

Perfect Secrecy

CS 5158/6058 Data Security and Privacy

Spring 2018

Instructor: Boyang Wang

Perfect Secrecy

- Observing ciphertext c has no effect on an adversary's knowledge regarding message m

Theorem An encryption scheme $(\text{KeyGen}, \text{Enc}, \text{Dec})$ with message space \mathcal{M} is **perfectly secret** if for every probability distribution over \mathcal{M} , every message $m \in \mathcal{M}$, and every ciphertext $c \in \mathcal{C}$:

$$\Pr[M = m | C = c] = \Pr[M = m]$$

Perfect Secrecy

- The distribution of the ciphertext does not depend on distribution of the plaintext

Lemma An encryption scheme $(\text{KeyGen}, \text{Enc}, \text{Dec})$ with message space \mathcal{M} is **perfectly secret** if for every $m, m' \in \mathcal{M}$ and every $c \in \mathcal{C}$

$$\Pr[\text{Enc}_K(m) = c] = \Pr[\text{Enc}_K(m') = c]$$

where the probabilities are over choice of K and any randomness of Enc .

Security Game

- Ciphertexts of m_0, m_1 are indistinguishable.

Given $\Pi = (\text{KeyGen}, \text{Enc}, \text{Dec})$, **security game** $\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \Pi}^{\text{eav}}$:

1. Adversary \mathcal{A} outputs $m_0, m_1 \in \mathcal{M}$ with $|m_0| = |m_1|$
2. Challenger flips a (fair) coin $b \in \{0, 1\}$, compute $c_b \leftarrow \text{Enc}_k(m_b)$, where $k \leftarrow \text{KeyGen}(1^l)$, and return c_b to \mathcal{A}
3. \mathcal{A} guesses a bit b'
4. Output 1 if $b' = b$, otherwise 0; \mathcal{A} wins if it is 1

Security Game

- Random guess is $1/2$, but cannot do better

Def. Encryption scheme $\Pi = (\text{KeyGen}, \text{Enc}, \text{Dec})$, with message space \mathcal{M} is **perfectly indistinguishable** if for every \mathcal{A} it holds that

$$\Pr[\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \Pi}^{\text{eav}} = 1] = \frac{1}{2}$$

- Adversary does not have any advantage

$$\text{Adv}_{\mathcal{A}, \Pi}^{\text{eav}} = \left| \Pr[\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \Pi}^{\text{eav}} = 1] - \frac{1}{2} \right| = 0$$

Vigenere Cipher

- Vigenere Cipher is not perfectly indistinguishable
 - Example: message $\mathcal{M} = \{\mathbf{aa}, \mathbf{ab}\}$, key is a string of 1 or 2 (key length is uniformly chosen)
1. Adversary \mathcal{A} chooses $m_0 = aa$ and $m_1 = ab$
 2. Challenger flips a coin, obtains b and $c_b \leftarrow \text{Enc}_k(m_b)$
 3. Given $c_b = c_{b1}c_{b2}$, Adversary \mathcal{A} guesses $b' = 0$ if $c_{b1} = c_{b2}$; otherwise $b' = 1$
 4. \mathcal{A} wins iff $b' = b$

Analysis on Vigenere Cipher

- Adversary A wins if $b' = 0 | b = 0$ or $b' = 1 | b = 1$
- Random guess $1/2$, prove A can win greater than $1/2$

$$\begin{aligned} & \Pr[\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \text{VC}}^{\text{eav}} = 1] \\ = & \Pr[b = 0] \cdot \Pr[\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \text{VC}}^{\text{eav}} = 1 | b = 0] \\ & + \Pr[b = 1] \cdot \Pr[\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \text{VC}}^{\text{eav}} = 1 | b = 1] \\ = & \frac{1}{2} \cdot \Pr[b' = 0 | b = 0] + \frac{1}{2} \cdot \Pr[b' = 1 | b = 1] \end{aligned}$$

Analysis on Vigenere Cipher

- $b' = 0 | b = 0$ ($c_b = c_{b1}c_{b2}$, $c_{b1} = c_{b2} | m_0 = aa$) has two cases:
 - Key length is 1 (k_1), any k_1 in $\{0, 1, \dots, 25\}$
 - E.g., $aa + k_1k_1 = \mathbf{xx}$
 - Key length is 2 (k_1k_2), and k_1, k_2 are same
 - E.g., $aa + k_1k_2 = k_1k_1 = \mathbf{xx}$

$$\Pr[b' = 0 | b = 0] = \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{1}{26} \approx 0.52$$

