## Eli\_CoHen

## LAGHIMA TIWARI

Okay, I will now process the provided answer script of Laghina Tiwari (Test Code: 1841) for Vision IAS General Studies Paper 4.

#### ANALYSIS OF THE ANSWER SCRIPT

### Overall Answer Writing Techniques Used by the Topper:

#### Structure:

- **Introduction:** Generally starts with a direct definition or explanation of the core concept in the question. Introductions are crisp and to the point.
- Body: Uses clear headings and sub-headings (often directly from the question's parts). Points are presented in a numbered or bulleted format, making them easy to read and evaluate. Examples (often with "Eg:") are integrated well within the points.
- Conclusion: Often concludes with a forward-looking statement, a relevant quote, or a summary that links back to the core theme, sometimes suggesting a balanced approach or the ideal path.
- **Keywords:** Uses relevant ethical terminology consistently (e.g., self-efficacy, accountability, transparency, integrity, moral prudence, ethical dilemma, digital ethics, etc.).
- **Tone:** The tone is analytical, balanced, and constructive. Even when discussing problems, there's an inclination towards suggesting solutions or improvements.
- Value Orientation: Consistently upholds constitutional values, probity, public service ideals, empathy, and compassion. There's a clear orientation towards ethical governance and citizen-centric administration.
- **Handwriting and Presentation:** Neat and legible handwriting. Good use of underlining for keywords and headings. Sufficient spacing between points.
- **Examples:** Uses a mix of contemporary and historical examples, often briefly stated to illustrate a point without excessive detail.
- Addressing all parts of the question: Systematically addresses each sub-part of the question, often using the question's phrasing for headings.

#### SYLLABUS-WISE EXTRACTION

#### **Ethics and Human Interface**

Essence, determinants and consequences of ethics in human actions Dimensions of ethics Ethics in private and public relationships

- Crisp Definitions/Explanations:
  - Self-efficacy: "Self-efficacy refers to the quality of knowing your strengths and weaknesses and accordingly influencing your actions." (Q1a, Pg 3)

- Determinants of Self-efficacy (implicitly, determinants of ethical actions/values): EII COHEN
  - "Family: Family values like gender equity, respecting elders etc. go in shaping individual." (Q1a, Pg 3)
  - "Education and school. has influence on a person (Eg: Team-work, tolerance mid-day meal)" (Q1a, Pg 3)
  - "Eminent personalities (Eg: Martin Luther King Jr. against racial discrimination)" (Q1a, Pg 3)
  - "Constitutional ideals and law of the land." (Q1a, Pg 3)
  - "Religious values (Eg: Ramayan influences private relationships)" (Q1a, Pg
     4)
- **Ethics:** "Ethics refer to a general set of guidelines and principles that help us differentiate between right and wrong." (Q1b, Pg 5)
- Difference between "right to do" and "what is right to do": "Ethics is knowing the
  difference between what you have the right to do and what is right to do.
  However, sometimes, ethical values are also crucial in differentiating between
  'what is the right thing to do' and 'what can be actually done'." (Q1b, Pg 5)
  - "Right to do is related to power & authority what you have right over."
     (Examiner's note, Pg 5, reinforcing the candidate's point)
- Organizational Values (Public vs. Private): "Certain sets of values guide our behaviour in public and private sectors." (Q3b, Pg 13)
  - Public Sector: "laid down by 2nd ARC and Nolan committee." Values include "Integrity, Leadership, empathy, accountability, transparency, innovative etc."
  - Private Sector: "No official provision family and friends, religion, scriptures like Ramayana & Mahabharata provide values." Values include "love, loyalty, honesty, affection etc."

#### Impactful Real-Life Examples:

- Martin Luther King Jr.: As an eminent personality influencing values (against racial discrimination). (Q1a, Pg 3)
- Armstrong Pame: Example of leadership in civil service (led road construction in Manipur). (Q1a, Pg 4)
- Art. 19 (Freedom of Speech vs. Individual Dignity): Example for "right to do" vs "what is right to do" "while Art. 19 gives former right; giving offensive remarks against women and transgend-ers go against ethics." (Q1b, Pg 5)
- Nazi Germany: Contextual ethics "Though lying is wrong; it can become right when in Nazi Germany done to save Jews." (Q1b, Pg 6)

#### Short Relevant Quotes:

- Aristotle: "knowing oneself is beginning of all wisdom." (Conclusion for selfefficacy, Q1a, Pg 4)
- Plato: "there is no dual morality. Both Personal and public spheres are interlinked." (Conclusion for public vs private values, Q3b, Pg 14)

#### Answer Writing Techniques:

- Q1a (Self-efficacy): Clearly defines, lists determinants with examples, then
  discusses significance for civil servants with examples.
   Eli CoHen
- Q1b (Right to do vs. Right to do): Defines ethics, explains the distinction with concrete examples for different scenarios (freedom of speech, professional dilemmas, contextual ethics, political criticism).
- Q3b (Public vs Private Sector Values): Uses a comparative table-like structure (though not explicitly a table) for differences, then discusses convergence with examples.

## Human Values – lessons from the lives and teachings of great leaders, reformers and administrators

Role of family, society and educational institutions in inculcating values

- Impactful Real-Life Examples/Personalities:
  - Martin Luther King Jr.: (Mentioned above, Q1a, Pg 3)
  - Armstrong Pame: (Mentioned above, Q1a, Pg 4)
  - Shastri: "taking responsibility of rail accident" (Example for Responsibility, Q3b, Pg
     14)
  - Shastri: "didn't use public resources for personal use & he also got only 'charkha' as dowry." (Example for selflessness, Q3b, Pg 14)
  - **Buddha:** "gave the noble 8 fold path to get rid of 'dukha' (miseries)." (Example for contentment leading to happiness, Q6a, Pg 24)
  - o Gandhi: "in his satyagraha techniques" (Honesty upheld by Gandhi, Q6c, Pg 27)
  - Yudhistar: "lied to Drona to kill Aswathama" (Honesty in certain situations can be harmful, Q6c, Pg 28)

#### Crisp Definitions/Explanations:

- Determinants of values: Family, Education/School, Eminent Personalities,
   Constitutional Ideals, Religious values (Q1a, Pgs 3-4)
- Honesty: "A civil servant should be honest about his personal interests, same honesty bedrock of personal relations." (Q3b, Pg 14)
- **Equity:** "Person whose sister and him treated alike will treat female co-workers equally." (Q3b, Pg 14)
- Happiness (Marcus Aurelius quote): "The happiness of your life depends upon the quality of your thoughts." Explained as: "it is your internal thoughts and characteristics that determine what kind of life you lead - happy or sad." (Q6a, Pg 23)
- Honesty (Thomas Jefferson quote): "Honesty is the first chapter in the book of wisdom." Explained as: "a wise man is one that treads the path of honesty in all circumstances." (Q6c, Pg 27)

#### Short Relevant Quotes:

- Gandhi: (implied through Satyagraha and) 'Satya Pammo Dharma' (Truth is the highest virtue) are upheld. (Q6c, Pg 28)
- Unique Case Studies/Ethical Dilemmas (within theory answers):

Q6c (Honesty): "Lying can provide temporary benefits, it can have negative impacts in the long run. Eg: The lying and deception of golden degree in the long run. Eg: The lying run. Eg: The l

## • Thinkers and Philosophies:

Aristotle: (Mentioned above)

Plato: (Mentioned above)

Buddha: (Mentioned above)

Gandhi: (Mentioned above)

Marcus Aurelius: (Quote on happiness, Q6a, Pg 23)

Thomas Jefferson: (Quote on honesty, Q6c, Pg 27)

- Jawaharlal Nehru: "The forces in a capitalist society, if left unchecked, tend to make the rich richer and the poor poorer." (Q6b, Pg 25)
  - Application: Explained in context of unequal distribution of modes of production, leading to economic inequality. Mentions Keynesian tactics as a counter.

## Answer Writing Techniques:

• For quote-based questions (Q6a,b,c), the candidate first explains the meaning of the quote, then provides examples/elaborations from various dimensions (individual, societal, national, international, ethical thinkers). The evaluator's comment on Q6a is "However, the meaning should be explained in terms of public welfare as well, as per the given thinker." This is a good improvement point. For Q5(a), the evaluator notes: "The first part of the answ should have focused on this point / argument in explained manner. Each pant should have been separately explained as per the question." This indicates the importance of distinct parts.

#### Aptitude and Foundational Values for Civil Service

Integrity, impartiality and non-partisanship Objectivity, dedication to public service, empathy, tolerance and compassion towards the weaker sections

#### Crisp Definitions/Explanations:

- Significance of high self-efficacy for a civil servant: (Q1a, Pg 4)
  - "self-awareness and self-regulation avoiding impulsive decisions."
  - "Taking better decisions even under stress."
  - "Working for larger good of public in lines with Gandhi's Talisman."
  - "Leadership."
- Accountability: "Accountability refers to being answerable for your actions and taking ownership." (Q4a, Pg 15)
- Responsibility: "while responsibility refers to taking leadership role in executing a given task at hand." (Q4a, Pg 15)
- **Difference between Accountability and Responsibility:** "Responsibility is closely linked to leadership; while accountability is in general the rule." (Q4a, Pg 15)

• Impactful Real-Life Examples:

Eli\_CoHen

- **Armstrong Pame:** (Leadership, Q1a, Pg 4)
- **Vikram Sarabhai:** "took responsibility of 1st ISRO mission failure, but accountability wed on entire team." (Distinction for responsibility vs accountability, Q4a, Pg 15)
- RTI, Lokpal, citizen charter: Examples of accountability mechanisms. (Q4a, Pg 16)
- **Bengaluru metro citizen charter:** Example of enhancing public participation and trust. (Q4a, Pg 16)
- Transparency International ranking (85th rank among 180 countries): Shows poor state of transparency affecting accountability. (Q4a, Pg 16)
- Thinkers and Philosophies:
  - Gandhi's Talisman: Referenced for working for the larger good of the public. (Q1a, Pg 4)
- References to Judgements and ARC Report:
  - 2nd ARC and Nolan Committee: Mentioned as sources for organizational values in the public sector. (Q3b, Pg 13)

#### Emotional Intelligence (EI)

Concepts, and their utilities and application in administration and governance

(No direct question on El, but aspects like self-awareness, empathy, managing stress are covered under self-efficacy and foundational values).

#### Public/Civil Service Values and Ethics in Public Administration

Status and problems

Ethical concerns and dilemmas in government and private institutions Laws, rules, regulations and conscience as sources of ethical guidance Accountability and ethical governance Strengthening of ethical and moral values in governance

- Crisp Definitions/Explanations:
  - **Ethical Dilemma:** "Ethical dilemma refers to a conflicting situation where you are trapped between two choices one that is in lines with professional rules and the other that upholds personal moral values." (Q2a, Pg 7)
  - Code of Conduct: "The code of conduct for civil services provide for certain basic guidelines that guide behaviour and action of civil servants in public sphere." (Q2b, Pg 9)
  - **Digital Ethics:** "Digital ethics refers to set of rules and regulations that needs to be followed while interacting through digital medium." (Q3a, Pg 11)
- Impactful Real-Life Examples:
  - Dealing with Ethical Dilemma (Rules vs. Moral Prudence):
    - Wrongful order of senior vs. public welfare (corruption in bridge construction). (Q2a, Pg 8)

- Not rejecting PDS benefits for non-availability of documents vs. arranging ad-hoc doc. (Empathy). (Q2a, Pg 8)
   Eli CoHen
- E. Sreedharan: Resisting political pressure (Metro Man). (Q2a, Pg 8)

#### Issues with Code of Conduct:

- "Only provides rules for basic discipline (Eg: Property Transaction)." (Q2b, Pg
   9)
- "No mention of ethical and moral values." (Q2b, Pg 9)
- "Ineffective in controlling corruption, politicisation of bureaucracy (Eg: Pooja Singhal - MGNREGA funds integrity)." (Q2b, Pg 10)

### • Ethical Implications of Digitizing Governance:

- "Infringement of privacy threat of cyber-surveillance (Eg: Criminal Identification (Amendment) Act, 2021 - store data for 75 years)." (Q3a, Pg 11)
- "Racial profiling and discrimination (Eg: Police using facial recognition)."
   (Q3a, Pg 11)
- "Creating new digital divide (Eg: Digitally illiterate cannot gain benefits of government schemes, digilocker)." (Q3a, Pg 12)

## Laws and Rules as Guide on Morality (but not sufficient):

- Constitution as guiding light (Ambedkar's principles of social justice). (Q4b, Pg 17)
- All India Services rule. (Q4b, Pg 17)
- Code of conduct (for public behaviour, property transaction). (Q4b, Pg 17)
- Rules of RTI, e-governance. (Q4b, Pg 17)
- Insufficiency: "Fear of misinterpretation," "Used as an 'end' in itself and not as means to an end (Eg: rules used for procedural delays)," "Misuse of rules in absence of vigilance (Eg: Favoritism in employment)," "Inadequate codification of ethical principles (No provision of code of ethics)," "Obsolete laws having gaps (Eg: Marital rape law already banned in UK)." (Q4b, Pg 18)

#### Diagrams or Flowcharts:

- Ethical Dilemma Diagram (Q2a, Pg 7):
   Action taken -> Ethical dilemma -> [Professional rules VS Personal moral prudence]
- Code of Ethics vs. Code of Conduct Diagram (Q2b, Pg 9):
   Concentric circles: Outer circle "Code of ethics (wider ambit)", Inner circle "Code of conduct".

