

PROBABILISTIC METHODS IN COMBINATORICS
MIT 18.226 (FALL 2024)
PROBLEM SET

<https://sammy-luo.github.io/18-226/>

A. INTRODUCTION AND LINEARITY OF EXPECTATIONS

A1. Verify the following asymptotic calculations used in Ramsey number lower bounds:

- (a) For each k , the largest n satisfying $\binom{n}{k} 2^{1-\binom{k}{2}} < 1$ has $n = \left(\frac{1}{e\sqrt{2}} + o(1)\right) k 2^{k/2}$.
- (b) For each k , the maximum value of $n - \binom{n}{k} 2^{1-\binom{k}{2}}$ as n ranges over positive integers is $\left(\frac{1}{e} + o(1)\right) k 2^{k/2}$.
- (c) For each k , the largest n satisfying $e \left(\binom{k}{2} \binom{n}{k-2} + 1\right) 2^{1-\binom{k}{2}} < 1$ satisfies $n = \left(\frac{\sqrt{2}}{e} + o(1)\right) k 2^{k/2}$.

A2. Prove that, if there is a real $p \in [0, 1]$ such that

$$\binom{n}{k} p^{\binom{k}{2}} + \binom{n}{t} (1-p)^{\binom{t}{2}} < 1$$

then the Ramsey number $R(k, t)$ satisfies $R(k, t) > n$. Using this show that

$$R(4, t) \geq c \left(\frac{t}{\log t}\right)^{3/2}$$

for some constant $c > 0$.

ps1

- A3. Let G be a graph with n vertices and m edges. Prove that K_n can be written as a union of $O(n^2(\log n)/m)$ isomorphic copies of G (not necessarily edge-disjoint).
- A4. Prove that there is an absolute constant $C > 0$ so that for every $n \times n$ matrix with distinct real entries, one can permute its rows so that no column in the permuted matrix contains an increasing subsequence of length at least $C\sqrt{n}$. (A subsequence does not need to be selected from consecutive terms. For example, $(1, 2, 3)$ is an increasing subsequence of $(1, 5, 2, 4, 3)$.)
- A5. *Generalization of Sperner's theorem.* Let \mathcal{F} be a collection of subset of $[n]$ that does not contain $k+1$ elements forming a chain: $A_1 \subsetneq \cdots \subsetneq A_{k+1}$. Prove that \mathcal{F} is no larger than taking the union of the k levels of the Boolean lattice closest to the middle layer.
- A6. Let G be a graph on $n \geq 10$ vertices. Suppose that adding any new edge to G would create a new clique on 10 vertices. Prove that G has at least $8n - 36$ edges.

Hint in white:

A7. Let $k \geq 4$ and H a k -uniform hypergraph with at most $4^{k-1}/3^k$ edges. Prove that there is a coloring of the vertices of H by four colors so that in every edge all four colors are represented.

ps1

A8. Given a set \mathcal{F} of subsets of $[n]$ and $A \subseteq [n]$, write $\mathcal{F}|_A := \{S \cap A : S \in \mathcal{F}\}$ (its *projection* onto A). Prove that for every n and k , there exists a set \mathcal{F} of subsets of $[n]$ with $|\mathcal{F}| = O(k 2^k \log n)$ such that for every k -element subset A of $[n]$, $\mathcal{F}|_A$ contains all 2^k subsets of A .

ps1

A9. Let A_1, \dots, A_m be r -element sets and B_1, \dots, B_m be s -element sets. Suppose $A_i \cap B_i = \emptyset$ for each i , and for each $i \neq j$, either $A_i \cap B_j \neq \emptyset$ or $A_j \cap B_i \neq \emptyset$. Prove that $m \leq (r+s)^{r+s}/(r^r s^s)$.

