

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES  
SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

PHILOSOPHY

COURSE UNIT OUTLINE 2015-16

**PHIL30251 Special Author: Wittgenstein**  
**Semester: 1 Credits: 20**

<b>Lecturer(s):</b>	Dr. Sean Crawford
<b>Office:</b>	Arthur Lewis 4.041
<b>Telephone:</b>	0161 275 1756
<b>Email:</b>	<a href="mailto:sean.crawford@manchester.ac.uk">sean.crawford@manchester.ac.uk</a>
<b>Office Hours:</b>	Tuesdays 1-2pm, Thursdays 2-3pm Please email to arrange an appointment outside of these hours.
<b>Tutors:</b>	Tutorials will be taken by Dr. Sean Crawford
<b>Administrator:</b>	Pamela Johnson, UG Office, G.001 Arthur Lewis Building Tel: 0161 275 7129, Email: <a href="mailto:pamela.johnson-2@manchester.ac.uk">pamela.johnson-2@manchester.ac.uk</a>
<b>Lectures:</b>	Mondays 10am – 12 noon - Simon Lecture Room 3 (3.40)
<b>Tutorials:</b>	Mondays and Tuesdays - Allocate yourself to a tutorial group using the Student System - this is compulsory and on a first come, first served basis)
<b>Assessment:</b>	2 hour exam – 60% 2500 word essay – 30% Tutorial Performance – 10%
<b>Reading week</b>	Monday 2nd November - Friday 6th November 2015

**\*\*\*IMPORTANT INFORMATION – PLEASE READ\*\*\***

<b>Pre-requisite(s):</b>	40 PHIL credits at Level 1
<b>Communication:</b>	<i>Students must read their University e-mails regularly, as important information will be communicated in this way.</i>

<b>Examination period:</b>	Monday 18th January – Friday 29th January 2016
<b>Resit exam period:</b>	Monday 22nd August – Friday 2nd September 2016

Please read this course outline through very carefully as it provides essential information needed by all students attending this course

This course guide should be read in conjunction with the [Philosophy Study Guide](#). Copies may be obtained from the Undergraduate Office, G.001 Arthur Lewis Building or from the SoSS intranet at: <http://www.socialsciences.manchester.ac.uk/intranet/ug/handbooks/>

## 2. ABOUT THE COURSE

### Summary

The course examines some of the major themes from Wittgenstein's *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus* (1921) and *Philosophical Investigations* (1953). Topics covered include:

- On the *Tractatus*: facts and things; the picture theory of meaning; the nature of logic and necessity; the distinction between saying and showing.
- On *Philosophical Investigations*: the relation between the *Investigations* and the *Tractatus*; the Augustinian picture of language and ostensive definition; meaning and use; following a rule; the private language argument, and the nature of mind and mental states.

### Aims

The course aims to:

- give students a detailed understanding of some of the issues and themes found in the work of the early and later Wittgenstein;
- enable students to evaluate Wittgenstein's work;
- enable students to appreciate Wittgenstein's relevance to current issues in philosophy;
- enable students to think through the issues for themselves and arrive at well-argued conclusions.

### Learning Outcomes

On successful completion of this course unit, students will be able to demonstrate:

- an incisive critical understanding of some of the crucial parts of Wittgenstein's *Tractatus* and *Investigations*;
- a grasp of the extent, and importance, of Wittgenstein's contribution to contemporary philosophical debates;
- an ability to write concisely, relevantly and analytically, and to construct independent lines of argument, both in an essay and under exam conditions.

## 3. COURSE ORGANISATION

**Lectures:** Mondays 10am – 12 noon - Simon Lecture Room 3 (3.40)

**Tutorials:**

DAY & TIME	LOCATION	TUTOR
Monday 1-2pm	Crawford House, Seminar Room D	Sean Crawford
Monday 2-3pm	Humanities Bridgeford St. Room G35	
Tuesday 10-11am	Humanities Bridgeford St. Room G35	
Tuesday 11am-12	Humanities Bridgeford St. Room G34	
Tuesday 12-1pm	Humanities Bridgeford St. Room G34	

Tutorials are weekly, starting in week 2. Attendance at tutorials is compulsory. It is students' responsibility to ensure that they have been allocated to a tutorial group. Students may not change group without permission.

## Work and attendance

The work and attendance requirements for this course are that you:

- **Attend all tutorials**

If you are absent from a tutorial through illness you should inform your tutor and fill in a Certification of Student Ill Health (available from your department or from the SoSS UG Office; see your degree programme handbook for further details). If you are absent for another reason you should tell your tutor or the Philosophy Administrator, Pamela Johnson as soon as possible – if possible, *before* the tutorial.

- **Prepare adequately for tutorials**

You will be set preparatory work for tutorials; see the study budget below for a guide to roughly how long you should spend on this.

- **Assessed Tutorial Performance**

Your performance in tutorial discussion forms 10% of your assessment for this course unit. It's crucial that you come to the tutorial having done the relevant reading and having completed the set tutorial work, and that you contribute to the tutorial discussion.

- **Complete written work on time**

Failure to complete assessed work by the due date constitutes a violation of the work and attendance requirement.

Violations of work and attendance requirements will be reported to your Programme Director. If you have difficulties (e.g. personal, financial or family problems) that result in persistent failure to meet the work and attendance requirements, you should talk to your Programme Director or Academic Advisor.

### There are three compulsory texts that you should buy:

1. Ludwig Wittgenstein, *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*, trans. B. F. McGuinness and D. F. Pears (London: Routledge, 1961; 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. 1974)
2. Ludwig Wittgenstein, *Philosophical Investigations*, 4<sup>th</sup> ed., trans G. E. M. Anscombe, P. M. S. Hacker, and Joachim Schulte (Wiley-Blackwell, 2009) [1<sup>st</sup> ed., trans. Anscombe (1953); 2<sup>nd</sup> ed., trans Anscombe (1958); 3<sup>rd</sup> ed., trans Anscombe (2001)]
3. William Child, *Wittgenstein* (London: Routledge, 2011)

Here is the web link to Blackwell's reading list web page for this course, from which you can order the books: [http://bookshop.blackwell.co.uk/jsp/readinglists/displaylist.jsp?fm\\_course=30514](http://bookshop.blackwell.co.uk/jsp/readinglists/displaylist.jsp?fm_course=30514)

Please note, too, that Hans-Johann Glock, *A Wittgenstein Dictionary* (Blackwell, 1995) is also very useful, and available online at *Blackwell Reference Online* <http://www.blackwellreference.com/public/>. A special username and password, which can be obtained on the University of Manchester Library's webpages, is necessary to gain access.

**Course materials:** Further materials will be made available on the course's Blackboard site.

Log-in to Blackboard at: <https://login.manchester.ac.uk/cas/login>

## Study budget

The University's Academic Standards Code of Practice specifies that a 20 credit course is expected to require about 200 hours work by students. For this course, you are recommended to break this down approximately as follows:

Lectures	10 x 2 = 20 hours
Tutorials	10 hours
Tutorial preparation	10 x 5 hours = 50 hours
Essay preparation	40 hours
Exam preparation	80 hours

**TOTAL: 200 hours**

### Prompt arrival at classes

Students should note that all lectures and tutorials start **on the hour** and should end at 50 minutes past the hour. Late arrival for tutorials may result in your being marked absent; if you arrive late it is your responsibility to ensure that your tutor has marked you as present.