#### References to Judgements and ARC Report:

- **2nd ARC:** "has also recommended code of ethics for same." (Q2b, Pg 10, for National Commission on Integrity).
- **BN Srikrishna Committee:** On Personal Data Protection Bill (for upholding public values in digital ethics). (Q3a, Pg 12)

#### • Thinkers and Philosophies:

Buddha's Madhyam Marg (Middle Path): For balancing rules and moral prudence.
 (Q2a, Pg 8)
 Eli CoHen

## • Answer Writing Techniques:

- Q2a (Ethical Dilemma): Defines, shows diagrammatically, explains importance of rules, then importance of moral prudence with examples for each. Concludes with balance.
- Q2b (Code of Conduct): Defines, uses diagram for CoC vs CoE, lists issues with CoC, then states need for National Commission on Integrity and Transparency with its potential roles. Evaluator suggests: "Please prioritize the arguments to adhere to the words limit."

## **Probity in Governance**

Concept of public service
Philosophical basis of governance and probity
Information sharing and transparency in government
Right to Information (RTI)
Codes of Ethics, Codes of Conduct
Citizen's Charters, Work culture, Quality of service delivery
Utilization of public funds
Challenges of corruption

### Crisp Definitions/Explanations:

- Transparency: "Transparency refers to releasing certain category of information to public about functioning of government institutions at regular intervals." (Q5a, Pg 19)
- 'Just-in-time' release of funds: "refers to releasing funds for specific schemes and projects at the exact moment of their initiation without any delays." (Q5b, Pg 21)

## Impactful Real-Life Examples:

- Significance of Transparency:
  - Cultivate public trust (Eg: Income Tax citizen charter ensures proper reimbursement of excess taxes). (Q5a, Pg 19)
  - Prevent corruption by keeping information in public domain at first place (deterrence effect). (Q5a, Pg 19)
  - Detect corruption (Eg: PAC role in detecting 2G scam, common wealth games scam). (Q5a, Pg 19)
  - Just and fair use of public money (Eg: releasing extra-budgetary borrowings
     15th FC). (Q5a, Pg 20)
  - Redressal of public grievances (Eg: Ombudsman app MGNREGA). (Q5a, Pg 20)

## • 'Just-in-time' funds release - Significance:

- Prevent red-tapism and bureaucratic hurdles. (Q5b, Pg 21)
- Boost Ease of Doing Business (Eg: support already in place GeM platform).
   (Q5b, Pg 21)
- Boost credibility of governance. (Q5b, Pg 21)

- Attract more investment and FDI. (Q5b, Pg 21)
- Prevent corruption and dining-ence (?) of funds -> upholding in significantly.
   (Q5b, Pg 22)
- Issues with 'Just-in-time' funds release:
  - Inadequate implementation due to lack of political will. (Q5b, Pg 22)
  - Lack of monitoring and vigilance (after funds have been transferred). (Q5b, Pg 22)
  - Bias and favouritism in transfer of fund. (Q5b, Pg 22)
  - Inadequate infrastructure (both digital and physical). (Q5b, Pg 22)
- References to Judgements and ARC Report:
  - 2nd ARC: Referenced for recommending Civil Services Board, code of ethics to ensure transparency. (Q5a, Pg 20)
- Answer Writing Techniques:
  - Q5a (Transparency): Defines, lists significance with diverse examples. Way forward suggests strengthening Lokpal/Lokayukta, RTI awareness, Civil Services Board, Code of Ethics.
  - Q5b (Just-in-time funds): Defines, lists significance, then discusses issues and provides a way forward focusing on implementation. Evaluator's comment "Please write with clarity" for Q5b.

#### **CASE STUDIES ANALYSIS**

### General Introduction/Conclusion Style for Case Studies:

- Introduction: Usually starts by identifying the central ethical theme or conflict presented in the case study. For example, Q7 intro: "The covid-19 pandemic tested the efficacy of local administration. However, the issue at hand presents the case of sexual harassment at workplace (Vishakha Guidelines)."
- Conclusion: Often reiterates the chosen course of action and justifies it based on ethical principles, values, or a pragmatic approach that upholds public interest/duty. Example Q7 conclusion: "Hence, both convergence of means and ends is required Gandhi."

#### Case Study 1: Q7 (District Magistrate, COVID, DMO-Sexual Harassment)

- **Underlying Theme:** Abuse of power, sexual harassment at workplace, ethical dilemma (professional duty vs. immediate action on misconduct), pressure from media/civil society. Governance in crisis.
- Ethical Issues Identified by Candidate:
  - Pressure of media vs following procedure set by rule of law.
  - Upholding dignity and modesty of female workers (Art. 16, 21, 51A).
  - Immoral acts by public officer vs impeccable service record.
  - Upholding rights of female workers vs larger good of society (health crisis due to pandemic).

Stakeholders: District Magistrate (me), District Medical Officer, Female Workers, People of district, Media and CSO, State at large.
 Eli CoHen

### • Options & Evaluation (Pros & Cons):

## 1. Immediately suspend DMO based on media reports:

- *Merits:* Safe work environment, media satisfaction, prevent social unrest.
- Demerits: Against investigatory procedure, DMO may be wrongfully punished, deteriorating COVID situation.

## 2. Keeping DMO in office despite allegations:

- Merits: Manage COVID crisis.
- Demerits: Lack of secure environment for female employees, unrest in media and CSO.

#### 3. Instituting enquiry and resorting to temporary measures (temporary suspension):

- *Merits:* Safe work atmosphere, uphold female dignity.
- Demerits: Delayed COVID response, excessive work.

## Chosen Course of Action & Justification (Option 3 refined):

- Forming an enquiry committee with representatives from media, female workers.
- Taking impartial decision based on reports.
- If found guilty -> immediate suspension; if not guilty -> address female issues, is trust building exercised.
- Justification: "objectivity," "Kant's Deontological approach" (implying duty-based action), "convergence of means and ends - Gandhi."
- **Keywords/Theories/Examples Used:** Vishakha Guidelines, Art 16, 21, 51A, Kant's Deontological approach, Gandhi (means and ends).

#### Case Study 2: Q8 (SP, Mob Lynching, Police Retaliation, Political Pressure)

• **Underlying Theme:** Mob justice, rule of law vs. public anger, police ethics (use of force), political interference, maintaining public order.

#### Ethical Issues Identified by Candidate:

- Against official witchcraft act, 2014 of Odisha government.
- Issue of Police brutality and proportionate use of force.
- Belief in supernaturalism (witchcraft) (Refers to Karl Marx: belief and faith masking rationality).
- Proportionate and adequate action against accused officials despite them trying to save two women.
- Vote-bank appearement issue vs. eroding adherence to rule of law.
- Following adequate enquiry procedure vs. giving into state will challenge for SP.
- Stakeholders: SP (me), Two women (accused of witchcraft), Villagers (3 killed, others protesting), Local police officials (accused of lathicharge), State government (election

interest).

## • Options & Evaluation (Pros & Cons):



- 1. Take strict action against local police without adequate enquiry:
  - *Merits:* Justice to 3 killed villagers, ruling party pressure handled, maintain social peace and rest.
  - Demerits: Not following procedure, policemen might be wrongfully accused.

