

Comments on Fu & Green, Clark & Estes

Ryan T. Moore

American University

2025-04-03

Fu & Green: *Latent Outcomes*

- Connections to many methods! (SEM, SUR, indices, stacked regression, GMM, MLE, GLS)

Fu & Green: *Latent Outcomes*

- ▶ Connections to many methods! (SEM, SUR, indices, stacked regression, GMM, MLE, GLS)
- ▶ Like “keeping interpretable scaling units”, λ_j .
Return to this in application. What's Y_1 ?
Does choice affect interpretation? (No, ATE is on η ?)

Fu & Green: *Latent Outcomes*

- ▶ Connections to many methods! (SEM, SUR, indices, stacked regression, GMM, MLE, GLS)
- ▶ Like “keeping interpretable scaling units”, λ_j .
Return to this in application. What's Y_1 ?
Does choice affect interpretation? (No, ATE is on η ?)
- ▶ Key: inverse-variance weighting ω_j

Fu & Green: *Latent Outcomes*

- ▶ Connections to many methods! (SEM, SUR, indices, stacked regression, GMM, MLE, GLS)
- ▶ Like “keeping interpretable scaling units”, λ_j .
Return to this in application. What's Y_1 ?
Does choice affect interpretation? (No, ATE is on η ?)
- ▶ Key: inverse-variance weighting ω_j
- ▶ Practical trade-off/advice: more measures v. more observations (apply to eligibility?)

Fu & Green: *Latent Outcomes*

- ▶ Connections to many methods! (SEM, SUR, indices, stacked regression, GMM, MLE, GLS)
- ▶ Like “keeping interpretable scaling units”, λ_j .
Return to this in application. What’s Y_1 ?
Does choice affect interpretation? (No, ATE is on η ?)
- ▶ Key: inverse-variance weighting ω_j
- ▶ Practical trade-off/advice: more measures v. more observations (apply to eligibility?)
- ▶ Need uncorrelated ϵ_j measurement errors in Y_j , but, “consistent under-reporters” or “over-centrists”?

Fu & Green: *Latent Outcomes*

- ▶ Connections to many methods! (SEM, SUR, indices, stacked regression, GMM, MLE, GLS)
- ▶ Like “keeping interpretable scaling units”, λ_j .
Return to this in application. What’s Y_1 ?
Does choice affect interpretation? (No, ATE is on η ?)
- ▶ Key: inverse-variance weighting ω_j
- ▶ Practical trade-off/advice: more measures v. more observations (apply to eligibility?)
- ▶ Need uncorrelated ϵ_j measurement errors in Y_j , but, “consistent under-reporters” or “over-centrists”?
- ▶ Need fundamental noise $\mathbb{E}(\zeta_i) = 0$?

Fu & Green: *Latent Outcomes*

- ▶ Connections to many methods! (SEM, SUR, indices, stacked regression, GMM, MLE, GLS)
- ▶ Like “keeping interpretable scaling units”, λ_j .
Return to this in application. What’s Y_1 ?
Does choice affect interpretation? (No, ATE is on η ?)
- ▶ Key: inverse-variance weighting ω_j
- ▶ Practical trade-off/advice: more measures v. more observations (apply to eligibility?)
- ▶ Need uncorrelated ϵ_j measurement errors in Y_j , but, “consistent under-reporters” or “over-centrists”?
- ▶ Need fundamental noise $\mathbb{E}(\zeta_i) = 0$?
- ▶ Practical concern (?): RI with SEM

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

Connections to “long treatment histories”:

- ▶ Dynamic treatment regimes
(Blackwell 2013)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

Connections to “long treatment histories”:

- ▶ Dynamic treatment regimes
(Blackwell 2013)
- ▶ Synthetic controls lit (Like distance metric idea, p. 2?)
(Abadie and Gardeazabal 2003; Abadie, Diamond, and Hainmueller 2010)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

Connections to “long treatment histories”:

- ▶ Dynamic treatment regimes
(Blackwell 2013)
- ▶ Synthetic controls lit (Like distance metric idea, p. 2?)
(Abadie and Gardeazabal 2003; Abadie, Diamond, and Hainmueller 2010)
- ▶ Forecasting
(Giroi and King 2008)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

Connections to “long treatment histories”:

- ▶ Dynamic treatment regimes
(Blackwell 2013)
- ▶ Synthetic controls lit (Like distance metric idea, p. 2?)
(Abadie and Gardeazabal 2003; Abadie, Diamond, and Hainmueller 2010)
- ▶ Forecasting
(Giroi and King 2008)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

Connections to “long treatment histories”:

- ▶ Dynamic treatment regimes
(Blackwell 2013)
- ▶ Synthetic controls lit (Like distance metric idea, p. 2?)
(Abadie and Gardeazabal 2003; Abadie, Diamond, and Hainmueller 2010)
- ▶ Forecasting
(Giroi and King 2008)

Connection to “sparse potential outcomes”:

- ▶ Interference
(Rosenbaum 2007)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

► $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$

▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$

▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$

▶ Why would $\max_{t \in 1,2,3} (Y_{2,t} - Y_{1,t})$ bound $Y_{2,5} - Y_{1,5}$?