## 4. ASSESSMENT

### Assessment Criteria

For the assessment criteria for PHIL course units, see the [Philosophy Study Guide](http://www.socialsciences.manchester.ac.uk/intranet/ug/handbooks/) (available online at: <http://www.socialsciences.manchester.ac.uk/intranet/ug/handbooks/> which also provides further guidance concerning the assessment criteria.

### EXAMINATION

One two-hour exam, on Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations* only, will be set at the end of semester one, in which you must answer two questions. This provides 60% of your assessment for the course. You will not be able to reproduce material from your assessed essay in your exam.

Past Exam Papers can be found on the Blackboard site for this course.

### ASSESSED ESSAY

One essay of 2500 words on Wittgenstein's *Tractatus* (titles listed below), which provides 30% of your assessment for this course.

The word limit includes footnotes but **excludes** the bibliography.

Students must state the word count at the end of the essay – failure to do so will result in a deduction of 2 marks.

If an essay goes over the word limit by 10% or more, 5 marks will be deducted.

You are also required to keep an electronic version of your essay in case we would like to double-check your word count.

### Presentation

Essays must be typed in at least 12 point in a readable font, and should be **double spaced**. They should include proper bibliography and references. Include your word count at the end of the essay.

When submitting electronically the title of your essay should be your student ID number.

### Bibliography and Referencing

The lack of a proper bibliography and appropriate reference will potentially greatly affect the mark for the work and may be considered plagiarism, which is a serious offence.

Students should consult the University's statement on plagiarism which can be obtained from the School of Social Sciences student intranet.

There are a number of referencing systems available. One that is both simple and widely used is the Harvard system of referencing. On this system, the bibliography would be set out as follows:

Putnam, Hilary (1975) 'The Meaning of 'Meaning'' in his *Philosophical Papers volume II* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press), pp.105-219.

Quine, W.V.O. (1960) *Word and Object* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: MIT Press).

Ryle, Gilbert (1948) 'It Was to Be' *Mind* 47 pp.23-38.

The system of referencing, then, has this pattern:

Surname, first name, date, title of book, location of publisher, name of publisher.

Or:

Surname, first name, date, title of article, title of journal or collection, journal volume number, page numbers for the beginning and end of the article.

Note that the title of the book or the journal should be italicised (or underlined.) The title of an article should be in quote-marks. (See the examples of Putnam and Ryle above.)

If the bibliography contains more than one item by an author published in the same year, the convention is to write the date followed by a small case letter. For example, (1948a), (1948b), etc.

*Whenever* you make a claim about what a philosopher says or believes – whether in direct or indirect speech – you must back it up with a reference. When giving a reference in your essay, simply write the author's name, followed by the date, followed by the relevant page(s). The convention is to put the reference at the end of a sentence. For example:

Ryle thought that the word 'exists' is ambiguous (Ryle (1949) pp.23-24). Quine argued against Ryle's view (Quine (1960) p.61).

Note that page numbers are given. Not including page references is very poor page referencing. The point of giving page references is to support your claim that Ryle or Quine say what you claim they said. The reader can check for him or herself that these philosophers said what you claimed they said without having to thumb through every page of the relevant books.

For further details please see the referencing guide included in the [Philosophy Study Guide](#).

### Submitting your essay

PHIL30521 Special Author: Wittgenstein uses online submission and marking only.

**You must submit your essay electronically to 'Turnitin' via Blackboard.** Further instructions on this are available on the Blackboard site for the course, see: <https://online.manchester.ac.uk>

**When submitting electronically the title of your essay (i.e. the filename) should be your student ID number, followed by the question number, i.e. xxxxxx Qy.**

### Deadline

The submission date for the assessed essay is **Tuesday 24<sup>th</sup> November 2015**. All essays should be submitted **by 2pm** on the hand-in day.

See the [Philosophy Study Guide](#) for information about the granting of extensions and penalties for unexcused late submission and for overlong essays.

### Penalties for late submission of essays

Essays submitted after 2pm carry the following day's date. The penalties for late submission of essays are as follows: the mark awarded will reduce by 10 marks per day for 5 days (assuming a 0-100 marking scale), after which a mark of zero will be awarded. Students who have a valid reason (*i.e.* mitigating circumstances with the necessary documentation) for not being able to submit their assessed essay on time should collect a mitigating circumstances form from the SoSS Undergraduate Office (Arthur Lewis Building, G.001), which should be completed and returned to G.001.

### Accessing feedback for essays using online marking

Feedback on your assessed essay will be available on Blackboard no later than 15 working days after the essay deadline date (provided the essay is submitted on time).

To access the feedback please log into My Manchester and go to the **Blackboard** site for PHIL30521 Special Author: Wittgenstein. Navigate to the **Submission of Coursework folder** and then click on and follow the instructions under: '**How to download your feedback from Turn it in**'

Please note that all essay marks are provisional until confirmed by the external examiner and the final examinations boards in June.

Students are welcome to discuss their essay with the course convenor during their office hours

### Feedback

The School of Social Sciences (SoSS) is committed to providing timely and appropriate feedback to students on their academic progress and achievement, thereby enabling students to reflect on their progress and plan their academic and skills development effectively. Students are reminded that feedback is necessarily *responsive*: only when a student has done a certain amount of work and approaches us with it at the appropriate fora is it possible for us to feed *back* on the *student's work*. The main forms of feedback on this course are written feedback responses to assessed essays and exam answers.

We also draw your attention to the variety of generic forms of feedback available to you on this as on all SoSS courses. These include: meeting the lecturer/tutor during their office hours; e-mailing questions to the lecturer/tutor; asking questions from the lecturer (before and after lecture); presenting a question on the discussion board on Blackboard; and obtaining feedback from your peers during tutorials.

### Assessed Essay Titles (on the *Tractatus*)

1. What is Wittgenstein's argument for the existence of simple objects? Is it convincing?
2. Expound and critically assess the picture theory of meaning.
3. In the *Tractatus* Wittgenstein never gives an example of an elementary proposition. How serious a problem is this?
4. What is the right response to the so-called "colour exclusion" problem?
5. Is it plausible to maintain that all non-elementary propositions are truth functions of elementary ones?
6. 'My fundamental idea is that the "logical constants" are not representatives' (4.0312). Explain and critically assess Wittgenstein's fundamental idea.
7. Expound and assess Wittgenstein's claim that 'The only necessity that exists is *logical* necessity' (6.37).
8. Explain Wittgenstein's distinction between senselessness (*sinnlos*) and nonsense (*unsinnig*). Is the distinction a cogent one?
9. Interpret and assess Wittgenstein's criticism of Russell's theory of judgment.

10. **Is Wittgenstein's saying/showing distinction defensible?**
11. 'It is clear that ethics cannot be put into words' (6.421)? Why does Wittgenstein think this? Is he right to?
12. Expound and assess Wittgenstein's philosophy of the mystical.
13. **What should we make of Wittgenstein's paradoxical claim at the end of the *Tractatus* that the propositions contained therein are nonsensical (6.54)?**

## 5. COURSE OUTLINE

Week 1 Biographical, Historical and Philosophical Background

Week 2 *Tractatus* I: Logical Atomism

Week 3 *Tractatus* II: The Picture Theory

Week 4 *Tractatus* III: Elementary Propositions, Truth Functions and the Colour Exclusion Problem

Week 5 *Tractatus* IV: Propositions and The Nature of Judgment

Week 6 READING WEEK: ESSAY RESEARCH/WRITING

Week 7 *Tractatus* V: The Limits of Language: Saying vs. Showing & The Paradox of the *Tractatus*

Week 8 *Investigations* I: Critique of the Augustinian Picture & Meaning as Use

Week 9 *Investigations* II: Meaning, Understanding and Mental Processes **[ESSAY DUE]**

Week 10 *Investigations* III: Following a Rule

Week 11 *Investigations* IV: The Private Language Argument

Week 12 *Investigations* V: Criteria and Other Minds

## 6. READING LIST

All reading lists are for guidance only! The texts listed should help you increase your understanding of the topics covered in the course, and help you prepare for the assessed essay and exam. But you are also encouraged to use your own initiative and find relevant articles and books by chasing up interesting footnotes, browsing real and virtual libraries, following your hunches, and so on.