## 2. Instituting enquiry committee - taking actions on findings:

- *If guilty:* suspension.
- If not guilty: take right steps to bridge trust deficit.
- Merits (chosen option): Upholding law of land, win-win for all groups.
- Demerits (of not choosing other options imply these are avoided): Political party pressure remains, fear of social unrest.
- 3. (Implicitly, not taking any action or siding with police without enquiry):
  - Demerits: Erosion of professional duty, social unrest. (Candidate chooses option 2)
- Chosen Course of Action & Justification (Option 2 refined):
  - I would choose option 2 as it promotes collective good and is in lines with professional duty.
  - Long-run measures for mob lynching:
    - Awareness campaign roping in civil society to limit such cases.
    - Institutional change effective vigilance and training of officials, only proportional use of force.
    - Building trust between police and people (Eg: Arif Sheikh Amcho Police, Amcho Bastar).
    - Public skits and school curriculum inclusion.
- **Keywords/Theories/Examples Used:** Witchcraft Act, Karl Marx, Proportionate force, Rule of Law, Vote-bank politics. Examples: Arif Sheikh Amcho Police, Amcho Bastar.

# Case Study 3: Q9 (Airworthiness Officer, Minor Safety Lapses, Influential Airline, Senior's Advice)

- **Underlying Theme:** Professional integrity vs. pressure from superiors/influential entities, public safety vs. business interests, organizational ethics.
- Ethical Dilemmas Identified by Candidate:
  - Safety of public vs. procedural flexibility.
  - Performing professional duties objectively vs. pressure from senior.
  - Giving benefit of doubt to airline vs. following strict rules and regulations.
  - Issue of crony capitalism business group having close ties with political parties affects functioning of government departments.

- Giving time for rectification, hence not including lapses in report verification, honest and fact-based report.
- **Stakeholders:** Airworthiness Officer (me), DGCA, Airline group (businessmen), Political parties (indirectly), People (passengers), Senior officer.
- Options & Evaluation (Pros & Cons):
  - 1. Giving in to senior's pressure giving time for rectification and not including lapses in report:
    - *Merits:* Not upsetting senior, business group, political party career benefits.
    - Demerits: Threat to flight and public safety.
  - 2. Forming an honest report including all minor lapses:
    - *Merits:* Upholding flight and passenger safety, following professional duty.
    - Demerits: Lack flexibility in approach, might upset senior and political party career ramifications.
  - 3. Including lapses in report while also asking the airline to do away issues post which new report will be issued (Chosen Option):
    - Merits: Doing professional duty; setting right precedent.
    - *Demerits:* The senior, business group and political party, might still be upset; career ramifications for me.
- Chosen Course of Action & Justification (Option 3):
  - "I will choose option 3 as it is in lines with 'Golden Mean' of Aristotle."
  - "Is giving time to airline to improve."
  - "Is objective decision-making."
  - "Is honest report."
  - "Is. upholding public safety."
  - "Hence, the issue of airline safety should not be compromised. moreover commerce without morality is a sin - Gandhi."
- **Keywords/Theories/Examples Used:** Crony capitalism, Procedural flexibility, Objectivity, Public safety. Thinkers: Aristotle (Golden Mean), Gandhi (Commerce without morality is a sin). Example: Spice Jet (recent safety issues).

## Case Study 4: Q10 (Media Ethics, 24x7 News, Sensationalization)

- **Underlying Theme:** Media ethics, freedom of press vs. responsibility, impact of sensationalism, declining professional standards.
- Ethical Issues Prevalent in Media:
  - Media-businessman-Politician nexus -> increasing trend of 'paid-news' -> infringing honesty, objectivity and transparency.
  - Lack of sensitisation while reporting (Eg: rape cases, recent Prophet Muhammad controversy).

- Spread of fake news masking truth and reality (Eg: North-East Delhi riots, 2020).
- Lack of constructive criticism of governance and policies (taking approaches of either appearement or bashing).
- Ignoring issues of vital public importance thus, not performing role of forming public opinion.

## Impact of Unethical Reporting on Society:

- Social unrest threat to peace (Eg: Amravati and Udaipur killings after Prophet's row).
- Threat to national security (Eg: threats from ISIS of bomb blast after Prophet row).
- International ramifications reduced credibility of government (Eg: Prophet remarks criticism by middle-east nations - crucial for energy security).
- Promoting culture of intolerance and radicalisation.
- Free pass to government as watchdog role compromised.
- Erosion of women dignity due to unsensitised media reporting.
- Damage to credibility of constitutional institutions like SC, Parliament etc.

#### Steps to Strengthen Ethics in Media:

- A citizen charter on reporting sensitive issues (suggested by UNESCO).
- Upskilling and re-skilling of media personnels as per changed needs.
- De-linking media and politics independent audit of keeping reports in public domain.
- Strengthening two-way communication channel people presenting their grievances to media channels.
- Independent media regulator collegium system for appointment.
- Social media reforms user awareness, 'fake news' tag on twitter, effective use (Eg: Mumbai Police).
- **Keywords/Theories/Examples Used:** Paid-news, Fake news, Sensationalism, Watchdog role of media, Fourth pillar of democracy, Art 19. Examples: Prophet Muhammad controversy, NE Delhi riots, Amravati/Udaipur killings, UNESCO, Mumbai Police.

## Case Study 5: Q11 (Dean of Academics, Specially-abled Professor Complaint, Discrimination Claim)

• **Underlying Theme:** Professional ethics, rights of persons with disabilities, discrimination vs. accountability, maintaining academic standards.

### Ethical Issues Identified by Candidate:

- Students' right to meaningful education (Art. 21A).
- PWD's rights under PWD Act, 2016 issue of discrimination vs erosion of Art. 16,
   21.
- Issue of honesty either students or teacher speaking the truth.
- Disruption of university environment in light of complaint and unrest.

- Declining academic standards and university reputation.
- Eli\_CoHer
- Stakeholders: Dean of Academics (me), Mr. X (specially-abled professor), Students, HoD, Larger university, Entire Disabled community.
- Options & Evaluation (Pros & Cons):
  - 1. Dismiss Mr. X on complaint of students:
    - Merits: Quality of education upheld.
    - Demerits: Not following proper procedure, erosion of duty, discriminatory to Teacher (especially when he belongs to PWD).
  - 2. Dismiss students complaints and carry on with regular teaching:
    - *Merits:* Mr. X doesn't file complain university reputation maintained.
    - Demerits: Students might be right eroding education quality, No discrimination against PWD attention to procedure (examiner notes "inadequate").
  - 3. Negotiating with Mr. X to hold filing complaint for a while; give him another charge for temporary period and institute enquiry (Chosen Option):
    - Merits: Upholding rule of law.
    - Demerits: Mr. X may not agree and still file complaint, Delays with enquiry.
- Chosen Course of Action & Justification (Option 3):
  - "I would choose option 3 as it propagates the 'utilitarian approach' promoting maximum benefit of all."
  - "Is the adequate decision would be taken on basis of committee report."
  - Long-term suggestions: Improving gap between PWD teachers and students,
     More accessible infrastructure.
  - "Hence, university is a temple of education and that should be upheld while respecting PWD rights."
- **Keywords/Theories/Examples Used:** Rights of Persons with Disabilities Act 2016, Art 21A, Art 16, Utilitarian approach. (Census 2011 data: over 2 crore disabled people in India, only 36% of them are employed).