- ps1★** A10. Show that in every non-2-colorable n -uniform hypergraph, one can find at least $\frac{n}{2} \binom{2n-1}{n}$ unordered pairs of edges with each pair intersecting in exactly one vertex.
- A11. Let A be a measurable subset of the unit sphere in \mathbb{R}^3 (centered at the origin) containing no pair of orthogonal points.
- ps1** (a) Prove that A occupies at most $1/3$ of the sphere in terms of surface area.
- ps1★** (b) Prove an upper bound smaller than $1/3$ (give your best bound).
- ps1★** A12. Prove that every set of 10 points in the plane can be covered by a union of disjoint unit disks.
- A13. Let $\mathbf{r} = (r_1, \dots, r_k)$ be a vector of nonzero integers whose sum is nonzero. Prove that there exists a real $c > 0$ (depending on \mathbf{r} only) such that the following holds: for every finite set A of nonzero reals, there exists a subset $B \subseteq A$ with $|B| \geq c|A|$ such that there do not exist $b_1, \dots, b_k \in B$ with $r_1 b_1 + \dots + r_k b_k = 0$.
- ps1** A14. Prove that every set A of n nonzero integers contains two disjoint subsets B_1 and B_2 , such that both B_1 and B_2 are sum-free, and $|B_1| + |B_2| > 2n/3$.
- ps1** A15. Let G be an n -vertex graph with pn^2 edges, with $n \geq 10$ and $p \geq 10/n$. Prove that G contains a pair of vertex-disjoint and isomorphic subgraphs (not necessarily induced) each with at least $cp^2 n^2$ edges, where $c > 0$ is a constant.
- ps1★** A16. Prove that for every positive integer r , there exists an integer K such that the following holds. Let S be a set of rk points evenly spaced on a circle. If we partition $S = S_1 \cup \dots \cup S_r$ so that $|S_i| = k$ for each i , then, provided $k \geq K$, there exist r congruent triangles where the vertices of the i -th triangle lie in S_i , for each $1 \leq i \leq r$.
- ps1★** A17. Prove that $[n]^d$ cannot be partitioned into fewer than 2^d sets each of the form $A_1 \times \dots \times A_d$ where $A_i \subsetneq [n]$.

B. ALTERATION METHOD

- B1. Using the alteration method, prove the Ramsey number bound

$$R(4, k) \geq c(k/\log k)^2$$

for some constant $c > 0$.

- B2. Prove that every 3-uniform hypergraph with n vertices and $m \geq n$ edges contains an independent set (i.e., a set of vertices containing no edges) of size at least $cn^{3/2}/\sqrt{m}$, where $c > 0$ is a constant.
- B3. Prove that every k -uniform hypergraph with n vertices and m edges has a transversal (i.e., a set of vertices intersecting every edge) of size at most $n(\log k)/k + m/k$.
- ps2** B4. *Zarankiewicz problem*. Prove that for every positive integers $n \geq k \geq 2$, there exists an $n \times n$ matrix with $\{0, 1\}$ entries, with at least $\frac{1}{2}n^{2-2/(k+1)}$ 1's, such that there is no $k \times k$ submatrix consisting of all 1's.
- ps2** B5. Fix k . Prove that there exists a constant $c_k > 1$ so that for every sufficiently large $n > n_0(k)$, there exists a collection \mathcal{F} of at least c_k^n subsets of $[n]$ such that for every k distinct $F_1, \dots, F_k \in \mathcal{F}$, all 2^k intersections $\bigcap_{i=1}^k G_i$ are nonempty, where each G_i is either F_i or $[n] \setminus F_i$.

- B6. *Acute sets in \mathbb{R}^n .* Prove that, for some constant $c > 0$, for every n , there exists a family of at least $c(2/\sqrt{3})^n$ subsets of $[n]$ containing no three distinct members A, B, C satisfying $A \cap B \subseteq C \subseteq A \cup B$.

Deduce that there exists a set of at least $c(2/\sqrt{3})^n$ points in \mathbb{R}^n so that all angles determined by three points from the set are acute.