### A. ANALYTICAL PHILOSOPHICAL BACKGROUND: FREGE & RUSSELL

Frege, 'On Sense and Reference'

Frege, 'Thoughts',

Frege, *The Foundations of Arithmetic*

The first two, and selections from the third, are all reprinted in Michael Beaney (ed.) *The Frege Reader*

Russell, *Principles of Mathematics*, ch 4

Russell, 'On Denoting'

Russell, *Introduction to Mathematical Philosophy*, chs 15 & 16

Russell, *The Problems of Philosophy*

Russell, 'The Philosophy of Logical Atomism', *The Monist* (1918)

Russell, 'Logical Atomism' (1924)

Both of the latter are reprinted in Robert C. Marsh (ed.), *Logic & Knowledge* and in David Pears (ed.), *Russell's Logical Atomism*

### B. BOOKS BY WITTGENSTEIN

Here are some of Wittgenstein's most important works in chronological order of composition (all posthumously published except for the *Tractatus*):

The Early Period:

*Notebooks 1914-1916*

*Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*



Here is an online hypertext version of the Pears/McGuinness translation:

<http://www.ucl.ac.uk/~uctyjz/TLPWebPage/FrontPage.htm>.

Here is a hypertext of both translations: [http://tractatus-online.appspot.com/Tractatus\\_en.html](http://tractatus-online.appspot.com/Tractatus_en.html)

Here is an online side-by-side version of both English translations together with the German original: <http://people.umass.edu/~klement/tlp/>

#### The Middle Transitional Period:

*Ludwig Wittgenstein and the Vienna Circle. Conversations Recorded by Friedrich Waismann*  
*Philosophical Remarks*  
*Philosophical Grammar*

#### The Late Period

*The Blue and Brown Books. Preliminary Studies for the Philosophical Investigations*  
*Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*

*Philosophical Investigations*, 4<sup>th</sup> ed., trans G. E. M. Anscombe, P. M. S. Hacker, and Joachim Schulte (Wiley-Blackwell, 2009); 1<sup>st</sup> ed., trans. Anscombe (1953); 2<sup>nd</sup> ed., trans Anscombe (1958); 3<sup>rd</sup> ed., trans Anscombe (2001)

*Zettel*

*On Certainty*

### **C. BOOKS ON WITTGENSTEIN**

#### **Biographies/Intellectual Histories**

N. Malcolm, *Ludwig Wittgenstein: A Memoir with a Biographical Sketch* by George Henrik von Wright

B. McGuinness, *Young Ludwig*

R. Monk, *Wittgenstein. The Duty of Genius*

K. T. Fann (ed.) *Ludwig Wittgenstein: The Man and his Philosophy* (Hassocks: Harvester, 1978)

Edward Kanterian, *Ludwig Wittgenstein*

Allan Janik and Stephen Toulman, *Wittgenstein's Vienna* (Chicago, 1973)

#### **Introductory**

R. Monk, *Wittgenstein* (London: Granta, 2005)

D. Pears, *Wittgenstein* (London: Fontana, 1971)

A. J. Ayer, *Ludwig Wittgenstein* (Pelican, 1985)

P.M.S. Hacker, 'Ludwig Wittgenstein (1889–1951)', in Martinich and Sosa (eds.) *Blackwell Companion to Analytic Philosophy* (2001)

#### **General**

Kuusela & M. McGinn (eds.) *The Oxford Handbook of Wittgenstein* (Oxford, 2012)

I. Block (ed.), *Perspectives on the Philosophy of Wittgenstein* (Oxford: OUP, 1981)

K. T. Fann (ed.) *Ludwig Wittgenstein: The Man and his Philosophy* (Hassocks: Harvester, 1978)

E. D. Klemke (ed.) *Essays on Wittgenstein* (Illinois, 1971).

P.M.S. Hacker, *Insight and Illusion*, 2nd. Edn., (Oxford: Clarendon, 1986)

P.M.S. Hacker, *Wittgenstein's Place in 20<sup>th</sup> Century Analytic Philosophy*, (Blackwell, 1996)

P. M. S. Hacker, *Wittgenstein: Connections and Controversies* (Oxford, 2001)

A. Kenny, *Wittgenstein* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1973; 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Blackwell, 2006)

R. Fogelin, *Wittgenstein* (London: Routledge, 1976; 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. 1987)

Child, Willian. *Wittgenstein* (Routledge, 2011)

Hans-Johan Glock, *A Wittgenstein Dictionary* (Blackwell, 1996) [available online through the library's electronic resources]

George Pitcher, *The Philosophy of Wittgenstein* (Prentice-Hall, 1964)

Norman Malcolm, *Nothing is Hidden* (Blackwell, 1986)

Dale Jacquette, *Wittgenstein's Philosophy in Transition* (Purdue, 1998).

H. Sluga and D. Stern (eds.) *Cambridge Companion to Wittgenstein* (CUP, 1996)

John V. Canfield (ed.) *The Philosophy of Wittgenstein*, 15 Vols. (New York: Garland, 1986)

Cora Diamond, *The Realistic Spirit. Wittgenstein, Philosophy and the Mind* (MIT Press, 1991)

Alice Crary and Rupert Read (eds.), *The New Wittgenstein* (Routledge, 2000)

Stuart Shanker (ed.) *Ludwig Wittgenstein: Critical Assessments*, 4 Vols. (London: Croom Helm, 1986)



### **Tractatus**

- E. Stenius, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Oxford: OUP, 1960)  
G. E. M. Anscombe, *An Introduction to Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (London: Hutchinson, 1959)  
M. Black, *A Companion to Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Cambridge: CUP, 1964)  
James Griffin, *Wittgenstein's Logical Atomism* (Oxford, 1964)  
George Pitcher, *The Philosophy of Wittgenstein* (Prentice-Hall, 1964), Part 1  
I. Copi and R. Beard (eds.) *Essays on Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Bristol: Thoemmes, 1966)  
D. Pears, *The False Prison*, Vol. 1 (Oxford: OUP, 1987)  
D. Pears, *Paradox and Platitude in Wittgenstein's Philosophy* (Oxford: OUP, 2006).  
R. Bradley, *The Nature of All Being. A Study of Wittgenstein's Modal Atomism* (Oxford, 1992)  
H-J Glock (ed.) *Wittgenstein: A Critical Reader* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001)  
H. O. Mounce, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1981)  
M. Ostrow, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Cambridge: CUP, 2002)  
A. Nordmann, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction* (Cambridge: CUP, 2005)  
R. White, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus* (London: Continuum, 2006)  
Michael Morris, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Routledge, 2008)  
McGinn, Marie. *Elucidating the Tractatus: Wittgenstein's Early Philosophy of Language and Logic* (Oxford: OUP, 2007)  
Brian McGuinness, *Approaches to Wittgenstein*. Routledge 2002, Part II.  
Denis McManus, *The Enchantment of Words. Wittgenstein's Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*  
Paul Horwich, *Wittgenstein's Metaphilosophy* (Oxford, 2012), ch. 3  
Michael Potter, *Wittgenstein's Notes on Logic* (Oxford, 2009).  
David Stern, *Wittgenstein on Mind and Language*, Part 1  
José L. Zalabardo (ed.) *Wittgenstein's Early Philosophy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012)  
José L. Zalabardo, *Representation and Reality in Wittgenstein's Tractatus* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015)

