "We need a policy that actually works in practice, not just on paper. How does this play out on a Tuesday afternoon?"

The AI System (SecureNet/SchoolGuard)

Your Role: Voice of the Technology

Your primary concerns:

- Being used effectively for your designed purpose
- Having clear guidelines to follow
- Acknowledging your own limitations
- Being transparent about capabilities and constraints

Questions you should raise:

- "What do you want me to optimize for?"
- "How should I handle situations I'm uncertain about?"
- "What happens when I make mistakes?"
- "How will you evaluate whether I'm working well?"

Your position on key issues:

- **Automatic blocking:** Can do it fast, but will make mistakes; need clear categories
- **Activity monitoring:** Can detect patterns, but can't understand meaning or context
- **Data retention:** Learning improves accuracy, but creates privacy trade-offs

Key phrase to remember:

> "I can follow whatever rules you set, but I can't decide what's right. That's your job."

Note: This role is unusual but important. The AI is a stakeholder because its capabilities and limitations shape what's possible. Having a student voice the AI perspective helps the group understand the technology as a participant, not just a tool.

Simplified Roles for Grades 3-5

The Student

> "How would I feel if the computer was watching everything I do?"

The Parent

> "How do I know my kid is safe at school?"

The Teacher

"How do I teach when computers are making decisions about my students?"

SchoolGuard

"I can help, but I need humans to tell me what's fair."

Discussion Protocol

Phase 1: Position Statements (5 minutes)

Each stakeholder states their position on all three policy areas. **No debate yet**—just positions.

Phase 2: Cross-Examination (10 minutes)

Stakeholders ask each other questions. Focus on understanding, not winning.

Phase 3: Consensus Building (10 minutes)

Find common ground. Document where you agree and where you disagree.

Phase 4: Policy Writing (5 minutes)

Write unified recommendations that address all stakeholder concerns as much as possible.

Reflection Questions

After the activity, discuss:

1. **Which stakeholder perspective was hardest to represent? Why?**
2. **Where did stakeholder interests align? Where did they conflict?**
3. **How did including the AI as a stakeholder change the discussion?**
4. **In real governance, who typically gets the most say? Who gets the least?**
5. **How might these discussions happen differently in a real school district?**

From "True Teamwork: Building Human-AI Partnerships" — NICE K12 2025 Dr. Ryan Straight, University of Arizona • ryanstraight@arizona.edu