

## Inferring the direction of introgression using genomic sequence data

---

**Sent**

26-Jul-2023

**From**

EiC.MBE@gmail.com, EAssist.MBE@gmail.com

**To**

z.yang@ucl.ac.uk

**CC**

EiC.MBE@gmail.com, EAssist.MBE@gmail.com

**Subject**

Editorial Decision to (minor) Revise MBE-23-0129.R1

**Body**

26-Jul-2023

MS: MBE-23-0129.R1

Title: Inferring the direction of introgression using genomic sequence data

Dear Prof. Yang,

The in-depth review of your manuscript by the editors and the peer reviewers is now complete. We are pleased to inform you that your manuscript has been deemed suitable for publication in Molecular Biology and Evolution (MBE). However, its final acceptance depends on the revision of the manuscript that satisfactorily responds to the comments from the Associate Editor and external reviewers (included below).

Please note that all articles accepted for publication will be published as Open Access and subject to payment of an Article Processing Charge (APC). Find out more on our Open Access page here: [https://academic.oup.com/mbe/pages/Open\\_Access](https://academic.oup.com/mbe/pages/Open_Access)

If you are planning to promote your accepted manuscript in the press, please contact the Editorial Office (EAssist.MBE@gmail.com) or Joe Caspermeyer (mbepress@gmail.com) (Phone: (480) 258-8972) as soon as possible so we can coordinate embargo dates and provide any other necessary assistance.

We invite you to revise your manuscript within 30 days and submit it for further consideration. A delayed submission will be treated as a new submission. If you need an extension, please contact Tom Whitehead by e-mail (EAssist.MBE@gmail.com) before the deadline.

You can create a revision by using the URL: \*\*\* PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. \*\*\*

\*\*\*LINK REMOVED\*\*\*

Following is a checklist of needed actions and files.

- [#1] Number and respond to each of the comments of the reviewers and the Editor. You must enter these comments in the Authors' Response section on the website when you submit the revision.
- [#2] Please follow the Author Guidelines at: ([https://academic.oup.com/mbe/pages/General\\_Instructions](https://academic.oup.com/mbe/pages/General_Instructions))  
In the File Upload section of the submission website, please provide the following:
- [#3] Upload a file in DOC/DOCX format, RTF format, or LaTeX format containing the text, tables and figure legends. If you are submitting a LaTeX/Tex file, please include accompanying .tex files (e.g., .bib, .sty, .cls,.bst).
- [#4] Upload files containing high-resolution figures – this does not apply to any supplementary figures. If you have color figures, please confirm which ones are to be published in color in print. If you have color figures that are to be published color online only, please ensure the figure legends do not refer to color. Images are required as high-resolution files (600-1200 dpi for line drawings and 350 dpi for color and half-tone artwork). Most formats are acceptable, including eps, tiff, pdf, jpg, and Powerpoint.
- [#5] Upload a copy of the manuscript in PDF (for “Advance Access”) that contains the complete manuscript, including text, any tables, figure legends, and figures, but excluding any supplementary material.
- [#6] Upload any supplementary information files. There is no limit on supplementary files. All supplementary information, including supplementary tables and supplementary figure legends, must be uploaded separately as "supplementary files" and not placed in the manuscript.  
([https://academic.oup.com/mbe/pages/Supplementary\\_Information](https://academic.oup.com/mbe/pages/Supplementary_Information)).
- [#7] Double-check the format of citations and references to ensure that they meet MBE requirements ([https://academic.oup.com/mbe/pages/General\\_Author\\_Guidelines#References](https://academic.oup.com/mbe/pages/General_Author_Guidelines#References)). Failure to do so will result in a delay in manuscript processing.
- [#8] Double-check the format for revisions. Articles, Letters, Brief Communications, Perspectives, Reviews, and Protocols all have different format requirements.  
Articles must have headings in order: Introduction, Results, Discussion, and Materials and Methods. Results and Discussion may be combined. Subsections are allowed throughout.  
Brief Communications must be in the resources category.  
([https://academic.oup.com/mbe/pages/manuscript\\_types](https://academic.oup.com/mbe/pages/manuscript_types))
- [#9] To ensure brevity, please make use of unlimited supplementary files to keep manuscripts below 20 pages using 1.5 line spacing for the main text (excluding references, figure legends, or tables). If the manuscript is longer, please justify the extent in the response to review.
- [#10] Your original files will be available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.

We look forward to receiving a revised version of the manuscript for further consideration.

Sincerely,

Board of Editors  
Molecular Biology and Evolution

**Associate Editor**

**Editors' Comments to the Author:**

Dear Ziheng.

I think the manuscript is almost ready. Please see some more suggestions from the excellent reviewers.

I am looking forward to seeing your revised version,

Tal Pupko.

**Reviewer: 1**

**Comments to the Author**

I went through the accompanying letter and the re-submission with new material in red. The authors have improved the manuscript substantially and address the great majority of points raised and I see no reason to give it another cycle of improvements. It is also better embedded in existing literature addressing this problem (much of which is written by these authors). The paper is still on the technical side and part of a series of problems, with transfer of genetic material from one entity to another leading to genealogical structure generalising the phylogeny (the ARG is another example). How to assign time-direction is also a problem arising in other context (for instance genomic/sequence evolution), where irreversibility/molecular can be invoked. Some - at least recombination - has an inherent time direction automatically creating a time direction. It would add further to readability of the paper.

**Reviewer: 2**

**Comments to the Author**

Please find my comments in the attached document.

**Attached Files**

[mbe-23-0129-r1-rev-md-anonymized.docx](#)