### **Philosophical Investigations**

- O. R. Jones (ed.) *The Private Language Argument* (London: Macmillan, 1971)  
G. Baker and P.M.S. Hacker, *Skepticism, Rules and Language* (Blackwell, 1984)  
George Pitcher, *The Philosophy of Wittgenstein* (Prentice-Hall, 1964), Part 2  
M. Budd, *Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Psychology* (London: Routledge, 1989)  
Norman Malcolm, *Nothing is Hidden* (Blackwell, 1986)  
S. Kripke, *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1982)  
C. McGinn, *Wittgenstein on Meaning* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1984)  
M. McGinn, *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (London: Routledge, 2013)  
D. Pears, *The False Prison*, Vol. 2 (Oxford: OUP, 1988)  
D. Pears, *Paradox and Platitude in Wittgenstein's Philosophy* (Oxford: OUP, 2006).  
G. Pitcher, ed., *Wittgenstein: The Philosophical Investigations. A Collection of Critical Essays* (New York: Doubleday, 1966)  
David Stern, *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations* (CUP, 2004)  
David Stern, *Wittgenstein on Mind and Language*, Part 2  
Arif Ahmed, *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations* (Continuum, 2010).  
Robert Fogelin, *Taking Wittgenstein at his Word* (Princeton, 2009).  
Jonathan Ellis & Daniel Guevara (eds.) *Wittgenstein and the Philosophy of Mind* (Oxford, 2012)  
Paul Horwich, *Wittgenstein's Metaphilosophy* (Oxford, 2012)

### **D. SURVEY ARTICLES/CHAPTERS**

#### **General**

- Michael Beaney, 'Wittgenstein on Language: From Simple to Samples', in Ernest Lepore and Barry C. Smith (eds.) *The Oxford Handbook of the Philosophy of Language* (OUP, 2006).  
Michael Potter, 'The Birth of Analytic Philosophy', in Dermot Moran (ed.) *The Routledge Companion to Twentieth Century Philosophy* (London: Routledge, 2008)  
H-J Glock, 'The Development of Analytic Philosophy: Wittgenstein and After', in Moran, *op. cit.*

### **Tractatus**

James Bogen, 'Wittgenstein's *Tractatus*', in Stuart Shanker (ed.) *Philosophy of Science, Logic and Mathematics in the Twentieth Century* (London: Routledge, 1996)  
Scott Soames, *Philosophical Analysis in the Twentieth Century, vol. 1: The Dawn of Analysis*, chs 9-11  
Adrian Moore, *The Evolution of Modern Metaphysics* (Cambridge, 2012), ch 9

### **Philosophical Investigations**

P. F. Strawson, 'Critical Notice: *Philosophical Investigations*', *Mind* LXIII (1954): 70-99; repr. in O. R. Jones (ed.) *The Private Language Argument*  
Norman Malcolm, 'Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*' *Philosophical Review* LXIII (1954): 530-59; repr. in Malcolm's *Knowledge and Certainty*  
John V. Canfield, 'Wittgenstein's Later Philosophy', in John V. Canfield (ed.) *Philosophy of Meaning, Knowledge and Value in the Twentieth Century* (London: Routledge, 1997)  
S. Soames, *Philosophical Analysis in the Twentieth Century, vol.2: The Age of Meaning*, chs 1-2  
Adrian Moore, *The Evolution of Modern Metaphysics* (Cambridge, 2012), ch 10

### **E. JOURNALS**

Here are two specialist journals devoted entirely to Wittgenstein:

*Philosophical Investigations* (in the library stacks and online)

*Nordic Wittgenstein Review*: <http://www.nordicwittgensteinreview.com>

Some other generalist journals that include articles on Wittgenstein fairly regularly include:

*The European Journal of Philosophy* (online)

*The Philosophical Review* (mostly older issues from 1950-1970, in the library stacks and online)

*Ratio* (in the library stacks and online)

### **F. WEBSITES**

British Wittgenstein Society: <http://www.editor.net/BWS/index.html>

Austrian Ludwig Wittgenstein Society: <http://www.alws.at>

Nordic Wittgenstein Society: <http://www.nordicwittgensteinsociety.org>

Cambridge Wittgenstein Archive: <http://www.wittgen-cam.ac.uk>

Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen: <http://wab.uib.no>

Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (SEP): <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/wittgenstein/>

SEP article on private language: <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/private-language/>

Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy: <http://www.iep.utm.edu/wittgens/>

Encyclopedia Britannica: <http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/646252/Ludwig-Wittgenstein>

### **G. TOPIC-BY-TOPIC READING LIST**

This gives you details of the sections of the *Tractatus* and/or the *Investigations* relevant to each topic, together with some additional articles and/or book chapters. (I assume that you will be able to select relevant chapters from the books listed in C above.) **For each weekly lecture/tutorial, you should read the specified double-asterisk\*\* selections from either Wittgenstein's *Tractatus* or the *Investigations*, as the case may be, together with the relevant chapter from *Child's Wittgenstein*, and a couple of further pieces of secondary literature (articles and/or chapters from books).** You are encouraged also to read the other specified selections from Wittgenstein's other works.

One final piece of advice: in the *Investigations*, Wittgenstein explained (or tried to explain) why he rejected some of the doctrines of the *Tractatus*. Consequently, it is worthwhile, when examining the *Tractatus*, to look at the relevant pages of the *Investigations*.

### **WEEK 1. HISTORICAL, BIOGRAPHICAL & PHILOSOPHICAL BACKGROUND**

Child, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 1

H. O. Mounce, 'Introduction' (pp. 1-15) to *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction*

Anthony Kenny, *Wittgenstein*, chs 1-3

David Pears, *The False Prison*, Vol.1, Part I, Introduction, chs 1-3

David Stern, *Wittgenstein on Mind and Language*, ch. 1

Bertrand Russell, Introduction to Wittgenstein's *Tractatus*

Frank P. Ramsey, 'Review of "Tractatus"', *Mind* 32, 128 (1923): pp. 465-78; repr. in Copi & Beard Hacker, *Insight & Illusion*, chs. 1 & 2

## WEEK 2. LOGICAL ATOMISM

**\*\*Tractatus 1-2.063**

Child, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 3

Wittgenstein, *Notebooks* 1914-16, pp. 1-25, 45, 60-5, App. 1  
*Investigations* I, §§ 46-64.

H. O. Mounce, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction*, ch. 1

R. Fogelin, *Wittgenstein*, Ch. 1

M. Morris, *Wittgenstein and the Tractatus*, Chs. 1, 2.

M. McGinn, *Elucidating the Tractatus*, Chs. 1, 6.

Irving Copi, 'Objects, Properties and Relations in the "Tractatus"', in Copi and Beard, *op. cit.*

G.E.M. Anscombe, 'Mr. Copi on Objects, Properties and Relations in the Tractatus', in Copi and Beard, *op. cit.*

Peter Hacker, *Insight and Illusion*, Ch. 3

Norman Malcolm, *Nothing is Hidden*, ch1

Anthony Kenny, *Wittgenstein*, Ch. 5.