Analysis on Vigenere Cipher

- $b' = 1 | b = 1 (C_b = C_{b1}C_{b2}, C_{b1} \neq C_{b2} | m_1 = ab)$ has two cases:
 - Key length is 1 (k_1), any k_1 in $\{0, 1, \dots, 25\}$
 - E.g., $ab + k_1k_1 = \mathbf{XY}$
 - Key length is 2 (k_1k_2), and k_2 is not k_1-1
 - E.g, $ab + k_1k_2 = k_1(k_1-1) = \mathbf{XX}$
- Practice: $\Pr[b' = 1 | b = 1] = ?$

$$\Pr[b' = 1 | b = 1] = \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2} \cdot \left(1 - \frac{1}{26}\right) \approx 0.98$$

Analysis on Vigenere Cipher

- Put everything together

$$\begin{aligned} & \Pr[\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \text{VC}}^{\text{eav}} = 1] \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \cdot \Pr[b' = 0 | b = 0] + \frac{1}{2} \cdot \Pr[b' = 1 | b = 1] \\ &\approx \frac{1}{2} \cdot 0.52 + \frac{1}{2} \cdot 0.98 \\ &= 0.75 > \frac{1}{2} \end{aligned}$$

Analysis on Vigenere Cipher

- Practice: message $\mathcal{M} = \{\text{aaa}, \text{aab}\}$, key is a string of 1, 2 or 3 (uniformly chosen)
- Complete the steps for adversary \mathcal{A} in the game
 1. Adversary \mathcal{A} chooses ????
 2. Challenger flips a coin, obtains b and ????
 3. Given $c_b = c_{b1}c_{b2}c_{b3}$, Adversary \mathcal{A} guesses $b' = 0$ if $c_{b2} = c_{b3}$; otherwise $b' = 1$
 4. \mathcal{A} wins iff ???

Analysis on Vigenere Cipher

- Practice: message $\mathcal{M} = \{aaa, aab\}$, key is a string of 1, 2 or 3 (uniformly chosen)
- Complete the steps for adversary \mathcal{A} in the game
 1. Adversary \mathcal{A} chooses $m_0 = aaa$ and $m_1 = aab$
 2. Challenger flips a coin, obtains b and $c_b \leftarrow \text{Enc}_k(m_b)$
 3. Given $c_b = c_{b1}c_{b2}c_{b3}$, Adversary \mathcal{A} guesses $b' = 0$ if $c_{b2} = c_{b3}$; otherwise $b' = 1$
 4. \mathcal{A} wins iff $b' = b$

Analysis on Vigenere Cipher

- Choose $m_0 = \text{aaa}$, $m_1 = \text{aab}$
- Given $c_b = c_{b1}c_{b2}c_{b3}$, guess $b' = 0$ if $c_{b2} = c_{b3}$
- Adversary A wins if $b' = 0|b = 0$ or $b' = 1|b = 1$
- Practice: Prove A can win greater than $1/2$

$$\begin{aligned} & \Pr[\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \text{VC}}^{\text{eav}} = 1] \\ &= \Pr[b = 0] \cdot \Pr[\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \text{VC}}^{\text{eav}} = 1 | b = 0] \\ & \quad + \Pr[b = 1] \cdot \Pr[\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \text{VC}}^{\text{eav}} = 1 | b = 1] \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \cdot \Pr[b' = 0 | b = 0] + \frac{1}{2} \cdot \Pr[b' = 1 | b = 1] \end{aligned}$$

Analysis on Vigenere Cipher

- $b' = 0 | b = 0$ ($c_b = c_{b1}c_{b2}c_{b3}$, $c_{b2} = c_{b3} | m_0 = \text{aaa}$) has 3 cases:
 - Key length is 1 (k_1)
 - E.g., $\text{aaa} + k_1k_1k_1 = \mathbf{xxx}$
 - Key length is 2 (k_1k_2), and k_1, k_2 are same
 - E.g., $\text{aaa} + k_1k_2k_1 = k_1k_1k_1 = \mathbf{xxx}$
 - Key length is 3 ($k_1k_2k_3$), and k_2, k_3 are same
 - E.g., $\text{aaa} + k_1k_2k_3 = k_1k_2k_2 = \mathbf{\#xx}$

$$\Pr[b' = 0 | b = 0] = \frac{1}{3} + \frac{1}{3} \cdot \frac{1}{26} + \frac{1}{3} \cdot \frac{1}{26} \approx 0.359$$

Analysis on Vigenere Cipher

- $b' = 1 | b = 1$ ($C_b = C_{b1}C_{b2}C_{b3}$, $C_{b2} \neq C_{b3} | m_1 = \text{aab}$) has 3 cases:
 - Key length is 1 (k_1)
 - E.g., $\text{aab} + k_1k_1k_1 = \text{XXY}$
 - Key length is 2 (k_1k_2), and k_2 is not k_1+1
 - E.g., $\text{aab} + k_1k_2k_1 = k_1(k_1+1)k_1 = \text{WXX}$
 - Key length is 3 ($k_1k_2k_3$), and k_3 is not k_2-1
 - E.g., $\text{aab} + k_1k_2k_3 = k_1k_2(k_2-1) = \text{\#XX}$

$$\Pr[b' = 1 | b = 1] = \frac{1}{3} + \frac{1}{3} \cdot \left(1 - \frac{1}{26}\right) + \frac{1}{3} \cdot \left(1 - \frac{1}{26}\right) \approx 0.974$$