#### Case Study 6: Q12 (District Magistrate, Manual Scavenging Prevalence & Deaths)

- **Underlying Theme:** Social justice, dignity of labor, failure of rehabilitation, caste-based discrimination, administrative apathy.
- Issues Associated with Manual Scavenging:
  - Prohibited under Art. 17 and Manual Scavenging Act of 2013.
  - Discriminatory to lower castes denying them opportunity of socio-economic development (Art. 14, 15, 16, 17).
  - Unsafe manual scavenging environment threat to health.
  - Against human dignity (Art. 21) and basic human right set by UN convention.

- Promotes caste-based occupational rigidity.
- Denies right to education and improved standard of living to future therefore (Art. 21A and 46).
- Exploitative of women in certain cases.
- Options & Evaluation (Pros & Cons):
  - 1. Let the situation continue ignore the issue:
    - Merits: No stopping of work including government work.
    - Demerits: Erosion of professional duties, setting wrong precedent, promoting caste-based divisions, continued threat to human health and life.
  - 2. Identify departments and sectors where manual scavengers are employed:
    - Merits: Taking adequate steps in line with duties, Taking steps against caste discrimination and scavenging.
    - Demerits: Inadequate response and delay in identification, Bad situation of manual scavengers in meantime.
  - 3. Institute proper committee to see lapses in law implementation and recommend future course of action (Chosen Option):
    - Merits: Following law of land, Action against caste based division, Upholding professional duty, Right precedent.
    - Demerits: Committee advise not implemented adequately, Some Departments (may not cooperate).
- Chosen Course of Action & Justification (Feasible Steps based on Option 3 logic):
  - "I will take steps 2 and 3 (implying identification and committee action).
  - Immediate basis:
    - Stop all works of manual scavenging.
    - Proper rehabilitation.
    - Action against guilty departments.
  - Long term:
    - Alternate livelihood source and training.
    - Spread awareness, through civil society.
    - Proper vigilance and monitoring.
  - "Manual scavenging is a threat for society, As per BR Ambedkar equality should be established."
- **Keywords/Theories/Examples Used:** Art 17, Manual Scavenging Act 2013, Art 14, 15, 16, 21, 21A, 46, UN Convention, Caste-based discrimination, Human dignity. Thinker: B.R. Ambedkar (equality).

This detailed breakdown should provide a comprehensive understanding of the topper's approach and the valuable content from her answer script. Okay, I have analyzed the

provided answer script of Laghina Tiwari (Test Code: 1841) for Vision IAS General Studies

Paper 4.

Eli CoHen

Here's the extraction as per your request:

#### SYLLABUS-WISE EXTRACTION

#### **Ethics and Human Interface**

Essence, determinants and consequences of ethics in human actions Dimensions of ethics Ethics in private and public relationships

- Crisp Definitions/Explanations:
  - Self-efficacy: "Self-efficacy refers to the quality of knowing your strengths and weaknesses and accordingly influencing your actions." (Q1a, Pg 3)
  - Determinants of Self-efficacy (implicitly, determinants of ethical actions/values):
    - "Family: Family values like gender equity, respecting elders etc. go in shaping individual." (Q1a, Pg 3)
    - "Education and school. has influence on a person (Eg: Team-work, tolerance mid-day meal)" (Q1a, Pg 3)
    - "Eminent personalities (Eg: Martin Luther King Jr. against racial discrimination)" (Q1a, Pg 3)
    - "Constitutional ideals and law of the land." (Q1a, Pg 3)
    - "Religious values (Eg: Ramayan influences private relationships)" (Q1a, Pg
       4)
  - Ethics: "Ethics refer to a general set of guidelines and principles that help us differentiate between right and wrong." (Q1b, Pg 5)
  - Difference between "right to do" and "what is right to do": "Ethics is knowing the
    difference between what you have the right to do and what is right to do.
    However, sometimes, ethical values are also crucial in differentiating between
    'what is the right thing to do' and 'what can be actually done'." (Q1b, Pg 5)
    - "Right to do is related to power & authority what you have right over."
       (Examiner's note, Pg 5, reinforcing the candidate's point)
  - Organizational Values (Public vs. Private): "Certain sets of values guide our behaviour in public and private sectors." (Q3b, Pg 13)
    - Public Sector: "laid down by 2nd ARC and Nolan committee." Values include "Integrity, Leadership, empathy, accountability, transparency, innovative etc."
    - Private Sector: "No official provision family and friends, religion, scriptures like Ramayana & Mahabharata provide values." Values include "love, loyalty, honesty, affection etc."
- Impactful Real-Life Examples:
  - **Martin Luther King Jr.:** As an eminent personality influencing values (against racial discrimination). (Q1a, Pg 3)
  - Armstrong Pame: Example of leadership in civil service (led road construction in Manipur). (Q1a, Pg 4)

- Art. 19 (Freedom of Speech vs. Individual Dignity): Example for "right to do" vs. "what is right to do" "while Art. 19 gives former right; giving offens he repairs the repairs to do" against women and transgend-ers go against ethics." (Q1b, Pg 5)
- Nazi Germany: Contextual ethics "Though lying is wrong; it can become right when in Nazi Germany done to save Jews." (Q1b, Pg 6)

#### Short Relevant Quotes:

- Aristotle: "knowing oneself is beginning of all wisdom." (Conclusion for selfefficacy, Q1a, Pg 4)
- Plato: "there is no dual morality. Both Personal and public spheres are interlinked." (Conclusion for public vs private values, Q3b, Pg 14)

## Human Values – lessons from the lives and teachings of great leaders, reformers and administrators

Role of family, society and educational institutions in inculcating values

- Impactful Real-Life Examples/Personalities:
  - Martin Luther King Jr.: (Mentioned above, Q1a, Pg 3)
  - Armstrong Pame: (Mentioned above, Q1a, Pg 4)
  - Shastri: "taking responsibility of rail accident" (Example for Responsibility, Q3b, Pg
     14)
  - Shastri: "didn't use public resources for personal use & he also got only 'charkha' as dowry." (Example for selflessness, Q3b, Pg 14)
  - Buddha: "gave the noble 8 fold path to get rid of 'dukha' (miseries)." (Example for contentment leading to happiness, Q6a, Pg 24)
  - Gandhi: "in his satyagraha techniques" (Honesty upheld by Gandhi, Q6c, Pg 27)
  - Yudhistar: "lied to Drona to kill Aswathama" (Honesty in certain situations can be harmful, Q6c, Pg 28)