Ian Proops, 'Wittgenstein's Logical Atomism', *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*,  
<http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/wittgenstein-atomism/>

Proops, 'Logical Atomism in Russell and Wittgenstein', in Kuusela & McGinn (eds.) *Oxford Handbook of Wittgenstein*

Ian Proops, 'Wittgenstein on the Substance of the World', *European Journal of Philosophy* 2004

David Pears, *The False Prison*, vol.1, ch 4

R. Bradley, *The Nature of All Being*, ch1

Scott Soames, *Philosophical Analysis in the Twentieth Century*, vol. 1, ch. 9

## WEEK 3. THE PICTURE THEORY

**\*\*Tractatus 2.1-3.-3.5, 4.01-4.0641, 4.12-4.1212, 4.123-4.124**

Child, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 2

*Notebooks*, *passim*

*Investigations* I, §§89-117.

H. O. Mounce, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction*, ch. 2

G. Picher, *The Philosophy of Wittgenstein*, ch. 4

R. Fogelin, *Wittgenstein*, chs. 2-3

M. Morris, *Wittgenstein and the Tractatus*, Chs. 3, 4.

M. McGinn, *Elucidating the Tractatus*, 4, 5.

Anthony Kenny, *Wittgenstein*, Ch. 4

Brian McGuinness, 'Pictures and Form in Wittgenstein's *Tractatus*', in Copi and Beard, *op. cit.* and repr. in McGuinness, *Approaches to Wittgenstein*

Peter Hacker, *Insight and Illusion*, Ch. 3

Peter Hacker, 'The Rise and Fall of the Picture Theory', in Block (ed.) *Perspectives on the Philosophy of Wittgenstein*

B. McGuinness, 'The So-Called realism of the *Tractatus*', in Block, *op. cit.* and repr. in McGuinness, *Approaches to Wittgenstein*

Hidé Ishiguro, 'The So-Called Picture Theory: Language and the World', in Glock, *Wittgenstein: A Critical Reader*

Thomas Ricketts, 'Pictures, Logic and the Limits of Sense in Wittgenstein's *Tractatus*', in Sluga and Stern (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Wittgenstein*

David Pears, *The False Prison*, vol.1, ch 6

David Pears, *Paradox and Platitude in Wittgenstein's Philosophy*, ch1

Keith Hossack, *The Metaphysics of Knowledge* (Oxford, 2007), pp. 68-71

Paul Horwich, *Wittgenstein's Metaphilosophy*, ch 3, esp pp. 80-84

## WEEK 4. ELEMENTARY PROPOSITIONS, TRUTH FUNCTIONS AND THE COLOUR EXCLUSION PROBLEM

**\*\*Tractatus**, 2.052, 2.061-2.062, 4.1-5.5423, 6-6.3751

Child, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 2 & pp. 75-87

*Notebooks*, pp. 81, 91

L. Wittgenstein, 'Some Remarks on Logical Form', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Supplementary Volume 9* (1929), pp. 162-171; repr. in Copi and Beard, *op. cit.*, pp. 31-37; also on course website.

L. Wittgenstein, *Philosophical Remarks*, pp. 76-84, 110-13, 317

*Ludwig Wittgenstein and the Vienna Circle. Conversations Recorded by Friedrich Waismann*

L. Wittgenstein, *Philosophical Grammar*, pp. 211-12

*Investigations I*, §§39-64

H. O. Mounce, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction*, chs. 3 & 4

R. Fogelin, *Wittgenstein*, chs. 4-5 & 7

Peter Hacker, *Insight and Illusion*, Ch. 2 & pp. 108-12

M. Morris, *Wittgenstein and the Tractatus*, Ch. 5.

M. McGinn, *Elucidating the Tractatus*, Chs. 8-10.

Anthony Kenny, *Wittgenstein*, Chs. 5&6

Edwin B. Allaire, 'Tractatus 6.3751', in Copi and Beard, *op. cit.*

H. Mounce, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus*, Ch. 3

G. E. M. Anscombe, *An Introduction to Wittgenstein's Tractatus*, ch1

Scott Soames, *Philosophical Analysis in the Twentieth Century*, vol. 1, ch. 10

Keith Hossack, *The Metaphysics of Knowledge* (Oxford, 2007), pp. 68-71.

Michael Beaney, 'Wittgenstein on Language: From Simple to Samples', in Ernest Lepore and Barry C. Smith (eds.) *The Oxford Handbook of the Philosophy of Language* (OUP, 2006).

R. Bradley, *The Nature of All Being*, ch3, esp. sect 13 'The Myth of Independence'

Scott Soames, *Philosophical Analysis in the Twentieth Century*, vol. 1, pp. 209-13

Dale Jacquette, *Wittgenstein's Philosophy in Transition*, pp. 172-186.

James Austin, 'Wittgenstein's Solutions to the Colour Exclusion Problem', *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* 41 (1980): 142-149.

The following two works (both published in 2012 and apparently independently of each other) offer essentially the same solution to the colour exclusion problem on W's behalf, a solution that is supposed to preserve the essential features of the *Tractatus*:

Paul Horwich, *Wittgenstein's Metaphilosophy*, p. 88n10.

Sarah Moss, 'Solving the Colour Incompatibility Problem', *Journal of Philosophical Logic* 41 (2012): 841-851.

## WEEK 5. PROPOSITIONS AND THE NATURE OF JUDGMENT

**\*\*Tractatus** 5.54-5.5422

Russell, 'Truth and Falsehood', ch. 12 of *Problems of Philosophy* (1912) [on Blackboard]

Child, *Wittgenstein*, pp. 26-30

'Notes on Logic', Appendix I, *Notebooks* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed, 1979), pp. 94-96, 103, 105, 106.

'Extracts from Wittgenstein's Letters to Russell, 1912-1920', Appendix III, *Notebooks*: Letter dated June 1913 (p. 122) and letter from Cassino 19.8.19 (pp. 130-131)

G.E.M. Anscombe, *An Introduction to Wittgenstein's Tractatus*, ch. 6

David Bostock. 2012. *Russell's Logical Atomism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, ch. 12.

Rosalind Carey, *Russell and Wittgenstein on the Nature of Judgment*. Continuum, 2007.

Sean Crawford. 2014. 'Propositional or Non-Propositional Attitudes?', *Philosophical Studies* 168: 179-210.

Elizabeth Eames, *Bertrand Russell's Dialogue with His Contemporaries* (Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 1989), ch. 7.

Nicholas Griffin, 'Wittgenstein's Criticism of Russell's Theory of Judgment', *Russell* 5 (1986): 132-45.

Peter Hanks. 2007. 'How Wittgenstein Defeated Russell's Multiple Relation Theory of

- Judgment', *Synthese* 154 (1): 121 – 146.
- Michael Jubien. 2001. 'Propositions and the Objects of Thought', *Philosophical Studies* 104 (1): 47-62.
- Anthony Kenny, *Wittgenstein*, pp. 87f
- Anthony Kenny, 'Wittgenstein's Early Philosophy of Mind', in Block (ed.) *Perspectives on the Philosophy of Wittgenstein*
- Norman Malcolm, *Nothing is Hidden*, ch. 4
- H. O. Mounce, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction*, ch. 8
- Christopher Pincock. 2008. 'Russell's Last (And Best) Multiple-Relation Theory of Judgment', *Mind* 117 (465): 107 – 139.
- Michael Potter, *Wittgenstein's Notes on Logic*, chs. 13 & 25.
- Bertrand Russell. 1983. *Theory of Knowledge: The 1913 Manuscript*. Edited by E. R. Eames. London: Allen & Unwin.
- Graham Stevens, 'Russell and the Unity of the Proposition', *Philosophy Compass* 3 (2008): 491-506.
- Peter Sullivan's 'What is Squiggle? Ramsey on Wittgenstein's Theory of Judgement', in H. Lillehammer & D. Mellor (eds.) *Ramsey's Legacy* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2005)

## WEEK 6. READING WEEK

## WEEK 7. THE LIMITS OF LANGUAGE: SAYING VS. SHOWING AND THE PARADOX OF THE TRACTATUS

**\*\*Tractatus**, 1-3.5, 4-4.2, 5.55–6.521, and 6.522-7.  
Child, *Wittgenstein*, pp. 60-74

*Notebooks*, *passim* (but especially the later entries; for ethics, see entries June 1916-Jan 1917)  
L. Wittgenstein, 'Lecture on Ethics', *Philosophical Review* 74 (1965)

- H. O. Mounce, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction*, ch. 11
- M. Morris, *Wittgenstein and the Tractatus*, Chs. 6, 7.
- M. McGinn, *Elucidating the Tractatus*, Chs. 7, 11.
- R. Fogelin, *Wittgenstein*, Ch. 8
- D. Pears, *The False Prison* Vol. 1, Ch. 7
- Erik Stenius, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus*, Ch. 11
- R. Bradley, *The Nature of All Being*, ch4, sec. 3
- Cora Diamond, 'Throwing Away the Ladder', in her *The Realistic Spirit* (MIT, 1991)
- Michael Kremer, 'The Whole Meaning of a Book of Nonsense', in M. Beaney (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Analytic Philosophy* (Oxford, 2013).
- Michael Kremer, 'The Purpose of *Tractarian* Nonsense', *Nous* 35 (2001)
- Michael Morris and Julian Dodd, 'Mysticism and Nonsense in the *Tractatus*', *European Journal of Philosophy* (2008)
- Peter Hacker, 'Was he Trying to Whistle It?', in Crary and Read (eds.), *The New Wittgenstein* (London: Routledge, 2000) [available on P.M.S. Hacker's website  
<http://info.sjc.ox.ac.uk/scr/hacker/RecentPapers.html>]
- Peter Sullivan, 'On Trying to be Resolute: A Response to Kremer on the *Tractatus*', *European Journal of Philosophy* 2002
- Marie McGinn, 'Between Metaphysics and Nonsense: The Role of Elucidation in Wittgenstein's *Tractatus*', *Philosophical Quarterly* 1999
- McGinn, Marie. (2009). 'Wittgenstein and Internal Relations', *European Journal of Philosophy*
- Peter Sullivan, 'What is the *Tractatus* about?', in Max Kölbel & Bernhard Weiss (eds.), *Wittgenstein's Lasting Significance*. Routledge (2004). Available online here:  
[http://www.philosophy.stir.ac.uk/tlp/documents/what\\_is\\_tlp\\_about.pdf](http://www.philosophy.stir.ac.uk/tlp/documents/what_is_tlp_about.pdf)
- A.W. Moore, 'On Saying and Showing', *Philosophy* 1987
- A.W. Moore, *The Infinite*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Routledge 2001), pp. 137ff
- A.W. Moore, *Points of View* (Oxford: OUP, 1997), esp. pp149ff

### On Ethics:

- H. O. Mounce, *Wittgenstein's Tractatus: An Introduction*, ch. 10
- Rush Rees. "Some Developments in Wittgenstein's View of Ethics." *The Philosophical Review* 74, no. 1 (1965): 17-26

A. Phillips Griffiths, 'Wittgenstein, Schopenhauer, and Ethics', Godfrey Vesey (ed.). *Understanding Wittgenstein*. Vol. 7, *Royal Institute of Philosophy Lectures*. London: Macmillan, 1974.  
 Cora Diamond. "Ethics, Imagination and the Method of Wittgenstein's *Tractatus*." Reprinted in Read, Rupert and Alice Crary (eds.). *The New Wittgenstein*. London: Routledge, 2000.  
 Denis McManus, *The Enchantment of Words*, chs 13-14  
 D. Z. Phillips, 'Ethics, Faith and "What Can be Said"', in Glock (ed.) *Wittgenstein. A Critical Reader*.  
 Anne-Marie S. Christensen, 'Wittgenstein and Ethics', in Kuusela & McGinn (eds.) *Oxford Handbook of Wittgenstein*

### **On the Mystical:**

B. McGuinness, 'The Mysticism of the *Tractatus*', *Philosophical Review* 1966  
 Eddy Zemach, 'Wittgenstein's Philosophy of the Mystical', in Copi and Beard (eds.) *Essays on Wittgenstein's Tractatus*  
 Denis McManus, *The Enchantment of Words*, pp. 223-27  
 Michael Morris and Julian Dodd, 'Mysticism and Nonsense in the *Tractatus*', *European Journal of Philosophy* (2008); on the course website

## **WEEK 8. CRITIQUE OF THE AUGUSTINIAN PICTURE & MEANING AS USE**

**\*\*Investigations I, §§1-88**  
 Child, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 4

*The Blue and Brown Books*, pp. 1-19, 77-89

R. Fogelin, *Wittgenstein*, Ch. 9  
 G. Pitcher, *The Philosophy of Wittgenstein*, ch. 11  
 Kenny, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 9, 'Language-Games'  
 Marie McGinn, *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*, Ch. 2  
 Michael Dummett, 'What does the Appeal to Use do for the Theory of Meaning?', **on course Bb website**; originally in A. Margalit (ed.) *Meaning and Use* (Dordrecht: Reidel); repr. in Dummett's *The Seas of Language* (Oxford, 1996) and in A. Moore (ed.) *Meaning and Reference* (Oxford, 1993).  
 Michael Dummett, *Frege. Philosophy of Language*, ch. 10, esp. pp. 359ff  
 G. E. M. Anscombe, 'A Theory of Language?', in Block, *op. cit.*  
 P.F. Strawson, 'Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*', in his *Freedom and Resentment*  
 Rush Rhees, 'Wittgenstein's Builders', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 60 (1959-60): 171-186; repr. in Fann (ed.) *Ludwig Wittgenstein: The Man and his Philosophy*  
 Warren Goldfarb, 'I Want you to Bring me a Slab: Remarks on the Opening Sections of the *Philosophical Investigations*', *Synthese* 56 (1983): 265-82.  
 Norman Malcolm, *Nothing is Hidden*  
 D. Stern, *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations*, ch. 4  
 Paul Horwich, *Wittgenstein's Metaphilosophy*, chs 1, 2 & 4, esp. pp. 107-24  
 Paul Horwich, *Meaning* (Oxford, 1998) [perhaps the most developed and sophisticated "use theory of meaning", inspired by but going far beyond Wittgenstein]  
 William Lycan, *Philosophy of Language*, ch. 6  
 Robert J. Stainton, *Philosophical Perspectives on Language*, ch. 9 (and Part 3 generally)  
 Gert, Heather J. (2002). 'The Standard Meter by Any Name is Still a Meter Long', *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* 65 (1): 50-68.