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

- ▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$
- ▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$
- ▶ Why would $\max_{t \in 1,2,3} (Y_{2,t} - Y_{1,t})$ bound $Y_{2,5} - Y_{1,5}$?
- ▶ (In fact, *backwards* from synthetic control RI!)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

- ▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$
- ▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$
- ▶ Why would $\max_{t \in 1,2,3} (Y_{2,t} - Y_{1,t})$ bound $Y_{2,5} - Y_{1,5}$?
- ▶ (In fact, *backwards* from synthetic control RI!)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

- ▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$
- ▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$
- ▶ Why would $\max_{t \in 1,2,3} (Y_{2,t} - Y_{1,t})$ bound $Y_{2,5} - Y_{1,5}$?
- ▶ (In fact, *backwards* from synthetic control RI!)

Critical: choice of C

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

- ▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$
- ▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$
- ▶ Why would $\max_{t \in 1,2,3} (Y_{2,t} - Y_{1,t})$ bound $Y_{2,5} - Y_{1,5}$?
- ▶ (In fact, *backwards* from synthetic control RI!)

Critical: choice of C

- ▶ Constant? (What value?)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

- ▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$
- ▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$
- ▶ Why would $\max_{t \in 1,2,3} (Y_{2,t} - Y_{1,t})$ bound $Y_{2,5} - Y_{1,5}$?
- ▶ (In fact, *backwards* from synthetic control RI!)

Critical: choice of C

- ▶ Constant? (What value?)
- ▶ Time-varying? (What function?)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

- ▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$
- ▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$
- ▶ Why would $\max_{t \in 1,2,3} (Y_{2,t} - Y_{1,t})$ bound $Y_{2,5} - Y_{1,5}$?
- ▶ (In fact, *backwards* from synthetic control RI!)

Critical: choice of C

- ▶ Constant? (What value?)
- ▶ Time-varying? (What function?)
- ▶ Difference-or-deviation (Shape matching)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

- ▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$
- ▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$
- ▶ Why would $\max_{t \in 1,2,3} (Y_{2,t} - Y_{1,t})$ bound $Y_{2,5} - Y_{1,5}$?
- ▶ (In fact, *backwards* from synthetic control RI!)

Critical: choice of C

- ▶ Constant? (What value?)
- ▶ Time-varying? (What function?)
- ▶ Difference-or-deviation (Shape matching)

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

- ▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$
- ▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$
- ▶ Why would $\max_{t \in 1,2,3} (Y_{2,t} - Y_{1,t})$ bound $Y_{2,5} - Y_{1,5}$?
- ▶ (In fact, *backwards* from synthetic control RI!)

Critical: choice of C

- ▶ Constant? (What value?)
- ▶ Time-varying? (What function?)
- ▶ Difference-or-deviation (Shape matching)

Substantive motivation for choice?

Clark & Estes: *Counterfactual Complexity*

When would “max pre-divergence deviation” fail to bound?

- ▶ $T_{1,1-5} = \text{CCCCC}$
- ▶ $T_{2,1-5} = \text{CCCTT}$
- ▶ Why would $\max_{t \in 1,2,3} (Y_{2,t} - Y_{1,t})$ bound $Y_{2,5} - Y_{1,5}$?
- ▶ (In fact, *backwards* from synthetic control RI!)

Critical: choice of C

- ▶ Constant? (What value?)
- ▶ Time-varying? (What function?)
- ▶ Difference-or-deviation (Shape matching)

Substantive motivation for choice?

(Path figures helpful here!)

References I

- Abadie, Alberto, Alexis Diamond, and Jens Hainmueller. 2010. "Synthetic Control Methods for Comparative Case Studies: Estimating the Effects of California's Tobacco Control Program." *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 105 (490): 493–505.
- Abadie, Alberto, and Javier Gardeazabal. 2003. "The Economic Costs of Conflict: A Case Study of the Basque Country." *The American Economic Review* 93 (1): 113–32.
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/3132164>.
- Blackwell, Matthew. 2013. "A Framework for Dynamic Causal Inference in Political Science." *American Journal of Political Science* 57 (2): 504–20.
- Giroi, Federico, and Gary King. 2008. *Demographic Forecasting*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Rosenbaum, Paul R. 2007. "Interference Between Units in Randomized Experiments." *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 102 (477): 191–200.