#### Crisp Definitions/Explanations:

- Determinants of values: Family, Education/School, Eminent Personalities, Constitutional Ideals, Religious values (Q1a, Pgs 3-4)
- Honesty: "A civil servant should be honest about his personal interests, same honesty bedrock of personal relations." (Q3b, Pg 14)
- **Equity:** "Person whose sister and him treated alike will treat female co-workers equally." (Q3b, Pg 14)
- Happiness (Marcus Aurelius quote): "The happiness of your life depends upon the quality of your thoughts." Explained as: "it is your internal thoughts and characteristics that determine what kind of life you lead - happy or sad." (Q6a, Pg 23)
- Honesty (Thomas Jefferson quote): "Honesty is the first chapter in the book of wisdom." Explained as: "a wise man is one that treads the path of honesty in all circumstances." (Q6c, Pg 27)

#### Short Relevant Quotes:

Gandhi: (implied through Satyagraha and) 'Satya Pammo Dharma' (Truth is the highest virtue) are upheld. (Q6c, Pg 28)
 Eli CoHen

### • Unique Case Studies/Ethical Dilemmas (within theory answers):

 Q6c (Honesty): "Lying can provide temporary benefits, it can have negative impacts in the long run. Eg: The lying and deception of golden deer (demon) in Ramayan ended his life ultimately." (Pg 27)

### Thinkers and Philosophies:

- Aristotle: "knowing oneself is beginning of all wisdom." (Q1a, Pg 4); "Golden Mean" (Q9, Pg 43).
- Plato: "there is no dual morality." (Q3b, Pg 14)
- **Buddha:** "noble 8 fold path to get rid of 'dukha'." (Q6a, Pg 24); "Madhyam Marg (Middle Path)" (Q2a, Pg 8).
- Gandhi: "Gandhi's Talisman" (Q1a, Pg 4); "Satyagraha techniques" (Q6c, Pg 27);
   "Satya Pammo Dharma'" (Q6c, Pg 28); "convergence of means and ends" (Q7, Pg 33); "commerce without morality is a sin" (Q9, Pg 43).
- Marcus Aurelius: "The happiness of your life depends upon the quality of your thoughts." (Q6a, Pg 23)
- **Thomas Jefferson:** "Honesty is the first chapter in the book of wisdom." (Q6c, Pg 27)
- **Jawaharlal Nehru:** "The forces in a capitalist society, if left unchecked, tend to make the rich richer and the poor poorer." (Q6b, Pg 25)
  - Application: Explained in context of unequal distribution of modes of production, leading to economic inequality. Mentions Keynesian tactics as a counter. (Q6b, Pg 25)
- Karl Marx: Referenced in context of belief in supernaturalism (witchcraft) where "belief and faith masking rationality". (Q8, Pg 36)
- B.R. Ambedkar: "equality should be established" (in context of manual scavenging). (Q12, Pg 58)

## • Answer Writing Techniques:

 For quote-based questions (Q6a,b,c), the candidate first explains the meaning of the quote, then provides examples/elaborations from various dimensions (individual, societal, national, international, ethical thinkers).

## Aptitude and Foundational Values for Civil Service

Integrity, impartiality and non-partisanship Objectivity, dedication to public service, empathy, tolerance and compassion towards the weaker sections

#### Crisp Definitions/Explanations:

- Significance of high self-efficacy for a civil servant: (Q1a, Pg 4)
  - "self-awareness and self-regulation avoiding impulsive decisions."
  - "Taking better decisions even under stress."

- "Working for larger good of public in lines with Gandhi's Talisman."
- "Leadership."



- Accountability: "Accountability refers to being answerable for your actions and taking ownership." (Q4a, Pg 15)
- Responsibility: "while responsibility refers to taking leadership role in executing a given task at hand." (Q4a, Pg 15)
- **Difference between Accountability and Responsibility:** "Responsibility is closely linked to leadership; while accountability is in general the rule." (Q4a, Pg 15)

## Impactful Real-Life Examples:

- Armstrong Pame: (Leadership, Q1a, Pg 4)
- Vikram Sarabhai: "took responsibility of 1st ISRO mission failure, but accountability wed on entire team." (Distinction for responsibility vs accountability, Q4a, Pg 15)
- RTI, Lokpal, citizen charter: Examples of accountability mechanisms. (Q4a, Pg 16)
- **Bengaluru metro citizen charter:** Example of enhancing public participation and trust. (Q4a, Pg 16)
- Transparency International ranking (85th rank among 180 countries): Shows poor state of transparency affecting accountability. (Q4a, Pg 16)

### Thinkers and Philosophies:

- Gandhi's Talisman: Referenced for working for the larger good of the public. (Q1a, Pg 4)
- References to Judgements and ARC Report:
  - 2nd ARC and Nolan Committee: Mentioned as sources for organizational values in the public sector. (Q3b, Pg 13)

#### Emotional Intelligence (EI)

Concepts, and their utilities and application in administration and governance

(No direct question on El, but aspects like self-awareness, empathy, managing stress are covered under self-efficacy and foundational values).

#### Public/Civil Service Values and Ethics in Public Administration

Status and problems

Ethical concerns and dilemmas in government and private institutions Laws, rules, regulations and conscience as sources of ethical guidance Accountability and ethical governance Strengthening of ethical and moral values in governance

## • Crisp Definitions/Explanations:

- Ethical Dilemma: "Ethical dilemma refers to a conflicting situation where you are trapped between two choices - one that is in lines with professional rules and the other that upholds personal moral values." (Q2a, Pg 7)
- Code of Conduct: "The code of conduct for civil services provide for certain basic guidelines that guide behaviour and action of civil servants in public sphere." (Q2b, Pg 9)

o Digital Ethics: "Digital ethics refers to set of rules and regulations that needs to be followed while interacting through digital medium." (Q3a, Pg 11)

## • Impactful Real-Life Examples:

- Dealing with Ethical Dilemma (Rules vs. Moral Prudence):
  - Wrongful order of senior vs. public welfare (corruption in bridge construction). (Q2a, Pg 8)
  - Not rejecting PDS benefits for non-availability of documents vs. arranging ad-hoc doc. (Empathy). (Q2a, Pg 8)
  - E. Sreedharan: Resisting political pressure (Metro Man). (Q2a, Pg 8)

#### Issues with Code of Conduct:

- "Only provides rules for basic discipline (Eg: Property Transaction)." (Q2b, Pg
   9)
- "No mention of ethical and moral values." (Q2b, Pg 9)
- "Ineffective in controlling corruption, politicisation of bureaucracy (Eg: Pooja Singhal - MGNREGA funds integrity)." (Q2b, Pg 10)