## **WEEK 9: MEANING, UNDERSTANDING AND MENTAL PROCESSES**

**\*\*Investigations I, §§138-184**  
 Child, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 5, 106-121

*The Blue and Brown Books*, pp. 12-14, 95-98  
 Zettel, §§608-611  
 Wittgenstein, 'Cause and Effect: Intuitive Awareness', *Philosophia* 6 (1976)



Colin McGinn, *Wittgenstein on Meaning*, chs. 1 & 3 [**HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**]  
 M. McGinn, *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*, Ch. 3  
 Anthony Kenny, *Wittgenstein*, ch 8  
 Fogelin, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 10  
 M. Budd, *Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Psychology*, ch 2  
 M. Budd, 'Wittgenstein on Meaning, Interpretation and Rules', *Synthese* 58 (1984)  
 Bede Rundle, 'Meaning and Understanding', in Glock (ed.) *Wittgenstein. A Critical Reader*  
 Warren Goldfarb, 'Wittgenstein on Understanding', in French, Uehling and Wettstein (eds.),  
*Midwest Studies in Philosophy 17: The Wittgenstein Legacy* (1992)  
 John McDowell, 'Are Meaning, Understanding, etc., Definite States?', in A. M. Ahmed (ed.) *Essays on Wittgenstein* (CUP, forthcoming); repr in McDowell's *The Engaged Intellect. Philosophical Essays* (Harvard, 2009) [response to Goldfarb]

## WEEK 10. RULE FOLLOWING

**\*\*Investigations I, §§185-242**  
 Child, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 5, pp. 121-148

*Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*, Part VI  
*The Blue and Brown Books*, pp. 12-14, 95-98

Colin McGinn, *Wittgenstein on Meaning*, chs. 1 & 3 [**HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**]  
 Crispin Wright, 'Critical Notice of Colin McGinn's *Wittgenstein on Meaning*', *Mind* 98 (1989): 289-305; repr. in A. Miller and C. Wright, *Rule-Following and Meaning* (Acumen, 2002).  
 M. McGinn, *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*, Ch. 3.  
 Fogelin, *Wittgenstein*, chs 11 & 12  
 R. Fogelin, *Taking Wittgenstein at his Word*, Ch. 1.  
 M. Budd, *Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Psychology*, ch 2  
 Budd, 'Wittgenstein on Meaning, Interpretation and Rules', *Synthese* 58 (1984)  
 Malcolm, N. (1989) 'Wittgenstein on language and rules', *Philosophy*, 64: 5–28  
 Baker, G.P. & Hacker, P.M.S. (1990), 'Malcolm on language and rules', *Philosophy*, 65: 167–79  
 David Pears, *The False Prison*, Vol. 2, chs 16-18  
 David Pears, *Paradox and Platitude*, ch2  
 Barry Stroud, 'Wittgenstein on Meaning, Understanding and Community', in Stroud's *Meaning, Understanding and Practice* (Oxford: OUP, 2000); originally appeared in R. Haller and J. Brandl (eds.) *Wittgenstein—Towards a Re-evaluation: Proceedings of the Fourteenth International Wittgenstein Symposium* (Vienna 1990)  
 Barry Stroud, 'Mind, Meaning and Practice', in Stroud's *Meaning, Understanding and Practice* (Oxford: OUP, 2000); originally appeared in Sluga and Stern, *op. cit.*  
 Donald Davidson, 'The Second Person', *Midwest Studies in Philosophy* 17 (1992); repr. in Davidson's *Subjective, Intersubjective, Objective*  
 John McDowell, 'Wittgenstein on Following a Rule', *Synthese* 1984; repr. in Moore (ed.), *Meaning and Reference*, and in Miller and Wright (eds.), *Rule-Following and Meaning*; and in McDowell's *Mind, Value and Reality* (Harvard, 1998)  
 John McDowell, 'Meaning and Intentionality in Wittgenstein's Later Philosophy', in P. French, T. Uehling and H. Wettstein (eds.) *Midwest Studies in Philosophy*, 1992, and repr. in his *Mind, Value and Reality*; on course website:  
<https://blackboard.manchester.ac.uk/webct/entryPageIns.dowebct>  
 R. Arrington, 'Following a Rule', in Glock (ed.), *Wittgenstein: A Critical Reader*  
 Canfield, J.V. (1996) 'The community view', *The Philosophical Review*, 105: 469–88  
 D. Stern, *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations*, chs 5 & 6  
 Warren Goldfarb, 'Rule-Following Revisited', in Jonathan Ellis & Daniel Guevara (eds.) *Wittgenstein and the Philosophy of Mind*

## Could Language be Invented by a Robinson Crusoe? A Debate between Ayer & Rees:

A.J. Ayer & Rush Rhees, 'Can There Be a Private Language?', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 28 (1954); both reprinted in Pitcher (ed.), *Wittgenstein: The Philosophical Investigations* and in Jones (ed.) *The Private Language Argument*



### **On Kripke's notorious "skeptical" interpretation (aka "Kripkenstein"):**

- S. Kripke, 'Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language', in Block (ed.) *Perspectives on the Philosophy of Wittgenstein*; **on Bb course website**
- Alexander Miller and Crispin Wright (eds.) *Rule-Following and Meaning* (Acumen, 2002).
- S. Kripke, *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1982)
- Colin McGinn, *Wittgenstein on Meaning*, chs. 2 & 4 [**HIGHLY RECOMMENDED**]
- Crispin Wright, 'Critical Notice of Colin McGinn's *Wittgenstein on Meaning*', *Mind* 98 (1989): 289-305; repr. in A. Miller and C. Wright, *Rule-Following and Meaning* (Acumen, 2002).
- Baker, G. and P. M. S. Hacker 'On Misunderstanding Wittgenstein: Kripke's Private Language Argument', *Synthese* 58.3 (1984): 407-50; repr. in P. M. S. Hacker, *Wittgenstein: Connections and Controversies* (Oxford, 2001); and on course website:
- Baker, G. P. and P. M. S. Hacker, *Skepticism, Rules and Language* (Blackwell, 1984)
- Simon Blackburn, 'The Individual Strikes Back', *Synthese* 1984, and in his *Essays in Quasi Realism*
- Paul Boghossian, 'The Rule Following Considerations', *Mind* 98 (1989)
- Bob Hale, 'Rule-following, Objectivity and Meaning', in Hale and Wright (eds.) *A Companion to the Philosophy of Language* (Blackwell, 1997)
- George Wilson, 'Rule-Following, Meaning, and Normativity', in Ernest Lepore and Barry C. Smith (eds.) *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy of Language*
- Paul Horwich, *Wittgenstein's Metaphilosophy*, ch. 5
- Claudine Verheggen. (2003). 'Wittgenstein's Rule-Following Paradox and the Objectivity of Meaning', *Philosophical Investigations*, 26 (4): 285-310.

### **WEEK 11: THE PRIVATE LANGUAGE ARGUMENT**

**\*\*Investigations I, §§ 243-315**

Child, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 5, esp.149-59

Zettel, §§532-565

Wittgenstein, 'Notes for Lectures on "Private Experience" and "Sense Data"', *Philosophical Review* 77 (3), July 1968; also in L. Wittgenstein, *Philosophical Occasions*, J. Klagge and A. Nordmann (eds.) and O. R. Jones (ed.) *The Private Language Argument*

O. R. Jones (ed.) *The Private Language Argument*

Fogelin, *Wittgenstein*, chs 11 & 12

R. Fogelin, *Taking Wittgenstein at his Word*, Ch. 2

Fogelin, 'The Private Language Argument One More Time', in Jonathan Ellis & Daniel Guevara (eds.) *Wittgenstein and the Philosophy of Mind*

M. McGinn, *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations*, Ch. 4.

Anthony Kenny, *Wittgenstein*, Ch. 10

Stuart Candlish, 'Private Language', *Stanford Encyclopedia Philosophy*:

<http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/private-language/>

P. Hacker, *Insight & Illusion*, ch. 9

Malcolm, N. (1989) 'Wittgenstein on language and rules', *Philosophy*, 64: 5–28

Baker, G.P. & Hacker, P.M.S. (1990), 'Malcolm on language and rules', *Philosophy*, 65: 167–79.