Analysis on Vigenere Cipher

- Put everything together

$$\begin{aligned} & \Pr[\text{PrivK}_{\mathcal{A}, \text{VC}}^{\text{eav}} = 1] \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \cdot \Pr[b' = 0 | b = 0] + \frac{1}{2} \cdot \Pr[b' = 1 | b = 1] \\ &\approx \frac{1}{2} \cdot 0.359 + \frac{1}{2} \cdot 0.974 \\ &= 0.667 > \frac{1}{2} \end{aligned}$$

Perfect Secrecy of OTP

Theorem An encryption scheme $(\text{KeyGen}, \text{Enc}, \text{Dec})$ with message space \mathcal{M} is **perfectly secret** if for every probability distribution over \mathcal{M} , every message $m \in \mathcal{M}$, and every ciphertext $c \in \mathcal{C}$:

$$\Pr[M = m|C = c] = \Pr[M = m]$$

Bayes' Theorem

$$\Pr[M = m|C = c] = \frac{\Pr[C = c|M = m] \cdot \Pr[M = m]}{\Pr[C = c]}$$

Perfect Secrecy of OTP

- We need to prove

$$\frac{\Pr[C = c | M = m]}{\Pr[C = c]} = 1$$

- For an arbitrary c in space \mathcal{C} and m in space \mathcal{M}

$$\begin{aligned}\Pr[C = c | M = m] &= \Pr[\text{Enc}_K(m) = c] \\ &= \Pr[m \oplus K = c] \\ &= \Pr[K = m \oplus c] \\ &= 2^{-l} \quad \text{key is uniformly distributed}\end{aligned}$$

Perfect Secrecy of OTP

- Total probability: for any c in space \mathcal{C}

$$\begin{aligned}\Pr[C = c] &= \sum_{m' \in \mathcal{M}} \Pr[C = c \cap M = m'] \\ &= \sum_{m' \in \mathcal{M}} \Pr[C = c | M = m'] \cdot \Pr[M = m'] \\ &= 2^{-l} \cdot \sum_{m' \in \mathcal{M}} \Pr[M = m'] = 2^{-l} \cdot 1 = 2^{-l}\end{aligned}$$

- Finally, we have

$$\Pr[M = m | C = c] = \frac{2^{-l} \cdot \Pr[M = m]}{2^{-l}} = \Pr[M = m]$$

Limitations of OTP

- Key is as long as message
 - Cannot decide message size in advance
 - Why not share the message directly while sharing the key

- Use each key only once

$$\begin{aligned}c \oplus c' &= (m \oplus k) \oplus (m' \oplus k) = m \oplus (k \oplus k) \oplus m' \\&= m \oplus \{0\}^\lambda \oplus m' = m \oplus m'\end{aligned}$$

$$k = m \oplus c$$

OTP is Optimal

- OTP is optimal for perfect secrecy
 - Key size is the smallest we can get
- If perfectly secret, then key space size $|\mathcal{K}|$ must be greater than or equal to message space size $|\mathcal{M}|$
- Prove $|\mathcal{K}| < |\mathcal{M}|$ cannot be perfectly secret
 - Uniformly distribution over message space \mathcal{M}
 - A ciphertext c occurs with non-zero probability

OTP is Optimal

- $\mathcal{M}(c)$: the set of messages that are possible decryption of ciphertext c

$$\mathcal{M}(c) = \{m | m = \text{Dec}_k(c) \text{ for some } k \in \mathcal{K}\}$$

- Decryption algorithm is deterministic, each m in $\mathcal{M}(c)$ should be decrypted by a different key, therefore $|\mathcal{M}(c)| \leq |\mathcal{K}|$

OTP is Optimal

- Learn $|\mathcal{M}(c)| \leq |\mathcal{K}|$, assume $|\mathcal{K}| < |\mathcal{M}|$,
—> $|\mathcal{M}(c)| < |\mathcal{M}|$
—> some m' in \mathcal{M} but not in $\mathcal{M}(c)$
- m' in \mathcal{M} and uniformly distribution over \mathcal{M} :

$$\Pr[M = m'] > 0$$

- m' not in $\mathcal{M}(c)$

$$\Pr[M = m' | C = c] = 0$$

- However, perfect secrecy needs

$$\Pr[M = m' | C = c] = \Pr[M = m']$$

Additional Reading

Chapter 2, *Introduction to Modern Cryptography*, Drs.
J. Katz and Y. Lindell, 2nd edition