## Ethical Implications of Digitizing Governance:

- "Infringement of privacy threat of cyber-surveillance (Eg: Criminal Identification (Amendment) Act, 2021 - store data for 75 years)." (Q3a, Pg 11)
- "Racial profiling and discrimination (Eg: Police using facial recognition)."
   (Q3a, Pg 11)
- "Creating new digital divide (Eg: Digitally illiterate cannot gain benefits of government schemes, digilocker)." (Q3a, Pg 12)

#### Laws and Rules as Guide on Morality (but not sufficient):

- Constitution as guiding light (Ambedkar's principles of social justice). (Q4b, Pg 17)
- All India Services rule. (Q4b, Pg 17)
- Code of conduct (for public behaviour, property transaction). (Q4b, Pg 17)
- Rules of RTI, e-governance. (Q4b, Pg 17)
- Insufficiency: "Fear of misinterpretation," "Used as an 'end' in itself and not as means to an end (Eg: rules used for procedural delays)," "Misuse of rules in absence of vigilance (Eg: Favoritism in employment)," "Inadequate codification of ethical principles (No provision of code of ethics)," "Obsolete laws having gaps (Eg: Marital rape law already banned in UK)." (Q4b, Pg 18)

#### Diagrams or Flowcharts:

Ethical Dilemma Diagram (Q2a, Pg 7):
 Action taken -> Ethical dilemma -> [Professional rules VS Personal moral prudence]

Code of Ethics vs. Code of Conduct Diagram (Q2b, Pg 9):
 Concentric circles: Outer circle "Code of ethics (wider ambit)", Inner circle "Code

of conduct".

## • References to Judgements and ARC Report:



- 2nd ARC: "has also recommended code of ethics for same." (Q2b, Pg 10, for National Commission on Integrity).
- **BN Srikrishna Committee:** On Personal Data Protection Bill (for upholding public values in digital ethics). (Q3a, Pg 12)

## Thinkers and Philosophies:

Buddha's Madhyam Marg (Middle Path): For balancing rules and moral prudence.
 (Q2a, Pg 8)

#### Probity in Governance

Concept of public service
Philosophical basis of governance and probity
Information sharing and transparency in government
Right to Information (RTI)
Codes of Ethics, Codes of Conduct
Citizen's Charters, Work culture, Quality of service delivery
Utilization of public funds
Challenges of corruption

## • Crisp Definitions/Explanations:

- Transparency: "Transparency refers to releasing certain category of information to public about functioning of government institutions at regular intervals." (Q5a, Pg 19)
- 'Just-in-time' release of funds: "refers to releasing funds for specific schemes and projects at the exact moment of their initiation without any delays." (Q5b, Pg 21)

#### Impactful Real-Life Examples:

- Significance of Transparency:
  - Cultivate public trust (Eg: Income Tax citizen charter ensures proper reimbursement of excess taxes). (Q5a, Pg 19)
  - Prevent corruption by keeping information in public domain at first place (deterrence effect). (Q5a, Pg 19)
  - Detect corruption (Eg: PAC role in detecting 2G scam, common wealth games scam). (Q5a, Pg 19)
  - Just and fair use of public money (Eg: releasing extra-budgetary borrowings
     15th FC). (Q5a, Pg 20)
  - Redressal of public grievances (Eg: Ombudsman app MGNREGA). (Q5a, Pg 20)

#### 'Just-in-time' funds release - Significance:

- Prevent red-tapism and bureaucratic hurdles. (Q5b, Pg 21)
- Boost Ease of Doing Business (Eg: support already in place GeM platform).
   (Q5b, Pg 21)
- Boost credibility of governance. (Q5b, Pg 21)

Attract more investment and FDI. (Q5b, Pg 21)



 Prevent corruption and diverting of funds -> upholding transparency and accountability. (Q5b, Pg 22)

#### Issues with 'Just-in-time' funds release:

- Inadequate implementation due to lack of political will. (Q5b, Pg 22)
- Lack of monitoring and vigilance (after funds have been transferred). (Q5b, Pg 22)
- Bias and favouritism in transfer of fund. (Q5b, Pg 22)
- Inadequate infrastructure (both digital and physical). (Q5b, Pg 22)
- References to Judgements and ARC Report:
  - **2nd ARC**: Referenced for recommending Civil Services Board, code of ethics to ensure transparency. (Q5a, Pg 20)

#### **CASE STUDIES ANALYSIS**

## General Introduction/Conclusion Style for Case Studies:

- Introduction: Typically starts by identifying the central ethical theme or conflict
  presented in the case study, sometimes linking it to broader governance principles or
  recent events.
  - Q7 (DMO Sexual Harassment): "The covid-19 pandemic tested the efficacy of local administration. However, the issue at hand presents the case of sexual harassment at workplace (Vishakha Guidelines)." (Pg 29-30)
- **Conclusion:** Often reiterates the chosen course of action and justifies it based on ethical principles, values (like Gandhian ideals, Kantian duty), or a pragmatic approach that upholds public interest/duty.
  - Q7: "Hence, both convergence of means and ends is required Gandhi." (Pg 33)

#### Theme 1: Governance, Corruption, and Abuse of Power in Public Sector

- Case Study: Q7 (District Magistrate, COVID, DMO-Sexual Harassment)
  - Ethical Issues Identified:
    - Pressure of media vs following procedure set by rule of law. (Pg 30-31)
    - Upholding dignity and modesty of female workers (Art. 16, 21, 51A). (Pg 31)
    - Immoral acts by public officer vs impeccable service record. (Pg 31)
    - Upholding rights of female workers vs larger good of society (health crisis due to pandemic). (Pg 31)

#### Justifications for Action:

- Chosen Action: Form an enquiry committee having representatives from media, female workers; take impartial decision based on reports.
- Justification: "objectivity," "Kant's Deontological approach" (implying duty-based action), "convergence of means and ends Gandhi." (Pg 33)

- Keywords/Theories/Examples Used: Vishakha Guidelines, Art 16, 21, 51A, Cant's Deontological approach, Gandhi (means and ends).
- Introduction: "The covid-19 pandemic tested the efficacy of local administration.
  However, the issue at hand presents the case of sexual harassment at workplace
  (Vishakha Guidelines)." (Pg 29-30)
- Conclusion: "Hence, both convergence of means and ends is required Gandhi."
   (Pg 33)
- Case Study: Q9 (Airworthiness Officer, Minor Safety Lapses, Influential Airline, Senior's Advice)
  - Ethical Issues Identified (Dilemmas):
    - Safety of public vs. procedural flexibility. (Pg 40)
    - Performing professional duties objectively vs. pressure from senior. (Pg 40)
    - Giving benefit of doubt to airline vs. following strict rules and regulations. (Pg 40)
    - Issue of crony capitalism. (Pg 41)
    - Giving time for rectification (not including lapses in report) vs. giving an honest and fact-based report. (Pg 41)

#### Justifications for Action:

- Chosen Action: Include lapses in report while also asking the airline to rectify issues; a new report post-rectification.
- Justification: "as it is in lines with 'Golden Mean' of Aristotle," "Is giving time to airline to improve," "Is objective decision-making," "Is honest report," "Is upholding public safety," "commerce without morality is a sin Gandhi." (Pg 43)
- Keywords/Theories/Examples Used: Crony capitalism, Public safety, Aristotle (Golden Mean), Gandhi (Commerce without morality is a sin). Example: Spice Jet (recent safety issues mentioned as context). (Pg 40, 43)
- Introduction: "In recent times, the issue of aviation safety have taken central stage with DGCA issuing show cause notice to airlines like Spice Jet. The case study also revolves around a similar issue." (Pg 40)
- Conclusion: "Hence, the issue of airline safety should not be compromised. moreover commerce without morality is a sin - Gandhi." (Pg 43)

#### Theme 2: Law and Order, Social Issues, and Political Interference

- Case Study: Q8 (SP, Mob Lynching, Police Retaliation, Political Pressure)
  - Ethical Issues Identified:
    - Against official witchcraft act, 2014 of Odisha government. (Pg 36)
    - Issue of Police brutality and proportionate use of force. (Pg 36)
    - Belief in supernaturalism (witchcraft) (Refers to Karl Marx: belief and faith masking rationality). (Pg 36)

- Vote-bank appearement issue vs. eroding adherence to rule of law. (Pg 36)
- Following adequate enquiry procedure vs. giving into state value of the state value of

#### Justifications for Action:

- Chosen Action: Institute an enquiry committee and take actions based on findings.
- Justification: "as it promotes collective good and is in lines with professional duty." (Pg 38)
- Long-run measures: "Awareness campaign," "Institutional change effective vigilance and training," "building trust between police and people," "Public skits and school curriculum inclusion." (Pg 38)
- Keywords/Theories/Examples Used: Witchcraft Act, Karl Marx, Proportionate force, Rule of Law, Vote-bank politics. Examples: Arif Sheikh - Amcho Police, Amcho Bastar (for building police-public trust). (Pg 38)
- Introduction: "Mob-lynching has become a serious issue with recent incidents in Punjab. Often tribal villages of Odisha, Jharkhand are spectator to mob-lynching surrounding witchcraft allegation." (Pg 35)
- Conclusion (Long-run measures): "These steps are crucial in light of such incidents." (Pg 38)

### Theme 3: Applied Ethics (Media Ethics)

- Case Study: Q10 (Media Ethics, 24x7 News, Sensationalization)
  - Ethical Issues Identified in Media:
    - Media-businessman-Politician nexus -> 'paid-news' -> infringing honesty, objectivity, transparency. (Pg 45)
    - Lack of sensitisation while reporting (Eg: rape cases, Prophet Muhammad controversy). (Pg 45)
    - Spread of fake news (Eg: North-East Delhi riots, 2020). (Pg 45)
    - Lack of constructive criticism (either appearement or bashing). (Pg 45)
    - Ignoring issues of vital public importance. (Pg 46)
  - Steps to Strengthen Ethics (Justifications implied in the need):
    - Citizen charter for sensitive issues (suggested by UNESCO). (Pg 47)
    - Upskilling and re-skilling of media personnel. (Pg 47)
    - De-linking media and politics; independent audit. (Pg 48)
    - Two-way communication channel for grievances. (Pg 48)
    - Independent media regulator (collegium system). (Pg 48)
    - Social media reforms (Eg: 'fake news' tag, Mumbai Police effective use). (Pg 48)
  - Keywords/Theories/Examples Used: Paid-news, Fake news, Watchdog role,
     Fourth pillar, Art 19. Examples: Prophet Muhammad controversy, NE Delhi riots,

Amravati/Udaipur killings, UNESCO, Mumbai Police.

- o Introduction: "Media is regarded as the 4th pillar of democracy. Here its paramount importance and should be adequately upheld." (Pg 44)
- **Conclusion:** "Hence, role of media is of importance as per Art. 19. Important reforms will further strengthen it." (Pg 48)

## Theme 4: Individual Values, Rights, and Institutional Integrity

- Case Study: Q11 (Dean of Academics, Specially-abled Professor Complaint, Discrimination Claim)
  - Ethical Issues Identified:
    - Students' right to meaningful education (Art. 21A). (Pg 50)
    - PWD's rights under PWD Act, 2016 issue of discrimination vs erosion of Art. 16, 21. (Pg 51)
    - Issue of honesty (students or teacher). (Pg 51)
    - Disruption of university environment. (Pg 51)
    - Declining academic standards and university reputation. (Pg 51)
  - Justifications for Action:
    - Chosen Action: Negotiate with Mr. X to hold complaint, give him another charge temporarily, institute enquiry.
    - Justification: "as it propagates the 'utilitarian approach' promoting maximum benefit of all," "adequate decision would be taken on basis of committee report." (Pg 53)
    - Long-term: "improving gap between PWD teachers and students," "More accessible infrastructure." (Pg 53)
  - Keywords/Theories/Examples Used: Rights of Persons with Disabilities Act 2016,
     Art 21A, Art 16, Utilitarian approach. Data: Census 2011 (disability stats). (Pg 49, 53)
  - Introduction: "As per census, 2011; there are over 2 crore disabled people in India and only 36% of them are employed. The given case presents a situation with respect to PWD." (Pg 49-50)
  - Conclusion: "Hence, university is a temple of education and that should be upheld while respecting PWD rights." (Pg 53)
- Case Study: Q12 (District Magistrate, Manual Scavenging Prevalence & Deaths)
  - Ethical Issues Identified:
    - Manual scavenging prohibited under Art. 17 and Manual Scavenging Act of 2013. (Pg 55)
    - Discriminatory to lower castes (violates Art. 14, 15, 16, 17). (Pg 55)
    - Unsafe environment threat to health. (Pg 55)
    - Against human dignity (Art. 21) & UN convention. (Pg 55)
    - Promotes caste-based occupational rigidity. (Pg 55)

- Denies right to education & improved standard of living (Art. 21A, 46). (Pg 56)
- Justifications for Action (Feasible Steps):



- Immediate: Stop all manual scavenging, proper rehabilitation, action against guilty departments.
- Long term: Alternate livelihood, awareness, vigilance & monitoring.
- Justification: "Manual scavenging is a threat for society, As per BR Ambedkar equality should be established." (Pg 58)
- Keywords/Theories/Examples Used: Art 17, Manual Scavenging Act 2013, Art 14, 15, 16, 21, 21A, 46, UN Convention, Human dignity, Caste-based discrimination, B.R. Ambedkar (equality).
- Introduction: "(a) Manual scavenging has been prohibited under Art. 17 as well as Manual Scavenging Act of 2013. The issue at hand showcases the problem of its continued existence." (Pg 55)
- Conclusion: "Manual scavenging is a threat for society, As per BR Ambedkar equality should be established." (Pg 58)

This detailed breakdown aligns with your request, covering examples, definitions, quotes, diagrams, answer writing techniques, references, thinkers, syllabus-wise organization, and a thematic analysis of the case studies with specific extractions for each.