M. Budd, *Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Psychology*, ch 3

Barry Stroud, 'Wittgenstein's "Treatment" of the Quest for a "language which describes my inner experiences and which only I myself can understand"', in Stroud's *Meaning, Understanding and Practice* (Oxford: OUP, 2000); originally appeared in P. Weingartner and H. Czermak (eds.) *Epistemology and Philosophy of Science: Proceedings of the Seventh International Wittgenstein Symposium* (Vienna 1983)

Barry Stroud, 'Private Objects, Physical Objects, and Ostension', in Stroud's *Meaning, Understanding and Practice* (Oxford: OUP, 2000); originally appeared in D. Charles and W. Child (eds.) *Essays on David Pears and Wittgenstein* (Oxford, 2000)

Barry Stroud, 'Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Mind', in G. Fløistad (ed.), *Contemporary Philosophy: A New Survey*, vol. VI, *The Philosophy of Mind*, (Hague, Netherlands 1983), pp. 319-341; reprinted in J. Canfield (ed.) *The Philosophy of Wittgenstein: The Private Language Argument*

David Pears, *The False Prison*, Vol. 2, chs 13-15

David Pears, *Paradox and Platitude*, ch3

- Don Locke, *Myself and Others* (Oxford, 1968), ch. 5
- Crispin Wright, 'Wittgenstein's Later Philosophy of Mind: Sensation, Privacy and Intention', *Mind*, 1989.
- S. Schroeder, 'Private Language and Private Experience', in Glock (ed.) *Wittgenstein. A Critical Reader*.
- Canfield, J.V. (1996) 'The community view', *The Philosophical Review*, 105: 469–88
- D. Stern, *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations*, ch. 7
- Don Locke, *Myself and Others* (1968)
- Stephen Mulhall, *Wittgenstein's Private Language: Grammar, Nonsense and Imagination in Philosophical Investigations*, sections 243-315
- Meredith Williams. (1983). 'Wittgenstein on Representation, Privileged Objects, and Private Languages', *Canadian Journal of Philosophy*, 13 (1): 57-78.
- Claudine Verheggen. (1995). 'Wittgenstein and "Solitary" Languages', *Philosophical Investigations* 18 (4): 329-347.

### ***Early & Historically Famous Philosophical-Exegetical Debates***

#### Could There be a Private Sensation Language? Strawson (Yes) vs. Malcolm (No)

- P.F. Strawson & Norman Malcolm, 'Exposition and Criticism of Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*', in O. R. Jones (ed.) *The Private Language Argument*
- These are excerpts from Strawson's and Malcolm's original reviews (see details under **D** above)

#### Could Language be Invented by a Robinson Crusoe? Ayer (Yes) vs. Rhees (No)

- A.J. Ayer & Rush Rhees Symposium, 'Can There Be a Private Language?', *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 28 (1954); both reprinted in Pitcher (ed.), *Wittgenstein: The Philosophical Investigations* and in Jones (ed.) *The Private Language Argument*

#### Does the PLA Depend on The Verification Principle? Thomson (Yes) vs. Kenny (No)

- Judith Jarvis Thomson, 'Private Languages', *American Philosophical Quarterly* 1 (1964): 20-31; repr. in O. R. Jones (ed.) *The Private Language Argument*
- Anthony Kenny, 'The Verification Principle and the Private Language Argument', in O. R. Jones (ed.) *The Private Language Argument*

### **WEEK 12: CRITERIA AND OTHER MINDS**

**\*\*Investigations I, §§276-414**

Child, *Wittgenstein*, ch. 5, esp. 160-175

- Akeel Bilgrami, 'Other Minds', in Dancy and Sosa (eds.) *A Companion to Epistemology* (Blackwell, 1992), pp. 317-323.
- Marie McGinn, *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (2013), ch 5, esp. pp. 205-14.
- Norman Malcolm, 'Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*' *Philosophical Review* LXIII (1954): 530-59; repr. in Malcolm's *Knowledge and Certainty*
- Norman Malcolm, 'Knowledge of Other Minds', *Journal of Philosophy* 45 (1958); repr. in Malcolm's *Knowledge and Certainty* and in G. Pitcher (ed.) *Wittgenstein*.
- Rogers Albritton, 'On Wittgenstein's use of the term "Criterion"', *Journal of Philosophy* LVI (1959): 845-857; repr. with retraction in Pitcher (ed.) *Wittgenstein*
- John McDowell, 'Criteria, Defeasibility and Knowledge', in *Proceedings of the British Academy* (1982); repr. in McDowell's *Meaning, Knowledge and Reality*
- Edward Witherspoon, 'Wittgenstein on Criteria and the Problem of Other Minds', in Kuusela & McGinn (eds.) *The Oxford Handbook of Wittgenstein* (2012)
- W. Gregory Lycan, 'Noninductive Evidence: Recent Work on Wittgenstein's "Criteria"', *American Philosophical Quarterly*, Vol. 8, No. 2 (Apr., 1971), pp. 109-125.
- P. Hacker, *Insight & Illusion*, ch 11
- S. Kripke, 'Wittgenstein and Other Minds', Postscript to Kripke's *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*, on pp. 114-145.

S. Kripke, *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*, pp. 98-107 (on criteria)  
 M. Budd, *Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Psychology*, chs1 & 5  
 Don Locke, *Myself and Others* (Oxford, 1968)  
 Jerry Fodor and Charles Chihara, 'Operationalism and Ordinary Language', *American Philosophical Quarterly* Vol. 2 No. 4 (1965); repr. in \*G. Pitcher(ed.) *Wittgenstein: The Philosophical Investigations* (New York: Doubleday, 1966) and repr. in Jerry Fodor, *Representations. Philosophical Essays on the Foundations of Cognitive Science*  
 J. W. Cooke, 'Human Beings', in P. Winch (ed.) *Studies in the Philosophy of Wittgenstein* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1969), pp. 117-51.  
 John McDowell, 'Intentionality and Interiority in Wittgenstein', in his *Mind, Value and Reality*  
 Crispin Wright, 'Wittgenstein's Later Philosophy of Mind: Sensation, Privacy and Intention', *Mind* (1989)  
 M. ter Hark, 'The Inner and the Outer', in Glock , *op. cit.*  
 Anita Avramides, *Other Minds* (Routledge, 2001), ch. 7  
 Stanley Cavell, *The Claim of Reason. Wittgenstein, Skepticism, Morality, and Tragedy*. Oxford, 1979, Part One.  
 John V. Canfield, *Wittgenstein. Language and World*. Amherst: The University of Massachusetts Press, 1981), 'Criteria', pp. 31-148.

## 7. SAMPLE EXAM PAPER (for guidance only)

### PHIL30251

Candidates must answer **TWO** questions.

1. What exactly is a "private language"? Could there be such a thing?
2. Should referentialism be rejected?
3. Can the concept of a criterion be used to defeat scepticism about other minds?
4. What is a language-game? How much light does the notion throw on the nature of language?
5. In order for an individual to follow a rule, must that individual be a member of a community of rule followers?
6. Should the meaning of an expression be identified with its use?

**END OF EXAMINATION PAPER**