Remark. The current best lower and upper bounds for the maximum size of an “acute set” in \mathbb{R}^n (i.e., spanning only acute angles) are $2^{n-1} + 1$ and $2^n - 1$ respectively.

ps2★

- B7. *Covering complements of sparse graphs by cliques*

- Prove that every graph with n vertices and minimum degree $n - d$ can be written as a union of $O(d^2 \log n)$ cliques.
- Prove that every bipartite graph with n vertices on each side of the vertex bipartition and minimum degree $n - d$ can be written as a union of $O(d \log n)$ complete bipartite graphs (assume $d \geq 1$).

ps2★

- B8. Let $G = (V, E)$ be a graph with n vertices and minimum degree $\delta \geq 2$. Prove that there exists $A \subseteq V$ with $|A| = O(n(\log \delta)/\delta)$ so that every vertex in $V \setminus A$ contains at least one neighbor in A and at least one neighbor not in A .

ps2★

- B9. Prove that every graph G without isolated vertices has an induced subgraph H on at least $\alpha(G)/2$ vertices such that all vertices of H have odd degree. Here $\alpha(G)$ is the size of the largest independent set in G .

C. SECOND MOMENT METHOD

ps2

- C1. *Threshold for k -APs.* Let $[n]_p$ denote the random subset of $\{1, \dots, n\}$ where every element is included with probability p independently. For each fixed integer $k \geq 3$, determine the threshold for $[n]_p$ to contain a k -term arithmetic progression.

- C2. Show that, for each fixed positive integer k , there is a sequence p_n such that

$$\mathbb{P}(G(n, p_n) \text{ has a connected component with exactly } k \text{ vertices}) \rightarrow 1 \quad \text{as } n \rightarrow \infty.$$

Hint in white:

ps2

- C3. *Poisson limit.* Let X be the number of triangles in $G(n, c/n)$ for some fixed $c > 0$.

- For every nonnegative integer k , determine the limit of $\mathbb{E}\binom{X}{k}$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$.
- Let $Y \sim \text{Binomial}(n, \lambda/n)$ for some fixed $\lambda > 0$. For every nonnegative integer k , determine the limit of $\mathbb{E}\binom{Y}{k}$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$, and show that it agrees with the limit in (a) for some $\lambda = \lambda(c)$.

We know that Y converges to the Poisson distribution with mean λ . Also, the Poisson distribution is determined by its moments.

- Compute, for fixed every nonnegative integer t , the limit of $\mathbb{P}(X = t)$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$.

(In particular, this gives the limit probability that $G(n, c/n)$ contains a triangle, i.e., $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{P}(X > 0)$. This limit increases from 0 to 1 continuously when c ranges from 0 to $+\infty$, thereby showing that the property of containing a triangle has a coarse threshold.)

ps2

- C4. *Central limit theorem for triangle counts.* Find a real (non-random) sequence a_n so that, letting X be the number of triangles and Y be the number of edges in the random graph

$G(n, 1/2)$, one has

$$\text{Var}(X - a_n Y) = o(\text{Var } X).$$

Deduce that X is asymptotically normal, that is, $(X - \mathbb{E}X)/\sqrt{\text{Var } X}$ converges to the normal distribution.

(You can solve for the minimizing a_n directly similar to ordinary least squares linear regression, or first write the edge indicator variables as $X_{ij} = (1 + Y_{ij})/2$ and then expand. The latter approach likely yields a cleaner computation.)

C5. *Isolated vertices.* Let $p_n = (\log n + c_n)/n$.

(a) Show that, as $n \rightarrow \infty$,

$$\mathbb{P}(G(n, p_n) \text{ has no isolated vertices}) \rightarrow \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } c_n \rightarrow -\infty, \\ 1 & \text{if } c_n \rightarrow \infty. \end{cases}$$

(b) Suppose $c_n \rightarrow c \in \mathbb{R}$, compute, with proof, the limit of LHS above as $n \rightarrow \infty$, by following the approach in **C3**.

ps2★

C6. Is the threshold for the bipartiteness of a random graph coarse or sharp?

(You are not allowed to use any theorems that we did not prove in class/notes.)

ps2

C7. *Triangle packing.* Prove that, with probability approaching 1 as $n \rightarrow \infty$, $G(n, n^{-1/2})$ has at least $cn^{3/2}$ edge-disjoint triangles, where $c > 0$ is some constant.

Hint in white: